

FULL REPORT OF THE

LIFE OF CHRIST RESEARCH PROJECT

By Dr. Fred Veltman

Research was financed by the General Conference
of Seventh-day Adventists
and in part by Pacific Union College

Research was reviewed and distributed by the
Life of Christ Research Project Review Committee:

Charles R. Taylor, chairman; Alden Thompson, secretary;
B. B. Beach, W. T. Clark, R. R. Hegstad, W. G. Johnsson,
R. W. Nixon, R. W. Olson, G. W. Reid, G. W. Rice,
W. H. Shea, J. R. Spangler, M. A. Warren,
F. W. Wernick, K. H. Wood.

The content is integrally that of Dr. Veltman
and his assistants

November, 1988

PREFACE

Today is Memorial Day. Flags are waving, parades are marching and the brave and the bold who gave their lives for freedom and for their country are being honored in cemeteries across the nation. It is a day to pause, to turn our attention from the present and from the future to the past, to those who gave their last full measure of devotion to a cause, to a duty, they held dear. And during these few moments we stand silently by their resting places, placing floral tributes at their memorial stones. We call their names and faces before our minds and honor them. They are heroes, all of them, by virtue of their living and their dying.

As I sit in my office this morning writing this preface, my mind goes back to 1980 when this project was initiated and when so many Adventists, particularly here in the United States, were raising questions over Ellen White's use of sources. Some Adventist workers lost their jobs over this problem. And more than a few, not able to harmonize the facts coming to light with their Adventist faith, left the church. There were those who solved the issue by dismissing the special claims on Ellen White's prophetic ministry as pious relics of a naive stage of Adventism. Others took a different tack. They dismissed the problem itself as unimportant, irrelevant, or as unfounded.

But there were also those in the church who knew that the questions about Ellen White's use of sources were not fabrications of critics and dissidents. These issues were legitimate concerns that had been raised before, briefly

PREFACE

treated, and laid aside, only to make their appearance again a few years later.

It was also known that students of Scripture have had to deal with similar questions addressed to the text of the Bible. No longer did it seem best for the future of Adventism, or even possible for that matter, to remain blind or uninformed in respect to the text of Scripture or that of Ellen G. White. It was therefore out of a deep regard for all the previous and present serious students of the Bible and of the writings of Ellen White that I accepted the challenge of making a serious study of Ellen White's use of sources in writing on the life of Christ.

In a few days the report on this research project will be sent to Elder Neal Wilson, President of the General Conference. The research and the study document of some 2,000 pages have occupied nearly eight years of my life, nearly five years on a full-time basis. Soon the research report will be duplicated and made available for study in the libraries of Adventist colleges and universities. The Ellen G. White Estate Research Centers will also have a copy and I have been told that individuals will be able to purchase personal copies if they desire. The report will not be edited and circulated by an Adventist publishing house.

On this Memorial Day, as I write the final sentences to this lengthy report, I find myself asking these questions. Was the study worth the cost - the cost to the church, the cost to my family, the cost to my life and career? Will it

PREFACE

answer the questions of those in the church who were concerned over Ellen White's use of sources? Will it disturb those in the church who were not interested in the question or who had their own answers to the problem? Will faith be strengthened? Will knowledge be meaningfully advanced in an area in which others have also worked and published?

These, however, are only some of the thoughts which come to mind on this special Monday morning. In my heart today there is also a deep sense of gratitude to those without whose help this research project would never have been completed. There is no way I could place the final period to this report without recognizing their very important role in this work. But before acknowledging my great debt to these supporters of the study let me deal with a few mundane matters relating to this research document.

What you hold in your hands is basically a first draft. The writing began with chapter three before the research had been done on all 15 chapters. For this reason the pagination begins with chapter three. Once the entire research was completed and written up the concluding chapter was written. Only then, having completed the research and the analysis, was I prepared to write the introductory chapters which explain the background to the study, the research methodology, the organization of the report document, and the history of the writings of Ellen White leading up to the publishing of The Desire of Ages, the major focus of the research. Because of the constraints of time and money I was not able to rewrite

PREFACE

the report from the vantage point of a completed research project. I have made typographical and statistical corrections and modified the syntax where my complex sentence structure defied all attempts by readers to understand what I had written. Allowing the report to stand, however, basically as first written, meant that the pages of the two introductory chapters would have to be numbered outside the sequential order begun with chapter three. I trust this double numbering will not confuse the reader.

The Ellen G. White Estate has now released all Ellen White manuscripts and letters included in the research document. No doubt those materials of Ellen White not previously placed in circulation will have been published by the time this report is distributed. We have tried our best to reproduce accurately all texts presented in the report. Any errors in our quotation of documents from the Ellen G. White Estate or other publications are my responsibility and not that of the White Estate or its officers.

There are many unnamed here who have contributed to this project through the questions raised and suggestions offered during the many public presentations I have given over the past eight years in church services, classroom discussions, meetings of Adventist Forum chapters, and in the more private contacts in the homes of Adventist members. Others have offered information and encouragement through their personal letters and telephone calls. To all these friends and interested fellow believers I owe a debt of gratitude.

PREFACE

When one attempts to express appreciation to specifically named individuals, one runs the risk of leaving out someone through oversight. Nevertheless, despite that likely possibility with its attendant embarrassment, I must mention those on whom I have leaned heavily over the last seven-plus years. First of all there is Elder Neal C. Wilson, President of the General Conference, who has stood by the project and me personally throughout the long period of research and writing. Through his efforts and influence the two-year project was extended to three years and twice since then the research has been funded for a year on a half-time basis. I am sure that no one had in mind a study of this magnitude when the research was first planned. Had it not been for the support of Elder Wilson and his associates at the General Conference the study would have taken much longer to complete.

I should also add here that General Conference Officers, at the suggestion of Elder Wilson, were willing to appoint a committee under the chairmanship of Charles R. Taylor, to review the research report at the time we had completed the analysis of the 15 chapters. The members of this committee made several very useful suggestions, particularly those who were selected to critique specific chapters: George W. Rice, William H. Shea, Alden Thompson, Mervyn A. Warren, Francis W. Wernick, and Kenneth H. Wood.

Much credit for the success of this research is also due the previous and present administrators of Pacific Union College. Jack Cassell, President, and Gordon Madgwick, Vice

PREFACE

President for Academic Administration, were willing to run the risk some eight years ago of supporting a research project about which many in the church had grave misgivings. They arranged for other teachers to take my classes, found someone else to chair the department of religion, and provided facilities on campus where the project could be housed. Malcolm Maxwell and Charles Bell, the current President and Academic Vice President of Pacific Union College, have maintained that support throughout the past five years despite the continuing concern on the part of some as to the wisdom of fostering this type of research. These college administrators, in a period of declining enrollments, nevertheless were willing to commit time, effort, and substantial financial support on behalf of a research project, which, while sponsored by the General Conference, was also seriously under question in the field. I deeply appreciate their confidence in me and their commitment to the search for truth which should characterize all Adventist educational institutions.

I owe the officers and employees of the Ellen. G. White Estate during the past seven years a very special note of appreciation. Some of these individuals no longer serve in the White Estate but their assistance will never be forgotten. Whether the request for assistance was made in connection with a personal visit or over the telephone, no call for help went unanswered and all assistance was offered willingly and cheerfully. Robert Olson, Secretary of the White Estate, went

PREFACE

out of his way on many occasions to offer his services. Space does not permit me to elaborate on the many ways in which the staff provided aid and encouragement, but Arthur L. White, Kenneth Wood, Ronald Graybill, Don Mansell, Paul Gordon, Roger Coon, John Hancock, Dorothy Christman, Norma Collins, Ellen Mattison, D. A. Delafield, and Garnett Strickland made my work a labor of joy. Alta Robinson spent hours copying documents from my never-ending list and Timothy Poirier as late as last week was searching the files for a letter I requested. Even the directors of the regional research centers, Hedy Jemison at Andrews University and James Nix at Loma Linda University, spared no effort to come to my assistance.

Ronald Graybill, at the time an officer in the White Estate, and Warren H. Johns, then a member of the staff of Ministry magazine, shared with me the results of their own research into Ellen White's use of sources and provided a basic working bibliography for this research from the inventory they were developing of the books which were in Ellen White's libraries at the time of her death.

A brief word of acknowledgment here is far from adequate when it comes to recognizing the volunteers who spent hours reading the sources and comparing them with one or two chapters from The Desire of Ages. The faithfulness of Don Casebolt, Edna Grove, Delmer Johnson, Marilyn Cotton, Genevieve Ost, Ruth Wheeler, Jean Murphy, and Joel Lutes in locating and carefully reporting the source parallels was of

PREFACE

inestimable value to the three of us working in the office here in Angwin.

Several individuals are mentioned in the study document in connection with their own publications. But they merit mention here as well. I am especially grateful to Walter Rea for opening his home to me for several days and allowing me to take notes from his research materials which later came to light in the publication of his book, The White Lie (Turlock, California: M & R Publications, 1982). Though I approached my research differently and did not agree with his interpretation of the data, much of what I found agreed with his evidence. The same kind of assistance was provided by Norman Jarnes of Verdict Publications. He allowed me to borrow some of the documentation used by Robert Brinsmead in writing several chapters in Judged by the Gospel (Fallbrook, California: Verdict Publications, 1980) having to do with Ellen White's method of writing. The use of their materials saved us many hours of searching for literary parallels and for this kindness on their part I am very thankful.

The library of the San Francisco Theological Seminary, San Anselmo, California, provided most of the 19th century lives of Christ, devotional works, and sermon materials surveyed in this study. Additional volumes were obtained through the member libraries of the Graduate Theological Union of Berkeley, California, and through the services of our own inter-library loan personnel, Lois Normington and Gary Shearer. Other faculty and staff members of Pacific Union

PREFACE

College who offered assistance were Keith Anderson and Richard Rockwell who helped with the random selection of the 15 chapters, Jeannie Crandall who assisted in the search of early Adventist literature, Willian Van Grit who provided English translations of selections from Ellen White's French edition of the life of Christ, and Larry Richards who early in the study worked with Samuel Andrews' chronology and harmony of the Gospels and more recently offered some very useful editorial suggestions.

Finally, apart from the members of my family, there are four persons who merit the highest praise for their patience, their competence, and their dedication on behalf of this project. I still have to stop and wonder at times how it came to pass that these four individuals were both willing and able to work on the project just when they were needed. Barbara (Belleau) Williams, a teacher of secretarial science and office administration, was looking for a part-time job when I took over the project in the fall of 1980. Her special skills were needed when the major tasks involved correspondence and organization. She helped me lay the foundation for the research.

Once the volunteers were selected and the research tasks were assigned Barbara left and Marcella Anderson applied for the half-time position as research assistant. Marcella had been working as a volunteer for nearly a year. She brought to the project a thorough knowledge of the Ellen G. White writings, a passion for hard work and a dedication to detail.

PREFACE

Throughout the remaining years of the project, Marcella has adjusted the demands of her personal life to the requirements of the project, volunteering many hours in addition to those she was hired to fulfill. Her untiring efforts have made possible the success of this research project. There is no way my remarks can communicate the depth of my gratitude to Marcella Anderson.

Just at the height of the research, when I was busy selecting the Ellen White documents through frequent trips to Washington and beginning the analysis and the writing, we needed another part-time helper in the office. Once again one of our volunteers, a retired English professor, joined our staff. Paul Stauffer had become interested in the literary aspects of the study through his work as a volunteer and he provided the professional assistance we needed in developing the literary criteria for comparative analysis, transcribing the handwritten documents from Ellen White's journals and providing editorial suggestions for the research report. When the General Conference terminated its financial support Paul offered his assistance on a volunteer basis when needed. I am indeed deeply indebted to Paul Stauffer for his guidance, suggestions, and personal help throughout the last six years.

The fourth person who merits special mention in this list of personal assistants is Alice Holst. Alice is a retired secretarial science teacher who with Geneva Durham served as volunteers in searching for literary parallels and providing several kinds of research assistance. What is remarkable

PREFACE

about the contribution of Alice Holst is her volunteering to read the entire research document and note errors, grave syntax problems, to suggest where explanatory remarks were necessary, and simply to provide the kind of careful editorial work a document of this nature with all of its detailed information required. She did not undertake the task of improving my writing style, though I am sure she recognized the need. She simply tackled the thankless job of checking references, making sure the document was accurate in its presentations, and that the text made sense when you read it. How do you express your appreciation for that kind of careful work on a report as long as this one is and for providing all this labor at no cost!

These four individuals who have worked the closest with me and have put in the most labor deserve much of the credit for the completion of this research project and its report. There is no way that a research of this magnitude can be the work of one individual. At the same time, however, it must be clearly understood that responsibility for the research design, the evaluations, and for the writing of the research report with its interpretation of the evidence and the conclusions is mine to bear. This independence applies to the sponsors as well. Even though the General Conference commissioned the study, I was given freedom to direct the research and to draw my own conclusions. The viewpoints expressed throughout the document are my own and not necessarily those of the Adventist church or its officers.

PREFACE

The one person who truly rejoices today is my wife. Renie has spent much time alone over the past eight years, listened to many talks on the topic, sat quietly when conversations at home or during visits to other homes inevitably turned to the subject of this research, and gave up countless weekends and holidays to this project. Her patience with me and her willingness to endure the extra demands this research placed on our marriage and family life is beyond measure. To Renie, therefore, I am most grateful and hopefully the church is also.

It is now evening on this Memorial Day. As the roll of the snare drums fades into a low rumble and the bugle notes of "Taps" faintly echo across the distant hills, thousands quietly retreat from the silent groves and graves to take up their regular activities once again. Perhaps it is only fitting as I end this preface and shut down the faithful computer and its word processor that I dedicate my labors over the years on this research to those loyal and faithful Adventists who not only have been willing to face the evidence and question their assumptions but also to question their own questions, whatever the cost.

Fred Veltman
Pacific Union College
Angwin, California
May 30, 1988

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	i
TABLE OF CONTENTS	xiii
I INTRODUCTION - PART A	1
II INTRODUCTION - PART B	107
III CHAPTER 3 - "The Fullness of Time"	1
IV CHAPTER 10 - The Voice in the Wilderness	59
V CHAPTER 13 - The Victory	123
VI CHAPTER 14 - "We Have Found the Messiah"	188
VII CHAPTER 24 - "Is Not This The Carpenter's Son?"	262
VIII CHAPTER 37 - The First Evangelists	319
IX CHAPTER 39 - "Give Ye Them to Eat"	363
X CHAPTER 46 - He Was Transfigured	406
XI CHAPTER 53 - The Last Journey From Galilee	440
XII CHAPTER 56 - Blessing the Children	476
XIII CHAPTER 72 - "In Remembrance of Me"	495
XIV CHAPTER 75 - Before Annas ... Court of Caiaphas	543
XV CHAPTER 76 - Judas	670
XVI CHAPTER 83 - The Walk to Emmaus	733
XVII CHAPTER 84 - "Peace Be Unto You"	792
XVIII SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	858
APPENDIX A - <u>DESIRE OF AGES</u> SENTENCE EVALUATIONS	A-1
APPENDIX B - PRE- <u>DESIRE OF AGES</u> TEXT EVALUATIONS	B-1
APPENDIX C - PRE- <u>DESIRE OF AGES</u> LITERARY SOURCES	C-1
APPENDIX D - ELLEN G. WHITE LETTERS, MSS., ETC.	D-i
APPENDIX E - BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCHES, MAJOR SOURCE AUTHORS	E-1
WORKS REVIEWED	W-1
GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY	Z-1

I INTRODUCTION - PART A

The document in your hands is the official report of a research project commissioned by the General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists in early 1980. The study has been long and involved, the report is quite detailed, and sections of it are technical. In view of the fact that many readers will be approaching this report without having had much background in comparative literary analysis and/or in the nature of the problem this study was designed to address, I have intentionally written a rather complete introduction. In the interest of those who have some knowledge of the nature of the project or the historical context in which it was conducted, let me quickly outline the content of the first two chapters of this report.

Chapter I (Introduction - Part A) sets forth the general background and organization of the project. We treat (1) the historical and literary context of the study, (2) the nature and implications of a literary analysis when sacred texts are involved, (3) the method of investigation followed in the research, and (4) the structure of the research report. Under (1) we will briefly review what was known about Ellen White's use of sources from the investigations of others. In that section we will also present a general overview of the concerns in Adventism at the time this study was

INTRODUCTION - PART A

commissioned. In (2) we will address the "faith" aspect of the project. That is to say, we will try to set forth my assumptions and to show why the academic study of sacred texts is in the best interest of preserving those texts. Included here will be a description of literary analysis and some definition of technical terms. The general principles noted under (2) will be specifically applied to this project under section (3). Here we will outline the research process, what we were trying to discover, and what we did not attempt to cover. The criteria for the evaluation levels and the evaluation questions will be fully explained. The final segment of this first chapter will describe the form of the research report, particularly the 15 chapters analyzing the text of The Desire of Ages. The keys to understanding abbreviations, symbols, indentation, text arrangement, and appendices are all identified in section (4).

It will be necessary to say something about the history and nature of the production of The Desire of Ages in Chapter I; but most of the information on Ellen White as a writer, her use of secretaries, and her writings on the life of Christ will be treated in Chapter II (Introduction - Part B). Under section (1) we will discuss the history of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ, with an emphasis on how she wrote The Desire of Ages. We will summarize what we

INTRODUCTION - PART A

knew about her use of sources and her personal writing methods under (2). In part (3) the focus will be on her literary assistants, who they were, and what they did.

The second section of the introduction will not anticipate the conclusions of the investigation. It merely presents some additional background for the study of the text of The Desire of Ages. Ellen White's writing methods and her use of secretaries are described according to the evidence found in her writings or that of her associates. The reader is left to judge whether the conclusions of this research corroborate these earlier claims.

I was asked to make a thorough study of Ellen White's use of sources. The intent was to investigate some of the questions being raised by scholars and students with some background in literary analysis. The report was to be carefully written and detailed so that it would be credible for the critics yet readable and comprehensible for those who are untrained in the area. Often when one tries to do two things at once one fails at both. I trust that this introduction will prove useful to those who have little knowledge of the situation in Adventism which called for the study in the first place, helpful to those who are not acquainted with the technical aspects of literary analysis, and acceptable to those who are familiar with both and find it rather long.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Historical and Literary Background

Over the seven years it has taken to complete this research project, which was first envisioned as a six-month study, many rumors and questions about it have circulated in the church. Individuals have written to me, telephoned me, and contacted me in person. Others have put their questions and comments in tracts and letters circulated among church members. People have questioned the need for the study, the value of the study, and the wisdom of the officers of the General Conference in choosing me to direct the research. Others have said I would never have the freedom to look at all the Ellen White documents in the White Estate office at the General Conference, the General Conference would never make the results of the study known to the church at large, and I could never write an honest report of my findings and still maintain my employment in the Adventist church organization.

It is clear to me that most if not all of those voicing their concerns or their questions to me during the last seven years were honest and loyal Adventists. The doctrinal controversies, the financial disasters of Davenport, and more recently Harris Pine Mills, and the newly-discovered (for many) evidence on Ellen White's writing methods have been troubling to a large segment of the Adventist church,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

particularly those in Europe, Australia, and in North America.

At the same time I have also been confident that the officers of the General Conference and of the White Estate wanted to know the truth and were no less concerned than those who raised the questions about recent developments in the church. I was given the freedom to go anywhere and speak to anyone if such a journey would serve the interests of the project. And Robert Olson, Secretary of the Ellen G. White Estate board, gave me free access to the documents vaults in Washington, D. C. When the historical background and literary context of the 1980s is understood, I think most readers will understand why this study was necessary and why it was organized as it was.

It is well-known by Seventh-day Adventists and other publics that Ellen G. White used the works of other writers in the production of her own works. The first public notice was given by D. M. Canright in 1887.¹ Among the latest public reports was the feature article in TIME magazine, August 2, 1982². In the century between these two dates several major presentations included references to Ellen

¹Michigan Christian Advocate, October 8, 1887, p. 2
[Cited by Francis D. Nichol, Ellen White and her Critics
(Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing
Association, 1951), p. 417.].

²Richard N. Ostling, "The Church of Liberal Borrowings,"
Time, August 2, 1982, p. 49.

White's literary borrowing.

A. G. Daniells, President of the General Conference in 1919, made it clear to the delegates attending that year's Bible Conference that Ellen White had taken material from Wylie, Conybeare and Howson, and Farrar.¹ W. C. White had spoken on the topic before the General Conference in 1911 with respect to the 1911 revision of The Great Controversy² and again in a presentation to the Advanced Bible School at Pacific Union College in 1935.³ The fact of Ellen White's use of sources was also noted by F. D. Nichol in 1951,⁴ by T. Housel Jemison in his college text on Ellen White first published in 1955,⁵ by A. L. White at the North American Academy Principals' Council in 1965,⁶ and by others we shall not take the time to mention here.⁷

¹Molleurus Couperus, "The Bible Conference of 1919," Spectrum, Vol. 10, Number 1, pp. 23-57.

²Cited by Arthur L. White in The Ellen G. White Writings (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1973), pp. 186-191.

³W. C. White, "Addresses to Faculty and Students at the 1935 Advanced Bible School" (White Estate Office), 37 pp.

⁴Francis D. Nichol, Ellen White and Her Critics (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1951), pp. 403-428.

⁵T. Housel Jemison, A Prophet Among You (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1955), pp. 330-350, 420-422.

⁶Cited by Warren H. Johns, "Ellen White: Prophet or Plagiarist?" Ministry, June, 1982, p. 12.

⁷See for example Donald McAdams' "Shifting Views of Inspiration: Ellen G. White Studies in the 1970s," Spectrum,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Though Walter Rea, a pastor in Southern California, called our attention to Ellen White's use of Edersheim as early as 1965,¹ it was probably the work of Ronald Numbers in 1976 which brought the question of Ellen White's use of sources to the attention of contemporary Adventists, particularly college students and teachers.² Arthur White's volume on The Ellen G. White Writings in 1973 covered the question of influences on Ellen White and her sources. His conclusion was that "It is neither correct nor in harmony with the facts to assume that similarity of views indicates that Ellen White gained her information from men, instead of God."³ When he reviews the statements of W. C. White, Ellen White's son and confidant, Arthur White makes the same point.

Vol. 10, Number 4 (March, 1980). Warren H. Johns, op. cit., has indicated where one may find "the first written or published records of borrowing known," in 1982. More recently (May, 1985) Gary W. Shearer, Special Collections Librarian at Pacific Union College, compiled a bibliographical guide to theses, dissertations, books, and periodical articles on Ellen White. In the last ten years numerous articles on the topic have appeared in the Review, Ministry, and Spectrum, and several pamphlets have been circulated by the White Estate Office. Anyone seeking further information on the topic of Ellen White's use of sources would do well to look for articles written by Arthur White, Robert Olson, Ron Graybill, Donald McAdams, Delmer A. Johnson, Paul Gordon, Roger Coon, Donald Casebolt, and David Neff.

¹Walter Rea, Claremont Dialogue, Vol. 2, Number 2, p. 32 as cited by Warren Johns, op. cit.

²Ronald L. Numbers, Propheticess of Health: A Study of Ellen G. White (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1976).

³Arthur L. White, The Ellen G. White Writings (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1973), p. 39 [Emphasis his].

INTRODUCTION - PART A

"Regardless of how W. C. White approached the matter of Ellen White's sources, all statements are in agreement, namely, that the basic concepts came to her in vision."¹ Numbers' work challenged the White Estate position. He argued that there were some problems in harmonizing Ellen White's disclaimers on the use of sources with the claims of James White, Ellen White's husband, and other documentary evidence of the times.² The reputation of Numbers as a scholar, the fact that Harper and Row had published his work, and the picture he drew of Ellen White's work and writings in her own social and spiritual world of the 19th century, was an "eye-opener" for many Adventists.

It was not as though Numbers was the first to show Ellen White used sources, for as we have already indicated that fact had been known in the 19th century. Numbers raised in a public forum the same question being raised "in house" by Donald McAdams and Ron Graybill. Did the sources Ellen White used provide more than incidental details and historical background? McAdams draws the following conclusion on Ellen White's use of Protestant historians.

In short, I believe that nothing in the statements of Ellen White, and those by her son which she endorsed, preclude the view that at least some of the historical

¹Ibid., p. 127.

²Ronald L. Numbers, op. cit., pp. 80-85.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

passages in Great Controversy were taken directly from Protestant historians and were not seen in vision.¹

In addition to the question of "how" literary sources were employed by Ellen White, especially in relation to the role of visions, there was the matter of extent. When the officers of the White Estate and the works of Nichol and Jemison had mentioned the fact of Ellen White's literary indebtedness, the extent of borrowing was usually minimized. Jemison argued that "the problem of the accusation of plagiarism may be regarded as limited to these books (Sketches From the Life of Paul, and The Great Controversy)."² Jemison was largely echoing the views of Nichol who had earlier concluded:

Of all this vast amount of matter only an insignificant part is borrowed from other authors. And the borrowed part is most certainly not central to the spiritual theme that distinguishes her writing. Thus if the little that she borrowed were deleted, it would scarcely affect the total of the writings, but much more importantly, it would not affect the quality and the force of the message that is contained in her writings. She borrowed the little she did with no attempt to deceive and for reasons which she clearly stated.³

Arthur White, supporting his position largely by the statements of W. C. White, also claimed that the sources played a very limited role. The amount of space he devotes

¹Donald R. McAdams, "Ellen G. White and the Protestant Historians," unpublished manuscript, 1974, revised 1977.

²Jemison, op. cit., p. 420.

³Nichol, op. cit., p. 467.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

to this aspect of Ellen White's writings in his descriptive account of her writings as well as the following statement bears this out.

There is evidence that she was not shown the names of all of the places and the dates of all the events. The basic conception of the significant events of the controversy story was clearly laid before her in vision. In many cases minor details were not presented. Some of this information could be ascertained from the sacred writings, some from common sources of knowledge, some from reliable historians. Apparently God in His providence did not consider it essential to impart these minutiae through vision.¹

It is no wonder with statements such as these circulating in Adventist textbooks and writings that many would be surprised over what Walter Rea and Donald McAdams were reporting in the late 1970s.² Many Adventists asked if the claims being made that the visions were the major source of Ellen White's information and that sources were used in a minor way to supply such details as dates and specific locations of historical events, were substantiated by the textual evidence. It was becoming increasingly clearer that what McAdams had discovered in his study of The Great Controversy was also becoming apparent in the other books of

¹Arthur L. White, op. cit., pp. 128, 129.

²Walter Rea was in direct correspondence with the White Estate office and later presented a summary of his findings at the Glendale meeting discussed below. Donald McAdams' study of "The Great Controversy, Chapter Six, on 'Huss and Jerome,'" cited above, clearly demonstrated that in producing this chapter Ellen White relied on James A. Wylie, a Protestant historian.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Ellen White, as supported by Rea's work.

The White Estate by this time was recognizing that the source issue was not a passing fancy of a few but was becoming a major interest of many. In response to the inquiries of the field and the new evidence being unearthed through comparative source studies, the White Estate Office not only became more active in its study of the problem but it was beginning to realize that the sources were employed by Ellen White to a greater extent than previously noted. This shift in position is obvious when comparing the series of REVIEW articles of Arthur White in 1978 and 1979 with his earlier statements.¹ Nevertheless, the visions are still given as the dominant source behind The Great Controversy, and The Desire of Ages (as well as her other books).

It seems clear that the visions given down through the years in which the life of Christ was portrayed and the visions repeated while she was working on the manuscript for The Desire of Ages and visions opening up fresh concepts all came into play as basic sources of her writing on the life of Christ.²

The quotations from historians found in The Great Controversy was a matter Adventists had known for some time. The same might be said for Ellen White's earlier work on the life of Paul. But the claims being made in respect to The

¹Arthur L. White, "Inspiration and the Ellen G. White Writings," a reprint of articles published in the Adventist Review during January and February, 1978, and July and August, 1979.

²Ibid., p. 33.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Desire of Ages were for the most part new and unwelcome. In her comments on the life of Christ we have some of Ellen White's most inspiring words and some major theological insights. To many in the church, the possible use of sources for the composition of The Desire of Ages was a more troublesome question than that of using quotations (and paraphrasing) in Great Controversy. The special interest of the White Estate in this new development may be measured by its increased involvement in source studies as the decade of the 1970s closed.¹

¹I am aware that there were those in the church at that time and later who claimed the White Estate was engaged in a cover-up. I do not agree that the policies of the White Estate governing access to and release of Ellen White documents, particularly manuscript copies, are appropriate given the claims of the church regarding Ellen White--i.e., that nearly everything is available in copy form--and the many unanswered questions on which Adventist scholars should be freely working. But at the same time I do not think such a charge has any foundation in fact. In May of 1979 the White Estate began circulating a 47-page document entitled, "How the Desire of Ages was Written." Robert Olson prepared the opening statement and Ron Graybill assisted in the compilation of various exhibits on the history of Ellen White's work on the book, her use of literary assistants, and several pages from a working document on the text. Most of the material consists of excerpts of letters relating to the writing of The Desire of Ages.

The charge of a cover-up involves the judgments of motives and intentions and in my view such an attack is as out of place as is the accusation that those who raise the question of sources or who make the source studies are out to destroy confidence in Ellen White and/or her writings. I have spent hundreds of hours working at the White Estate. That same entity is often under heavy criticism from those in the church who view its positions as quite liberal when it comes to inspiration. Many do not seem to realize that the White Estate office is a resource center rather than a research center. It responds to questions and concerns of

INTRODUCTION - PART A

In addition to its efforts to obtain the services of James C. Cox, Chairman of the Department of New Testament at Andrews University, the White Estate sought the help of two recently retired Adventist Bible scholars to compare the text of The Desire of Ages with William Hanna's life of Christ. Raymond Cottrell reported that a correlation between the text of 11 chapters of The Desire of Ages and the comparable text of Hanna's commentary on the life of Christ was approximately 2.6 percent.¹ Walter Specht, working on the last half of Ellen White's work and focusing on the thoughts more than on a word count as did Cottrell, found some parallels between the two commentaries but concluded that the percentage of the literary borrowing was small.²

The next major turning point following the publication of Ronald Numbers' book on Ellen White was the Glendale meeting between a specially selected committee chaired by Ralph Thompson, Secretary of the General Conference, and Walter Rea, a pastor in the Southern California Conference. Rea had urged the meeting in the interest of clearly showing

both membership and church administrators who seek Ellen White counsel on various matters. Only recently has the general concern in the church over the question of Ellen White's use of sources justified its heavier emphasis on this aspect of Ellen White's work.

¹Raymond F. Cottrell, "The Literary Relationship Between The Desire of Ages, by Ellen G. White and The Life of Christ, by William Hanna," unpublished manuscript, November 1, 1979.

²Walter F. Specht, "The Literary Relationship Between The Desire of Ages, by Ellen G. White and The Life of Christ, by William Hanna, Part II," unpublished manuscript, 1979.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

that Ellen White's use of sources extended far beyond the use of Hanna and involved Ellen White's other writings, including her testimonies.

The committee agreed that Rea's evidence revealed that "Ellen White in her writing, used various sources more extensively than we had previously believed."¹ Robert Olson reported that the White Estate was developing plans to make a broader study of the text of The Desire of Ages than Cottrell and Specht had been asked to do. The Glendale group followed up on this idea by including in its recommendations to the General Conference that such an investigation be made of The Desire of Ages to determine the degree of dependency and nature and significance of that dependency.² The committee also recommended that someone trained in literary analysis work with Walter Rea in the continued study of Ellen White's use of sources. The General Conference President's Executive Advisory Committee (PREXAD), while not approving every recommendation of the special ad hoc committee, evidently agreed with the suggestion that a thorough investigation be made of The Desire of Ages, for shortly thereafter James Cox of Andrews University was selected to direct a General Conference sponsored two-year source study of this very popular work of Ellen White's. Later in the year, after Dr.

¹Douglas Hackleman, "GC Committee Studies Ellen White's Sources," Spectrum, Vol. 10, No. 4 (March, 1980), p. 14.

²Loc. cit.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Cox was called to the presidency of Avondale, I accepted responsibility for this investigation. The White Estate followed up the conclusions of the Glendale Committee with a statement on Ellen White's use of sources and continued its support of the Desire of Ages project which was now to be handled by the General Conference.¹ A most welcome addition to the publications on Ellen White was Selected Messages, Book Three, particularly section III on "The Preparation of the Ellen G. White Books."²

Thus far we have been reviewing earlier reports on Ellen White's literary dependency. We have seen how this study enters the stream of Ellen White research. Obviously this project was not designed to establish the fact that Ellen White used the writings of others to produce her own works. That point cannot be denied. We also knew in 1980 that literary sources provided more than just incidental matters of historical backgrounds. Literary parallels had been found in Ellen White's testimonies and in the recounting of her visions. We had examples of both verbatim and paraphrased quotations. As yet, however, no one had made a thorough study of a complete work or substantial portion of a work.

¹Robert Olson, "Ellen G. White's Use of Uninspired Sources," White Estate Document, April 10, 1980.

²Ellen G. White, Selected Messages, Book III, a compilation by the Ellen G. White Estate (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1980).

INTRODUCTION - PART A

No one had attempted to evaluate her dependency or independence on the basis of literary criteria. Though a number of studies included a consideration of Ellen White's own contribution, Walter Rea's far-reaching probes typically pointed out the similarities without noting the dissimilarities. It is altogether natural that initial studies would stress dependency. Given the general understanding of Ellen White's minimal use of sources, every additional literary parallel would strike one's attention. As far as I know, until this time no one had made a systematic search among 19th-century writers for possible additional sources. Clearly there were enough unanswered questions to justify further research. Before turning to a discussion of the type of research planned, it might be helpful to sketch in broad outline the general historical context of the times.

Walter Rea's disclosure of rather widespread use of literary sources in the Ellen White writings came at the very time that Desmond Ford was meeting regularly with an advisory committee to discuss his views on the sanctuary doctrine as believed by Adventists. Ford, an exchange professor from Avondale College in Australia and at the time on the religion faculty of Pacific Union College, had presented a lecture to the local chapter of the Association of Adventist Forums in

INTRODUCTION - PART A

October of 1979 in which he challenged some of the traditional Adventist views on the sanctuary doctrine.¹ As is nearly always the case, questions on orthodoxy turn on the claims for authority, whether authority of the church in its interpretations of sacred writings or authority of the sources used by the church to establish doctrine. Since Ellen White had written extensively on the sanctuary issues coming under question by Dr. Ford, his views also had implications for the role of Ellen White's writings in Adventism.

Prior to Ford's presentation on the sanctuary he had been a very popular speaker at camp meetings, workers' meetings, and other church gatherings not only in Australia but also during the two years he had been teaching at Pacific Union College. Many in the church were watching to see what would be the outcome of his doctrinal challenge. It was no secret that a good number in the church, particularly among Bible scholars, while not in agreement with Ford's answers were sympathetic with his questions. After all, Ford was not

¹Desmond Ford spoke on the subject of the investigative judgment. He argued that several aspects of the sanctuary doctrine as Adventists traditionally have taught are not in harmony with the teachings of Scripture. His major concern was over the post-resurrection heavenly ministry of Jesus and the significance of 1844 in terms of salvation history. Obviously his views carried implications for how one interprets Ellen White's statements on the topic and the authority of her writings.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

the first to raise some concern in respect to Adventist teachings on the sanctuary.

The issues of Ellen White's use of sources and the sanctuary doctrine were particularly troublesome because they came only two years after Geoffrey Paxton, an Anglican clergyman, published his analysis of contemporary Adventism. He and Robert Brinsmead had circled the Adventist globe urging reform on the Adventist concept of the Christian gospel, particularly in reference to the teachings of the church on "righteousness by faith."¹

History has taught us that often in such times of uncertainty, churches have taken special efforts to reaffirm their beliefs, clarify their doctrinal positions, and even have gone so far as to develop creedal statements. It was perhaps not just a coincidence that the major activity of the business sessions at the General Conference session in Dallas in April 1980 was the development of a revised statement of fundamental beliefs.²

The year 1980 was notable in Adventist history for other

¹I have reference here to Geoffrey Paxton's work on The Shaking of Adventism (Wilmington, Del.: Zenith Publishers, Inc., 1977) and the congresses of Robert Brinsmead whose viewpoints were published in Judged by the Gospel, A Review of Adventism (Fallbrook, CA: Verdict Publications, 1980).

²It is hard for many not to see a heightening of Ellen White's authority in the newly-formulated church statement as it appears under Fundamental Belief 17, "The Gift of Prophecy," Adventist Review, May 1, 1980, pp. 25, 26.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

developments as well. There was a cluster of events: the Sanctuary Review Committee and a Theological Consultation held in August at Glacier View, Colorado; the creation of a new religious magazine obviously directed at an Adventist audience;¹ Desmond Ford losing his Adventist credentials as an ordained minister; Robert Brinsmead publishing his critique of Adventism;² and finally, the feature article in the Los Angeles Times focusing on Walter Rea's research on Ellen White's use of sources and the charges of plagiarism against her.³ The Times report was picked up by newspapers around the globe, and Adventists could not escape the questions being raised over Ellen White's literary practices.

It is beyond the scope of this paper to argue how and to what degree these various events affected the way in which this project was set up, the selection of its director, and the attitude of church members and administrators toward the project. I have no question but that these developments did have their impact, judging from the rumors and questions I have already alluded to and from the reactions of many who

¹Evangelica, edited by Alan Crandall and published by Evangelica Publications, St. Joseph, Michigan, came out in 1980.

²See under footnote on page 18 above.

³John Dart, "Plagiarism Found in Prophet Books," Los Angeles Times, October 23, 1980. Walter Rea has insisted that his use of the term "plagiarism" in respect to the Ellen White writings was made on the basis of Dart's definition. Dart had defined plagiarism as using the writings of others without giving credit to the source.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

attended the various services in 1981 where I was invited to explain the project and its purposes.

We have been describing the literary and historical matrix out of which this research project was born. Before turning to the discussion of the general nature of this literary analysis, it might be well to mention what has happened along these same lines since this investigation has been in progress. Readers who now take this report in hand should also know that others have been working on projects of their own which have a bearing on the current state of affairs in Adventism today.

Ron Graybill presented a series of morning worship talks at the General Conference in November of 1981. Drawing upon his own work and that of others he concluded that Ellen White (1) "made more extensive use of . . . sources than we had previously understood," (2) borrowed words, phrases, and conceptual outlines, and (3) took not only historical and geographical information but also devotional and theological expressions. Graybill suggested that it would be "unwise" to claim that literary borrowing would not be found in any type of writing barring autobiographical material and offered the view that Ellen White's handwritten draft is often closer to the source than later forms of the text.¹ Graybill used as

¹Ron Graybill, "E. G. White's Literary Work, An Update" (Annotated transcript, Nov. 15-19, 1981), 32+ pp.

one of his exhibits the literary parallels from Henry Melvill which were circulated in 1982 as a separate White Estate Document.¹ Apart from his findings in respect to Ellen White's handwritten drafts, which Walter Rea would not have had available for his studies, these three conclusions corroborated what Rea had reported to the Glendale Committee over 18 months earlier. The differences between Graybill's and Rea's reports were in the interpretations of the data and the extrapolations made from what was actually found.

Anticipating the appearance of Walter Rea's book, the major content of which Walter had shared with me and several others, John Robertson put out a short popular defense of Ellen White.² Robert Olson dedicated a section of his compilation from the writings of Ellen White on the sanctuary doctrine to answering questions on Ellen White's method of writing and use of sources, and on plagiarism.³ Rea finally published the results of his studies in 1982 and shortly thereafter his ministerial credentials were withdrawn by the Southern California Conference.⁴ Arthur White completed his

¹"Henry Melvill and Ellen G. White: A Study in Literary and Theological Relationships," White Estate Document, April, 1982.

²John J. Robertson, The White Truth (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1981), 112 pp.

³Robert Olson, One Hundred and One Questions on the Sanctuary and on Ellen White (Washington, D. C.: Ellen G. White Estate, 1981).

⁴Walter T. Rea, The White Lie (Turlock, CA: M & R Publications, 1982).

INTRODUCTION - PART A

biography of Ellen White in 1986. His volume on The Australian Years, 1891-1900, contains a chapter on the writing of The Desire of Ages.¹

Through the efforts of those mentioned here and others who could be added, we gathered more evidence to support what was already known in 1980 when the project began. But nothing in the way of new insights was offered except for Graybill's work on Ellen White's handwritten text on subjects not treated in his and Donald McAdams' previous studies on The Great Controversy. Walter Rea's book, insofar as the Ellen White writings are discussed, mainly served to acquaint many Adventists with the basic issues and evidence presented to the Glendale Committee.² We shall have occasion to refer again to the Ellen White documents presented by Robert Olson and Arthur White when we discuss the background to The Desire of Ages in Part B of the Introduction. A very helpful document for those studying sources used by Ellen White is the compilation of her library works made available by the Ellen G. White Estate in various editions since about 1981.³

¹Arthur L. White, Ellen G. White: The Australian Years (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1983).

²Walter Rea utilizes the evidence of Ellen White's literary dependency as only one element in his argument against the Ellen White Estate and the organizational leadership of the church for what he sees as their manipulation of information on Ellen White. Hence the book's title, White Lie.

³Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier, and Ron Graybill, "A

INTRODUCTION - PART A

This brief survey of developments since 1980 is not meant to be exhaustive. Additional contributions to the subject may be found in the Adventist Review, Ministry, and Spectrum on Ellen White's use of sources, on the use of sources in Scripture, and on the implications of these findings for belief in the inspiration of Ellen White. Elder Wilson presented to the 1985 General Conference session in New Orleans a summary of a preliminary concluding statement I had formulated as a tentative report based upon my findings to that date.¹ Even though the major portion of the research had been completed at the time, the last chapter of this present report should be taken as the final summary and conclusion of the project.

Literary Analysis

When the Glendale Committee reviewed the work of Walter Rea they were impressed by the number of sources Ellen White used, the various kinds of content exhibiting parallels from the sources, and the differing degrees of literary dependency. They recognized that there was enough literary borrowing to merit a serious study of a major work of Ellen

Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries," Ellen G. White Estate, Second Revised Edition, January, 1983.

¹Neal C. Wilson, Adventist Review, July 11, 1985, p. 18.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

White's. They also agreed that they wanted a scholarly comparative study of Ellen White's text and of 19th-century writers.

This type of analysis is one form of literary criticism. The term "criticism" as used in such a study refers to careful and discriminating analysis. When scholars "criticize" a report, an article in a magazine, a text, or the work of another scholar, they do not limit themselves to negative considerations. Many critical reviews are completely positive. "Criticism" as used here is not a loaded term. It carries neither positive nor negative connotations.

Literary criticism may be broadly defined as that branch of knowledge which seeks to understand any work of literature.¹ By "literary" we do not limit the criticism to "belle lettres" (literature judged for its literary magnificence) or to any particular standard of literature. The term may apply to popular as well as to elitist works.

Since there are many ways in which a text may be

¹William A. Beardslee, Literary Criticism of the New Testament (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970), p. 1. While I am indebted to Beardslee for some of the thoughts presented in connection with the discussion on literary criticism, my comments reflect for the most part various studies in the area in connection with my special interest in New Testament interpretation. For further information the reader may consult almost any introduction to the New Testament literature, or any study of Old or New Testament interpretation for that matter.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

approached, with nearly every approach demanding a different methodology, students of literary criticism have found it useful to categorize the various studies according to their specific focus.¹ It may be a study of a text to determine authorship, intention of the author in writing the literary work, an investigation into the content to determine the type of literature a given text is, et cetera. We hear of textual criticism,² form criticism, style criticism, rhetorical criticism, historical criticism, redaction criticism, genre criticism, linguistic criticism, and source criticism, to name a few of the more familiar types of literary criticism. The two ways we approached the text were source criticism and redaction criticism.

In view of the fact that it is difficult to separate form and content, and that source analysis includes a look at forms of literary expression, we found it necessary to give some attention to content criticism. But we should emphasize that this investigation was not concerned in any major way with content analysis. We were not comparing ideas expressed but rather the actual words used to express the ideas.

¹Literary criticism is not always viewed in as comprehensive a scope as is the case with Beardslee. With some writers literary criticism is used as another term for speaking of source criticism. Cf. Norman Perrin, What is Redaction Criticism? (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1969), p. 2.

²The SDA Bible Commentary discusses textual criticism of the New Testament in Vol. 5, pp. 134ff.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Individuals may express the same or very similar ideas yet never have known each other or read each other's works. Christians discussing Bible stories will most likely often express the same ideas. The ideas have become part of the Christian framework or mind set. It would be very difficult to say who has borrowed which idea from whom. Literary dependency, though difficult to establish, does allow us to develop certain criteria or measuring devices by which we can identify to some degree what has been taken from whom. Before discussing further the particular type of literary criticism we employed, it is perhaps best to mention several characteristics of this study which raise special problems. The nature of the literature, the special claims of the writer, and the attitudes of Adventists toward the writings of Ellen White, may in the minds of some rule out any form of literary criticism.

The writings which form the subject matter of this research project are those of a special author, a prophetic personality. Traditionally, especially in the ecclesiastical community where the writings of Ellen G. White have special importance, the literary works of a prophet have been placed on a different level from those of the ordinary writer, even a Christian writer. The qualitative difference of the prophetic experience, ordinarily described under the term

INTRODUCTION - PART A

"inspiration," has usually carried with it a special understanding of the prophet's writing methods, source of information, and even literary standard. To apply the critical methods of scholarship to such writings is viewed by some to be a breach of faith. It is often assumed by devout believers in such prophetic writings that anyone undertaking or promoting such an investigation has in so doing already declared his/her lack of faith in the special claims of the author under review.

To be more specific, serious questions have been raised against this study on the basis that the writer involved, Ellen White, received the content from visions. Would not an investigation looking for literary sources indicate a lack of faith in the prophet's claim to have derived the content of the writings from visions?

It is clear that Ellen G. White claimed to have had visions, dreams, and other special experiences through which God gave her information. She felt under obligation to God to communicate these messages of God to the early Advent believers and later to a more general audience. Her use in the earlier writings of such expressions as, "I saw," "Then I was carried down to," "I was shown," et cetera, were obviously meant to be understood as indicating that what followed originated through this special prophetic experience

INTRODUCTION - PART A

she enjoyed. These same expressions and others of a similar nature occur in a work published in 1864 which carried in the preface this statement by Ellen White, " . . . the great facts of faith, connected with the history of holy men of old have been opened to me in vision; . . ."¹ The fact that her later treatment of these same biblical stories and themes do not include such expressions as "I was shown," is not to be taken as a denial of her original source, or that her prophetic experience has undergone a qualitative change. The publishers of her writings offer the following explanation for the change.

However, as the reading groups greatly broadened to include many who were not acquainted with the source of her information, the author, in keeping with her responsibility, omitted in these later works intended now for the general reader, a few points dealt with in the little volumes that were penned for the church alone.²

In the facsimile reproduction of volume four of The Spirit of Prophecy by Ellen G. White a supplement by Arthur L. White appears. In his account of "Ellen G. White's Portrayal of the Great Controversy Story," the then secretary of the Ellen G. White Estate informs us that when the book

¹Ellen G. White, Spiritual Gifts, Vol. 3 (Battle Creek, Mich.: Steam Press, 1864), p. v.

²Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications, "Preface to Facsimile Edition," Spiritual Gifts, Vols. 3, 4, by Ellen G. White (Battle Creek, Mich.: Steam Press, 1864; facsimile ed., Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1945).

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Spiritual Gifts, Volume I, was republished in 1882, "the phrase 'I saw' and its equivalent were many times omitted."¹

Our point here is not to solve the problem of harmonizing the nature of her inspiration with what we know about her use of materials from other writers and her employment of secretaries and editorial assistants. It is hoped that this investigation of her use of sources in the writings on the life of Christ will make a contribution in that direction. What we are concerned to show here is that the claim of Ellen G. White herself and that of the many who have read her writings over the years does raise special problems for any study specifically directed at locating and analyzing literary parallels between her writings and contemporary or earlier textual materials. Does not the claim to have had visions rule out the possibility of the use of sources? Will not such a dependency upon visions lead one to minimize the use of sources? And contrariwise, will not a serious and rather exhaustive search for possible literary sources be seen as a serious attempt to negate the claim of Ellen White to have had visions or at least diminish the influence of the visions on her writings? And should our

¹Arthur L. White, "Ellen G. White's Portrayal of the Great Controversy Story," The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. 4 by Ellen G. White (Oakland, CA: Pacific Press, 1884; facsimile ed., Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1969), footnote p. 510.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

knowledge that Ellen White used sources be a threat to our faith in the inspiration of these writings? Before we attempt a brief answer to these questions relating to the special kind of literature under investigation, let us turn to another distinctive characteristic of these writings.

The use of sources by Ellen G. White has not been emphasized. In fact, outside the brief notation in the Introduction to the 1888 edition of The Great Controversy we have no such admission by Ellen White. Even there the reference is limited to works of history and to Adventist writers. We do have a number of statements leading the reader to believe she did not use sources of any type. It has been her "unique" prophetic experience which has been stressed. One might reasonably argue that the mind set of the "typical" Adventist reader of the writings of Ellen White, at least until recently, is expressed in the words of James White her husband and associate in the leadership of the early Advent believers:

In her published works there are many things set forth which cannot be found in other books, and yet they are so clear and beautiful that the unprejudiced mind grasps them at once as truth. . . .

If commentators and theological writers generally had seen these gems of thought which strike the mind so forcibly, and had they been brought out in print, all the ministers in the land could have read them. These men gather thoughts from books, and as Mrs. W. has written and spoken a hundred things, as truthful as they are beautiful and harmonious, which cannot be found in the writings of others, they are new to the most

INTRODUCTION - PART A

intelligent readers and hearers. And if they are not to be found in print, and are not brought out in sermons from the pulpit, where did Mrs. W. find them? From what source has she received the new and rich thoughts which are to be found in her writings and oral addresses? She could not have learned them from books, from the fact that they do not contain such thoughts. And, certainly, she did not learn them from those ministers who had not thought of them. The case is a clear one. It evidently requires a hundred times the credulity to believe that Mrs. W. has learned these things of others, and has palmed them off as visions from God, than it does to believe that the Spirit of God has revealed them to her.¹

Another uncommon aspect of this project is the purpose or intention that drives the research. Can one carry out this type of research honestly and with the degree of objectivity necessary for the results to be taken seriously? Will the study receive a fair hearing? Can one writing from within the Adventist faith and tradition be open to the evidence to be found when the subject matter being investigated or read has potentially the power to seriously challenge one's faith? Is one able to stand as it were outside the data? Is it possible for one to put his (or her) existential self "on hold" as it were until the research has been completed so that there remains some kind of "constant" that guarantees the same treatment of the evidence throughout the research task? Can we be sure that one's openness to the data and one's evaluation of the data are consistent throughout the investigation?

¹James White, Life Sketches (Battle Creek, Mich.: Steam Press, 1880), pp. 328, 329.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

In addition to the trauma effected by the nature of the data itself, there are also the external pressures. Can a researcher studying data which may have serious consequences for the faith of many in the community who have a special orientation to the writings of Ellen G. White be faithful to his/her task as well as to the community whose faith he (or she) shares? Is there a greater loyalty to be addressd than a researcher's loyalty to truth, particularly when it must be admitted that at best we do not recognize truth, only our perceptions of truth?

This research task has not originated as some grand flight of fantasy. It is not a matter of pure scholarly interest for the sake of pushing back the frontiers of our knowledge of Ellen White and her writings. We have already indicated above that this research project was conceived, designed, commissioned, and executed in a context in which to some degree questions of theological understanding and doctrinal authority were matters of concern in Adventism. The church administrators sponsoring this research on behalf of the church at large are well aware of the crucial role played by the Ellen G. White writings in the religious life and teachings of the Seventh-day Adventist church. These church leaders are also very much concerned to foster and maintain a strong sense of unity in practice and teaching

INTRODUCTION - PART A

throughout an international church endeavoring to fulfil its mission in an ever-changing and increasingly more complex world. It is only natural for such leadership to question whether this kind of a study, which has the potential of being "counter productive" for the general growth, economic stability, and spiritual strength of the whole church, should be carried out at all.

Our purpose in mentioning these special characteristics of the Ellen White writings and their place in the religious life of Adventists is not to lead the reader to expect that the research will answer questions in the area of Ellen White's inspiration, the content of her visions, her limited admission to using sources, and the authority of her writings in matters of theology. Our point is rather to suggest that this study recognizes the particular character of Ellen White's writings. One does not have to call into question or deny the peculiar aspects of religious writings in order to carry out this type of research. Indeed, it should be stressed that such investigations may enhance our understanding and appreciation of these particular dimensions of the writings.

In addition to the faith or divine side of religious or divine writings there is the objective or human side. The Ellen White writings after all are just that, writings. They

INTRODUCTION - PART A

consist of handwritten diary materials, typescript copies, and published texts. In literary type or genre there are personal diary notations, personal and formal letters, sermons, essays or topical manuscripts, testimonies, magazine articles, and books. The context varies from biography and history, to health, family, church, administration, theology, and Christian life. These textual materials were copied, edited, combined, rewritten, and partially, or at times completely, duplicated by Ellen White and her literary assistants. We also know these writings include the use of contemporary literary sources. In short, it would appear that the writings under study were produced in the same manner as were (and are) other writings, regardless of what additional assistance may have been available to the writers, such as the content of visions, the guidance of the Holy Spirit, or a deep religious experience.

It stands to reason that the appropriate methodology for any given research project is governed by the nature of the data being studied and the kinds of questions being asked of the data. We are studying textual or literary materials. Our method will therefore have to be a literary one. Even though, as we have mentioned, there are various literary methods, all share at least two common assumptions. One basic assumption is that the understanding and appreciation

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of a particular literary composition is greatly enhanced through serious study and reflection as over against mere reading and immediate perception. A second assumption is that the serious study of literature involves a comparison of a given literary composition with a larger literary context or frame of reference.

It is also now generally recognized that there is much profit to be gained by looking at biblical literature or other types of "sacred" literature in just the same way we view other books. What this means, of course, is that the special nature of such "sacred" works will be given the same particular attention that is granted to other types of literature.

For those readers who may be tempted to view this comparative approach to "sacred" or "inspired" literature as demeaning and illegitimate, we would appeal to the internal evidence of the literature itself, at least the literature of the Bible. The Scriptures make it clear that the prophet, the priest, and even the Messiah were fully human and were taken from among ordinary men and women. If it was not inappropriate for God to become flesh and dwell on earth as a man among men, surely it should not be so strange to find that His Word is among us as man's word. If God communicates His Word to us only through the "otherness" of Scripture, how

INTRODUCTION - PART A

would we hear, understand, and respond? Indeed, it is the very identity of God's Son and God's Word with humanity and human word that is so scandalous for faith to accept.

But to admit that the literature of the Bible or other "sacred" literature may be treated in the same way that we seek to understand other literature, is additionally to recognize that the interpreter must also take into consideration the special claims of the religious text. Literature claiming inspiration must be read in the context of an attitude of faith. If the believer is to include the more objective or human dimension in his or her study, the student of the text should also include the faith perspectives in the analysis. What we mean is that even though the "faith" aspect of the text may not methodologically be examined by literary methods, neither should literary methods be so used or applied as to rule out the faith dimension.

The point we are endeavoring to make at this juncture is to insist on the necessity of looking at religious literature in the same way as we do other literature. This approach, rather than eliminating or demeaning the special nature of such literature, demands that its particularity be seriously confronted. The Godward side is not to be neglected in favor of the manward aspect. To do this would be inconsistent with

INTRODUCTION - PART A

the claims of the methodology, particularly as it is recognized by the best literary critics of today. Admittedly, the inclusion of a "faith" dimension in such scholarly research causes tension. But if such tension is openly admitted and self-conscious, it can be used creatively to enhance the study and lend integrity to the investigation. There is no way an unbeliever can understand the significance of a literature that presupposes belief on the part of the reader. Both believer and unbeliever, however, should be able to appreciate the literary dimensions of the vehicle through which the message to be grasped by faith comes to expression. The swaddling clothes of the Christ child were probably very much like the swaddling clothes of other Bethlehem children.

In the light of these assumptions the literary analysis focuses on the text and how it compares with contemporary texts. The inspiration of Ellen White, the fact that she had visions, the guidance of the Holy Spirit in her work, and her own devoted Christian commitment is assumed. These claims of Ellen White are not disputed. We are looking only at the evidence of the text, Ellen White's text, the text produced by her literary helpers, and the published text in the context of comparable literature of her times. In respect to this study our interest does not extend to the effect of the text on the reader. We are not making an audience analysis

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of any of the texts coming under our examination. Our concern is with the text itself, particularly its source and redaction. We shall be using the generally applied methodologies for these approaches, but first some definitions and cautions are in order.

Source Criticism or Analysis. Source criticism endeavors to determine if and to what degree a given writer used sources in the production of his literary work. It seeks to discover the number of sources used and the nature of these sources--that is, were they oral or written--and how such sources were used by the writer. The emphasis of source critics is usually placed upon the sources or building materials used by the later author. The location of sources is largely accomplished by establishing the existence of literary parallels between a given writing and earlier textual materials.

Source criticism as a modern literary approach to the text owes its origin, at least in part, to "a reaction against the older purely dogmatic approach to Scripture, which viewed it as supernatural revelation divorced from its historical background. . . ."¹ Like most reactions, the pendulum swung too far at first and the special supernatural claims of Scripture were disclaimed or at least neglected.

¹Donald Guthrie, New Testament Theology (Leicester, England: Inter-Varsity Press, 1981), p. 34.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Indeed, among certain scholars even the religious nature of the text was not taken into consideration when making literary comparisons. It is now understood that one need not discount the faith dimension to do serious study in the area of source analysis. There are, however, some serious cautions to be kept in mind when making source critical studies. William S. Peterson, at the time Professor of English, University of Maryland, recognized and underscored several such cautions when studying Ellen White's writings.

Any literary scholar can tell us that "source studies" are among the most treacherous tasks to under-take, for merely establishing a similarity--even a marked similarity--between two literary texts is not sufficient evidence of borrowing. One must also demonstrate (a) that text B was written after the publication of text A (the presumed "source"), (b) that the author of text B could be reasonably supposed to have had access to text A, and (c) that the ideas or even the language of text A have not become sufficiently dispersed so as to be, in effect, the common literary property of the age.

It is this third condition that is especially important to keep in mind in dealing with Mrs. White's books. Although many Adventist readers today are not aware of it, the types of books that Mrs. White wrote--particularly the Conflict of the Ages series--represent very common genres in the nineteenth century. In any large university or seminary library one will find row on row of Victorian lives of Christ, most of them done in approximately the same manner as The Desire of Ages. Frequently the engravings, the chapter titles, the style, and the pattern of development are virtually identical. To an Adventist who has been raised on The Desire of Ages, reading these books can be an eerie experience, evoking as it does the shock of recognition and the sudden realization that The Desire of Ages belongs to a recognizable literary category; one becomes aware that it was not produced in a vacuum. Obviously to isolate specific "sources" or

INTRODUCTION - PART A

"influences" in such a context is difficult, for we are confronted instead with an entire atmosphere of shared literary assumptions and habits.¹

Samuel Sandmel, the late Jewish New Testament scholar, pointed out what might be regarded as the "occupational hazard" of source criticism. He called this dangerous tendency among those doing source studies "Parallelomania," which he defined as "that extravagance among scholars which first overdoes the supposed similarity in passages and then proceeds to describe source and derivation as if implying literary connection flowing in an inevitable or predetermined direction."² Students of Old Testament and New Testament studies are cognizant of the almost assumed close association of the Genesis creation stories with the Babylonian creation myth and John the Baptist with the people of Qumran. The excitement of finding certain parallels appears to cloud the eyesight and narrow the vision. The differences are somehow underplayed or overlooked and connections are established upon the flimsiest of bases. Once the initial shock of the discovery fades and calmer attitudes prevail, the scene changes in color and the picture becomes much more complex.

Another danger in source criticism is the tendency to

¹William S. Peterson, "Ellen White's Literary Indebtedness," Spectrum, Autumn, 1971, pp. 78, 79.

²Samuel Sandmel, "Parallelomania," JBL, LXXXI (1962), pp. 1-13.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

give all parallels the same importance. Sandmel warns us that "Two passages may sound the same in splendid isolation from their context, but when seen in context reflect difference rather than similarity."¹

We tried to accommodate these variables by developing a list of criteria to be followed when making the evaluations. We wanted to avoid the common pitfalls of source studies as mentioned above. In addition we wanted to design a system of evaluation which would reflect the special nature of the text under study. This meant that we had to allow for some parallels to have been strongly influenced by the biblical text. Other parallels had to be evaluated in terms of "stock" words, that is, words that any number of religious writers (in this case) might well have chosen were they writing on the same topic at that time. We also had to allow for the nonparallels or independent comment of Ellen White. Each sentence, whether dependent or independent, has to be evaluated for its importance as a parallel or nonparallel on its own merits as well as in terms of the role that particular sentence plays in the context. As Peterson said, this kind of study is very difficult to carry out.

We admit that any study incorporating criteria designed to avoid these pitfalls will necessarily result in minimal

¹Ibid., p. 2.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

claims for parallels. But in the light of the nature of our task, one fraught with the perils of subjectivity, it is probably better to err on the side of understatement.

Redaction Criticism or Analysis. Redaction criticism, particularly as used by students of Scripture, attempts to identify the theological intention or motivation of the writer who put the text in the form we have it today. For example, the stories in the Gospels on the life of Jesus are not arranged in the same order in all four accounts or even in the narratives of Matthew, Mark, and Luke. The term "redaction" is based upon a Latin root meaning "to edit." We may briefly define redaction criticism then as that type of literary criticism which "is concerned with studying the theological motivation of an author as this is revealed in the collection, arrangement, editing, and modification of traditional material, and in the composition of new material or the creation of new forms. . . ." ¹ Biblical interpreters as yet have not come up with an English equivalent, apart from "redaction," to speak of the process of arranging or modifying a text apart from our word "edit" which does not have a noun form with the same basic meaning.

Redaction criticism or analysis deals with the activity of the writer as editor. It may be used to speak of the

¹Norman Perrin, What is Redaction Criticism (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1969), page 1.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

writer's arrangement of his or her original composition but more often the term refers to the way in which an original text has been modified. Our study does not make a serious attempt to apply redaction analysis to Ellen White's writings but at the same time we could not altogether avoid a limited study of redaction in The Desire of Ages. We know Ellen White engaged in a certain amount of selectivity when using the materials of other writers. In addition, there is the structuring of the earlier Ellen White materials into manuscripts, articles, and books by Ellen White and her editorial staff. We did not analyze the revised text to discover the theological or other intention of Ellen White and/or her literary assistants. We were interested, however, to ask if the thematic arrangement of the chapters or the literary subunits of the chapters showed literary dependence on a given author from whom literary parallels were taken. Redaction criticism forces us to look beyond the isolated literary parallel provided by a sentence or two to the larger context. Source dependency or independency is not only registered at the point of a specific sentence but in the way the composition as a whole has been put together.

As with source analysis, redaction studies also call for careful scrutiny. Similarity in theme development may be due to the common biblical narrative used by all authors. As

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Peterson has warned us, the story of Jesus' life and ministry was treated in so many Victorian lives (of Christ) that all writers had a common literary pool from which to draw. In view of this widespread literary genre, commonality would not necessarily indicate dependency. We will have to look for unusual aspects of a given writer, indisputable use of similar if not identical language expression, and perhaps reference to extrabiblical elements to establish dependency.

It might be helpful in this connection to remind the reader once again that we are not primarily concerned to locate the source of the ideas which come to expression in the E. G. White writings, even though content study is required for redaction analysis. Ideas and concepts often float, as it were, in the air of the times. Any writer or speaker, including the prophetic personality, is a product of his or her world even when the messages are in opposition to that world and its views. At any given time there are streams of common thought patterns running through the minds of a given sector of society. Ellen Harmon White was a devout Christian from the days of her early teens. She heard many sermons in the religious services she attended. She traveled widely from her late teens throughout the major portion of her life, often speaking herself or listening to others proclaim Christian messages. In addition to her

INTRODUCTION - PART A

reading in books she read the religious journals of the day. And finally, there is the matter of her visions and dreams which according to her claims did include some propositional content. And when one stops to remember that at the root of all her writings were the Bible and the Christian teachings of those who held the Bible as their authority for religious faith and practice, it becomes a rather delicate, indeterminate task to isolate even the probable sources for the ideas to be found in her writings. Our efforts at redaction will be directed, rather to discover which ideas govern her use of sources. Or to put it another way, we will want to see if certain ideas dominate the dependent material as compared with the independent text. Such a comparison may help to isolate whatever literary or theological intentions Ellen White may have had and thereby help us discover her principles of selectivity. It is the result of this distillation process which is of primary interest to us. The study of the process is only important for the assistance it provides in distinguishing the finished product from the materials available independent of process.

Even in our application of source criticism to the Ellen White writings there will be some distinctions from the typical concerns of this discipline. We are not concerned to locate, necessarily, the precise literary sources used by

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Ellen White in a particular sentence. For example, the location of an exact literary parallel between Ellen White's material and an earlier text does not prove that Ellen White used that source. Since it is well known that literary borrowing was not unique to Ellen White, both of these writers may have borrowed verbatim from a third work, a common source. Nevertheless such an instance of parallelism will be useful for our purposes. We are interested in locating those places where Ellen White depended to some extent on the literary work of another. It matters not if we have located the exact source. Once we have located as many of these parallels as possible, given the time and staff limitations, we will have some indication of her degree of literary dependence and independence.

Organization and Methodology

The work of organizing the various tasks and developing the proper methodology of a carefully constructed research project are both interrelated and separate activities. By organization we refer to the overall plan or protocol of the entire study. Method has to do with those aspects of the research which involve the research data, such as collection, analysis, and evaluation. Both organization and methodology

INTRODUCTION - PART A

are to a large degree influenced by the nature of the data to be studied, the amount of information available, the number and kind of inquiries to be made of the data, the number of researchers, and the time available. Obviously finances play a very important role in most studies because funds determine how many can be employed on the project for a given period of time.

We could not avoid introducing some aspects of organization and method in the previous section where we discussed the general type and form of literary research under which our project falls. For example, we set forth some of the limits to our study and described the basic approach of source and redaction analysis. In this segment of the report we will outline the protocol or procedure of this specific research project.

Organization. The original design called for a thorough study of at least the full text of The Desire of Ages. Since it was also known that the material Ellen White was producing on the life of Christ "overflowed" into two additional books, Thoughts From the Mount of Blessing (published in 1896) and Christ's Object Lessons (published in 1900), some thought it might be well to cover the entire scope of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ. The General Conference planned for the study to be completed in two years by a staff

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of one full-time researcher and one or two part-time graduate student helpers. With both financial and time constraints determined, the only place left for adjusting the investigation would be in the number of questions to ask and the amount of literature to cover.

After studying the nature of the problem for three months and feeling the pressure of three months of the time period already taken up by the selection of the research director, I decided that the project had to be cut down in size. We would have to limit the investigation to a strict source study, omitting questions of content and the issue of plagiarism.

But it would take more than a reduction in the scope of the inquiries. We would have to reduce the textual base to be analyzed. There was no way we could cover the full text of The Desire of Ages, let alone the other two books created out of the "leftovers." It was now clear to me that The Desire of Ages was a composite work, constructed from a compilation and a revision of Ellen White's earlier materials and from texts specifically written for this new publication on the life of Christ. The source studies would obviously have to include the text of The Desire of Ages, for that is the basic work of Ellen White on the life of Christ. But we would also need to analyze Ellen White's manuscripts,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

letters, diary notations, and published articles if we were to locate her use of sources.

It was not only the magnitude of the Ellen White textual materials forcing us to limit the scope of the study. We also discovered from our investigation of possible sources on the life of Christ that we faced literally hundreds of works to be reviewed. The two-year time period was an impossible target if we planned on doing a thorough work. We struggled with the problems of getting more help and cutting down the size of the project without jeopardizing the usefulness of the conclusions or compromising the integrity of the research.

The study was organized into five phases, the search for literary parallels, the evaluation of every Ellen White sentence for degree of dependency or independency, the analysis of the findings for each chapter, the summarization and conclusion of the study, and finally writing the research report. To save time and provide for some measure of consistency we designed a series of summary questions to be asked of each chapter once we had made the analysis. This permitted us to write up the report for each chapter as the analysis was completed.

Research responsibilities were divided according to time commitments and the demands of the project. When it became

INTRODUCTION - PART A

clear that optical scanners were not at the stage of development where they could read the various type fonts used in the sources or in Ellen White's writings, including handwritten texts, and there was no money to pay people to type the texts for entry into computer memory banks, we decided to ask for volunteer help. We asked the volunteers to become well acquainted with the text of one chapter (in some cases two chapters) of The Desire of Ages. These volunteer assistants would check the Ellen White text with the photocopy of the comparable portion(s) of a 19th-century life of Christ sent to them. Each volunteer had instructions, marking pencils, and charts by which they would indicate the literary parallels they found between the two texts. This process would be repeated for each of the sources reviewed.

The sources did not include Adventist writers. We knew of no commentary on the life of Christ written by an Adventist, but doubtless Ellen White had listened to or read sermons on the life of Christ by Adventist preachers. When we limited the scope largely to books on the life of Christ it automatically ruled out Adventist works. Had we decided to include Adventist sermons there would have been the additional problem of establishing the independence of these sermons from Ellen White's messages on the life of Christ

INTRODUCTION - PART A

which in turn many Adventist ministers certainly had heard and perhaps noted.¹

To reduce the amount of text to what we hoped would be manageable size for a two-year project and yet permit us to draw valid general conclusions was a challenge. At first we thought it might be possible to cover at least the text of The Desire of Ages, the major work of Ellen White on the life of Christ. Further investigation of the texts involved convinced us we would not be able to cover even two-thirds of the 87 chapters of this popular book. It was finally decided that we could investigate with acceptable thoroughness 15 chapters. Even then, as the time commitment and cost, as well as the length and complexity of the study show, a gross underestimate was made of the effort that would be necessary.

At one time we considered dividing the chapters of The Desires of Ages into categories according to their content and selecting one or two chapters from each type. This approach was scratched when we discovered the content of most chapters was mixed between biblical, extrabiblical, historical, narrative, theological, devotional, and other such categories. Even if this classification scheme had proved possible there was the problem of selection within the

¹See under Part B of the Introduction, page 111, note 1, for further comment on the issue of Adventist influence in the writing of The Desire of Ages.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

types. We had received suggestions from interested observers that we include certain chapters for their known dependence or independence.

The selection of the sample chapters was not a complex process; but to eliminate any question of bias and because our purpose was to make inferences about the entire book, Desire of Ages, rather than just about the 15 chapters studied, it was decided to turn over to the Pacific Union College mathematics department a list of the 87 chapters, ordered with respect to length, and requested that five chapters each be selected from the 29 shortest, 29 middle-length, and 29 longest chapters in the book. Such a stratified random sample was drawn by Professors Richard Rockwell and Keith Anderson using a random number table and simple, standard procedure. It is these 15 statistically selected chapters that have been the focus of The Desire of Ages research project.

The only point at which I influenced the selection was in the stratification of the chapters according to length. There were those who had claimed that Ellen White's enlarging of her comments from her earliest published work to the text of The Desire of Ages was due to her increased dependency upon literary sources. Since The Desire of Ages represents a serious revision of the earlier texts, and our chapters do not match in content the chapters of The Spirit of Prophecy,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Volumes II and III, the only way we had to check on the correspondence between dependency and length was to take into consideration the length of the chapters in our text. By taking the average number of words in a line of text, counting the lines on each page, taking into account the space taken by pictures or partial pages of text, and counting the pages for each chapter, I drew up a list of the 87 chapters numbered in sequence from shortest to the longest.

One control chapter was randomly selected from the 15. The content of these 15 chapters became the control for locating earlier Ellen G. White material and for selecting source materials for our comparative study. At times this division of text by chapters rather than by content gave us problems. The earlier texts of Ellen White and the chapters of the Victorian lives of Christ holding possible literary parallels did not always agree on content. For example a source might have the three temptations of Christ in one chapter where The Desire of Ages covers this Jesus event in two. The limiting of the comparison to the one chapter may have resulted in missing some literary parallels.

While the volunteers were checking the sources against the text of The Desire of Ages we were following the same program for the earlier Ellen White writings. During periodic visits to the Ellen G. White Estate office in

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Washington, D. C., I read and scanned all of her diary journal entries, letters, and manuscripts dating from her earliest writings in the late 1840s to December of 1898 when The Desire of Ages was published. All references to the life of Christ were noted and copies of these pages were taken to the project office for sorting to match the content of the 15 chapters and then for comparison with the contemporary writings on the life of Christ that we were collecting from libraries throughout the U. S. A. At the same time we were locating the articles on the life of Christ published in Adventist journals and Ellen White's comments on this same content published in her earlier books and testimonies. All of these textual materials were copied and filed in notebooks chronologically according to chapter content.

Once we had collected and collated both the entire textual tradition of Ellen White on the content of a given chapter and that of the sources into notebooks, the tedious and laborious task of comparison was carried out. The parallels located by the volunteers, as well as those supplied by others who had studied the text of The Desire of Ages,¹ were examined and every source was also read at the project office comparing the contemporary writers with the

¹Major contributors to our beginning stock of literary parallels for the text of The Desire of Ages were Walter Rea, Norman Jarnes of Verdict Publications (Fallbrook, California), and Robert Olson and Ron Graybill of the Ellen G. White Estate office.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

earlier writings of Ellen White not available to the volunteers. After more than 500 possible literary sources were reviewed, the parallels isolated were evaluated according to the methodology described below and were formatted so that they could be read in parallel arrangement on matching pages.

The final stages of the organization involved the analysis of our findings and writing of the research report which are fully detailed under the last section of this chapter. Throughout the years it has taken to complete this study the officers of the General Conference have been kept informed. During the first three years a progress report was presented each year. A preliminary statement of our findings was sent to Neal Wilson for presentation to the 1985 General Conference session in New Orleans. A special review committee was established late in 1985 and 11 chapters of the research report were reviewed at a special meeting in early February of 1986. The final statement has been revised in part to meet some of their suggestions, particularly in the presentation of the textual materials for purposes of greater clarity. Additional points on the final form of the report follow below. We turn now to a more detailed review of our method of literary analysis and evaluation.

Methodology. Methodology is the heart of a research project. The purpose of research is to arrive at valid

INTRODUCTION - PART A

conclusions. The conclusions of any research task are governed by at least four factors. If the results of a study are to be convincing, there must be an adequate data base to support the claims being made, the methodology must be consistent with the type of evidence being evaluated, the methodology must be consistently applied, and the interpretation of the evidence must not intrude upon the collection of the data or the execution of the methodology. When the subject matter of an investigation involves questions of religious faith for the researchers, the sponsors, and the intended readers, as is the case with this project, the above factors are all the more crucial for the success of the research project.

It is these considerations which have guided us in the design of this research project. The following comments set forth how the research procedures attempted to fulfill the conditions of the methodology chosen.

This study was commissioned to include at the minimum not a chapter or two from Ellen White's pen but an entire book of 87 chapters. No previous study of Ellen White's use of sources ever set out to cover so much of her material. We have already described how we were forced by Ellen White's method of writing to include her earlier works as well, and by our time and financial limitations to narrow the scope of content from 87 to 15 chapters.

On the other side of the equation, however, there was

INTRODUCTION - PART A

the question of possible sources. What sources were available to Ellen White? How could we be sure our research of likely sources was broad enough to validate our conclusions? After all, the study was designed to establish the extent of Ellen White's use of sources, not the fact that she used sources. This would mean the surveying of a large number of works which one might reasonably expect Ellen White would have had available and of the type she would likely have consulted.

We started at ground zero. We began with the list of books already known to have been used by Ellen White in writing The Desire of Ages. Our second approach took us to the library lists found among the documents drawn up at the death of Ellen White for the settlement of her estate.¹ From that point we noted the publishers of the books we knew she had consulted on the life of Christ. We located other works they advertised and/or published. Obviously we selected our books in the English language, published prior to Ellen White's time of writing, and those generally listed as Victorian lives of Christ, since the lives known to have been used by her were generally found in this category. We also made some effort to look among books of sermons and

¹These inventory lists were later compiled by Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier, and Ron Graybill and published by the Ellen G. White Estate as A Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries, 2nd revised ed., Jan., 1983.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

devotional thoughts. The full list of over 500 works that were studied has been appended to this report. We would argue that as a result of these efforts we do have an adequate data base for supporting our conclusions.

The fundamental methodology for this source analysis, as we have noted above, comes from the discipline of literary criticism. Such an approach is not only direct in the selection of comparative texts but also in the way in which the comparisons are made. We have already emphasized how one must be careful to establish that a parallel is truly there. Even though opinion is necessarily involved, there must be some way to argue for literary dependency from factual evidence as well. In addition, the evaluation of literary dependency should allow for some measurement of the degree of dependency or independency. And above all, measures must be taken to insure a basic consistency in the evaluation process.

Walter Specht approached his comparative study of a portion of the text of The Desire of Ages and William Hanna's Life of Christ using the criteria given by Alfred M. Perry.¹ Perry's criteria have been used in analyzing the similarities and differences between the first three Gospels, Matthew, Mark, and Luke.

¹Walter F. Specht, op. cit., pp. 1, 2.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

The two criteria of dependence upon written sources are resemblance and continuity. Proof here does not rest upon casual similarity but upon the following rather definite similarities:

1. Resemblance of the contents: telling the same stories.
2. Resemblance in continuity: telling the stories in the same order.
3. Similar sentence and word order: telling the stories in the same way.
4. Extensive agreement (50 per cent to 60 per cent) in the words used.
5. Agreement in using unusual words or harsh constructions.

The concurrence of all these lines of evidence makes an impressive argument for dependence upon written sources, and agreements in wording (items 4 and 5) would rule out the likelihood of independent translations. But where this concurrence is not consistent or close, it is not safe to consider documentary dependence proved. To account for such lesser resemblances other possibilities must be explored.¹

As Specht also notices, these criteria while useful in source studies on Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ are not always applicable. The basic source behind both Ellen White and her contemporary writers is the Bible. Correspondence between commentators on the life of Christ, especially in respect to telling the same stories and presenting them in the same way, may be explained on the basis of a common source used independently rather than on literary dependency between them.²

¹Alfred M. Perry, "The Growth of the Gospels," The Interpreter's Bible, Vol. VII (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1981). p. 62.

²Specht, op. cit., p. 2.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

The differences between the literature we are comparing and that of the Gospels and the fact that we also wanted to weight the criteria for purposes of indicating the degree of dependency prompted us to develop our own set of guidelines. The list of criteria with brief descriptions and the dependency rating values may be found on the following three pages. At this point we would offer a more complete explanation of their nature, the rationale behind their development, and how they are applied.

Ellen White's narrative commentary on the life of Christ, while built upon the Bible record, includes much more than may be found in the Gospel stories of the New Testament. She weaves into her account background information, moral lessons to be learned, devotional appeals, doctrinal teachings, and details on how God and the angels, as well as Satan, view the experiences of Jesus. The variations she plays on the central Bible theme taken from the life of Christ are so diverse that the unit of comparison has to be smaller than the story or even the paragraph. On the other hand, the ways in which she combined various thoughts into one sentence, or in which her literary assistants revised and combined her sentences, tempted us to use a phrase as the basic unit of comparison. Taking the small portion of text would permit us to isolate those phrases which were dependent

INTRODUCTION - PART A

TYPES AND CRITERIA OF LITERARY PARALLELS

- | I. <u>VERBATIM</u> | LEGEND VALUE |
|---|--------------|
| 1. Strict Verbatim | (V1) [7] |
| Exact duplication of all words and syntax | |
| 2. Verbatim | (V2) [6] |
| Slight modification of word forms, incidental word substitutions or punctuation changes | |
|
II. <u>PARAPHRASE</u> | |
| 1. Strict Paraphrase | (P1) [5] |
| A. Significant verbatim similarities | |
| B. Parallel structural elements | |
| C. Identical or nearly identical ordering of sentence elements | |
| D. Obvious substitution of synonyms or variants | |
| 2. Simple Paraphrase | (P2) [4] |
| A. Striking verbatim words or phrases which establish relationship to the source | |
| B. A number of identical words not necessarily unusual or striking, but occurring together and in a sentence whose context gives evidence of additional parallels | |
| C. The sentence presents a thought very closely resembling (though not necessarily identical to) the source | |
| D. Frequently this type of paraphrase offers a shortened, condensed, simplified, or clarified version of the source parallel | |
| E. When simple paraphrase treats extrabiblical material its dependency upon the source may be considered equal to that of strict paraphrase | |
| 3. Loose Paraphrase | (P3) [3] |
| A. A presentation of a very similar idea to that of a given source in a context where (1) verbatim or closer paraphrase is also found | |

INTRODUCTION - PART A

- (2) the development of an idea is progressing in substantially the same order as in the source
 - (3) often a few verbatim words appear in the sentence suggesting dependency and
 - (4) frequently it is compressing or summarizing a more fully elaborated passage
- B. When loose paraphrase treats extrabiblical material its dependency upon the source may be considered equal to that of simple paraphrase

III. BIBLE

1. Bible (B2) [0]

When the use of the Bible text may be explained on the basis of both writers following a common knowledge of the biblical materials, or when Ellen White uses the Bible independently, the Bible as a literary source is noted but not evaluated

2. Source Bible (B1) [2]

When any use of the Bible (direct or indirect quotation, strict or loose paraphrase, partial or complete text) may be accounted for from the special use of the Bible by the source and not on the basis of common usage of the Bible (Bible verses commonly associated with the theme or Bible story being treated)

IV. INDEPENDENT

1. Strict Independence (I1) [0]

- A. Where the thought presented does not show itself to be dependent upon the source by reason of
 - (1) common literary expression
 - (2) parallel context development
 - (3) specific opposing thoughts to source
- B. Where there is reasonable doubt of dependency when applying the above criteria to literary units in a given context where other literary units reveal dependency
- C. Where no source has been located for the literary expression of the content whether

INTRODUCTION - PART A

in a context where dependency is otherwise indicated, or where dependency is not established

- D. Where Ellen White includes use of the Bible as part of her comments, but not similar use of the Bible appears at this location from a source

2. Partial Independence

(I2) [1]

- A. When the unit of comparison includes a category of paraphrase listed above, yet adds or omits a significant thought to or from that found in the source
- B. When the literary unit presents a thought in opposition or addition to the source in the context where
 - (1) the order of presentation and
 - (2) the nature of the contrasting or additional thought expressed can best be explained as having been prompted by the source
- C. Paraphrase of common words found in a source clearly being used in the context but could also be explained as typical usage and therefore evaluated on the side of independence rather than dependence due to doubtful source dependency
- D. Same conditions as (C) above but having reference to a source used sparingly in this context
- E. When the conditions of (C) or (D) above exist but additional or opposing thoughts are present

INTRODUCTION - PART A

from those which were independent in complex sentences. In the end we found this plan to be too idealistic and tedious for the large textual base to be analyzed. We settled on the sentence as the fundamental unit of comparison. However, where it seemed appropriate and useful we did in several instances evaluate independent clauses as separate literary units within compound sentences.

The criteria developed for our comparative study were arranged into nine classifications measuring varying degrees of dependency from the highest dependency of verbatim to nondependency for independent sentences. We do not deny that a measure of arbitrary subjective judgment is involved in the placement of sentences into these categories of dependency/nondependency. At the same time I would argue that while opinions may vary on a given sentence, when several individuals apply the criteria to a good-sized sample of sentences the culminating results are very close. The following descriptions and illustrations are provided as a demonstration of the method of literary comparison used in this study.

The highest level of dependency is the category of "strict verbatim." A verbatim sentence or independent clause is labeled "strict" if it fully duplicates a sentence or independent clause. This kind of construction has identical

INTRODUCTION - PART A

words, word order, and syntax. This level carries the highest dependency rating, 7 points, and as one might expect does not occur frequently. We found this type of dependency more likely to occur in very short sentences. Since a short sentence from one writer is more likely to be identical with a short sentence of some other writer through the use of common language on the same topic, we would also need some further indication of dependency to show the correspondence was not just an isolated coincidence. Two examples of strict verbatim taken from DA chapter 14 material follow.

Manuscript 13, sentence 267 reads--

"The broken links have been repaired."

Manuscript 13, sentence 268 reads--

"A highway has been thrown up along which the weary and heavy laden may pass."

Melvill's sermon on "Jacob's Vision and Vow," sentence 19 reads--

"Yea, we can now thank the 'Lord of heaven and earth,' that the broken links have been repaired, so that the severed parts of creation may be again bound into one household; that a highway has been thrown up, along which the weary and heavy-laden may pass to that rest which remaineth for the people of God."

Even though the full sentence of Melvill was not used, the excerpts taken by Ellen White were verbatim insofar as they went. The sentences of The Desire of Ages are generally shorter than those of the sources, and also of the Spirit of Prophecy written by Ellen White some twenty years earlier.

When the resemblance is not complete due to some slight

INTRODUCTION - PART A

change in word forms or word substitutions, the sentence is identified as simple "verbatim" and given a rating value of 6. Once again we look for additional indications of source dependency to support the claim for verbatim usage of a source. The two sentences taken from the same context as used above clearly demonstrate the "verbatim" category.

Manuscript 13, sentence 256 reads--

"They seemed connected by a path which Deity loved to traverse."

Signs of the Times, July 31, 1884, sentence 35 of an Ellen White article reads--

"Heaven and earth had been connected by a path that the Lord loved to traverse."

Melvill's sermon on "Jacob's Vision and Vow," sentence 12 reads--

"Up to the moment of rebellion there had been free communion: earth and heaven seemed connected by a path which the very Deity loved to traverse."

The sentences from Manuscript 13 and the Signs are very close to what Melvill had written in his sermon. In the first sentence Ellen White substitutes "they" for "earth and heaven" and omits "the very" before "Deity." The second sentence retains "heaven and earth" but in reverse order and replaces "which the very Deity" of Melvill with "that the Lord."

The paraphrase categories allow for more variation in the wording and word order. What is crucial here for establishing literary dependency is the resemblance of the wording, word order, and the arrangement of the sentence

INTRODUCTION - PART A

units. The greater the similarity the higher the dependency. In "strict paraphrase" we would expect close correspondence between significant words and phrases and the structural elements. This type of sentence carries the rating value of 5. In sentences where the verbal similarities are not as great yet the structural elements are basically present I have labeled the sentence as "simple paraphrase" and given it a value of 4. Often sentences of this type will be a condensed version of the source text. When there is little in the way of verbal similarity but the thought is basically the same as the source in a context which clearly contains verbatim words and sentences, we have generally evaluated the sentence as "loose paraphrase" and rated it at a value of 3. In each of these cases we will take into consideration the presence or absence of what might be called corroborating evidence in the immediate context. By this we mean instances of strict paraphrase or verbatim, parallels involving nonscriptural content, and identical or similar thematic development. Let us take a few examples from the study to illustrate these categories of dependency. The source text from March is given first. We then follow with three different ways the content is taken over by Ellen White. The dependency will move from "verbatim," to "strict paraphrase," and finally to "simple paraphrase."

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Daniel March, Night Scenes of the Bible, sentence 30, page 416.

"Nothing in his dress or manner or person leads them to suspect that he can be anything else than one of the pilgrims returning from the great feast to some distant home."

Signs of the Times, January 20, 1888, offers a "verbatim" form of March's text.

"and there was nothing in his dress or his manner to lead the disciples to suspect that he was any other than one of the many pilgrims returning from the great feast."

The Desire of Ages, chapter 83, sentence 65, presents an example of "strict paraphrase."

"They thought that He was one of those who had been in attendance at the great feast, and who was now returning to his home."

Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III, sentence 62b, page 212, is an example of "simple paraphrase."

"nothing in his bearing suggested to them that they were listening to other than a casual pilgrim, returning from the feast, but one who thoroughly understood the prophecies."

Were it not for the last part of the sentence the evaluation of the Spirit of Prophecy sentence would have been "strict paraphrase." Clearly Ellen White has added a thought not found in the source text. Had her addition equaled about half the sentence or more it would have been more accurate to register her independence and either give the sentence the appropriate rating for partial independence or split the sentence into two independent clauses and give them separate ratings. Leaving the sentence as it stands I opted for indicating dependency, judging on the major portion of the text, but giving it a "simple paraphrase" rating of 3 rather

INTRODUCTION - PART A

than the higher level of dependency. This is just one example of where one makes a judgment call which could go in more than one direction. By listing the criteria and the full text the reader has the information necessary for making his or her own judgments.

The following rather lengthy quotation is an example of "loose paraphrase." This category is not very common because it relies on the content more than the form. Great care must be taken to make sure the content is basically the same as the source text and that there is correspondence elsewhere in the context. In most cases Ellen White will expand or in some way modify the content so that other categories of evaluation become applicable as we shall discuss below.

William Hanna, Life of Christ, sentence 70, page 667.

"Jesus will now openly, not only take to himself his own name, assume his office, and assert his Divine prerogatives, but in doing so he will let those earthly dignitaries, who have dragged him thus to their tribunal, before whose judgment-seat he stands, know that the hour is coming which shall witness a strange reversal of their relative positions--he being seen sitting on the seat of power, and they, with all the world beside, seen standing before his bar, as on the clouds of heaven he comes to judge all mankind."

Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III, sentence 167, page 120.

"In it he presented to the minds of those present a reversal of the scene then being enacted before them, when he, the Lord of life and glory, would be seated at the right hand of God, the supreme Judge of Heaven and earth, from whose decision there could be no appeal."

The Bible is the common source behind both the sources' and Ellen White's comments on the life of Christ. Ordinarily

INTRODUCTION - PART A

when Ellen White quotes Scripture directly, indirectly, or clearly bases her remarks on the Bible text, we do not consider this usage of Scripture as an example of literary dependency. Nearly every chapter of The Desire of Ages opens with a footnote pointing the reader to the Bible passages supporting the commentary. Even though Ellen White does not always indicate through the use of quotation marks that she is quoting Scripture, we have tried to identify all usages of Scripture. These sentences are given the rating of zero (0) and are not included in the evaluation of dependence/nondependence.

There is, however, a second use of Scripture which we have called "source Bible." This category has been applied to any usage of Scripture in any form, whether quoted or paraphrased, whether presented as a complete or partial quotation, which may to some degree be attributable to the way the source used the Bible. This type of usage may be the quoting of a text which is not ordinarily associated with the gospel story being narrated or a pattern of quoting and commenting on a story in the same sequence and at the same junctions in the story as does the source. Another example of this kind of dependency is when Ellen White quotes Scripture in places where it would be expected of one commenting on a story from the life of Christ, but her

INTRODUCTION - PART A

introductory or closing remarks for the quotation are clearly taken from or influenced by the way the literary source has used the Bible text. Since we have a separate category to indicate independent or common use of Scripture, when the Bible text is given a source-dependency rating the burden of proof would fall on the one claiming Ellen White's independent use of Scripture. Here is one example of the influence of the source upon the use of Scripture which we evaluated as 2 on the scale of literary dependency.

Sentence 274 of The Desire of Ages, chapter 75 reads--

"An hour had passed, when one of the servants of the high priest, being a near kinsman of the man whose ear Peter had cut off, asked him, 'Did not I see thee in the garden with Him?'"

Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ, sentences 33 & 36 read--

"A whole hour passed: . . . and at last one of the High Priest's servants--a kinsman of the wounded Malchus--once more strongly and confidently charged him with having been with Jesus in the garden. . . ."

Ellen White has combined portions of Luke and John in her indirect and direct quoting of Scripture as has Farrar. The story of Peter's denial of Christ is reported in all four Gospels. The fact that Ellen White would at this place choose to combine the very two references that Farrar also unites, suggests the influence of Farrar. The evidence becomes stronger when one notices the other sentences of this context where Farrar's work is being utilized.

Two types of sentences were dedicated to noting Ellen

INTRODUCTION - PART A

White's independence. If the entire sentence or the majority of the words appearing in a sentence exhibited no resemblance and the content did not appear to be a loose paraphrase of the source in a context where clear dependency was also registered, we labeled the sentence under "strict independence" and gave it a dependency rating of zero. No doubt many readers will conclude from their study of the evidence that I was liberal in putting many Ellen White sentences in this category, even many sentences carrying the same content as did the source. There were several reasons for giving the credit to Ellen White for the composition of such sentences.

This is a study of literary dependency and one should be careful to see that some literary evidence is present, not merely content. One must guard against giving everything over to the dependency on sources when one is dealing with common topics as are the stories of Jesus among Christian writers. In looking for a balance one is also influenced by the inability to register degrees of Ellen White's influence on the texts which carry dependency ratings. Finally, I would remind the reader once again of the subjectivity which cannot be eliminated from literary analysis, particularly source criticism. The organization and methodology followed in this research should permit the reader to make his/her own

INTRODUCTION - PART A

evaluations of dependency using the textual evidence provided and either these criteria of evaluation or one's own.

The final category of literary dependence or nondependence is a rather complex one. Originally several separate types of sentences were developed to show the various ways in which a given sentence unit participated in both dependence and independence. These various kinds of mixed sentences were collapsed into one basic type which I classified as "partial independence." The lowest value of dependency, a rating of 1, was attached to this category. Obviously these sentences could have been designated as "partial dependence" even as the paraphrased sentences could have been viewed from the point of view of their independence rather than their dependence.

Once again we must point to our concern for balance in the matter of judgment for literary dependence/independence. In this type of sentence we endeavor to note the particular contribution of Ellen White which must involve at least half the sentence. Ellen White's additions, omissions, or oppositions to the source text must be clearly indicated and must make a significant difference in the reading of the sentence, whether in content or form. The single reduction of a lengthy sentence into one or more shorter sentences is not classified in this category. In every sentence of this

INTRODUCTION - PART A

type some evidence of source dependency as well as independency must be apparent from a comparison of Ellen White's sentence with the content of the source.

Each sentence of the 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages was evaluated in terms of the above categories of dependency and independency. The earlier writings of Ellen White were also thoroughly surveyed and evaluated in respect to those sentences which clearly revealed source dependency. The earlier texts were not studied in full and no attempt was made to register their independent sentences.

The dependent sentences of the earlier materials were utilized as primary texts for studying Ellen White's use of sources. The evaluations of the dependent sentences of these pre-Desire of Ages texts allow us to make several literary comparisons between the Ellen White writings themselves and between her writings and the sources she appropriated. The earlier writings as pre-edited texts more clearly reveal the use of literary sources, and combined with later published works provide a comparison base from which to study how Ellen White's writings were edited.

Once we had in hand the complete body of text materials, at least to the extent we could recover the textual tradition for the content of the 15 chapters, we tabulated the dependency or independency, analyzed the textual evidence,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

and summarized our findings for the chapter. Because we had selected the chapters on a random basis, the data from the 15-chapter sample could be used to make some generalizations for the text of The Desire of Ages as a whole.

The literary dependency of thematic development and narrative structure, or what we have called redaction analysis, was not a major aspect of the project. Nevertheless, by also indicating carefully the location of the source parallels in the literary source document we were able to trace the number and sequence of literary parallels in a given chapter taken from the same source. When several sentences in numerical sequence in the text of The Desire of Ages revealed literary dependence on a block of sentences occurring in one source, correspondence of literary structure could be studied. The length of these blocks of similar text content and the number of such units present in one or more sources would indicate the degree to which the composition of the chapter's content arrangements was dependent on one or more sources.

The data which emerged from the evaluation of sentence and unit dependency/independency were set out in various tables for study by the reader. Even though the tabulations are a necessary part of applying the methodology, they represent a stage of analysis beyond the actual task of

INTRODUCTION - PART A

literary criticism. We shall discuss these aspects of the project as well as the questions addressed to the data under our description of the research report to which we now turn.

The Structure of the Research Report

The lengthy and detailed research report of which this chapter is one part consists of four divisions, though these major sections have not been so marked out in the Table of Contents or elsewhere. We shall briefly describe the divisions here, but the primary purpose of this section is to explain those portions of the report which have to do with the presentation of the text and its analysis.

The first two chapters of the report form the introduction to the research report, and have been outlined above. The final chapter containing the summary and conclusions of the investigation carry their own descriptions and require no special elaboration here. The fourth and final section of the report contains the appendices and research bibliographies. Each appendix carries a title page with a brief comment on the nature of the material which follows. Since several of the charts making up the first three appendices, Appendix A, B, and C, relate to the data generated by the analysis of the 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages, further explanation of those appendices will be

INTRODUCTION - PART A

included in our discussion of the major section of the report which follows.

Each of the 15 chapters selected from The Desire of Ages is treated as an independent document in this project. A separate chapter in the report is dedicated to each of these chapters of The Desire of Ages. Chapters 3 through 17 of this research account are given to reporting the research and the reader can select any one of the chapters and obtain the complete information on that portion of Ellen White's text. Chapter 3 deals with the first chapter selected from The Desire of Ages, which just happened to be chapter 3. Chapter 4 of the report covers chapter 10 of The Desire of Ages, and the remaining chapters relate to the other chapters selected from Ellen White's life of Christ. Chapter 17 of our report treats the last of the 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages, chapter 84.

Each of these chapters reporting on the research, chapters 3-17, is organized according to the same pattern of four sections, namely, introduction, text presentation, analysis, and summary. In the following pages of this introductory chapter we offer a full description of these four parts so that the reader will have no difficulty, we hope, in following the analysis, and understanding the necessary abbreviations.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

The reader is advised to study chapter 3 before turning to any one of the other chapters in that division of the report document. In view of the fact that chapter 3 was the first application of the research methodology to the textual data we endeavored to explain the steps of analysis and evaluation as we proceeded, even though now it involves some repetition of explanations given.

The Introduction. The first part of each chapter provides some background to the content of the chapter of The Desire of Ages under scrutiny. Ellen White's earlier writings on the topic are listed and the relation of those earlier writings to the text of The Desire of Ages is set forth. All references to the earlier materials are provided for the convenience of the reader who may wish to consult the published text for comparison purposes. The form of the text is also described as to handwritten, typescript by Ellen White's literary helpers, and whether manuscript, letter, or diary material.

This section of the chapter also lists the Bible references where the narrative event in the life of Jesus may be found. The literary sources which in my judgment are reflected in the Ellen White texts are also introduced. Where possible we make some attempt to show why it is reasonable to assume that Ellen White would have had access

INTRODUCTION - PART A

to those sources. The dates to all textual materials are established so that one can relate the texts to each other in terms of their chronological priority.

Finally the introduction provides the key to the abbreviations used in the presentation of the text to identify the Ellen White and source texts. For example the text of The Desire of Ages is abbreviated with the letters, DA, which we shall hereafter also use in our references to the major Ellen White text. The earlier writings are referred to as a group with the designation, pre-DA. The individual documents are identified by the initial letters of the major terms found in their titles. The text of Spiritual Gifts carries the abbreviation of SG and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March goes by the letters NS. In some usages they are underlined but when used as part of an extended reference to page location they usually are not.

The Text Presentation. The second part of each of the 15 chapters detailing the research presents the full textual evidence evaluated for that particular chapter of the DA text. The facing pages are double numbered in parallel fashion with the Ellen White texts on the left-facing page and the source texts on the right-facing page.

Before explaining the system used in presenting the various texts and identifying their location for

INTRODUCTION - PART A

documentation and cross-referencing purposes, I would warn the reader that the pattern exhibits some inconsistencies. Other than unintentional errors of application three factors account for the lack of complete consistency. First, the system was set up for chapter 3. It was not developed after all texts were located and all variables noted. To save time we wrote the report as the research was completed for each chapter. Some variation of the format became necessary as new types of texts were introduced.

Second, the White Estate has not catalogued all Ellen White texts in the same way and at times a document once filed as a letter has been refiled as a manuscript, and vice versa. The diary or journals kept by Ellen White contain letter, manuscript, as well as the more familiar daily diary notations one might expect from personal records. Variations in the type of texts and their identification tags as given by the White Estate resulted in some modifications of our reference system as the research progressed. Once a person understands the basic pattern and notes the way the text is identified in the introduction of the chapter, the reference system should prove no problem to follow.

A third factor forcing some modification was the practical problem of space. In order to include the full text for both Ellen White and the sources, to identify text

INTRODUCTION - PART A

references in a form short enough to allow listing also in statistical tables of columns, and if possible to list the date of unpublished documents and journal articles, we were forced to design a very limited abbreviation system. With some texts the only possibility for keeping the reference form within the space available was to modify the format. These changes should not raise serious difficulties when one becomes acquainted with the general system.

The DA text as the controlling text appears in full in each chapter. The sentences are numbered according to their order in the text, beginning with the first sentence of the chapter as sentence number 1. The DA sentences begin at the left margin of the left-facing page. The location of the sentence is given initially. The text abbreviation appears first, followed by the sentence number when counting from the beginning of the chapter, and following the slash mark (/) the page of the DA text where the sentence may be found is given.

Apart from a working manuscript of the DA text which also is presented from the left margin, all quotations from earlier Ellen White texts are indented. The first indention was usually used to present the earliest form of the text. The earliest pre-DA text might be the text of The Spirit of Prophecy, indicated by SP, written in 1877, or it might be a

INTRODUCTION - PART A

diary text written in 1897. If both types of text appear in the same chapters the one closest to the hand of Ellen White will be given the first indention and the earlier though edited text of the SP will be given the second indention. With the great variety of texts the indentations may vary from chapter to chapter but within the same chapter the presentation format will be entirely consistent. The main purpose of the indentation of texts was to assist the reader in noting when the text quoted was from a different document than the preceding sentence. The width of the page made it impractical to have a different indention for each separate document.

Text taken from Ellen White's diary entries, letters, manuscripts, and journal articles are fully described in the introduction to each chapter, but only three elements appear in the reference format. The first element identifies the type of document or name of journal. For example: Di = Ellen White diary; MS = manuscript; Lt = letter; ST = Signs of the Times; and RH = Review and Herald. The second element appears in parenthesis, (), and refers to the year of the diary book or the year when the journal article was published.¹ In the case of letters and manuscripts the

¹The year given identifies the diary, not the year when the text was written. When we designed the system the diary year matched the text date. Later we discovered diaries

INTRODUCTION - PART A

middle term gives the manuscript or letter number as filed in the Ellen G. White Estate office.

The third factor of the format gives the sentence number. Unless some special circumstances of the text make it impractical or impossible, the usual practice was to number the sentences in numerical sequential order from the beginning of the letter, article, or manuscript. The diary sentences were numbered in sequence from a given location of the diary as indicated in the introduction of the chapter quoting diary material. We followed the same procedure when numbering the sentences in letters and manuscripts. Often Ellen White comments would vary widely in content within the same letter or manuscript. If the document was very long and included other types of material, the numbering might not begin at the opening of the document but at the place where the comparative content begins. Specific details are provided whenever we depart from the usual procedures.

If the textual material from a particular document or book involved only a few sentences, we found it more efficient to identify the location of the sentence by giving

covering several years of text. Rather than change the identification system to indicate the number of the diary book as filed at the White Estate Office, we chose the dominant year and identified the year of the text in the introduction to the chapter where such diary material appears.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

the page number and the general location on the page as a decimal number or fraction of 10. For example: 2RL48.6 would refer to a sentence just below the midpoint on page 48 of Redemption Leaflets, No. 2; Lt(47)10.7 would indicate the sentence about two-thirds down the text on page 10 of Ellen White letter 47; and Lt(1a)4 would refer to sentence number 4 of Ellen White letter 1a. The reader would need to consult the introduction of the chapter to obtain the year Ellen White wrote the letter or journal articles which are not identified by year in the reference identification format.

The text following the location reference is always the exact reproduction of the sentence as it appears in the document as identified. I have added the underlining to indicate some level of dependency other than "loose paraphrase." In the majority of sentences where underlining occurs there will be one or more words in bold type. Even though the word processing and computer-driven printer did not always make the boldface easy to notice, particularly when the originals have been photocopied, our intent was to use the boldface to indicate the words in the Ellen White text which also appear in the literary source. We have used the boldface in a few places where the same word appears but in a different form. Variations might include participial- or verb-forms of a noun, plural use of singular terms,

INTRODUCTION - PART A

compounds made from simple terms, or other similar modifications. In general the greater the number of verbatim words in proportion to nonidentical or similar terms, and the more extensive the underlining compared to the complete text of the sentence the greater is the degree of literary dependency.

The reader will recognize that many common words are placed in bold type and underlined. Viewed as individual words one could not make a case for verbatim and dependency. The words, even commonstock phrases, have to be viewed in terms of the context, in the word arrangement or syntax, and in relation to expressions involving technical or special vocabulary. While I do not wish to deny the subjective element in the evaluation, I will argue that the impact of the context and the general drift of the commentary have an objective bearing on decisions regarding dependency or independency.

Following every sentence listed for the Ellen White text we have indicated the literary source reference (for dependent sentences) and the sentence classification according to our schedule of nine categories. Typically the source reference consists of three elements within brackets. The first factor is a capital letter giving the first letter of the author's last name. The second element gives the

INTRODUCTION - PART A

sentence or sentences of the source, and the final element lists the page of the source. If only a short section of text is entailed, just the page is given and the sentence location on the page is indicated with decimal numbers as described above for the Ellen White text when only small units of text are involved.

The limited identification system is adequate because the source text appears at approximately the same location on the right-facing page. Further details on the identity of the author and the specific volume where the text is located is provided with the source quotation. The reference system for the literary sources is explained below.

Following the source reference we have identified the sentence classification within parentheses. The schedule of sentence types and their criteria appear in conjunction with the statement on evaluation presented above on pages 64 to 74. For the convenience of the reader we are repeating the schedule in abbreviated form on the following page (87).

Three final comments are in order before moving to the description of text presentation for the source texts. Ellen White's independent use of the Bible in direct or indirect quotation is followed by the Bible reference. Obviously when the text appears in more than one New Testament gospel we cannot be certain we have selected the actual reference she

INTRODUCTION - PART A

SENTENCE CLASSIFICATIONS AND DEPENDENCY VALUES

<u>Sentence Type</u>	<u>Abbreviation</u>	<u>Dependency Value</u>
Strict Verbatim	V1	7
Verbatim	V2	6
Strict Paraphrase	P1	5
Simple Paraphrase	P2	4
Loose Paraphrase	P3	3
Bible	B2	0
Source Bible	B1	2
Strict Independence	I1	0
Partial Independence	I2	1

INTRODUCTION - PART A

had in mind, particularly if she is paraphrasing. We have inserted a bracketed reference following an Ellen White sentence when that sentence appears elsewhere also but does not serve our purposes of showing greater dependence, or aiding in the establishment of the content. The notation is helpful in the further analysis of how Ellen White's comments are duplicated and/or re-edited for additional use in other publications.

We would stress, however, that we do not include anywhere in the report the results of our efforts to trace all references in Ellen White's writings to a given episode in the life of Jesus. That data has not been collated from our working notebooks. The laser disk concordance based on the complete published text of Ellen White's writings would be the best resource for constructing an Ellen White textual tradition on a given subject.¹

The placement of the earlier text materials of Ellen White into the sequence of the DA text is in some instances merely an arbitrary decision on my part. Due to the repetition found in the DA commentary and the dissimilarity between the earlier texts and the DA I could not in every

¹I refer here to the Ellen G. White Concordance [by Select Video Products] (St. Paul, MN: 3m, 1982) and the E. G. White Concordance Word list (Bakersfield, CA: Select Video Products, 1983).

INTRODUCTION - PART A

instance be sure of the proper placement. We did attempt, however, to coordinate the pre-DA text with the DA text. When the earlier writings treated the same general content of the DA chapter under study but was in part or altogether not incorporated into the DA text, we followed one of two procedures depending on the length of the early text.¹ If the previous writing involved only a few sentences we inserted them where we thought they best fitted the thematic development or harmonized with the narrative as presented in Scripture. The break in the DA text context introduced by this insertion of nonrelated DA material was indicated by a short broken line beginning at the left margin. If the earlier material constituted a major insertion we placed the pre-DA text at the end of the DA text. We hoped by this method to avoid confusion with the DA text and to permit the earlier text to be presented in continuous format. The corresponding source parallels were always located in relation to the Ellen White text, whether inserted or placed at the end of the text-presentation section of the chapter.

The literary sources which in my estimation are reflected in the writings of Ellen White on the life of Christ are presented on the right-facing page, opposite the

¹For the most part we included only those texts of Ellen White or the general topic which involved the use of sources. It is quite likely such texts would have been included in Marian Davis' collection of Ellen White's earlier writings even though not selected for the DA text.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

respective Ellen White sentences. As far as spacing permitted we attempted to include as much text as possible in order to allow the reader to evaluate the nature and extent of Ellen White's paraphrasing.

Each source sentence or sentence unit begins with a reference number consisting of two major elements divided by a slash mark. The first factor gives the sentence or unit number when counting from the beginning of the chapter or chapter section of the source where this Jesus event is discussed. The second element gives the page of the book where the sentence may be found. If the source is not heavily used the sentence location may be indicated by the page number and the decimal fraction of the page as used to document isolated sentences of Ellen White.

Some 19th-century writers had a writing style that involved the use of long and rather complex sentence structures. Others often strung together a number of independent clauses. The earlier writings of Ellen White exhibit some degree of this composite style, but it is not characteristic of the DA text. When such sentences contained parallels we divided the sentence into subunits and identified the sections with lower-case alphabet letters. For example, the first subsection of a sentence numbered 51 would be identified as 51a, the second subsection as 51b, and so forth throughout the sentence. If 51a, 51b, and 51d were

INTRODUCTION - PART A

identified, and no 5lc was listed, the reader should conclude that 5lc contained no text parallel and space did not permit us to include that portion of the text.

The underlining and boldface type function for the source parallels as was the case for the text of Ellen White. These special marking techniques point to verbatim words and parallel thoughts and expressions between the source and Ellen White's text.

At the end of a sentence, or sometimes at the end of a series of sentences from the same source, the last name of the author and the first letters of the major words of the book's title are given in brackets. The complete bibliographic information on the sources is given in the introduction to the chapter where their sources appear.

Occasionally we list a source reference but make no mention of it in connection with the presentation of the Ellen White text. Such special source materials are identified further and explained in the analysis section of the report. Usually they are included to show how the sources appear to be dependent on earlier materials not always identified.

The reference data on both the Ellen White and source texts are tabulated separately in three appendices. Appendix A contains the source references and text evaluations for the sentences of each of the 15 chapters of the DA text. In view

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of the fact that the study presents the full text of the DA, the entry numbers at the left margin correspond to the sentence numbers of the chapter. The second column contains the source reference for each dependent sentence. Bible quotations are merely identified by the term "Bible" and independent sentences are left blank. The third column gives the literary dependence rating for each sentence. This system of registering the sources and evaluations allowed us to see at a glance the arrangement or order of dependent/independent sentences for a given chapter.

Appendix B accomplishes the same purposes for the pre-DA text but the multiplicity of text documents and the partial presentation of those texts required that we modify the columns. The first column gives entry numbers for cross-referencing the Ellen White sentences with the source references tabulated in Appendix C. They do not indicate the sentence numbers of the text.

The second column identifies the pre-DA text document, sentence, and page number. Column 3 gives the sentence evaluations and the fourth column lists the sentence numbers of the DA text after which the earlier text is located. Since the pre-DA materials were inserted where their content or context was considered closest to the DA text, the only way to identify their location in the text presentation was to tie them to the particular sentences where they appear.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Appendix C completes the tabulation of data on the pre-DA text by repeating the entry number and document information for cross-referencing with Appendix B and adding the source references. This appendix allows us to obtain an overview of the sources used by the various pre-DA documents.

Appendices A, B, and C, containing the tabulations for each of the 15 chapters on the source references and sentence evaluations for both the DA and pre-DA text may be found at the close of the report where such addenda are usually placed. Having this data collected in one place facilitates comparative analysis between the chapters. The size of the research report, however, makes it also advisable to have this information more readily available for analyzing the individual chapters. For this reason we have duplicated the tabulation charts of these three appendices and inserted them at the close of the chapters to which they apply. These pages from Appendices A, B, and C carry the pagination of the separate appendices rather than the sequential page numbering of the main body of the report.

Perhaps this is the best place to review the general nature of Appendix D. It occurred to me that while it is possible to get the general thought flow of the DA text by just reading the sentences which begin at the left margin of all left-facing pages, one cannot read the other texts so easily. Every other text, whether of Ellen White or the

INTRODUCTION - PART A

sources, is subordinated to the structure of the DA text. The structural arrangements of these other texts are lost in the adjustment of their component sentences to fit the composition of the DA text. Appendix D was used as the location to present several pre-DA texts in full, at least insofar as their content related to the content covered by the 15 DA chapters under study in this project. The reader will also find some larger segments of the source texts as well.

Appendix D does not contain the texts from documents represented in each of the 15 chapters. The analysis of each chapter will identify the texts which appear in Appendix D, and the materials of Appendix D are further described in the introductions to the various sections of this fourth appendix which correspond to the chapters of the DA text.

We have also added a fifth section, Appendix E, containing some background on the major authors whose works are reflected in the writings of Ellen White. The reader may wish to consult this section of the research report when reading the writings of an author associated with a particular chapter of the DA text.

The Analysis. The analysis of each chapter was primarily designed to cover two types of literary criticism on two kinds of textual materials. Source analysis was first applied to the data generated by the text of DA and then to

INTRODUCTION - PART A

the pre-DA documents. A second step took us into redaction analysis of these same two categories of Ellen White texts.

The fundamental concern of the analysis and interpretation was focused by the 14 questions being addressed to each chapter. In this section of the report we argue the evidence from the text which would be used in the summary of each chapter.

These sections of the analysis and the 14 questions will be further discussed below. What I want to emphasize at this juncture of the introduction is that our careful scrutiny of the texts was not confined to these 14 specific questions. We did not wish to approach the textual data with a set of blinders on our eyes. The analysis section of the study permitted us to face the text with a more open stance. I felt it was legitimate to mention questions or implications suggested by the study of the text even though these points would not become a part of the summary which was largely limited to the preformulated 14 questions. Hopefully, others who study these same textual materials will notice elements or draw inferences not apparent to me. Where particular insights suggest that further investigation might be appropriate, interesting, or even urgent, I have not hesitated to point those out and to include them in the final summary and conclusion of the research project.

One such interesting observation developed out of our

INTRODUCTION - PART A

analysis of the pre-DA texts. We found much duplication of content and literary formulation. As we compared those earlier materials of Ellen White with each other as well as with the DA text, the compilation technique of Marian Davis became more obvious. To better portray the relationships between the Ellen White materials we designed a new table, Table A, which is not to be found in every chapter.

Table A lists in parallel columns the parallel sentences in the pre-DA and the DA texts. Each column carries the identification of a particular document, and the three-digit number in the extreme left column indicates the entry number for reference purposes. The specific sentence of each document is identified by sentence and page number separated by a slash. The multiple columns present the documents in chronological order with the earliest-dated text to the extreme left and moving through time until the latest text, the DA text, is given in the extreme right column.

I did make some attempt to use parentheses and brackets to indicate when substantive changes were made in the original form, the parenthesis indicating the first change, brackets the second, and alternating parentheses and brackets pointing to further changes. In some cases this system has not worked very well and the reader is advised to consult the sentences directly rather than to depend on this system for indicating change. For example a sentence in the DA column

INTRODUCTION - PART A

without parenthesis or brackets indicates the form of the DA text to be the same as an earlier form, but the reader will not be able to tell if the DA text matches the original or one of the later modified forms.

Despite the shortcomings of certain features of the format of Table A, the reader should be able to see at a glance how certain portions of the DA text represent a reformulation of earlier material or how other sections introduce new material on the life of Christ.

Under the source analysis (or criticism) of the DA text the sentence evaluations were compiled and given their dependency ratings according to the values arbitrarily established for comparison purposes. The same was done for the dependent sentences selected from the pre-DA documents. We endeavored to compare the dependency of the DA with the pre-DA texts and also to compare the content of the dependent sentences with that of the independent sentences. We were constantly challenged to analyze the material from the points of view of both similarity and dissimilarity.

We found it helpful in getting a grasp on the statistics and their implications to make several tables of statistics. These tables appear in the analysis section of each of the 15 chapters detailing the research.

Table 1 contains the sentence evaluations for both the DA and pre-DA texts. The DA text always appears on line 1.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

Every sentence of the chapter is represented in one of the 9 categories with the total number of sentences given in the column farthest to the right. Lines 2 and following list the pre-DA texts in chronological sequence; the earliest pre-DA text data is presented on line 2 and the latest text prior to the publication of the DA on the last line. The dependent sentences (and independent when it was deemed necessary to include here for establishing context) are totaled on the right, and the totals of each category are listed on the last line. The parentheses appearing in the totals of columns 8 and 9 indicate these particular sentences do not carry dependency value.

Tables 2 and 3 look at this same data from the point of view of the sources. Through these tables we are able to note which sources furnished the most parallels and therefore which authors or books functioned as major literary sources for the chapter. Table 2 presented the statistics relating to the DA text sources, and Table 3 did the same for the sources reflected in the pre-DA Ellen White materials. Both tables list the authors and their works in the left-hand column. The abbreviations of book titles follow the same system utilized in the text presentation of literary sources. Where I have concluded Ellen White has combined material from two or more sources in the same sentence, I took that combination as a source and named it by linking the initials

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of the titles to the books in a format connected by a slash. Space did not permit including the names of the authors in such combined use of sources.

Table 4 was an attempt (I am not sure how successful) to compare similar sentences appearing in the DA text and in one or more earlier texts. The top section of the table lists parallel sentences which vary only slightly in wording. The bottom section lists what I think are basically parallel sentences but the similarity is determined in terms of content rather than in literary form. Obviously the second comparison is more subjective and you need the context for control. At any rate the evaluation columns list the categories and one can check my comparisons of the dependency of the DA text with that of the earlier text of Ellen White. The table is designed to compare up to two earlier texts against the text of DA. The numbers on the far left are entry numbers for reference purposes only.

The analysis of source dependency of Ellen White's writings, the evaluations, and the dependency ratings based on the evaluations were made according to the evaluation and rating schedule set out above. Readers who disagree with the criteria or their application will want to adjust the analysis according to their own schedule. These tables do permit one to change the evaluations of individual sentences and refigure the conclusions without going through the entire

INTRODUCTION - PART A

statistical base.

For those readers who may wish to see how we calculated the average dependency ratings for each chapter we offer a copy of a working sheet for chapter 3 of the DA text on the following page, 101. The figures can be modified according to the data of anyone of the other chapters, or according to evaluation changes preferred by the reader, to develop other conclusions.

The final subsections of the analysis division of each chapter were dedicated to analyzing the compositional structure of the texts and/or their literary subunits. The redaction studies treated the content or themes, to discover to what degree, if any, Ellen White's order and arrangement of the narrative, background description, devotional, or other commentary was influenced by the sources. We limited our analysis to those sources known to have been consulted by Ellen White as may be established by the literary parallels. We know that Samuel Andrews' Life of Christ was used for placing the chapters of the DA text in chronological order, and there is some evidence of his influence in the composition of chapter 75 as well.¹

The redaction analysis is a rather straightforward study

¹W. C. White in a letter to L. E. Froome (Jan. 8, 1928) reported that Ellen White "occasionally referred to Andrews, particularly with reference to chronology." [Cited by Arthur L. White in Ellen G. White, The Australian Years, op.cit., p. 379]. See also Introduction, Part B, pp. 157-159.

INTRODUCTION - PART A

LITERARY DEPENDENCY OF CHAPTER 3

<u>Evaluations/Values</u>		<u>No. of Sentences</u>		<u>Chapter Value</u>	
1.	V1 - 7	X	0	=	0
2.	V2 - 6	X	1	=	6
3.	P1 - 5	X	0	=	0
4.	P2 - 4	X	9	=	36
5.	P3 - 3	X	20	=	60
6.	B1 - 2	X	5	=	10
7.	I2 - 1	X	24	=	24
8.	I1 - 0	X	67	=	0
9.	B2 - [Not figured]				
TOTALS			<u>126</u>		<u>136</u>

Chapter Average dependency for all sentences,
Dependent/Independent

Total sentences divided by categories 1-8
 $136 / 126 = 1.079$ or 1.08

Chapter Average for Dependent sentences only,

Total sentences divided by categories 1-7
 $136 / (126-67)$ or $136 / 59 = 2.3$

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of content and needs no further clarification here. Since content analysis was not the major thrust of this investigation no attempt was made to develop and apply a list of criteria for establishing redaction dependency or independency. There remain only the chapter summaries to cover and we shall have finished the introduction to the research procedures and the completed research report.

The Summary. We have already mentioned that in an attempt to maintain a high degree of consistency in our analysis of 15 chapters of different length and content we structured 14 questions to be addressed to each chapter. It was our hope that those questions would keep our focus sharp and serve as guideposts for the literary comparison. We never intended that our analysis would necessarily be limited to those questions only, but that they would be the minimum boundaries of our inquiry regardless of the chapter's content. The questions and their answers as provided by the 15 chapters of the DA text function as the basis for the summary and conclusions of the entire project.

The 14 questions are not repeated at the end of each chapter. Instead the summary statements appear in the form of conclusions. We are therefore presenting the questions in full here. The questions carry their same identifying number(s) throughout the chapter summaries and the final concluding summary. The reader can return to this

INTRODUCTION - PART A

introduction at any time to review the statement of the questions, or compare the conclusions of the various chapters using the same identifying number of a particular question.

If a chapter does not treat the content of a given question, the corresponding answer number will appear in the summary with a brief comment to that effect. This way of organizing our summary statements should also assist the reader in following the development of the investigation and in checking the final summary statement against the evidence provided by the various chapters.

We conclude this Part A of the Introduction with the listing of the 14 summary questions. Each question is briefly elaborated by the addition of several related questions.

1. In what form are the textual materials for the study of the content of this chapter of the DA text? Do we have any primary texts, that is, handwritten texts by Ellen White, for this chapter? Are we dealing with a corrected typescript of the chapter? Does this chapter appear to have been written as an original composition, or to have been compiled and edited from earlier articles, diary items, letters, or manuscripts which formed the scrapbook collection of Ellen White's writings developed by Marian Davis, Ellen White's literary assistant? Do we have any "autographs" (texts in Ellen White's handscript) of these earlier materials?

INTRODUCTION - PART A

2. If the DA text represents a reworking of earlier texts, what were those earlier materials? When were they written? Is the DA chapter an expansion of the earlier works of Ellen White?

3. Were there previous writings apparently not used for the composition of the DA text? What can be said about Ellen White's previous writings on the general topic being treated in DA? Had she written much and what was the general content? Was there much duplication in the published materials?

4. Does the content of the DA text represent any significant change from that of the earlier writings evidently used? Are there additions, deletions, differences which could be taken as contradictions, changes in emphases, et cetera?

5. How many sentences of the DA text indicate literary dependency? What percentage of the total number of sentences gives evidence of this dependency?

6. How many sentences of the DA text appear to be the independent literary work of Ellen White or her assistant? What percentage of the total composition can be said to be independent of literary dependency?

7. What is the nature of the literary dependency? Were there verbatim quotations, paraphrase, and so forth? And

INTRODUCTION - PART A

given the scale of dependency what is the overall or average dependency rating?

8. Which authors and what literary works were used to a major degree in the writing of the DA text? What was the nature and scope of their use?

9. Which authors and what literary works were to some degree apparently used in the writing of the the DA text? How were these writers used?

10. What authors and works were used in the writing of the pre-DA text, and to what degree were they used?

11. If any of these writers used in the earlier work are also to be found behind the DA text, how does their use compare between the DA text and the earlier writings? While it must be recognized that the earlier texts have not been studied fully, do there appear to be some differences in the degree of dependency or the nature of the content of the dependent sentences from that found in the DA text?

12. What can be said about the content of the dependent sentences and that of the independent sentences in the DA text? Is there any general nature or character to the independent sentences which may be distinguished from the content of the literary-dependent sentences?

13. How does the compositional arrangement of the chapter in DA compare with the development and/or arrangement

INTRODUCTION - PART A

of the subject matter in the source materials used? Does the editing (redaction) of the DA text show dependency upon the literary framework or structure to be found in the works which otherwise were used in the writing of the DA text? How does the development of the theme being treated in the DA text compare with the development of the same theme or content by writers evidently consulted by Ellen White?

14. While we are not able to cover the earlier writings of Ellen White in their entirety, even in respect to those which cover the content of the DA text under consideration, what can be said about the arrangement of their content as compared to that of the sources evidently used in their composition?

II INTRODUCTION - PART B

History and Background of The Desire of Ages

The writing and publishing of books in the 19th century demanded more involvement of the authors than has been the custom until the present time. The development of modern technology and high labor costs have made it both possible and necessary for writers to handle the production, editing, and proofreading of books. For Ellen White, who had only the most limited formal education and whose responsibilities in church leadership through guidance and counseling demanded much in the way of writing, travel, and speaking, the management of book production called for some special arrangements.

Throughout my college years, early ministry, and even seminary classwork, I had the impression that Ellen White wrote The Desire of Ages. In my mind the picture of Ellen White with her lapboard across the arms of her chair reinforced the understanding that she composed the book chapter by chapter as she reflected on the gospel stories of the life of Christ. Her visions would have added insights not obvious in the reading of the Bible text. Once she had completed a chapter the rough draft would go to her assistants who, as I had been led to imagine, took the text and corrected the spelling, punctuation, and grammar as they copied the text for publication. This same very limited

INTRODUCTION - PART B

editorial assistance would also have prepared the articles written by her for the various church publications.

It is now widely known among North American Adventists and by many others throughout the world field that this reconstruction description of Ellen White's writing methods has no basis in fact. Perhaps my understanding was colored by what my religious devotion wanted me to believe, and was not the result of my Adventist education. I do know that I was not alone in holding this view as to the way Ellen White produced her books.

The White Estate through its representatives has used various means over the last decade to correct such false impressions and to provide further information on how Ellen White wrote her books.¹ As widespread as their efforts have

¹I refer here to the following publications which have been footnoted (with or without annotation) in Chapter I of the Introduction: Ellen G. White: The Australian Years by Arthur L. White (Volume 4 of his biography of Ellen White); two series of articles by Arthur L. White published in the Adventist Review ("Toward an Adventist Concept of Inspiration," January 12, 19, 26, and February 2, 1978, and "The Ellen G. White Historical Writings," July 12, 19 26, and August 2, 9, 16, and 23, 1979); Selected Messages, Book 3, Section III, "The Preparation of the Ellen G. White Books," (a compilation of comments from the writings of Ellen White); three monographs by Robert Olson: Ellen G. White's Use of Uninspired Sources; How the Desire of Ages Was Written; and pages 64-111 of One Hundred and One Questions on the Sanctuary and on Ellen White; and E. G. White's Literary Work: An Update by Ron Graybill (then Associate Secretary of the E. G. White Estate). Apart from Selected Messages, Book 3 (which is available through local Adventist Book Centers), the other items, including a reprint of the Adventist Review

INTRODUCTION - PART B

been through published books, pamphlets, and articles, in workshops for ministers and teachers, and in various types of public presentations, I cannot be sure that all those who may be interested to review this report will be acquainted with that background material.

This chapter, therefore, attempts to fulfill two objectives. Its primary purpose is to furnish a connected account of the history and background of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ, particularly The Desire of Ages. By including this information the report stands on its own as a complete statement. All the basic knowledge necessary for making sense of the study and the report is provided for the reader.

A secondary motivation behind the writing of this chapter has to do with setting forth the evidence for the claims we have made elsewhere in the report in respect to Ellen White's writings and for the operating assumptions which have influenced the research methodology and text presentation and analyses. It is not only to provide the background information on the way Ellen White wrote her books, for those who have not had access to this history; there is also the need to make an independent statement.

articles, are available from the Ellen G. White Estate Office at the General Conference headquarters in Washington, D. C.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

This project was sponsored by the General Conference and designed to be a study outside the White Estate's sphere of influence. Naturally I was to have complete access to the White Estate documents, and total freedom to select whatever materials in my judgment related to the investigation. Even though these arrangements were partially influenced by charges that the White Estate had been involved in some kind of a "coverup," and for this reason could have resulted in a very difficult or strained working situation, nothing of this order ever developed. Robert Olson, Arthur White, and all those connected with the White Estate, its employees, and its Board of Trustees, were most cooperative. They were anxious to do whatever I requested yet never tried to direct or even influence my research.

Readers who have consulted the White Estate documents relating to Ellen White's use of sources, the role of her literary assistants, and her work on The Desire of Ages will recognize that I included much of the same evidence as they have. This correspondence has been unavoidable due to the fact we are using many of the same documents and treating the same questions. The White Estate documentation includes evidence from Ellen White letters after 1898 and other sources I did not research. This presentation of the historical and literary context to the DA text is not

INTRODUCTION - PART B

intended to be an exhaustive treatment of Ellen White's writing practices.

The careful reader who is acquainted with these writings on the topic of Ellen White's use of sources and secretaries will note several additional differences in the following comments from those of the White Estate. My remarks, as would be expected given the nature of this report, are limited to Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ. Secondly, the evidence is limited to the primary sources. That is to say, the statements of Ellen White and Marian Davis provide the major evidence for the arguments. They were the central figures in the writing process. W. C. White's comments are limited to claims on what he did to assist in the task. His comments on how his mother wrote are not included here, though the reader should not infer that I am assuming his word to be unduly biased or not worthy of trust. His comments, like those of A. G. Daniels, W. W. Prescott, and other contemporaries of Ellen White, apart from statements of their own involvement with the writing process, provide secondary evidence and would extend the scope of this report beyond its limitations.¹

¹I am aware of the inquiries by students about the work of H. C. Lacey, the influence of W. C. White, and the issues raised in the letters of G. W. Amadon, J. H. Kellogg, W. W. Prescott, and W. C. White, et al. To adequately treat these concerns would have required a review of post-1898 letters

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Finally, a third difference is in the selection and arrangement of the evidence. Since neither the White Estate reports nor my own present the entire available textual base, it is inevitable that different interpreters will select different excerpts to sustain their arguments. Fortunately the White Estate materials mentioned above are available and can be checked against the evidence which follows. Hopefully, the White Estate will soon make the entire collection of materials accessible in facsimile form for investigation.

Now that we have described the general objectives of this chapter and the kind of evidence we shall employ, it remains for us to set out the general approach to our topic. Though some overlap will be apparent due to the nature of the evidence, the major divisions of the chapter fall into three fields of interest.

In the first division we shall retrace the history and tradition of Ellen White's major writings on the life of

and documents of Ellen White and those associated with her. Documentation filed in the office of Adventist archives would also have to be reviewed. These questions are important for a complete portrayal of how Ellen White produced her writings. Hopefully others will join the task of reconstructing the life, times, and thought characterizing early Adventist history, and the attitudes, motivations, and roles of our founding fathers. The earlier histories of Adventism and of the pioneers, written without the documentation now available for our use, need to be updated.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Christ. Our emphasis will be on the earlier published texts, the working manuscript of the DA, and the final struggles to produce the DA text. Some attention will also be given to Ellen White's other works on the ministry of Christ.

The second segment will look at Ellen White's writing skills and methods, not from the evidence of the text itself, which is the major concern of the project, but from Ellen White's claims (or lack thereof) and those of her literary assistants. We were not able altogether to avoid alluding to Ellen White's method of writing in our attempt earlier to briefly survey the literature leading up to this research. For the most part, however, we have in the first chapter presented the views of Ellen White's interpreters who based their positions on a more limited text sample and/or on both primary and secondary sources.

The third and final part of our discussion in this chapter moves the focus from Ellen White to her literary assistants. Who were these helpers and what duties did they perform? What do they say they did, and how does Ellen White describe their activities?

It is important to bear in mind that we are not in this chapter attempting to anticipate the conclusions of the project. The summary and conclusions are in the main developed from the textual evidence, not from the statements

of Ellen White and Marian Davis in which they describe their work. Once the textual evidence is studied it will be possible to compare the results of the text analysis with the description of their work as given here. A careful review of the following documentary materials should also give some indication of the degree to which the general church membership would have been aware of the process Ellen White used in producing her writings.

The History of The Desire of Ages Text

The Desire of Ages is the only single volume in the English language by Ellen White covering the life of Christ. In addition to numerous articles on episodes in the life of Jesus and on aspects of the ministry and teachings of Christ, Ellen White published several works which treat in part the life of Christ. All of this literature in one way or another is related to the writing of the DA text. The following account briefly outlines the history and nature of those relationships.

Spiritual Gifts. The Advent Review and Sabbath Herald of September 9, 1858, announced the publication of Spiritual Gifts, Volume I, which was also titled, The Great Controversy Between Christ and His Angels and Satan and his Angels, covering the entire history of salvation from the fall of

Satan until the final destruction of Satan in the second death. This work included eight chapters on the life of Christ. The major portion of this brief treatment of the life of Christ is dedicated to the suffering, death, resurrection, and ascension of Jesus. Only two chapters are given to the days of Christ's ministry. Though occasionally Ellen White prefaces her account with comment to the effect that she "was shown" or otherwise was informed through vision, her narrative for the most part reads like a paraphrase of Scripture.

Though there seems to have been very little direct effect of the text itself on Ellen White's later writings on the life of Christ, the general outline of the volume covering the great controversy theme evidently influenced her later writings. Volumes III and IV which had to do with Old Testament history followed in 1864. Ellen White must have sensed the need to place the story of the plan of redemption in a chronological order, and to present it in much greater detail. In 1870 she came out with a revision of the Old Testament section in the first volume of a new series titled Spirit of Prophecy.

Spirit of Prophecy. The first major treatment of the life of Christ is presented as part of a four-volume work called Spirit of Prophecy. In a letter to her children late

in 1872 she writes: "We shall try to write and get out my second volume of Spirit of Prophecy."¹ A few days later a notice in her diary reads, "Wrote ten pages to Elder Littlejohn, after writing closely all day upon my matter for Spirit of Prophecy."² The duplication of material found in her writings is to be expected when manuscripts destined for her books also find their way into the church papers. During February of 1873 she wrote: "We arose early, prepared eight pages of manuscript for the Review, which matter is to go into my Spirit of Prophecy, Volume Two."³

Evidently Volumes II and III were being prepared at the same time. In June of 1873 she "wrote fifteen pages on sufferings of Christ,"⁴ which became part of Volume III of SP. In August of the same year she records in her diary, "looked over several pages of manuscript--The Temptation of Christ."⁵ Some of the life of Christ was also prepared in article form for the Instructor.⁶ Her commentary on the temptations of Christ is separated out of her general writings on the life of Christ and published in pamphlet form. She notes in her diary, Sabbath, September 27, 1873:

¹Ltr W-23-1872, Dec. 24 to Edson and Willie.

²MS 3, 1873.

³MS 4, 1873.

⁴MS 8, 1873.

⁵MS 10, 1873.

⁶MS 11, 1873.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

This is a beautiful day; not a cloud in the heavens. I spent the day in writing and reading over manuscript for printer, upon the temptations of Christ in the wilderness. I am anxious to get this before the people, for they need it.¹

The manuscript on the temptations of Christ was no doubt related to the pamphlet on the same topic published in 1874.² That the manuscript did not include her full comment on the topic may be inferred from a later diary entry for October 26, 1873, in which she remarks that "I had some freedom in writing upon the temptation of Christ."³

Throughout the next several years Ellen White kept to her task of preparing these new books on the life of Christ. Several letters from 1876 contain references to the pressure she felt to complete the work. Writing from her home in California to her husband who was then president of the General Conference she clearly indicated what her priorities were:

I cannot see any light shining to Michigan for me. This year I feel that my work is writing. I must be secluded, stay right here, and I must not let inclination or persuasion of others shake my resolution to keep closely to my work until it is done.⁴

¹Ibid. We shall have an occasion below to comment on Ellen White's checking her own manuscripts for publishing, and on her freedom to do this work on the Sabbath.

²"Redemption, or The Temptation of Christ in the Wilderness," 96 pp. See Comprehensive Index to the Writings of Ellen G. White (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Assn., 1963), p. 3197.

³MS 12, 1873.

⁴Ltr 63, 1876 (March 25, 1876).

It is clear that she is referring in the quote above to her writing on the life of Christ. In a letter to James White only a few days later she adds:

I am writing and having freedom in my writing. Precious subjects I am handling. The last I completed or about completed yesterday--Jesus healing the impotent man at the pool of Bethesda [sic].¹

Volume II of Spirit of Prophecy was published in 1877. The chapters of this enlarged commentary on the life of Christ from birth to the entry into Jerusalem were published separately as a pamphlet series called Redemption, numbers 1, 3 through 6 the same year (with the exception of the chapter on the wilderness temptations which had already been printed in 1874 as number 2).² Numbers 7 and 8 came out the next year with the printing of SP, Volume 3.

About two-thirds of Volume III (20 chapters) of Spirit of Prophecy was published early in 1878. Ellen White's vision of the value of her works extending far beyond the ranks of Adventism is clearly indicated by her thoughts on marketing. Notice the following comment in a letter to William and his wife.

We received yesterday the third volume of Spirit of Prophecy. I have thought if the covers were made for all three volumes, with a different title and these books were introduced in the bookstores in Boston,

¹Ltr 1, 1876 (March 31, 1876).

²Comprehensive Index to the Writings to Ellen G. White,
op. cit.

Rochester, Battle Creek and other places, it would scatter the light and do good.¹

In addition to furnishing the text for several articles,² the SP text provides the basic material for several foreign-language translations of Ellen White's life of Christ.³ Because of certain modifications to the text I have chosen to treat these translations as a separate stage in the transmission of the DA text.

La Vie de Jesus-Christ notre Seigneur (The Life of Jesus Christ our Saviour). This is the earliest use we found of Ellen White's two volumes of the SP text as a separate one-volume work carrying the title so commonly used by 19th-century writers. If the French edition (and no doubt the other non-English texts as well) were only a translation we could hardly argue that it represented a further development of the text. Several innovations in this life of Christ merit its special place in the history of the DA text.

The December 15, 1890, issue of Bible Echo, published in Melbourne, Australia, carried the following announcement among its advertisements.

This new volume from the pen of the above gifted author is written in a simple, yet terse and interesting

¹Ltr W-10-1878.

²Ltrs 12 & 13, 1876, to James White (April 21 & 24).

³Our comments are based on our study of an undated copy of the second American edition of the French text published by the International Tract Society, Battle Creek, Michigan. There were also German, Swedish, and Danish translations.

narrative style, and brings out many gems of truth in the life and works of Christ which cannot but awaken new interest and arouse a deeper love for the Saviour of mankind.

The narrative of the four evangelists is skillfully woven into the work, and they are shown to be in harmony throughout. While the work will be found to harmonize strictly with the Bible, it at the same time so thoroughly interests the reader that it is with reluctance that he lays it down until the last page has been read.

"The life of Christ" is printed in clear, large type, from new plates, on fine calendered paper, and contains 600 pages.

Issued only in French, German, Swedish, and Danish.

The Life of Christ in English is supplied in two volumes known as THE GREAT CONTROVERSY, VOLS. II & III.

My efforts to trace the origins of the French life of Christ were not entirely successful. We know that Ellen White had several workers with her when she set up headquarters in Basel, Switzerland. Among these were Marian Davis and L. R. Conradi and his wife.¹ We also know that during this period in Europe Ellen White and her assistants were working on the text for Patriarchs and Prophets, which represented the revision of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume I.² Arthur White informs us that not much work was done at this time on Ellen White's life of Christ project.³ Evidently a measure of work was carried forward on this task because the

¹Arthur L. White, Ellen G. White/Volume 3/The Lonely Years/1876-1891 (Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1984), p. 339.

²Patriarchs and Prophets was published in 1890 after Ellen White returned to America.

³Arthur White, op. cit., pp. 443, 444.

French edition departs from the SP text in several aspects. How much of this revision was on the way before Ellen White and her staff arrived makes an interesting question. It is possible the major task of translation/revision had been accomplished by workers at the Basel publishing house prior to this time because we are told in a letter from W. C. White in December of 1888 that there had been "continued demand" for this single-volume Life of Christ in French (and the other languages).¹ In fact, it "was making its way in Europe, and an English edition was contemplated."²

At any rate the revision pleased Marian Davis because she later mentions the volume and how her work on the DA text was influenced by this new Life of Christ for Europe. These are her words:

Ten or eleven years ago, when her life of Christ was published in French and German, the matter was arranged and prepared with the counsel of Sister White, W. C. W., M. K. W., and Sister E. J. Burnham. The decisions then reached have guided me also in the preparation of the chapters of the new book as far as they have gone, though I have not yet reached the closing scenes in the Saviour's life.³

¹Arthur White, op. cit., p. 444; cf. pp. 435, 445. I refer here to the revision of Volumes II and III of the SP text.

²Ibid.

³Marian Davis to J. E. White, December 22, 1895. A smaller work, written as a children's book (for which J. E. White was to be responsible) and prepared from the manuscripts Ellen White was producing for the DA text, was published in 1896 as Christ Our Saviour. The initials W. C. W. and M. K. W. stand for William White, another son of Ellen White, and Mary White his wife.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

The French edition has 55 chapters against 52 chapters of the SP text. Part but not all of this difference may be explained by an altered arrangement of the same material. There are, however, portions of the DA text which do not appear in the earlier SP volumes. Our comparison of the materials on the birth and ministry of John the Baptist revealed that selections which later appear in Patriarchs and Prophets but are not part of the SP text show up also in the French work. There are other sentences which appear to be, upon translation into English, closer to the DA text than to the SP text. We also found sentences in the French edition which we were not able to find elsewhere in Ellen White's writings. Perhaps these materials originated from the writings Ellen White was preparing at the time and while translated for the European editions were not preserved for the English text of either Patriarchs and Prophets or the DA.

In addition to the differences between the French edition and the SP account of the life of Christ there are also positive connections to be noted between the French work and the later lives of Christ composed from the writings of Ellen White. We have in mind here the order and arrangement of the narrative presentation.

Marian Davis was concerned that all new editions of Ellen White's books on the life of Christ agree on their

presentations of the details relating to Jesus. In the letter to Edson from which the previous quotation was taken she makes a further reference to the French text.

In the suggestions made as to detail and arrangement, I have followed, as nearly as seemed feasible, the French L. C. [Life of Christ].¹

After going into further explanation of the changes to be made in the book Edson was handling, she comments as follows:

The above arrangement is that which we shall probably follow in the new book, and it is very undesirable to have different books disagree, especially now when they have such wide circulation.²

There can be no doubt that the French edition had a definite impact on the developing tradition of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ. It seems reasonable to view the one-volume European Life of Christ by Ellen White as constituting a distinct stage in the history of the DA text. These books were not simply translations of the SP volumes. That this was also recognized by others may be inferred from the plan, later aborted, to prepare an English edition of this single-volume life of Christ.³

The Desire of Ages. In a letter of 1895 to Dr. J. H. Kellogg Ellen White made a revealing remark about the focus of her life. "You know that my whole theme both in the

¹Ibid.

²Ibid.

³Arthur White, op. cit., pp. 444, 445.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

pulpit and in private, by voice and pen, is the life of Christ."¹ No doubt this comment most directly refers to the burden she was carrying in regard to the completion of her major volume on the life of Christ. But one who reads through her letters and manuscripts cannot avoid the impression that this woman was throughout her life possessed by this subject. Over and over again one reads brief notices of her sermons on the sufferings of Christ or on His triumphal entry into Jerusalem, evidently two of her favorite topics.

One of the earliest hints that Ellen White had in mind to write the book we know as The Desire of Ages may be found in a letter to her children in 1880, only two years after SP, Volume III, was published.

We are now deciding to spend this winter and next summer in preparing books. First, I get articles prepared for Signs. 2. I get out articles for private testimony, Health institutions. 3. Get out testimony No. 30. 4. Letters to her children by a Mother. 5. Volume Four. 6. Life of Christ, both books. The most sharp and interesting matter in one large book for canvassers to use for public sale. So you see we have work to do. We dare not go South and will remain here this winter in Michigan. In summer we may go to Colorado.²

Perhaps this desire prompted the format of the European editions which combined the two SP volumes into a single book. It should also be noted that in this letter we

¹Ltr K-4-1895.

²Ltr W-43-1880.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

additionally find the controlling purpose that will influence the selection of the material and its style of presentation. Ellen White wants to publish a book on the life of Christ for colporteurs to use. The projected popular reader audience may have lent some direction in Ellen White's choice of sources. At any rate a number of the "lives" she consulted were of this type.

It was also quite evident to Marian Davis at least, that the SP volumes on the life of Christ were in need of revision. The "old book" mentioned in the following selection taken from a letter to W. C. White refers to the SP text.

Whatever plan we follow, there is much work to be done if the book is finished at all as it should be. Considering that the very cream has been taken from a large part of the old book, and has been put into everybody's hands, it seems a pity that this new work should have nothing fresh for many of its most important chapters. It seems a pity too, that the most important part of the book should be the part to be hurried and slighted. Again, the chapters as they stand in the old book need a thorough revision and rearrangement for the new. You know what criticisms that will excite. If we can add fresh matter it will help the case. I do not write these things to complain of difficulties, but because I think, so far as possible, you should understand the situation just as it is.¹

About two years after returning home from her European trip Ellen White notes in a letter that she is "now commencing the work on Vol. I and II, and Life of Christ."²

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, August 9, 1897.

²Ltr F-30-1889.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

From June, 1891, onward, we begin to find references to her "writing" in her letters and diary notations. They usually read as follows: "I have devoted most of four days to writing on the life of Christ," or, "In afternoon I wrote a few pages on the miracles of Christ."¹

In 1891 Ellen White went to Australia and took her staff with her. Early in 1892 she recounted in her diary how just prior to her leaving home she collected from her writings those materials she had written on the life of Christ.

I attended the Lansing camp meeting and malaria fastened itself upon me. But I was enabled, by the strength given me of God, to look over an accumulated mass of writing and select those things I had written in regard to the life of Christ. This book was so much needed that in counseling with my brethren it was thought advisable to take my workers with me and remain in Australia until the Life of Christ was ready for the press.²

Ellen White's health problems slowed her progress at times. Earlier she had entertained the thought that her illness might have a positive value for her writing plans. In a letter to Lucinda Hall she suggested that "It may be that I am a cripple in order to do this work so long neglected."³ Disappointingly, it did not turn out that way. Her health problems hindered her work. In May she wrote to Elder Haskell:

¹MS 43, 1891 (Diary, June 5 & 10).

²MS 40, 1892 (Feb. 13).

³Ltr H-90-1892 (Jan. 23).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

I am trying to write a little. The rheumatism is still upon me. In some respects I am physically better. I think the malaria has been mastered, for the present. I have great difficulty in using my hands, for my arms and shoulders are full of soreness and the pain I suffer with sciatica in hips and knees makes them stiff and painful. Yet I do not lose my courage; I will trust in the Lord.¹

Nevertheless she kept faith in the Lord and pressed on with her writing.

I believe now that my sickness in this strange country is a part of God's plan. I have been able to sleep but very little, yet my memory is good, my head clear. My arms and hands I feared would become helpless; but although painful, I can use my right hand, and every mail I have sent to America between one and two hundred pages of letter paper written by my own hand. Last mail bore away from me one hundred and seventy-five pages. I can sit up only a short time in one position. I can write best as I am now, half sitting and half reclining, bolstered up with pillows.

My heart is full of happiness, and of love, and gratitude to God.²

By midsummer of 1894 plans were being made for publishing the book even though there was still much writing to be completed. At first they considered printing the book at the Australian publishing house.

And now my letter writing is to be cut down wonderfully, and I will not be diverted from the main work. Talk with our brethren in regard to the printing of Life of Christ at the Echo office.³

Some thought was given to publishing the DA text in three separate books. It is possible that the publishing of

¹Ltr H-16d-1892 (May 7).

²Ltr W-28-1892 (July) [to P. W. B. Wessels].

³Ltr W-135-1894 (Aug. 6) [to W. C. White].

the little volume on Christ's sermon on the mount triggered the idea. The depression in Australia's economy may also have influenced this suggestion. Marian Davis offered her ideas on this possibility to W. D. Salisbury of the Echo office.¹

"Life of Christ," is progressing slowly, but it is progressing. Why would it not be a good plan to issue this book, not only as one large volume, but as three smaller ones? We could use the same plates, or rather another set, changing folios, and running titles, and making each book independent of the others, and put them out in a cheap form. Many would buy them who could not take the large book; and others would prefer to have the matter in a form more easily handled.²

During the year of 1895, in addition to pushing ahead with the writing and publishing plans for the life of Christ there was a constant flow of mail between Australia, England, and the United States of America in regard to the publication of Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing which was finally completed a year later.³

¹The Bible Echo was the Australian version of The Signs of the Times.

²Marian Davis to W. D. Salisbury, February 28, 1895.

³The dummy proofs arrived in January, 1896, but Ellen White was not pleased with them (Ltr P-90-1896). Evidently the Battle Creek publishing house went ahead with the publication because she was so disappointed with the illustrations that she would not send a copy of the book to Elder Haskell. In answer to one of his letters, she wrote on June 1: "You speak of the book Mount of Blessing, the book I do not wish to give to anyone. I have written to the ones who published it a very decided disapproval. It is a shame to get out such pictures upon such a beautiful subject, such elevated themes. If I get a book that I can approve, you shall have a copy, but I would not insult my friends with

INTRODUCTION - PART B

We shall have more to say on the publication of this book when we discuss the roles of Ellen White and her assistants in the production of her writings.

At this time Ellen White was projecting three and possibly four volumes on the life of Christ, with Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing as the first book. In a letter to her children she spoke of her plans.

We will have two volumes of the life of Christ and a small book upon the parables, and may have to have one on the miracles of Christ, but the lives of the disciples and apostles is yet to be prepared. Then I ought to get out an important book--the second volume of Old Testament History.¹

The DA became the second volume and the "parables" book evidently was Christ's Object Lessons, published in 1900. Since many miracle stories made their way into the DA text no further book on this topic ever materialized.

Because the parables of Jesus are woven into the gospel narratives of the life of Christ they do not lend themselves as easily to a separate treatment as did the sermon on the mount. The publishers apparently thought it would be possible to put out the "parable" book while waiting for Ellen White to complete her commentary on the life of Christ. Even though we catch a little glimpse of how Marian Davis served in her capacity as "book-maker," a topic to be

such illustrations as are in that book. So you will excuse my not sending you a book." (Ltr H-167-1896).

¹Ltr W-140-1896 (Jan. 23).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

discussed later, the following excerpt from one of Marian Davis' letters to C. H. Jones of the Pacific Press furnishes some insights on the complexities of unraveling the textual tradition behind the DA text.

You ask me if I cannot, by this mail, send to the press the MS of the parables. You also ask when the balance of the MS for the last book will be ready. And you request Sr. White to write on the parable of the Rich Man and Lazarus. I fully agree with you that the "Life of Christ" should be closed up as soon as possible. But let me state the situation: Considerably more than a year ago Sr. White began writing on the trial and crucifixion of Christ. She has a number of MSS unfinished. It is her intention to gather these together as soon as possible and complete them for the book. Of late she has had a very heavy burden for the General Conference, as well as for individuals, and the work in South Africa and in Cooranbong. But now that the Conference is over, and she has written quite fully in regard to these other cases, she fully intends to devote her time to the MS. I have been almost consumed with anxiety to complete the book. I prepared some chapters with what material I had, thinking that she would not write on these subjects. She did write on them, however, and I had my work to do over. Then I concluded it would be wiser to wait until the matter was ready.

About the parables: Before we send the book for the press, Sr. White must read it. She must concentrate her mind on the subject. She will no doubt wish to fill out some points, and will perhaps add several parables--possibly the Rich Man and Lazarus and the Unjust Steward. Now should she be called off from the "Life of Christ" to attend to this? Do you want the parables more than you want the large book? It is altogether safe to say that not one-twentieth of her time is given to book work. I might almost say, not one-fiftieth. But she has written some very precious things for Book 2, and I hope she will be able to complete the book soon.

I trust that the request I made about two months ago in regard to the parables will not be neglected. I want to be sure we are right before going ahead. Since last mail I have thought that we might cut down the

INTRODUCTION - PART B

parables, condensing the narrative and expository part, and omitting most of the personal application or exhortation. Then they could be combined, bringing several into one chapter. It might be better to use them in this way. I hope those who have an interest in the arrangement of the book will take the trouble to consider this matter now, while their criticism or suggestion will do some good. It would be so much better than regretting afterward that the book does not suit them.

On one hand the book will be incomplete without the parables. On the other, unless they are considerably condensed, I fear it will be a little heavy with them. But there is some narrative connected with them, and perhaps they ought to be condensed enough for the book. I feel that I must have counsel. But let it be remembered that the work is not finished. The articles still need some more editing. I have already had three of the four parable articles copied that would go in the first book. Sr. White has read them. So far as this first book is concerned, the use of the parables will require little extra labor. And it would not take so long to prepare parables and the life of Christ together as separately. With the last three chapters transposed to part 2 (the last three that are now in the book, I mean) the insertion of the parables in this first book would add to it only about a dozen pages of MS.¹

The disappointment over the first edition of Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing drove Ellen White to select the Pacific Press in Oakland, California, as her publishers. Writing to Edson and his wife Emma she clearly spoke her mind on this point.

We are now just sending off in this mail the first twenty chapters to Pacific Press. I cannot conscientiously have my book go through the press at Battle Creek. There has been so little dealing upon straight lines of principle, I can put but little reliance in anything they may say. If the devil tempts them to make it hard and trying for me, they will not

¹Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, March 11, 1897.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

see, they will not discern the evil. Judging from the past, therefore, I shall not place Life of Christ in their hands. I am sorry, so sorry.¹

A few weeks later she wrote to a friend, "My revised Life of Christ, the first book, has just gone to Pacific Press for them to handle, which means two thousand dollars American money."² The work referred to here must be Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing. The "revised" "Life of Christ" was not yet published if by that title one would understand Ellen White to be referring to the DA text. The expenses must have to do with the extra costs incurred in switching publishers and perhaps also the costs of obtaining the new illustrations.

Further evidence for this reconstruction of this history of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ is furnished by an excerpt from what appears to be a letter written in 1897. It is not difficult to understand from this background why she was looking in the direction of a Christian publisher outside the Adventist organization.

I expected that the sale of Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing would help me to help in advancing the work in Australia. But the way the book was kept back in America, after being in the hands of the publishers for two years, and then coming out in a style that I could in no wise accept, had disappointed me greatly. The delay also on the "Life of Christ," preparing suitable cuts, is another drawback. The means I hoped to obtain have not answered my expectations, and now I must do all I possibly can to help in various ways the cause in this

¹Ltr W-152-1896 (July 5).

²Ltr C-132-1896 (Aug. 30).

missionary field. . . .

Some felt very much dissatisfaction that Steps to Christ was given to Revell. I have received quite a sum of money, more than has come to me from some books; and I think more would come to me if he had more of my books to handle. He has written to me to send him writings on the childhood and life of Christ. He sent me copies that he had been using, but said that he would prefer my style of writing, and thought he could produce books better adapted to the necessities, and which would find a more ready sale than any they had on hand. I shall place more books in his hand as soon as I can get them prepared, for I can receive better satisfaction than I have received from the Battle Creek publishing house. There is an advantage in doing this, because they get the truth before a class that we will not reach.¹

As the time for publishing this major work on the life of Christ drew near the question of the book's title became an important issue to settle. E. M. Morrison suggested the name "The Desire of Ages" in a letter to C. H. Jones, manager of the Pacific Press Publishing Company.² He had taken the title from a poem by Frances Ridley Havergal. Marian Davis notified Jones in March of 1897 that of the two titles being suggested by Jones, "Desire of Ages" and "Desire of All Nations," "Sister White prefers the former, as I do, with all others who have expressed an opinion."³

The year of 1897 was evidently a particularly trying one

¹MS 80, 1897 (July 4) [No addressee].

²E. M. Morrison letter of August 24, 1896, White Estate Document File 89.

³Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, March 11, 1897. I am indebted to Robert Olson for supplying the documents from the file on C. H. Jones. Other titles under consideration were: "Christ Our Brother" (Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, Aug. 3 and 9, 1896), and "The Sunlight of Heaven" (Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, Nov. 9, 1896).

for Ellen White. She was pressed to complete the book on the life of Christ, to furnish articles for church journals, and to speak at various meetings. It would seem that she also sensed a deep personal obligation to work for the souls of those she felt faced eternal loss unless they turned to God. She tried several ways to accommodate these demands. Instead of writing for the magazines and much for the book it would appear she elected to concentrate on the life of Christ by allowing her writings to be worked into articles by others. Then Marian Davis would take some of the articles and from them construct chapters on the life of Christ. She explained this system in a letter to Jones.

Meanwhile Sister White is stirred up to write on the matter for the second part. I think my work on the first part has roused her to finish the book. She has written quite largely on some points, and is having much of the matter copied and sent out in place of writing especially for the mail.

. . . So you see we are short of help. However, the work on the new manuscript will be pushed forward as rapidly as possible. We intend to keep all our editing force on this as far as we can. When the great masses of matter are edited for the papers, it is much less work to select and compile for the book.¹

The attempt to combine her writing effort extended also to her personal letters. A letter to W. C. White includes three short sentences in this regard:

I am now writing on the feet-washing ordinance and on the Lord's Supper. Will send you the matter. I have decided from henceforth no letters go from me only of

¹Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, April 11, 1897.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

such a character as Bible subjects so that if I wish to use them in books I can do so.¹

The double editing of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ and the final selection process for the completed text of the DA explains why in the search for literary sources used by Ellen White we had to study the pre-edited texts where still available. These documents could be expected more accurately to reflect the work of Ellen White. In addition, the earlier manuscripts, letters, and articles would provide a broader and more realistic textual base than the limited compilation chosen for the DA text. It is only to be expected that some manuscript material will appear in the journals and also in the DA text; other portions of the text will be found in either the DA text or in article form; and still other will exist only in its manuscript stage. In most chapters where this process was evidently followed to some extent we have attempted to show the textual relationships through a table listing the sentences in parallel. Sentences from an earlier document not used in the DA text would be indicated by the missing sentence numbers for that manuscript or periodical article.²

Ellen White also hoped to handle the pressure of work through limitation and veiled threats to discontinue book

¹Ltr W-189-1897 (March 11).

²The table is identified as Table A.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

publication unless she received more help and better cooperation from the publishers. Both her anguish and her hope came through in a letter to W. C. White.

I shall certainly try to be excused from attending the campmeeting in Sydney and in Melbourne. I must have quietude and rest. I long for it, and these attacks of exhaustion must be avoided. I look over the congregation when I am at these meetings and see there persons whom I know will be lost unless they repent and are converted and I am then to carry the load. I cannot rest day nor night. The two last campmeetings have been meetings that have worn me terribly. I want now to complete my book if possible, but I tell you not another book will I ever consent to work as this Desire of Nations has been worked. If there is no person of a healthful mind to take the charge of my books, if I must be left with the help I now have, I am done. I am now having this one burden: to get through with that book, and I pray daily for help, but this is my one burden now.¹

As the year drew to a close Ellen White could finally declare, "The book on life of Christ is done. Thank the Lord for this."² Of course there was much left to be done in preparing the text for publication, as we shall note when discussing the work of Ellen White's literary helpers. But Ellen White could say, "I have had some most precious things for the book, the last chapter. My part is done now. Oh, thank the Lord. Praise His Holy Name He has spared my life to see the closing up of the book."³

Now that the text of the DA was finalized they could

¹Ltr W-198-1897 (Sept. 21)

²Ltr K-163-1897 (Dec. 20)

³Ltr W-211-1897 (Dec. 31)

INTRODUCTION - PART B

take the extra materials relating to parables and make up the text for what came to be called Christ's Object Lessons. According to a comment in a letter to Edson and Emma White the preparation of the book on the parables of Jesus also involved more writing.

Plans were made for me to remain over the Sabbath, and speak to the people in the evenings. But I cannot do this; for the subjects upon which I speak are of such intense interest to me that every fibre of being is stirred. I must return to "Sunnyside," and prepare the book on the parables to go in this mail, if we can get it ready. But I think I shall have to withhold it until next mail. We prepared the chapters on the parables for the large book on the life of Christ, and condensed them for this purpose. They must now be made fuller, seeing that they are to be put in a book by themselves.¹

The Desire of Ages was published in 1898. There was some criticism by the literature evangelists (colporteurs) over its size and about several other features.² The continual popularity of this life of Christ after nearly a century of publication as well as its translation into numerous languages testify to the successs achieved by Ellen White and her assistants in this writing venture.

The survey of the textual history behind the writing of The Desire of Ages naturally raises the question of Ellen White as a writer. In view of her admitted dependency on others to help her, what can be said about her work as

¹Ltr W-38-1898 (Feb. 2)

²For further details see How the Desire of Ages Was Written, an Ellen G. White Estate document prepared by Robert Olson, p. 43.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

distinguished from the activities of her literary assistants? To find our answer let us turn to her own statements and those of her helpers.

Ellen White as a Writer

The Adventist traditions about Ellen White are rather consistent in portraying her as an indefatigable worker. Her responsibilities were many and varied as the wife of a central figure in the early leadership of the Adventist Church, and as a prophetic and charismatic spokesperson in her own right. Several biographical studies on her life and work would appear to confirm our image of a devout, courageous, and forward-thinking nineteenth century woman.¹ But what was Ellen White as a writer? What can be discovered from her own comments on this aspect of her activities and from the statements penned by those who worked closely with her? What may we conclude in respect to her writing skills and habits, and her use of sources?

¹I have in mind here the multiple-volume biography by Arthur L. White, to which we have already made reference, and the unpublished and as yet uncirculated doctoral dissertation by Ron Graybill. We await the publication of Ellen G. White and Victorian America: A Study of Prophecy, Culture and Society by Jonathan Butler. The general summary of her work is not meant as a character study. My purpose here is merely to provide a very brief sketch of the background against which we shall consider Ellen White as a writer. It is an attempt to suggest the whole within which her activities as a writer are a part.

We would remind the reader that what follows is not an exhaustive study of Ellen White as a writer. Our purpose is merely to illuminate the historical and literary context within which her writings on the life of Christ are to be viewed. The large share of the evidence presented here comes from the documents which contain these writings and those written by her coworkers which refer to Ellen White as writer or editor.

The Writing of Ellen White. There seem to have been three basic assumptions or controlling presuppositions held by Ellen White in respect to her writings. Since they appear again and again in her statements they should not be overlooked or excluded in any serious review of her as a writer.

The most fundamental of these convictions was that she was writing (or speaking) God's messages on His authority. No matter by what system, mechanism, or intermediary the impression or message was transmitted to her, the ultimate source was God. Note her comment, following, published in 1902, only four years after the DA was completed.

Sister White is not the originator of these books. They contain the instruction that during her life-work God has been giving her. They contain the precious, comforting light that God has graciously given His servant to be given to the world. From their pages this light is to shine into the hearts of men and women, leading them to the Saviour.¹

¹Colporteur Evangelist, p. 36.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

A similar statement may be found in a very early letter.

The truth is like fire shut up in my bones and I must speak that I may be relieved. I greatly regret that I have not done more the present season in going to different points. God has given me a testimony that no other one has and I am responsible for the great gift. Our people in California know but little of me, but they shall be better acquainted ere long. At the camp-meeting I shall meet many I have never seen, many who have been brought newly to the faith. I am not now studying what would be agreeable to me but what is my duty.¹

Confidence in God's selection of herself as a messenger not only gave her a sense of destiny and duty but also encouraged in her a sense of expectancy.

This is an important time just now, the closing up of the book on life of Christ. I want quiet and restfulness, that if the Lord has anything to impress upon my mind,² I can discern the subject and prepare it for the book.

This basic orientation or self-understanding of her work carried with it an overwhelming feeling of inadequacy. The glory and majesty of God and the holiness of His thought seemed to her to be overpowering. The following two paragraphs from a letter to Elder O. A. Olsen, then president of the General Conference, are typical of expressions sprinkled all through her writings.

This week I have been enabled to commence writing on the life of Christ. Oh, how inefficient, how incapable I am of expressing the things which burn in my soul in reference to the mission of Christ! I have hardly dared to enter upon the work. There is so much

¹Ltr W-31-1878.

²Ltr W-173-1896 (Nov. 29).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

to it all. And what shall I say, and what shall I leave unsaid? I lie awake nights pleading with the Lord for the Holy Spirit to come upon me, to abide upon me.

I walk with trembling before God. I know not how to speak or trace with pen the large subject of the atoning sacrifice. I know not how to present subjects in the living power in which they stand before me. I tremble for fear lest I shall belittle the great plan of salvation by cheap words. I bow my soul in awe and reverence before God and say, "Who is sufficient for these things?"¹

Additional statements appear below in connection with Ellen White's denial of human influence.

Of particular importance for our study of Ellen White as a writer is her consistent admission she was not up to the task of putting these messages from God in writing. It was not a general feeling of inadequacy for the task of communicating the truths of God as referred to above. Here we have reference to her recognition of the lack of a specific skill, the ability to write in an acceptable manner for the reading public.

While working on SP Vol. II, she made two entries in her diary which clearly signal her self-appraisal as a writer.

We rose early to prepare to go to San Francisco. My heart is inexpressibly sad. This morning I take into candid consideration my writings. My husband is too feeble to help me prepare them for the printer, therefore I shall do no more with them at present. I am not a scholar. I cannot prepare my own writings for the press. Until I can do this I shall write no more. It is not my duty to tax others with my manuscript.²

¹Ltr O-40-1892 (July 15), cited by Robert Olson in How the Desire of Ages Was Written, p. 23.

²MS 3, 1873, p. 5 (Jan. 10), cited by Robert Olson, op.

We rested well last night. This Sabbath morning opens cloudy. My mind is coming to strange conclusions. I am thinking I must lay aside my writing I have taken so much pleasure in, and see if I cannot become a scholar. I am not a grammarian. I will try, if the Lord will help me, at forty-five years old to become a scholar in the science. God will help me. I believe he will.¹

Ellen White's plans to "become a scholar" were not to be realized. To compensate for this natural consequence of a very limited formal educational experience, she sought the assistance of others. The work of her literary helpers will be reviewed below.

Within the framework provided by these three working presuppositions, her special calling, the importance of her responsibilities, and the need to depend upon others in preparing her communications for the reading public, Ellen White accomplished her writing and publishing goals. Her letters and diary notations are replete with reference to her writing, often citing subjects and pages. The February 4, 1873, entry records that she "Wrote twenty-seven pages upon the blessings Christ pronounced upon the mount."² On February 7 she remarked "I again resumed my writing upon Spirit of Prophecy."³

cit., pp. 10, 11.

¹Ibid., p. 5 (Jan. 11).

²MS 4, 1873.

³Ibid.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Though she often wrote in "the night seasons" or early in the mornings these were not exclusively her writing times. She would often write throughout the day as the following excerpts disclose:

I have felt drawn out in earnest petitions to God all day. In the early morning I wrote nine pages before breakfast and wrote many pages through the day. I spoke in the hall to a good congregation.

I felt most intensely upon some points, especially the inauguration of Christ, on the banks of Jordan, to His appointed work. The dedication of Christ was not to be mingled with any human agency. What an event was this--Christ entering upon his work with the seal of divinity upon Him!¹

I have just returned from Sherman Campmeeting. I felt so stupid, so lifeless, that although I slept well nights, I would as soon as I attempted to write, lose myself, nod, and make large scrawls with my pen. I tried to the uttermost of my power to change this condition of things and I could not. Days I could not make my brain work. All the noise and hammering had not the least effect on me; when I could write I was as one who heard not, and could write all day as fast as my pen could go over the paper, then again came this benumbing, stupiness that almost drove me distracted because I could not work. I had given up all thought of attending the meeting until I was so affected with this sleepiness, then I said I cannot endure this, I will go to the meeting.²

Ellen White, to the consternation of some Adventists, extended her writing activities into the hours of the Sabbath. Her diary contains this comment for Sabbath, May 31, 1873: "I have written twenty-two pages of matter in my copy book."³ The entry for a Sabbath in August of the same

¹MS 52, 1890 (Dec. 16).

²Ltr W-11-1891 (June 29).

³MS 7, 1873 (May 31).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

year reads as follows:

We devoted some time in prayer to God alone before breakfast. We had some assurance of His presence and of His grace. We wrote twenty-one pages of foolscap. We had no rest upon the Sabbath.¹

In response to a criticism over her Sabbath-keeping, Ellen White defended her practice by an appeal to the practice by the priests of Israel who offered sacrifices on Sabbath.

I have ever been particular in regard to the observance of the Sabbath in my conversation and actions. In regard to writing, I know my duty on that point. I am no more breaking the Sabbath in my writing than the priest who offered more sacrifices upon the Sabbath than upon any other days of the week.²

It was customary for Ellen White to use what she called "scratch books." These books or journals were of various kinds and sizes. Some were the simple exercise or writing tablets very similar to what may be found today where school supplies are sold. They were bound rather than loose-leaf and the page size was approximately 6 by 8 inches. She also wrote on diaries which were outdated. The size would correspond to what we would call foolscap today (8"x12") and is probably what Ellen White referred to when she spoke of so many pages of "foolscap" being written. The content varied within one day's entry, within one book, and between books. No order or arrangement is apparent within the journals which

¹MS 10, 1873 (Aug. 23).

²Ltr C-1-1873 (Nov. 12).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

remain for our study today. Evidently Ellen White picked up one and wrote on a topic and while this material was being copied she would use another one. The lack of a system or topical index made it difficult and time-consuming to locate the previous material on any given topic. Even the corrected copies were evidently stored in boxes without the use of an indexing system to facilitate retrieval.

I have today sent you a copy of the testimony given for you some time ago, read to you and Adelia in Oregon. I would not now have taken the pains to look through stored away copy to find this and copy it if I did not feel that it would be for your good to have it. I tried many times to find it but could not. I found it last Friday, after a long and diligent search. Please read it carefully.¹

The scratch books held DA material on various chapters. Writing to W. C. White, Ellen White described her writing method.

I write some every day on the life of Christ. One chapter sets my mind fresh upon other subjects so that I have several scratch books that I am writing upon.²

We may wish today she had been more careful about these writings. We have pages missing from some of the journals and also loose pages evidently cut out with a razor or knife from a journal. Most of the original text in its handwritten form no longer exists. On the other hand we have much more of Ellen White's original or first copies than we have of many

¹Ltr V-8-1884 (Feb. 26).

²Ltr W-132-1893 (July 2).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

other writers whose works we treasure.

We can be thankful Ellen White made some effort to preserve her writings for her own use even if neither she nor her assistants established any orderly way to carry it out. She went so far as to request people to return her letters. She wrote to her son Edson, "Preserve all my letters. I may wish some selections from this for some purpose."¹ She asked the same of a church member and was careful to include her return address.

I sent you a letter written from Bourough Valley, but I did not copy it and there are some ideas which I wrote under the movings of the Spirit of God and I want to preserve them; therefore I wish you to return to me the letter. Address me: Mrs. E. G. White, Healdsburg, Cal., Box 65.

I seek to preserve every thought and every matter written when I am burdened and feel urged to write, and especially when the matter lays open before me as clearly as that did at the time I wrote. I wish it could have been received by you as truth, but as nothing seems to move you from your own determined purpose, I can say nothing further.²

This practice of preserving her writings upon a trust that others would return the original was begun early in Ellen White's writing career. In 1864 she included the following request in a letter: "Please copy and return this to me. I have to have a copy of all I send out that I can refer to the original if necessary."³

¹Letter to Edson and Emma, August 6, 1874.

²Ltr H-39-1888 (Aug. 29).

³Ltr I-15a-1864.

It is clear that Ellen White preserved the writings of others as well. In covering this aspect of her writing methods it might be helpful also to include here her claims, denials, or references to the use of literary works in the production of her writings.

Ellen White's Use of Literary Sources. The records show that when James White was editing the Review Ellen White would spend time at the publishing house in Battle Creek, Michigan. The papers and journals coming to the editorial office provided a ready access to Christian articles and books. Several notes in her diary of 1873 refer to spending "some time in the office preparing matter for Reformer."¹ Ellen White had a "corner" in this health journal and she often included quotations from other writers, giving the name of the author and where the quotation could be found. When she and her husband were in the West the Review and Christian Weekly followed them.² She specifically mentioned in another journal entry how in visiting the home of Brother Kellogg she "borrowed a book to select piece for Reformer."³ In this same excerpt she speaks of spending the afternoon "at the

¹MS 5, 1873 (Mar. 23, 25).

²MS 9, 1873 (July 24)

³MS 5, 1873 (Mar. 26). In the entry for April 3, 1873, she mentioned the arranging of a room at the office where she could write without being interrupted. The next day she noted: "I took out pieces from papers worth preserving." (MS 6, 1873).

office selecting pieces for my department in Reformer."1

The Reformer articles are not only unique in that they contain quotations from various authors and give the names and sources quoted, but she evidently gave someone else the right (at least in one instance) to change what she had written. In a letter to Dr. Kellogg she directed, "I send you article for next Reformer. It has been in testimonies which I have selected and arranged. You can cut down, change any portion of it, accept it or reject it as you choose."2

About six years earlier some of her readers were struck by the similarity of her material to that of other health reformers. Ellen White referred to this concern in the following comment which may be found in The Story of Our Health Message.

That which I have written in regard to health was not taken from books or papers. As I related to others the things which I had been shown, the question was asked, "Have you seen the paper, The Laws of Life of the Water Cure Journal?" I told them no, I had not seen either of the papers. Said they, "What you have seen agrees very much with much of their teachings." I talked freely with Dr. Lay and many others upon the things which had been shown me in reference to health. I had never seen a paper treating upon health.

After the vision was given me my husband was aroused upon the health question. He obtained books, upon our eastern journey, but I would not read them. My view was clear. And I did not want to read anything until I had fully completed my books. My views were written independent of books or of the opinions of others.³

1 Ibid.

2 Ltr K-66-1878 (Feb. 6).

3 MS 7, 1867, quoted by D. E. Robinson in The Story

Later in her ministry she underscored the fact that her messages were of divine origin and in harmony with the Scriptures.

What a battle I am obliged to fight! My brethren seem to judge me as taking positions that are not necessary. They do not see that God in his own wisdom has made revelations to me which cannot successfully be contradicted or disputed. Nothing can rub out that which has been presented to me and imprinted on the tablets of my soul. All the oppositions or gainsaying to make my testimony of none effect only compels from me, by the urgency of the Spirit of God, a more decided repetition, and to stand on the light revealed with all the force of the strength God has given me. All the arguments of men, all their opposing influence, is of no force to me. . . .

Every word spoken is in harmony with the living Oracles, and it is only by wresting the Scriptures from their true meaning, by misapplying and misinterpreting them, and the testimonies which God has given me, that this can be gainsaid.¹

This same emphasis on the revelatory basis of her messages is found in a letter to a Bro. Larson.

I see that you regard my work and my mission as on a level with your own work. . . . When I stand before the people I do not stand in my own spirit. My words are not mine, but His who sent me, and has given me a message to bear. If you consider the words a rebuke, take them; for the Lord meant them to you as such.²

We must admit that the claims for the divine origin of her messages in the face of obvious use of literary sources does present a conundrum. I have not found it helpful to

of Our Health Message (Nashville, TN: Southern Publishing Association, 1943), p. 78.

¹MS 25, 1890

²Ltr L-18d-1890

INTRODUCTION - PART B

attempt a separation between her writings. Her own statements clearly indicate she did not make such a distinction with reference to the source behind them. To pick and choose among her written or spoken messages given in the context of public presentation or in private communications seems unwarranted. The following excerpt from a letter makes the point in a general way but there is no scarcity of such affirmations throughout her writings.¹

I took up this work, to be faithful in it as I would in the articles I write for our papers and the discourses given before the congregation. I must meet my work in the judgment.²

Further comment on this apparent inconsistency in Ellen White's statements in regard to the sources behind her writings may be found in the research report, particularly the last chapter. To attempt to solve the problem would take us beyond the scope of this research project.

Ellen White used what she called "scrapbooks" to preserve the items she copied from various books and papers she read. Apparently she also had scrapbooks containing her own compositions. She also stored her previously written materials in boxes. Marian Davis found this collection almost overwhelming when she was set out to gather together

¹Cf. Colporteur Ministry, p. 126 and Selected Messages, Book 3, pp. 121-124, as two samples of her views on this issue.

²Ltr W-81-1889.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Ellen White's writings for the DA text.

You will perhaps remember some things I said last spring about the necessity of having the matter from articles and scrap-books, that might be available for use in the life of Christ, copied, so as to be convenient for reference. Perhaps you can imagine the difficulty of trying to bring together points relating to any subject, when these must be gleaned from thirty scrap books, a half dozen bound volumes, and fifty manuscripts, all covering thousands of pages.¹

Evidently somewhere among these items Ellen White was preserving her selections. In a letter written from Oakland, California, she mentioned the problem of preparing "a piece for the Reformer." In this connection she wrote: "Do not neglect to send my selections for I want them to use. Send my scrap books also."²

In my search for these "scrapbooks" and "bound volumes" I discovered only a few scrapbooks containing clippings from magazines. There were poems, sermons, stories, and miscellaneous excerpts on moral, religious, and educational topics, as well as on health and nature. In none did I find handwritten or typescript of her writings. Unless I missed something these scrapbooks did not contain materials from the "lives" she was consulting. The only bound volumes to be found were the diary journals. These number more than the "half dozen" Marian Davis used. We can only surmise that

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, March 29, 1893.

²Ltr W-25-1877 (Oct. 16).

the other scrapbooks have been lost. The additional journals could have been added in the years since Marian Davis started her compilation. It is also possible some journals contained other subject matter and were not counted in this listing of collected writings on the life of Christ. At any rate several of the diary journals which remain until today contain life of Christ matter.

It seems to me reasonable to assume that when Ellen White speaks of copying her own writings she is copying them in her journals or diaries. The disjunctive discourse may reflect these insertions though the lack of obvious arrangement could also reflect the frequent interruptions.

The following excerpt may be interpreted to support some such reconstruction of Ellen White's writing habits.

It is a foggy morning. A board is fastened against the wall, one for my husband and one for myself, that we can stand up and write instead of sitting down. I commenced to prepare matter for the Instructor. I wrote Brother Kellogg six pages of note paper. Sent my children four pages. Copied seven pages of matter I wished to preserve.¹

If Ellen White's use of the term "scrapbook" is understood not to apply to her diary journals but to those collections of stories and miscellaneous selections pasted into what we would recognize as scrapbooks, the quotation from a letter to a "Sister Laura Harper" is puzzling.

¹MS 3, 1873 (Jan. 7).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Be not offended because I call you thus, for this is your true name. Since coming on this ground I find in my scrapbook a letter which should have been sent to you long ago. For some reasons it did not go to you, and I now write you a few lines. . . .

I write because I love your soul. I take no copy of this, and as you showed so little respect for my request in regard to my last letter, I shall not trust this with you. I send it to your father, and I want it returned to me. If you want to copy it, you may.¹

What are we to understand as to the form of the letter in the "scrapbook"? Had it been written directly on the page she would have had to copy it for mailing, and she does not refer to copying the letter from the scrapbook. Had it been in this form she would have had her copy in hand and would not have insisted they return her letter. We can only conclude that the letter was in her original handwriting and either lightly attached or, most likely, just "filed" between the pages of the scrapbook. Had it been in corrected form the original would have been with Ellen White's other materials and she would not have had to ask for the letter to be returned.

Perhaps our reconstruction is inaccurate. I find it difficult to make any other sense of her statement. At any rate we may conclude that some of her scrapbooks did contain her own writings in one form or another. No doubt they also contained as well, selections from the writings of others whether in paraphrased or in verbatim form.

¹Ltr H-51-1889 (May 19).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

It is also possible that Ellen White was not using her terms as technically and specifically as we have interpreted her to have. She also speaks of finding a letter in one of her "scratch books." In a note addressed to "Dear brethren Daniells, Colcord, Faulkhead, and Salisbury," she writes:

While examining my scratch books for an article which I wished to find, I came across the letter which I am sending to you. I supposed it had been copied and sent. I will have it copied and sent to you on the morrow. I dare not neglect this matter. I am sorry that for some reason there has been a delay.¹

Perhaps by "scratch books" here, as well as the "scrapbook" quotation mentioned above, she had in mind what we know as her diaries or journals.²

Since we have some of her diaries from this period we could possibly verify this assumption by looking there for a copy of this letter. The note appears to be dated January 13, 1897, but the letter to which it refers has been filed in the 1896 drawer. Evidently the copy of the letter has been preserved.

There is no problem with the manuscript material. Many of these still remain and Ellen White added to the number as she continued to prepare the DA text. Several manuscripts on the life of Christ from 1897 are still to be found among her writings.

¹Ltr D-27-1896 (Jan. 13, 1897).

²See earlier comment on "scratch books," pp. 144, 145.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Ellen White has an intriguing statement in a letter to Elder Haskell written while she was working on the DA text. She had not time to make a copy and wanted him to copy the letter for her. Evidently he would return the original letter. The interesting comment is found in reference to the nature and source of the material she wished to preserve.

Brother Haskell, I have written this by lamplight, yesterday and this morning. If you cannot read every word then send it back and I will copy and return you a clean copy. If you can read it, copy it for me, for some things presented themselves as I wrote that I wish to preserve; they have helped me while writing. I have much good matter just come from Melbourne. I have no time to copy.¹ [Underlining supplied.]

We have already indicated above that Ellen White combined at times her writing on the life of Christ and her letters to denominational leaders. Some were later made into testimonies and some of this material was also selected by Marian Davis for the DA. Often these letters contained selections paraphrased from sources. With this general background in mind it is interesting to ponder the meaning of the phrase, "for some things presented themselves as I wrote," and also the comment, "I have much good matter just come from Melbourne." Does she refer to material from a book or to impressions from God? Could it be both? Was she impressed to select items from a source? And what is the "good matter" received from Melbourne? We shall have

¹Ltr H-251-1895 (May 31).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

occasion below to refer to Marian Davis' experiences in attending the meetings being held at Melbourne. Did Marian supply Ellen White with source materials for use in the writing on the life of Christ? The ambiguous quote raises some questions which cannot be answered with certainty without further evidence.

We do have specific references to several books used by Ellen White in writing on the life of Christ. In order to establish literary dependency one must not only be able to show textual similarities. There should also be some evidence to indicate the writer had access to editions of these works dating from an earlier time. In addition to the bibliographies developed from the documents prepared for establishing the estate of Ellen White at the time of her death, we have several notations from her writings which name specific books. The Ellen White Estate collected most of these references and has circulated them, at least since 1979.¹

As early as 1876 when she was working on the SP text Ellen White mentioned to either Mary Kelsey-White or Mary Clough that "You need not send Walks and Homes of Jesus," a topical book on the life of Christ by Daniel March.² Two

¹I refer here to books mainly on the life of Christ. See under footnote no. 1, page 108, for a partial listing of the Ellen G. White Estate documents providing this information.

²Ltr 27a, 1876.

years later in a letter to Mary White, W. C. White's first wife, she requested two books. "Send books, red-covered Jewish Antiquities and the Bible Dictionary. Is Night Scenes of the Bible there? If so, send it."¹

The general titles of the first two books mentioned make specific identification problematical. The first title could refer to the work by Josephus carrying the same name, and the second work could be Kitto's dictionary. Night Scenes is Daniel March's selection of episodes in the life of Jesus which took place at night. A general letter to her sons William and Edson includes the request to Mary White to "find me some histories of the Bible that would give me the order of events."²

Several books are mentioned by W. C. White in a letter to B. L. Whitney who was connected with the publishing office in Basel, Switzerland, which handled the French and German editions of Ellen White's life of Christ.

I also enclose a list of books prepared by Sister Davis which she wishes to have examined by some of your party that we may know if any of them will be valuable to us in our Bible study or the preparation of articles on Bible subjects. After reading the memoranda as prepared by Sister Davis I see there is little I need to say. Perhaps you will want some of these in the office library. . . .

You will note what they say about the cuts in Farrar's Life of Christ. This is just the way they

¹Ltr 60, 1878.

²Ltr 38, 1885.

talked at first about those in the Child's Life of Christ. . . .

Please buy of Cassell one set [of] Wylie's Prot., one Hanna's Life of Christ, and for your library I think you would do well to have a set of Geikie's Hours With the Bible. If you have not already obtained them in New York, you ought to inquire for, and purchase for your library, The Temple and its Services, Jewish Social Life, Andrew's Life of Our Lord, a good harmony of the Gospels, and other works that will be useful to your wife in preparing notes for the Sabbath School lessons. She ought to have a copy of the latest and best Bible dictionary.¹

Here we see reference to several lives of Christ, a history of the Protestant reformation, and Edersheim's history and background to the Old Testament. Apart from the work of Child and Wiley's church history text we will meet all these books in the literary source studies made on the 15 chapters of the DA. We have no idea to which work Ellen White refers in the following note taken from her letter to Elder Littlejohn.

I received your present of the book entitled "Life of Christ" and thank you for the gift. I have been so overloaded with cares and responsibilities, having had so much writing and speaking to do, that I have not yet had time to read the book.²

While we have not found references to all the "lives" or sermons Ellen White evidently consulted in her writings on the life of Christ, it is clearly evident by her general remarks and specific references to books on the topic that

¹W. C. White Letter Book A-2 (Jan. 16, 1887), pp. 74-76.

²Ltr L-48-1894 (June 3).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

she made use of the writings of others in the composition of her own. Marian Davis admits that "In the order of chapters we followed Andrew's Harmony, as given in his life of Christ. He is generally regarded as the very best authority, and is quoted by leading writers."¹ That she would find such writings helpful is only to be expected of one who was convinced she was "a poor writer."²

In the foregoing discussion we have attempted to present Ellen White as a writer, using her own claims and those who worked closely with her. Our purpose has been to provide the context for understanding why the study was designed the way it was and to provide some background for looking at the sources Ellen White used. The focus centered on Ellen White as writer. In view of the fact that she used others in the production of her works, it is possible that further insight might be provided by approaching the basic issue from the other side. By noting what she required of her assistants we may come to better understand what work Ellen White did not undertake, whether or not, given the time, she could have done it. We may also discover those tasks which Ellen White clearly felt she did not have the ability to perform. In either case we can reasonably assume that Ellen White

¹Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, Nov. 23, 1896 (W. C. W. Letter Book 10-A, p. 17a).

²Ltr P-67-1894 (Jan. 18) to W. W. Prescott.

fulfilled those writing responsibilities not given to her helpers. We therefore turn our attention to the work of these literary assistants.

The Work of Ellen White's Secretaries

Ellen White, during the many years of active participation in the leadership (though indirectly) of the early Adventist Church, employed many assistants of various kinds. The need for help increased as her travel took on international scope, her book production expanded, and after her life companion, James White, died in 1881.

Judging from her many statements on the work of her literary assistants one cannot avoid the impression that it was in connection with her publishing activities that she felt her greatest vulnerability. Ellen White entertained no illusion over her writing skills. She knew she did not have the education required to prepare articles and books. At the same time, the nature of her writings and the authority she felt they should carry if she were to be faithful to her God-given duty required that she maintain the control over the literary productions which carried her name. That tension created by the need to depend upon others yet not surrender the independence of the text is not only felt in her use of sources but also in the use of literary

assistants. We shall have occasion in our survey of the various tasks her assistants fulfilled, to sense this tension and note how she endeavored to balance the two demands. We shall look at their activities as copyists, reporters, and editors of articles and books.

The copyists and their work. One of the earliest copyists was Lucinda Hall,¹ a friend of Ellen White. For a time "Brother and Sister Van Horn" were copying an article on the temptation of Christ for publication.² Sister Van Horn also copied material for the SP text.³ We read of a Mary Smith Abbey who attended Ellen White on one of her journeys. Of her work Ellen White wrote, "I thought she would be a good copyist, good singer and serviceable in many ways."⁴ Before coming to the East Mary Clough was doing some copying.⁵

Ellen White expected her copyists to make corrections. She desired others who checked her work to also make corrections. It was a disappointment for her when they did not improve her composition. James White and Elder Waggoner both proved to be poor copiers in Ellen White's view.

Matter at Petaluma was needed for labor there next week. I put copy in Elder Waggoner's hand to copy. He just did a miserable job. He did not change anything or

¹Ltr W-17-1871 (Nov. 10).

²Ltr W-5-1874 (Jan. 23).

³Ltr W-16-1874 (Feb. 24).

⁴Ltr W-47-1878 (Aug. 28).

⁵Ltr 4, 1876 (Apr. 7). Mary Clough, a niece of Ellen White, was not an Adventist.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

improve it at all. I prize Mary more and more every day.¹

We are driving matters on testimonies. Tell me how it comes out. I want to know how it reads. Is the composition passable? Father does not make any changes and my copist [sic] will follow copy precisely even to wrong spelling although both have been teachers.²

We have no interest here to record the names of all those who served Ellen White as copyists. A few more notations may, however, give us a better grasp of what Ellen White expected of them.

Ellen White wanted her copyist to correct spelling and general sentence construction, in addition to copying the material on the "calligraph" or typewriter.³ She did not expect them to add to the text. In a letter to Marian Davis over the difficulties being experienced with Fannie Bolton we catch a glimpse of the work of a copyist even though Fannie Bolton had other responsibilities as well.

Fannie, poor soul, does not know herself. I have talked with her, and told her that I must know of what she complains in the work she has had to do. She must tell me the real cause for all this disaffection, but all she could say was that sometimes I left sentences incomplete. I reminded her, that I was often interrupted in my writing, and sometimes in the middle of a sentence, and that when I resumed the work I would go right on, not noticing the incomplete sentence. But I had told her that when this occurred she might either hand the matter to me or else strike it out and go on. Doing as much writing as I do, it is not surprising if there are many sentences left unfinished.⁴

¹Ltr 59, 1876 (Apr. 8).

²Ltr W-62-1878 (Dec. 19).

³Cf. Ltr W-117-1893 (July 12).

⁴Ltr D-103-1895 (Nov. 12). The problem between Ellen

INTRODUCTION - PART B

The copyists had the liberty to correct the sentences, even to omitting the incomplete sentences if Ellen White was not around to finish the expression. From this we may deduce that Ellen White was practical in her approach. We know from other comments that she was aware of her tendency at times to repeat herself. The reading and proof-checking by Ellen White and her associates would also provide a control on whether, in the case of omission, the remaining text made sense.

Ellen White felt free to call upon her children to help in the task of copying. In one letter addressed to "Dear Children" a passing remark with reference to copying gives us a clue on how to evaluate the content of her letters.

I shall send you in this letter copies of letters written to Dr. Kellogg because I have not time to copy one. These letters I ask you to copy and send to him, and you can take copies for yourself. Send me a copy, for I wish to preserve all I write except such letters as I write to you now. . . .

I am so tired today--brain tired--I cannot write much, but the copy of letters sent you will perhaps make up for the lack of my writing personally to you. I am always glad to receive your letters.¹

I have not made a thorough study of all the letters

White and Fannie Bolton will be alluded to in other quotations to follow. For those interested in reading more about the claims and counter-claims to be found in the letters of Ellen White and Fannie Bolton the White Estate has further information available. Alice Gregg has written an account of the story in "Fannie's Folly," Adventist Currents, Vol. 1, No. 2, Oct., 1983.

¹Ltr W-161-1896 (Nov. 23).

which remain from Ellen White's extensive correspondence. This notation that excludes "such letters as I write to you" may indicate that she considered her family correspondence to be outside the limits of her messages from the Lord. If this distinction is maintained by Ellen White it would offer some guidance for those compiling her material as counsel to the church. Obviously the letters to her children are important for the reconstruction of the history and background to Ellen White's other writings and activities.

Thus far we have been discussing the work of the copyists. Often the task of copying went hand in hand with work that also demanded some compositional skills. One job demanding speed and accuracy as well as writing ability was that of reporting.

The copyist as reporter. One of the earliest references to Ellen White's workers serving as reporters appears in a letter to Lucinda Hall. In this comment we are not told if the reports included quotations from the addresses of Ellen White. That the papers are newspapers of the day and not Adventist journals appears clear from Ellen White's reference to "reporters" and giving the count as 32.

Mary [Clough] worked early and late. She reported for thirty-two important papers. We had no idea she was getting so much work on her hands, but as soon as it was known by her articles the ability of her pen, she was beset by reporters to furnish reports for the various papers in which they were interested until it reached

INTRODUCTION - PART B

this number. She wrote constantly--reports varying in matter and size to accommodate different papers.¹

While Ellen White was in Australia Maggie Hare served as a reporter. When the work became too much for Miss Hare alone to handle, or when there were other writing demands to occupy her time, Emily Campbell, Ellen White's bookkeeper and secretary filled in.

We have nothing to do to call Emily off from her work. She has been at her bookkeeping. She does nothing at housework. Maggie Hare goes with me and takes my talks and writes them out.²

We are in the midst of stirring times just now. Brother Shannon, who lives in Sydney, has been arrested and prosecuted for working on Sunday. . . . My secretary, Sister Emily Campbell, was also present to take shorthand notes of the proceedings. If I can get the reports from the secular papers, I will send them to you.³

Maggie Hare also reported the lectures of W. W. Prescott. In the following portion of a letter to Edson White we also may note Ellen White's keen evaluation of Prescott's sermons. No doubt Ellen White at times drew from such sources for her writings even as she took from the writings of others when she viewed their comments as carrying the stamp of Heaven's approval. It is regrettable that this investigation could not include a serious search of Adventist writers and speakers for possible source parallels.

¹Ltr H-62-1876 (Sept. 29).

²Ltr W-142-1894 (Feb. 12).

³Ltr H-30-1894 (Aug. 13).

There simply was no time to stretch the project's scope to this extent.

In the evening Professor Prescott gave a most powerful discourse, instruction precious as gold. The tent was full, and many were standing outside. All seemed to be fascinated with the word of God as the speaker presented the truth in new lines, separating the truth from the companionship of error, and by the divine influence of the Spirit of God making it to shine like precious jewels. . . .

Seldom can I give myself the pleasure of listening to discourses from our ministering brethren; but Sabbath forenoon I attended the meeting and heard Professor Prescott preach. I know that since coming to this place he has had the outpouring of the Holy Spirit; his lips have been touched with a live coal from off the altar. We know and can distinguish the voice of the true Shepherd. The truth has been poured forth from the lips of the servant of God as the people had never heard it before; unbelievers turn pale and say, That man is inspired. . . . Maggie Hare, my reporter and typewriter, has been taking the discourses of Professor Prescott and writing them out so that they may be published in pamphlet or tract form.¹

The move from reporter to an editor of journal articles was no doubt only one of degree. Clearly the composition of a newspaper report involved some skill in arrangement and an ability to grasp and hold the reader's attention. Ellen White, however, apparently saw these various responsibilities as differing, particularly in the amount of trust she found necessary to invest in the worker. Because of her evident distinctions also between the editing of articles and books we will treat these two activities as separate ones. The similarities between these two applications of editorial

¹Ltr W-82-1895 (Nov.).

skills will mean some overlap or duplication of Ellen White comment in the two final subsections of this chapter.

The editors of journal articles. Ellen White seems to have had no difficulty with her letters. She was satisfied that they adequately expressed her thoughts and needed only copying and correction of the obvious errors of punctuation, spelling, and fundamental grammar. Evidently she was not seriously concerned over their compositional arrangement since they were not written for publication. It was an altogether different matter when it came to her articles and especially in respect to her books which we shall cover in the next section.

When Ellen White first prepared articles and books for publication she had the assistance of James White, her children, and Mary Clough. A diary entry in 1872 gives the following account: "Read my manuscript to my husband and corrected it for printer."¹ Another journal note states: "I looked over my writings with my husband. Prepared twenty pages of manuscript for a printer."² One more entry around the middle of the year had Ellen White reading over a manuscript for the Review and correcting it while on the way to the post office. The context indicates her husband was riding alongside her and evidently looking over the text with

¹MS 4, 1872 (Sunday, July 28).

²MS 4, 1873 (Sabbath, Feb. 8).

her.¹ On one occasion when James White was away she took her pamphlet on "Sufferings of Christ" to the Review office for Uriah Smith to "criticize."² W. C. White's wife, Mary Kelsey White, was also brought into the work of "reading proof and preparing matter for paper."³ Her children had the freedom to take available material and construct articles for the Reformer. In one case she attached this note to a letter to Edson and Emma:

P.S. If my manuscript does not come in time for the Reformer, select from the matter written to the office or that I have sent you some things that will be appropriate upon health reform, or bearing upon it.⁴

Ellen White seems to have been confident in her ability to recognize when the work was done properly even though she did not have the skills to arrange the text. In one instance she wrote her husband: "This was rather a trying subject to write upon, but Mary and I have read it over this afternoon, and pronounce it excellent, excellent."⁵

The articles took less editing than did the preparation of books. A work similar to editing articles was involved in preparing, on occasion, rather lengthy letters which Ellen White wrote to several church leaders. Part of the content of one letter would be left out of the same when addressed to

¹MS 9, 1873 (Tuesday, July 22).

²Ltr W-44-1874 (July 17).

³Ltr W-5-1876 (Apr. 11).

⁴Ltr W-14-1872.

⁵Ltr W-15-1876 (Apr. 27).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

another individual. An example of this type of editing may be noted in her instructions to W. C. White.

Willie, I did not expect to write so long a letter, but I trace out this matter as I have now. If you will put this into Fanny's hands, and let her put it into shape, cutting out the stove business and anything you deem best, I will make this letter serve so that it will save me writing to Elder Haskell and some other long letters. Please consider this, and if Fanny arranges it in shape, send it back to me.¹

Fannie Bolton had the job of preparing the articles for the church papers from the writings or "articles" of Ellen White. The diary entry for July 5, 1893, records that Ellen White "arose early" in the "morning to prepare and complete articles to send to Fannie for the papers, articles on the life of Christ for Marian, letters for Willie."² Marian Davis was working on the DA text.

The nature and extent of editorial work needed to put Ellen White's work in shape for publishing is not clearly described. We get one account of this work in a letter of Ellen White to Elder Olsen. In the following excerpt Ellen White was giving an account of what George Starr told her Fannie had said.

Brother Starr came to me and talked with me in reference to things Fanny had said to him. He said he was reading from the testimonies, and making remarks in regard to the clear light presented before them for us in these last days, and spoke of the beautiful language used in a certain testimony. Fannie took him after

¹Ltr W-74-1892 (Oct. 10).

²MS 81, 1893 (July 5).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

meeting and asked him, If he thought it was right to give all the credit to Sister White, and make no mention of the workers, Marian and herself. She said the ideas and preparations of the articles were almost entirely changed from the writings of Sister White. That her writings came in such a shape that they had to be made all over and that she got all the credit, and those who were engaged in fitting up these articles received no recognition. Elder Starr said he met her squarely, and said, What do you mean by saying these things to me? He said it went like a dagger to his heart. She has talked these things to Marian and Marian I fear has been led into much of the same views, but has not done to the extent of Fannie. . . .¹

Some time later Ellen wrote a letter to Marian Davis giving more details of how Fannie had modified her writings. From these remarks of Ellen White we are able better to understand what these literary assistants were expected to do and what they were forbidden to do.

She had underscored some words in a book "Christian Education," "beautiful words," she called them, and said that she had put in those words, they were hers. If this were the truth, I ask, Who told her to put in her words in my writings. She has, if her own statement is correct, been unfaithful to me.

Sister Prescott however says that, in the providence of God that very article came to them (Brother and Sister Prescott) uncopied and in my own handwriting, and that these very words were in that letter. So Fannie's statement regarding these words is proved to be untrue.²

In this instance Ellen White insists that Fannie Bolton "claims that she has done the very things in my service I have told her in no case to do, that she has substituted her words for my words."³

¹Ltr O-59-1894 (Feb. 5).

²Ltr D-102-1895 (Oct. 29).

³Ibid.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

It is in the context of these problems between Ellen White and Fannie Bolton that Ellen White admitted her need for literary assistants. Writing to Miss Bolton Ellen White asserted:

I am sincerely sorry that I could not place in your hands articles fully prepared for the press. I have furnished one to work the typewriter and you were to prepare these articles for the press. Unfortunately I could not do this part of the work. If I could have done it, your services would not have been required.

. . . .
I am sorry, truly sorry that I have not done better work, but your course of action has been such a mystery to me and so uncalled for that it has been a great discouragement to me.¹

Some months earlier when Fannie was not feeling well enough to work Ellen White wrote to Dr. J. H. Kellogg, "I am in need of editors to prepare manuscripts for the press. Persons to run the typewriter I can obtain, but these do not reach the demand."²

Ellen White did not give us the details of what the editors were to do apart from the correction of the sentences and the arrangement of the material. Some further understanding of what the editors did will be provided by Marian Davis' descriptions of her work. The one thing these literary assistants were not authorized to do was change the language. Ellen White was concerned that the writings remain hers. If it could be successfully argued that the writings

¹Ltr B-9a-1895 (Nov. 11).

²Ltr K-44-1895 (Aug. 29).

were the products of her helpers rather than herself the writings would lose their special authority. It is this fear that seemed to drive Ellen White almost to despair. Note the following comment to the General Conference president.

I am now brought where I lie [sic] down my pen. I cannot write even on the Life of Christ, until I understand whether my writing is to come forth with Fannie's ideas and language, or with Marian's ideas and fixing up and the productions are claimed to be Marian's and Fannie's. Let this impression be made on the minds of our ministers, and of what value or force will the testimonies be to them. I will say no more now.¹

This concern over the reception of her writings as the expression of revelations from God would appear to lie behind these words written to Marian Davis.

But when she takes the position that she has made my books, my articles and is responsible for the beautiful language, it is evident that Satan can through her do me any amount of harm. She can do more to implant doubts and sow seeds of evil than any person I know. She is a dangerous helper to me.²

It seems clear to me that Ellen White was worried over the danger of emptying the messages of their power through her dependence upon the writing abilities of others. Notice how she was concerned that the books and articles not be taken as "largely" the work of others and thus she fail in what she sensed was her duty. She wrote to Fanny Bolton:

I must have an opportunity to have my writings prepared by some other hand than yours, that not one jot

¹Ltr O-59-1894 (Feb. 5).

²Ltr D-102-1895 (Oct. 29).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

or title [sic] of your valuable talent shall be mingled with the things I feel it is my duty to write. I must arrange matters so that your talent shall not be counted with my articles and book-making as to be considered as largely your work.¹ [Emphasis supplied.]

In my judgment it is basically this same burden of Ellen White's over the reception of her writings as messages from the Lord that led her not to fully disclose her dependency on literary sources. The issue of outside human influence will surface again in connection with those who helped Ellen White produce her books. Let us therefore turn to the work of her book editors.

Ellen White's "bookmakers." In view of the major thrust of this research project, it is fitting that we complete the introduction of this report with a discussion of the role of Ellen White's "bookmakers."

One of Ellen White's earliest extended comments on her need for editorial assistance appears in reference to her efforts to prepare manuscripts for the last volume in the Spirit of Prophecy series.

¹Ltr B-9a-1895 (Nov. 11). I have selected only those comments from Ellen White's letters which addressed the work of the editors and her concern for the integrity of the writings as productions directed by the Holy Spirit. I have purposely excluded the claims of Fannie Bolton because the whole question of Fannie Bolton's consistency in making her claims would have to be addressed. I have also endeavored to omit all unnecessary comment of Ellen White in regard to Fannie Bolton's statements and charges. The reader may consult the references given under footnote 4, page 163 above, for the complete story.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

I sent word that I could furnish material for Volume 4 [Spirit of Prophecy], but I must have been wild. Father needs a great deal of my time, and should I attempt to write, I must give my whole time to it. Heretofore I have had a copyist who took charge of all the proofs and who furnished a very nice copy.

You well know my deficiency in this respect. It is a great task for me to arrange my matter to be placed in the hands of the printer without any aid in the matter. If I could do as I have done, write and have a competent copyist prepare my writing for the press, I could do considerable. But as it is, I dare not promise copy to get out a form oftener than once in two weeks, even if I can do that. I will give time and attention to Father. He needs me. He has not society here as he would have at Oakland or Battle Creek. I am his constant companion in riding and by the fireside. Should I go, shut myself up in a room and leave him sitting alone, he would become nervous and restless. . . .

My health is good, but there has been such a strain on my mind in regard to Mary [Clough?] and her work. I cannot tell much about proof sheets. That great batch sent us confused me and I could not tell what to do. Father did not seem to care to perplex his mind about it. Henceforth while you are right at the heart of the work, where there are good proof readers, tell them to be critical, and send me the forms for last reading. You must, there at Battle Creek, take the burdens on yourselves. If I had Lucinda I could then be fitted with some help, but I have no one now, not one.¹ [Emphasis supplied.]

Ellen White set forth four needs in this lengthy statement from a letter to W. C. White. At that time she required copyists, help in arranging her material, and proofreaders. Finally she needed to see the text for the last reading. For it to be her writing she would need to approve the text before printing. When it came to the details of the printing process she was perfectly willing to

¹Ltr W-4d-1878 (Jan. 22).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

leave those matters in the hands of William her son and the publishers, as the following note clearly reveals.

We are glad to hear from you, but in relation to printing, binding, electrotyping and the sizes of edition of books, you that live at the great market can judge much better than I can. As far as I have any official duty in these matters, will simply say that you and those associated together in the work are at liberty to act your own judgment. My interest in the prosperity of the work prompts me to say this knowing that I should be liable to come to wrong conclusions, being ignorant of those particulars necessary to make up proper judgment.¹

William and his wife were in Battle Creek and could make the decisions in respect to the printing. Though Marian Davis had not yet joined Ellen White's staff, she was working at the "Review Office." Ellen White suggested that her son turn over the strict editing work to her and Mary Clough since he carried the responsibility to oversee the printing aspect of the book production. We read in her letter to W. C. White:

I have been broken in upon very many times, but I send it to you. Read it over and put it in the hand of Sister Marian Davis to copy. She is a critical examiner of articles. Tell her to improve it if she sees where it should be improved. I think it would be a task for you to do this with all your other cares.²

Ellen White trusted William White's judgment of matters related to the printing, and we shall note below that she desired his input on reviewing the text as well. She looked

¹Ltr W-5-1878 (Jan. 24).

²Ltr W-4b-1878 (Jan. 12).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

to him to evaluate the suggestions of others, yet she never surrendered her role of overall supervision and approval, even though in this instance she was in California writing and the book was being put together in Michigan. She had Mary Clough with her to help with putting the proof sheets together for final approval.

We present another lengthy quote from a letter to her son where she described the plan we have just outlined.

I will write on Volume IV and be company for Father.

My health is good. I can perform a great amount of labor. I sent for my manuscript to publish my book here, but I have more fully considered the matter. Mary Clough has promised to copy for me. If she is with me we can publish the book at Battle Creek and she can keep straight all the perplexing matters of proof sheets. You can do it better at Battle Creek than they can in this office, and with a saving of expense to us. Will you write us, children, at once, and tell us what you think of this matter? When would it be wisdom to print this book? You have critical proofreaders and good critics that would make it safer, we think, than to have it done here. We shall not be in Oakland when the book is published. We would feel as safe to trust the mails to Michigan as from here to Oakland. Lucinda thought it a good plan to set the book up in wide measure for Signs, and then make it up in pamphlet. But the last five weeks spent in Oakland has led me to distrust the efficiency of those in the office to take the charge of so important a book. What do you say?

We think you did right in working up as far as you could in the pamphlet setting ahead of Volume IV. We think the book all right. Go ahead and send us a few more copies at once.¹

Before the end of the year Ellen White asked for Marian Davis to become her literary helper in producing her books.

-----¹

¹Ltr W-16-1878 (Mar. 13).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

She made it clear that she desired Marian Davis' "judgment of composition [sic]." Others could do the copying.¹ Marian Davis apparently joined the work force sometime between 1878 and 1883 when we read of Ellen White's refusal to attempt a "critical" reading of Sketches from the Life of Paul. Writing to W. C. White she made her point:

I am using my head some now. Yesterday for the first time wrote a few pages on my book. Life of Paul has just come to hand. Makes a neat book. Marian expects me to read it through critically, but I can do no such thing. If those who have read it cannot do this, it will go, for I would not trust my head or memory.²

It bears notice here that Ellen White was not refusing to give the work a final reading. It is the critical reading to which she was objecting. No doubt Marian Davis as a new member of the team did not yet feel confident to take over the responsibility for approving matters of spelling, syntax, construction, and other details of this kind. We shall see no such hesitancy on her part when the DA text requires this same careful scrutiny.

While Ellen White was attending meetings in Battle Creek she wrote Marian Davis that she was willing to pick up some additional workers from Michigan. One might well imagine how overwhelmed Marian Davis must have felt when she received the letter with W. C. White's intents for the winter's work load.

¹Ltr W-62-1878 (Dec. 19).

²Ltr W-21-1883 (June 13).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Willie has been telling what is to be done this winter in the book preparation. Volume one is to be revised, Volume Two and Three to be revised and additions made. Volume Four to be finished. There are other works to be prepared.

Now, Marian, had I not better secure help from Battle Creek? I could get Sister Burnham; shall I? Can you work with her? Can she prepare copy for printer? Set her on one branch of the work, you on another. Is there any one you would choose to help you prepare copy? Will you write freely and frankly what you think about this matter? There is much to be done. Mother's influence, book on temperance, and one on the law. I want these works hastened out as soon as possible.¹

I seriously doubt that Ellen White or her son envisioned the Conflict of the Ages series when he proposed the revisions of the four volumes of the SP text.

The two years Ellen White was in Europe demanded much from her in the way of traveling and speaking. She was also anxious to have her writings translated into French and German.² In the following selections from what we think were letters to Edson White we have a brief description of how Ellen White organized her European staff.

Our family consists of Brother and Sister Ings, W. C. White, Mary K. White and Mabel White, Marian Davis, Sarah McEnterfer and a hired girl that speaks only German and French. Brother and Sister Mason we will have in our family. . . .

Sarah takes dictation from W. C. W. and writes out the Discourses I Have given which she has taken in shorthand. Sister Ings is following Marian and taking off on calligraph the chapter for Volume One. My time, when able to write, has been upon that book. I wish to get all the matter in shape for the printers if possible

¹Ltr D-16-1883 (Nov. 2).

²Ltr W-72a-1886.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

before leaving Basel. Mary White takes care of baby and is preparing morning talks that have been given in Battle Creek, and in other places.¹

Sister Ings is writing on the calligraph for Marian, getting copy all ready for printers. Mary White has every moment employed in writing, preparing manuscript, reading proof, when she is not compelled to take care of her children.²

As Ellen White's letter indicates and as we pointed out in our review of the history of the DA text in the earlier part of this chapter, the two years spent in Europe were largely spent on the revision of SP, Vol. I. To put it another way, they were working on the text of Patriarchs and Prophets. We have no special reason to conclude that Marian Davis' role expanded during the European tour. According to both Ellen White's and Marian Davis' letters dating from 1893 and 1892 onward, respectively, Ellen White's "bookmaker" appears to have exercised greater initiative after they arrived in Australia.

Marian Davis, then seriously working on the DA text, was concerned over a possible violation of copyright laws. We read of her apprehension in a letter to W. C. White.

One thing more: Since Revell copyrighted the book, "Steps to Christ" before arrangements were made to reserve the right of using any of the matter in "Life of Christ," ought there not to be some understanding with him as soon as possible? It would be quite a task, after the book is completed to remove from L. C. all the sentences and paragraphs that have been used in "Steps."

¹Ltr W-81-1887 (Unclassified L-81-1887).

²Ltr W-82-1887.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

And as I have said before, in one case--possibly two--I shall want to use rather more than a page from "Steps."¹

I did not follow the case to see how the problem was solved. The copyrighted material must have been released because material for Steps appears in the DA text.

Ms. Davis also felt free to make suggestions to Ellen White on what needed to be included in the new work on the life of Christ. Because, as we shall have reason to discuss later, Ellen White was charged with succumbing to the influence of others, her response to Marian Davis' proposals are of interest.

Marian specifies chapters and subjects for me to write upon that I do not see really need to be written upon. I may see more light in them. These I shall not enter upon without the Lord's Spirit seems to lead me. The building a tower, the war of kings, these things do not burden my mind, but the subjects of the life of Christ, his character representing the Father, the parables essential for us all to understand and practice the lessons contained in them, I shall dwell upon.²

In this comment we are able to catch a glimpse of Ellen White's principle of selection. She was not attempting to cover the entire life of Christ. She was concentrating on certain topics which in her judgment had practical value for Christian living. One may wonder how she was impressed by "the Lord's Spirit." She did not mention here how her past (or then present) visions impacted on her choices of topics.

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, April 3, 1892.

²Ltr W-131-1893 (June 15).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Perhaps Ellen White is influenced in a major way through her earlier writings which Marian Davis "under great difficulties," was "gathering . . . a little here and little there, to arrange as best she can."¹ If she was impressed once before to write on a given subject, no doubt Ellen White would not have needed further direction to include that material which met the general objectives of this book for colporteurs. The same might be said for topics addressed in Ellen White's letters.

In a letter to Dr. J. H. Kellogg, Ellen White expanded on the nature of Marian Davis' task.

Marian greedily grasps every letter I write to others in order to find sentences that she can use in the Life of Christ. She has been collecting everything that has a bearing on Christ's lessons to His disciples, from all possible sources.²

A reference to the life of Christ which Ellen White at one time felt would meet the need of a particular individual would no doubt serve the benefit of many more readers. These previous comments on the ministry of Christ provided text materials for Marian Davis to use and also suggested some of the topics to be included in the DA text. The following comment speaks to this point.

We sent the letter for Sydney workers to Bro. McCullagh. It was so good, I must keep all the general for my scrap books. Of late I have been using the

¹Ltr O-55-1894 (June).

²Ltr K-41-1895 (Oct. 25).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

matter gleaned from late letters, testimonies, etc. Have found some of the most precious things, some in those letters to Eld. Corliss. They have been to me like a storehouse of treasures. There's something in these personal testimonies that are written with deep feeling, that comes close to the heart. It seems to me that things gathered in this way give a power and significance to the book that nothing else does. I hope the one who copies will not forget to send me a copy of everything.¹

We have already commented on the sources where Ms. Davis obtained her basic text for compiling the DA. We learn something about the difficulties of this work from the larger context from which the earlier quote was taken.²

You will perhaps remember some things I said last spring about the necessity of having the matter from articles and scrap-books, that might be available for use in the life of Christ, copied, so as to be convenient for reference. Perhaps you can imagine the difficulty of trying to bring together points relating to any subject, when these must be gleaned from thirty scrap books, a half dozen bound volumes, and fifty manuscripts, all covering thousands of pages. Last spring an effort was made to have matter copied, but there was time to make only a beginning, or at least the work was far from being completed, as May Israel spent most of her time in copying in the MS of the sermon on Mount, which has never been completed. When she came to the school, there seemed no way of getting mine [sic] copying done, so I worked along in the old way. But while I can do tolerably well with some subjects, on which the matter is readily accessible, there are others that it is almost impossible to deal with in that way. I get so confused, hunting around in such a mass of matter,--it is impossible to bring subjects together so as to see the connection. I feel that I cannot do justice to the work in this way. I do not feel free to hire copying done, without authorization from those who have to bear the expense. I think you will see that the

¹Marian Davis to Ellen White, Nov. 25, 1895.

²See page 151 above.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

copying already done is of comparatively little value unless the work can be completed, so that I can have the matter all together, and be released from the ever-recurring task of hunting over the scrap-books and MSS.

When I first began work on the life of Christ, I suggested that it would be better to have matter copied as I now prepare, but it was thought that it would be better to work from an index, to save expense of copying. An index served very well on Steps to Christ, the book being small, and on a connected line of thought. Yet it would have been much better in the end, had I worked on the other plan, as I had to copy a great amount of matter with lead pencil, and all that was unused was worthless, not being in shape for further use.

Again, there are a number of chapters prepared that have not been copied. It would be a great help to get these done.

I wish I could give you an estimate of the amount of time that will be required for the work prepared. For the matter for use,--the selections, it seems to me a week or two would be amply sufficient. Perhaps less time, as we have so much already done. I think May Israel copied on that work only two or three days, and she was just beginning to use the typewriter but she copied a large amount of matter.

One thing I would prepare to do to save copying would be to buy two sets of Testimonies and cut them up.

. . .

While it will take some time and expense to carry out the plan proposed, I fully believe that it will, in the end, be a saving of both. The time I now spend in hunting over articles,--and with meager results,--is simply astonishing.

When I begin to talk of these perplexities, the frequent response is, "You need a rest." I think you understand the situation sufficiently to know that there is no rest that can be compared to that found in having your work arranged so as to produce the best results; and there is nothing so harassing as toil put forth in vain.

One thing more--as to why so much more is needed for life of Christ than for previous books, the material is much more abundant, the range of subjects, much greater; the work demands more in every way.¹

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, Mar. 29, 1893.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Marian had written to Ellen White a few days earlier requesting some help in the copying.

Would it be all right for me to have Sr. Tenney copy some of the chapters in Life of Christ? It is hard to work in advance when all my MS is in shape so difficult to refer to. Can't tell what has been introduced and what has not. Thought it might be a help to get the MS copied.¹

If our reconstruction is correct the earlier materials were either cut out of early publications or fragments were copied out and pasted into scrapbooks without being indexed or located according to subject. Apparently Marian went through the scrapbooks and selected the materials according to topic and then had one of her assistants type up these items. Once she had the typed material on a given subject she would work these fragments into a connected narrative and send the rough draft of the chapter to Ellen White. This procedure required a close working arrangement with Ellen White even while her work took her to various parts of Australia, New Zealand, and Tasmania.

Many thanks for your kind letters. We appreciate them highly, and yet for the sake of giving to you time to write on the life of Christ, we will not ask for long letters, just a line to tell us how you are. . . .

We now have all the chapters copied that are prepared on Life of Christ. I sent you two packages by this mail. Have a few more that I will send later. Now we are finishing up the Sermon on the Mount, copying what we did not have time to do when May I. was at Preston. Soon she will have the fragments also copied,

¹Marian Davis to Ellen White, Mar. 16, 1893.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

and then I shall be ready to begin work again on the chapters.¹

The rough chapter outlines required sections to be filled in, links to be supplied, and Ellen White would add comment by way of extending her earlier remarks or introducing new material on related topics suggested by the scriptural content.

Perhaps several selections from Marian Davis' letters to Ellen White presented in chronological sequence over a period of several months will allow us to grasp a better idea of how the flow of text between these two women gradually moved the DA toward completion.

As I read over the new chapters in LC, they seem very precious to me,--the lessons of hope and faith, the love and tenderness of the Saviour, and I feel anxious that the book should go to the people. I pray that God will give you strength, and will give grace and wisdom to me. I am so glad that he is willing for me to rest in him, to abide in his love.²

I suppose that the next--MSS I sent--made the matter plain, that the articles I first sent were chapters we had copied in the Life of Christ.³

I do feel an interest in these [--?--] hard working mothers, and I believe if Jesus were here, he would be found among them, even as of old. I have some passages, among my selections for the life of Christ, about his interest and sympathy for the mother, that I'm going to give Fannie for the Messenger, so that they will reach these mothers. . . .

Now about the MS you wrote about. I did not

¹Marian Davis to Ellen White, May, 1893.

²Marian Davis to Ellen White, May 22, 1893.

³Marian Davis to Ellen White, June 7, 1893.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

understand what you meant at all, until your last letter. I think the selection you have on the lost sheep, lost piece of silver, etc. were copied from the Testimonies before we left America, so that you could see what was already written on these points. Don't think anything has been copied since.

. . . I thank you a thousand times for what you wrote,--concerning the reality of our union with Christ. It is a precious thought. I trust that I may never lose sight of it.¹

Now about the book. I am so glad you are writing on the two journeys to Galilee. I was so afraid you would not bring that out. Shall hope to receive something from you before long. There's a good deal of work to be done behind me, but I don't like to turn back if I can help it; rather wait, till I get nearly or quite through, and have all the matter together, and then I can go back once for all, and finish up. That will save going over the ground more than twice. . . .

Am so glad you are writing just where you are. There is such a rich field in the teachings of Christ after he left Jerusalem after the feast of Tabernacles.²

I have a number of chapters prepared on Life of Christ, but cannot get them copied just now. Perhaps I can on vacation. If so, I will send them to you.

Am glad you are working on Life of Christ, and am looking eagerly for MSS. There are chapters, or parts, that are to be prepared, in what I have gone over,--some things that were left incomplete,--and I can be working on these till I get more MSS. Of course I have a considerable MS ahead of where I am working, but it is not in regular connection, and it will be better to prepare it after I get the intervening links.³

These selections from Marian Davis' letters to Ellen White clearly reveal what the latter meant when in a letter to Elder G. A. Irwin, president of the General Conference, she referred to Marian as her "bookmaker."⁴ It would appear

¹Marian Davis to Ellen White, July, 1893.

²Marian Davis to Ellen White, Aug. 2, 1893.

³Marian Davis to Ellen White, Aug. 22, 1893.

⁴Ltr 61a, 1900.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

from this evidence that Marian Davis' work began with the text Ellen White wrote. Once the basic text was written she was given substantial freedom as editor.

Perhaps at this juncture of our introduction where we are considering the work of Ellen White's literary assistants in the early stages of text production we should introduce a question often raised in connection with the activities of Ellen White's helpers. Gregg claims that Marian Davis did not limit her search for earlier writings on the life of Christ to the work of Ellen White.

Further, Marian herself was clearly searching, studying, and selecting pertinent material not from Ellen's scrapbooks alone but from the works of other religious writers (Alfred Edersheim, William Hanna, John Harris, Daniel March, Henry Melvill, to name some) and from various Adventist ministers. . . .¹

Indeed, a statement attributed to Robert Olson, secretary of the Ellen G. White Estate, by the editor of Ministry could be interpreted to support the contention of Alice Gregg who does not document her position.² In commenting on the introductory statement to The Great Controversy, where Ellen White admits to using the writings of others, Olson is quoted as adding:

¹Alice Elizabeth Gregg, "Marian the 'Bookmaker,'" Adventist Currents, Feb. 1984, p. 23.

²Robert Olson has since indicated to me that he did not intend to convey this general impression. He had in mind the historical material which used in writing The Great Controversy.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

In fact, she even allowed her secretaries to help choose some of the historical material at times. She trusted her secretary and W. C. White to get the right materials for her. Of course, she read everything in the end to approve it.¹

It is very possible Marian Davis, W. C. White, and others of her workers gathered selections from these other writers as Alice Gregg argues. I do not wish to deny it here. I can only say that the evidence I reviewed nowhere indicated their work involved such activities. It is, of course, very possible that I missed something along the way because the research project was concentrated on locating the source parallels not the copyists' use of sources.

There is no question that Ellen White was charged with being under the influence of others in the production of her writings or in her other activities. When Elder Haskell made what Ellen White took as an accusation that William White, her son, was influencing her she replied, "The Lord has not led you to take the position that W. C. White influenced his mother in any way to sway her judgment from the righteous principles He was setting before her. You cannot be vindicated in taking this ground."²

When the story was being spread in Battle Creek that Ellen White's secretaries did the major writing for some of the testimonies, Marian Davis offered this rebuttal:

¹J. R. Spangler, "Ellen White and Literary Dependency," Ministry, June, 1980, p. 4.

²Ltr H-142-1898 (Feb. 2).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

For more than twenty years I have been connected with Sister White's work. During this time I have never been asked either to write out a testimony from oral instruction, or to fill out the points in matter already written. . . .

A word more. Letters are sometimes sent to Sister White making inquiries to which, for want of time, she cannot write out a reply. These letters have been read to her, and she has given directions as to how they should be answered. The answers have been written out by W. C. White or myself. But Sister White's name was not appended to these letters. The name of the writer was signed, with the words, For Mrs. E. G. White.¹

If Ellen White's secretaries made selections from the non-Allen White source materials it is unclear as to the form in which these excerpts reached Ellen White. According to the letters of Ms. Davis, she did more than just hand Ellen White a packet of excerpts from the earlier writings. Ellen White was given an integrated rough draft of the chapter composed from the fragments. Since the majority of the source parallels were paraphrased expressions interwoven into Ellen White's comments, a first draft of the chapter would have included the source parallels in so subtle a fashion Ellen White would have not recognized which comments were hers and which came from the sources. The only other option would require Marian to have inserted blocks of source material into the integrated composition of Ellen White's words. From this matrix of text Ellen White would have then produced her copy of the full chapter.

¹Marian Davis to G. A. Irwin, Apr. 23, 1900 (General Conference E. G. White Letter Book 1898-1900, pp. 39, 40).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

We need not spend more time on the question of how the sources were used in producing the DA text. We know that in one way or another the responsibility for their use lay in the hands of Ellen White.

A major figure among Ellen White's editorial helpers was her son, William C. White. Though our study did not include a major review of his correspondence, it does not appear that he played a dominant role in the actual work of editing and arranging the chapters of the DA text.¹ Ellen White more than once urged him to help her, but his other responsibilities absorbed the major segments of his time. She found it difficult to get him even to read the text and in this way offer his evaluation of her writing. Note her anxious concern in one letter.

Now in regard to that chapter Marian put in your hands, will you please to read it at once and send to Marian that after reading it she may send it to Echo office. I am sorry for this delay, but will you attend to it at once? Marian watches with intense interest every mail to see if the manuscript has come.²

Writing to Edson and Emma about a year later, Ellen White again faces the difficulty of getting assistance from William.

I had written you a letter for you to seek the Lord most earnestly to know your duty in regard to connecting

¹Ellen White depended on William White after her husband died. Once Marian Davis could provide the editorial assistance, William was utilized in various public and administrative capacities.

²Ltr W-143-1895 (Feb. 28).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

with me in my work in bookmaking. I cannot have help from Willie. That is not to be expected, now nor any future time. You could help me and we could counsel together. But I have little courage to attempt to do anything while I have only Marian to help me.¹

We should not conclude from this that Ellen White did not consult William White over her writings. She valued his suggestions and wanted his input.

The matter of several chapters came from Battle Creek for me to read. . . . I have an idea not to accept Reaser as my artist. I do not accept his pictures you brought, and I do not and have not felt confidence in his taste. . . .

In regard to the manuscript for life of Christ, it is done, waiting for you to look it over. There are several chapters on temperance waiting for you to look over.²

In no way, however, should one conclude that Ellen White gave her son the last word. She was not above dealing directly with the printing house even though she left many of the details to Marian Davis or W. C. White. In the following letter to the manager of the Pacific Press she voices strong objections to the art work for the DA text.

I wish to say to you that I am sadly disappointed in the cuts prepared for such a book as the Life of Christ. I consider that if Brother Reaser accepts such figures that his eye and taste has lost its cunning. You cannot expect me to be pleased with such productions. Look at these figures critically, and you must see that they are either made from Catholic designs or Catholic artists. The picture of Mary has a man's face, the representations of Christ with the two fingers prominent, while the others are closed, is wholly a Catholic sign and I object to this. I see but very little beauty in any of the faces, or persons. There is

¹Ltr W-139-1896 (Jan. 16).

²Ltr W-206-1897 (Dec. 7).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

the scenery of nature, landscape scenery, that is not as objectionable, but I could never rest my eyes upon the face pictures ["portraits"] without pain. I would much prefer to have no pictures than representations that are not representations, but disfigurements of the true. This is my opinion. . . . Better pay double price, or treble, and have pictures, if pictures must be had that will not pervert facts.¹

Another image of William White emerges when we focus on the editorial work connected with publishing. Both Marian Davis and William White were very actively involved in preparing the first volume on the life of Christ, Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing, and in working out the details for the soon-anticipated publication of the DA. It is true that W. C. White would carry other responsibilities as well even as Marian Davis would be busy writing on the text. Of course Marian Davis no doubt would have expected W. C. White to handle financial questions as we note from her comment to the manager of the publishing house.

Since we came to Australia, those who are most concerned in the book have been pressed with care that they have known little about the matter, that is, in a way to plan for it. The Editor of the manuscript ought not to take the responsibility of deciding on plans. She may propose plans, but those who own the book ought to decide upon them. But enough of this.²

Marian Davis here refers to herself as the "editor." I am aware of her use of this title with reference to herself in only one other letter.

¹Ltr J-81a-1897 (Dec. 20).

²Marian Davis in a postscript to C. H. Jones, Mar. 11, 1897.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Ellen White had a number of additional helpers in the mid-nineties. Minnie Hawkins and Maggie Hare were copying, proofreading, and editing. May Israel was still serving as bookkeeper and also using her shorthand skills to report Ellen White's sermons. Eliza Burnham was developing the abilities and competence of Minnie Hawkins as well as carrying senior responsibilities along with Marian Davis as book editors.¹

Some idea of the way in which the final text of the DA was developed is provided by a one-volume work we have called a "working manuscript" book containing chapters 2-37 of the present text. The original pages of the work consist of manuscript pages from an earlier version. Sheets from a revised manuscript of the chapters have been pasted close to the spine, each to an "earlier" page. Between the lines there are interlinear emendations to the last version. One can trace here how paragraphs were shifted and/or reworked. Titles of chapters have been changed. At times the present DA text follows the earlier material and at other times the later. Notations at the top of some chapter introductions read "chapter copied," or "re-copied."

Marian Davis felt free to expand or abridge the text according to her best judgment. When the final proofs were

¹Ltr W-128-1896 (July 9) and Ltr W-154-1896 (Aug. 2).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

being prepared for Mount of Blessing, which had been held up over questions on how its material would relate to the DA text, she wrote to W. C. White:

If the type is to be changed, I am very anxious to do the planning myself, as I could restore a little where it had been taken out needlessly, or possibly condense and save a page, though I would shrink from doing any more cutting.

Please let us know, if possible, your decision about the type, as it will necessitate considerable work, and quite likely require the re-copying of the MSS.¹

Another insight into Marian Davis' range of editorial involvement may be garnered from her concern over the prepublication use of DA materials in other books and papers. In her letter to Edson White she registered her concern over DA matter appearing in his simplified version of the life of Christ which appeared as Christ Our Saviour in 1896.

For a number of weeks, or months, I have been trying to get one hour of Bro. White's time for the consideration of some points on the Life of Christ, but I am afraid it will be put off until after camp-meeting, and then indefinitely.

I shall be heartily glad to see some simple work gotten up for the colored people, and do not think there will be any objection to the plan you have proposed. At the same time don't you think care should [--?--] about using matter on the life of Christ until the book is published. Sr. White is almost wholly dependent on her books for means to carry on her work. What she received from the conference is hardly a drop in the bucket. Her expenses are very great. If the income from her books were cut off, her hands would be completely tied. Now the work on the Life of Christ has been done under many and great difficulties, and at great expense, and with

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, April 24, 1895.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

many hindrances. Much of the matter has been run through the papers, then compiled and amplified, as the material is collected from Testimonies. Now if the little book proposed is kept within the limits mentioned, and in the style proposed,--something small and simple for the southern field,--all right, but I am sure you will feel that after all the labor and expense of getting out the life of Christ, nothing else should come in first that would use up enough of the best matter to destroy the freshness of the larger book. The interests of the work in all fields are one, and it will not be a real help to any one to cut off one source of income for the sake of securing another.

Sr. White is eager to help your work in every way possible, and will unite in this desire. If rightly managed, I believe it can be done without injuring the truth.

The thought that you are engaged in winning souls to Christ is a great joy to her, how great a joy I think you cannot realize. Her love for her children is the most vivid representation I know of Christ's love for his people.¹

Marian Davis takes her concern over Edson White's new proposals to his brother W. C. White. From her letter we glean further information on how she compiled the DA text.

The enclosed letter from your brother probably contains nothing new to you, but I wish to call your attention to the fact that in his proposition concerning new books, he is planning to do the very thing I had anticipated,--the thing that is done, will make the "Life of Christ" really a second-hand affair altogether. He does not seem to realize that already he is publishing as the body of his book the very matter that must go into the life of Christ, and, as I judge, with very little change, except that he has the advantage of being able to condense and throw out extraneous matter as we are not free to do. He speaks of the matter on the child-life of Jesus as most valuable because it is new, and by the very circulation of it in that book it will be old in the larger one. Now it seems to me either we should give up the plan of publishing the life

¹Marian Davis to J. E. White, Sept. 29, 1895.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

of Christ, or not to continue to draw from it so as to destroy the last vestige of freshness. All I have to make the book from,--so far as the narrative is concerned--is the old book and the matter that runs through the papers. If this is nearly all used in the publication of small books, and they are widely circulated as they will be, what heart will canvassers have to follow them with the large book? This is God's work, and not mine, and I have no wish to dictate, but it seems to me these things ought to be thought of.¹

In view of the fact that the compositional arrangement and style of the text was the editor's responsibility and not Ellen White's, Marian evidently felt the burden of having to make so many of these decisions alone. On one occasion she asked Ellen White for some assistance in this area.

I should be very thankful if it could be arranged for Eliza to read with me the chapters on the Life of Christ. I didn't mean to send them to her. That would amount to little. But to use them together. It is an important work, and while I have tried to do the work in such a way as to please God, and meet the needs of the people, it would be a benefit to the book, no doubt, and would be a great satisfaction to me, to have the aid of another's judgment. To me its chapters seem beautiful, full of divine light.²

An example of Marian Davis' influence on the style of the DA text may be seen in her decision to change the introductory sentences to several chapters. A comparison of the earlier and later stages of the text as they are retraceable in the working manuscript book referred to earlier bears this out. She comments on this modification of the text in a letter to C. H. Jones.

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, Dec. 10, 1895.

²Marian Davis to Ellen White, Nov. 25, 1895.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

Now that the book is to be in one volume it must be planned more carefully than if the two parts were issued separately. Since your letter of Feb. 2 arrived, I have for the first time been sure that the type-setting is not in progress. I have taken up the MS to see how the matter seemed after laying aside for a while. I see a very serious defect,--one that, if not corrected, I am sure will almost ruin the book. I know that others must have seen it. I wonder that they have not pointed it out to me. I wonder that I was so blind as not to see it myself. Many of the chapters begin as if the book were the diary of an itinerant minister. The chapters begin with dry little details that might be omitted or placed elsewhere. There is great sameness. This error can and must be corrected. The change will no doubt involve expense. It is too much to hope that the initials are not yet engraved. But the change must be made. The book will not be acceptable as it is. I will begin the chapters with the same letter wherever possible, but can do it in only a few cases. I know that all parties will be far better satisfied with the book when these changes are made. I know that it will sell enough better to warrant the delay and expense, even if the latter is considerable.¹

It should be obvious by now that Ellen White's book editors played significant roles in the production of her books, at least such seems to have clearly been the case with the DA. With so many workers moving in and out of her employment many in the church would have heard of the work of her copyists and editors. Ellen White apparently had no problem over W. W. Prescott being listed as a compiler of one of her books.²

¹Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, Mar. 11, 1897.

²I have in mind here the comment of Ellen White in a letter to Brother and Sister Tenney: "There was at this time an advertisement in one of the papers regarding one of my books. When Fannie noticed this advertisement, which spoke of Prof. Prescott compiling the book, she vehemently declared

INTRODUCTION - PART B

At the same time it must be admitted that the letters of Ellen White referring to books needed or to copying and preserving material were usually addressed to family members or to someone in the role of Marian Davis. It is also probable that someone reading Ellen White's "corner" in the Reformer and noting the use of documented quotations would infer that where Ellen White did not so refer to other writers in her writings she was not quoting them.

In the foregoing discussion of the activities of Ellen White's literary assistants, particularly of her editors, we have provided the evidence from letters of Ellen White and Marian Davis. As we draw this introduction of the research project to a close, we could provide no better summary of the content of this chapter than Marian Davis herself provides in several letters, or major portions thereof. The drama, the detail, and the dedication are all there.

By this mail some matters are sent that I feel sure will be welcomed by those interested in the Life of Christ. Some important changes have been made. First of these is the new introductory chapter, "The Word Made Flesh." I think that all will be pleased with it. It is fresh, containing a considerable new matter that will not be published elsewhere until after the book is issued. I hope this MS will be read by Eld. Wilcox and others. I have sent a copy to Bro. White. Whatever criticisms may be offered, will, I suppose, have to be considered by Sr. Burnham. They can be referred to Bro. White if necessary.

with wild gesticulations, that it was a lie." (Ltr T-114-1897, July 1).

INTRODUCTION - PART B

The chapter "As a Child," I have divided, by taking out of it the story of the passover visit. I have always thought the old chapter too long, especially as it contained so many lessons. But until now I have not seen how it could be divided. The present chapter heading and tail piece will, I think, still be appropriate for the chapter "As a Child." I send first and last page of the "Passover Visit" so that heading and tail piece can be planned for it.

The new first pages for chapters will make the book far more attractive. They will greatly help its sale, as well as make it more interesting to the reader. I hope that the expense of re-engraving initials, or even headings, will not prevent these changes from being made. The expense will be far more than made up by the better sale of the book. In a few cases, as "The Chosen People," "Days of Conflict," and "The Sabbath," I will gladly pay for the change of initial myself rather than not have it made. What appears like a slight change, makes a great difference in the effect. New matter written since the MS was first sent has helped to brighten some of the pages, and to make the change that was necessary. When the new pages are compared with the old ones, I am sure that no one will grudge the time they have cost, which has been but little.

The chapters as a whole have required more work. I think you will find them more compact, vigorous, and simple. . . .

Could not the copy I sent to Bro. White be returned to me? It would be a great favor if this can be done. If not, I will do the best I can with the tissue copy.

One item I omitted to mention in the proper place: The chapters "Give Ye Them to Eat" and "The Divine Shepherd," may require new initials. I have not given attention to these pages yet. Possibly a few other changes may be made past No. 40.

Our typewriters are so crowded with work that I must finish my letter with the pen. If the chapter headings are not already engraved, there are two changes I would like to make,--"Whom Also He Named Apostles" to "The Apostles Set Apart,"--not using marks of quotation in the heading, of course; and to change "Wherefore Didst Thou Doubt" for "A Night on the Lake." I have little hope, however, that these changes can be made.

If you have arranged for Sister Burnham to come to Pacific Press, for the book, there is plenty of work she can be doing for Sr. White. She is exceeding anxious to get out a pamphlet on giving the tithe, etc. This she

INTRODUCTION - PART B

intends to have made up from the articles sent to REVIEW about Christmas time, and of course such other matter as can be combined with them. She has been waiting for months to have this work done. So if Sr. Burnham is available, I know that Sister White would be more than glad for her to do this work.

I hope you will urge upon Bro. White the importance of reading this first chapter before it goes to press.

You can safely count on receiving the MS by next month's mail. No part of a book ought to be put in type until the book is completed. Especially is this true of Sr. White's books, since she does not write systematically, and at any stage we are likely to get fresh points on any part of the book, or matter that necessitates rearrangement. But that matter is beyond my control. I will content myself with trying to finish the book. . . .

P. S.--I did not send copy of first chapter for press, thinking it would be little advantage to have it, and it has been so recently prepared I would like to keep it until next month with the rest of the matter.¹

Some time since, I received notice from C. H. Jones that it was planned to publish "Desire of Ages," in the spring of '98, and in order to [do] this, all the copy must be in the hands of the printers as early as Sept. '97. From what I learn of the artist's work, I cannot believe that the printers will be ready for the MS by Sept. They have now 25 chapters, as finally revised. Twenty-five more were prepared to send, but a few changes will have to be made in them, as I finish the later chapters. For this I am holding them. I wish we could know how soon the MS will really be needed. We have already been so greatly delayed by trying to hurry things, we can't afford to lose more time that way. Sister White is constantly harassed with the thought that the MS should be sent to the printers at once. I wish it were possible to relieve her mind, for the anxiety makes it hard for her to write and for me to work. We are from day to day alternating between the two plans of adding or not adding to the book. The feeling is, that the book must be gotten out at once, even before New Year's. At the same time the work of writing is going forward, but for the most part a little behind the work of editing, so that a second or third

¹Marian Davis to C. H. Jones, Apr. 11, 1897.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

revision of chapters is required.

Since the artist's work must be done before the printer's, I thought it might be best to prepare as many chapters as possible for him, even if they were not completed for the printer. They will have the main points for illustration. By the next mail after this, I shall, if possible, send twenty-five chapters to Reaser. This will make seventy-seven in his hand. There will be 86 in all. . . .

Your references to "descriptive" and "discursive" chapters seem to indicate that you wish the latter were wholly or in part removed from the book. Every bit of descriptive matter has been used so far as possible. As to the "discursive," probably not one-twentieth that was in the L. C. MS has been used in the book. The chapters have been accepted by yourself and Sister White. To throw them out now would involve greater responsibility than I dare to take. It would require time that I don't have to give. The only person with whom I am at liberty to consult is Elder Haskell. To him I have read a number of the "discursive" chapters. I cannot get his consent to the omission of even one. If it seems necessary to throw out some of these chapters, could you not select them, or find some one to do so. I hardly think, however, Sr. White would confide in the judgment of W. A. Reaser in this matter, however trustworthy his judgment as an artist may be.

"Thoughts from Mount of Blessing." Inclosed is an extract from a letter just received from W. D. Salisbury. No doubt he has written to you to the same effect. Sister White is not now at home, but from what she has said, I think she will probably decide to have the first edition issued at once without cuts. Certainly this would be preferable to using such stupid and commonplace productions. They degrade the book. We have already waited more than two years for cuts. I don't think she will consent to wait another year.

As to the plan of using small cuts in "Thoughts," do you think they would look well in a book made up as that is? I fear that you will not be satisfied with them.

We have great reason for gratitude that your visit to America should have been just in time to arrange for the illustration for the book. Now, as you truly say, what we need most is the blessing and help of God. Sister White seems inclined to write, and I have no doubt she will bring out many precious things. I hope it will be possible to get them into the book. There is

INTRODUCTION - PART B

one thing, however, that not even the most competent editor could do,--that is, prepare the MS before it is written. I am glad to know that you pray for us. God is above all the perplexities, and he promises to give wisdom and strength. He not only pities our weakness, but forgives our sins. We hope soon to hear of your return homeward. Wishing you a speedy and prosperous journey, Yours in the work, M. Davis.

P. S. The work of revising and condensing has, I hope, made most of the "discursive" chapters somewhat more compact and direct. Perhaps they will not be found to be quite so objectionable as before.¹

The days since you went away have been busy ones. Most of Thursday and Friday and all of Sunday Minnie was copying for the school. We have a few things to send you, and hope to send more soon. This morning we mail "The Man of Sorrows"--copied from the new matter you left; and the parable of the talents, for the parable book. The matter on the sower which was given to Minnie she has copied; but that which was given to Miss Peck has not been done. If Miss P. does not have time to do it soon, I think we will let Minnie take it as I am anxious to get it into your hands, and you will want it all together, so as to know what you have. We will not send any on the Sower, till we can send all.

I have been gathering out the precious things from these new MSS. on the early life of Jesus. Sent a number of new pages to California by the Vancouver mail, and shall send more for later chapters by the next mail. Two of these new articles on Christ's missionary work I let Bro. James have to read in Church. Last Sabbath he read the one which speaks of the Saviour's denying himself of food to give to the poor. These things are unspeakably precious. I hope it is not too late to get them into the book. It has been a feast to work on this matter.

I learn that our Sabbath Schools are soon to take up the study of the life of Christ. So the book will come out just in time to help them. I am so glad.

I will send a copy of a little I gathered out for the chapter "In Joseph's Tomb." It supplies a link that was missing, and I think will be a real help to the book.

¹Marian Davis to W. C. White, Aug. 9, 1897. The remainder of this letter appears on page 125 and elsewhere in the report.

INTRODUCTION - PART B

I learn that the work of setting the book is underway, so we want to finish up the last chapters as soon as possible. Hope you will be able to send us soon the rest of the matter on Christ's ministry of healing and, as soon as convenient, the rich man and Lazarus. I do hope the book on the parables can come out at the same time with the life of Christ.¹

¹Marian Davis to Ellen White, Mar. 1, 1898.

III CHAPTER 3 - "The Fullness of the Time"

This chapter of DA takes its theme from Paul's letter to the Galatians rather than from one of the four gospels. Its content is theological rather than narrative. It seeks to set the coming of Christ in the context of God's promises and providence. Arthur White describes this chapter along with chapters 1 and 2 as being the "general introductory chapters" of DA and notes that these chapters were being worked on by Marian Davis in 1896 when the book "was thought to be nearing completion."¹

Our studies show that this chapter was constructed for the most part from eight Ellen White articles and letters dating from the 1890s. Most of these materials were written in Australia when Ellen White was working on the life of Christ. We do not find the theme treated in Spiritual Gifts or such a chapter in Spirit of Prophecy. Volume II of Spirit of Prophecy does devote a few paragraphs to the religious beliefs and practices of the Jewish people at the time of the first advent of Christ.

Since this study quotes from an earlier text of Ellen White only when the earlier text indicates greater dependency upon a source or helps to confirm the use of a particular source, we are providing a list of these articles and where they may be found in their entirety. In the following list of references the identification of the Ellen

¹Arthur L. White, Ellen G. White: Volume 4, The Australian Years (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1983), p. 385.

"The Fullness of the Time"

White article or manuscript as used in our study is given first after which we indicate the number of sentences quoted from that article in our comparison of literary parallels. We then provide the title of the article and where it may be found.

1. ST(90) [14 sentences] - "God Made Manifest in Christ," ST Vol. XVI, No. 8 (Jan. 20, 1890).

2. MS(24) [10 sentences] - Sentences begin with the section entitled, "The Causes of the Jewish Rejection of Christ," MS 24, March, 1891, pp. 20-22.

3. ST(94) [26 sentences] - "God's Love Unmeasured," ST Vol. XX, No. 14 (Feb. 5, 1894). Sentence numbers begin about the middle of the article.

4. Lt(43) [3 sentences] - Letter of Ellen White written from N. S. W., Australia, on June 14, 1895, to Dr. J. H. Kellogg, pp. 18-25.

5. RH(95) [17 sentences] - "Satan's Malignity Against Christ and His People," RH Vol. XXXII. No's. 43, 44 (Oct. 22, 29, 1895). This material is taken from the EGW letter to J. H. Kellogg mentioned under entry 4 above.

6. FE(399-401) [21 sentences] - "The Divine Teacher," from MS 9, 1896 (copied March 23, 1896).

7. BE(97) [5 sentences] - "Christ the Life Giver," BE Vol. XII, No. 10 (March 8, 1897).

8. ST(98) [3 sentences] - "The Truth as It Is in Jesus", ST Vol. XXIV, No. 24 (June 16, 1898).

The articles used by Marian Davis relating to the

"The Fullness of the Time"

content of this chapter originated as late as twenty years before the death of Ellen White. We have been able to locate Ellen White's handwritten text only of MS 24, 1891. According to the White Estate records, this manuscript was copied in 1903 by C. C. Crisler.¹ Once in this chapter and only seldom elsewhere we make reference to a letterbook which contains a working copy of the first 39 chapters of DA in their pre-publication state. Where the text of this editor's copy is closer to a source we have indicated this stage of the DA text as DA(MS).

Other than her use of the Bible (5 sentences), Ellen White appears to have made use of three authors in the composition of her supporting articles used to prepare this chapter of DA. These are: E. W. Thayer, Sketches from the Life of Jesus, Historical and Doctrinal, Fleming H. Revell Co., 1891 [SLJ]; William S. Kennedy, Messianic Prophecy, and the Life of Christ, Barnes & Burr, 1860 [MP]; and John Harris, The Great Teacher, Second Edition, J. S. and C. Adams, 1836 [GT].

The reader is reminded once again that this study limits the comparison to verbal expression. Parallels have to be rather close and in a sequence which indicates literary dependency. And since the actual handwritten materials of Ellen White were edited and re-worked by her copyists and bookmakers, the closer we can move the

¹A photocopy of the relevant portions of MS 24, 1891, and the text as copied by C. C. Crisler appear in Appendix D, as does also Lt(43), 1895, to Dr. Kellogg.

"The Fullness of the Time"

comparison to the point of origin, i.e., the first writing of Ellen White, the better chance we have of making an accurate comparison, even though we are not able to utilize these earlier compositions in our final comparison figures. Our point of comparison is a chapter in a book, not an isolated letter, manuscript article, or portions thereof which have been combined at a later time with other texts and independent writings to form the finished chapter. These earlier writings can, however, help to establish the claim that Ellen White at some point was using a given source.

In the textual comparisons which follow, the left-facing page contains the Ellen White text and the right-facing page shows the source text. The sequence follows the DA text which is presented in full for each chapter. The earlier writings of Ellen White have been inserted where they seem best to represent the same context and theme development. The content of the earlier writings will not always match the content of the DA sentence after which they occur. The sequence of thought does not always remain the same between texts which use the same or similar sentences. If the earlier writing contains a number of sentences where both the verbal expression and the order of development matches a source, we will insert them in the DA text in the same order. If they correspond to the DA sentence, but not the DA sentence order, we will match content rather than sequence. When the earlier sentence

"The Fullness of the Time"

contains a source parallel treating a subject not included in the DA text, we will insert the sentences in their original order in a location where other sentences from this same document match the DA text.

The pre-DA materials have been indented for easier identification.

Verbatim words appear in boldface type and the more obvious paraphrased portions have been underlined along with the verbatim expressions. Following the Ellen White sentence, the source reference is given in brackets and the evaluation appears within closed parentheses. The source reference indicates the initial letter of the author's surname, the page where the literary parallel may be found in the source indicated, and the sentence number. By glancing to the right-facing page the reader may note the source text which is introduced by the same page and sentence number. The author's last name and the initials taken from the major words of the source title follow the quotation of the source text.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA1/31 "WHEN the fullness of the time was come, God sent forth His Son, . . . to redeem them that were under the law, that we might receive the adoption of sons." [Gal. 4:4, 5.] (B2)

DA2/31 The Saviour's coming was foretold in Eden. [T/2.8] (P3)

DA3/31 When Adam and Eve first heard the promise, they looked for its speedy fulfillment. (I1)

DA4/31 They joyfully welcomed their first-born son, hoping that he might be the Deliverer. (I1)

DA5/31 But the fulfillment of the promise tarried. (I1)

DA6/31 Those who first received it died without the sight. (I1)

DA7/31 From the days of Enoch the promise was repeated through patriarchs and prophets, keeping alive the hope of His appearing, and yet He came not. [K/174.2] (I2)

DA8/31 The prophecy of Daniel revealed the time of His advent, but not all rightly interpreted the message. [K/175.6] (I2)

DA9/31 Century after century passed away; the voices of the prophets ceased. (I1)

DA10/31 The hand of the oppressor was heavy upon Israel, and many were ready to exclaim, "The days are prolonged, and every vision faileth." [Ezek. 12:22.] (I1)

DA11/31 But like the stars in the vast circuit of their appointed path, God's purposes know no haste and no delay. [T/22.1] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

13.5 But when **the fulness of time** was come, God sent forth his son, made of a woman, made under the law, to redeem them that were under the law. [Thayer, SLJ]

2.8 The announcement to Adam of the appearance of a divine personage, who should also be the seed of the woman, who should crush the head of the old serpent, regain man's lost inheritance, and atone for human sin . . . [Thayer, SLJ]

174.2 We remember the Patriarch's remark, that "Judah's sceptre should not depart till Shiloh come;" we remember the promise of an eternal dominion to the family of David: and still more vividly shines the vision of Daniel. [Kennedy, MP]

175.6 The seventy weeks, too, were well nigh fulfilled. If Daniel were a prophet of the Lord, the Anointed would then appear. [Kennedy, MP]

[See Thayer 22.1 below]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA12/32 Through the symbols of the great darkness and the smoking furnace, God had revealed to Abraham the bondage of Israel in Egypt, and had declared that the time of their sojourning should be four hundred years. (I1)

DA13/32 "Afterward," He said, "shall they come out with great substance." [Gen. 15:14.] (B2)

DA14/32 Against that word, all the power of Pharaoh's proud empire battled in vain. (I1)

DA15/32 On "the self-same day" appointed in the divine promise, "it came to pass, that all the hosts of the Lord went out from the land of Egypt." [Ex. 12:41.] (B2)

DA16/32 So in heaven's council the hour for the coming of Christ had been determined. [T/22.1] (I2)

DA17/32 When the great clock of time pointed to that hour, Jesus was born in Bethlehem. [T/22.1] (I2)

DA18/32 "When the fullness of the time was come, God sent forth His Son." (B2)

DA19/32 Providence had directed the movements of nations, and the tide of human impulse and influence, until the world was ripe for the coming of the Deliverer. (I1)

DA20/32 The nations were united under one government. [T/21.6] (P3)

DA21/32 One language was widely spoken, and was everywhere recognized as the language of literature. [T/21.8] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

22.1 It was the fulness of time; the world was fully ripe for the event. The clock of destiny had struck the hour: God is in no haste about his special operations. [Thayer, SLJ]

21.6 While the dominion of Rome so oppressed the nations; it yet unified the world, and harmonized it into the semblance of one family. [Thayer, SLJ]

21.8 When we further consider that there was, as it were, one universal language, superseding by its copiousness and fulness all others,--the language of literature, of cultivation, of the arts, and of trade and commerce,--we easily see that the whole world had almost become one family: [Thayer, SLC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA22/32 From all lands the Jews of the dispersion gathered to Jerusalem to the annual feasts. (I1)

DA23/32 As these returned to the places of their sojourn, they could spread throughout the world the tidings of the Messiah's coming. (I1)

DA24/32 At this time the systems of heathenism were losing their hold upon the people. [K/174.7] [T/14.5] (I2)

DA25/32 Men were weary of pageant and fable. [K/174.7] [T/14.5] (I2)

DA26/32 They longed for a religion that could satisfy the heart. [K/174.8] [T/16.3] (I2)

DA27/32 While the light of truth seemed to have departed from among men, there were souls who were looking for light, and who were filled with perplexity and sorrow. [H/4/49] (P3)

ST(90)1 At the first advent of Christ, darkness covered the earth, and gross darkness the people. [H/7/49] (B1)

ST(90)2 Light and truth seemed to have departed from among men, and Satan appeared to reign in undisputed power. [H/4-7/49] (I2)

ST(90)5 Many were sighing, "What is truth?" [H/5,6/49] (P3)

MS(24)2 The most learned men in the days of Christ,--philosophers, legislators, priests,--in all their pride and superiority, could not interpret God's character. [H/3/49] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

174.7 Certain it is, that the best forms of heathenism then began to wane. They had come to their flowering and fruitage; they had done what they could, and were about to die. [Kennedy, MP]

14.5 Christ came as soon as idolatry had lost its hold upon any considerable portion of mankind. [Thayer, SLJ]

174.8 The better part of the heathen were yearning for a new religious development. [Kennedy, MP]

16.3 Idolatry had begun to destroy itself; and the great heart of humanity was yearning after the true and living God; and this was the proper time for his interposition. [Thayer, SLJ]

4/49 Reason, confident in her resources, had sent forth her sons under all auspices, and in every direction: but they returned, defeated and disheartened; the footsteps of truth could nowhere be found. [Harris, GT]

7/49 Darkness covered the earth, and gross darkness the minds of the people. (Isaiah 60:2) [Harris, GT]

5/49 In vain had generation after generation asked, in its way to oblivion, 'What is truth?' [Harris, GT]

MS(24)3 They could not discern spiritual things.
[H/3/49] (P3)

MS(24)4 The ancient pages of the oracles of the gods were turned over and over again, but did not give the wise men any help in solving the problem.
[H/6,9/49,50] (P3)

DA28/32 They were thirsting for a knowledge of the living God, for some assurance of a life beyond the grave.
[H/19/50,51] (I2)

MS(24)20 Would human ignorance give way?
[H/19/50,51] (P3)

MS(24)21 Would there be a thirsting for a deeper knowledge of God? [H/19/50,51] (P2)

ST(90)7 They were thirsting for a knowledge of the living God, for some assurance of a life beyond the tomb. [H/19/50,51] (I2)

DA29/32 As the Jews had departed from God, faith had grown dim, and hope had well-nigh ceased to illuminate the future.
[H/8/49+] (I2)

DA30/32 The words of the prophets were uncomprehended.
(I1)

DA31/32 To the masses of the people, death was a dread mystery; beyond was uncertainty and gloom. [H/8,17/49,50+] (I2)

DA32/32 It was not alone the wailing of the mothers of Bethlehem, but the cry from the great heart of humanity, that was borne to the prophet across the centuries,--the voice heard in Ramah, "lamentation, and weeping, and great mourning, Rachel weeping for her children, and would not be comforted, because they are not." [Matt. 2:18] (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

6/49 The devotee had urged the inquiry at the shrine of his god; the priest, at his altar of sacrifice; the sage had repeated it as he walked amidst the works and wonders of creation; but nothing was heard in reply; nothing, but the faint and bewildering echo, 'What is truth?' [Harris, GT]

3/49 Legislators, philosophers, and poets--the pride of their time, and the boast of the species--had toiled to construct a system whose top should reach unto heaven; but in vain; they built only to the clouds. [Harris, GT]

[See Harris 9/50 below.]

19/50,51 In this remarkable passage, we behold the divine philosopher, rising from a mournful survey of human ignorance, turning with an air of despondency from every earthly resource, yet eagerly thirsting for a knowledge of God, and virtue, and futurity, till his thirst grows into a desire for celestial aid, and his desire matures to an anticipation, and even a prediction, which God was actually intending to fulfil; perhaps indeed, we err in not cordially recognising in his language the presence of heavenly inspiration. [Harris, GT]

8/49+ Nor can the state of Judea be regarded as an exception to the prevailing gloom. [Harris, GT]

ST(90)3 Rival sects existed, and among those who professed to be the servants of God were displayed love of pre-eminence and strife for power and position. [H/9/50] (I2)

MS(24)16 So long had they neglected to study and contemplate the Bible, that its pages were to them a mystery. [H/10/50] (P3)

MS(24)17 They turned with aversion from the truth of God to the traditions of men. [H/10/50] (P2)

DA33/32 In "the region and shadow of death," men sat unsolaced. [Matt. 4:16] [H/21b/51] (B1)

ST(98)3 Men were sitting in the shadow of death. [H/21b/51] (V2)

DA34/32 With longing eyes they looked for the coming of the Deliverer, when the darkness should be dispelled, and the mystery of the future should be made plain. [H/21b/51] (I2)

MS(24)14 The earth was languishing for a teacher sent from God; but when He came just as the living oracles specified He would come, the priests and the instructors of the people could not discern that He was their Saviour, nor could they understand the manner of His coming. [H/15/50] (I2)

ST(98)4 The only hope for the world was for this gloom to be lifted, and God revealed to the world. [H/14,15/50] (P3)

ST(98)5 A teacher from heaven must come to this earth. [H/15/50] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

9/50 There, indeed, the ancient oracles of God were yet extant; but their still small voice, heard only, at any time, by the attentive listener, had been long since overpowered and silenced by the dogmas of their professed interpreters, and the clamors of rival sects. [Harris, GT]

10/50 The spiritual import of the sacred volume, like the seven-sealed roll of the Apocalypse, had long been closed to the Jew; and when the lion of the tribe of Judah prevailed to open it, the aversion with which they turned from the sight, showed how unaccustomed they were to gaze on the truth. [Harris, GT]

21b/51 what must have been the wishes and aspirations of those who, with a keen perception of their exigence, were sitting in darkness and the shadow of death? [Harris, GT]

14/50 If she would relieve the gloom, she must descend, and shine, and dissipate it with her actual presence. [Harris, GT]

15/50 All things proclaimed the urgent necessity that the world should be visited by 'a teacher sent from God.' [Harris, GT]

DA35/33 Outside of the Jewish nation there were men who foretold the appearance of a divine instructor.
[H/16,22/50,51] (P3)

ST(90)8 There were men not of the Jewish nation who prophesied that an inspired instructor would come to teach them of the truth. [H/17,18/50] (P3)

DA36/33 These men were seeking for truth, and to them the Spirit of Inspiration was imparted. [H/18/19/50] (P3)

DA37/33 One after another, like stars in the darkened heavens, such teachers had arisen. (I1)

DA38/33 Their words of prophecy had kindled hope in the hearts of thousands of the Gentile world. [H/20/51] (P3)

DA39/33 For hundreds of years the Scriptures had been translated into the Greek language, then widely spoken throughout the Roman Empire. (I1)

DA40/33 The Jews were scattered everywhere, and their expectation of the Messiah's coming was to some extent shared by the Gentiles. [H/22/51] (I2)

DA41/33 Among those whom the Jews styled heathen were men who had a better understanding of the Scripture prophecies concerning the Messiah than had the teachers in Israel. (I1)

DA42/33 There were some who hoped for His coming as a deliverer from sin. (I1)

DA43/33 Philosophers endeavored to study into the mystery of the Hebrew economy. [H/24/51] [K/174.8] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

16/50 Not only did this awful exigence exist, it was extensively felt and acknowledged; and, by many of the more enlightened heathens, a Divine Instructor was ardently desired. [Harris, GT]

17/50 In illustration of this, the language of Plato has been often cited; nor is it easy to conceive of any thing more conclusive and striking than his picture of Socrates advising his pupil to forego the usual sacrifices until a teacher should be sent from on high. [Harris, GT]

18/50 In another place, speaking of such an inspired teacher, he represents, with prophetic sagacity and precision, that 'he must be poor, and void of all qualifications but those of virtue alone; that a wicked world would not bear his instructions and reproofs; and therefore, within three or four years after he began to preach, he would be persecuted, imprisoned, scourged, and at last put to death.' [Harris, GT]

[See Harris, 19/50 above.]

20/51 And in uttering the desire which his words disclose, we may take it for granted, he was clothing the thoughts of a thousand bosoms, venting the secret and cherished longings of unnumbered hearts. [Harris, GT]

22/51 Now the appearance of a Divine Instructor, thus absolutely necessary, and ardently desired, might have been warrantably expected. [Harris, GT]

24/51 Besides, the very presence and nature of the Jewish economy was a standing evidence that such was his gracious intention. [Harris, GT]

174.8 Greeks and Egyptians began to frequent the Hebrew festivals, and to look thitherward for a new faith. [Kennedy, MP]

DA44/33 But the bigotry of the Jews hindered the spread of the light. [K/174.9] (P3)

DA45/33 Intent on maintaining the separation between themselves and other nations, they were unwilling to impart the knowledge they still possessed concerning the symbolic service. [K/174.9] (I2)

DA46/33+ The true Interpreter must come. [H/25,26/51] (P3)

DA47/34 The One whom all these types prefigured must explain their significance. [H/25-29/51,52] (I2)

DA48/34 Through nature, through types and symbols, through patriarchs and prophets, God had spoken to the world. [H/23,25/51] (P3)

DA49/34 Lessons must be given to humanity in the language of humanity. (I1)

DA50/34 The Messenger of the covenant must speak. [H/37/52] (P3)

BE(97)10 The messenger of the covenant, the Sun of Righteousness, must rise upon the world. [H/37/52] (P1)

DA51/34 His voice must be heard in His own temple. (I1)

DA52/34 Christ must come to utter words which should be clearly and definitely understood. (I1)

DA53/34 He, the author of truth, must separate truth from the chaff of man's utterance, which had made it of no effect. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

174.9 Hebrew bigotry and exclusiveness alone prevented them from making still greater advance. [Kennedy, MP]

25/51 Bearing the marks of a celestial origin, and fraught with important truth, it yet veiled its meaning in types and enigmas, the solution of which remained to be given. (26) Here were mysteries--where was the interpreter? (27) Here were shadows--the substance, 'the very things themselves,' must be at hand. [Harris, GT]

23/51 Indubitable evidence existed that God already had spoken to man, at sundry times, and in divers manners; and as the ignorance of the world was still unreclaimed, and there was no intimation that his voice had been final, there was ground to anticipate that, in his own time, he would break the silence again. [Harris, GT]

37/52 For, reading on to its closing lines, we find it predict him as the Messenger of the covenant who was yet to come; and the Sun of Righteousness yet to arise. [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA54/34 The principles of God's government and the plan of redemption must be clearly defined. (I1)

DA55/34 The lessons of the Old Testament must be fully set before men. (I1)

DA56/34 Among the Jews there were yet steadfast souls, descendants of that holy line through whom a knowledge of God had been preserved. (I1)

DA57/34 These still looked for the hope of the promise made unto the fathers. [H/31/52] (I2)

DA58/34 They strengthened their faith by dwelling upon the assurance given through Moses, "A Prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you of your brethren, like unto me; Him shall ye hear in all things whatsoever He shall say unto you." [Acts 3:22.] [H/31/52] (B1)

ST(90)10 They rejoiced in the promise that God had made to his servant Moses: "I will raise them up a prophet from among their brethren, like unto thee, and will put my words in his mouth; and he shall speak unto them all that I shall command him. [Deut. 18:18] [H/31/52] (B1)

ST(90)11 And it shall come to pass, that whosoever will not hearken unto my words which he shall speak in my name, I will require it of him." [Deut. 18:19] [H/32/52] (B1)

DA59/34 Again, they read how the Lord would anoint One "to preach good tidings unto the meek," "to bind up the brokenhearted, to proclaim liberty to the captives," and to declare the "acceptable year of the Lord." [Isa. 61:1, 2] [H/35a/52] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

31/52 'For Moses truly said unto the fathers, A prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you of your brethren, like unto me; him shall ye hear in all things whatsoever he shall say unto you'. [Harris, GT]

32/52 'And it shall come to pass, that every soul, which will not hear that prophet, shall be destroyed from among the people'. [Harris, GT]

35a/52 Unfolding it farther, we read that he should preach the gospel to the poor, and proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord; [Harris, GT]

DA60/34 They read how He would "set judgment in the earth," how the isles should "wait for His law," how the Gentiles should come to His light, and kings to the brightness of His rising. [Isa. 42:4; 60:3.] [H/35b/52] (B1)

DA61/34 The dying words of Jacob filled them with hope: "The scepter shall not depart from Judah, nor a lawgiver from between his feet, until Shiloh come." [Gen. 49:10.] [K/174.2] (B1)

DA62/34 The waning power of Israel testified that the Messiah's coming was at hand. (I1)

DA63/34 The prophecy of Daniel pictured the glory of His reign over an empire which should succeed all earthly kingdoms; and, said the prophet, "It shall stand forever." [Dan. 2:44] (I1)

DA64/34 While few understood the nature of Christ's mission, there was a widespread expectation of a mighty prince who should establish his kingdom in Israel, and who should come as a deliverer to the nations. (I1)

DA65/34 The fullness of the time had come. [H/1/49] (V2)

MS(24)5 When, in the fulness of time, Christ came to our world, it was darkened and marred by the curse of apostasy and spiritual wickedness. [H/1/49] (P2)

FE2/399 The pity and sympathy of God were exercised in behalf of man, fallen and bound to Satan's chariot-car; and when the fullness of time was come, He sent forth His Son. [H/39,40b/230] [H/39/52+] (P3)

MS(24)1 It has been demonstrated that man by searching can not find out God. [H/2/49] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

35b/52 that he should set judgment in the earth, and the isles should wait for his law; and the Gentiles should come to his light, and kings to the brightness of his rising. [Harris, GT]

[See above under 174.2 Kennedy, MP]

1/49 When, in the fulness of time, the eternal Son came forth from the bosom of the Father, he descended to a region of spiritual darkness. [Harris, GT]

39/52+ When the fulness of time was come, God sent forth His Son. [Harris, GT]

39/230 He beheld in it a scene of woe, which never failed to call forth his profound compassion. [Harris, GT]

40b/230 . . . captive world, chained to the wheels of the spoiler, and moving along, (most of them so beguiled, as to be actually pleased with the mock pomp of the gloomy procession, to endless death. [Harris, GT]

2/49 Ages of inquiry, conjecture, and effort, had only served to demonstrate the fact--that man, 'by searching cannot find out God.' [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA66/34 Humanity, becoming more degraded through ages of transgression, called for the coming of the Redeemer. (I1)

[The following Ellen White quotes are not close enough in verbal similarities to indicate they were used in the composition of the DA text. We have included them here because they reflect the same content as the DA text and allow us to show Ellen White's use of the sources in her writings on the life of Christ.]

FE1/399 The deep necessity of man for a divine teacher was known in heaven. [H/41/52] (I2)

BE(97)17 Man's terrible necessity demanded help without delay. [H/41/52] (I2)

BE(97)21 Hear, O heavens, and be astonished, O earth; for the appointed Instructor of man was no less a personage than the Son of God! [H/40/52] (V2)

FE3/400 The One appointed in the counsels of heaven came to the earth as an instructor. [H/40/52] (P2)

FE4/400 He was no less a being than the Creator of the world, the Son of the Infinite God. [H/40/52] (P2)

BE(97)18 Who met this necessity?--An illustrious Teacher, the Son of God. [H/41/52] (P2)

BE(97)19 The eternal Word came to our world to win the confidence of humanity. [H/41/52] (P1)

FE5/400 The rich benevolence of God gave Him to our world; and to meet the necessities of humanity, He took on Him human nature. [H/41,44/52] (P2)

FE8/400 Mysteriously He allied Himself to human nature. [H/44/52] (V2)

FE9/400 "The Word was made flesh, and dwelt among us." [H/44/52] (B2)

40/52 Hear, O heavens; and be astonished, O earth! the appointed Instructor appears, and proves to be no less a being than the Son of God himself. [Harris, GT]

41/52 It is true, the deep necessities of man, the riches of the divine benevolence, and the glowing colors of prophecy, might have kindled and justified the expectation of a most illustrious teacher; but that he should have appeared in the person of the Eternal Word exceeds the highest flight of human hope; that he should have come from the bosom of the Father was an excess of goodness, one of those splendid surprises of grace, by which mercy delights to melt the obduracy, and to win the confidence of our guilty race. [Harris, GT]

44/52 The condescending object of his mission required that, for a time, he should hold the essential glories of his nature in abeyance: accordingly he mysteriously allied himself to our condition; 'the Word was made flesh.' [Harris, GT]

FE10/400 God's excess of goodness, benevolence, and love was a surprise to the world, of grace which could be realized, but not told. [H/41/52] (I2)

FE11/400 That Christ, during His childhood, should grow in wisdom, and in favor with God and man, was not a matter of astonishment; for it was according to the laws of His divine appointment that His talents should develop, and His faculties strengthen by exercise. [H/46a/52] (P2)

FE12/400 He sought neither the schools of the prophets nor the learning received from the rabbinical teachers; He needed not the education gained in these schools; for God was His instructor. [H/46b/52] (P3)

FE13/400 When in the presence of the teachers and rulers, His questions were instructive lessons, and He astonished the great men with His wisdom and deep penetration. [H/47/52] (P2)

FE15/400 The stores of wisdom and the scientific knowledge Christ displayed in the presence of the wise men, were a subject of surprise to His parents and brothers; for they knew He had never received from the great teachers instruction in human science. [H/48/53+] (P2)

FE17/400 They could not comprehend Him; for they knew not that He had access to the tree of life, a source of knowledge of which they knew nothing. [H/49/54] (P2)

FE18/400+ He ever possessed a peculiar dignity and individuality distinct from earthly pride or assumption; for He did not strive after greatness. [H/50/54] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

46a/52 That he should have grown in wisdom as he arose to maturity, was only according to a law of our nature--an ordinance of his own divine appointment--since it is only by a gradual development that the faculties of man arrive at perfection; [Harris, GT]

46b/52 but the office he had come to assume, and the divine qualifications he brought to it, supposed him superior to human tuition; and accordingly he sought it not. [Harris, GT]

47/52 When in childhood, he mingled a moment with the doctors of the temple, 'they were astonished at his understanding;' his inquiries were more instructive and replete with wisdom than their replies. [Harris, GT]

48/53+ On an after occasion, their surprise at his stores of sacred science was augmented by their knowledge of the fact, that he had 'never learned,' never approached the schools of human instruction. [Harris, GT]

49/54 He had access to a tree of knowledge they knew not of. [Harris, GT]

50/54 As his dignity was of an order distinct from earthly pomp, incapable of being diminished by its absence, or of being embellished by its presence, he entirely dispensed with it. [Harris, GT]

FE19/401 After Christ had condescended to leave His high command, step down from an infinite height and assume humanity, He could have taken upon Him any condition of humanity He might choose. [H/51/54] (P2)

FE20/401 But greatness and rank were nothing to Him, and He selected the lowest and most humble walk of life. [H/51/54] (P2)

FE21/401 The place of His birth was Beuhlehem, and on one side His parentage was poor, but God, the Owner of the world, was His Father. [H/52/54] (I2)

FE22/401 No trace of luxury, ease, selfish gratification, or indulgence was brought into his life, which was a continual round of self-denial and self-sacrifice. [H/52/54] (I2)

FE23/401 In accordance with His humble birth, he had apparently no greatness or riches, in order that the humblest believer need not say that Christ never knew the stress of pinching poverty. [H/53/54] (I2)

ST(90)23 The Saviour of the world proposed that no attraction of an earthly character should call men to his side. [H/54/54] (P2)

ST(90)24 The light and beauty of celestial truth alone should be the drawing power. [H/54/54] (P3)

ST(90)25 The outward glory, the worldly honor, which attracts the attention of men, he would not assume. [H/54/54] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

51/54 The various gradations of human condition were all open and free to his choice, but of these he selected the lowliest, and however astonishing the selection may appear to those who place distinction in opulence and rank, to him who had already stooped from an infinite height in becoming man, the varieties of earthly rank were as nothing, were only minute degrees of littleness. [Harris, GT]

52/54 The place of his birth, like a place constructed from the very wrecks of poverty, was entirely swept of every trace of luxury, every vestige of indulgence, and seemed sacred to humility alone. [Harris, GT]

53/54 And the lowliness of all his subsequent life strictly accorded with the humbleness of his birth. [Harris, GT]

54/54 Had he come in the pomp of outward state, the multitude would have been debarred from his presence, and the regards of men would have been divided between the attractions of his earthly rank, and the claims of celestial truth; but by choosing the low condition of the great majority, and declining the tinselled drapery which charms the eye, he graciously made himself accessible to all, while he seemed to put forward truth alone as the only object demanding their notice--to challenge their whole attention to the native worth, the intrinsic importance of the doctrines he announced. [Harris, GT]

FE24/401 Had he possessed the semblance of outward show, of riches, of grandeur, the poorest class of humanity would have shunned His society; therefore He chose the lowly condition of the far greater number of the people. [H/54/54] (P2)

FE25/401 The truth of heavenly origin was to be His theme: He was to sow the earth with truth; and He came in such a way as to be accessible to all, that the truth alone might make an impression upon human hearts. [H/54/54] (P2)

ST(90)26 He made himself accessible to all, teaching the pure, exalted principle of truth as that which was only worthy of their notice. [H/54/54] (P2)

ST(90)29 Wonders in the heavens above and signs in the earth beneath attested his power and majesty. [H/55/54] (I2)

ST(90)30 At his baptism a voice from heaven fell upon the ears of men, declaring, "This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased." [H/60/55+] (B1)

DA67/34 Satan had been working to make the gulf deep and impassable between earth and heaven. [H/6/145] (P2)

DA68/34+ By his falsehoods he had emboldened men in sin. (I1)

DA69/35 It was his purpose to wear out the forbearance of God, and to extinguish his love for man, so that He would abandon the world to satanic jurisdiction. [H/6/145] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

[See above]

55/54 But though, for the reasons assigned, he assumed the most bare and unpretending simplicity, as the hour for opening his divine commission drew nigh, the public mind was apprised of the event by 'wonders in heaven above, and signs in the earth beneath.' [Harris, GT]

60/55+ Having thus honored the ministry of his servant, and ratified and obeyed existing laws, he ascended from the waters, and prayed; and as he prayed, 'Lo, the heavens were opened unto him, and he saw the Spirit of God descending like a dove, and lighting upon him: and, lo, a voice from heaven, saying, This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased.' [Harris, GT]

6/145 Besides, by widening the breach which existed between earth and heaven, Satan might calculate on the possibility of at length realizing his own lie, of wearing out the goodness which only encountered abuse, of extinguishing the last spark of love in the breast of God, and of exasperating justice to doom and destroy the whole species. [Harris, GT]

DA(MS)4/54:2 Through his falsehoods he had emboldened men in transgression, seeking to wear out the forbearance of God, to extinguish in his heart all love for man, and so exasperate his justice that he would abandon the world to Satanic jurisdiction. [H/6/145] (I2)

[Likewise, the following quotes are not close enough in verbal similarities to indicate they were used in the composition of the DA text. We have included them here because they reflect the same content as the DA text and allow us to show Ellen White's use of the sources in her writings on the life of Christ.]

RH(95)1 Speaking of Satan, our Lord says that "he abode not in the truth." [H/12a/227]
(V2)

RH(95)/2 He was once the covering cherub, glorious in beauty and holiness. [H/12b/227]
(P3)

RH(95)6a He was envious of the position that was held by Christ and the Father, (I1)

RH(95)6b and he turned from his allegiance to the Commander of heaven and lost his high and holy estate. [H/12c/227] (P1)

RH(95)7 Though the angels had a knowledge of God and of Jesus Christ, though they were happy in the glorious service which they did for the King of heaven, yet, through his crooked representations of Christ and the Father, the evil one deceived a great company of angels, drew them into sympathy with himself, and associated them with himself in rebellion. [H/13/227] (I2)

RH(95)8 Satan and his sympathizers became the avowed antagonists of God, established their own infernal empire, and set up a standard of rebellion against the God of heaven. [H/14/228] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

[See above]

12a/227 Speaking of Satan, our Lord declares that 'he abode not in the truth;' [Harris, GT]

12b/227 once, he possessed a throne where all is radiant with holiness and joy, [Harris, GT]

12c/227 but he swerved from his allegiance to 'the blessed and only Potentate,' and thus lost his first estate. [Harris, GT]

13/227 Together with an unknown multitude of associate rebels, he was driven from the presence of God, cut off from the loyal part of the creation, and doomed to be the prey of his own mighty depravity. [Harris, GT]

14/227 From that moment he became the avowed antagonist of God; established an infernal empire, and planted the standard of rebellion, around which all the principles and powers of evil might rally and combine. [Harris, GT]

RH(95)9 All the principalities and powers of evil rallied to the work of overthrowing the government of God. [H/14/227] (P2)

RH(95)10 Satan accomplished the fall of man, and since that time it has been his work to efface in man the image of God, and to stamp upon human hearts his own image. [H/15/227] (P2)

Lt(43)28 It is at Lucifer's throne that every evil work finds its starting point, and obtains its support. [H/19/228] (P2)

RH(95)11 Possessing supremacy in guilt, he claims supremacy for himself, and exercises over his subjects the power of royalty. [H/20/228] (I2)

RH(95)12 He cannot expel God from his throne, but through the system of idolatry, he plants his own throne between the heaven and the earth, between God and the human worshiper. [H/21/228] (P1)

RH(95)13 He intercepts every ray of light that comes from God to man, and appropriates the worship that is due to God . . . [H/21/228] (I2)

DA70/35 Satan was seeking to shut out from men a knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God, and to establish his own kingdom. [H/25/229] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

[See above]

15/227 Actuated by that universal law, by which each being and principle seeks to conform all things to its own nature, and stimulated by implacable hatred against God, he no sooner found our world created, than he came to efface from it the image of God and to stamp his own on its breast. [Harris, GT]

19/228 His throne is the rallying point, to which all evil looks for reinforcement and support; the centre from which flows, and to which gravitates, all evil; the heart of the great system of guilt. [Harris, GT]

20/228 The domination which Satan has acquired on earth is called by Christ a kingdom; in which he possesses, by right of supremacy in guilt, the princely titles, and exercises the prerogatives of royalty. [Harris, GT]

21/228 Unable to expel God from his throne, and thus succeed to the homage of man; he had, by a universal system of idolatry, planted his throne between the human worshipper and the Divine Being, intercepting and appropriating the adoration which belonged to God alone. [Harris, GT]

25/229 At different times he seems to have put all the forces of his kingdom into motion to bear upon it: for to shut up the temple of God, to seduce the people to idolatry, to erect an idol in the holy place, was to sit on the only throne of God upon earth, was a triumph which could only be exceeded by ascending the throne of heaven. [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Lt(43)29 Satan has charged injustice upon God, and at various times has set in motion all his supernatural agencies in order to shut off from man the knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God and his sanctuary, and to establish his own kingdom in the earth. [H/25/229] (P2)

DA71/35 His strife for supremacy had seemed to be almost wholly successful. [H/27/229] (P2)

DA72/35 It is true that in every generation God had His agencies. (11)

DA73/35 Even among the heathen there were men through whom Christ was working to uplift the people from their sin and degradation. (11)

DA74/35 But these men were despised and hated. (11)

DA75/35 Many of them suffered a violent death. (11)

DA76/35 The dark shadow that Satan had cast over the world grew deeper and deeper. (11)

RH(95)33 It has seemed that the confederacy of idolatry has borne supreme sway, and that Satan had indeed become the god of this world. [H/31,33/229] (P3)

DA77/35 Through heathenism, Satan had for ages turned men away from God; but he won his great triumph in perverting the faith of Israel. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

[See above]

27/229 His contest for earthly supremacy, so long disputed by heaven, seemed crowned with success. [Harris, GT]

31/229 Nor did Judea itself form an exception to this wide infernal sway; for (short of formal idolatry) it belonged to the universal confederacy, and formed one of the fairest and most faithful provinces of the satanic empire. [Harris, GT]

33/229 Satan had become 'the prince of this world.' [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA78/35 By contemplating and worshiping their own conceptions, the heathen had lost a knowledge of God, and had become more and more corrupt. (11)

DA79/35 So it was with Israel. (11)

DA80/35+ The principle that man can save himself by his own works lay at the foundation of every heathen religion; it had now become the principle of the Jewish religion. (11)

DA81/36 Satan had implanted this principle. (11)

DA82/36 Wherever it is held, men have no barrier against sin. (11)

DA83/36 The message of salvation is communicated to men through human agencies. (11)

DA84/36 But the Jews had sought to make a monopoly of the truth which is eternal life. [H/111.3] (12)

DA85/36 They had hoarded the living manna, and it had turned to corruption. (11)

DA86/36 The religion which they tried to shut up to themselves became an offense. (11)

DA87/36 They robbed God of His glory, and defrauded the world by a counterfeit of the gospel. (11)

DA88/36 They had refused to surrender themselves to God for the salvation of the world, and they became agents of Satan for its destruction. (11)

DA89/36 The people whom God had called to be the pillar and ground of the truth had become representatives of Satan. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

111.3 Human selfishness would make a monopoly of eternal life. The Jewish Christians [sic] would fain have made it a local and national benefit; till the unconfined spirit came, and showed them that, like the air, it belonged to the world. [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA90/36 They were doing the work that he desired them to do, taking a course to misrepresent the character of God, and cause the world to look upon Him as a tyrant. (11)

DA91/36 The very priests who ministered in the temple had lost sight of the significance of the service they performed. (11)

DA92/36 They had ceased to look beyond the symbol to the thing signified. (11)

DA93/36 In presenting the sacrificial offerings they were as actors in a play. (11)

DA94/36 The ordinances which God Himself had appointed were made the means of blinding the mind and hardening the heart. (11)

DA95/36 God could do no more for man through these channels. (11)

DA96/36 The whole system must be swept away. (11)

DA97/36 The deception of sin had reached its height. (11)

DA98/36 All the agencies for depraving the souls of men had been put in operation. (11)

DA99/36 The Son of God, looking upon the world, beheld suffering and misery. [H/39/230] (P3)

RH(95)34 But the only begotten Son of God has looked upon the scene, has beheld human suffering and misery. [H/39/230] (P3)

DA100/36 With pity He saw how men had become victims of satanic cruelty. [H/40a/230] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

39/230 He beheld in it a scene of woe, which never failed to call forth his profound compassion. [Harris, GT]

40a/230 On all sides he beheld the blinded victims of satanic cruelty; [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Lt(43)9 With pity he has seen how his human agencies have been blinded by the deceptions of the enemy, and have become victims of satanic cruelty. [H/40a/230] (P2)

DA101/36 He looked with compassion upon those who were being corrupted, murdered, and lost. [H/40b/230] (P3)

DA102/36 They had chosen a ruler who chained them to his car as captives. [H/40c/230] (P3)

DA103/36 Bewildered and deceived, they were moving on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,--to death in which is no hope of life, toward night to which comes no morning. [H/40d/230] (I2)

RH(95)39 He looked with compassion upon men who were becoming corrupted, ruined, murdered, and lost, through choosing a ruler who chained them to his car as captives, and yet these slaves were so bewildered, so beguiled and deceived, that they were actually pleased with their slavery as they moved on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,--to death in which is no hope of life, toward night to which comes no morning. [H/40/230] (P2)

DA104/36 Satanic agencies were incorporated with men. [H/42/231] (P2)

DA105/36 The bodies of human beings, made for the dwelling place of God, had become the habitation of demons. [H/42,43/231] (P2)

RH(95)40 He saw human beings possessed by devils, saw Satanic agencies incorporated with men, saw the bodies of men become the habitations for the degrading indwelling of demons. [H/42/231] (P1)

RH(95)41 Man, made for the dwelling-place of God, became the habitation of dragons. [H/43a/231] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

40b/230 vast, crowded tracts of spiritual beings, immortal essences, wasted, ruined, murdered, lost; [Harris, GT]

40c/230 a captive world, chained to the wheels of the spoiler, [Harris, GT]

40d/230 and moving along, (most of them so beguiled, as to be actually pleased with the mock pomp of the gloomy procession, to endless death. [Harris, GT]

41/230+ While immediately beneath his eye, in the very land where he had taken humanity, he saw legions of fiends in actual, bodily possession of miserable man. [Harris, GT]

42/231 Not satisfied with the evil they could inflict by ordinary temptation, he beheld them consummating their cruelty by actually incorporating with men; turning their bodies into living tombs, engrossing and demonizing all their powers, merging the man in the fiend. [Harris, GT]

43a/231 Yes, man, who had been created in the image of God, became 'the habitation of dragons;' [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA106/36 The senses, the nerves, the passions, the organs of men, were worked by supernatural agencies in the indulgence of the vilest lust. [H/43b/231] (P3)

DA107/36 The very stamp of demons was impressed upon the countenances of men. [H/43c/231] (P3)

DA108/36 Human faces reflected the expression of the legions of evil with which they were possessed. [H/43c/231] (P3)

DA109/36 Such was the prospect upon which the world's Redeemer looked. [H/43d/231] (P3)

DA110/36 What a spectacle for Infinite Purity to behold! [H/43d/231] (P2)

DA111/37 Sin had become a science, and vice was consecrated as a part of religion. [H/34/229+] [H/102.9] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

43b/231 his heart the fuel consumed by their passions; his senses and organs, the slaves of their rampant impiety; hell brought to him, and begun in him, upon earth; [Harris, GT]

43c/231 an incarnate demon, his fetures putting on the image of the legion within him; [Harris, GT]

43d/231 --what a sight for the Lover of souls! what a spectacle for infinite goodness to contemplate! [Harris, GT]

34/229 Wherever he looked the expanse was his own; the teeming population were his subjects; the invisible rulers were his selected agents; temptation in his hands had become a science, and sin was taught by rule; [Harris, GT]

We interrupt the presentation of the text here to remind the reader that for the final 19 sentences of the third chapter of DA we will be listing 23 consecutive sentences from Harris and 25 consecutive sentences from an article by EGW published in 1894¹². With the full text available the reader will be able to note the subtle and varied use of the source which almost defies all our efforts to categorize and to measure in terms of dependency. In addition, this format makes it easier for us to recognize the way in which earlier articles of EGW have been utilized in the composition of chapters developing a larger theme. The inclusion of major portions of the source text, though not often done because of space limitations, makes manifest the dependency of the EGW text on Harris for the development of the theme or narrative. Another tremendous advantage to presenting the full text of the source is that it permits a more accurate comparison. We are more easily able to notice where EGW omits, abbreviates, or expands on the coverage of a given theme by a source. It is this kind of data as well as the notation of similarities that makes possible the fairest evaluation of the EGW text.

12. Ellen G. White, "God's Love Unmeasured," ST, Vol. 20, No. 14 (February 5, 1894)

ST(94)1 The question has been asked, "Would not a lesser gift from God have been adequate for the redemption of lost man?" [H/6a/101]
(P2)

ST(94)2 "In this was manifested the love of God toward us, because that God sent his only-begotten Son into the world, that we might live through him. (B1)

ST(94)3 Herein is love, not that we loved God, but that he loved us, and sent his Son to be the propitiation for our sins." (B1)

ST(94)4 The question is unanswerable, and it is not profitable for us to spend our time in making conjectures. (I1)

ST(94)5 All our thoughts and imaginations will not alter in the least any part of the plan of redemption devised from all eternity. (I1)

ST(94)6 God loved the world to such an extent that he gave full and complete evidence of the fact. [H/6b/101] (I2)

ST(94)7 He did not leave any chance for the tempter to say that he did not love us, for he gave a gift whose value could not be estimated. [H6c/101] (I2)

ST(94)8 Had he done less, Satan and his agencies would have sought to have inspired jealousy against God by intimating that he could have done more than he did. (I1)

ST(94)9 God so loved the world that he determined to give a gift beyond all computation, and make manifest how immeasurable was his love. [H/6d/101] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

6a/101 We will not presume to question whether a gift of inferior value would have been adequate to relieve the world or not: [Harris, GT]

6b/101 but God so loved us that he could not have realized his vast propensions of grace by giving us less; [Harris, GT]

6c/101 he so loved us, that he would not suffer it to remain possible to be said he could love us more; he knew that a donation of calculable value would only call forth an odious spirit of fierce and jealous monopoly, [Harris, GT]

6d/101 but he so loved us, that he resolved on a gift, defying all computation, [Harris, GT]

ST(94)10 The gift of God would be a wonder to all worlds, to all created intelligences [sic], ever enlarging their ideas of what God's love was in its infinity and greatness. [H/6e/101] (I2)

ST(94)11 Contemplation of this love would uproot from the heart all selfishness, and so transform the soul that men would cherish generosity, practice self-denial, and imitate the example of God. [H/6e/101] (I2)

ST(94)12 God so loved the world that he gave heaven's best gift, in order that the most guilty transgressor should not be deferred from coming to Christ, however great his sin, and be enabled to ask for pardon at a throne of mercy. [H/6f/101] (I2)

ST(94)13 Since God has given the greatest gift in his power, we are to render to him our whole heart. [H/6g/101] (I2)

ST(94)14 He has poured out to the world the treasures of heaven, giving with such largeness that there is nothing more to bestow, no reserve grace or power or glory, and we are to respond to this love by rendering willing service to Jesus, who has died for us on Calvary's cross. [H/6g/101] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

6e/101 and the very mention of which should surcharge our minds with greatness, give us an idea of infinity, and impregnate our selfishness with a transforming sentiment of generous and diffusive benevolence; [Harris, GT]

6f/101+ he so loved us, that he would leave nothing for the most apprehensive guilt to fear, nor the most capacious wishes to desire; [Harris, GT]

6g/102 he laid claim to the whole of our affections, by pouring out the whole treasury of heaven, by giving us his all at once. [Harris, GT]

7/102 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

8/102 'God sent not his Son into the world to condemn the world, but that the world through him might be saved.' [Harris, GT]

DA112/37 Rebellion had struck its roots deep into the heart, and the hostility of man was most violent against heaven. [H/11,12/102] (P3)

ST(94)15 At the time when sin had become a science, when the hostility of man was most violent against heaven, when rebellion struck its roots deep into the human heart, when vice was consecrated as a part of religion, when Satan exulted in the idea that he had led men to such a state of evil that God would destroy the world, Jesus was sent into the world, not to condemn it, but, amazing grace! to save the world. [H/10-18/102+] (I2)

DA113/37 It was demonstrated before the universe that, apart from God, humanity could not be uplifted. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

9/102 In order to enhance our views of the divine compassion, the Savior in this language, reminds us of the terrible alternative which outraged Omnipotence might have adopted. [Harris, GT]

10/102 He carries back our thoughts to the time when God, after looking with centuries of patience and forbearance on the unparalleled spectacle of his holy law prostrate, and broken, and trampled under foot by a confederated race of rebellious creatures, came forth out of his place, and punished the inhabitants of the earth for their iniquity; swept them away with a flood as with a besom of destruction. [Harris, GT]

11/102 But man, insensible to the lessons of chastisement, was no sooner permitted to repeople the earth, than he resumed his weapons, renewed his hostility to heaven under circumstances of aggravation unknown before, and transmitted to his posterity, as if it has been a sacred obligation, the art and spirit of the unnatural war. [Harris, GT]

12/102 So deep had this infernal enmity to God struck its roots in the human heart, and so wide were its ramifications throughout the entire mass of humanity, that even a solitary indication of returning friendship towards him was denounced as treachery to a common cause; the first relaxation of this impious strife, the first relenting sigh, was instantly detected by a wakeful impiety, quickened by hatred to an instinctive vigilance; and was summarily dealt with as an enemy in the camp. [Harris, GT]

13/102+ Man had naturalized the principle of sin; had consecrated vice in all its forms; had opened to it all the recesses of his nature; cherished and established its dominion by every species of submission and indulgence; and boasted of his new allegiance in the face of heaven. [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA114/37 A new element of life and power must be imparted by Him who made the world. (I1)

DA115/37 With intense interest the unfallen worlds had watched to see Jehovah arise, and sweep away the inhabitants of the earth. [H/10,17,18/102,103] (I2)

ST(94)16a The unfallen worlds watched with intense interest to see Jehovah arise and sweep away the inhabitants of the earth, and Satan boasted that if God did do this, [H/10,18/102,103] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

14/103 The only law which kept mankind united, the only sympathy which held the unnumbered parts and interests of the world in affinity, seemed to be an all-pervading principle of aversion to God; and this was sufficient to bind them fast for ages, in one great and unbroken work of prodigious guilt. [Harris, GT]

15/103 The destruction of the world, therefore, so far from being an infraction of justice, was only what justice required; would only have been the natural course of things, flowing in the unobstructed order of cause and effect. [Harris, GT]

16/103 A crisis had arrived in the government of God on earth, in which something great and decisive must be done; prolong the delay--and the character of God will be compromised and gone; the voices of the souls beneath the altar were wearied with crying for retribution; the armory of heaven was open; all its hosts and equipments ready; justice had only to speak the word, and in a moment's flight, the panic earth would have beheld its firmament filled with the careering fires and terrific forms of descending [sic] wrath. [Harris, GT]

17/103 The Son of God had only to pour out the vial of incensed wrath, and there had been voices, and thunders, and lightnings, and earthquakes, and universal desolation; and all the holy intelligences, as they stood afar off, on the sea of glass, beholding the tremendous catastrophe, would have said, 'Thou art righteous, O Lord, because thou hast judged thus.' [Harris, GT]

18a/103 But at that crisis of the world, when every movement in the government of God was to be watched with breathless apprehension, when, had justice made the slightest move, every thing that had feeling would have veiled its eyes in fear, then mercy prevailed to unfold the scheme of love, [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA116/37 And if God should do this, Satan was ready to carry out his plan for securing to himself the allegiance of heavenly beings. (I1)

ST(94)16b he would complete his plans and secure for himself the allegiance of unfallen worlds. (I1)

DA117/37 He had declared that the principles of God's government make forgiveness impossible. (I1)

DA118/37 Had the world been destroyed, he would have claimed that his accusations were proved true. (I1)

DA119/37 He was ready to cast blame upon God, and to spread his rebellion to the worlds above. (I1)

DA120/37 But instead of destroying the world, God sent His Son to save it. [H/18b/103] (P3)

DA121/37 Though corruption and defiance might be seen in every part of the alien province, a way for its recovery was provided. (I1)

DA122/37 At the very crisis, when Satan seemed about to triumph, the Son of God came with the embassy of divine grace. [H/16-18/103] (I2)

ST(94)17 He had arguments ready by which to cast blame upon God, and to spread his rebellion to the worlds above; but at this crisis, instead of destroying the world, God sent his Son to save it. [H/18b/103] (I2)

DA123/37 Through every age, through every hour, the love of God had been exercised toward the fallen race. [H/3/101] (P2)

DA124/37 Notwithstanding the perversity of men, the signals of mercy had been continually exhibited. [H/2/101] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

18b/103 and it became the office of justice to wonder and attend; then, when God might have sent his Son to condemn the world, he was sent--amazing grace!--to save it. [Harris, GT]

1/101 'God so loved the world that he gave his only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life.' [Harris,GT]

2/101 Though sin had for ages disturbed the equable flow of the divine benevolence to man, that benevolence had never, for a moment, ceased to accumulate, or lost its earthward direction. [Harris, GT]

3/101 Through every hour, of every age, it had continued to increase; and was only restrained till a suitable channel was ready, and the world prepared to receive it. [Harris, GT]

ST(94)18 The apostle caught a glimpse of the plan, and he kindled into inspiration upon the great theme. [H/20/103+] (I2)

ST(94)19 Language cannot express his conception, but ever falls below the reality. [H/21/104] (I2)

ST(94)20 John exclaims: "Behold, what manner of love the Father hath bestowed upon us, that we should be called the sons of God; therefore the world knoweth us not, because it knew him not." (B1)

ST(94)21 Before the coming of Christ to the world evidences abundant had been given that God loved the human race. [H/22/104] (P3)

ST(94)22 But in the gift of Christ to a race so undeserving was demonstrated the love of God beyond all dispute. [H/22/104] (P3)

DA125/37 And when the fullness of the time had come, the Deity was glorified by pouring upon the world a flood of healing grace that was never to be obstructed or withdrawn till the plan of salvation should be fulfilled. [H/4/101] (I2)

ST(94)23 This gift outweighed all else, showed that his love could not be measured. [H/22,23/104] (P3)

ST(94)24 We have no line to measure it, no plummet by which to sound its depths, no chain by which to encompass it, no standard with which to compare it. [H/23/104] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

19/103 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

20/103+ The apostles never touched it, but they instantly kindled at the inspiration of the theme. [Harris, GT]

21/104) Conscious that their language fell far below their conceptions, and their conception below their subject, they could only exclaim, in the impotence of overwhelming admiration, Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

22/104 The universe is crowded with proofs of his benevolence; but here is a proof which outweighs them all! [Harris, GT]

4/101 And now, when the fulness of time was come, the windows of heaven, the heart of Deity itself, was opened, and poured forth on the world a healing flood of heavenly grace. [Harris, GT]

5/101 Herein is love! [Harris, GT]

23a/104 How much he loved us we can never compute; we have no line with which to fathom, no standard with which to compare it; [Harris, GT]

ST(94)25 All we can say is that "God so loved the world, that he gave his only-begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life." (B1)

DA126/37 Satan was exulting that he had succeeded in debasing the image of God in humanity. (I1)

DA127/37+ Then Jesus came to restore in man the image of his Maker. (I1)

DA128/38 None but Christ can fashion anew the character that has been ruined by sin. (I1)

DA129/38 He came to expel the demons that had controlled the will. (I1)

DA130/38 He came to lift us up from the dust, to reshape the marred character after the pattern of His divine character, and to make it beautiful with His own glory. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 3 - SOURCES

23b/104 but he so loved us that he gave his only begotten Son, that through him he might confer on us eternal life.
[Harris, GT]

"The Fullness of the Time"

Analysis

In the preceding 28 double-pages we have presented the full text of DA, chapter 3, which we divided into 130 sentence units for comparison purposes. In addition, we have included 100 sentences from Ellen White's earlier writings as well as the text of the sources apparently used in the literary composition of the EGW materials. In this section of our report we will attempt an analysis of our comparative study, including both similarities and dissimilarities, in respect to the aspects of verbal expression (source analysis) and thematic arrangement (redaction). Our emphasis will be on source analysis of the DA text though some consideration will be given to redaction where it applies. The pre-DA text will be presented in a supporting role for reasons which have been earlier given.

Source Analysis - The Desire of Ages

In Table 1 on page 34 the evaluations of the DA sentence units have been tabulated according to the nine categories, seven of which are considered to indicate literary dependency according to the criteria as presented in the introduction to this study. The individual evaluation of each sentence of chapter three and the literary source involved appears in Appendix A.

Out of the 130 sentence units 67 appear to be original with the DA text from a literary point of view and therefore are evaluated as non-dependent. Four units were credited to

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 3

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1 Strict Verbatim V1	2 Verbatim V2	3 Strict Paraphrase P1	4 Simple Paraphrase P2	5 Loose Paraphrase P3	6 Source Bible B1	7 Partial Independence I2	8 Strict Independence I1	9 Bible B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	01	00	09	20	05	24	67	04	130
02. ST(90)	00	00	00	02	04	04	04	—	—	14
03. MS(24)[91]	00	00	00	05	04	00	01	—	—	10
04. ST(94)	00	00	00	02	04	04	12	(04)	—	26
05. Lt(43)[95]	00	00	00	03	00	00	00	—	—	03
06. RH(95)	00	01	04	05	03	00	03	(01)	—	17
07. FE(96) (MS 9)	00	01	00	11	02	00	06	—	(01)	21
08. BE(97)	00	01	02	01	00	00	01	—	—	05
09. ST(98)	00	01	00	00	02	00	00	—	—	03
10. DA(MS)[97/98]	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	—	—	01
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	04	06	29	19	08	28	(05)	(01)	100

"The Fullness of the Time"

the Bible as the literary source selected by the writer or as common to Bible commentators treating the topic. These sentences are also excluded from our study of literary dependency. The remaining 59 sentences were found to exhibit literary dependency in four categories: 1 Verbatim; 9 Simple paraphrase; 20 Loose Paraphrase; 5 Source Bible; and 24 Partial Independence. No examples of Strict Verbatim or Strict Paraphrase were found.

If we assign the value of 0 to category (I1), Strict Independence; the value of 1.0 to category (I2), Partial Independence; 2.0 to category (B1), Source Bible; 3.0 to category (P3), Loose Paraphrase; 4.0 to (P2), Simple Paraphrase; 5.0 to (P1), Strict Paraphrase; 6.0 to (V2), Verbatim, and 7.0 to (V1), Strict Verbatim, the average literary dependency for the 130 sentences of the chapter is 1.079 or 1.08. If we exclude those categories which do not indicate dependency and limit our evaluation to the categories of dependency, giving the lowest value of 1.0 to the lowest level of dependency, i.e., Partial Independence (I1), our average dependency for chapter 3 is 2.3.¹

Table 2 presented on page 36 shows the distribution of sources used in chapter 3. Of the 59 sentences involving some degree of dependency, six reflected the use of Thayer, five were influenced by Kennedy and four appear to have

¹This figure has been derived from adding the totals of 1 x 24, 2 x 5, 3 x 20, 4 x 9, 5 x 0, 6 x 1 and 7 x 0 (24 + 10 + 60 + 36 + 0 + 6 + 0 = 136), and dividing by the total

TABLE 2
DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 3
Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	—	(04)	04
02. Harris GT	00	01	00	08	17	03	15	—	—	44
03. Kennedy MP	00	00	00	00	01	01	03	—	—	05
04. Thayer SLJ	00	00	00	01	02	00	03	—	—	06
05. MP/SLJ	00	00	00	00	00	00	03	—	—	03
06. GT/MP	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	—	—	01
TOTALS DA Text	00	01	00	09	20	04	25	—	(04)	63

"The Fullness of the Time"

depended on various combinations of Thayer, Kennedy and Harris. Harris was the main literary source, being used in 44 sentences. The Bible was used for 4 sentences.

For chapter three the majority of literary borrowing occurs in clearly defined sections of the source. There is very little skipping around in the source with an isolated use here and there.

The use of Thayer is largely limited to the second chapter of Sketches from the Life of Jesus which covers the subject of "Reasons for the Delay of the Advent." The content is very similar to what Ellen White is dealing with in this chapter and Thayer introduces his chapter with the quotation from Galatians 4:4, "But when the fullness of time was come . . . ," the words Ellen White chose for the title of her chapter.

The parallels from Kennedy are found in his introduction on page 174. On page 173 he also uses the phrase, "the fulness of time was come." In his table of contents Kennedy outlines the content of this section of his "Introduction" as having to do with "Antecedents" and "Probable time of the Advent." Kennedy's work was listed in the inventory of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death.

The Harris material is largely taken from three sections of The Great Teacher. The first essay of Harris'

number of sentences which is 59. Dividing 136 by 59 results in 2.3.

"The Fullness of the Time"

work is entitled, "On the Authority of our Lord's Teaching." We found definite correspondence between pages 49-53 (the first five pages of this essay) and 19 sentences of chapter 3 beginning with #27 and running through until sentence #65. A second section of Harris, his second essay entitled, "On the Originality of our Lord's Teaching," pages 101 to 103, is reflected in sentences 111 to 125 of our chapter. The third major use of Harris in this chapter of DA, sentences 99-110, focuses on a subsection of this same essay on our Lord's originality entitled "On Satanic Agency."

The non-dependent literary work of Ellen White in this chapter also seems to come in sections. Apart from a few independent sentences at the beginning and ending of chapter 3 the majority of her independent expression occurs in sentences 72 to 98 where she is describing the failure of Israel to represent God aright in their religious beliefs and practices. This is not to say that the ideas coming to expression in these independent sentences are unique to Ellen White. A comparison with sentences before #72 and after #98 which show dependency upon Harris, reveals that Ellen White is dealing with the same subject and expressing often the same ideas as is Harris. The difference is to be found in their literary styles and theme development.

The purpose of this study does not include a comparison of the content of Ellen White's work with that of the sources being used. We are limiting our concern to the literary parallels. It would appear, however, that content

"The Fullness of the Time"

does not play an important role in terms of which sentences reflect literary borrowing and those which do not. Literary dependence as well as independence seems to apply across the board whether the writing concerns history, theology, biblical narrative, background descriptions, or personal devotion.

Thus far in our analysis we have centered our discussion on the DA text which we know was a compilation of earlier Ellen G. White writings and materials specifically written for this publishing venture on the life of Christ. A serious study of the sources must include, therefore, an evaluation of those earlier writings which formed the text base for this compilation. Such a review of these earlier writings becomes all the more appropriate and necessary when we recognize that the one compiling and arranging the new publication is not Ellen White but her "bookmaker," Marian Davis. Apart from those materials specifically prepared for this larger work on the life of Christ the actual hand of Ellen White in the use of literary sources would more likely be revealed through a study of these earlier articles and manuscripts which had a life on their own independent of compilation and arrangement for republication in DA.

Source Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

In our attempt to reconstruct the text resources Marian Davis would most likely have had at her disposal in the compilation of materials for DA, we found eight different

"The Fullness of the Time"

writings which can be dated prior to the publication of DA in 1898, including one sentence from a working manuscript of DA. Most of these materials had been published in some form prior to 1898. Manuscript 24 of 1891 has not been published in full as of this date. The selections from the EGW letter to John Harvey Kellogg, Letter 43, 1895, were published as part of the article quoted quite extensively in the pre-DA materials for this chapter under RH(95).

Even though chapter 3 was one of the later chapters of DA to be written, apart from MS 24, 1891, we found no handwritten texts in support of the finished chapter or of any of the articles which were apparently used in the development of the chapter. The particular eight documents reviewed as background material for this chapter yielded 100 sentences reflecting literary dependency. These sentences which bear on the content of chapter 3 have been evaluated for each Ellen White document and the totals are listed in Table 1 above. The list for the individual evaluations of each individual sentence is provided in Appendix B. In the distribution table on page 41, Table 3, we show that all 100 sentences reflect the use of The Great Teacher by Harris. Were we to assess the evaluation scores for these writings as we did the DA text, omitting the six verses which do not show dependency (categories 8 & 9), our average level of dependency would be 2.89, somewhat higher than we found for DA. Such a comparative evaluation would be invalid, however, for several reasons. We have not included any

TABLE 3
DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 3
Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT																		
	00	04	06	29	19	05	28	05	01	100								
V1	1	V2	2	P1	3	P2	4	P3	5	B1	6	I2	7	I1	8	B2	9	TOTAL
Strict Verbatim		Verbatim		Strict Paraphrase		Simple Paraphrase		Loose Paraphrase		Source Bible		Partial Independence		Strict Independence		Bible		

"The Fullness of the Time"

sentences from these writings where the Ellen White text stands alone nor have we included those sentences which show dependence but which treat a content beyond that of chapter 3.¹ We have also found that some of these earlier writings were not independently written but appear to have been in part dependent upon still earlier writings.² Finally, such an evaluation would be invalid because we have not evaluated every sentence in the Ellen White article or manuscript as we did for the entire chapter in DA.

We have included sentences which have no comparable DA sentence in chapter 3 when such sentences appear in a context where comparable chapter 3 sentences may be found.³ These additional parallels provide further evidence of the literary borrowing which would not be so obvious were we to

¹The RH article of October 22, 1895, which is quoted in part as a supporting text for this chapter is continued in the October 29 RH. In part two of the article we have more quotes from Harris and at least one from Melvill. We did not use this second part of the article, however, because it dealt with material to be found in chapters 4, 5, 7, etc. of DA.

²A case in point is the use of Ellen White's letter to John H. Kellogg (Lt 43, 1995) as the basis for the two-part article in the RH, October 22, 29, 1895, both of which appear to have been used in the construction of chapter 3. At times it is difficult to tell if one writing is dependent upon another, both are the result of repeated use of the same source, or if we have an instance of separate uses of the source combined with the use of earlier writings.

³Two examples of this use of earlier materials as supporting evidence for literary borrowing for this chapter are the inclusion of the sentences from Fundamentals of Christian Education (MS 9, 1896) and from ST(94) which also have sentences not comparable to the content of chapter 3. FE2/399 though placed elsewhere in the text sequence clearly relates to DA101-103 as well as to RH(95). FE3/400, located after DA66, is very similar to DA35. FE25/401 clearly echoes ST(90)26 and ST(90) has many parallels with

"The Fullness of the Time"

limit our selection to those sentences which have been taken over for use in writing chapter 3.

Even though we are not able to evaluate the 100 sentences selected from the various texts used in the composition of this chapter, a careful study of the textual evidence provided will show that often the earlier work is closer to the literary source, i.e., shows greater dependency, than does the later DA text. This dependency is often too subtle and too varied to classify in separate categories but that it does exist is quite apparent. Some of the more obvious instances of this higher level of dependency for the earlier documents can be noted from Table 4 on page 44.

We must not leave the question of closer dependency for the earlier writings without noting the exceptions. We have in this chapter some evidence that Ellen White does show greater dependency in the later writings. If it is fair to make a difference between something written in 1890 and another article using the same source being written in 1897, then it is clear from Table 1 that the categories one, two and three, which exhibit the greatest dependency, do not apply to the earlier Ellen White writings used in this chapter until 1895.

DA chapter 3. A number of sentences from ST(94) do not exhibit verbal similarities with DA chapter 3 but the content for the most part is clearly very similar. When we find such sentences as ST(94)15 related to DA112 and ST(94)16a so similar to DA115, it would seem reasonable to include these sentences in our text base.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 3

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt.	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u>	Eval.
01. -	<u>DA28/32</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>MS(24)21</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>ST(90)7</u>	<u>I2</u>
02. -	<u>DA33/32</u>	<u>B1</u>	<u>ST(98)3</u>	<u>V2</u>		
03. -	<u>DA35/33</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>ST(90)8</u>	<u>P3</u>		
04. -	<u>DA50/34</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>BE(97)10</u>	<u>P1</u>		
05. -	<u>DA103/36</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>RH(95)39</u>	<u>P2</u>		
06. -	<u>DA105/36</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>RH(95)40</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>RH(95)41</u>	<u>P1</u>
07. -	<u>DA115/37</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>ST(94)16a</u>	<u>I2</u>		

"The Fullness of the Time"

A final reason for an extended use of these earlier materials beyond their specific reference to material found in chapter 3 of DA has to do with the evidence they present for studying the question of Ellen White's use of sources in the arrangement of her materials.

Redaction Analysis - The Desire of Ages

Ellen White's first treatment of the life of Christ in Spiritual Gifts began with the birth of Jesus as did many of the 19th century lives of Christ. In the second connected account of the life of Jesus, Spirit of Prophecy, volumes two and three, pages 10-16 of chapter 1, "The First Advent," describe the religious beliefs and practices of the Jewish people at the time of the first advent. In DA this presentation of the background to the appearance of Christ in our world is given three chapters, chapter 3 being the last. Harris' work on The Great Teacher covered many of the same points made by Ellen White but not in a single chapter. Since there is no narrative structure to chapter 3 there are any number of ways the various thematic elements of the chapter could have been put together. It is reasonable to hold that Marian Davis selected from the various earlier writings of Ellen White those sentences and paragraphs that related to the general topic, arranged them in some order, and edited them, with Ellen White adding those portions which are not represented by her earlier articles. The arrangement of this chapter then has to be credited to Ellen

"The Fullness of the Time"

White and not to Harris whose work she used.

It is not enough to say that Ellen White is on her own in the literary design of this chapter. Though she uses the editorial assistance of Marian Davis, and the parallels from The Great Teacher by Harris clearly predominate in both the DA and the pre-DA material, Ellen White's involvement in the literary construction of this chapter needs to be recognized. While we have clear evidence that Ellen White is using the earlier materials gathered by Marian Davis, it is not necessary to preclude her returning to the use of these sources, in this case Harris, at the time of her working on the text of DA. It would appear that she was referring to Thayer's work at the time this chapter was composed, for the date of publication for the Thayer source is 1891. Time and time again we will have occasion to note parallels in the DA text which are not in the earlier texts or are closer to the literary form of the source text than what is found in the earlier materials. We refer the reader to DA sentences 67 and 69 as two examples of this late use of the source in this chapter. We have found no evidence to support the claim that at any time Marian Davis or others were making such selections from the sources rather than Ellen White herself.

The comments evaluated as independent of literary borrowing in this chapter are not all that independent in terms of their content. The basic ideas to be found in chapter 3 can also be found in the sources, particularly

"The Fullness of the Time"

Harris. A survey of those sentences where Ellen White enlarged on an idea or otherwise independently expressed herself reveals that she had a great interest in commenting on God's character, God's plan of salvation, and the revelation of Satan's attempt to thwart the purposes of God. The great controversy theme may be found in the sources she used but not as detailed or elaborated to the extent we find in the DA.

A review of the sentence evaluations of the DA text (Appendix A) shows that generally Ellen White has grouped the materials into blocks. The chapter begins with Thayer, Kennedy, and a few of her comments mixed in. After this we find the text put together in blocks of material which for the most part appear to be governed by the earlier articles and their use of Harris or her own blocks of added material which elaborate on what was carried over from the earlier articles or serve to tie the various parts together. The reader will note how Harris material occurs in groupings, pages 49-52; 145, 229-231; 102-103; and 101. In addition, within each section of pages, the sentences in both DA and Harris are rather consistently found to occur in the same sequence.

We may conclude from this survey of the chapter arrangement that while Ellen White arranged the blocks of material for this chapter according to her own scheme, assisted by Marian Davis, within the sections she largely developed the thought in parallel to that of her literary

"The Fullness of the Time"

source. And while we have noted some modification of the earlier material in its accommodation to the chapter presentation, generally the order of sentence sequence of the earlier writing is carried over "intact" into the arrangement of this chapter. It would appear that a kind of "paste and scissors" act was involved here.

Redaction Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

It is not within the purposes of our study to establish the degree of dependency between the earlier articles and the sources used in their composition. We only wish to further illustrate what appears to have been, at least with respect to this chapter, the literary method of Ellen White in the development of a theme.

The reader is invited to review the DA text as presented or to turn to Appendix C and note how the Fundamentals of Christian Education sentences following DA66 have parallels in Harris' GT, pp. 52-54. The Review and Herald sentences from 1895 which appear after DA69 reflect Harris' GT, pp. 227-231. And finally, the 25 consecutive sentences from the Signs, 1894, which interlock with the DA text after sentence 111, may be seen as closely corresponding with the 23 sentences taken from Harris' GT, pp. 101-104.

This evidence clearly shows that in chapter 3 Ellen White follows the thought development of her literary source

"The Fullness of the Time"

in the composition of the subunits of the chapter. In the face of this rather consistent literary pattern, it would appear reasonable to hold Ellen White and not Marian Davis responsible for arranging the material in correspondence to that of the source. The fact that we find the same phenomenon in the individual articles and even in the personal letter to John H. Kellogg argues for this dependency to be that of Ellen White. It remains to be seen if such a pattern occurs in the other chapters of DA to be surveyed and in articles written at a time when Marian Davis was involved.

Our analysis does show, therefore, that Ellen White in this chapter is dependent upon her source(s) for the redaction of her material but only in a limited application. Such dependency is to be found in her subthemes or literary units within the chapter but not with respect to the arrangement of the chapter as a whole.

As we complete our analysis of chapter three it may be of interest to the reader to note a few of the complications involved in establishing and evaluating literary parallels in terms of dependency.

In sentence 103 of DA we have a shortened version of RH(95)39. The condensed form is balanced between the use of the source and Ellen White's modification of the sentence. In order to give credit to both aspects we evaluated the verse as Partial Independence, stressing the role of Ellen White over that of the source. The earlier RH sentence is

longer and the bold type clearly shows more words to have been taken from the source. The earlier sentence is obviously more like the source in literary expression even though some of Ellen White's modification is still apparent. In this instance we registered the sentence as having greater dependence.

Another interesting example of the problems faced in this kind of literary analysis is to be found in a closer look at sentence 105 of the text which combines in a shorter form two sentences from the earlier article, RH(95)40,41. The resulting combined sentence is given a rating of P2 even though each of the component sentences was rated as being P1. The very act of combining the two earlier sentences results in a looser paraphrase of the source even though the real dependency has not changed. Since it is the verbal similarity to the source that is being measured and not the content or idea, the dependency is given a lower rating.

It must be apparent to the reader by now and no doubt will become more obvious as the remainder of the DA text is reviewed that a certain amount of subjectivity is necessarily involved in making these evaluations. At the same time there is also a certain arbitrariness involved in deciding the degree of dependency. For these reasons, even though great care was taken to be as consistent as possible, the evaluations should be taken with some degree of caution and used only as pointers to the dependency. The reader is not only invited but encouraged to compare the source text

"The Fullness of the Time"

with the Ellen White parallel for him-/herself.

This leads us to a final comment on the difficulty of indicating dependency by some consistent measuring scale.

Near the end of the text of chapter 3 the study presents 23 sentences in full and in sequence from The Great Teacher by John Harris. Some of these sentences were not used by Ellen White and others only partly used. As one follows the development of the theme and the apparent use of certain expressions, at times paraphrase and at times verbatim, dependency is easily recognized. The borrowing, however, often involves the partial use of sentences. The problem is how to measure the amount of dependency and be fair in registering the degree to which the source is being used while at the same time to give proper credit to the writer who is using the old "stones" and "mortar" to create a new edifice. We can only claim that we attempted a fair evaluation. Once again we invite the reader to make the final judgment.

Summary

This summary follows the form as indicated in the introduction to this research report. We will present the evidence of our study of chapter 3 in the form of a series of statements. These statements will be very similar to those which will appear in the summary of our research on each of the 14 following chapters. It is our hope that by using a consistent form of presentation the reader will be

"The Fullness of the Time"

able to follow the chain of evidence as it leads from the analysis of each chapter into that chapter's summary and from the separate 15 summaries to the final summary and conclusion of the research document. These statements will together constitute the answers to the questions which were raised in the introduction to this study and which will be presented once again in the final summary. We have numbered the statements to correspond with the number of the question for which the statement provides the answer, whether for an individual chapter or for the final summary. Where a given chapter does not furnish information for answering a specific question a simple statement of "No information" will follow the statement number.

1. There are no extant handwritten manuscripts of the text of chapter 3. Neither do we possess any typescript manuscript of this chapter in the early stages of its development. Evidently Ellen White added to the earliest form of the compilation of previous writings on the topic but we have no handwritten text of this first writing. The handwritten material is limited to the sentences from Manuscript 24, 1891. We do have the typed and corrected form of the Kellogg letter and Manuscript 9, 1896 (or the sentences from Fundamentals of Education, pages 399-401). The other texts exist only in their published form.

2. In addition to what Ellen White had written in Spirit of Prophecy, II, chapter 1, we found references to eight previously written Ellen White texts dating from 1890

"The Fullness of the Time"

to 1898. The SP text contains around 15 sentences matching the content of DA, chapter 3. The remaining 75 sentences on the background to the first advent of Christ correspond to material found in chapters 2 and 3 of the DA text. These two DA chapters contain 212 sentences (82 + 130). Since the content of chapters 2 and 3 overlap in DA, even as in the earlier SP chapter, we can say that there is a general increase in Ellen White's coverage of the topic from 90 sentences to 212, or 122 sentences. On the other hand, chapter 3 alone gives evidence of a condensation of her coverage of the subject, if we take into consideration the text of DA and that of the eight sources of earlier Ellen White writings which went into the composition of chapter 3. We made no attempt to present the text of these earlier writings apart from their evidence on Ellen White's use of sources. A survey of these earlier articles will show that they contain some 315 sentences by conservative count treating the content of chapter 3. The total number of sentences found in these eight articles is much higher of course. Evidently Ellen White was doing much of her writing on this topic in the general interest of ministering to the church through her letters and articles in the church papers as well as in her writing for the general public through the columns of the Signs of the Times. This material was largely reduced for presentation in DA. We must remember that the sentences marked as independent in our evaluation do not necessarily indicate new material from Ellen White.

"The Fullness of the Time"

The evaluation only refers to non-dependency upon outside literary sources. It has no bearing on Ellen White's use of her own previous work.

3. The content of chapter 3 is rather broad in nature. It includes Jewish history and theology. It treats the great controversy theme which was a favorite motif with Ellen White. Similar ideas can be found in Patriarchs and Prophets (1890), The Great Controversy (1884, 1888) and various testimonies. It is evident from the materials used in the composition of this chapter that duplication of content often occurred between personal letters, articles, manuscript text, and book publication. This multiple use of Ellen White's writings should be taken into account in estimating Ellen White's total literary production.

4. There is significant development of the great controversy theme and other aspects of the incarnation from what was treated in Spirit of Prophecy but there are no important developments beyond that already covered by Ellen White in her earlier articles. We must bear in mind that the previously written texts were written within a decade of the writing of The Desire of Ages.

5. The Desire of Ages text of chapter 3 shows some degree of literary dependency in 59 of its 130 sentences or about 45 percent of the total text.

6. Chapter 3 shows literary independence in 67 of its sentences or 52 percent of the text. Four sentences or three percent were credited to biblical usage and excluded

"The Fullness of the Time"

from the evaluation.

7. Using the dependency rating scale as indicated in the introduction and in this first chapter of our study, the degree of dependency for the 59 dependent sentences is 2.3. The degree of dependency for the entire chapter of 130 sentences is 1.08.

8. The Great Teacher by John Harris was the one main source behind this chapter and behind the earlier writings used in the composition of this chapter. It was used for 44 out of the 59 sentences which showed literary dependency. A copy of this work bearing Ellen White's personal signature was found in her office library at the time of her death and is part of the White Estate library collection at the present time.

9. The chapter appears to have made minor use of two sources, an 1860 work by William S. Kennedy, Messianic Prophecy, and the life of Christ, and Sketches from the Life of Jesus, Historical and Doctrinal by E. W. Thayer. The latter book was published in 1891 by Fleming H. Revell, a religious publishing concern which also published a 12-chapter edition of Steps to Christ by Ellen White in 1892. Thayer does not appear in the inventory list of Ellen White's library collection at the time of her death.

10. The Great Teacher by Harris was also the only source found to have been used in the composition of the previous writings on the topic of chapter 3.

11. Where the earlier texts are treating the same

"The Fullness of the Time"

content as chapter 3 of DA the usage is quite similar but somewhat closer in dependency. The more concise coverage of the DA text involves greater editing and in the combining of separate sentences of earlier documents many of the earlier verbal similarities are lost.

12. Ellen White made use of literary sources in the writing of chapter 3 regardless of the subject matter. Literary dependency was found in comments on the great controversy between the forces of heaven and those of Satan, on the Jewish background to the advent, on the role of Christ, on the plight of the human race, and on God's great love for this world in rebellion. Parallels were found in descriptive, devotional, theological, historical, and biblical content areas. What Ellen White did not take from the literary sources for this chapter were their lengthy comments on a given point, the harsh and extreme expressions which occasionally appeared in the source, and the vocabulary which gave the impression of being more in the interest of literary embellishment than conveying meaning.

13. Ellen White and/or Marian Davis arranged the chapter content independent of the arrangement found in Harris or in any of the other sources located for this chapter, though it must be admitted that our special concern was with the verbal similarities to be found. The editing of chapter 3 is to be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. The literary subunits within chapter 3, however, insofar as source parallels allow us to conclude, do appear

"The Fullness of the Time"

to follow the literary arrangement of the source, particularly Harris.

14. The articles collected by Marian Davis for the composition of chapter 3 show that Ellen White selected her sources according to their treatment of a major theme or topic. There is no indication that the selection represents a choice of a "gem" quotation from this page and another choice quotation from another page. It is rather a series of parallels from blocks of material covering anywhere from one to six pages. The thematic development of these earlier writings of Ellen White do indicate close similarities to the thematic arrangement of the sources evidently used. Since we did not study the earlier texts as complete literary documents we cannot speak to the question of their redaction apart from a few of the literary subunits where we noted literary dependency. Our research indicates, however, that a careful investigation of these earlier documents in their entirety should be undertaken to ascertain what degree, if any, the sources used by Ellen White influenced the structure of her shorter writings such as articles, letters, etc.

Before concluding our summary of chapter 3 one important point should be registered. Two documents surveyed in connection with this chapter provide very strong evidence that Ellen White personally borrowed from her literary sources. Manuscript 24, 1891, written in America exists in handscript and the letter to John Harvey Kellogg

"The Fullness of the Time"

written from Australia in 1895 is available in typescript as it came from the copyists. The evidence of literary dependency in documents at this early pre-publication stage, and in so personal a form, leads us to conclude that the paraphrasing from a source was the work of Ellen White and not one of her literary assistants.

The foregoing analysis and summary contains more detailed description of the evaluation process than will occur in the following chapters. Our intention was to demonstrate in this first chapter the process described in the introductory chapters insofar as the text of chapter 3 and its parallels permit. The repetition of discussion on the procedures used in the evaluation process was intended to assist the reader in his/her efforts to weigh critically the evidence presented and to follow the argumentation of the analysis. In some sense this chapter also serves as a sample for the general structure of the introduction, analysis, and summary of the following chapters.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	Bible	B2	051.		I1
002.	Thayer SLJ/2.8	P3	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.		I1	054.		I1
005.		I1	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.	Kennedy MP/174.2	I2	057.	Harris GT/31/52	I2
008.	Kennedy MP/174.6	I2	058.	Harris GT/31/52	B1
009.		I1	059.	Harris GT/35a/52	B1
010.		I1	060.	Harris GT/35b/52	B1
011.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	061.	Kennedy MP/174.2	B1
012.		I1	062.		I1
013.	Bible	B2	063.		I1
014.		I1	064.		I1
015.	Bible	B2	065.	Harris GT/1/49	V2
016.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	066.		I1
017.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	067.	Harris GT/6/145	P2
018.	Bible	B2	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.	Harris GT/6/145	I2
020.	Thayer SLJ/21.6	P3	070.	Harris GT/25/229	P2
021.	Thayer SLJ/21.8	P2	071.	Harris GT/27/229	P2
022.		I1	072.		I1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.	MP/174.7 SLJ/14.5	I2	074.		I1
025.	MP/174.7 SLJ/14/5	I2	075.		I1
026.	MP/174.8 SLJ/16.3	I2	076.		I1
027.	Harris GT/4/49	P3	077.		I1
028.	Harris GT/19/50,51	I2	078.		I1
029.	Harris GT/8/49+	I2	079.		I1
030.		I1	080.		I1
031.	Harris GT/8,17/49+	I2	081.		I1
032.		I1	082.		I1
033.	Harris GT/21b/51	B1	083.		I1
034.	Harris GT/21b/51	I2	084.	Harris GT/111.3	I2
035.	GT/16,22/50,52	P3	085.		I1
036.	Harris GT/18,19/50	P3	086.		I1
037.		I1	087.		I1
038.	Harris GT/20/51	P3	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.	Harris GT/22/51	I2	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.	GT/24/51 MP/174.8	I2	093.		I1
044.	Kennedy MP/174.9	P3	094.		I1
045.	Kennedy MP/174.9	I2	095.		I1
046.	Harris GT/25,26/51	P3	096.		I1
047.	GT/25-29/51,52	I2	097.		I1
048.	Harris GT/23,25/51	P3	098.		I1
049.		I1	099.	Harris GT/39/230	P3
050.	Harris GT/37/52	P3	100.	Harris GT/40a/230	P2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	Harris GT/40b/230	P3	151. -		
102. -	Harris GT/40c/230	P3	152. -		
103. -	Harris GT/40d/230	I2	153. -		
104. -	Harris GT/42/231	P2	154. -		
105. -	Harris GT/42/231	P2	155. -		
106. -	Harris GT/43b/231	P3	156. -		
107. -	Harris GT/43c/231	P3	157. -		
108. -	Harris GT/43c/231	P3	158. -		
109. -	Harris GT/43d/231	P3	159. -		
110. -	Harris GT/43d/231	P2	160. -		
111. -	GT/34/229,102.9	I2	161. -		
112. -	GT/11,12/102	P3	162. -		
113. -		I1	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -	GT/10,17,18/102,3	I2	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -		I1	167. -		
118. -		I1	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -	Harris GT/18b/103	P3	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -	GT/16-18/103	I2	172. -		
123. -	Harris GT/3/101	P2	173. -		
124. -	Harris GT/2/101	P3	174. -		
125. -	Harris GT/4/101	I2	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -			181. -		
132. -			182. -		
133. -			183. -		
134. -			184. -		
135. -			185. -		
136. -			186. -		
137. -			187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 3

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	MS(24)2	P2	23	051.	-	ST(90)26	P2	66
002.	-	MS(24)3	P3	23	052.	-	ST(90)29	I2	66
003.	-	ST(90)1	B1	27	053.	-	ST(90)30	B1	66
004.	-	ST(90)2	I2	27	054.	-	DA(MS)4/54:2	I2	69
005.	-	ST(90)5	P3	27	055.	-	RH(95)1	V2	69
006.	-	MS(24)4	P3	27	056.	-	RH(95)2	P3	69
007.	-	MS(24)20	P3	28	057.	-	RH(95)6a	I1	69
008.	-	MS(24)21	P2	28	058.	-	RH(95)6b	P1	69
009.	-	ST(90)7	I2	28	059.	-	RH(95)7	I2	69
010.	-	ST(90)3	I2	32	060.	-	RH(95)8	P2	69
011.	-	MS(24)16	P3	32	061.	-	RH(95)9	P2	69
012.	-	MS(24)17	P2	32	062.	-	RH(95)10	P2	69
013.	-	ST(98)3	V2	33	063.	-	Lt(43)28	P2	69
014.	-	MS(24)14	I2	34	064.	-	RH(95)11	I2	69
015.	-	ST(98)4	P3	34	065.	-	RH(95)12	P1	69
016.	-	ST(98)5	P3	34	066.	-	RH(95)13	I2	69
017.	-	ST(90)8	P3	35	067.	-	Lt(43)29	P2	70
018.	-	BE(97)10	P1	50	068.	-	RH(95)31	P2	71
019.	-	ST(90)10	B1	58	069.	-	RH(95)33	P3	76
020.	-	ST(90)11	B1	58	070.	-	RH(95)34	P3	99
021.	-	MS(24)5	P2	65	071.	-	Lt(43)9	P2	100
022.	-	FE2/399	P3	65	072.	-	RH(95)39	P2	103
023.	-	MS(24)1	P2	65	073.	-	RH(95)40	P1	105
024.	-	FE1/399	I2	66	074.	-	RH(95)41	P1	105
025.	-	BE(97)17	I2	66	075.	-	ST(94)1	P2	111
026.	-	BE(97)21	V2	66	076.	-	ST(94)2	B1	111
027.	-	FE3/400	P2	66	077.	-	ST(94)3	B1	111
028.	-	FE4/400	P2	66	078.	-	ST(94)4	I1	111
029.	-	BE(97)18	P2	66	079.	-	ST(94)5	I1	111
030.	-	BE(97)19	P1	66	080.	-	ST(94)6	I2	111
031.	-	FE5/400	P2	66	081.	-	ST(94)7	I2	111
032.	-	FE8/400	V2	66	082.	-	ST(94)8	I1	111
033.	-	FE9/400	B2	66	083.	-	ST(94)9	P3	111
034.	-	FE10/400	I2	66	084.	-	ST(94)10	I2	111
035.	-	FE11/400	P2	66	085.	-	ST(94)11	I2	111
036.	-	FE12/400	P3	66	086.	-	ST(94)12	I2	111
037.	-	FE13/400	P2	66	087.	-	ST(94)13	I2	111
038.	-	FE15/400	P2	66	088.	-	ST(94)14	I2	111
039.	-	FE17/400	P2	66	089.	-	ST(94)15	I2	112
040.	-	FE18/400+	I2	66	090.	-	ST(94)16a	I2	115
041.	-	FE19/401	P2	66	091.	-	ST(94)16b	I1	116
042.	-	FE20/401	P2	66	092.	-	ST(94)17	I2	122
043.	-	FE21/401	I2	66	093.	-	ST(94)18	I2	124
044.	-	FE22/401	I2	66	094.	-	ST(94)19	I2	124
045.	-	FE23/401	I2	66	095.	-	ST(94)20	B1	124
046.	-	ST(90)23	P2	66	096.	-	ST(94)21	P3	124
047.	-	ST(90)24	P3	66	097.	-	ST(94)22	P3	124
048.	-	ST(90)25	P3	66	098.	-	ST(94)23	P3	125
049.	-	FE24/401	P2	66	099.	-	ST(94)24	P2	125
050.	-	FE25/401	P2	66	100.	-	ST(94)25	B1	125

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 3

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	MS(24)2	*H/3/49	051.	-	ST(90)26	H/54/54
002.	-	MS(24)3	H/3/49	052.	-	ST(90)29	H/55/54
003.	-	ST(90)1	H/7/49	053.	-	ST(90)30	H/60/55+
004.	-	ST(90)2	H/4-7/49	054.	-	DA(MS)4/54:2	H/6/145
005.	-	ST(90)5	H/5,6/49	055.	-	RH(95)1	H/12a/227
006.	-	MS(24)4	H/6,9/49+	056.	-	RH(95)2	H/12b/227
007.	-	MS(24)20	H/19/50+	057.	-	RH(95)6a	
008.	-	MS(24)21	H/19/50+	058.	-	RH(95)6b	H/12c/227
009.	-	ST(90)7	H/19/50+	059.	-	RH(95)7	H/13/227
010.	-	ST(90)3	H/9/50	060.	-	RH(95)8	H/14/228
011.	-	MS(24)16	H/10/50	061.	-	RH(95)9	H/14/227
012.	-	MS(24)17	H/10/50	062.	-	RH(95)10	H/15/227
013.	-	ST(98)3	H/21b/51	063.	-	Lt(43)28	H/19/228
014.	-	MS(24)14	H/15/50	064.	-	RH(95)11	H/20/228
015.	-	ST(98)4	H/14,15/51	065.	-	RH(95)12	H/21/228
016.	-	ST(98)5	H/15/50	066.	-	RH(95)13	H/21/228
017.	-	ST(90)8	H/17,18/50	067.	-	Lt(43)29	H/25/229
018.	-	BE(97)10	H/37/52	068.	-	RH(95)31	H/27/229
019.	-	ST(90)10	H/31/52	069.	-	RH(95)33	H/31,33/229
020.	-	ST(90)11	H/32/52	070.	-	RH(95)34	H/39/230
021.	-	MS(24)5	H/1/49	071.	-	Lt(43)9	H/40a/230
022.	-	FE2/399	H/39+/230	072.	-	RH(95)39	H/40/230
			H/39/52+	*	-	H denotes Harris GT	
023.	-	MS(24)1	H/2/49	073.	-	RH(95)40	H/42/231
024.	-	FE1/399	H/41/53	074.	-	RH(95)41	H/43a/231
025.	-	BE(97)17	H/41/53	075.	-	ST(94)1	H/6a/101
026.	-	BE(97)21	H/40/52	076.	-	ST(94)2	Bible
027.	-	FE3/400	H/40/52	077.	-	ST(94)3	Bible
028.	-	FE4/400	H/40/52	078.	-	ST(94)4	
029.	-	BE(97)18	H/41/52	079.	-	ST(94)5	
030.	-	BE(97)19	H/41/52	080.	-	ST(94)6	H/6b/101
031.	-	FE5/400	H/41,44/52	081.	-	ST(94)7	H/6c/101
032.	-	FE8/400	H/44/52	082.	-	ST(94)8	
033.	-	FE9/400	H/44/52	083.	-	ST(94)9	H/6d/101
034.	-	FE10/400	H/41/52	084.	-	ST(94)10	H/6e/101
035.	-	FE11/400	H/46a/52	085.	-	ST(94)11	H/6e/101
036.	-	FE12/400	H/46b/52	086.	-	ST(94)12	H/6f/101
037.	-	FE13/400	H/47/52	087.	-	ST(94)13	H/6g/101
038.	-	FE15/400	H/48/53+	088.	-	ST(94)14	H/6g/101
039.	-	FE17/400	H/49/54	089.	-	ST(94)15	H/10-18/102+
040.	-	FE18/400+	H/50/54	090.	-	ST(94)16a	H/10-18/102+
041.	-	FE19/401	H/51/54	091.	-	ST(94)16b	
042.	-	FE20/401	H/51/54	092.	-	ST(94)17	H/18b/103
043.	-	FE21/401	H/52/54	093.	-	ST(94)18	H/20/103+
044.	-	FE22/401	H/52/54	094.	-	ST(94)19	H/21/104
045.	-	FE23/401	H/53/54	095.	-	ST(94)20	Bible
046.	-	ST(90)23	H/54/54	096.	-	ST(94)21	H/22/104
047.	-	ST(90)24	H/54/54	097.	-	ST(94)22	H/22/104
048.	-	ST(90)25	H/54/54	098.	-	ST(94)23	H/22,23/104
049.	-	FE24/401	H/54/54	099.	-	ST(94)24	H/23/104
050.	-	FE25/401	H/54/54	100.	-	ST(94)25	H/23/104

IV CHAPTER 10 - The Voice in the Wilderness

John the Baptist is a central figure in four chapters of DA. Chapter 10, "The Voice in the Wilderness," covers the birth, wilderness life, and ministry of John. His reaction to the request of Jesus for baptism is treated in chapter 11; the relation of John's ministry to that of Jesus is the theme of chapter 18, "He Must Increase;" and chapter 22 concerns the "Imprisonment and Death of John."

It is not surprising to find duplication of content when a given character is treated in four different chapters. For example, chapter 11 in comparing the background of John and Jesus prior to the baptism of Jesus by John once again refers to the wilderness experience of John which Ellen White had covered in chapter 10. In chapter 22, page 218, we read that John spoke plainly to the "princes and soldiers, publicans and peasants." We find a similar statement in sentence 158 of chapter 10, "Princes and rabbis, soldiers, publicans, and peasants came to hear the prophet."

It is therefore very possible that we have missed some parallels in Ellen White's writings on John because our random sample includes only one of the four chapters on John. It is very likely that the sources surveyed included comments on the content of chapter 10 in the context of subject matter treating another aspect of the life and ministry of John. Since the scope of this research project has forced us to bypass these other content areas, there is

The Voice in the Wilderness

no way of knowing if such writings contain literary parallels. This problem should not cause great concern, however, because, as indicated at the beginning, this study is not to be taken as an exhaustive treatment of Ellen White's use of sources.

The life and work of John the Baptist is also a popular theme for sermons which compare the ministry of Jesus and John and which liken the life and ministry of John to that of Christians who would prepare the world for the second advent of Christ. It is very possible that Ellen White would have found the writings of various early advent preachers particularly helpful in addressing this subject. We may recall the statement from the introduction to her earlier work, The Great Controversy, where she admits to using such materials on occasion.¹ Once again we are reminded of the limited nature of our study. Our investigation has concentrated on 19th century (and earlier) books on the life of Christ. We have purposefully, for lack of time and assistance but not of interest or relevance, ruled out any careful survey of sermons, whether those of her Adventist associates or those she is likely to have read in the books and journals of her times.

Ellen White's earliest writing on John appears in a general summary statement one paragraph in length in Spiritual Gifts, I, pp. 29,30 [1858]. Throughout the years following we often find her pencil tracing the life and

¹Ellen G. White, Great Controversy, p. xii.

The Voice in the Wilderness

ministry of this remarkable individual as she urges health reform, simple living, and consecration to God for those who have been called of God to join the movement dedicated to preparing the way for the Lord's second coming.¹

Among the relatively few handwritten documents of Ellen White yet remaining in the White Estate collection we located a few pages on the life and work of John the Baptist. On page 1 of Diary Book 20, carrying the date of 1894, the following words are found in the general context of counsel regarding the location of the school to be built in Australia, and educational work in general.

Our minds have been much exercised day and night in regard to our Schools. Where shall they be conducted and what shall be the education and training of the youth? Where shall our school be located? I was awakened at one o'clock this morning with a serious burden upon my Soul. As the subject of education has been presented before me in different times in a variety of figures and illustrations, and with direct specifications upon one point and at another time upon another point and the different aspects have been illustrated I feel that we have much to learn. We are ignorant in many things. In the life of John the baptist, in the life of Christ, I have tried to present that which has been presented to me. Our schools should not be located in cities but away from our cities. We are under obligation to God to study this subject candidly for it is worthy of close critical examination upon every side. John the Baptist was the greatest prophet Christ declared that was born of woman and that prophet was led by the spirit of God into the wilderness away from the contaminating influences of the cities to receive an education to qualify him to receive his instructions more purely from God than from any of the learned schools.²

¹Cf. 3T, 61-63 (Testimony #21, 1872) and The Health Reformer, Vol. 15, No. 2, February, 1880.

²The quotation as presented is a typescript taken directly from the handwritten diary of Ellen White without editing except for a few punctuation marks. The edited text

The Voice in the Wilderness

The text continues for another page drawing lessons from the experiences of John and applying them to those who are called to prepare the way of the Lord. We did not find any direct use of this diary material in the composition of chapter 10 nor did we find any sources for its literary expression.

A second Ellen White handwritten text on John the Baptist was found in Diary Book 26 under the date of April 21, 1897. The excerpt was written from Sunnyside, Cooranbong, N. S. W., Australia, and carries the title, "For he shall be great in the sight of the Lord." The article begins with a reference to John and quotations from Luke 1 describing his birth and the words of the angel to Zacharias. After a few paragraphs on John the emphasis shifts to the main concern of the article. Ellen White is stressing that true greatness is measured by faith and obedience toward God and not by the intellect, money, or favorable birth. Our search did not uncover any literary sources for the construction of this writing nor did we find any specific use made of it in chapter 10 or in any of the other published writings of Ellen White. The diary material is of interest to us, however, due to the relatively little

was published under "Special Testimonies on Education," February, 1894, and may also be found in Fundamentals of Christian Education (Nashville: Southern Publishing Association, 1923), pp. 310, 311.

It is also of interest to note how in this quotation Ellen White describes the content of her revelatory experiences and claims that she has endeavored to present the life of Christ as it was presented to her.

The Voice in the Wilderness

extant handwritten material on the life of Christ.

It appears that Marian Davis used only one previous writing of Ellen White on John the Baptist for chapter 10. The structural base for the chapter was evidently taken from chapter III of Spirit of Prophecy, II, "Life and Mission of John." Though this work was published in 1877 the text is substantially the same as found in a series of articles published in the Review and Herald, Vol. 41, January 7 and 14, 1873. We shall have cause to refer to the text of an article from The Youth's Instructor, January 7, 1897, but it is not possible to claim for sure that the article was used to develop chapter 10 for the DA text. It is very likely that Ellen White would have written chapter 10 sometime before 1897 in view of the fact that the entire work of 87 chapters was published in 1898.

In our efforts to uncover the textual tradition behind the writing of DA we were led to the foreign language editions on the life of Christ, in particular the French, the first edition of which was published in Basel, Switzerland, in 1887.¹ In comparing the DA text of chapter 10 with its counterpart in the French edition, Chapter IV of La Vie de Jesus-Christ notre Seigneur, "Jean-Baptiste," we were intrigued to discover materials which are not in Spirit of Prophecy, Vols. II & III, nor in the other Ellen White writings in our possession. Of special interest were the

¹For further details on the writing, publication, and content of Ellen White's French edition of the life of Christ see Introduction, Part II.

The Voice in the Wilderness

literary parallels from John Cunningham Geikie's work on the life of Christ, The Life and Words of Christ, first published in England in 1877. A copy of an 1880 edition of Geikie's life of Christ was found in the private library or "sitting room bookcase" of Ellen White at the time of her death.

The text of the French edition of Ellen White's life of Christ presented some special problems for the research project. The White Estate has no manuscripts from the Spirit of Prophecy text for this chapter which dates from 1873. As pointed out in the Introduction to our research project, chapter II, we also have no record of Ellen White's adding to the life of Christ materials while in Europe. In addition, we have no Ellen White text of the content of chapter 4 of the French edition in English and we have no French edition of Geikie's work. International bibliographies, including a listing of the National Library of France, indicate that no French translation was ever made of Geikie's life of Christ. In order to demonstrate the parallels between Ellen White's French text and Geikie's English text and to avoid the charges that we distorted the English translation of the French text of Ellen White, we asked Dr. William Van Grit, Chairman of the Modern Languages Department of Pacific Union College to provide the English translation of the Ellen White text. The translation was made without any knowledge that we would be comparing it with Geikie's English text. For those

The Voice in the Wilderness

readers who know French and would like to check our translation we have provided the relevant portions of the French edition of Ellen White's life of Christ along with the translation in English. The French text is indicated by Vie (Life) and Geikie's work, The Life and Words of Christ, is represented by the abbreviation LC. Since the French edition of the life of Christ is not just a translation of Spirit of Prophecy but very similar to The Desire of Ages in format and in some places appears to represent an intermediate stage of the text tradition on the way to becoming what we know as DA, we have not indented the text even though it dates some ten years earlier.

Four sources in addition to Cunningham Geikie will be represented in the literary parallels located for chapter 10. The Life of Our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ, by John Fleetwood is also indicated by the symbol LC. We used an 1860 edition by J. W. Bradley of Philadelphia. Ellen White had available an 1852 edition of Fleetwood in her private library at Elmhaven, California, during her last years. William Hanna's Life of Christ, 1863 edition published by the American Tract Society of New York, is also referred to by the letters LC. The White Estate's copy of this work carries Ellen White's personal signature. Another literary source reflected in the writing of this chapter is a work by George Jones, Life Scenes from the Four Gospels, which we have abbreviated with the letters LSFG. The 1868 edition by J. C. Carrigues & Co. of Philadelphia was also found in

The Voice in the Wilderness

Ellen White's personal library at the time of her death. The White Estate library has a copy of this same edition signed by Ellen White. The fourth source is John Kitto's Daily Bible Illustrations;..., a six-volume work first published in 1850. We used an 1881 edition by Robert Carter & Brothers of New York. The abbreviation for Kitto's work is DBI.

The working manuscript of DA had first entitled chapter 10, "John the Baptist," as did the French edition of the life of Christ. Other than this type of editorial change, the working manuscript on this chapter substantially represents the present text of DA.

In the text presentation which follows we have chosen to include the material from Ellen White's French "Life of Christ" even though it does not in every case relate to the content of the DA text, nor does it always contain source parallels. Our purpose is to present the corresponding French text in as complete a form as practicable and yet follow the story line of the DA text as closely as possible. Where the French does not directly relate to the DA text we did not use indentation. The indented French text more clearly relates to, or "modifies" the content of the DA sentence.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA1/97 From among the faithful in Israel, who had long waited for the coming of the Messiah, the forerunner of Christ arose. (11)

DA2/97 The aged priest Zacharias and his wife Elisabeth were "both righteous before God;" and in their quiet and holy lives the light of faith shone out like a star amid the darkness of those evil days. (11)

DA3/97 To this godly pair was given the promise of a son, who should "go before the face of the Lord to prepare His ways." (11)

DA4/97 Zacharias dwelt in "the hill country of Judea," but he had gone up to Jerusalem to minister for one week in the temple, a service required twice a year from the priests of each course. [G/61.8] (P2)

DA5/97 "And it came to pass, that while he executed the priest's office, his lot was to burn incense when he went into the temple of the Lord." (B2)

SP4/41 The Romans claimed the right to appoint men to the priesthood, and to remove them from office at will. [H/43,45/71] (P2)

SP6/41 The priests, not being divinely appointed, abused their office, and were unfaithful in their ministrations. [H/43,45/71] (P2)

Vie21/49 Dans l'offrande journaliere de l'encens, il y avait toujours deux sacrificateurs qui officiaient.

Vie21/49 In the daily offering of incense, there were always two sacrificing priests who officiated. [G/1/69]
(P1)

Vie22/49 L'un d'eux portant l'encens, l'autre un vase de charbons qu'il repandait sur l'autel des parfums dans le lieu saint.

61.8 The services at the Temple in Jerusalem, where alone sacrifices could be offered, were entrusted to the care of each course in rotation, for a week of six days and two Sabbaths, and, hence, the member of each, whose ministrations might be required, had to go up to Jerusalem twice a year. [Geikie, LC]

43,45/71 The emperor now claimed and exercised the right of investiture, and appointed and deposed as he pleased. This dependence on Rome, not only for the appointment but for continuance in it, necessarily generated great servility on the part of aspirants to the office, and great abuses in the manner in which its duties were discharged. [Hanna, LC]

1/69 The daily incense offering required the ministration of two priests, . . . [Geikie, LC]

Vie22/49 One of the two carrying the incense, the other a vessel of charcoal which he poured on the altar of incense in the Holy Place. [G/1/69] (P2)

Vie23/49 Le premier sacrificateur parsemait ensuite l'encens sur les charbons brulants.

Vie23/49 The first priest then sprinkled the incense on the burning embers. [G/2/69] (V2)

Vie24/49 On regardait cela comme un office particulièrement sacre et honorable, le sacrificateur etant ainsi amene plus directement en presence de Dieu que dans aucun autre acte de son sacerdoce journalier.

Vie24/49 This office was considered a particularly sacred and honorable one, the priest being thus brought more directly into the presence of God than in any other act of his daily priesthood. [G/2/69] (P2)

Vie25/49 Il n'etait permis a personne de faire ce service une seconde fois, le sacrificateur etant choisi chaque jour parmi ceux qui n'avaient pas encore officie.

Vie25/49 No one was allowed to do this service a second time, the sacrificing priest being chosen every day among those who had not yet officiated. [G/2,3/69] (P2)

Vie26-28/49 Le moment d'offrir l'encens matin et soir, etait d'un interet particulier pour le peuple qui etait venu dans la cour du temple pour adorer Dieu. Avant de se placer en la presence de Dieu par le sacerdoce du sacrificateur officiant, ils devaient sincerement sonder leurs coeurs et faire la confession de leurs peches. Puis ils devaient prier silencieusement en tournant leur visage du cote du lieu saint, et leur priere montait ainsi avec la fume de l'encens.

Vie26-28/49 The moment of offering the incense morning and evening, was of a particular interest for the people who had come into the temple court to worship God. Before placing themselves in God's presence by the priesthood of the officiating priest, they had to sincerely examine their hearts and make the confession of their sins. Then they had to pray silently while turning their faces in the direction of the Holy Place, and their prayer thus rose with the smoke of the incense. [G/4,6/69] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

1/69 . . . one of whom bore the incense in a special vessel; the other, glowing embers in a golden fire-pan, from the altar of burnt sacrifice before the entrance of the Holy Place, and these he spread on an altar within. [Geikie, LC]

2/69 The first priest then sprinkled the incense on the burning coals, . . . [Geikie, LC]

2/69 . . . an office held so honourable that no one was allowed to perform it twice, since it brought the offering priest nearer the Divine Presence in the Holy of Holies than any other priestly act, and carried with it the richest blessing from on high, which all ought to have a chance of thus obtaining. [Geikie, LC]

3/69 Like the rest of the sacred functions, it was determined daily by lot. [Geikie, LC]

4/69 During the burning of the incense, each morning and night, the worshippers in the different courts remained in silent prayer, their faces towards the holy spot where the symbol of their devotions was ascending in fragrant clouds towards heaven; their fondest hope being that their prayer might rise up, odorous and well-pleasing like it, towards Jehovah. [Geikie, LC]

Vie 29/49+ Tandis que les sacrificateurs entraient matin et soir dans le lieu saint ou se trouvait le chandelier a sept branches, brulant jour et nuit,--souvenir constant de celui qui, enveloppe de la colonne de feu, avait ete le protecteur d'Israel,--le sacrifice journalier etait pret a etre offert sur l'autel des sacrifices dans le parvis exterieur.

Vie 29/49+ While the priests entered morning and evening into the Holy Place where the candlestick of seven branches was found, burning day and night--constant memory of Him who, enveloped in the column of fire, had been the protector of Israel,--the daily sacrifice was ready to be offered on the altar of burnt offerings in the outer court. [G/5/69] (P1)

Vie30/50 C'est ainsi que le sacrifice expiatoire et les nuces odoriferantes de l'encens, symbole des prieres du peuple, s'unissaient dans l'esprit de tout Israel.

Vie30/50 It is in this manner that the expiatory sacrifice and the sweet-smelling clouds of incense, symbol of the prayers of the people, united themselves in the spirit of all Israel. [G/6/69] (P1)

Vie31/50 Les heures fixees pour ces offrandes, connues sous le nom de sacrifice du matin et sacrifice du soir, etaient regardees comme sacrees, et elles en vinrent a etre considerees comme le temps fixe pour la priere du matin et pour la priere du soir dans toute la nation juive.

Vie31/50 The fixed hours for these offerings, known under the name of morning sacrifice and evening sacrifice, were considered as sacred, and they came to be considered as the fixed time for morning and evening prayer in all the Jewish nation. [G/7a/69] (P2)

Vie32/50 Tandis que le sacrificateur se tenait devant l'autel des parfums, et qu'en dehors la fumee de l'autel des holocaustes montait, les prieres offertes par les fideles assemblees dans les cours du temple se repetaient a travers le monde entier, partout ou il y avait quelque Juif pieux.

Vie32/50 While the sacrificing priest stood before the altar of incense, and while outside the smoke of the altar of burnt offerings rose, the prayers offered by the assembled faithful in the temple courts were repeated across the whole world, everywhere where there was a pious Jew. [G/7b/69] (P1)

5/69 While the priests entered, morning and evening, into the Holy Place, with its seven lamps burning night and day for ever, the memento of the awful presence in the pillar of fire that had guarded them of old, and its table of "continual bread" of the presence--a male lamb, with the due fruit and drink-offering connected with such a sacrifice, was ready to be offered on the great altar of burnt offering outside. [Geikie, LC]

6/69 The atoning sacrifice, and the clouds of incense, the outward symbol of the prayers of the people, were thus indissolubly associated, and so holy were they in all eyes, that the hours sacred to them were known as those of the morning and evening sacrifice. [Geikie, LC]

PP353.91

7a/69 They served, still further, to set a time, throughout the Jewish world, for the morning and evening prayers of all Israel, [Geikie, LC]

PP354.0

7b/69 and thus, when the priest stood by the incense altar, and the flame of the burnt offering, outside, ascended, the prayers offered in the Temple courts were repeated all over the land, and even in every region, however, distant, to which a godly Jew had wandered.

PP353.7

[Geikie, LC]

Vie33-35/50 Les chretiens ont dans cet exemple l'autorite de leur culte du soir et du matin. Dieu aime l'ordre. Tandis qu'il condamne un culte qui ne consiste qu'en ceremonies, d'ou l'esprit est absent, il prend plaisir a abaisser ses regards sur ceux qui l'aiment et le craignent, et qui, sur toute la terre, s'inclinent devant lui matin et soir, recherchant le pardon de leurs peches commis, et presentant leurs requetes pour obtenir les graces dont ils ont besoin.

Vie33-35/50 The Christians have in this example the authority of their evening and morning worship. God loves order. While he condemns a worship that consists of none other than ceremonies, where the spirit is absent, he takes pleasure in watching those who love him and fear him, and who, in all the earth, bow before him morning and evening, searching for the forgiveness of the sins they committed, and presenting their requests for obtaining the graces (favours) which they need. (I1)

Vie36/50 Il etait echu par sort a Zacharie d'offrir l'encens journalier.

Vie36/50 It fell to Zacharias by lot to offer the daily incense. [G/8/70] (B1)

DA6/97 He was standing before the golden altar in the holy place of the sanctuary. (I2)

Vie37/50 Dans ses vetements blancs du sacerdoce, il officiait dans le lieu saint afin que la fumee de l'encens avec les prierces des saints montat devant Dieu, preparant la voie a la fumee du sacrifice de l'autel des holocaustes.

Vie37/50 In his white garments of the priesthood, he officiated in the Holy Place so that the smoke of the incense with the prayers of the saints ascended before God, preparing the way to the smoke of the sacrifice of the altar of burnt offerings. [G/9/70] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

8/70 On the day when our narrative opens, the lot for the daily incense offering had fallen on Zacharias. [Geikie, LC]

9/70 In his white sacerdotal robes, with covered head and naked feet, . . . he entered the Holy Place, that the clouds of the incense, which symbolized Israel's prayers, might herald the way for the smoke of the victim presently to be burned in their stead. [Geikie, LC]

Vie38/50 Dans ce lieu sacre, qui n'etait separe que par un voile du lieu tres saint, ou Dieu avait manifeste sa presence auguste, Zacharie etait emu au sentiment de la solennite et de l'importance de son office.

Vie 38/50 In this sacred place, which was separated only by a veil from the Most Holy Place where God had manifested His majestic presence, Zacharias was moved by the sentiment of the solemnity and the importance of his office. [G/10/70]
(P2)

Vie39/50 Au son de la cloche qui annoncait que le sacrifice allait etre place sur l'autel des holocaustes, tous les sacrificateurs et les levites se rendirent a leurs places marquees dans les cours du temple.

Vie39/50 At the sound of the bell which announced that the sacrifice was going to be placed on the altar of burnt offerings, all the priests and the Levites went to their marked places in the courts of the temple. [G/9,11a/70]
(V2)

Vie40/50 Zacharie et son compagnon commencerent les devoirs de leur charge.

Vie40/50 Zacharias and his companion started the duties of their post. [G/11b/70] (V2)

Vie41/50 Les charbons furent poses sur l'autel, l'assistant du sacrificateur se retira.

Vie41/50 The coals were placed on the altar, the priest's assistant withdrew. [G/12a/70] (V2)

Vie42/50+ Zacharie se trouve seul en presence des lampes toujours allumees et de l'autel embrase.

Vie42/50+ Zacharias finds himself alone in the presence of the always lighted lamps and the glowing altar. [G/12b/70]
(V2)

Vie43/51 Il repand l'encens sur les flammes, et une odeur suave s'eleve en nuage, symbole des prieres d'Israel montant a Dieu de toutes les parties de la terre.

10/70 In a place so sacred, separated only by a veil from the Holy of Holies, the awful presence chamber of the Almighty--a place where God had already shown that He was near, by human words to the officiating priest--at a moment so solemn, when it had fallen to him to enjoy an awful honour which most of his brethren could not expect to obtain, and which could never be repeated, he must have been well-nigh over-powered with emotion. [Geikie, LC]

9,11a/70 . . . at the tinkling of the bell which announced that the morning or evening sacrifice was about to be laid on the great altar, . . . At the tinkling of the bell all the priests and Levites took their stations through the Temple courts, [Geikie, LC]

11b/70 and he and his helper began their ministrations. [Geikie, LC]

12a/70 And now the coals are laid on the altar, the helping priest retires [Geikie, LC]

12b/70 and Zacharias is left alone with the mysterious, ever-burning, lamps, and the glow of the altar which was believed to have been kindled, at first, from the pillar of fire in the desert, and to have been kept unquenched, by miracle, since then. [Geikie, LC]

DA7/97 The cloud of incense with the prayers of Israel was ascending before God. [G/13/70] (P1)

Vie43/51 He scatters the incense on the flames, and a sweet-smelling odor ascends as a cloud, a symbol of the prayers of Israel ascending to God from every part of the earth. [G/13/70] (V2)

Vie44/51 Comme intercesseur choisi pour son peuple, il unit ses supplications a celles des fideles.

Vie44/51 As chosen intercessor for his people, he unites his supplications to those of the faithful. [G/14/70] (V2)

DA8/97 Suddenly he became conscious of a divine presence. [G/7/70] (P3)

DA9/97 An angel of the Lord was "standing on the right side of the altar." (B1)

DA10/97+ The position of the angel was an indication of favor, but Zacharias took no note of this. [G/7/70] (I2)

Vie49/51 Pendant que ses prieres montaient au ciel, un ange du Seigneur lui apparut, se tenant debout au cote droit de l'autel des parfums, position qui signifiait que l'Eternel etait favorable a son peuple.

Vie49/51 While his prayers ascended to heaven, an angel of the Lord appeared to him, standing at the right side of the altar of incense, a position signifying that the Lord was favorable to his people. [G/7/70] (P2)

DA11/98 For many years he had prayed for the coming of the Redeemer; now heaven had sent its messenger to announce that these prayers were about to be answered; but the mercy of God seemed too great for him to credit. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

13/70 He pours the incense on the flames, and its fragrance rises in clouds, which are the symbol of the prayers of Israel, now rising over all the earth. [Geikie, LC]

14/70 As the intercessor for his people, for the time, he, too, joins his supplications. [Geikie, LC]

7/70 While he prays, there stands a mysterious Presence before him, on the right side of the altar, the side of good omen, as the angels, afterwards, appeared at the right side, in the Holy Sepulchre, and as Christ was seen, by the Martyr Stephen, standing on the Right Hand of God. [Geikie, LC]

Vie48/51 Il deplorait la triste condition dans laquelle se trouvait son peuple degenerate, disperse ca et la a cause de leur eloignement de Dieu, et le retrait de ses soins protecteurs; et il demandait ardemment la venue du Redempteur si longtemps attendue.

Vie48/51 He deplored the sad condition in which his degenerate people found itself, dispersed here and there because of the estrangement from God, and the withdrawal of His protecting cares; and he fervently asked for the coming of the Redeemer so long awaited.
(11)

DA12/98 He was filled with fear and self-condemnation.
(11)

Vie50/51 Zacharie fut saisi de frayeur.

Vie50/51 Zacharias was stricken by fright. (11)

DA13/98 But he was greeted with the joyful assurance: "Fear not, Zacharias: for thy prayer is heard; and thy wife Elisabeth shall bear thee a son, and thou shalt call his name John. (B2)

DA14/98 And thou shalt have joy and gladness; and many shall rejoice at his birth. (B2)

DA15/98 For he shall be great in the sight of the Lord, and shall drink neither wine nor strong drink; and he shall be filled with the Holy Ghost. . . . (B2)

DA16/98 And many of the children of Israel shall he turn to the Lord their God. (B2)

DA17/98 And he shall go before Him in the spirit and power of Elias, to turn the hearts of the fathers to the children, and the disobedient to the wisdom of the just; to make ready a people prepared for the Lord. (B2)

DA18/98 And Zacharias said unto the angel, Whereby shall I know this? for I am an old man, and my wife well stricken in years." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

2/20 . . .for it was unnatural in him to think that he and his wife Elizabeth, who were advanced in years, should have a son; nay, he intimates his doubts concerning it in these words: "Whereby shall I know this? for I am an old man, and my wife well stricken in years." [Fleetwood, LC]

DA19/98 Zacharias well knew how to Abraham in his old age a child was given because he believed Him faithful who had promised. [F/6/21] (I2)

SP52/44 Zacharias was as much astonished at the words of the angel, as he was at his appearance.
[F/5/21] (P1)

DA20/98 But for a moment the aged priest turns his thought to the weakness of humanity. [F/6/21] (P3)

DA21/98 He forgets that what God has promised, He is able to perform. [F/6/21] (P3)

SP55/44 Zacharias for a moment forgot the unlimited power of God, and that nothing was impossible with him. [F/6/21] (P1)

SP56/44 He did not call to mind the case of Abraham and Sarah, and the fulfillment of the promise of God to them. [F/6/21] (P2)

Vie58/52 Le coeur est lent a accepter d'etre soulage d'un chagrin et de deceptions que l'on a longtemps endure.

Vie58/52 The heart is slow in accepting to be relieved of a sorrow and of deceptions that we have endured for a long time. [G/27/71] (I2)

Vie59/52 La foi est lente a saisir les promesses de Dieu et a s'en rejouir.

Vie59/52 Faith is slow at grasping the promises of God and rejoicing in them. (I1)

Vie60/52 Zacharie pouvait croire le message concernant la naissance du Messie; mais la prediction qu'un fils lui naitrait lui semblait d'un accomplissement impossible.

Vie60/52 Zacharias could believe the message concerning the birth of the Messiah; but the prediction that a son would be born to him seemed to him an impossible fulfillment.
[G/28/71] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

5/21 The good old priest was as much astonished at the subject of his mission as he was at the appearance of the messenger; and esteeming it impossible that his wife, thus advanced in years, should conceive a son, weakly demanded a sign, to confirm his belief in the fulfilment of the promise, though he knew the authority of the angel was derived from the God of truth. [Fleetwood, LC]

6/21 But, as it is the lot of humanity to err, Zacharias had, for that time, forgot that nothing was impossible to Omnipotence, as well as that it was not the first time the aged were caused to conceive and bear children. The least reflection would have reminded him that Sarah had conceived and borne Isaac when she was far advanced in years; [Fleetwood, LC]

27/71 But the heart is slow to receive the access of any sudden joy, and to lay aside disappointment. [Geikie, LC]

28/71 The thought rises in the heart of Zacharias that the glad tidings of the birth of the Messiah may well be true, but, as to the son promised his wife, stricken in years as she is, can it be possible? [Geikie, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA22/98 What a contrast between this unbelief and the sweet, childlike faith of Mary, the maiden of Nazareth, whose answer to the angel's wonderful announcement was, "Behold the handmaid of the Lord; be it unto me according to thy word"! Luke 1:38. (11)

DA23/98 The birth of a son to Zacharias, like the birth of the child of Abraham, and that of Mary, was to teach a great spiritual truth, a truth that we are slow to learn and ready to forget. (11)

DA24/98 In ourselves we are incapable of doing any good thing; but that which we cannot do will be wrought by the power of God in every submissive and believing soul. (11)

DA25/98 It was through faith that the child of promise was given. (11)

DA26/98 It is through faith that spiritual life is begotten, and we are enabled to do the works of righteousness. (11)

DA27/98 To the question of Zacharias, the angel said, "I am Gabriel, that stand in the presence of God; and am sent to speak unto thee, and to show thee these glad tidings." (11)

DA28/98 Five hundred years before, Gabriel had made known to Daniel the prophetic period which was to extend to the coming of Christ. (11)

DA29/98 The knowledge that the end of this period was near had moved Zacharias to pray for the Messiah's advent. (11)

DA30/98 Now the very messenger through whom the prophecy was given had come to announce its fulfillment. (11)

DA31/99 The words of the angel, "I am Gabriel, that stand in the presence of God," show that he holds a position of high honor in the heavenly courts. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA32/99 When he came with a message to Daniel, he said, "There is none that holdeth with me in these things, but Michael [Christ] your Prince." Dan. 10:21. (I1)

DA33/99 Of Gabriel the Saviour speaks in the Revelation, saying that "He sent and signified it by His angel unto His servant John." Rev. 1:1. (I1)

DA34/99 And to John the angel declared, "I am a fellow servant with thee and with thy brethren the prophets." Rev. 22:9. (I1)

DA35/99 Wonderful thought--that the angel who stands next in honor to the Son of God is the one chosen to open the purposes of God to sinful men. (I1)

DA36/99 Zacharias had expressed doubt of the angel's words. (I1)

DA37/99 He was not to speak again until they were fulfilled. (I1)

DA38/99 "Behold," said the angel, "thou shalt be dumb, . . . until the day that these things shall be performed, because thou believest not my words, which shall be fulfilled in their season." (B2)

SP57/44+ Zacharias received a confirmation of the angel's message, "Behold, thou shalt be dumb, and not able to speak, until the day that these things shall be performed, because thou believest not my words which shall be fulfilled in their season." [F/8,9/21+] (B1)

SP58/45 He was soon made to realize the verity of the divine mission. [F/10a/21] (P1)

SP59/45 The angel had no sooner departed than he was struck dumb. [F/10a/21] (V2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

8/21 His curiosity was, indeed gratified, but in a manner that carried with it at once a confirmation of the promise, and a punishment of his unbelief. [Fleetwood, LC]

9/21 As he had verbally testified his doubt of the fulfilment of the prediction of the angel, he was punished with the loss of his speech, which was to continue to the very day in which the prediction should be accomplished: "Behold, thou shalt be dumb, and not able to speak, until the day that these things shall be performed, because thou believest not my words, which shall be fulfilled in their season." [Fleetwood, LC]

10a/22 Zacharias soon received an awful testimony of the divinity of the mission of Gabriel, who was no sooner departed than he was struck dumb; [Fleetwood, LC]

DA39/99 It was the duty of the priest in this service to pray for the pardon of public and national sins, and for the coming of the Messiah; but when Zacharias attempted to do this, he could not utter a word. [F/3,10b/20,22] (P2)

SP60/45 The particular office of Zacharias was to pray in behalf of the people, for pardon of public and national sins, and to earnestly pray for the coming of the long-expected Saviour whom they believed must redeem his people. [F/3/20] (P1)

SP61/45 When Zacharias attempted to pray, he could not utter a word. [F/10/22] (P1)

Vie45/51 Il confesse ses propres peches, les peches de sa famille et les peches de sa nation, et prie que Dieu veuille accepter le sacrifice d'expiation de l'agneau qui allait etre offert.

Vie45/51 He confesses his own sins, the sins of his family and of his nation and prays that God is willing to accept the sacrifice of expiation of the lamb that was going to be offered. [G/16/70] (P2)

DA40/99 Coming forth to bless the people, "he beckoned unto them, and remained speechless." (B2)

DA41/99 They had waited long, and had begun to fear, lest he had been cut down by the judgment of God. (I1)

DA42/99 But as he came forth from the holy place, his face was shining with the glory of God, "and they perceived that he had seen a vision in the temple." (I1)

DA43/99 Zacharias communicated to them what he had seen and heard; and "as soon as the days of his ministration were accomplished, he departed to his own house." (B2)

SP66/45 He made signs to them that an angel had appeared to him in the temple, and because of his unbelief he was deprived of the power of speech, until the prediction of the angel should be fulfilled. [F/10c/22] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

3/20 Besides, he was a priest of the course of Abia, whose particular office was to pray on behalf of the people, for public and national blessings; so that it is reasonable to think that on all occasions of public worship he prayed most earnestly for the accomplishment of the prophecies relative to the appearance of the long-expected Messiah, who was promised as a general blessing to all the nations of the earth. [Fleetwood, LC]

10b/22 for when he came to pray in the course of his office during the oblation of his incense, he could not utter a word, [Fleetwood, LC]

16/70 It was, doubtless, that the sins of the nation, his own sins, and the sins of his household, might be forgiven; that Jehovah would accept the atonement of the lamb presently to burn on the great altar in their stead; and that the long-expected Hope of Israel, the Messiah foretold by prophets, might soon appear. [Geikie, LC]

10c/22 . . . and was under a necessity of making signs to the people that an angel had appeared to him in the temple, and that he was deprived of the faculty of speech, as a punishment for his doubting the fulfilment of an event which had been foretold concerning him. [Fleetwood, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA44/99 Soon after the birth of the promised child, the father's tongue was loosed, "and he spake, and praised God. (11)

DA45/99 And fear came on all that dwelt round about them: and all these sayings were noised abroad throughout all the hill country of Judea." (B2)

DA46/99+ And all they that heard them laid them up in their hearts, saying, What manner of child shall this be!" (B2)

DA47/100 All this tended to call attention to the Messiah's coming, for which John was to prepare the way. (11)

DA48/100 The Holy Spirit rested upon Zacharias, and in these beautiful words he prophesied of the mission of his son: "Thou, child, shalt be called the prophet of the Highest: For thou shalt go before the face of the Lord to prepare His ways; To give knowledge of salvation unto His people By the remission of their sins, Through the tender mercy of our God; Whereby the Dayspring from on high hath visited us, To give light to them that sit in darkness and in the shadow of death, To guide our feet into the way of peace." (B2)

DA49/100 "And the child grew, and waxed strong in spirit, and was in the deserts till the day of his showing unto Israel." (B2)

DA50/100 Before the birth of John, the angel had said, "He shall be great in the sight of the Lord, and shall drink neither wine nor strong drink; and he shall be filled with the Holy Ghost." (B2)

DA51/100 God had called the son of Zacharias to a great work, the greatest ever committed to men. (11)

DA52/100 In order to accomplish this work, he must have the Lord to work with him. (11)

DA53/100 And the Spirit of God would be with him if he heeded the instruction of the angel. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA54/100 John was to go forth as Jehovah's messenger, to bring to men the light of God. (I1)

DA55/100 He must give a new direction to their thoughts. (I1)

DA56/100 He must impress them with the holiness of God's requirements, and their need of His perfect righteousness. (I1)

DA57/100 Such a messenger must be holy. (I1)

DA58/100 He must be a temple for the indwelling Spirit of God. (I1)

DA59/100 In order to fulfill his mission, he must have a sound physical constitution, and mental and spiritual strength. (I1)

DA60/100 Therefore it would be necessary for him to control the appetites and passions. (I1)

DA61/100 He must be able so to control all his powers that he could stand among men as unmoved by surrounding circumstances as the rocks and mountains of the wilderness. [H/33/70] (I2)

SP96/47 John was fitting himself, by the privations and hardships of his secluded life, to so control all his physical and mental powers that he could stand among the people as unmoved by surrounding circumstances as the rocks and mountains of the wilderness that had surrounded him for thirty years. [H/33/70] (I2)

YI(97)26 John accustomed himself to privations and hardships, that he might be able to stand among the people as unmoved by circumstances as the rocks and mountains of the wilderness that had surrounded him for thirty years. [H/33/70] (P3)

YI(97)27 A great work was before him; and it was necessary that he should form a character that would not be swerved from right and duty by any surrounding influence. [H/33/70] (P3)

33/70 It may, in truth, in no small measure have served to fit him for his peculiar work that--removed from all influences which must have served, had he lived among them, to blunt his sense of surrounding evils, and to mould his character and habits according to the prevailing forms and fashions of Jewish life--he was carried by the Spirit into the desert to be trained and educated there, thence, as from a watch-tower, to look down upon those strange sights which his country was presenting, undistractedly to watch, profoundly to muse and meditate, the fervor of a true prophet of the Lord kindling and glowing into an intenser fire of holy zeal; till at last, when the hour for action came, he launched forth upon his brief earthly work with a swift impetuosity, like a rush of those short-lived cataracts, yet with a firmness of unbending will and purpose, like the stability of those rocky heights among which for thirty years he had been living. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA62/100 In the time of John the Baptist, greed for riches, and the love of luxury and display had become widespread. (I1)

DA63/100 Sensuous pleasures, feasting and drinking, were causing physical disease and degeneracy, benumbing the spiritual perceptions, and lessening the sensibility to sin. (I1)

DA64/100 John was to stand as a reformer. (I1)

DA65/100+ By his abstemious life and plain dress he was to rebuke the excesses of his time. (I1)

DA66/101 Hence the directions given to the parents of John--a lesson of temperance by an angel from the throne of heaven. (I1)

DA67/101 In childhood and youth the character is most impressible. (I1)

DA68/101 The power of self-control should then be acquired. (I1)

DA69/101 By the fireside and at the family board influences are exerted whose results are as enduring as eternity. (I1)

DA70/101 More than any natural endowment, the habits established in early years decide whether a man will be victorious or vanquished in the battle of life. (I1)

DA71/101 Youth is the sowing time. (I1)

DA72/101 It determines the character of the harvest, for this life and for the life to come. (I1)

DA73/101 As a prophet, John was "to turn the hearts of the fathers to the children, and the disobedient to the wisdom of the just; to make ready a people prepared for the Lord." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA74/101 In preparing the way for Christ's first advent, he was a representative of those who are to prepare a people for our Lord's second coming. (11)

DA75/101 The world is given to self-indulgence. (11)

DA76/101 Errors and fables abound. (11)

DA77/101 Satan's snares for destroying souls are multiplied. (11)

DA78/101 All who would perfect holiness in the fear of God must learn the lessons of temperance and self-control. (11)

DA79/101 The appetites and passions must be held in subjection to the higher powers. (11)

DA80/101 This self-discipline is essential to that mental strength and spiritual insight which will enable us to understand and to practice the sacred truths of God's word. (11)

DA81/101 For this reason temperance finds its place in the work of preparation for Christ's second coming. (11)

DA82/101 In the natural order of things, the son of Zacharias would have been educated for the priesthood. (11)

DA83/101 But the training of the rabbinical schools would have unfitted him for his work. (11)

DA84/101 God did not send him to the teachers of theology to learn how to interpret the Scriptures. (11)

DA85/101 He called him to the desert, that he might learn of nature and nature's God. (11)

DA86/101 It was a lonely region where he found his home, in the midst of barren hills, wild ravines, and rocky caves. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA87/101 But it was his choice to forego the enjoyments and luxuries of life for the stern discipline of the wilderness. (11)

YI(97)8b . . . and he chose to separate himself from the world, and make the wilderness his home. [H/25b/70] (P2)

YI(97)9 He denied himself the ordinary comforts of life; his food was simple; his clothing, a garment made of camel's hair, and confined about the waist by a leathern girdle. [H/25c,25d/70] (P2)

SP72/45+ The prophet John separated himself from his friends and kindred, and made his home in the wilderness. [H/25b/70] (P2)

SP73/46 He denied himself of the ordinary comforts of life. [H/25c/70] (P1)

DA88/101 Here his surroundings were favorable to habits of simplicity and self-denial. (11)

DA89/101 Uninterrupted by the clamor of the world, he could here study the lessons of nature, of revelation, and of Providence. (11)

DA90/101 The words of the angel to Zacharias had been often repeated to John by his God-fearing parents. (11)

DA91/101 From childhood his mission had been kept before him, and he had accepted the holy trust. (11)

DA92/101 To him the solitude of the desert was a welcome escape from society in which suspicion, unbelief, and impurity had become well-nigh all-pervading. [H/24,25/70] (12)

DA93/101 He distrusted his own power to withstand temptation, and shrank from constant contact with sin, lest he should lose the sense of its exceeding sinfulness. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

24/70 All that we are told is that till the time of his showing unto Israel he was in the desert, in those wild and lonely regions which lay near his birthplace, skirting the northwestern shores of the Dead sea. [Hanna, LC]

25a/70 True to the angelic designation, accepting the vow that marked him as a Nazarite from his birth, [Hanna, LC]

25b/70 John separated himself early from home and kindred, retired from the haunts of men, buried himself in the rocky solitudes of the wilderness, letting his hair grow till it fell loose and dishevelled over his shoulders, [Hanna, LC]

25c/70 denying himself to all ordinary indulgences, whether of food or dress, [Hanna, LC]

25d/70 clothing himself with the roughest kind of garment he could get, a robe of hair-cloth bound around him with a leathern girdle, [Hanna, LC]

25e/70 satisfying himself by feeding on the locusts and wild honey of the desert. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA94/102 Dedicated to God as a Nazarite from his birth, he made the vow his own in a life-long consecration.
[H/25a/70] (P2)

DA95/102 His dress was that of the ancient prophets, a garment of camel's hair, confined by a leather girdle.
[K/169.6] (P2)

DA96/102 He ate the "locusts and wild honey" found in the wilderness, and drank the pure water from the hills.
[K/169.6] (P2)

SP75/46 His clothing was a garment made of hair-cloth, confined about the waist with a leather girdle. [H/25d/70] (P1)

DA97/102 But the life of John was not spent in idleness, in ascetic gloom, or in selfish isolation. [H/26,29/70] (P2)

YI(97)11 So far from being lonely, gloomy, or morose, he enjoyed his life of simplicity and retirement, and his temperate habits kept all his senses unperverted. [H/26/70] (I2)

YI(97)12 And John was not indolent. (P2)

DA98/102 From time to time he went forth to mingle with men; and he was ever an interested observer of what was passing in the world. [H/30/70] (P3)

DA99/102 From his quiet retreat he watched the unfolding of events. [H/30/70] (P3)

DA100/102 With vision illuminated by the divine Spirit he studied the characters of men, that he might understand how to reach their hearts with the message of heaven. (I1)

DA101/102 The burden of his mission was upon him. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

[See above Hanna, 25a]

169.6 He was clad in a dress which would wear well, and required no care, such as Elijah, and other ancient prophets wore. . -- a rough, but stout and serviceable, robe of camel's hair, or of camel's hair and wool combined, bound about the waist by a broad girdle of stiff leather. His food was "locusts, and wild honey" from the rocks, aided doubtless by the wild products of the soil. [Kitto, DBI]

[See above Hanna, 25d, 25e]

26/70 But it was not in a morose or ascetic spirit that he did so. [Hanna, LC]

27/70 He had not fled to those solitudes in chagrin, to nurse upon the lap of indolence regrets over bygone disappointments; nor had he sought there to shroud his spirit in a religious gloom deep as that of Engedi and Adullam, . . [Hanna, LC]

29/70 Though dwelling apart from others, avoiding observation, and shunning promiscuous intercourse, he was not wasting those years in idleness heedless of the task... [Hanna, LC]

30/70 Through the loopholes of retreat we can well imagine the Baptist as busily scanning the state of that community upon which he was to act. [Hanna, LC]

31/70 When he stepped forth from his retirement, and men of all kinds and classes gathered round him, he did not need any one to tell him who the Pharisees, or the Sadducees, or the publicans were, or what were their peculiar and distinctive errors. [Hanna, LC]

32/70 He appears from the first to have been well informed as to the state of things outside the desert. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA102/102 In solitude, by meditation and prayer, he sought to gird up his soul for the lifework before him. (11)

SP84/46 A great work was before him, and it was necessary that he should form a character unbiased by any surrounding influence. [H/33/70] (P2)

SP89/47 He feared his character would be molded according to the prevailing customs of the Jews, and he chose the wilderness as his school, in which his mind could be properly educated and disciplined from God's great book of nature. [H/33/70] (P2)

DA103/102 Although in the wilderness, he was not exempt from temptation. (11)

DA104/102 So far as possible, he closed every avenue by which Satan could enter, yet he was still assailed by the tempter. (11)

DA105/102 But his spiritual perceptions were clear; he had developed strength and decision of character, and through the aid of the Holy Spirit he was able to detect Satan's approaches, and to resist his power. (11)

DA106/102 John found in the wilderness his school and his sanctuary. (11)

DA107/102 Like Moses amid the mountains of Midian, he was shut in by God's presence, and surrounded by the evidences of His power. (11)

33/70+ It may, in truth, in no small measure have served to fit him for his peculiar work that--removed from all the influences which must have served, had he lived among them, to blunt his sense of surrounding evils, and to mould his character and habits according to the prevailing forms and fashions of Jewish life--he was carried by the Spirit into the desert to be trained and educated there, thence, as from a watch-tower, to look down upon those strange sights which his country was presenting, undistractedly to watch, profoundly to muse and meditate, the fervor of a true prophet of the Lord kindling and glowing into an intenser fire of holy zeal; till, at last, when the hour for action came, he launched forth upon his brief earthly work with a swift impetuosity, like the rush of those short-lived cataracts, yet with a firmness of unbending will and purpose, like the stability of those rocky heights among which for thirty years he had been living. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA108/102 It was not his lot to dwell, as did Israel's great leader, amid the solemn majesty of the mountain solitudes; but before him were the heights of Moab, beyond Jordan, speaking of Him who had set fast the mountains, and girded them with strength. (11)

DA109/102 The gloomy and terrible aspect of nature in his wilderness home vividly pictured the condition of Israel. (11)

DA110/102 The fruitful vineyard of the Lord had become a desolate waste. (11)

DA111/102 But above the desert the heavens bent bright and beautiful. (11)

DA112/102 The clouds that gathered, dark with tempest, were arched by the rainbow of promise. (11)

DA113/102 So above Israel's degradation shone the promised glory of the Messiah's reign. (11)

DA114/102 The clouds of wrath were spanned by the rainbow of His covenant-mercy. (11)

DA115/102 Alone in the silent night he read God's promise to Abraham of a seed numberless as the stars. (11)

DA116/102+ The light of dawn, gilding the mountains of Moab, told of Him who should be as "the light of the morning, when the sun riseth, even a morning without clouds." 2 Sam. 23:4. (11)

DA117/103 And in the brightness of noontide he saw the splendor of His manifestation, when "the glory of the Lord shall be revealed, and all flesh shall see it together." Isa. 40:5. (11)

DA118/103 With awed yet exultant spirit he searched in the prophetic scrolls the revelations of the Messiah's coming,--the promised seed that should bruise the serpent's head; Shiloh, "the peace giver," who was to appear before a king should cease to reign on David's throne. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA119/103 Now the time had come. (11)

DA120/103 By the sure word of the Lord, already the Christ was born. (11)

DA121/103 Isaiah's rapt portrayals of the Messiah's glory were his study by day and by night,--the Branch from the root of Jesse; a King to reign in righteousness, judging "with equity for the meek of the earth;" "a covert from the tempest; . . . the shadow of a great rock in a weary land;" Israel no longer to be termed "Forsaken," nor her land "Desolate," but to be called of the Lord, "My Delight," and her land "Beulah." Isa. 11:4; 32:2; 62:4, margin. [G/264.6] (12)

DA122/103 The heart of the lonely exile was filled with the glorious vision. (11)

DA123/103 He looked upon the King in His beauty, and self was forgotten. (11)

DA124/103 He beheld the majesty of holiness, and felt himself to be inefficient and unworthy. (11)

DA125/103 He was ready to go forth as Heaven's messenger, unawed by the human, because he had looked upon the Divine. (11)

DA126/103 He could stand erect and fearless in the presence of earthly monarchs, because he had bowed low before the King of kings. (11)

DA127/103 John did not fully understand the nature of the Messiah's kingdom. (11)

DA128/103 He looked for Israel to be delivered from her national foes; but the coming of a King in righteousness, and the establishment of Israel as a holy nation, was the great object of his hope. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

264.6 Isaiah, especially, had excited in him a faith so deep and intelligent that Jesus rebuked his fears, when perplexed and doubting, by a quotation from that prophet's Messianic predictions. [Geikie, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA129/103 Thus he believed would be accomplished the prophecy given at his birth,--"To remember His holy covenant; . . . That we being delivered out of the hand of our enemies Might serve Him without fear, In holiness and righteousness before Him, all the days of our life." (11)

DA130/103 He saw his people deceived, self-satisfied, and asleep in their sins. [G/264.3] (P2)

DA131/103 He longed to rouse them to a holier life.
[G/264.3] (12)

DA132/103+ The message that God had given him to bear was designed to startle them from their lethargy, and cause them to tremble because of their great wickedness. [J/12/23]
(P2)

DA133/104 Before the seed of the gospel could find lodgment, the soil of the heart must be broken up. (11)

DA134/104 Before they would seek healing from Jesus, they must be awakened to their danger from the wounds of sin. (11)

DA135/104 God does not send messengers to flatter the sinner. (11)

DA136/104 He delivers no message of peace to lull the unsanctified into fatal security. (11)

DA137/104 He lays heavy burdens upon the conscience of the wrongdoer, and pierces the soul with arrows of conviction. (11)

DA138/104 The ministering angels present to him the fearful judgments of God to deepen the sense of need, and prompt the cry, "What must I do to be saved?" (11)

DA139/104 Then the hand that has humbled in the dust, lifts up the penitent. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

264.3 he was, above all men, fitted to rouse the sleeping conscience of Israel, and to lay bare the self-deceptions and sins of even the religionists of the day. [Geikie, LC]

12/23 for the cry of the Baptist that the kingdom of heaven was at hand, repeated over all the country, had startled the people out of the lethargy wrought by oppressions, or by a fear that God had withdrawn from them. [Jones, LSFG]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA140/104 The voice that has rebuked sin, and put to shame pride and ambition, inquires with tenderest sympathy, "What wilt thou that I shall do unto thee?" (11)

DA141/104 When the ministry of John began, the nation was in a state of excitement and discontent verging on revolution. [H/47-51/72] (P2)

SP97/47 The state of public affairs when John's work commenced, was unsettled. [H/47-51/72] (P2)

SP8/41 The whole country felt their oppression, and revolt and dissension were the result of this state of things. [H/47-51/72] (P2)

DA142/104 At the removal of Archelaus, Judea had been brought directly under the control of Rome. (11)

DA143/104 The tyranny and extortion of the Roman governors, and their determined efforts to introduce the heathen symbols and customs, kindled revolt, which had been quenched in the blood of thousands of the bravest of Israel. (11)

DA144/104 All this intensified the national hatred against Rome, and increased the longing to be freed from her power. (11)

DA145/104 Amid discord and strife, a voice was heard from the wilderness, a voice startling and stern, yet full of hope: "Repent ye; for the kingdom of heaven is at hand." [H/54/72] (P2)

SP98/47+ Discord and insurrection were prevailing, when the voice of John was first lifted up, like the sound of a trumpet pealing forth from the wilderness, thrilling the hearts of all who heard with a new and strange power. [H/54/72] (P2)

DA146/104 With a new, strange power it moved the people. (11)

DA147/104 Prophets had foretold the coming of Christ as an event far in the future; but here was an announcement that it was at hand. (11)

47-51/72 Such a state of things among the governing authorities fomented the popular animosity to the foreign rule. The whole country was in a ferment. Popular outbreaks were constantly occurring. The public mind was in such an inflammable condition that any adventurer, daring enough and strong enough to raise the standard of revolt, was followed by multitudes. Among those insurrectionary chiefs, etc. [Hanna, LC]

54/72 Such was the state of public affairs and of the public feeling, when a voice, loud and thrilling like the voice of a trumpet, issues from the desert, saying, "Repent ye, for the kingdom of heaven is at hand." [Hanna, LC]

DA148/104 John's singular appearance carried the minds of his hearers back to the ancient seers. [J/2,3/17] (P2)

SP101/48 They saw, in the singular dress and appearance of this prophet, a resemblance to the description of the ancient seers . . . [J/3/17] (P2)

DA149/104 In his manner and dress he resembled the prophet Elijah. [J/3/17] (P1)

DA150/104 With the spirit and power of Elijah he denounced the national corruption, and rebuked the prevailing sins. (I1)

DA151/104 His words were plain, pointed, and convincing. [J/20/24] (I2)

SP103/48 In simplicity and plainness he pointed out the errors and crimes of men. [J/20/24] (I2)

SP110/49 His discourses were plain, pointed, and convincing. [J/20/24] (I2)

DA152/104 Many believed him to be one of the prophets risen from the dead. [J/3/17] (I2)

DA153/104 The whole nation was stirred. (I1)

DA154/104 Multitudes flocked to the wilderness. (I1)

DA155/104 John proclaimed the coming of the Messiah, and called the people to repentance. (I1)

SP108/48 His discernment of character and spiritual sight read the purposes and hearts of those who came to him, and he fearlessly told, both rich and poor, the honorable and the lowly, that without repentance of their sins, and a thorough conversion, although they might claim to be righteous, they could not enjoy the favor of God, and have part in the kingdom of the Messiah, whose coming he announced. [H/82,83/74] (P2)

DA156/104 As a symbol of cleansing from sin, he baptized them in the waters of the Jordan. [G/275.7+] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

2,3/17 . . . a large gathering of excited people around a man of singular appearance, who was making a most wonderful announcement, and was engaging in a baptismal rite of startling significance. He was a gaunt ascetic; in his dress and manner, and in his authoritative language, reminding all who saw and heard him of the old prophets; and indeed, in his appearance so much resembling Elijah, that the query was immediately started in every man's mind, whether he was not actually that prophet risen from the dead. [Jones, LSFG]

20/24 The teachings of John were plain and simple. [Jones, LSFG]

82,83/74 His quick, keen, spiritual insight at once detected the veiled deceit that lay in their doing so, and in the very spirit which his great Master afterwards displayed, he proceeded to denounce their hypocrisy, giving them indeed the very title which Jesus bestowed on them. John's whole ministry, his teaching and baptizing, if it meant anything, meant this, that without an inward spiritual change, without penitence, without reformation, no Israelite was prepared to enter into that kingdom whose advent he announced. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA157/104 Thus by a significant object lesson he declared that those who claimed to be the chosen people of God were defiled by sin, and that without purification of heart and life they could have no part in the Messiah's kingdom.
[G/275.7+] [H/82,83/74] (P2)

DA158/105 Princes and rabbis, soldiers, publicans, and peasants came to hear the prophet. (11)

DA159/105 For a time the solemn warning from God alarmed them. (11)

DA160/105 Many were brought to repentance, and received baptism. (11)

SP106/48 The people, as if with common consent, came to him repenting, and confessing their sins, and were baptized of him in Jordan. [H/64,65/73] [F/1/44]
(P1)

SP115/49 He was successful in his ministry.
[F/1/44] (V2)

DA161/105 Persons of all ranks submitted to the requirement of the Baptist, in order to participate in the kingdom he announced. [F/1/44] (P2)

SP116/49 Persons of all rank, high and low, rich and poor, submitted to the requirements of the prophet, as necessary for them in order to participate in the kingdom he came to declare. [F/1/44] (P1)

DA162/105 Many of the scribes and Pharisees came confessing their sins, and asking for baptism. [F/2/45] (P2)

SP117/49 Many of the scribes and Pharisees came to him, confessing their sins, and were baptized of him in Jordan. [F/2/45] (P1)

275.7+ A new symbol was needed, striking enough to express the vastness of the change he demanded. . . . "He was a good man," says Josephus, "and urged the Jews who were willing to live worthily, and to show uprightness one to another, and piety towards God, to be baptized. For baptism was approved of by him, not as a means of obtaining pardon for some sins only, but for the purity of the whole body, when the soul had been cleansed beforehand by righteousness." On baptism, in itself, he set no mysterious sacramental value. It was only water, a mere emblem of the purification required in the life and heart, and needed an after baptism by the Holy Spirit. [Geikie, LC]

64, 65/73 It would seem as if with one consent the entire population of the southern part of Palestine had gathered around the Baptist, and for the time were pliant in his hands. It may have facilitated their assemblage if, as has been conjectured, it was a Sabbatic year when John began his work, and the people, set free from their ordinary labors, were ready to follow him, as he led them to the banks of the Jordan to be baptized. [Hanna, LC]

1/44+ He proved very successful in his ministry, as he enforced the doctrine of repentance because the kingdom of heaven was at hand: persons of all degrees and professions flocked to him, confessed their sins, were baptized in Jordan and submitted to whatever the prophet prescribed as necessary to obtain an inheritance in that kingdom the approach of which he came to declare. [Fleetwood, LC]

2/45 Among the converts were many of the Pharisaical tribe, some of whom confessed their sins and were likewise baptized in Jordan. [Fleetwood, LC]

DA163/105 They had exalted themselves as better than other men, and had led the people to entertain a high opinion of their piety; now the guilty secrets of their lives were unveiled. [F/3/45] (I2)

DA164/105 But John was impressed by the Holy Spirit that many of these men had no real conviction of sin. (I1)

SP118/49 The confessions made by the Pharisees astonished the prophet; for they had exalted themselves as better than other men, and had maintained a high opinion of their own piety and worthiness. [F/3/45] (P2)

SP119/49 As they sought to obtain remission of their sins, and revealed the secrets of their lives, which had been covered from the eyes of men, the prophet was amazed. [F/3/45] (I2)

DA165/105 They were timeservers. (I1)

DA166/105 As friends of the prophet, they hoped to find favor with the coming Prince. (I1)

DA167/105 And by receiving baptism at the hands of this popular young teacher, they thought to strengthen their influence with the people. (I1)

DA168/105 John met them with the scathing inquiry, "O generation of vipers, who hath warned you to flee from the wrath to come? (B2)

DA169/105+ Bring forth therefore fruits meet for repentance: and think not to say within yourselves, We have Abraham to our father: for I say unto you, that God is able of these stones to raise up children unto Abraham." (B2)

DA170/106 The Jews had misinterpreted God's promise of eternal favor to Israel: "Thus saith the Lord, which giveth the sun for a light by day, and the ordinances of the moon and of the stars for a light by night, which divideth the sea when the waves thereof roar; The Lord of hosts is His name: If those ordinances depart from before Me, saith the Lord, then the seed of Israel also shall cease from being a nation before Me forever. [F/4/45] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

3/45 The conversation [sic] of the Pharisees surprised the Baptist, knowing that they maintained a high opinion of their own sanctity, for which reason it was very astonishing that they should express any desire of obtaining a remission of their sins. [Fleetwood, LC]

4,5/45 In short, he was much surprised to find the whole nation so affected by his threatenings, especially as he knew they expected salvation, on account of their being of the seed of Abraham,--a conceit which they cherished, and which they seem to have derived from a misrepresentation of the following passage: "Thus saith the Lord, who giveth the sun for a light by day, and the ordinance of the moon and the stars for a light by night; who divideth the sea when the waves thereof roar; the Lord of Hosts is his name: If those ordinances depart from before me, saith the Lord, then the seed of Israel also shall cease from being a nation before me forever. Thus saith the Lord: If the heaven above can be measured and the foundation of the earth searched out beneath, I will also cast off the seed of Israel for all that they have done." [Fleetwood, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA171/106 Thus saith the Lord; If heaven above can be measured, and the foundations of the earth searched out beneath, I will also cast off all the seed of Israel for all that they have done, saith the Lord." Jer. 31:35-37.
[F/5/45] (B1)

DA172/106 The Jews regarded their natural descent from Abraham as giving them a claim to this promise. (I1)

DA173/106 But they overlooked the conditions which God had specified. (I1)

DA174/106 Before giving the promise, He had said, "I will put My law in their inward parts, and write it in their hearts; and will be their God, and they shall be My people. . . ." (B2)

DA175/106 For I will forgive their iniquity, and I will remember their sin no more." Jer. 31:33, 34. (B2)

DA176/106 To a people in whose hearts His law is written, the favor of God is assured. (I1)

DA177/106 They are one with Him. (I1)

DA178/106 But the Jews had separated themselves from God. (I1)

DA179/106 Because of their sins they were suffering under His judgments. (I1)

DA180/106 This was the cause of their bondage to a heathen nation. (I1)

DA181/106 Their minds were darkened by transgression, and because in times past the Lord had shown them so great favor, they excused their sins. (I1)

DA182/106 They flattered themselves that they were better than other men, and entitled to His blessings. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

[See above Fleetwood, LC/4,5/45]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA183/106 These things "are written for our admonition, upon whom the ends of the world are come." 1 Cor. 10:11. (B2)

DA184/106 How often we misinterpret God's blessings, and flatter ourselves that we are favored on account of some goodness in us! (11)

DA185/106 God cannot do for us that which He longs to do. (11)

DA186/106 His gifts are used to increase our self-satisfaction, and to harden our hearts in unbelief and sin. (11)

DA187/106 John declared to the teachers of Israel that their pride, selfishness, and cruelty showed them to be a generation of vipers, a deadly curse to the people, rather than the children of just and obedient Abraham. (11)

DA188/106 In view of the light they had received from God, they were even worse than the heathen, to whom they felt so much superior. (11)

DA189/106 They had forgotten the rock whence they were hewn, and the hole of the pit from which they had been digged. (11)

DA190/106+ God was not dependent upon them for the fulfilling of His purpose. (11)

DA191/107 As He had called Abraham out from a heathen people, so He could call others to His service. (11)

DA192/107 Their hearts might now appear as lifeless as the stones of the desert, but His Spirit could quicken them to do His will, and receive the fulfillment of His promise. (11)

DA193/107 "And now also," said the prophet, "the ax is laid unto the root of the trees: therefore every tree which bringeth not forth good fruit is hewn down, and cast into the fire." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA194/107 Not by its name, but by its fruit, is the value of a tree determined. (11)

DA195/107 If the fruit is worthless, the name cannot save the tree from destruction. (11)

DA196/107 John declared to the Jews that their standing before God was to be decided by their character and life. (11)

DA197/107 Profession was worthless. (11)

DA198/107 If their life and character were not in harmony with God's law, they were not His people. (11)

DA199/107 Under his heart-searching words, his hearers were convicted. (11)

DA200/107 They came to him with the inquiry, "What shall we do then?" (B2)

DA201/107 He answered, "He that hath two coats, let him impart to him that hath none; and he that hath meat, let him do likewise." (B2)

DA202/107 And he warned the publicans against injustice, and the soldiers against violence. (11)

DA203/107 All who became the subjects of Christ's kingdom, he said, would give evidence of faith and repentance. (11)

DA204/107 Kindness, honesty, and fidelity would be seen in their lives. (11)

DA205/107 They would minister to the needy, and bring their offerings to God. (11)

DA206/107 They would shield the defenseless, and give an example of virtue and compassion. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA207/107 So the followers of Christ will give evidence of the transforming power of the Holy Spirit. (11)

DA208/107 In the daily life, justice, mercy, and the love of God will be seen. (11)

DA209/107 Otherwise they are like the chaff that is given to the fire. (11)

DA210/107 "I indeed baptize you in water unto repentance," said John; "but He that cometh after me is mightier than I, whose shoes I am not worthy to bear: He shall baptize you with the Holy Ghost and with fire." Matt. 3:11, R. V., margin. (B2)

DA211/107 The prophet Isaiah had declared that the Lord would cleanse His people from their iniquities "by the spirit of judgment, and by the spirit of burning." (B2)

DA212/107 The word of the Lord to Israel was, "I will turn My hand upon thee, and purely purge away thy dross, and take away all thy tin." Isa. 4:4; 1:25. (B2)

DA213/107 To sin, wherever found, "our God is a consuming fire." Heb. 12:29. (B2)

DA214/107 In all who submit to His power the Spirit of God will consume sin. (11)

DA215/107 But if men cling to sin, they become identified with it. (11)

DA216/107 Then the glory of God, which destroys sin, must destroy them. (11)

DA217/107 Jacob, after his night of wrestling with the Angel, exclaimed, "I have seen God face to face, and my life is preserved." Gen. 32:30. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA218/108 Jacob had been guilty of a great sin in his conduct toward Esau; but he had repented. (11)

DA219/108 His transgression had been forgiven, and his sin purged; therefore he could endure the revelation of God's presence. (11)

DA220/108 But wherever men came before God while willfully cherishing evil, they were destroyed. (11)

DA221/108 At the second advent of Christ the wicked shall be consumed "with the Spirit of His mouth," and destroyed "with the brightness of His coming." 2 Thess. 2:8. (B2)

DA222/108 The light of the glory of God, which imparts life to the righteous, will slay the wicked. (11)

DA223/108 In the time of John the Baptist, Christ was about to appear as the revealer of the character of God. (11)

DA224/108 His very presence would make manifest to men their sin. (11)

DA225/108 Only as they were willing to be purged from sin could they enter into fellowship with Him. (11)

DA226/108 Only the pure in heart could abide in His presence. (11)

DA227/108 Thus the Baptist declared God's message to Israel. (11)

DA228/108 Many gave heed to his instruction. (11)

DA229/108 Many sacrificed all in order to obey. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 10 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA230/108 Multitudes followed this new teacher from place to place, and not a few cherished the hope that he might be the Messiah. [F/8/46] (I2)

SP214/57 The people thought that John might be the promised Messiah. [F/8/46] (P1)

SP218/57 He did not aspire to worldly honor or worldly dignity, but was humble in heart and life, and did not assume honors that did not belong to him. [F/8/46] (P2)

SP219/57 He assured his followers that he was not the Christ. [F/8/46] (P2)

SP220/57 John, as a prophet, stood forth as God's representative, to show the connection between the law and prophets, and the Christian dispensation. [H/125/78] (I2)

SP221/57 His work and ministry pointed back to the law and the prophets, while he, at the same time, pointed the people forward to Christ, as the Saviour of the world. [H/125/78] (I2)

DA231/108 But as John saw the people turning to him, he sought every opportunity of directing their faith to Him who was to come. (I1)

8,9/46 . . . they began to conjecture that John might be the promised Messiah, and were even ready to pronounce him the Redeemer of Israel; so that, had he aspired to worldly dignity, he might, for a time, have shone in all the grandeur of human pomp, and claimed a regard superior to the sons of men. But, pious in principle and humble in heart, he could not arrogate honors of which he was conscious of his unworthiness; and therefore honestly undeceived his numerous followers by assuring them that, so far from being the glorious person promised, he was only his forerunner,
[Fleetwood, LC]

125/78 Meanwhile, let us dwell a moment on the place and office which the ministry of John occupied midway between the old and the new economy. "The law and the prophets were until John." In him and with him they expired. [Hanna, LC]

The Voice in the Wilderness

Analysis

In our analysis of chapter 10 we noted two special characteristics of Ellen White's work. In the writing of this chapter, Ellen White is largely revising her earlier comments in Spirit of Prophecy, II, even though she had written much on the topic of John the Baptist in various articles and manuscripts. It is also very clear from the reading of the 231 sentences of chapter 10, 62 pages of DA text and sources, that Ellen White exerted a great deal of independence in the composition of this chapter on John the Baptist. These two features deserve special comment before moving to the general analysis of our findings.

Literary analysis, whether involving style, source, or redaction, can hardly avoid some study of the content. We remind the reader once again, however, that our concern is in the main with the literary writing or composition and not with the ideas being expressed. We have not given content the careful scrutiny that we have given to verbal expression even though some attention will be given to the nature of Ellen White's blocks of independent material under the discussion of redaction analysis.¹

¹We often run into instances of parallel ideas between a source text and that of the Ellen White text. This similarity of content, particularly in extra-biblical details, is especially interesting though outside the scope of our investigation. One example noticed in this chapter has to do with John being instructed by his parents, DA90 and 91. The context clearly indicates that Ellen White has been following the story as earlier presented in SP and as developed by Hanna in his life of Christ. We found no reference to this role of John's parents in the SP context

The Voice in the Wilderness

The expansion of Ellen White's coverage of the great controversy between Christ and Satan from her rather succinct treatment in her first writings to the five-volume series entitled "The Conflict of the Ages" has been explained on the basis of her use of sources. In this connection it is interesting to note how the DA material compares with the SP text written some 20 years earlier.

Chapter III of SP on "The Life and Mission of John" has 37 paragraphs divided into 225 sentences. Chapter 10 of DA has 46 paragraphs with 231 sentences. Both the paragraphs and sentences of the later chapter are generally shorter than the earlier work. The SP text has been seriously reworked in terms of sentence structure, combination of thoughts, and order of arrangement. In column I of Table A on page 100 the SP paragraphs have been listed in their numerical sequence, and in column II the comparative DA paragraphs are registered. The letters "a", "b", "c", etc., indicate the sub-sections, or roughly the sentences within the paragraph. This subdivision allows us to show where similarities and differences occur within a given paragraph. The blank spaces in column II indicate where the SP content is missing from chapter 10. The added material in the DA

but in Hanna we read a statement very close in content to the two sentences in DA yet the literary expressions are diverse enough to merit our giving Ellen White an independent rating. According to Hanna, LC/29/70, John was not "... heedless of the task for the performance of which the life he led was intended, as we presume he must have been informed by his parents, to prepare him."

TABLE A

Spirit of Prophecy and Desire of Ages Paragraphs
Listed according to Corresponding Content

Chapter 10

	<u>SP</u>	<u>DA</u>	<u>SP</u>	<u>DA</u>
		Entry/list no.		
001.	1	31b	049.	19a
002.	2	-	050.	19b
003.	3	1, 2, 3a	051.	19c
004.	4	3b	052.	20a
005.	5a	4	053.	20b
006.	5b	13b	054.	20c
007.	6a	13c	055.	21a
008.	6b	13d	056.	21b
009.	7a	13c, 14c	057.	21c
010.	7b	15b	058.	21d
011.	7c	15a	059.	21e
012.	7d	15c	060.	22a
013.	7e	17a	061.	22b
014.	8	17b	062.	22c
015.	9	5	063.	22d
016.	10	9b	064.	22e
017.	11a	9c	065.	22f
018.	11b	10	066.	23a
019.	12a	11	067.	23b
020.	12b	12a, 12b	068.	24a, b, c, d
021.	12c	13a	069.	24e
022.	13a	12c	070.	24f & c.
023.	13b	20b	071.	25a, b
024.	13c	20a	072.	26
025.	14a	21a	073.	27
026.	14b	19f	074.	28
027.	14c	21b	075.	29
028.	14d	19f	076.	30
029.	14e	13b	077.	31
030.	14f	14a	078.	32a
031.	14g	29b	079.	32b
032.	14h	21b	080.	33
033.	15a	19f	081.	34
034.	15b	18b, 23a	082.	35
035.	15c	19b		
036.	15d	21c		
037.	15e	22a		
038.	16a	19c		
039.	16b	29b, 30		
040.	16c	14d		
041.	17a	-		
042.	17b	32a		
043.	17c	32e		
044.	17d	32c		
045.	18a	29c		
046.	18b	-		
047.	18c	30		
048.	18d	33b		

DA PARAGRAPHS NOT IN SP			
		094.	31a
083.	14b	095.	32b
084.	16	096.	33a
085.	19d	097.	36
086.	19e	098.	37
087.	24	099.	37a
088.	25	100.	38
089.	26	101.	40c
090.	27	102.	40f
091.	28	103.	44
092.	29	104.	45
093.	30	105.	46

The Voice in the Wilderness

text consists of the following paragraphs: 14b, 16, 19d, 19e, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31a, 32b, 33a, 37a, 38, 40c, 40f, 44, and 45.

If we translate these figures into content, we find that Ellen White did not carry over into the DA text, at least in this chapter, the lengthy description of conditions in Judea in the time of John, the comments on how different were the words of the people from their actions, the biblical quotes on the blessings and cursings of God for obedience and disobedience, a paragraph on the lack of repentance for disobedience, John's lessons on practical obedience which took over one page of the SP text, and a few miscellaneous sentences. The new material in DA apart from a sentence here and there consisted largely of John's study of the Old Testament prophecies which related to the coming of the Messiah and some material strengthening her spiritual appeals to her readers. Substantially the two chapters are very similar though the arrangement of the content has been thoroughly revised.

The literary independence noted for this chapter may not be entirely the work of Ellen White's personal hand due to the nature of this editorial work. Two illustrations will clearly show how the work of revising and compiling the texts necessitates a change in the sentence composition and literary expression. The resulting sentence structure shows independence in literary expression even though it is obvious that Ellen White is working from her earlier text

The Voice in the Wilderness

which clearly shows the literary dependency. One example may be found in sentences 150 and 155.¹ It is clear from the context that she is echoing SP108 yet her two DA sentences are nowhere near as long as the SP sentence, and the dependency on Hanna, which rated a (P2) for her literary expression in SP108, is not at all apparent for the DA sentences. The same could be said for DA160 when compared with SP106/48 and the sources of Hanna and Fleetwood.

The DA text, while mostly an edited edition of the earlier SP text may also include portions of revised Ellen White articles. Sentence 87 of the DA seems to reflect the content of The Youth's Instructor, 1897, as well as the earlier SP text, of 1877. Yet the reworking of the text so changes the literary expression that in terms of literary dependency we feel it merits an independent rating. But this editing could well have been that of Marian Davis working either with the SP or the YI text, or perhaps even with both earlier texts. If Ellen White did the editing by combining the work of earlier articles the resulting combination merits the independent rating in terms of literary expression even though the work upon which her DA text is based is clearly dependent in its literary expression.

These two examples have been mentioned, not in order to lessen the impact of Ellen White's obvious independence in the production of most of this chapter, but because our

¹See Table 4 on page 116 for a list of these and other examples.

The Voice in the Wilderness

concern is to provide a balanced report and to argue for caution in taking the evaluations of the DA text as being the final word. We must continually remember that we are evaluating a text which is a compilation not only of earlier writings but which perhaps includes in places a return to the source or to new sources for added literary help. At the stage we have the DA text it is no longer possible to untangle the various strands of text tradition and it may prove profitable to do some additional studies in several chapters of the Spirit of Prophecy or Patriarchs and Prophets in the interest of checking on the degree to which the results of our study can be said to be representative of the writing methods of Ellen White. Perhaps our study of the remaining chapters of the DA text will shed further light on these problems.

Source Analysis - The Desire of Ages

Ellen White covered the early life and ministry of John the Baptist in 231 sentences. Table 1 on page 104 breaks this total into the various categories of independence or dependence and shows that 166 sentences, or 72 percent of the total 231, registered as Strict Independence. Of the remaining 65 sentences, 30 were taken from the Bible. Adding these two categories of non-source sentences we have a total of 196 or 85 percent of the sentences in this chapter credited independently to Ellen White or the Bible.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 10

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. DA VI Strict Verbatim	00	00	02	15	05	03	10	166	30	231
02. SP II V2 Verbatim	00	02	12	14	00	01	06	00	00	35
03. YI (97) P1 Strict Paraphrase	00	00	00	03	02	00	01	00	00	06
04. Vie de Christ P2 Simple Paraphrase	00	07	06	07	00	01	02	04	00	27
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	09	18	24	02	02	09	(04)	(00)	68

The Voice in the Wilderness

The balance of 35 sentences were scattered over five categories of dependency.

If we apply our scale of values to the nine categories, giving the value of zero to category (I1), Strict Independence; one to category (I2), Partial Independence; and continue this scale through all levels of dependency until we come to category (VI), Strict Verbatim, with a value of seven; the average literary dependency for the 231 sentences of the chapter is 0.50. If we omit the independent category from our scale the average dependency for chapter 10 is 2.9.

The 35 literary parallels found in the DA text were related to five sources as identified in Table 2 on page 106. Fleetwood, Geikie, and Hanna accounted for most of the parallels, 27 out of 35, with roughly the same distribution of parallels among them. Of the eight remaining parallels, Jones is credited with five. The parallel category showing greatest use was Simple Paraphrase with 15 occurrences; we registered 10 parallels under Partial Independence.

There is no predominant use of sources nor of a given source in this chapter of DA. Ellen White made almost as much use of the Scriptures as she did the sources in the construction of this chapter. What actually stands out in our analysis of chapter 10 is the non-use of sources. As the sentence evaluations for chapter 10 shown in Appendix A indicate, Ellen White's own hand is quite visible in the text of chapter 10. There are at least seven blocks of

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 10

Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	TOTAL
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	30	30
02. Fleetwood LC	00	00	00	03	02	02	03	00	00	10
03. Geikie LC	00	00	01	03	01	01	03	00	00	09
04. Hanna LC	00	00	00	04	02	00	02	00	00	08
05. Jones LSG	00	00	01	02	00	00	02	00	00	05
06. Kitto DBI	00	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	02
07. Hanna/Fleetwood	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
TOTALS DA Text	00	00	03	14	05	03	10	00	(30)	65

The Voice in the Wilderness

Ellen White material at least six sentences in length each scattered throughout the 231 sentences of this chapter. In the first block of 16 independent sentences, 22 through 37, the role of the angel Gabriel is emphasized. The second block of 10 sentences stresses the holiness which John was to reach in order to be an effective worker for the Lord. In the third block, consisting of 30 sentences, John is presented as a representative of those who must prepare the way for the Lord's second advent. From sentence 101 to 129 Ellen White treats the special training of John's wilderness school. After two shorter sections where the result of John's training is described and the nature of his message is covered, Ellen White refers to some source material to describe the reaction of the people and religious leaders to the preaching of John. The final section from sentence 172 through 229 explains the spiritual lessons to be drawn from the message of John and its practical value for Christians of all time, particularly those awaiting the second advent.

From this analysis of the DA text it is clearly evident that Ellen White is in charge of her material. Though she occasionally leans on other writers, the arrangement and subject content of this chapter are definitely to be credited to her.

Source Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

In view of the frequent use Ellen White made of the life and ministry of John the Baptist in her writings, it is

The Voice in the Wilderness

somewhat surprising to find so little from the earlier articles on the theme of this chapter. Apart from a few sentences from The Youth's Instructor on the topic of "A Lesson from One of God's Prophets,"¹ it appears that Marian Davis used only chapter III of Spirit of Prophecy, II.

The length and content of the chapter III in SP and that of chapter 10 in DA have been shown to be quite similar. The figures from Table 3, page 109, and Appendix B evaluations for chapter 10 indicate that Ellen White used sources at least as often and generally more closely for the earlier SP chapter than she did in writing chapter 10. The figures from Table 1 above indicate that the SP text contained 2 Verbatim and 12 Strict Paraphrase against only 2 Strict Paraphrase for the DA text. The French edition is even more striking in its similarity to Geikie. If our translation is a fair representation of Ellen White's original work there are nine Simple Verbatim parallels in the French life of Christ where the DA text had none.

We have included the material from the French edition of the life of Christ because the work is credited to Ellen White and the text contains some very close parallels to Cunningham Geikie's work on the life of Christ.² Since we know of no English text by Ellen White and we have no knowledge that Marian Davis knew French, we are led to conclude that Ellen White referred to the source directly in

¹February 7, 1897.

²The Life and Works of Christ, (New York: United States Book Company, n.d.).

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 10

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
		V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. BGM									04		04
02. Fleetwood LC	00	02	09	04	00	01	01	00	00	00	17
03. Geikie LC	00	07	06	07	00	01	02	00	00	00	23
04. Hanna LC	00	00	03	12	02	00	04	00	00	00	21
05. Jones ISFG	00	00	00	01	00	00	02	00	00	00	03
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	09	18	24	02	02	09	04	04	(00)	68

The Voice in the Wilderness

the case of such sentences as DA7, DA8 and DA10 which do not appear in the SP text. It is possible that Ellen White had in her possession in Australia a copy of the textual additions to SP which were translated into the French life of Christ edition earlier. But since we have some evidence from sentences 130, 132, 145 and 149 that Ellen White was referring to the sources at the time she was writing this chapter of DA, the parallels between the French edition and DA could be accounted for on this same basis. It seems likely that both writings go back to the same literary source rather than the later Ellen White text to her earlier writing.

The SP sentences do not show any dependency on Geikie and this is to be expected. Geikie's work on the life of Christ was published in the same year, 1877. The earliest record we found for Ellen White's use of Geikie was in her French life of Christ published ten years after Geikie's book.

There is some question whether The Youth's Instructor article was used by Marian Davis. The portion of the text which relates to what we find in the DA text also is found in the SP text. The article in YI could have been developed with the use of the earlier SP text and these few sentences need not have been derived from a new look at Hanna's work on the life of Christ. There is, however, just enough difference in a few sentences from the earlier SP text and

The Voice in the Wilderness

just enough added similarity to the source text to raise the possibility of a direct dependency on Hanna for the DA text.

Redaction Analysis - The Desire of Ages

As may be seen from Table A, page 100, apart from the opening of the chapter which in the DA text begins with material found in paragraph three of the SP text, there are many structural parallels between these two works of Ellen White. And while Geikie's comparable chapter carries the identical heading as does the DA text, "The Voice in the Wilderness," and Ellen White has clearly borrowed from Geikie's work on the life of Christ, the structure and general content of the two chapters are very dissimilar. The same can be said for Hanna's chapter entitled "The Forerunner."

The relatively little use made of sources in the composition of chapter 10 and the way in which that use is scattered throughout the lengthy chapter of 231 sentences argues for independence in the structuring of the composition. Unless we have missed a source for the large independent sections of this chapter we can only conclude that Ellen White had taken as her foundation the basic structure and content of chapter III of SP and modified it to present John as the model for Christians living in the last days before the second advent of Christ. She has used the references to the call for repentance by John for the basis of her appeal to the people who will read her material to accept Jesus Christ and prepare for His soon return.

Redaction Analysis - Pre-DA Text

We have already indicated that the content and length of this chapter compare favorably with that of chapter III of Spirit of Prophecy, II, and that the structure of Ellen White's earlier writing did not follow that of either Geikie or Hanna. The same may be said for Fleetwood. Ellen White used these writers but her development is different. Geikie moves from the birth of John to his early training, the geographical area of his wilderness life, his food, desert life, and personal character. He then treats Pilate, the office of the Baptist, and opens the next chapter with Messianic expectations. Hanna begins, as does Ellen White and the Bible, with the account of the announcement to Zechariah but soon moves into John's retirement into the desert, the inauguration of his prophetic ministry, Jewish and Roman history during the recent decades, and John's message of repentance. Hanna gives great attention to the baptism of John and the reaction of the people, particularly the religious leaders, to John's special ministry. The last part of this section of Hanna treats the character of John as a prophet and his inferior standing in relation to Christ. Fleetwood treats in some detail the birth announcement of John to Zechariah and then gives equal space to the angel's visit to Mary and the announcement of the birth of the Messiah. He continues the narrative returning to the birth of John, then to the response of Joseph to the news of Mary's pregnancy, to the birth of Jesus, to Pilate,

and to the preaching of John.

Chapter III of Spirit of Prophecy opens with comments on the condition of the Jewish people at the time of John's birth, follows with the appearance of the angel to Zechariah in the temple, the words of the angel, the special work of John, the reaction of John to the message of the angel, John's life in the desert including his own personal feelings and attitude toward his calling, the purpose of John's work for the Jewish nation and their reactions to his call to repentance. The spiritual nature of John's work as well as the desired and actual spiritual response of the people is stressed by Ellen White.

Certain segments of chapter III of SP do follow the development of thought as presented in the source used for that portion of the chapter. The French edition quite consistently follows Geikie and there are groups of sentences in the SP text which reveal dependency upon either Hanna or Fleetwood for the most part. Since we did not examine the full SP chapter for literary dependency we have no basis for making any claims for major sections of the chapter following the literary arrangement of the sources indicated by the partial study. The list of literary sources for the pre-DA material of this chapter as presented in Appendix C does show that there is not always the same continuity in the source text as we find in the SP text. For example, using the list of pre-DA sources for chapter 10 as found in Appendix C, lines 001 and 002 show that SP 4 and

The Voice in the Wilderness

6 of page 41 have parallels found in Hanna, 43, 54 of page 71. Yet line 051 presents a parallel between SP 97 on page 47, some distance from sentence 6 of page 41 mentioned earlier, and lines 47-51 of Hanna page 72. At the same time this same listing shows that sentences on page 49 of SP beginning with 115 (see lines 059-062 of the same Appendix C chart) follow right along with the sentences beginning on page 44 of Fleetwood. Since we have not made a study of all the sentences of the SP chapter involved we have no idea how many more sentences of this text are parallel to one or more of the sources already indicated in this partial study.

We cannot give further attention to the redaction of the pre-DA material since our work with the DA text is more than we can adequately cover. Nevertheless this brief excursion into the earlier text tradition seems to indicate that in this chapter of SP Ellen White structures her composition independent of the sources. Literary dependency, however, is evident in the thematic development of certain subunits of the composition.

One clear example may be found in the material from Geikie's life of Christ used in the French edition. In 27 sentences in Vie de Christ Geikie is used 23 times and in nearly the same order.¹

Once again our studies have shown that as with source analysis, redaction analysis of the DA text may well be

¹The listing may be found in the chapter 10 chart provided in Appendix C. Further, we are assuming for lack

The Voice in the Wilderness

served by a study of the structure of earlier texts, particularly those which give evidence of being similar in content and extensive enough to serve as a model for the later revision.

of contrary evidence that Ellen White is the author of the English text behind the French edition.

Before summarizing our findings for chapter 10 let us consider further the comparison between the DA text and the earlier SP coverage on John the Baptist. From Table 4 on page 116 we may note some examples which seem to indicate that Ellen White often shows greater literary dependency in the materials written prior to the production of the DA text. Since these closer parallels are not limited to the writings from her midlife period (1870s) but are also found in her articles dated as late as 1887 when the French edition of Vols. II and III of Spirit of Prophecy was published, we cannot account for this use of sources as indicating a change in Ellen White's literary practices.¹ It would appear more reasonable to account for the literary independence of the DA text on the basis of the rewriting and editorial activities of Ellen White and Marian Davis in producing an integrated text largely compiled from earlier separately written documents. It will be interesting to see if the analysis of the remaining chapters of DA supports this tentative conclusion.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 10

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	<u>Eval.</u>	<u>Pre-DA Txt.</u>	<u>Eval.</u>	<u>Pre-DA</u>	<u>Eval.</u>
01. -	<u>DA7/97</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>Vie43/51</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
02. -	<u>DA21/98</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>SP55/44</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
03. -	<u>DA161/105</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>SP116/49</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
04. -	<u>DA162/105</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>SP117/49</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01. -	<u>DA36/99</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>SP57/44+</u>	<u>B1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
02. -	<u>DA37/99</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>SP58/45</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
03. -	<u>DA38/99</u>	<u>B2</u>	<u>SP59/45</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
04. -	<u>DA39/99</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>SP60,61/45</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
05. -	<u>DA61/100</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>YI(97)26,27</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
06. -	<u>DA87/101</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>YI(97)8b</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
07. -	<u>DA150/104</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>SP108/48</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
08. -	<u>DA155/104</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>SP108/48</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
09. -	<u>DA160/105</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>SP106/48</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

The Voice in the Wilderness

Summary

Chapter 10 has raised some special problems by reason of its content. It is only one of a number of chapters in DA on the subject of John the Baptist and limiting our search for parallels to this chapter may have led us to overlook some parallels. Other parallels may have been missed within writings of Ellen White's associates or popular Protestant preachers because we did not include sermons in our search. Nevertheless, granting the various kinds of limitations, we would summarize the evidence of this chapter as follows.

1. Handwritten comments on John the Baptist may be found today in two of Ellen White diaries, Books 20 and 26, dated 1894 and 1897 respectively. We did not find any evidence, however, that these materials were used in the composition of chapter 10 or in connection with the only pre-DA text which postdates the diary material, The Youth's Instructor of January 7, 1897.

2. Ellen White's writings contain many references to John the Baptist and his ministry but judging from the literary expression it would appear that only one, chapter III of Spirit of Prophecy II, was seriously used. We list the 1897 article from The Youth's Instructor but with its date so close to the publication of the finished text of The Desire of Ages, we cannot be sure some material was taken from the pre-published text of DA and presented as a separate article. Whatever the case, the parallels between

The Voice in the Wilderness

the VI article and this chapter are so few that it matters little for our conclusions.

We have not compared the four chapters on John the Baptist in DA to the three chapters in SP (III, IV, and V) which treat the same general contents but if our sentence count is correct the DA text is only six sentences longer than chapter III of SP. The expansion of Ellen White's comments on John the Baptist are more to be found when comparing her first writing in Spiritual Gifts with the Spirit of Prophecy text. The SC text of 1858 used 12 sentences whereas the SP text of 1877 (1873 in article form) used 225.

3. In addition to the diary materials noted under 1 above there are numerous references in the writings of Ellen White on the work of John the Baptist. John's life style, character, and ministry were understood by Ellen White as ideal models for the people of God preparing for the second advent. This same material was published in the series known as Redemption Leaflets, The Review and Herald, and Early Writings.

These earlier articles were in the main written for fellow Adventists and except for broad generalities would not have suited the evangelistic purposes of the DA text.

4. There is no appreciable or significant difference between the DA text and the earlier SP text on which the DA text is built. The content is modified in arrangement and Ellen White adds to the earlier text her spiritual appeals.

The Voice in the Wilderness

The DA text was being produced as a book to be sold by colporteurs. The DA was designed to be an evangelistic book to be sold to the public at large in contrast to the earlier work designed for advent believers. The changes appear to be consistent with the new objective.

5. Out of a total of 231 sentences, 35 or 15% of the chapter's sentences show literary dependency.

6. Ellen White was credited with 166 of the 231 sentences, or 72 percent of the chapter, and 30 sentences were attributed to the Bible.

7. The sentences involving literary parallels were roughly divided between Simple Paraphrase (15) and Partial Independence (10). Two sentences were evaluated as Strict Paraphrase, five as Loose Paraphrase, and three as Source Bible.

The dependency rating for the entire chapter of 231 sentences, less the 30 Bible quotations, is .50. If we exclude the independent sentences and evaluate the average degree of dependency for those sentences showing source influence the rating is 2.9.

8. No one source seems to have contributed significantly to the verbal expressions and arrangement of this chapter. Ellen White departs from the sources to draw her spiritual lessons from the life and ministry of John.

9. Ellen White used occasionally the writings of five authors in the construction of chapter 10: The Life and Words of Christ by John Cunningham Geikie; The Life of Our

The Voice in the Wilderness

Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ by John Fleetwood; William Hanna's Life of Christ; Life Scenes from the Four Gospels by George Jones; and a source book by John Kitto, Daily Bible Illustrations . . .

Ellen White exhibits great independence in this chapter, not only in her literary expression but also in the extent to which she develops a given theme; we found no apparent area of interest or type of content excluded from her use of sources. The evidence from chapter 10 suggests she felt free to borrow general commentary material, whether spiritual, devotional, historical, or psychological. Geikie's, Fleetwood's, or Hanna's comments on John's character, feelings, or personal attitudes are included along with descriptions of the priestly services and wilderness life.

10. Four of the sources mentioned under 9 above were used in the writing of the earlier texts of Ellen White on John's life and ministry. We found no earlier parallels to Kitto's work in the partial review given to these earlier documents.

Our limited survey did show that Ellen White exhibits greater dependency in these pre-DA materials.

11. The special feature associated with our study of chapter 10 is the use made of Geikie in the earlier life of Christ published in the French language. The French work does not exist in English. It is a revision of Ellen White's earlier publication, Spirit of Prophecy, volumes II

The Voice in the Wilderness

and III. Yet in the chapter on John the Baptist it departs from the SP text in the treatment of Zecharias' priestly ministry in the temple and in the process depends heavily on Geikie's life of Christ. The DA also omits this portion of the French edition even though it does have a few parallels from Geikie at a later point in the story.

12. The independent sentences of the DA text appear to focus on two general concerns of Ellen White. John's life and ministry were an excellent model for Christians living in the expectation of Christ's second advent. In addition, his life of holiness and his dedication were exemplary for true Christians living in a sinful world. These themes which were also present in the SP text become generalized for all Christians in the DA.

13. The structure of chapter 10 is Ellen White's. None of the writers from whom Ellen White borrowed in the writing of sentences or in the arrangement of literary units within the chapter arranged their work on John in the way Ellen White did. A general chronological order may be found in Luke's gospel and this arrangement no doubt influenced Ellen White as well as other writers.

14. The one earlier text used to any major extent by this chapter was chapter III of SP. This earlier work, insofar as our examination revealed, used sources for certain subsections. Within these sections the SP text reflects the structure of the sources. The arrangement of chapter III of SP as a whole, however, appears to be the

The Voice in the Wilderness

work of Ellen White.

We did not examine the entire chapter on John from the French work by Ellen White, but the section on Zecharias as mentioned under 11 above shows striking similarities with Geikie's treatment of this part of the narrative.

Our study of chapter 10 has left us with the intriguing problem of the French edition. Would a closer review of this earlier life of Christ result in more special additions such as those found in the Zecharias story? How does this French work compare with the earlier English text of SP volumes II and III? Would it be more accurate to describe it as a revised edition of the SP material than to call it a translation?

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -		I1
002. -		I1	052. -		I1
003. -		I1	053. -		I1
004. -	Geikie LC/61.8	P2	054. -		I1
005. -	Bible	B2	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -	Geikie LC/13/70	P1	057. -		I1
008. -	Geikie LC/ 7/70	P3	058. -		I1
009. -	Geikie LC/ 7/70	B1	059. -		I1
010. -	Geikie LC/ 7/70	I2	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -	Hanna LC/33/70	I2
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -	Bible	B2	063. -		I1
014. -	Bible	B2	064. -		I1
015. -	Bible	B2	065. -		I1
016. -	Bible	B2	066. -		I1
017. -	Bible	B2	067. -		I1
018. -	Bible	B2	068. -		I1
019. -	Fleetwood LC/6/21	T2	069. -		I1
020. -	Fleetwood LC/6/21	P3	070. -		I1
021. -	Fleetwood LC/6/21	P3	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -		I1	073. -	Bible	B2
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -		I1
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -		I1	085. -		I1
036. -		I1	086. -		I1
037. -		I1	087. -		I1
038. -	Bible	B2	088. -		I1
039. -	F LC/3,10b/20	P2	089. -		I1
040. -	Bible	B2	090. -		I1
041. -		I1	091. -		I1
042. -		I1	092. -		I1
043. -	Bible	B2	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -	Hanna LC/25a/70	P2
045. -	Bible	B2	095. -	Kitto DBI/169.6	P2
046. -	Bible	B2	096. -	Kitto DBI/169.6	P2
047. -		I1	097. -	Hanna LC/26-29/70	P2
048. -	Bible	B2	098. -	Hanna LC/30/70	P3
049. -	Bible	B2	099. -	Hanna LC/30/70	P3
050. -	Bible	B2	100. -	Hanna LC/31,32/70	I2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Jones LSFG/20/24	I2
102. -		I1	152. -	Jones LSFG/3/17	I2
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -		I1	155. -		I1
106. -		I1	156. -	Geikie LC/275.7+	P2
107. -		I1	157. -	G/275.7+H/82.83/74	P2
108. -		I1	158. -		I1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -	Fleetwood LC/1/44	P2
112. -		I1	162. -	Fleetwood LC/2/44	P2
113. -		I1	163. -	Fleetwood LC/3/45	I2
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -		I1	166. -		I1
117. -		I1	167. -		I1
118. -		I1	168. -	Bible	B2
119. -		I1	169. -	Bible	B2
120. -		I1	170. -	Fleetwood/4/45	B1
121. -	Geikie LC/264.6	I2	171. -	Fleetwood/5/45	B1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -		I1	173. -		I1
124. -		I1	174. -	Bible	B2
125. -		I1	175. -	Bible	B2
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -		I1	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -	Geikie LC/264.3	P2	180. -		I1
131. -	Geikie LC/264.3	I2	181. -		I1
132. -	Jones LSFG/12/23	P2	182. -		I1
133. -		I1	183. -	Bible	B2
134. -		I1	184. -		I1
135. -		I1	185. -		I1
136. -		I1	186. -		I1
137. -		I1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -		I1	189. -		I1
140. -		I1	190. -		I1
141. -	Hanna LC/47-51/72	P2	191. -		I1
142. -		I1	192. -		I1
143. -		I1	193. -	Bible	B2
144. -		I1	194. -		I1
145. -	Hanna LC/54/71	P2	195. -		I1
146. -		I1	196. -		I1
147. -		I1	197. -		I1
148. -	Jones LSFG/2.3/17	P2	198. -		I1
149. -	Jones LSFG/3/17	P1	199. -		I1
150. -		I1	200. -	Bible	B2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency .
201. -	Bible	B2	251. -		
202. -		I1	252. -		
203. -		I1	253. -		
204. -		I1	254. -		
205. -		I1	255. -		
206. -		I1	256. -		
207. -		I1	257. -		
208. -		I1	258. -		
209. -		I1	259. -		
210. -	Bible	B2	260. -		
211. -	Bible	B2	261. -		
212. -	Bible	B2	262. -		
213. -	Bible	B2	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -		I1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -	Bible	B2	267. -		
218. -		I1	268. -		
219. -		I1	269. -		
220. -		I1	270. -		
221. -	Bible	B2	271. -		
222. -		I1	272. -		
223. -		I1	273. -		
224. -		I1	274. -		
225. -		I1	275. -		
226. -		I1	276. -		
227. -		I1	277. -		
228. -		I1	278. -		
229. -		I1	279. -		
230. -	Fleetwood LC/8/46	I2	280. -		
231. -		I1	281. -		
232. -			282. -		
233. -			283. -		
234. -			284. -		
235. -			285. -		
236. -			286. -		
237. -			287. -		
238. -			288. -		
239. -			289. -		
240. -			290. -		
241. -			291. -		
242. -			292. -		
243. -			293. -		
244. -			294. -		
245. -			295. -		
246. -			296. -		
247. -			297. -		
248. -			298. -		
249. -			299. -		
250. -			300. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 10

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	2SP 4/41	P2	5	051.	-	2SP 97/47	P2	141
002.	-	2SP 6/41	P2	5	052.	-	2SP 8/41	P2	141
003.	-	Vie 21/49	P1	5	053.	-	2SP 98/47+	P2	145
004.	-	Vie 22/49	P2	5	054.	-	2SP 101/48	P2	148
005.	-	Vie 23/49	V2	5	055.	-	2SP 103/48	I2	151
006.	-	Vie 24/49	P2	5	056.	-	2SP 110/49	I2	151
007.	-	Vie 25/49	P2	5	057.	-	2SP 108/48	P2	155
008.	-	Vie 26-28/49	T2	5	058.	-	2SP 106/48	P1	160
009.	-	Vie 29/49+	P1	5	059.	-	2SP 115/49	V2	160
010.	-	Vie 30/50	P1	5	060.	-	2SP 116/49	P1	161
011.	-	Vie 31/50	P2	5	061.	-	2SP 117/49	P1	162
012.	-	Vie 32/50	P1	5	062.	-	2SP 118/49	P2	164
013.	-	Vie 33-35/50	I1	5	063.	-	2SP 119/49	I2	164
014.	-	Vie 36/50	B1	5	064.	-	2SP 214/57	P1	230
015.	-	Vie 37/50	P1	6	065.	-	2SP 218/57	P2	230
016.	-	Vie 38/50	P2	6	066.	-	2SP 219/57	P2	230
017.	-	Vie 39/50	V2	6	067.	-	2SP 220/57	I2	230
018.	-	Vie 40/50	V2	6	068.	-	2SP 221/57	I2	230
019.	-	Vie 41/50	V2	6	069.	-			
020.	-	Vie 42/50	V2	6	070.	-			
021.	-	Vie 43/51	V2	6	071.	-			
022.	-	Vie 44/51	V2	6	072.	-			
023.	-	Vie 49/51	P2	10	073.	-			
024.	-	Vie 48/51	I1	11	074.	-			
025.	-	Vie 50/51	I1	12	075.	-			
026.	-	2SP 52/44	P1	19	076.	-			
027.	-	2SP 55/44	P1	21	077.	-			
028.	-	2SP 56/44	P2	21	078.	-			
029.	-	Vie 58/52	I2	21	079.	-			
030.	-	Vie 59/52	I1	21	080.	-			
031.	-	Vie 60/52	P1	21	081.	-			
032.	-	2SP 57/44+	B1	38	082.	-			
033.	-	2SP 58/45	P1	38	083.	-			
034.	-	2SP 59/45	V2	38	084.	-			
035.	-	2SP 60/45	P1	39	085.	-			
036.	-	2SP 61/45	P1	39	086.	-			
037.	-	Vie 45/51	P2	39	087.	-			
038.	-	2SP 66/45	P1	43	088.	-			
039.	-	2SP 96/47	I2	61	089.	-			
040.	-	YI (97) 26	P3	61	090.	-			
041.	-	YI (97) 27	P3	61	091.	-			
042.	-	YI (97) 8b	P2	87	092.	-			
043.	-	YI (97) 9	P2	87	093.	-			
044.	-	2SP 72/45+	P2	87	094.	-			
045.	-	2SP 73/46	P1	87	095.	-			
046.	-	2SP 75/46	P1	96	096.	-			
047.	-	YI (97) 1	I2	97	097.	-			
048.	-	YI (97) 12	P2	97	098.	-			
049.	-	2SP 84/46	P2	102	099.	-			
050.	-	2SP 89/46	P2	102	100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 10

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	2SP 4/41	H/43,45/71	051.	-	2SP 97/47	H/47-51/72
002.	-	2SP 6/41	H/43,45/71	052.	-	2SP 8/41	H/47-51/72
003.	-	Vie 21/49	G/1/69	053.	-	2SP 98/47+	H/54/72
004.	-	Vie 22/49	G/1/69	054.	-	2SP 101/48	J/3/17
005.	-	Vie 23/49	G/2/69	055.	-	2SP 103/48	J/20/24
006.	-	Vie 24/49	G/2/69	056.	-	2SP 110/49	J/20/24
007.	-	Vie 25/49	G/2,3/69	057.	-	2SP 108/48	H/82,83/74
008.	-	Vie 26-28/49	G/4,6/69	058.	-	2SP 106/48	H/64,65/73
009.	-	Vie 29/49+	G/5/69	059.	-	2SP 115/49	F/1/44
010.	-	Vie 30/50	G/6/69	060.	-	2SP 116/49	F/1/44
011.	-	Vie 31/50	G/7/69a	061.	-	2SP 117/49	F/2/45
012.	-	Vie 32/50	G/7/69b	062.	-	2SP 118/49	F/3/45
013.	-	Vie 33-35/50		063.	-	2SP 119/49	F/3/45
014.	-	Vie 36/50	G/8/70	064.	-	2SP 214/57	F/8/45
015.	-	Vie 37/50	G/9/70	065.	-	2SP 218/57	F/8/46
016.	-	Vie 38/50	G/10/70	066.	-	2SP 219/57	F/8/46
017.	-	Vie 39/50	G/9,11a/70	067.	-	2SP 220/57	F/125/78
018.	-	Vie 40/50	G/11b/70	068.	-	2SP 221/57	H/125/78
019.	-	Vie 41/50	G/12a/70	069.	-		
020.	-	Vie 42/50+	G/12b/70	070.	-		
021.	-	Vie 43/51	G/13/70	071.	-		
022.	-	Vie 44/51	G/14/70	072.	-		
023.	-	Vie 49/51	G/7/70	073.	-		
024.	-	Vie 48/51		074.	-		
025.	-	Vie 50/51		075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 52/44	F/5/21	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 55/44	F/6/21	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 56/44	F/6/21	078.	-		
029.	-	Vie 58/52	G/27/71	079.	-		
030.	-	Vie 59/52		080.	-		
031.	-	Vie 60/52	G/28/71	081.	-		
032.	-	2SP 57/44+	F/8,9/21+	082.	-		
033.	-	2SP 58/45	F/9/21	083.	-		
034.	-	2SP 59/45	F/9/21	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 60/45	F/3/20	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 61/45	F/10b/22	086.	-		
037.	-	Vie 45/51	G/16/70	087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 66/45	F/10c/22	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 96/47	H/33/70	089.	-		
040.	-	YI (97) 26	H/33/70	090.	-		
041.	-	YI (97) 27	H/33/70	091.	-		
042.	-	YI (97) 8b	H/25b/70	092.	-		
043.	-	YI (97) 9	H/25c25d/70	093.	-		
044.	-	2SP 72/45+	H/25b/70	094.	-		
045.	-	2SP 73/46	H/25c/70	095.	-		
046.	-	2SP 75/46	H/25d/70	096.	-		
047.	-	YI (97) 11	H/26,27/70	097.	-		
048.	-	YI (97) 12	H/27/70	098.	-		
049.	-	2SP 84/46	H/33/70+	099.	-		
050.	-	2SP 89/46	H/33/70+	100.	-		

V CHAPTER 13 - The Victory

Ellen White's readers are aware of her fondness for three themes, the great controversy between Christ and Satan, the saving ministry of Jesus Christ, and sanctification, or the victorious life of the Christian. All three of these favorite subjects are presented in the topic of chapter 13, "The Victory."

The temptation of Christ in the wilderness is surely to be understood as a presentation of the conflict of the ages. The hunger and deprivation endured by Jesus speak to the humiliation of his incarnation. His victory over the temptations through faith in God and reliance on His word serve as the model for victorious Christian living in a world where Christ's foes still seek to defeat His followers.

It will come as no surprise, then, to find that Ellen White often touched on the theme of Christ's temptations. The Desire of Ages gives two full chapters to this subject. Our research index on the content of chapter 13 which covers the second and third temptations contains over 60 references to the same. Ellen White's first presentation of the subject in SG took 41 sentences. A series of early articles in The Review and Herald of 1874 on the temptations of Christ may be read today in Selected Messages I, pages 271-289.¹ The Spirit of Prophecy, chapter VI, coverage of the last two temptations took 60 sentences.

¹These articles appeared in the August 4, 18, and

The Victory

The textual tradition behind chapter 13 includes manuscripts and letters, testimonies, and articles in the various journals of the Adventist church. The full literary collection Marian Davis could have compiled need not be presented here. What is important to note, however, is the literary independence of chapter 13 from these earlier documents. We found very little literary dependence upon earlier Ellen White texts in the composition of 127 sentences.

Our study of these earlier documents has, nevertheless, proved very fruitful in advancing our general knowledge of Ellen White's literary methods. Accordingly, we have included 246 sentences from several earlier texts. Our reasons for making such an extended investigation of this chapter will soon be clear.

Ellen White did not always develop her comments on the temptations in the same way; she did not in every instance confine certain comments to certain temptations or speak on the second two independent of the first. Our random selection of chapter 13, however, forces an arbitrary division. We must exclude chapter 12 on "The Temptation," along with any literary sources directly reflected in those Ellen White comments on Christ's wilderness experience.

While we honored this division of content in the DA text, we did not maintain this separation for the pre-DA

September 1 issues of the RH and a month earlier in The Signs of the Times. They were also reprinted as part of the Redemption Leaflets.

The Victory

material. The earlier documents evidently served as part of Marian Davis' "scrapbook" of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ. Much of their content does appear in the DA text even though the literary expression of her thoughts varies from that found in the earlier materials. Their special value for our study lies in the evidence these pre-DA texts provide for our understanding of Ellen White's use of source materials.

For the most part these previous writings on Christ's temptations have been presented in a separate section of this chapter.¹ We wanted to avoid any confusion with the DA text and to list the earlier material in a consecutive text form. Any attempt to match the content of the various documents to the DA text would have necessitated breaking up the text into separate units and scattering them throughout the DA text presentation.

Those readers who are interested in comparing the content of the early documents with the content of the DA text should consult Appendix B (at the end of this chapter) where we indicate to which DA sentences the former would best correspond. In other words, we have allowed Appendix B of this chapter to follow the same arrangement as for other chapters, even though the largest proportion of pre-DA sentences have been separated from the main body of the DA text and placed some pages later.

¹The texts are described and presented following the DA text. See below pages 141 to 170.

The Victory

We have included several parallels from Ellen White's earlier writings to show how similar to, and yet how different from, these texts is the DA material. These sentences do not occur in any particular order. They are integrated into the DA text where they appear to be making the same point. The non-dependency of the DA text verbally and the nature of the content do not permit us to establish the accuracy of their placement. In fact some of the sentences no doubt apply more specifically to the content of chapter 12. The location is not crucial for the role they play in this study.

Redemption Leaflets, Numbers 1 and 2, 1874, provided a few sentences identified as 1RL or 2RL.¹ The references signified by Lt(1a) specify sentences from an Ellen White letter to a church brother in 1872. The (1a) is the White Estate number for this letter, and the number following indicates the sentence. The portion of the letter we have used was published in the compilation, Our High Calling.² The abbreviation SP has been used before and here refers to the Spirit of Prophecy, Volume II, chapter VI, "Temptation of Christ," published in 1877. The sentence and page

¹The sentences from pages 48-50 of Redemption Leaflet #1 have been taken from an 1877 printing. According to the Comprehensive Index to the Writings of Ellen G. White, Vol. III (Washington, D. C.: The Ellen G. White Estate, Incorporated, 1963), p. 3196, these leaflets were first published as articles in The Signs of the Times and Review and Herald, and later were used in Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, 1877, and also in a series of pamphlets published the same year.

²The Ellen G. White Estate, Inc. (Review and Herald, Washington, D.C., 1961), p. 93.

The Victory

numbers follow. One sentence has been taken from The Bible Echo of 1892, where Ellen white published an article entitled, "Tempted in All Points Like as We Are."¹ The entry, 3T, refers to Testironies to the Church, Volume III. The sentence quoted was first published as a part of Testimony for the Church, No. 25, 1874.²

In all references where only one number appears following the identifying letters, the number refers to the page of the text. For example, 3T 482.6 indicates that the sentence may be found just over halfway down (6/10ths of the way) page 482 in volume 3 of the Testimonies.

We have usually listed the Ellen White text on the left (facing) page, and the source parallels on the right-hand page. Where no sources appear for the complete text page of Ellen White material, and we can use the right (facing) page also for the Ellen White text, without otherwise disturbing our regular format, we will do so.

William Hanna's Life of Christ is the only source furnishing literary parallels for chapter 13 and the few earlier texts which we have listed possible supporting texts. We shall have more to say about likely source materials under the section on the pre-DA texts below.

¹The Bible Echo and Signs of the Times, Nov. 15, 1892 (Melbourne, Australia: Bible Echo Publishing House).

²First published by The Steam Press, Battle Creek, Michigan.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA1/124 "THEN the devil taketh Him up into the holy city, and setteth Him on a pinnacle of the temple, and saith unto Him, If Thou be the Son of God, cast Thyself down: for it is written,--"He shall give His angels charge concerning Thee: And in their hands they shall bear Thee up, Lest at any time Thou dash Thy foot against a stone." (B2)

DA2/124 Satan now supposes that he has met Jesus on His own ground. (I1)

DA3/124 The wily foe himself presents words that proceeded from the mouth of God. (I1)

DA4/124 He still appears as an angel of light, and he makes it evident that he is acquainted with the Scriptures, and understands the import of what is written. (I1)

DA5/124 As Jesus before used the word of God to sustain His faith, the tempter now uses it to countenance his deception. (I1)

DA6/124 He claims that he has been only testing the fidelity of Jesus, and he now commends His steadfastness. (I1)

DA7/124 As the Saviour has manifested trust in God, Satan urges him to give still another evidence of His faith. (I1)

DA8/124 But again the temptation is prefaced with the insinuation of distrust, "If Thou be the Son of God." (I1)

DA9/124 Christ was tempted to answer the "if;" but He refrained from the slightest acceptance of the doubt. (I1)

DA10/124 He would not imperil His life in order to give evidence to Satan. (I1)

DA11/125 The tempter thought to take advantage of Christ's humanity, and urge him to presumption. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA12/125 But while Satan can solicit, he cannot compel to sin. (11)

DA13/125 He said to Jesus, "Cast Thyself down," knowing that he could not cast Him down; for God would interpose to deliver Him. (11)

DA14/125 Nor could Satan force Jesus to cast Himself down. (11)

DA15/125 Unless Christ should consent to temptation, He could not be overcome. (11)

DA16/125 Not all the power of earth or hell could force Him in the slightest degree to depart from the will of His Father. (11)

DA17/125 The tempter can never compel us to do evil. (11)

DA18/125 He cannot control minds unless they are yielded to his control. (11)

DA19/125 The will must consent, faith must let go its hold upon Christ, before Satan can exercise his power upon us. (11)

DA20/125 But every sinful desire we cherish affords him a foothold. (11)

DA21/125 Every point in which we fail of meeting the divine standard is an open door by which he can enter to tempt and destroy us. (11)

DA22/125 And every failure or defeat on our part gives occasion for him to reproach Christ. (11)

DA23/125 When Satan quoted the promise, "He shall give His angels charge over Thee," he omitted the words, "to keep Thee in all Thy ways;" that is, in all the ways of God's choosing. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

DA24/125 Jesus refused to go outside the path of obedience. (I1)

DA25/125 While manifesting perfect trust in His Father, He would not place Himself, unbidden, in a position that would necessitate the interposition of His Father to save him from death. [H/75-77/94] (P2)

2SP94/94 But Jesus came off victor from the second temptation, by spurning the sin of presumption. (I2)

2SP95/94 While manifesting perfect trust in his Father, he refused to voluntarily place himself in such peril that it would be necessary for the Father to display divine power in order to save his Son from death. [H/75-77/94] (P2)

BE(92)5 But while manifesting perfect trust in his Father, He refused to place Himself in a position which would necessitate the interposition of his Father to save Him from death. [H/75-77/94] (P2)

2RL48.6 But to do this unbidden, and to experiment upon his Father's protecting care and love, because dared by Satan to do so would not show his strength of faith. [H/77-80/94] (P2)

DA26/125 He would not force Providence to come to His rescue, and thus fail of giving man an example of trust and submission. (I1)

DA27/125 Jesus declared to Satan, "It is written again, Thou shalt not tempt the Lord thy God." (B2)

DA28/125+ These words were spoken by Moses to the children of Israel when they thirsted in the desert, and demanded that Moses should give them water, exclaiming, "Is the Lord among us, or not?" Exodus 17:7. (B2)

DA29/126 God had wrought marvelously for them; yet in trouble they doubted Him, and demanded evidence that He was with them. (I1)

75-80/94 Jesus would rely to the very uttermost upon the Divine faithfulness, upon God's promised care and help; but he would not put that faithfulness to a needless trial. If put by the devil in a position of difficulty and danger, he will cherish an unbounded trust in God, and if extrication from that position be desirable, and no other way of affecting it be left, he will even believe that God will miraculously interpose in his behalf. But he will not of his own accord, without any proper call or invitation, for no other purpose than to make an experiment of the Father's willingness to aid him, to make a show of the kind of heavenly protection he could claim; he will not voluntarily place himself in such a position. He was here on the pinnacle of the temple, from that pinnacle there was another open, easy, safe method of descent; why should he refuse to take it if he desired to descend; why fling himself into open space? If he did so unasked, unordered by God himself, what warrant could he have that the Divine power would be put forth to bear him up. God had indeed promised to bear him up, but he had not bidden him cast himself down, for no other purpose than to see whether he would be borne up or no; to do what Satan wished him to do, would be to show not the strength of his faith, but the extent of his presumption. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA30/126 In their unbelief they sought to put Him to the test. (Il)

DA31/126 And Satan was urging Christ to do the same thing. (Il)

DA32/126 God had already testified that Jesus was His Son; and now to ask for proof that He was the Son of God would be putting God's word to the test,--tempting Him. (Il)

DA33/126 And the same would be true of asking for that which God had not promised. (Il)

DA34/126 It would manifest distrust, and be really proving, or tempting, Him. (Il)

DA35/126 We should not present our petitions to God to prove whether He will fulfill His word, but because He will fulfill it; not to prove that He loves us, but because he loves us. (Il)

DA36/126 "Without faith it is impossible to please him: for he that cometh to God must believe that He is, and that He is a rewarder of them that diligently seek Him." Heb. 11.6. (Il)

DA37/126 But faith is in no sense allied to presumption. (Il)

DA38/126 For presumption is Satan's counterfeit of faith. (Il)

DA39/126 Faith claims God's promises, and brings forth fruit in obedience. (Il)

DA40/126 Presumption also claims the promises, but uses them as Satan did, to excuse transgression. (Il)

DA41/126 Faith would have led our first parents to trust the love of God, and to obey His commands. (Il)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA42/126 Presumption led them to transgress His law, believing that His great love would save them from the consequence of their sin. (I1)

DA43/126 It is not faith that claims the favor of Heaven without complying with the conditions on which mercy is to be granted. (I1)

DA44/126 Genuine faith has its foundation in the promises and provisions of the Scriptures. (I1)

DA45/126 Often when Satan has failed of exciting distrust, he succeeds in leading us to presumption. (I1)

DA46/126 If he can cause us to place ourselves unnecessarily in the way of temptation, he knows that the victory is his. (I1)

DA47/126 God will preserve all who walk in the path of obedience; but to depart from it is to venture on Satan's ground. (I1)

DA48/126 There we are sure to fall. (I1)

DA49/126 The Saviour has bidden us, "Watch ye and pray, lest ye enter into temptation." Mark 14:38. (B2)

DA50/126 Meditation and prayer would keep us from rushing unbidden into the way of danger, and thus we should be saved from many a defeat. [H/153/98] (I2)

Lt(1a)4 There are many who profess to be followers of Christ, claiming by their faith to be enlisted in the warfare against all evil in their nature, yet who, with hardly a thought, plunge into scenes of temptation that would require a miracle to bring them forth unsullied. [H/151/98] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

[See following page]

151/98 Or what again shall we say of him who, fairly committed to the faith of Christ, and embarked in the great effort of overcoming all that is evil in his evil nature, plunges, with scarce a thought, into scenes and amid temptations such that it would need a miracle to bring him forth unscathed? [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Lt(1a)6 The promises of God are not for us to claim rashly, to protect us while we rush on recklessly into danger, violating the laws of nature, or disregarding prudence and the judgment God has given us to use. [H/153/98]
(P1)

3T482.65 God's precious promises are not given to strengthen man in a presumptuous course or for him to rely upon when he rushes needlessly into danger. [H/153/98] (P2)

DA51/126 Yet we should not lose courage when assailed by temptation. (11)

DA52/126 Often when placed in a trying situation we doubt that the Spirit of God has been leading us. (11)

DA53/126 But it was the Spirit's leading that brought Jesus into the wilderness to be tempted by Satan. (11)

DA54/126 When God brings us into trial, He has a purpose to accomplish for our good. (11)

DA55/126+ Jesus did not presume on God's promises by going unbidden into temptation, neither did He give up to despondency when temptation came upon Him. (11)

DA56/129 Nor should we. (11)

DA57/129 "God is faithful, who will not suffer you to be tempted above that ye are able; but will with the temptation also make a way to escape, that ye may be able to bear it." (B2)

DA58/129 He says, "Offer unto God thanksgiving; and pay thy vows unto the Most High: and call upon Me in the day of trouble: I will deliver thee, and thou shalt glorify Me." 1 Cor. 10:13; Ps. 50:14, 15. (B2)

DA59/129 Jesus was victor in the second temptation, and now Satan manifests himself in his true character. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

153/98 Many and most precious indeed are the promises of Divine protection and support given us in the word of God, but they are not for us to rest on if recklessly and needlessly we rush into danger, crossing any of the common laws of nature, or trampling the dictates of ordinary prudence and the lesson of universal experience beneath our feet. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA60/129 But he does not appear as a hideous monster, with cloven feet and bat's wings. (I1)

DA61/129 He is a mighty angel, though fallen. (I1)

DA62/129 He avows himself the leader of rebellion and the god of this world. (I1)

DA63/129 Placing Jesus upon a high mountain, Satan caused the kingdoms of the world, in all their glory, to pass in panoramic view before Him. (B2)

DA64/129 The sunlight lay on templed cities, marble palaces, fertile fields, and fruit-laden vineyards. (I1)

DA65/129 The traces of evil were hidden. (I1)

DA66/129 The eyes of Jesus, so lately greeted by gloom and desolation, now gazed upon a scene of unsurpassed loveliness and prosperity. (I2)

2RL52.2 The eye of Jesus for a moment rested upon the glory presented before him; but he turned away, and refused to look upon the entrancing spectacle. [H/121,122/97] (P1)

2RL51.55 This last temptation was the most alluring of the three. [H/94/95] (P1)

2SP116a/96 The eyes of Jesus rested for a moment upon the scene before him; he then turned resolutely from it, refusing to dally with the tempter by even looking upon the enchanting prospect he had presented to him; [H/121,122/97] (P2)

2SP112/96 This last temptation was designed to be the most alluring of all. [H/94/95] (P2)

DA67/129 Then the tempter's voice was heard: "All this power will I give Thee, and the glory of them: for that is delivered unto me; and to whomsoever I will I give it. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

121-122/97 The eye of Jesus may for a moment have been dazzled by the offer made, and this implied neither imperfection nor sin, but it refused to rest upon the seducing spectacle. It turned quickly and resolutely away. No sooner is the bribe offered than it is repelled. [Hanna, LC]

94/95 The third, had, however, a special adaptation to Christ's personal character and position at the time, and this very adaptation lent to it peculiar strength, making it, as it was the last, so also the most insidious, the most alluring of the three. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA68/129 If Thou therefore wilt worship me, all shall be Thine." (B2)

DA69/129 Christ's mission could be fulfilled only through suffering. (I1)

2SP111/95+ He promised to put Christ in possession of all the kingdoms without suffering or peril, if he would make one concession, and that was to acknowledge Satan his superior, and pay him homage.
[H/106,108/96] (P2)

DA70/129 Before Him was a life of sorrow, hardship, and conflict, and an ignominious death. (I1)

DA71/129 He must bear the sins of the whole world. (I1)

DA72/129 He must endure separation from His Father's love. (I1)

DA73/129 Now the tempter offered to yield up the power he had usurped. (I1)

DA74/129 Christ might deliver Himself from the dreadful future by acknowledging the supremacy of Satan. (I1)

DA75/129 But to do this was to yield the victory in the great controversy. (I1)

DA76/129 It was in seeking to exalt himself above the Son of God that Satan had sinned in heaven. (I1)

DA77/129 Should he prevail now, it would be the triumph of rebellion. (I1)

DA78/129 When Satan declared to Christ, The kingdom and glory of the world are delivered unto me, and to whomsoever I will I give it, he stated what was true only in part, and he declared it to serve his own purpose of deception. (I1)

106, 108/96 He will offer them all to him at once, without a single blow being struck, a single peril encountered, a single suffering endured. . . . In one great gift he will make over his whole right of empire over these kingdoms of the world to Christ, suffer him at once to enter upon possession of them, and clothe himself with all their glory. This is his glittering bribe, and all he asks in return is that Jesus shall do him homage as the superior by whom the splendid fief was given, and under whom it is held. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA79/129 Satan's dominion was that wrested from Adam, but Adam was the vicerent of the Creator. (11)

DA80/129 His was not an independent rule. (11)

DA81/129 The earth is God's, and He has committed all things to His Son. (11)

DA82/129 Adam was to reign subject to Christ. (11)

DA83/129 When Adam betrayed his sovereignty into Satan's hands, Christ still remained the rightful King. (11)

DA84/129+ Thus the Lord had said to King Nebuchadnezzar, "The Most High ruleth in the kingdom of men, and giveth it to whomsoever He will." Dan. 4:17. (11)

DA85/130 Satan can exercise his usurped authority only as God permits. (11)

DA86/130 When the tempter offered to Christ the kingdom and glory of the world, he was proposing that Christ should yield up the real kingship of the world, and hold dominion subject to Satan. (11)

DA87/130 This was the same dominion upon which the hopes of the Jews were set. (11)

DA88/130 They desired the kingdom of this world. (11)

DA89/130 If Christ had consented to offer them such a kingdom, they would gladly have received Him. (11)

DA90/130 But the curse of sin, with all its woe, rested upon it. (11)

DA91/130 Christ declared to the tempter, "Get thee behind Me, Satan: for it is written, Thou shalt worship the Lord thy God, and Him only shalt thou serve." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA92/130 By the one who had revolted in heaven the kingdoms of this world were offered Christ, to buy His homage to the principles of evil; but He would not be bought; He had come to establish a kingdom of righteousness, and He would not abandon His purpose. [H/108/96] (I2)

DA93/130 With the same temptation Satan approaches men, and here he has better success than with Christ. (I1)

DA94/130 To men he offers the kingdom of this world on condition that they will acknowledge his supremacy. (I1)

DA95/130 He requires that they sacrifice integrity, disregard conscience, indulge selfishness. (I1)

DA96/130 Christ bids them seek first the kingdom of God, and His righteousness; but Satan walks by their side and says: Whatever may be true in regard to life eternal, in order to make a success in this world you must serve me. (I1)

DA97/130 I hold your welfare in my hands. (I1)

DA98/130 I can give you riches, pleasures, honor, and happiness. [H/156a/99] (P2)

Lt(1a)10 But Satan comes to us with worldly honor, wealth, and the pleasures of life.
[H/156a/99] (P1)

Lt(1a)11 These temptations are varied to meet men of every rank and degree, tempting them away from God to serve themselves more than their Creator. [H/156b/99] (P1)

Lt(1a)13 "All these things will I give thee," says Satan to man. [H/157a/99] (P1)

Lt(1a)14 "All this money, this land, all this power, and honor, and riches, will I give thee;" and man is charmed, deceived, and treacherously allured on to his ruin.
[H/157b/99] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

108/9 In one great gift he will make over his whole right of empire over these kingdoms of the world to Christ, suffer him at once to enter upon possession of them, and clothe himself with all their glory. This is his glittering bribe, and all he asks in return is that Jesus shall do him homage as the superior by whom the splendid fief was given, and under whom it is held. [Hanna, LC]

156a/99 Thrones and kingdoms, and all their glory, are not held out to us, but the wealth and the distinctions, the honors and the pleasures of life-- [Hanna, LC]

156b/99 these in different forms, in different degrees, ply with their solicitations all of us in every rank, from the highest to the lowest, tempting us away from God to worship and serve the creature more than the creator, who is blessed for evermore. [Hanna, LC]

157a/99 A spectacle not so wide, less gorgeous in its coloring, but as sensuous, as illusive as that presented to Jesus on the mountain-top, the arch-deceiver spreads out before our eyes, whispering to our hearts, "All this will I give you;" [Hanna, LC]

157b/99 all this money, all that ease, all that pleasure, all that rank, all that power; but in saying so he deals with us more treacherously than he dealt with Christ of old. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA99/130 Hearken to my counsel. (11)

DA100/130 Do not allow yourselves to be carried away with whimsical notions of honesty or self-sacrifice. (11)

DA101/130 I will prepare the way before you. (11)

DA102/130 Thus multitudes are deceived. (11)

DA103/130 They consent to live for the service of self, and Satan is satisfied. (11)

Lt(1a)15 If we give ourselves up to worldliness of heart and of life, Satan is satisfied. [H/159/99] (P2)

DA104/130 While he allures them with the hope of worldly dominion, he gains dominion over the soul. (11)

DA105/130 But he offers that which is not his to bestow, and which is soon to be wrested from him. (11)

DA106/130 In return he beguiles them of their title to the inheritance of the sons of God. (11)

DA107/130 Satan had questioned whether Jesus was the Son of God. (11)

DA108/130 In his summary dismissal he had proof that he could not gainsay. (11)

2RL54.1 Satan had asked Christ to give him evidence that he was the Son of God, and he had in this instance the proof he had asked. [H/125a/97] (P2)

DA109/130 Divinity flashed through suffering humanity. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

159/99 He asks from us no bending of the knee, no act of outward worship; all he asks is, that we believe his false promises, and turn away from God and Christ to give ourselves up to worldliness of heart and habit and pursuit.
[Hanna, LC]

125a/97 Satan had wanted Jesus to give him some proof of his divine power, and now he gets it; [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA110/130 Satan had no power to resist the command.
[H/125b/97] (P2)

2RL54.15 At the divine command of Christ, he was
compelled to obey. [H/125b/97] (P1)

DA111/130 Writhing with humiliation and rage, he was forced
to withdraw from the presence of the world's Redeemer. (I1)

DA112/130 Christ's victory was as complete as had been the
failure of Adam. (I1)

DA113/130 So we may resist temptation, and force Satan to
depart from us. (I2)

Lt(1a)16 The Saviour overcame the wily foe,
showing us how we may overcome. [H/161/99]
(P2)

Lt(1a)17 He has left us His example, to repel
Satan with Scripture. [H/163/99] (P3)

Lt(1a)18 He might have had recourse to His
own divine power and used His own words, but
His example would not then have been as useful
to us. [H/166,167/99] (P1)

DA114/130+ Jesus gained the victory through submission and
faith in God, and by the apostle He says to us, "Submit
yourselves therefore to God. (I1)

DA115/131 Resist the devil, and he will flee from you.
(I1)

DA116/131 Draw nigh to God, and He will draw nigh to you."
James 4:7, 8. (I1)

DA117/131 We cannot save ourselves from the tempter's
power; he has conquered humanity, and when we try to stand
in our own strength, we shall become a prey to his devices;
but "the name of the Lord is a strong tower: the righteous
runneth into it, and is safe." Prov. 18:10. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

125b/97 gets it as that command is given which he must instantly obey. [Hanna, LC]

161/99 But if it be to the very same temptations as those which beset our Lord and Master, that we are still exposed, let us be grateful to him for teaching us how to overcome them. [Hanna, LC]

163/99 He had the whole armory of heaven at his command; but he chose only one instrument of defence, the word, the written word, that sword of the spirit. [Hanna, LC]

166,167/99 He did not need to have recourse to it. A word of his own spoken would have had as much power as a written one quoted; but then the lesson of his example had been lost to us--the evidence that he himself has left behind of the power over temptation that lies in the written word. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA118/131 Satan trembles and flees before the weakest soul who finds refuge in that mighty name. (11)

DA119/131 After the foe had departed, Jesus fell exhausted to the earth, with the pallor of death upon His face. (11)

DA120/131 The angels of heaven had watched the conflict, beholding their loved Commander as He passed through inexpressible suffering to make a way of escape for us. (11)

DA121/131 He had endured the test, greater than we shall ever be called to endure. (11)

DA122/131 The angels now ministered to the Son of God as He lay like one dying. (11)

DA123/131 He was strengthened with food, comforted with the message of His Father's love and the assurance that all heaven triumphed in His victory. (11)

DA124/131 Warming to life again, His great heart goes out in sympathy for man, and He goes forth to complete the work He has begun; to rest not until the foe is vanquished, and our fallen race redeemed. (11)

DA125/131 Never can the cost of our redemption be realized until the redeemed shall stand with the Redeemer before the throne of God. (11)

DA126/131 Then as the glories of the eternal home burst upon our enraptured senses we shall remember that Jesus left all this for us, that He not only became an exile from the heavenly courts, but for us took the risk of failure and eternal loss. (11)

DA127/131 Then we shall cast our crowns at his feet, and raise the song, "Worthy is the Lamb that was slain to receive power, and riches, and wisdom, and strength, and honor, and glory, and blessing." Rev. 5:12. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

PRE-DESIRE OF AGES WRITINGS OF ELLEN WHITE NOT UTILIZED IN
THE DA TEXT

This special section of Ellen White texts, along with their literary source parallels, has been added to allow us further to demonstrate Ellen White's use of sources in her writings on the life of Christ. We did not include this material under the DA text presentation because the Ellen White text is not close enough in verbal similarity to indicate it was used in the composition of the DA text, even though her material reflects the same general content of this chapter.

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

The introduction to this research report has clearly shown that The Desire of Ages was not entirely an original composition. This life of Christ project was first designed to be a revision of The Spirit of Prophecy text based primarily upon the writings of Ellen White completed since the publication of the SP text. Our research has also pointed out that where Ellen White had not commented on the life of Christ, Marian Davis would often suggest additional material be provided. These new manuscripts would not be the DA text, but rather writings to be added to the collection of texts from which the DA chapter was to be constructed. These earlier writings naturally, therefore, provide the clearest evidence as to the nature and extent of Ellen White's use of literary sources.

In this special section we present evidence of literary dependency from three sources. As explained earlier, by our separating the previous writings from the DA text presentation we can list the full text portion treating our general topic in its original sequence without disturbing the DA text format.

The first part of this section will include additional sentences from the Redemption Leaflets and SP, Vol. II, not included with the DA text because we were not sure where these earlier texts were to be inserted to match the DA content.

Fifty consecutive sentences in the sequence, in which

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

they appear in Book 14 of Ellen White's diary journals, follow the Redemption Leaflets sentences. This section of the Ellen White text apparently carries the title, "Christ's Humiliation," and treats the temptations of Christ in a general fashion. The diary is dated 1890--hence the reference symbol Di(90). The text begins on page 272 of the diary, though the sentences we have selected for presentation here start with sentence 15, found on page 274. After sentence 43 on page 281, there appears to be a break in the diary material. Page 282 carries the date of January 4, 1890, and treats another subject. Since Ellen White returns to the topic of Christ's humiliation on page 283, we continue to list the sentences as they appear in the diary.¹ At this point another break occurs in the diary, and the "Humiliation of Christ" theme is picked up again on page 293 and continues to the top of page 295.² These pages of the diary furnish the text for sentences 56-64 of our presentation.

We have made our typescript of Ellen White's handwritten text preserving for the reader spelling errors and textual form. Through this presentation the reader will be able personally to evaluate Ellen White as a writer, noting her literary style and use of sources.

We have not presented the uncorrected text of Ellen

¹This material is found in sentences 44-50. Page 283 begins with sentence 51 and ends with 55.

²Pages 284-290 contain another diary entry for January 4, 1890, and pages 291 and 292 are blank.

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

White to emphasize her errors. To the contrary, Ellen White may be seen to be a very able writer on her own. Our intention was to allow Ellen White to be read as Ellen White, and to avoid any confusion over just what changes in the text were made by us, had we undertaken to present a corrected text.

The full text of these portions of Diary Book 14 may be found in Appendix D. We have included photocopies of the original manuscript as well as our typescript. Sentence numbers as we have divided the text have been inserted for the convenience of the reader.

A second series of sentences from an Ellen White diary completes this special section on pre-DA writings on the temptations of Christ. These final 139 sentences are from Book 32 and are identified as Di(99).¹ Sentence 1 is found at the top of page 5 of the diary where the following notation also appears, "Copied for L. C." (Copied for Life of Christ).² Evidently this material formed part of Marian Davis' collection on the life of Christ even though it was not selected for the published DA text. Our text represents our best efforts to reproduce the handwritten text of Ellen

¹Since the diary carries the date of 1899 we have maintained the 1899 date in our identification of this diary material. We do know from comparing the 1897 manuscript and Signs article of 1898, that this diary material was written before 1899, and therefore before the publication of the DA in 1898. A single Ellen White diary book often contained material from several different years. The reference to 1889 on page 25 of the diary suggests the text was written at that time.

²The earlier pages have to do with Christ fulfilling the prophecy of Genesis 49:10.

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

White. In some places we have made the sentence divisions and regularized punctuation and capitalization accordingly. Photocopies of the diary pages from which our sentences have been taken may be found in Appendix D. The handwritten text contains interlinear changes and corrections which are of interest.

These comments on the temptations of Christ were also utilized to some degree in an Ellen G. White manuscript which was copied on December 9, 1897, and carries the stamped signature of Ellen White.¹ We have included this document in Appendix D to establish the fact that the diary material must have been written earlier than 1899, as it is dated, and to demonstrate how the writings of Ellen White were edited to serve various needs of the church.² In this manuscript entitled, "Christ's Mission to Earth," Ellen White ranges over the life of Christ, touching on the meaning of his incarnation, temptation, and teachings. Because only scattered references to the temptation appear in this document, we did not list them in the text presentation.

A third stage in the development of a text tradition stemming from the diary text, appears to have been the Signs article, "Tempted in All Points Like as We Are," published about six months before The Desire of Ages was completed.³

¹The initials of the copyist, "M. V. H.," stand for Minnie Hawkins.

²See Appendix D, Introduction to Diary Book 32 for details on the correspondence between the diary and MS 143.

³Signs of the Times, June 9, 1898. The manuscript sent

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

We have included sentences from this article in our text presentation under the symbol of ST(98) followed by the sentence number. When the text of the diary has been duplicated exactly, we have not included it in our text. We do, however, list the sentence number where the sentence is repeated in the Signs article. The complete text of the article may be found in Appendix D where we use the reprint from Selected Messages, Volume I.¹

The primary value of these documents for our study lies in the evidence they provide for Ellen White's personal use of literary sources in her writings on the temptations of Christ. We should not overlook, however, their importance for our investigations into the issue of Ellen White's use of literary assistants. A comparison of the original diary material with MS 143, 1897, and the Signs article reveals that these literary assistants were really editors. Sentences, even parts of sentences, have been divided, recombined, omitted, or whatever. The basic content remains, but a new composition in form and style emerges.

The literary sources, used in the writings on Christ's temptation include those also used in chapters 3 and 10. But in addition to the works on Christ by Fleetwood, Hanna, and Harris, Ellen White in this chapter uses a sermon of Henry Melvill and selections from Glory of the Redeemer by

to the Signs was prepared by Minnie Hawkins and carries the date of March 28, 1897 (Article File, 1898, #13).

¹Selected Messages is a more accessible source than are the issues of the Signs.

Pre-DA Texts on the Temptations of Christ

Octavius Winslow.¹ Our sign for this source is [Winslow, GR1.

Walter Rea and Ron Graybill have previously called our attention to Ellen White's use of Melvill, particularly his sermon, "The First Prophecy," which is the Melvill source used in chapter 13.² We label this source as [Melvill, FPl. We are not aware of previous notice being given on Winslow. Here Ellen White is borrowing from his chapter on "The Glory of the Redeemer in His Humiliation." Three books by Winslow, including the one Ellen White used in writing on Christ's temptation, were found in her private library at the time of her death. Our brief survey of the other works led us to conclude that Ellen White probably found Winslow's devotional writings very helpful.

No attempt has been made to list all of Ellen White's use of these sources in her pre-DA writings. For example, Harris and Melvill also appear in the Ellen White letter to J. H. Kellogg, K-43-95, mentioned in our review of chapter 3 above. What we have included is adequate to support our claims for Ellen White's use of sources and to illustrate the manner in which her materials were edited for publication.

¹Winslow, Octavius, The Glory of the Redeemer in His Person and Work (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1855)

²In 1982, the Ellen G. White Estate published a report on Ellen White's use of Melvill, "Henry Melvill and Ellen G. White: A Study in Literary and Theological Relationships" by Ron Graybill, Warren H. Johns, and Tim Poirier. Our text of Melvill's sermon is taken from Melvill, Henry, Sermons, ed. by C. P. McIlvaine, 3rd edition (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1844), pp. 9-19.

1RL2/48 Christ's human nature endured the pangs of hunger. [F/50.9] (P2)

1RL3/48 While emaciated and suffering, Satan came to him with a covering of light, as one of the bright angels from glory, hoping to deceive and ensnare the Son of God, whom he regarded as his rival. (11)

1RL4/48 Satan reasoned with Christ thus: If the words spoken after his baptism were indeed the words of God, that he was the Son of God, he need not bear the sensations of hunger; he could give him proofs of his divinity by showing his power in changing the stones of that barren wilderness into bread: "If thou be the Son of God, command that these stones be made bread." [F/50.9] (P2)

1RL6/48 Christ meets Scripture with Scripture, by citing the words of Moses, "Man shall not live by bread alone; but by every word that proceedeth out of the mouth of God." [F/51.3] (B1)

1RL9/48 Being defeated here, Satan tries another device. [F/51.5] (P1)

1RL13/49 Satan, by an insulting taunt, urged Christ to prove his mission by casting himself down from the high eminence whereon he had placed him, declaring that God had promised that angels should bear him up. [F/52.2] (P2)

1RL28/50 This presumptuous blasphemy, and insult to Jehovah, excited the indignation of Christ, and led him to exercise his divine authority, and command Satan in an authoritative, dignified manner to desist. [F/51.9] (P1)

2RL39.7 He found Christ in the desolate wilderness without companions, without food, and in actual suffering. [H/44/91] (P3)

50.9+ But, at the expiration of the forty days, when the blessed Jesus had endured the keenest hunger, the tempter, to make proof of the divinity of his mission, insolently demanded why he bore the sensations of hunger, since, if he was the Son of God, he must have power to change the stones of that dreary wilderness into bread. [Fleetwood, LC]

51.3 But our blessed Saviour repelled his device by citing the words of Moses, which implied that God, whenever it seemed good in his sight, could, by extraordinary means provide for the support of the human race. "Man shall not live by bread alone, but by every word of God." Luke iv. 4. [Fleetwood, LC]

51.5 Satan, being defeated in his effort, took him to the top of a very high mountain, and, thinking to work on him by another artifice . . . [Fleetwood, LC]

52.2 . . . by a taunt of insolence, urged him to prove the truth of his mission by casting himself down from thence, citing, as an encouragement for him to comply with his desire a text from the Psalms: [Fleetwood, LC]

51.9 This blasphemy, as well as insolence, incited the blessed Jesus to exert his divine authority and command him, in a peremptory manner, to desist. [Fleetwood, LC]

44/91 'If thou be really the Son of God, as I have so lately heard thee called--but canst thou be? can it be here, and thus, alone in these desert places, foodless, companionless, comfortless, for so many days, that God would leave or trust his son? [Hanna, LC]

2RL39.9 He hoped to shake the confidence of Christ in his Father, who had permitted him to be brought into this condition of extreme suffering in the desert, where the feet of man had never trod.
[H/48/92] (P2)

2RL47.7 He admitted that he was right in the wilderness, in his faith and confidence that God was his Father under the most trying circumstances.
[H/63,64/93] (P2)

2RL47.8 He then urged Christ to give him one more proof of his entire dependence upon God, one more evidence of his faith that he was the Son of God, by casting himself from the temple. [H/65/93] (P3)

2SP93/94 Satan was well aware that if Christ could be prevailed upon to fling himself from the temple, in order to prove his claim to the protection of his Heavenly Father, he would by that very act, exhibit the weakness of human nature. [H/68/93] (I2)

2RL52.3 When Satan solicited homage, Christ's divine indignation was aroused, and he could no longer tolerate his blasphemous assumption, or even permit him to remain in his presence. [H/124/97] (P2)

ELLEN WHITE DIARY BOOK 14, 1889-1890

Di(90)15 He was face to face not with a hideous monster as is represented with bats [sic] wings and cloven feet but a beautiful angel of light apparently just from the presence of God, and his deceiving powers which was [sic] so great that the third of the heavenly angels were induced to believe him to be right and unite with him against God and his Son Jesus Christ. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

48/92 The temptation is here twofold: to shake if possible Christ's confidence in Him who had brought him into such a condition of extreme need, and to induce him, under the influence of that distrust, to exert at once his own power to deliver himself, to work a miracle to provide himself with food. [Hanna, LC]

63, 64, 65, 68/93 "I acknowledge that you have been right in the wilderness, that you have acted as a true Son of the Father. You have given, in fact, no mean proof of your entire confidence in him as your Father. . . But come, I ask you now to make another and still more striking display of your dependence in all possible conjunctures on the Divine aid. . . .as you fling yourself into the yielding air; [Hanna, LC]

124/97 . . . in anger too at the base condition coupled with the bribe, and as if he who offered it could no longer be suffered to remain in his presence he calls the devil by his name, and says: "Get thee hence, Satan;. . . [Hanna, LC]

Di(90)16 And now was Satan's personal contact in this world with Christ of a most determined character [sic] for if Satan succeeded here in his strong and wily efforts he was conqueror and the Prince of the World [sic] but all his claims to the kingdoms of the world he knew was [sic] false and could not be sustained unless he should overcome Christ. (I1)

Di(90)17 It is impossible to take in the depth [sic] and the force of these temptations unless the Lord shall bring man where he can open these scenes before him by a revelation of the matter and then compassed with humanity it can only be but partially comprehended. (I1)

Di(90)18 His assaults were prepared for the circumstances in accordance [sic] with the exalted character [sic] with which he had to deal. (I1)

Di(90)19 If he gains the victory in the first temptation he would secure him in all the rest [sic] (I1)

Di(90)20 Satan had never aimed his darts at so shining a mark. [W/78/132] (P1)

Di(90)21 Our Lords [sic] trial and test and proving shows that he could yield to these temptations else the battle was all a farce. [W/81/132] (P2)

Di(90)22 But he did not yield to the solicitation of the enemy thus evidencing that the human nature of man united with the divine nature by faith may be strong and withstand Satans [sic] temptations. [W/81/132] (I2)

Di(90)23 Christ [sic] perfect humanity is the same that man may have through connection with Christ. [W/81/132] (I2)

Di(90)24 As God Christ could not be tempted any more than he was not tempted from his allegiance [sic] in heaven [W/82/132] (I2)

Di(90)25 But as Christ humbled himself to the nature of man he could be tempted. [W/82/132] (I2)

78/132 Never were the assaults of the prince of darkness more fearful, never were his fiery darts more surely aimed and powerfully winged, and never had so shining a mark presented itself as the object of his attack than now.
[Winslow, GR]

81/132 Our Lord's exposure to temptation, and his consequent capability of yielding to its solicitations, has its foundation in his perfect humanity. [Winslow, GR]

82/132 It surely requires not an argument to show that, as God, he could not be tempted, but that, as man, he could.
[Winslow, GR]

Di(90)26 He had not taken on him even the nature of the angels but humanity perfectly identical with our own nature except without the taint of sin.
[W/83,84/132] (P1)

Di(90)27 A human body [sic] a human mind [sic] with all the peculiar properties [sic] he was bone [sic] brain and muscle [sic] a man of our flesh.
[W/85,86a/132,133] (P1)

Di(90)28 He was compassed with the weakness of humanity and the circumstances of his life was [sic] of that charicter [sic] that he was exposed to all the inconvenience [sic] that belong to men [sic] not in wealth or in ease [sic] but in poverty and want and humiliation. [W/86c/133] (I2)

Di(90)29 He breathed the very air man must breath [sic] [W/87/133] (P1)

Di(90)30 he [sic] trod our earth as man [sic] [W/87/133] (P1)

Di(90)31 He had reason [sic] conscience [sic] memory [sic] will and affections of the human soul which was united with his divine nature. [W/89/133] (P1)

Di(90)32 Our lord [sic] was tempted as man is tempted [sic] [W/90/133] (P1)

Di(90)33 he [sic] was capable of yielding to temptations as are human beings. [W/91/133] (P1)

Di(90)34 His finite nature was pure and spotless but the divine nature that led him to say to Philip he [sic] that hath seen me hath seen the Father [sic] also was not humanized [sic] neither was humanity deified by the blending or union of the two natures [W/92-94/133] (I2)

Di(90)35 each [sic] retained its essential charicter [sic] and properties. [W/95/133] (V2)

Di(90)36 But here we must not become in our ideas common and earthly and in our perverted ideas we must not think that the liability of Christ to yield to Satans [sic] temptation degrades his humanity and he possesses the same sinful corrupt propensities as man. [W/96/133] (I2)

83,84/132 His inferior nature was finite and created; it was not angelic, it was human. It was perfectly identical with our own,--in its entire exemption from all taint of sin, only excepted. [Winslow, GR]

85,86a/132 A human body and a human mind were his, with all their essential and peculiar properties. He was "bone of our bone, and flesh of our flesh:" [Winslow, GR]

86c/133 he was encompassed with all the weaknesses, surrounded by all the circumstances, exposed to all the inconveniences, that belong to our nature. [Winslow, GR]

87/133 He breathed our air, trod our earth, ate our food. [Winslow, GR]

89/133 Reason, conscience, memory, will, affections, were essential appendages of that human soul which the Son of God took into union with his Divine. [Winslow, GR]

90/133 As such, then, our Lord was tempted. [Winslow, GR]

91/133 As such, too, he was capable of yielding. [Winslow, GR]

92-94/133 His finite nature, though pure and sinless, was yet necessarily limited in its resources, and weak in its own powers. Touching his inferior nature, he was but man. The Godhead, as I have before remarked, was not humanized,--nor was the humanity deified, by the blending together of the two natures. [Winslow, GR]

95/133 Each retained its essential character, properties, and attributes, distinct, unchanged, and unchangeable. [Winslow, GR]

96/133 But let no one suppose that a liability in Jesus to yield to Satan's temptation, necessarily implies the existence of the same sinful and corrupt nature which we possess. [Winslow, GR]

Di(90)37 The divine nature combined with the human made him capable of yielding to Satans [sic] temptations [W/98/133] (I2)

Di(90)38 here [sic] the test to Christ was far greater than that of Adam and Eve, for Christ took our nature fallen but not corrupted; and would not be corrupted unless he received the words [of] Satan in the place of the words of God (I1)

Di(90)39 [The concept that he] was not capable of yielding to temptation places him where he cannot be a perfect example for man and the force and the power of this part of Christ [sic] humiliation [sic] which is the most eventful [sic] is no instruction or help to human beings. [W/98/133] (P2)

Di(90)40 But the facts of this history is [sic] not a fable but a living [?] active [?] experience [sic] and would rob Jesus of his greatest glory [sic] allegiance [sic] to God which enshrouded him as a garment in this world on the field of battle with the relentless foe [W/99/133+] (P2)

Di(90)41 and [sic] he is not reckoned with the transgressor because he descended in his humiliation to be tempted as man would be tempted and his nature was that of man capable of yielding to temptation [W/100a/134] (I2)

Di(90)42 His very purity and loveliness [sic] was [sic] assailed by a fallen foe [sic] the very one that he [sic] became corrupted and been [sic] ejected from Heaven [W/109b/135] (P1)

Di(90)43 How deeply and cruelly must Christ have felt this humiliation. . . . [W/110/135] (P1)

Di(90)44 If we only knew the result of our course of action on others [sic] characters [sic], how precious would be regarded our present opportunities, of doing good in the service of the Master in winning souls to Christ. (I1)

Di(90)45 Many, many opportunities are passed carelessly by when had we known it was our last opportunity we would have had to use our entrusted talents [sic] by presenting [winning?] invitations to the ones with whom we associate to come to [thel] Saviour for pardon and forgiveness of sins [sic] (I1)

98/133 To deny his capability of succumbing to temptation, were to neutralize the force, beauty, and instruction of this eventful part of his history altogether. [Winslow, GR]

99/133 It were to reduce a splendid fact to an empty fable, a blessed reality to a vague supposition; it were to rob Jesus of the great glory which covered him when left alone, the victor on this battle-field. [Winslow, GR]

100a/134 And yet, that he must necessarily be sinful in order to be thus capable of yielding, does not follow; [Winslow, GR]

109b/134 his reverence for, and allegiance to his Father assailed, and his very purity tampered with by a fallen and corrupt spirit whom he had ejected from heaven? [Winslow, GR]

110/135 Ah, how deeply and keenly he must have felt it to be so, the first moment he was brought into contact with this arch-fiend, and subtle foe of God and man! [Winslow, GR]

Di(90)46 When we look upon the faces that no longer recognize us who are passing from us into eternity. [sic] What [sic] thoughts will suggest themselves of improved opportunities [sic] (11)

Di(90)47 Let us each resolve to live each day as though that day was [sic] our last for ourselves; [sic] the last that we have to impress their minds [sic] (11)

Di(90)48 how [sic] much sorrow would be saved us [sic] how many keen regrets (11)

Di(90)49 We need to connect ourselves closely with Jesus Christ and receive that we may give to others (11)

Di(90)50 we [sic] need his blessing upon us always [?] that we shall not hurt or bruise one of God's little ones. (11)

Di(90)51 Christ's humiliation (11)

Di(90)52 How do angels fallen look upon this pure and uncontaminated [?] One. [sic] the Prince of life [sic] through the different stages of his humiliation when they look upon the scene, [sic] the Son of the Living God humiliated to take upon himself the nature of man, and meet the strong man armed with all his weapons of deception and falsehood to overcome Jesus Christ, (11)

Di(90)53 and [sic] every victory gained how precious it is (11)

Di(90)54 It is in behalf of the human family exalting [sic] elevating [sic] ennobling the Workmanship of God (11)

Di(90)55 and [sic] Satan that has been at work for centuries to do the work of degrading [sic] debasing and prostituting [?] all his powers to do his hellish work. . . . (11)

Di(90)56 The Humanity of Christ received the fallen foe and engaged in battle with him (11)

Di(90)57 he [sic] was sustained in that conflict by divine power just as man will be sustained by his being a partaker of the divine nature. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Di(90)58 He gained victory after victory as our champion [sic] the Captain of our Salvation (11)

Di(90)59 and [sic] the divine approval of God and all the universe of heaven flowed into his soul (11)

Di(90)60 his [sic] nature was shocked almost unto death but the heavenly angels ministered unto the suffering one [W/113b,113c/135] (12)

Di(90)61 All heaven rejoiced because humanity [sic] the workmanship of God [sic] was placed in an elevated scale with God (11)

Di(90)62 by [sic] the signal victory gained Christ was more than conqueror [sic] leaving the way open that man may be more than conqueror through Christs [sic] merits because he loved [?] him [W/113d/135] (12)

Di(90)63 The Son of the Infinite God is brought into the tenderest sympathies with the tempted church. [W/113e/135] (P1)

Di(90)64 He knows how to succor those who shall be tempted because he was himself tempted. (11)

E. G. WHITE DIARY, BOOK 32, 1899

[The following 139 sentences from Diary Book 32 were penned at least as early as June, 1898, though more likely in 1897. The designation, ST(98)11 stands for sentence 11 in the Signs article of 1898. The text of the Signs article is quoted when it differs from the diary text. When the two texts are identical we merely indicate the reference in the Signs article where the same sentence appears.]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

113b,113c/135 the shock which his humanity sustained,--the mighty power by which he was upheld,-- [Winslow, GR]

113d/135 the signal victory which he achieved,--the Divine consolation and comfort which flowed into his soul as his vanquished enemy retired from the conflict, leaving him more than conqueror,-- [Winslow, GR]

113e/135 and above all, the close and tender sympathy into which he was now brought with the tempted church! [Winslow, GR]

Di(99)1 The temptation in the wilderness was a most trying ordeal. (I1)

Di(99)2 What a picture was this for Heaven to look upon. (I1)

ST(98)11 What a sight was this for Heaven to look upon! (I1)

Di(99)3 Christ who knew not the least moral taint of defilement or sin took our nature in its deteriorated condition which was humiliation indeed greater than finite man can comprehend. [W/43,46/128,129] (I2)

ST(98)12 Christ, who knew not the least taint of sin or defilement, took our nature in its deteriorated condition. [W/43,46/128,129] (P2)

ST(98)13 This was humiliation greater than finite man can comprehend. (I1)

Di(99)4 He was holy, harmless, undefiled; separate from sin and sinners. [W/44/128] (V2)

Di(99)5 There must be not the faintest lines of misgiving in regard to the perfect freedom from sinfulness in the human nature of Christ. [W/45a/129] (P2)

ST(98)79 We should have no misgivings in regard to the perfect sinlessness of the human nature of Christ. [W/45a/129] (P1)

Di(99)6 Our faith must be an intelligent faith looking unto Jesus in perfect confidence in full and entire faith in the atoning sacrifice. [W/45b/29] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)80]

Di(99)7 This is essential that the soul may not be enshrouded in darkness. [W/45c/129] (P2)

[Cf. ST(98)81]

Di(99)8 The least taint of sin in Jesus Christ, Satan would have bruised his head, but he could only touch the heel. [W/46/129;M/15a.1,.2] (P2)

[Cf. ST(98)74,75]

43/128 The assumption of our nature, in its depressed and bruised condition, constituted no small feature in the abasement of the Son of God. [Winslow, GR]

46/129 As a single leak must have sunk the ark beneath the waves, so the existence of the slightest taint of sin in Jesus would have opened an inlet through which the dark billows of Divine wrath would have rolled, plunging both himself and the church he sustained in eternal woe. [Winslow, GR]

44/128+ That, in the strong language of the Holy Spirit, he was "holy, harmless, undefiled, and separate from sinners," is a truth we cannot too distinctly affirm, or too earnestly maintain. [Winslow, GR]

45a/129 The least misgiving touching the perfect sinlessness of the human nature of our Lord, [Winslow, GR]

45b/129 tends to weaken the confidence of faith in the atonement, [Winslow, GR]

45c/129 and so to enshroud in darkness the hope of the soul. [Winslow, GR]

[See 46/129 above.]

15a.1 He touched the heel, he could not touch the head of the Mediator. [Melvill, FP]

Di(99)9 Had the head beer touched, the hope of the whole race has perished. [M/15a,1,.2] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)76]

Di(99)10 Divine wrath would have come upon Christ as upon Adam, and himself, and the church would have no hope. [W/46/129] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)77,78]

Di(99)11 "He knew no sin." [W/48a/129] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)72]

Di(99)12 He was the Lamb without blemish. [W/48b/129] (V2)

[Cf. ST(98)73]

Di(99)13 This Holy Substitute is able to save to the uttermost for he presented to the wondering universe perfect and complete humility in his human character and perfect obedience to all the requirements of God. [W/49a/129] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)82]

Di(99)14 This is why repenting, believing man may be made the righteousness of God in Jesus Christ. [W/49b/129] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)84]

Di(99)15 Taking upon himself man's nature in its fallen state does not make Him in the least a participant in their sins. [W/51a,51b/129] (I2)

ST(98)69 In taking upon Himself man's nature in its fallen condition, Christ did not in the least participate in its sin. [W/51a,51b/129] (I2)

Di(99)16 Notwithstanding he is subject to infirmities and weaknesses of the flesh with which humanity was encompassed, "that it might be fulfilled which was spoken by Esaias the prophet saying, Himself took our infirmities and bear our sicknesses." [W/51b,52/129] (P1) (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)70]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

15a.2. . . if he could have profaned, by a solitary thought, the sanctuary of his soul; then it would have been the head which he had bruised; and rising triumphant over man's surety, he would have shouted, "Victory!" [Melvill, FP]

[see 46/129 above]

48a/129 He "knew no sin," [Winslow, GR]

48b/129 he was the sacrificial "Lamb without spot." [Winslow, GR]

49a/129 And because he presented to the Divine requirement a holy, unblemished, and perfect obedience and satisfaction, [Winslow, GR]

49b/129 we who believe are "made the righteousness of God in him." [Winslow, GR]

51a,51b/129 But his taking up into subsistence with his own, our nature in its fallen condition, comprehends the sinless infirmities and weaknesses with which it was identified and encompassed. [Winslow, GR]

52/129 "That it might be fulfilled which was spoken by Esaias the prophet, saying, Himself took our infirmities and bare our sicknesses." [Winslow, GR]

Di(99)17 When we contemplate that Jesus was on this earth a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief, that in order to save fallen man from eternal ruin he for our sakes became poor that we through his poverty might be made rich, it should lay in the dust all our pride and put to shame all our vanity and reveal to us our sin of self sufficiency [sic]. [W/53/129+] (12)

[Cf. ST(98)26,19]

Di(99)18 Behold him making the wants and trials and griefs and sufferings of sinful man his own. [W/53/129] (P1)

[Cf. ST(98)27]

Di(99)19 Can we not take home the lesson that God personally and sympathetically entered into humiliation of the sufferings and bruises of the soul in consequence of sin and yet he was without spot. [W/54/130] (P2)

[Cf. ST(98)28]

Di(99)20 He was touched with the feelings of our infirmities in all points tempted like as we are tempted. [W/55/130] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)71]

Di(99)21 God was manifest in the flesh. [W/29/128] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)14]

Di(99)22 He humbled himself. [W/29/128] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)15]

Di(99)23 What subject for thought deep [sic] earnest contemplation. [W/30/128] (P3)

Di(99)24 So infinitely great that he was the Majesty of heaven and he stooped so low, yet without losing one atom of his dignity or lessening in any degree his glory and yet steps still [sic] still lower, [sic] he was in his own world which he made yet in poverty in the depths of abasement and humiliation among men. [W/31,32,35/128] (P2)

[Cf. ST(98)17,18]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

53/129+ And when I see him weeping, bowed down with grief, and enduring privation, when I behold Him making the wants, and sorrow, and sufferings of others His own, what do I learn, but that my Lord and Master was truly a "Man of sorrows and acquainted with grief"? [Winslow, GR]

54/130 Is there any spectacle more affecting, than thus to behold the incarnate God, entering personally and sympathetically into all the humiliations of my poor, bruised, vile nature, and yet remaining untouched, untainted, by its sin? [Winslow, GR]

55/130 Taking my weaknesses, bearing my sicknesses, sorrowing when I sorrow, sighing when I sigh, weeping when I weep, touched with the feeling of my infirmities, in all points tempted like as I am! [Winslow, GR]

29/128 "God was manifest in the flesh,"--"He humbled himself." [Winslow, GR]

30/128 Oh, it is an amazing truth! [Winslow, GR]

31,32,35/128 So infinitely great was he, he could thus stoop without compromising his dignity, or lessening his glory. But, if possible, a step still lower did he seem to descend. . . . Here was the God-man sinking, as it were, in the depths of abasement and humiliation below the human. [Winslow, GR]

Di(99)25 He stated, "The foxes have holes and the bird [sic] of the air have nests, but the Son of man had not where to lay his head.." [W/69b/131] (B1)

[Cf. ST(98)20]

Di(99)26 He submitted to insult and mockery and contempt [sic] to ridicule [sic] to bear false statements [sic] to hear his message freighted with love and goodness and mercy misapplied, misstated, and himself called the Prince of Devils because he had the divine power to testify to his being the Son of God, for no one could do the works that he did do unless his power came from heaven. (I1)

ST(98)21 Christ submitted to insult and mockery, contempt and ridicule. (I1)

ST(98)22 He heard His message, which was fraught with love and goodness and mercy, misstated and misapplied. (I1)

ST(98)23 He heard Himself called the prince of demons, because He testified to His divine Sonship. (I1)

Di(99)27 What moved his own nation to throw such scorn upon Jesus? (I1)

Di(99)28 It was the purity and sinlessness of Christ's humanity that stirred up such Satanic hatred, because truth was revealing falsehoods. (I1)

Di(99)29 He [sic] Satan, had declared that the sin of Adam revealed that human beings could not keep the law of God, and he thus sought to carry the universe with him in this decision. (I1)

ST(98)1 After the fall of man, Satan declared that human beings were proved to be incapable of keeping the law of God, and he sought to carry the universe with him in this belief.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

69b/131 . . . "The Son of man hath not where to lay his head," was the heart-rending acknowledgment extracted from his lips. [Winslow, GR]

Di(99)30 Christ came to the earth, taking humanity and standing as man's representative, to show in the conflict and controversy with Satan that he was a liar, that man, as God created him, connected with the Father and the son, could obey every requirement of God. (11)

[Cf. ST(98)29]

Di(99)31 God speaking through his servants declares, "and his commandments are not grievous." (11)

[Cf. ST(98)30]

Di(99)32 Sin separated man from his God and, keeping or maintaining this separation, Satan's words would appear to be truth. (11)

Di(99)33 Christ came to unmask Satan and reveal him as a liar, pure truth against error. (11)

ST(98)31 It was sin that separated man from his God, and it is sin that maintains this separation. (11)

ST(98)2 Satan's words appeared to be true, and Christ came to unmask the deceiver. (11)

Di(99)34 Christ came that through trial and disputing of Satan's claims in the great conflict, he should demonstrate the matter, that a ransom had been found, that no less than the Majesty of heaven would undertake in man's behalf, taking man's nature and with the same facilities that man may obtain, he will stand the test and proving of God as man must stand the same test and trial. (11)

ST(98)3 The Majesty of heaven undertook the cause of man, and, with the same facilities that man may obtain, withstood the temptations of Satan as man must withstand them. (11)

Di(99)35 Divinity and humanity combined, he was victor, and man was not left in his human strength in the warfare with Satan, but divine power was placed upon man that, at the seeking and asking of man, man may become a partaker of the divine nature, "let him take hold of my strength and make peace with me and he shall make peace with me, saith the Lord." (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

Di(99)36 He overcomes the corruption that is in the world through lust. (I1)

ST(98)83 Divine power is placed upon man, that he may become a partaker of the divine nature, having escaped the corruption that is in the world through lust. (I1)

ST(98)4 This was the only way in which fallen man could become a partaker of the divine nature. (I1)

Di(99)37 Now Satan sees that his true character before all the universe of heaven and all the worlds which God had created would go wholly on the side of God, and his prospect of future influence with these would be cut off entirely. (I1)

[Cf. ST(98)66,67]

Di(99)38 Christ's humanity has demonstrated for eternal ages the matter which would settle the controversy. (I1)

ST(98)68 Christ's humanity would demonstrate for eternal ages the question which settled the controversy. (I1)

Di(99)39 The enmity in the prophecy in Eden was to be universal, not confined merely to Satan and the Prince of Life, but be felt by all mankind between the serpent's seed and the seed of the woman.
[M/12a.3,.4] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)32,33,34,35]

Di(99)40 The seed of Satan is wicked men who resist the Spirit of God, who will call his law, as did their father the Devil, a yoke of bondage. [M/12a.5] (I2)

Di(99)41 He that committeth sin is of the Devil. (I2)

Di(99)42 Sin is the transgression of the law. (I1)

12a.3,.4 And we are bound. . . to examine whether . . . we might infer from the terms of the prophecy, that the placed enmity would be partial, not universal. The enmity is to subsist, not merely between Satan and the woman, but between his seed and her seed. [Melvill, FP]

12a.5 But the seed of Satan can only be interpreted of wicked men. [Melvill, FP]

Di(99)43 The enmity was supernaturally put between the seed of the woman against the seed of the Devil.
[M/11b.6] (P1)

ST(98)36 The enmity put between the seed of the serpent and the seed of the woman was supernatural. [M/11b.6] (P1)

Di(99)44 With Christ the enmity was in one sense natural, in another, supernatural as human [sic] and divinity was [sic] combined. [M/13b.2] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)37]

Di(99)45 Never was the enmity developed in such marked degree as when Christ was a resident of this earth, his divinity clothed with humanity. [M13b.1] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)38]

Di(99)46 Never had there been a being upon the earth that hated sin with so perfect a hatred as Jesus Christ. [M/13b.3] (V2)

[Cf. ST(98)39]

Di(99)47 He had seen its deceiving, infatuating power upon the holy angels which resulted in their revolt, and all his power was enlisted against Satan. (I1)

[Cf. ST(98)40]

Di(99)48 This is the secret which stirred up Satan with such an intense hatred against Christ. [M/13b.4,.7] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)44]

Di(99)49 The truth was flashing its light in the purity and holiness of Jesus Christ amid the moral darkness wherewith Satan had enshrouded the world and thus was exposing his falsehoods and deceiving character of sin, and spoiling his corrupting influence. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

11b.6 And accordingly it has come to pass, that there is enmity on the earth between man and Satan; but an enmity supernaturally put, and not naturally entertained. [Melvill, FP]

13b.2 It was in Christ Jesus in one sense naturally, and in another supernaturally. [Melvill, FP]

13b.1 Now the enmity was never put in such overpowering measure, as when the man Christ Jesus was its residence. [Melvill, FP]

13b.3 And never did there move the being on this earth who hated sin with as perfect a hatred, or who was as odious in return to all the emissaries of darkness. [Melvill, FP]

13b.4,.7 It was just the holiness of the Mediator which stirred up against him all the passions of a profligate world, and provoked that fury of assault which rushed in from the hosts of reprobate spirits. . . . The great secret of the opposition to Christ lay in the fact, that he was not such an one as ourselves. [Melvill, FP]

ST(98)42 In His life the light of truth was flashed amid the moral darkness with which Satan had enshrouded the world. (11)

ST(98)43 Christ exposed Satan's falsehoods and deceiving character, and in many hearts destroyed his corrupting influence. (11)

Di(99)50 Satan and the whole lust [host] of fallen beings was determined to urge the warfare most vigorously, for there stood one in the world, so pure he was a perfect representation of the Father, and in character and practices was a refutation of Satan's misrepresentations of the character of God. (11)

[Cf. ST(98)45]

Di(99)51 The pure life and holiness of God was heaven's light in contrast with Satanic darkness, truth pure and heavenly in contrast with error and darkness. (11)

Di(99)52 Thus a perpetual reproach of all sin was in a world of sensuality and sin, because of his spotless righteousness who did not sin, neither was guile found in his mouth. [M/13b.5] (P1)

ST(98)41 The purity and holiness of Christ, the spotless righteousness of Him who did no sin, was a perpetual reproach upon all sin in a world of sensuality and sin. [M/13b.5] (P2)

Di(99)53 With what intense interest was this controversy watched by the loyal angels and the unfallen worlds, as the honor of the law of God was being vindicated. (11)

[Cf. ST(98)61]

Di(99)54 Not merely for this world, but for the universe of heaven and the worlds that God had created was to have [sic] the controversy forever settled. (11)

[Cf. ST(98)62]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

13b.5 There was thrown a perpetual reproach on a proud and sensual generation by the spotlessness of that righteous individual, "who did no sin, neither was guile found in his mouth." [Melvill, FP]

Di(99)55 Satan saw God, whom he had charged with the attributes himself [sic] possessed, revealed in Christ in his true light, of a compassionate, merciful God, not willing that any should perish, but that all sinful men come to repentance and should have eternal life. (11)

ST(98)46 Satan had charged upon God the attribute he himself possessed. (11)

ST(98)47 Now in Christ he saw God revealed in His true character--a compassionate, merciful Father, not willing that any should perish, but that all should come to Him in repentance, and have eternal life. (11)

Di(99)56 This was what enraged Satan. (11)

Di(99)57 It was not wholly the absence of external honor and riches and glory which caused the Jews to reject Jesus, but it was [the] Son of righteousness, shining amid the moral darkness in such distinct rays, it revealed the contrast between sin and holiness, purity and defilement, and such light was not welcome to them. [M/13b.7] (12)

Di(99)58 Christ was not such an one as themselves, and every miracle which he wrought did convince some of his divine character, answering to them to specifications of Messiah in prophecy; but those who did not receive this light of heaven set themselves the more determinedly against this evidence to mislead the people. [M/13b.7] (12)

Di(99)59 Had a man in the common walks of life done the same works in miracles that Christ done [sic], all would have given credence that he was working by the power of God. [M13b.9+] (P3)

Di(99)60 The sick were healed, persons afflicted with demoniac demonstrations were healed and sitting at the feet of Jesus clothed and in their right mind, lepers and paralytics were healed, the dumb spoke, the ears of the deaf were opened, the dead were brought to life and that which Christ specified would characterize his work, the poor would have the Gospel preached to them. (11)

13b.7 We are accustomed to think that the lowliness of his condition, and the want of external majesty and pomp, moved the Jews to reject their Messiah; yet it is by no means clear that these were, in the main, the producing causes of rejection. [Melvill, FP]

13b.7 The great secret of the opposition to Christ lay in the fact, that he was not such an one as ourselves. [Melvill, FP]

13b.9+ The peasant, who could work the miracles which Christ worked, would be admitted, on all hands to have mightier engines at his disposal than the prince who is clothed with the ermine and followed by the warriors. [Melvill, FP]

Di(99)61 The Jews were expecting an earthly prince to deliver them from that which the Lord had told them would take place if they did not keep the way of the Lord in obeying his statutes and his commandments, and his laws. [M/14a.1] (I2)

Di(99)62 The Jews had made their proud boasts that Israel's king, the star arising from Judah, would break their thralldom and the Jewish nation would be a kingdom of Priests. [M/14a.4] (I2)

Di(99)63 They could have borne this disappointment better than the righteous denunciations [sic] of every abomination in the land. [M/14a.5] (I2)

Di(99)64 He laid bare in parables their professed sanctity as whited sepulchers deceiving the people by pretensions to sanctity. [M/14a.5] (P1)

Di(99)65 The teachings of Christ is [sic] the sowing of the seed to be afterwards transplanted and cultivated by his disciples. [H/xxv.8] (P1)

Di(99)66 He scattered the heavenly grain like precious pearls here and there which minds and hearts who desired light and knowledge would skillfully gather up as precious treasures sent them from heaven. [H/xxv.7] (I2)

Di(99)67 After his resurrection, then opened he their understanding, that they might understand the scriptures. [H/xxiv.5] (B1)

Di(99)68 Everything seemed to be transposed by the working of the arts of Satan. (I1)

Di(99)69 Truth was covered up with [sic] rubbish of error, hidden from finite sight, and the special work of Christ was occupied in adjusting the claims between heaven and earth. [H/xxxv.6] (I2)

Di(99)70 The inordinate attachment to earthly things had eclipsed the heavenly, and put the Lord out of their sight and knowledge, and false theories as false gods which they cherished and worshipped in the place of God. [H/xxxv.6] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

14a.1 And if the Jews looked for a Messiah who would lead them to mastery over enemies, then, we contend, there was everything in Christ to induce them to give him their allegiance. [Melvill, FP]

14a.4 . . . if that strength dwelt in Jesus which had discomfited Pharaoh, and broken the thralldom of centuries. . [Melvill, FP]

14a.5 They could have tolerated the meanness of his parentage; for that was more than compensated by the majesty of his power. They could have endured the lowliness of his appearance . . . But the righteous fervor with which Christ denounced every abomination in the land; the untainted purity by which he shamed the "whited sepulchres" who deceived the people by the appearance of sanctity; . . . [Melvill, FP]

xxv.8 His teaching is the seedplot in which the great doctrines of grace were first sown, to be afterwards transplanted and cultivated in the inspired ministry of the apostles. [Harris, GT]

xxv.7 'For Christ,' saith Milton, 'gives no full comments, or continued discourses, but speaks oft in monosyllables, like a master, scattering the heavenly grain of his doctrine like pearls here and there, which requires a skilful and laborious gatherer.' [Harris, GT]

xxiv.5 And after his resurrection, 'he said unto them, these are the things which I spake unto you, while I was yet with you. . . . Then opened he their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures; . . . [Harris, GT]

xxxv.6 Much of the preaching of Jesus was occupied in adjusting the claims between heaven and earth; . . . A prevailing characteristic of man, as portrayed in scripture, is an inordinate attachment to the world. [Harris, GT]

Di(99)71 The tempter said to Christ, "If thou wilt worship me, all the kingdoms of the world shall be thine." (B2)

ST(98)57 "The devil taketh him up into an exceeding high mountain, and sheweth him all the kingdoms of the world, and the glory of them; and saith unto him, All these things will I give thee, if thou wilt fall down and worship me" (Matt. 4:8, 9). (B2)

Di(99)72 Intense worldliness has been one of Satan's most successful temptations to keep the minds and hearts of men so completely filled with worldly attractions and worldly business that there is no room for heavenly things. (I1)

Di(99)73 The work of Jesus Christ was to set forth truths more spiritual and deep because of their importance than they had ever heard before from rulers, scribes and elders. [H/xxiv.2] (I2)

Di(99)74 The sayings of Christ are to be appreciated not merely in that measure of understanding of those who heard him, but in their important bearings which he himself attached to them. [H/xxiii.9+] (P1)

Di(99)75 He took the old, old truths which [sic] himself was the originator and placed them before his hearers in heaven's own light. (I1)

Di(99)76 How different were their meaning [sic]! (I1)

Di(99)77 what [sic] a flood of meaning and brightness and spirituality was brought into the explanations of these truths! (I1)

Di(99)78 When Christ referred to his humiliation, rejection, and crucifixion, the disciples would not take in his meaning. [H/xxiv.3] (P3)

Di(99)79 It had been a part of their education to expect Christ to set up a temporal kingdom, and when he spoke of his sufferings, they could not comprehend his words. [H/xxiv.3] (I2)

xxiv.2 Second, his own practice contains a warrant for this canon; for how often do we find him applying it to the interpretation of the Old Testament: expounding some of its truths in a sense more spiritual and profound, than even the original propounders themselves conceived. [Harris, GT]

xxiii.9+ First, that, in direct contradiction to this proposition, it is a well-known canon of scripture interpretation, that 'the sayings of our Savior are to be apprehended, not merely in that sense to which the views of his hearers at the time could reach, but in the sense which he himself attached to them.' [Harris, GT]

xxiv.3 Third, his express declarations, and the confessions of his apostles, harmonize with it. They frankly acknowledge, that when he adverted to the nature and necessity of his sufferings, they understood not his meaning. [Harris, GT]

Di(99)80 He reproved them because of their slowness of apprehension. [H/xxiv.3] (V2)

Di(99)81 He promised that when the comforter should come that he would bring many things to their remembrance. [H/xxiv.4] (P2)

Di(99)82 The truth that is opened to the understanding, which the mind grasps as truth, is capable of constant expansion and new developments, while looking it [sic], the truth is seen in its bearings on life and character and becomes more clear and certain and beautiful while the mind grasps it in its preciousness, in its heavenly properties, and all who take hold upon it becomes [sic] elevated, ennobled, sanctified. [H/xxiv.7] (P3)

Di(99)83 The Light of the world is sending his divine rays back to enlighten the earlier Jewish economy and the truth relating to himself in figures and types, and the minds that through false interpretation of Scripture have been accepting the sayings of men as the commandments of God now look to God himself as the Author of all truth and man's inventions and traditions as unreliable, and not only so, but dangerous, for they place men where God should be. [H/xxiv.9] (I2)

Di(99)84 The sayings of men are put where a Thus saith the Lord should be. (I1)

Di(99)85 The light and life, Jesus the world's redeemer [sic], after his resurrection, shows he possesses the key and he unlocks the treasure house of the old testament [sic], opens and explores hidden things. [H/xxiv.9] (I2)

Di(99)86 He separates the precious truth from superstitious errors and devisings and imaginings of men, and yet many truths he had to say to his disciples which [sic] could not be said because they did not advance with the shining of the light which was flashed upon the whole Levitical laws and the sacrificial offerings. [H/xxiv.9] (P2)

Di(99)87 They had become corrupted with the traditions of men. (I1)

xxiv.3 He reproached them with their slowness of apprehension. [Harris, GT]

xxiv.4 He promised his Spirit to recall his sayings to their minds as so many lost truths. [Harris, GT]

xxiv.7 Fourth, it seems to be necessary for the moral development of our nature, that the truth employed should be such as is itself capable of constant expansion and new developments;--that, like its Divine original, it should brighten while we are looking at it; heighten while we are aspiring to reach it; and thus elevate us to itself, the standard of perfection. [Harris, GT]

xxiv.9+ And what is the Jewish economy, if we desire to reach its interior truths, but a vast, profound, elaborated enigma, to which the gospel indeed brings us the key,--but the opening and exploration of which is yet incomplete: excusing, if not justifying the opinion of Origen, that 'a clear understanding of the reasons of the Israelitic economy, and of all the Levitical laws, belongs to the privileges of the future life.' [Harris, GT]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Di(99)88 Therefore, the minds of his disciples do not comprehend important matters of truth even in 1889, for the same reason. (I1)

Di(99)89 Christ assigned [sic] why he could not say the many things he longed to say to them because they did not advance with the light, embrace the light and follow on to still greater brightness as Providence leads the way. (I1)

Di(99)90 So dull have been the comprehension of even those who teach the truth to others that many things cannot be opened to them until we reach heaven. (I1)

Di(99)91 It ought not to be so, but as men's minds become narrow they think they know all, and set one stake after another in points of truth as they have only a glimpse of it and close the mind as though there was [sic] no more room for them to learn; and should the Lord attempt to lead them on, they will not take up with this increased light, but hug the spot where they think they see a glimmering [sic] of light when it is only a link in the living chain of truths and promises to be studied to find entrance into the mind. [H/xxv.4] (I2)

Di(99)92 They have only a rough outline of what is to follow. [H/xxv.4] (P1)

Di(99)93 The entire system of Judaism was the Gospel veiled. [H/xxv.5] (V2)

Di(99)94 For, very far are human minds from grasping in the teachings of Christ old truths in new settings, but I have been shown that those who will not consider are like the Jews. (I1)

xxv.4 . . . but that in some of the earliest and simplest links of the living chain, there is traceable a promise, a mute prophecy of all the rest, a rough outline of all that is to follow; [Harris, GT]

xxv.5 In like manner, the entire system of Judaism was one compacted prophecy of the gospel, a presentiment of Christianity. [Harris, GT]

Di(99)95 It is humbling to their dignity and pride to work the mines of truth, the harmonious relation of truth like links in a chain. [H/xxvi.3,.4] (I2)

Di(99)96 Just as fast as the mind is quickened by the spirit of God to comprehend the light and in humbleness of mind appropriate it that it shall be diffused to others and effect back glory to God in increased light. [H/xxvi.3] (I2)

Di(99)97 Development of truth will be the reward of the humble-hearted diligent man who fear [sic] God, who walk [sic] with God. [H/xxvi.3] (P2)

Di(99)98 Many, very many who are teachers are generally content with a supposition in regard to the truth. [H/xxvi.4] (P2)

Di(99)99 They have crude ideas and are content with a surface work in searching for truth, taking for granted they have all that is essential. [H/xxvi.4] (P3)

Di(99)100 They take the sayings of men and are too indulgent to put themselves to vigorous, earnest labor represented as digging for the truth as for hidden treasure. [H/xxvi.4,.7] (I2)

Di(99)101 Sharp clear conceptions truth will never be the reward of indolence. [H/xxvi.4] (I2)

Di(99)102 Investigation of every point that has been accepted as truth would richly repay the earnest seeker in finding precious gems of old truths in new settings. [H/xxvi.6,.7] (I2)

Di(99)103 In closely investigating every jot and tittle in ideas of truth that we think is established truth beyond controversy, in comparing Scripture with Scripture, searching to see if there is no flaw in the interpretation of Scripture, errors may be discovered; and while digging in the mines of truth, examining the ore, precious jewels will be found of inestimable value. [H.xxvi.7] (I2)

Di(99)104 Jesus would have the searcher of the Scriptures [sic] truths of vital importance to their present and eternal interest sink down the shaft deeper in the mines of truth which they have been working upon, and if the Spirit of research is properly conducted there will be discovered lodes of precious golden treasury. [H/xxvi.9+] (P3)

xxvi.3 . . . but it may be suggested, that even with their inspired epistles in our hand, and regarding those epistles in the light of commentaries on the sayings of our Lord, there yet remain to be discovered in his teaching, new aspects of some truths, the immeasurable compass of others, and harmonies subsisting between them all, beyond the perception of ordinary vision; and the development of which is reserved to reward the pious industry of the devout and vigorous mind. [Harris, GT]

xxvi.4 The church of God has been too generally content with the great surface-truths of revelation,--those which we have only to stoop for in order to possess,--but which are made so obvious and placed so near, not as a premium to indolence, but in accommodation to our moral incuriousness and necessities; . . . [Harris, GT]

xxvi.7 'The kingdom of heaven'--in the sense of celestial truth--'is like treasure hid in a field; the which, when a man hath found, he hideth; and for joy thereof, goeth, and selleth all that he hath, and buyeth that field;' and buyeth it in order that he may ransack, and turn up every part of it, and make himself master of all its treasures. And further, it is as if the same man, while digging for more coins and concealed jewels, should unexpectedly happen on a vein of precious ore. Hitherto, we have done little more than collect, estimate, and classify the more accessible treasures. [Harris, GT]

xxvi.9+ But let the shaft which is already begun, be sunk deep enough, and the labors of the mind be properly conducted, and the discovery of many a rich and precious lode will demonstrate that the great globe itself is not more interlaced with golden veins, and filled with precious things, than the field of revelation: the storehouse of the unsearchable riches of Christ. [Harris, GT]

Di(99)105 The Scripture is the field, for it is the storehouse of the unsearchable riches of Christ. [H/xxvi.9+] (Pl)

Di(99)106 This was the character of the teachings of Christ. [H/xxvii.2] (Pl)

Di(99)107 I am the Way, the Truth, and the Life. (Il)

Di(99)108 The rich treasures of truth opened before the hungry starving people attracted and charmed their senses. (Il)

Di(99)109 It was so in contrast with the dry lifeless spiritless expositions of the old testament scriptures [sic], and the miracles which he wrought kept constantly before the minds the glory and honor of God. (Il)

Di(99)110 He seemed to his hearers to be a messenger direct from heaven for he spoke not to their ears, but to their hearts. (Il)

Di(99)111 After listening to Christ, the doctrines and teachings of the priests and rulers was [sic] dry and painful to the senses, and the priests and rabbis saw they could not hold the people. (Il)

Di(99)112 This excited the jealousy and hostility of the dignitaries of the temple and synagogue. (Il)

Di(99)113 He stood forth in his humility but in majesty and dignity as one born to command. (Il)

Di(99)114 A power attended him wherever he went and hearts were melted into tenderness, and earnest desire was created to be in his presence to listen to his voice which uttered truths with solemn melody. (Il)

Di(99)115 And Satan was earnest and determined in his enmity against Christ. (Il)

Di(99)116 Evil angels conspired with evil men and the whole energies of apostacy was [sic] aroused because one stood in their midst unlike themselves. (Il)

xxvii.2 This, indeed is predicable of every part of Scripture; but, for the reasons already glanced at, it applies especially to the teachings of Christ; . . .
[Harris, GT]

Di(99)117 The whole confederacy of darkness was watching critically a semblance of a chance to rise in triumph over the divine and human substitute and surety for the human race, that he might shout "Victory!" and the world and its inhabitants forever become his kingdom. [M/15a.2] (I2)

[Cf. ST(98)63]

Di(99)118 But Satan reached only the heel. [M/15a.1] (V2)

Di(99)119 He could not touch the head. [M/15a.1] (V1)

Di(99)120 The circumstances of his birth was [sic] divine, but was [sic] treated by his own nation, those who had blinded their eyes to spiritual things, as a blot and stain upon him. (I1)

Di(99)121 These insinuations and charges against him was [sic] a small part of the abasement he endured in his life, not easy for humanity to bear. (I1)

Di(99)122 There was not a part of the bitterness which he did not taste and the bitter woe and curse which he did not endure that he might bring many sons and daughters into glory. (I1)

Di(99)123 He was in his youth subject unto his parents, an example to all youth in obedience and honoring his parents. (I1)

Di(99)124 He was the Majesty of heaven but in the divine plan he must descend from his high and holy estate to take humanity that humanity might touch humanity and divinity combine with humanity by [taking] hold of divinity. (I1)

Di(99)125 In his youth he learned the trade of a carpenter and employed his time in earning his bread by the sweat of his brow. [W/59,63c/130,131] (P2)

Di(99)126 Thus he honored physical labor and gave this as a lesson in his practical life, in his lowly occupation, which should be an encouragement to strengthen every human being in performing the common place [sic] duties of life that Jesus labored and toiled to provide for his own temporal wants; and he was God in human flesh. [W/63c,65/131] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

15a.2 . . . if he could have profaned, by a solitary thought, the sanctuary of his soul; then it would have been the head which he had bruised; and rising triumphant over man's surety, he would have shouted "Victory!" [Melvill, FP]

15a.1 He touched the heel, he could not touch the head of the Mediator. [Melvill, FP]

59/130 Until the age of thirty he lived a life of entire seclusion from the world; and, as he was "**subject unto his parents,**" doubtless his early years were employed in assisting his father in his lowly calling; thus, with his own hands ministering to his temporal necessities. [Winslow, GR]

63c/131 in early life, by the sweat of his brow, he did literally provide for his own temporal sustenance. [Winslow, GR]

65/131 How does it dignify the most lowly occupation, sweeten the heaviest trial, and lighten the deepest care, to reflect, "thus lived, and laboured, and toiled, the incarnate God!" [Winslow, GR]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - ELLEN G. WHITE

Di(99)127 His entire life was marked with humility, and everything connected with Christ was not after the world's habits and customs and practices. (Il)

Di(99)128 What a lesson is given to the Christian churches throughout the world not to exalt themselves above Jesus, the Majesty of heaven, their Redeemer. (Il)

Di(99)129 What do they find in the example of Christ for their feelings of superiority, keeping themselves apart from their fellow men, hiding themselves from their own flesh? (Il)

Di(99)130 Because one has obtained more of this worlds [sic] goods than his neighbor, because the world honors the wealthy and despises the poor, will those who claim to follow Jesus do this? (Il)

Di(99)131 Who's [sic] leading and example are they imitating? (Il)

Di(99)132 Certainly not the example of him who said, "I came to preach the Gospel to the poor, to heal the broken hearted," etc. (Il)

Di(99)133 Satan controls the minds of men in their devotion and love of the world. (Il)

Di(99)134 They are so attached to worldly things that all kinds of sins will be committed in order to gain some worldly advantage. (Il)

Di(99)135 Satan thought to succeed with Christ on this point. (Il)

Di(99)136 He thought that the humanity of Christ might easily be overcome by his temptations, but Christ was not moved. (Il)

Di(99)137 God must be supreme in every mind. (Il)

Di(99)138 Christ used the only weapons justifiable for human beings to use, that is the word of him who is mighty in council, "It is written." (Il)

Di(99)139 Man is dazed and charmed with the glitter and tinsel of the world. (Il)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 13 - SOURCES

The Victory

Analysis

The second and third temptations of Jesus are covered in 127 sentences out of which only eight show literary dependency. What is even more striking is the absence of any obvious literary dependency on earlier writings. It seems strange to us to find in this chapter virtually a new composition when so much Ellen White material was available for Marian Davis to edit. In fact, a note written at the top of the diary material on the temptations of Christ in Book 32 reads "copied for L.C.," meaning "life of Christ."

We do have evidence in the diary texts that Ellen White was still producing new articles on the temptation as late as 1897 and even later. Here again, however, we are surprised at the rather free use of sources in the diary material and the relatively independent writing of the chapter 13.

Two possible solutions come to mind, either one or both of which would account for the evidence. It is possible we have missed the source or sources providing the major support for this chapter. On the other hand, having written so much on the topic through the years, Ellen White was very familiar with the content. It could well be that given the evangelical purposes of this new work on the life of Christ, Ellen White pulled together the ideas which so often had been on her mind and wrote a new composition.

However chapter 13 was written, its content is clearly more practical and more personal than is the earlier SP

The Victory

text. Its sentences are also much shorter. The theology is simply put and not as developed as in the diary comments.

Source Analysis - The Desire of Ages

This chapter rates as quite independent using our evaluation scale. In Table 1, page 173, 110 of the 127 sentences have been designated as (I1) or Strict Independence. As Table 2 on page 174 shows, of the remaining 17, nine sentences were from the Bible and on that basis omitted from evaluation. The other eight were divided between Simple Paraphrase (three sentences) and Partial Independence (five sentences). Excluding the Bible verses the average value for the total chapter is .14. If we weigh only the sentences which show some dependency, the average rate is 2.1.¹

All eight sentences where literary dependence is found contain parallels to William Hanna's Life of Christ. The dependent sentences involve theology, assumed attitudes on the part of Christ and Satan, and general comment. We found no particular reason why a source would have been used in these sentences and not in others when it is clear Ellen White was truly adopting the expressions of others, at least in a partial way, in her other writings on the topic of chapter 13.

¹The full testing of all 127 sentences and their evaluations is provided in Appendix A.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 13

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1 Strict Verbatim V1	2 Verbatim V2	3 Strict Paraphrase P1	4 Simple Paraphrase P2	5 Loose Paraphrase P3	6 Source Bible B1	7 Partial Independence I2	8 Strict Independence I1	9 Bible B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	00	00	03	00	00	05	110	09	127
02. 1RL	00	00	02	03	00	01	00	01	00	07
03. 2RL	00	00	03	05	02	00	00	00	00	10
04. SP	00	00	00	04	00	00	02	00	00	06
05. BE	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
06. Lt(1a)	00	00	06	03	00	00	01	00	00	10
07. 3T	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
08. Di(90)	00	01	11	03	00	00	11	24	00	50
09. Di(99)	01	06	09	10	06	08	33	65	01	139
10. ST(98)	00	00	02	02	00	00	01	16	01	22
TOTALS PRE-DA	01	07	33	32	08	09	48	(106)	(02)	246

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 13

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT					
01. Bible	V1	Strict Verbatim	1		
	V2	Verbatim	2		
	P1	Strict Paraphrase	3		
	P2	Simple Paraphrase	4		
	P3	Loose Paraphrase	5		
	B1	Source Bible	6		
	I2	Partial Independence	7		
	I1	Strict Independence	8		
	B2	Bible	9	09	
	TOTAL			09	
02. Hanna					08
TOTALS DA Text				(09)	17

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

We have argued earlier that the preceding writings of Ellen White usually show closer dependency than the final compositions. The evidence in support of this contention was the DA text when compared to writings produced much earlier in time or even when written within the same decade.

But if our studies in connection with chapter 13 are supported by evidence from other chapters, we shall have to modify our position slightly. Diary material written at the very time the DA text was being produced shows Ellen White was clearly using sources and her sentences indicate closer dependency. The question of dependency is not necessarily, then, a matter of when in Ellen White's life of writing she did the writing. It is rather an issue of how close we are to Ellen White's hand.

At the same time, however, we would not want to suggest that everything that comes from the hand of Ellen White is in some sense dependent on a source. The manuscripts reviewed in connection with this chapter have portions which we have designated as Strict Independence. In point of fact the first 14 verses of Di(90), which were not included here because of their content, were largely independent as far as we could tell. The list provided in Appendix B for chapter 13 also reveals long sections where Ellen White is writing on her own.

The final answer to Ellen White's use of sources awaits a thorough study of Ellen White's use of sources as found in

The Victory

her handwritten documents, regardless of the content. Our investigation of the DA text is proving helpful but the evidence we are accumulating seems to suggest we are too far along in the development of the literary tradition when we get to the published stage of the text to recover the actual literary work of Ellen White.

In the 246 sentences of pre-DA text presented in connection with chapter 13, 106 were listed as (I1) or Strict Independence and two were Bible verses on the topic. The remaining 138 sentences reflect the literary influence of five sources. Table 1 (see above) indicates that the sentences with the greatest dependency were found among her diary writings. The distribution list presented in Table 3, page 177, shows us that Winslow supplied nearly twice as many parallels as did any one of the three other major sources.

It is quite possible we have missed some parallels between these writers and Ellen White by reason of duplication and arrangement of content. All parallels have been located through personal notice and memory. We have not had the advantage of computer-assisted search programs.

Take for example Di(99)117, 118, 119. On the first two passes we evaluated these three sentences of the diary material as strictly independent along with sentences immediately before and after. Earlier Ellen White was following Harris. On previous readings we noted nothing that indicated a parallel here. But on the third pass the

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 13

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01.Bible	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	02
02.Fleetwood	00	00	02	03	00	01	00		00	06
03.Hanna	00	00	09	13	03	00	03		00	28
04.Harris	00	02	05	04	04	01	14		00	30
05.Melville	01	02	04	01	01	00	12		00	21
06.Winslow	00	03	13	10	01	07	19		00	53
TOTALS Pre-DA	01	07	33	31	09	09	48	--	(02)	140

The Victory

word "victory" in Di(99)117 and the following two sentences caught our attention. Sure enough, Ellen White was repeating herself in the same document. Returning to Di(99)8 and 9, where Ellen White had used the same general expression, we also found the associated parallel from Melvill. The second use of the source in the same document making virtually the same point results in closer parallels than the earlier use.

It is very likely we have missed other parallels for this and similar reasons. Once again, we repeat the warning that our tabulations should not be taken as precise totals.

The parallels found in these pre-DA writings should not overshadow the 106 independent sentences where Ellen White's role as a writer is to be recognized. Nearly 50% of the sentences in both diary excerpts were evaluated as Strict Independence. In addition, these two texts have 44 sentences showing Partial Independence.

We have already commented on the general differences between the earlier writings, particularly SP and the DA text. We also found the diary materials to be more theological and general than the DA text. More detailed analysis cannot be attempted here. There is one curious difference between the DA text and the earlier SP account, however, that seemed to beckon for our special attention.

We found no subsequent comment in Ellen White writings on the temptations of Christ that picks up on the brief reference in SP, II, chapter VII, to John's unwelcomed visit

The Victory

to Christ at the time of His temptation experience. In the SP account the telling of the experience is presented in the context of Christ's first miracle in Cana of Galilee but in the DA text Ellen White has no reference to John's encounter with Jesus in chapters on the temptation or in chapter 15, "At the Marriage Feast."

The SP account of this extra-biblical story is presented below. No doubt it was omitted from the DA text for the very reason that it does not appear in the gospels of Matthew and Luke where the temptation of Christ is recorded.

The telling of this incident of Christ's wilderness experience in the setting of the home of Mary, the mother of Jesus, just prior to the marriage feast at Cana is strikingly similar to a story we found in the fictionalized account of the life of Christ by J. H. Ingraham. Ingraham's work, The Prince of the House of David; or Three Years in the Holy City,¹ is cast in the form of letters written from the perspective of an eyewitness by a certain Adina, a Jewish lady living in Jerusalem, to her father in Egypt. The letters relate the incidents in the life of Jesus of Nazareth from His baptism by John to His crucifixion. Ingraham was rector of Christ Church and St. Thomas Hall, Holly Springs, Mississippi.

¹Ingraham's work was first copyrighted in 1859. Our text was the 1888 edition by Roberts Brothers, Boston, which appears to be a reprint of the author's revision, 1864.

The Victory

We have no record of Ellen White's ever having this particular book in her library though she did have another work by this same author in her personal library at the time of her death. The conversational style of the presentation, the lack of strong verbal parallels and the post-temptation context of the story place it out of our patterns of comparison.

We do, however, feel that the similarities between the accounts, the extra-biblical nature of the story and the temptation context of the story itself merit its inclusion in the temptation textual materials, particularly the closing chapter on the temptation narrative.

On the following two pages, opposite to the SP account, we have recorded Ingraham's text taken from pages 155 to 157.

Ingraham, J. H. The Prince of the House of David;...

"John has seen Him," answered Lazarus, seriously, "ask him, and he will tell you all."

We looked at John, who sat sad and pensive, as if he were dwelling in his mind upon some painful, yet tender sorrow. The eyes of my cousin Mary, which always caught their lustre from his, were shaded with an inquiring look of sympathy and solicitude.

"You are not well, I fear," she said, placing her fair hand upon his white brow, and putting back the hair from his temples. "You have been long away, and are weary and ill."

"Weary, Mary? I shall never complain of weariness again, after what I have beheld."

"What have you seen?" I asked.

"Jesus in the desert; and when I remember Him there, I shall forget to smile more."

"You found Him, then?" I eagerly asked.

"Yes, after days of painful search. I found Him in the very centre of the Desert of Ashes, where foot of man had never trodden before. I saw Him upon His knees, and heard His voice in prayer. I laid down the sack of bread and fishes, and the skin of water I had brought with me to succor Him, and with awe drew near where He stood."

Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, Chapter VII

"The Marriage at Cana"

1/98+ - AFTER this, Jesus returned to Jordan, as has been previously stated, and was declared by John to be the "Lamb of God that taketh away the sin of the world."

2/99 - At this time, also, he chose John, Andrew, Simon, Philip, and Nathanael, for his disciples, all of which has been recounted in connection with the history of John the Baptist.

3/99 - Jesus now entered upon the great work of his life.

4/99 - There was to be a marriage in Cana of Galilee.

5/99 - The parties were relatives of Joseph and Mary.

6/99 - Christ knew of this family gathering, and that many influential persons would be brought together there, so, in company with his newly-made disciples, he made his way to Cana.

7/99 - As soon as it was known that Jesus had come to the place, a special invitation was sent to him and his friends.

8/99 - This was what he had purposed, and so he graced the feast with his presence.

9/99 - He had been separated from his mother for quite a length of time.

10/99 - During this period he had been baptized by John and had endured the temptations in the wilderness.

11/99 - Rumors had reached Mary concerning her son and his sufferings.

12/99 - John, one of the new disciples, had searched for Christ and had found him in his humiliation, emaciated, and bearing the marks of great physical and mental distress.

13/99 - Jesus, unwilling that John should witness his humiliation, had gently yet firmly dismissed him from his presence.

14/99 - He wished to be alone; no human eye must behold his agony, no human heart be called out in sympathy with his distress.

15/99+ - The disciple had sought Mary in her home and related to her the incidents of this meeting with Jesus, as well as the event of his baptism, when the voice of God was heard in acknowledgment of his Son, and the prophet John had pointed to Christ, saying, "Behold the Lamb of God . . ."

The Victory

"How did you find Him there?" I asked, with that painful interest which exacts all details.

"By His footsteps in the sand and ashes. I saw where He sat down to rest, and where two nights He reposed upon the ground. I expected to find Him perished, but each day I discovered His progressing footsteps and followed them. As I now drew near Him, I heard Him groan in spirit, and He seemed to be borne down to the earth by some mortal agony. He was, as it were, talking to some invisible evil beings who assailed Him.

"Rabbi! good Master, I said, I have brought thee food and water. Pardon me if I have intruded upon thy awful loneliness, which is sacred to some deep grief; but I weep with thee for thy woes, and in all thy afflictions I am afflicted. Eat, that thou mayest have strength to endure thy mysterious sufferings.

"He turned His pale countenance full upon me, and extended towards me His emaciated hands, while He smiled faintly, and blessed me and said:

"Son, thou art very dear to me. Thou shalt one day be afflicted for me, but not now, and then understand wherefore I am now a sufferer in the desert."

"Let me remain with thee, Divine Messiah, I said.

"Thou believest, then, that I am He?" he answered, regarding me with love.

"I replied by casting myself at His desert-parched feet, and bathing them with my tears. He raised me, and said, 'Go thy way presently. When the time of my fasting and temptation is past, I will see thee again.'

"Nay, I will not leave thee, I asserted.

"If thou lovest me, beloved, thou wilt obey me," he answered, with a tone of gentle reproof.

"But thou wilt first eat of the bread I have brought, and drink of the water, I entreated.

"Thou knowest not what temptation thou art offering to me," he replied, sadly. "Thou hast not enough for thine own needs. Go, and leave me to gain the victory over Satan, the Prince of this world, for which I was led by the spirit thither!"

"I once more cast myself at his feet, and He lifted me up, kissed me, and sent me away. Oh, you would not have known him! Worn and emaciated by long abstinence, weak through suffering, He looked but the shadow of himself.¹ He could not have lived thus if there had not been a divine power within to sustain him! His existence so long, for He had been in the desert five weeks without food, when I found him, was a miracle in itself, proving the power of God to be in him!" [Ingraham, PHD, 155-7]

¹The possible parallel hinges on the overall similarity of content and not on a few words. In Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I, p. 31, written earlier than Ingraham's text, Ellen White wrote, "I saw that the Son of God was pale and emaciated through fasting and suffering."

The Victory

Redaction Analysis - DA Text

The literary independence of the DA text and the general pattern of the composition suggest that Ellen White is working from the biblical narrative, particularly Matthew's account. She adds her spiritual appeals from time to time as well as her practical spiritual lessons in harmony with the evangelistic nature of this publication.

Redaction Analysis - the pre-DA Text

Ellen White does not utilize her earlier treatments of the temptation episode in the life of Christ in the DA account. These previous writings when viewed on their own merits, however, do exhibit clear dependency upon literary sources. This dependency extends beyond the verbal and sentence parallels to include literary structure, particularly in the two diary texts. In these writings, with few exceptions, we have found the development of the story line and its theological commentary closely follows that of the source being used.

This is not to say that Ellen White is totally subject to the thematic arrangement of her sources. Appendix C clearly shows that she is not bound to the source. She appears to work with blocks of material from more than one writer, inserting blocks of her own independent composition at will. Once again it would appear that a fair evaluation would emphasize both the derivative and original nature of her work.

The Victory

Summary

Our research project thus far has shown each chapter of The Desire of Ages to have a charm and excitement of its own. Surely chapter thirteen is no exception. We look forward to the time when careful scrutiny can be given to each of the 87 chapters of Ellen White's life of Christ.

Our review of chapter 13 on the completion of Christ's temptation may be summarized as follows:

1. We found no primary source material for the DA text which appears to be from a literary point of view a new composition. If Marian Davis compiled this chapter from the earlier writings of which there were many, the literary connection between this chapter and the previous writings remains hidden.

We did locate two documents in Ellen White's original hand, one of which has never been published. A second text in her personal hand permits us to follow the editing process through the copying stage to the published form. These two handwritten texts on Christ's temptation merit further study not only in respect to the use of sources, which is very much in evidence, but also in terms of the role of Ellen White's literary assistants.

2. The scrapbook of writings on the temptation of Christ would have been replete with previous writings.

While most single articles would not be longer than the DA text of 127 sentences, the diary entry on the same subject written sometime around 1897 contains 156 sentences.

The Victory

Of course we must also bear in mind that Ellen White's DA text has more than one chapter dedicated to the temptation of Christ. Chapter 12 on the first temptation contains at least 242 sentences.

No final statement can be made comparing the extent of the DA text with the earlier writings until the full textual tradition on this subject is included in the study. The content overlaps between the DA chapters as well as between the earlier articles.

In any case the apparent independence of chapter 13 as well as its comparative order argue against the text of the DA being a larger treatment due to a greater use of sources. That argument may apply, however, to the multiplication and extent of earlier writings. Only further study will provide the conclusive answer.

3. The content generally stressed the various associated motifs of the great controversy between Christ and Satan and the nature of Christ's temptations which both in origin and victory are instructive for the Christian. The earlier writings did not generally have the strong spiritual appeals which the DA text presents in harmony with its objectives as an evangelistic tool for those not of the Adventist faith.

4. No significant differences appear between the DA account and the earlier writings. The omission in the DA text of John's visit to Christ in the wilderness of temptation is of interest on two accounts. Nowhere else in

The Victory

Ellen White's profuse writings on the topic have we noted a further reference to this incident and it does carry some resemblance to a fictionalized account by Ingraham. Further study is required before one may speak with any certainty of Ellen White's use of Ingraham here.

5. Eight of the 127 sentences of chapter 13 or six percent of the entire chapter reveals literary dependence.

6. Ellen White used nine sentences to present Bible texts on the topic. Eighty-seven percent of the chapter or 110 of the 127 sentences were evaluated as being Ellen White's independent work.

7. Literary dependency was evident in three sentences involving Simple Paraphrase and five sentences of Partial Independence. Omitting the Bible verses the dependency rate for the entire chapter was 0.14. If our rate of dependency is calculated only for those sentences when dependency has been established, the dependency rate is 2.1.

8. There is no apparent major use of sources in the writing of chapter 13.

9. Ellen White is indebted only to Hanna's Life of Christ in the literary composition of this chapter.

10. Five sources were identified from the study of the pre-DA text. In addition to the lives of Christ by Fleetwood and Hanna, Ellen White used The Great Teacher by Harris, a sermon by Henry Melvill and some material from The Glory of the Redeemer by Octavius Winslow.

11. The DA text is striking in its freedom from

The Victory

literary parallels, whether of contemporary literary sources or prior Ellen White writings. Her previously written works, however, especially the two diary excerpts, are remarkable for their many literary parallels and for the nature of this literary dependency. The diary texts were written in the 1890s and exhibit frequent use of paraphrase with some verbatim expressions.

12. The lack of any significant dependency in the DA text gives us no grounds for comparing the content of dependent and independent sentences in chapter 13.

13. The strong independence of chapter 13 suggests that Ellen White and/or her literary assistants were responsible for the construction of the text. It does not appear to be a redaction of the earlier SP text. The chapter appears to follow the temptation story as presented in Matthew's gospel interspersed with comments and spiritual appeals directed at the general reader. The content is fully in harmony with the stated purpose for writing The Desire of Ages.

14. We did not completely cover each of the earlier works of Ellen White. Where we followed the Ellen White text for an extended sequence of sentences we also found at times a similar sequence of parallels from a given source or a series of independent sentences. The redaction of the Ellen White text paralleled that of a source only for a given section of material. She moved back and forth between various sources and her own comments.

The Victory

Our study of chapter 13 shows Ellen White to be in control of her writing, whether in her use of sources or in her independent materials. Though her general writings on the subject of Christ's second and third temptations exhibit a great deal of literary parallels, especially at the level of her handwritten text, the DA text appears to be for the most part her own work.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 13

No. --	Source	Dependency	No. --	Source	Dependency
001. --	Bible	B2	051. --		I1
002. --		I1	052. --		I1
003. --		I1	053. --		I1
004. --		I1	054. --		I1
005. --		I1	055. --		I1
006. --		I1	056. --		I1
007. --		I1	057. --		B2
008. --		I1	058. --		B2
009. --		I1	059. --		I1
010. --		I1	060. --		I1
011. --		I1	061. --		I1
012. --		I1	062. --		I1
013. --		I1	063. --	Bible	B2
014. --		I1	064. --		I1
015. --		I1	065. --		I1
016. --		I1	066. --	Hanna LC/121/97	I2
017. --		I1	067. --	Bible	B2
018. --		I1	068. --	Bible	B2
019. --		I1	069. --		I1
020. --		I1	070. --		I1
021. --		I1	071. --		I1
022. --		I1	072. --		I1
023. --		I1	073. --		I1
024. --		I1	074. --		I1
025. --	Hanna LC/75-77	P2	075. --		I1
026. --		I1	076. --		I1
027. --	Bible	B2	077. --		I1
028. --	Bible	B2	078. --		I1
029. --		I1	079. --		I1
030. --		I1	080. --		I1
031. --		I1	081. --		I1
032. --		I1	082. --		I1
033. --		I1	083. --		I1
034. --		I1	084. --		I1
035. --		I1	085. --		I1
036. --		I1	086. --		I1
037. --		I1	087. --		I1
038. --		I1	088. --		I1
039. --		I1	089. --		I1
040. --		I1	090. --		I1
041. --		I1	091. --	Bible	B2
042. --		I1	092. --	Hanna LC/108/96	I2
043. --		I1	093. --		I1
044. --		I1	094. --		I1
045. --		I1	095. --		I1
046. --		I1	096. --		I1
047. --		I1	097. --		I1
048. --		I1	098. --	Hanna LC/156a/99	P2
049. --	Bible	B2	099. --		I1
050. --	Hanna LC/153/98	I2	100. --		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 13

No.	-	Source	Dependency	No.	-	Source	Dependency
101.	-		I1	151.	-		
102.	-		I1	152.	-		
103.	-		I1	153.	-		
104.	-		I1	154.	-		
105.	-		I1	155.	-		
106.	-		I1	156.	-		
107.	-		I1	157.	-		
108.	-	Hanna LC/125a/97	I2	158.	-		
109.	-		I1	159.	-		
110.	-	Hanna LC/125b/97	P2	160.	-		
111.	-		I1	161.	-		
112.	-		I1	162.	-		
113.	-	Hanna LC/161/99	I2	163.	-		
114.	-		I1	164.	-		
115.	-		I1	165.	-		
116.	-		I1	166.	-		
117.	-		I1	167.	-		
118.	-		I1	168.	-		
119.	-		I1	169.	-		
120.	-		I1	170.	-		
121.	-		I1	171.	-		
122.	-		I1	172.	-		
123.	-		I1	173.	-		
124.	-		I1	174.	-		
125.	-		I1	175.	-		
126.	-		I1	176.	-		
127.	-	Bible	B2	177.	-		
128.	-			178.	-		
129.	-			179.	-		
130.	-			180.	-		
131.	-			181.	-		
132.	-			182.	-		
133.	-			183.	-		
134.	-			184.	-		
135.	-			185.	-		
136.	-			186.	-		
137.	-			187.	-		
138.	-			188.	-		
139.	-			189.	-		
140.	-			190.	-		
141.	-			191.	-		
142.	-			192.	-		
143.	-			193.	-		
144.	-			194.	-		
145.	-			195.	-		
146.	-			196.	-		
147.	-			197.	-		
148.	-			198.	-		
149.	-			199.	-		
150.	-			200.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	1 RL 2/48	P2	12	051.	-	Di (90) 47	I1	60
002.	-	1 RL 3/48	I1	12	052.	-	Di (90) 48	I1	60
003.	-	1 RL 4/48	P2	12	053.	-	Di (90) 49	I1	60
004.	-	1 RL 6/48	B1	12	054.	-	Di (90) 50	I1	60
005.	-	1 RL 9/48	P1	12	055.	-	Di (90) 51	I1	60
006.	-	2 RL 39.7	P3	12	056.	-	Di (90) 52	I1	60
007.	-	2 RL 39.9+	P2	12	057.	-	Di (90) 53	I1	60
008.	-	2 RL 47.7	P2	7	058.	-	Di (90) 54	I1	60
009.	-	2 RL 47.8	P3	7	059.	-	Di (90) 55	I1	60
010.	-	2 SP 93/94	I2	7	060.	-	Di (90) 56	I1	60
011.	-	2 SP 94/94	I2	25	061.	-	Di (90) 57	I1	60
012.	-	2 SP 95/94	P2	25	062.	-	Di (90) 58	I1	60
013.	-	BE (92) 5	P2	25	063.	-	Di (90) 59	I1	60
014.	-	2 RL 48.6	P2	25	064.	-	Di (90) 60	I2	60
015.	-	1 RL 13/49	P2	32	065.	-	Di (90) 61	I1	60
016.	-	Lt (1a) 4	P1	50	066.	-	Di (90) 62	I2	60
017.	-	Lt (1a) 6	P1	50	067.	-	Di (90) 63	P1	60
018.	-	3T 482.6	P2	50	068.	-	Di (90) 64	I1	60
019.	-	Di (90) 15	I1	60	069.	-	2 RL 52.2	P1	66
020.	-	Di (90) 16	I1	60	070.	-	2 RL 51.5	P1	66
021.	-	Di (90) 17	I1	60	071.	-	2 SP 116a/96	P2	66
022.	-	Di (90) 18	I1	60	072.	-	2 SP 112/96	P2	66
023.	-	Di (90) 19	I1	60	073.	-	2 SP 111/95+	P2	69
024.	-	Di (90) 20	P1	60	074.	-	2 RL 52.3	P2	91
025.	-	Di (90) 21	P2	60	075.	-	1 RL 28/50	P1	91
026.	-	Di (90) 22	I2	60	076.	-	Lt (1a) 10	P1	98
027.	-	Di (90) 23	I2	60	077.	-	Lt (1a) 11	P1	98
028.	-	Di (90) 24	I2	60	078.	-	Lt (1a) 13	P1	98
029.	-	Di (90) 25	I2	60	079.	-	Lt (1a) 14	I2	98
030.	-	Di (90) 26	P1	60	080.	-	Lt (1a) 15	P2	103
031.	-	Di (90) 27	P1	60	081.	-	2 RL 54.1	P2	108
032.	-	Di (90) 28	I2	60	082.	-	2 RL 54.1	P1	110
033.	-	Di (90) 29	P1	60	083.	-	Lt (1a) 16	P2	113
034.	-	Di (90) 30	P1	60	084.	-	Lt (1a) 17	P3	113
035.	-	Di (90) 31	P1	60	085.	-	Lt (1a) 18	P1	113
036.	-	Di (90) 32	P1	60	086.	-	Di (99) 1	I1	127
037.	-	Di (90) 33	P1	60	087.	-	Di (99) 2	I1	127
038.	-	Di (90) 34	I2	60	088.	-	ST (98) 11	I1	127
039.	-	Di (90) 35	V2	60	089.	-	Di (99) 3	I2	127
040.	-	Di (90) 36	I2	60	090.	-	ST (98) 12	P2	127
041.	-	Di (90) 37	I2	60	091.	-	ST (98) 13	I1	127
042.	-	Di (90) 38	I1	60	092.	-	Di (99) 4	V2	127
043.	-	Di (90) 39	P2	60	093.	-	Di (99) 5	P2	127
044.	-	Di (90) 40	P2	60	094.	-	ST (98) 79	P1	127
045.	-	Di (90) 41	I2	60	095.	-	Di (99) 6	I2	127
046.	-	Di (90) 42	P1	60	096.	-	Di (99) 7	P2	127
047.	-	Di (90) 43	P1	60	097.	-	Di (99) 8	P2	127
048.	-	Di (90) 44	I1	60	098.	-	Di (99) 9	I2	127
049.	-	Di (90) 45	I1	60	099.	-	Di (99) 10	I2	127
050.	-	Di (90) 46	I1	60	100.	-	Di (99) 11	B1	127

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
101.	-	Di (99) 12	V2	127	151.	-	ST (98) 42	I1	127
102.	-	Di (99) 13	I2	127	152.	-	ST (98) 43	I1	127
103.	-	Di (99) 14	Bl	127	153.	-	Di (99) 50	I1	127
104.	-	Di (99) 15	I2	127	154.	-	Di (99) 51	I1	127
105.	-	ST (98) 69	I2	127	155.	-	Di (99) 52	P1	127
106.	-	Di (99) 16	Bl	127	156.	-	ST (98) 41	P2	127
107.	-	Di (99) 17	I2	127	157.	-	Di (99) 53	I1	127
108.	-	Di (99) 18	P1	127	158.	-	Di (99) 54	I1	127
109.	-	Di (99) 19	P2	127	159.	-	Di (99) 55	I1	127
110.	-	Di (99) 20	Bl	127	160.	-	ST (98) 46	I1	127
111.	-	Di (99) 21	Bl	127	161.	-	ST (98) 47	I1	127
112.	-	Di (99) 22	Bl	127	162.	-	Di (99) 56	I1	127
113.	-	Di (99) 23	P3	127	163.	-	Di (99) 57	I2	127
114.	-	Di (99) 24	P2	127	164.	-	Di (99) 58	I2	127
115.	-	Di (99) 25	Bl	127	165.	-	Di (99) 59	P3	127
116.	-	Di (99) 26	I1	127	166.	-	Di (99) 60	I1	127
117.	-	ST (98) 21	I1	127	167.	-	Di (99) 61	I2	127
118.	-	ST (98) 22	I1	127	168.	-	Di (99) 62	I2	127
119.	-	ST (98) 23	I1	127	169.	-	Di (99) 63	I2	127
120.	-	Di (99) 27	I1	127	170.	-	Di (99) 64	P1	127
121.	-	Di (99) 28	I1	127	171.	-	Di (99) 65	P1	127
122.	-	Di (99) 29	I1	127	172.	-	Di (99) 66	I2	127
123.	-	ST (98) 1	I1	127	173.	-	Di (99) 67	Bl	127
124.	-	Di (99) 30	I1	127	174.	-	Di (99) 68	I1	127
125.	-	Di (99) 31	I1	127	175.	-	Di (99) 69	I2	127
126.	-	Di (99) 32	I1	127	176.	-	Di (99) 70	I2	127
127.	-	Di (99) 33	I1	127	177.	-	Di (99) 71	B2	127
128.	-	ST (98) 31	I1	127	178.	-	ST (98) 57	B2	127
129.	-	ST (98) 2	I1	127	179.	-	Di (99) 72	I1	127
130.	-	Di (99) 34	I1	127	180.	-	Di (99) 73	I2	127
131.	-	ST (98) 3	I1	127	181.	-	Di (99) 74	P1	127
132.	-	Di (99) 35	I1	127	182.	-	Di (99) 75	I1	127
133.	-	Di (99) 36	I1	127	183.	-	Di (99) 76	I1	127
134.	-	ST (98) 83	I1	127	184.	-	Di (99) 77	I1	127
135.	-	ST (98) 4	I1	127	185.	-	Di (99) 78	P3	127
136.	-	Di (99) 37	I1	127	186.	-	Di (99) 79	I2	127
137.	-	Di (99) 38	I1	127	187.	-	Di (99) 80	V2	127
138.	-	ST (98) 68	I1	127	188.	-	Di (99) 81	P2	127
139.	-	Di (99) 39	I2	127	189.	-	Di (99) 82	P3	127
140.	-	Di (99) 40	I2	127	190.	-	Di (99) 83	I2	127
141.	-	Di (99) 41	I1	127	191.	-	Di (99) 84	I1	127
142.	-	Di (99) 42	I1	127	192.	-	Di (99) 85	I2	127
143.	-	Di (99) 43	P1	127	193.	-	Di (99) 86	P2	127
144.	-	ST (98) 36	P1	127	194.	-	Di (99) 87	I1	127
145.	-	Di (99) 44	I2	127	195.	-	Di (99) 88	I1	127
146.	-	Di (99) 45	I2	127	196.	-	Di (99) 89	I1	127
147.	-	Di (99) 46	V2	127	197.	-	Di (99) 90	I1	127
148.	-	Di (99) 47	I1	127	198.	-	Di (99) 91	I2	127
149.	-	Di (99) 48	I2	127	199.	-	Di (99) 92	P1	127
150.	-	Di (99) 49	I1	127	200.	-	Di (99) 93	V2	127

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
201.	-	Di (99) 94	I1	127	251.	-			
202.	-	Di (99) 95	I2	127	252.	-			
203.	-	Di (99) 96	I2	127	253.	-			
204.	-	Di (99) 97	P2	127	254.	-			
205.	-	Di (99) 98	P2	127	255.	-			
206.	-	Di (99) 99	P3	127	256.	-			
207.	-	Di (99) 100	I2	127	257.	-			
208.	-	Di (99) 101	I2	127	258.	-			
209.	-	Di (99) 102	I2	127	259.	-			
210.	-	Di (99) 103	I2	127	260.	-			
211.	-	Di (99) 104	P3	127	261.	-			
212.	-	Di (99) 105	P1	127	262.	-			
213.	-	Di (99) 106	P1	127	263.	-			
214.	-	Di (99) 107	I1	127	264.	-			
215.	-	Di (99) 108	I1	127	265.	-			
216.	-	Di (99) 109	I1	127	266.	-			
217.	-	Di (99) 110	I1	127	267.	-			
218.	-	Di (99) 111	I1	127	268.	-			
219.	-	Di (99) 112	I1	127	269.	-			
220.	-	Di (99) 113	I1	127	270.	-			
221.	-	Di (99) 114	I1	127	271.	-			
222.	-	Di (99) 115	I1	127	272.	-			
223.	-	Di (99) 116	I1	127	273.	-			
224.	-	Di (99) 117	I2	127	274.	-			
225.	-	Di (99) 118	V2	127	275.	-			
226.	-	Di (99) 119	V1	127	276.	-			
227.	-	Di (99) 120	I1	127	277.	-			
228.	-	Di (99) 121	I1	127	278.	-			
229.	-	Di (99) 122	I1	127	279.	-			
230.	-	Di (99) 123	I1	127	280.	-			
231.	-	Di (99) 124	I1	127	281.	-			
232.	-	Di (99) 125	P2	127	282.	-			
233.	-	Di (99) 126	I2	127	283.	-			
234.	-	Di (99) 127	I1	127	284.	-			
235.	-	Di (99) 128	I1	127	285.	-			
236.	-	Di (99) 129	I1	127	286.	-			
237.	-	Di (99) 130	I1	127	287.	-			
238.	-	Di (99) 131	I1	127	288.	-			
239.	-	Di (99) 132	I1	127	289.	-			
240.	-	Di (99) 133	I1	127	290.	-			
241.	-	Di (99) 134	I1	127	291.	-			
242.	-	Di (99) 135	I1	127	292.	-			
243.	-	Di (99) 136	I1	127	293.	-			
244.	-	Di (99) 137	I1	127	294.	-			
245.	-	Di (99) 138	I1	127	295.	-			
246.	-	Di (99) 139	I1	127	296.	-			
247.	-				297.	-			
248.	-				298.	-			
249.	-				299.	-			
250.	-				300.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	1 RL 2/48	F/50.9	051.	-	Di (90) 47	
002.	-	1 RL 3/48		052.	-	Di (90) 48	
003.	-	1 RL 4/48	F/50.9	053.	-	Di (90) 49	
004.	-	1 RL 6/48	F/51.3	054.	-	Di (90) 50	
005.	-	1 RL 9/48	F/51.5	055.	-	Di (90) 51	
006.	-	2 RL 39.7	H/44/91	056.	-	Di (90) 52	
007.	-	2 RL 39.9+	H/48/92	057.	-	Di (90) 53	
008.	-	2 RL 47.7	H/63,64/93	058.	-	Di (90) 54	
009.	-	2 RL 47.8	H/65/93	059.	-	Di (90) 55	
010.	-	2 SP 93/94	H/68/93	060.	-	Di (90) 56	
011.	-	2 SP 94/94	H/80/94	061.	-	Di (90) 57	
012.	-	2 SP 95/94	H/75-77/94	062.	-	Di (90) 58	
013.	-	BE (92) 5	H/75-77/94	063.	-	Di (90) 59	
014.	-	2 RL 48.6	H/77-80/94	064.	-	Di (90) 60	W/113b/113c
015.	-	1 RL 13/49	F/52.2	065.	-	Di (90) 61	
016.	-	Lt (1a) 4	H/151/98	066.	-	Di (90) 62	W/113d/135
017.	-	Lt (1a) 6	H/153/98	067.	-	Di (90) 63	W/113e/135
018.	-	3T 482.6	H/153/98	068.	-	Di (90) 64	
019.	-	Di (90) 15		069.	-	2 RL 52.2	H/121,122/97
020.	-	Di (90) 16		070.	-	2 RL 51.5	H/94/95
021.	-	Di (90) 17		071.	-	2 SP 116a/96	H/121,122/97
022.	-	Di (90) 18		072.	-	2 SP 112/96	H/94/95
023.	-	Di (90) 19		073.	-	2 SP 111/95+	H/106,108/96
024.	-	Di (90) 20	W/78/132	074.	-	2 RL 52.3	H/124/97
025.	-	Di (90) 21	W/81/132	075.	-	1 RL 28/50	F/51.9
026.	-	Di (90) 22	W/81/132	076.	-	Lt (1a) 10	H/156a/99
027.	-	Di (90) 23	W/81/132	077.	-	Lt (1a) 11	H/156b/99
028.	-	Di (90) 24	W/82/132	078.	-	Lt (1a) 13	H/157a/99
029.	-	Di (90) 25	W/82/132	079.	-	Lt (1a) 14	H/157b/99
030.	-	Di (90) 26	W/83,84/132	080.	-	Lt (1a) 15	H/159/99
031.	-	Di (90) 27	W/85,86a	081.	-	2 RL 54.1	H/125a/97
032.	-	Di (90) 28	W/86c/133	082.	-	2 RL 54.1	H/125b/97
033.	-	Di (90) 29	W/87/133	083.	-	Lt (1a) 16	H/161/99
034.	-	Di (90) 30	W/87/133	084.	-	Lt (1a) 17	H/163/99
035.	-	Di (90) 31	W/89/133	085.	-	Lt (1a) 18	H/166.167/99
036.	-	Di (90) 32	W/90/133	086.	-	Di (99) 1	
037.	-	Di (90) 33	W/91/133	087.	-	Di (99) 2	
038.	-	Di (90) 34	W/92-94/133	088.	-	ST (98) 11	
039.	-	Di (90) 35	W/95/133	089.	-	Di (99) 3	W/43,46/128
040.	-	Di (90) 36	W/96/133	090.	-	ST (98) 12	&129
041.	-	Di (90) 37	W/98/133	091.	-	ST (98) 13	
042.	-	Di (90) 38		092.	-	Di (99) 4	W/44/128
043.	-	Di (90) 39	W/98/133	093.	-	Di (99) 5	W/45a/129
044.	-	Di (90) 40	W/99/133+	094.	-	ST (98) 79	W/45a/129
045.	-	Di (90) 41	W/100a/134	095.	-	Di (99) 6	W/45b/129
046.	-	Di (90) 42	W/109b/135	096.	-	Di (99) 7	W/45c/129
047.	-	Di (90) 43	W/110/135	097.	-	Di (99) 8	W/46/129
048.	-	Di (90) 44					M/15a.1, .2
049.	-	Di (90) 45		098.	-	Di (99) 9	M/15a.1, .2
050.	-	Di (90) 46		099.	-	Di (99) 10	W/46/129
				100.	-	Di (99) 11	W/48a/129

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
101.	-	Di (99) 12	W/48b/129	151.	-	ST (98) 42	
102.	-	Di (99) 13	W/49a/129	152.	-	ST (98) 43	
103.	-	Di (99) 14	W/49b/129	153.	-	Di (99) 50	
104.	-	Di (99) 15	W/51a,b/129	154.	-	Di (99) 51	
105.	-	ST (98) 69	W/51a,b/129	155.	-	Di (99) 52	M/13b.5
106.	-	Di (99) 16	W/51b,52/"	156.	-	ST (98) 41	M/13b.5
107.	-	Di (99) 17	W/53/129	157.	-	Di (99) 53	
108.	-	Di (99) 18	W/53/129	158.	-	Di (99) 54	
109.	-	Di (99) 19	W/54/130	159.	-	Di (99) 55	
110.	-	Di (99) 20	W/55/130	160.	-	ST (98) 46	
111.	-	Di (99) 21	W/29/128	161.	-	ST (98) 47	
112.	-	Di (99) 22	W/29/128	162.	-	Di (99) 56	
113.	-	Di (99) 23	W/30/128	163.	-	Di (99) 57	M/13b.7
114.	-	Di (99) 24	W/31,32,35"	164.	-	Di (99) 58	M/13b.7
115.	-	Di (99) 25	W/69b/131	165.	-	Di (99) 59	M/13b.9+
116.	-	Di (99) 26		166.	-	Di (99) 60	
117.	-	ST (98) 21		167.	-	Di (99) 61	M/14a.1
118.	-	ST (98) 22		168.	-	Di (99) 62	M/14a.4
119.	-	ST (98) 23		169.	-	Di (99) 63	M/14a.5
120.	-	Di (99) 27		170.	-	Di (99) 64	M/14a.5
121.	-	Di (99) 28		171.	-	Di (99) 65	H/xxv.8
122.	-	Di (99) 29		172.	-	Di (99) 66	H/xxv.7
123.	-	ST (98) 1		173.	-	Di (99) 67	H/xxiv.5
124.	-	Di (99) 30		174.	-	Di (99) 68	
125.	-	Di (99) 31		175.	-	Di (99) 69	H/xxxv.6
126.	-	Di (99) 32		176.	-	Di (99) 70	H/xxxv.6
127.	-	Di (99) 33		177.	-	Di (99) 71	Bible
128.	-	ST (98) 31		178.	-	ST (98) 57	Bible
129.	-	ST (98) 2		179.	-	Di (99) 72	
130.	-	Di (99) 34		180.	-	Di (99) 73	H/xxiv.2
131.	-	ST (98) 3		181.	-	Di (99) 74	H/xxiii.9+
132.	-	Di (99) 35		182.	-	Di (99) 75	
133.	-	Di (99) 36		183.	-	Di (99) 76	
134.	-	ST (98) 83		184.	-	Di (99) 77	
135.	-	ST (98) 4		185.	-	Di (99) 78	H/xxiv.3
136.	-	Di (99) 37		186.	-	Di (99) 79	H/xxiv.3
137.	-	Di (99) 38		187.	-	Di (99) 80	H. xxiv.3
138.	-	ST (98) 68		188.	-	Di (99) 81	H/xxiv.4
139.	-	Di (99) 39	M/12a.3,.4	189.	-	Di (99) 82	H/xxiv.7
140.	-	Di (99) 40	M/12a.5	190.	-	Di (99) 83	H/xxiv.9
141.	-	Di (99) 41		191.	-	Di (99) 84	
142.	-	Di (99) 42		192.	-	Di (99) 85	H/xxiv.9
143.	-	Di (99) 43	M/11b.6	193.	-	Di (99) 86	H/xxiv.9
144.	-	ST (98) 36	M/11b.6	194.	-	Di (99) 87	
145.	-	Di (99) 44	M/13b.2	195.	-	Di (99) 88	
146.	-	Di (99) 45	M/13b.1	196.	-	Di (99) 89	
147.	-	Di (99) 46	M/13b.3	197.	-	Di (99) 90	
148.	-	Di (99) 47		198.	-	Di (99) 91	H/xxv.4
149.	-	Di (99) 48	M/13b.4,.7	199.	-	Di (99) 92	H/xxv.4
150.	-	Di (99) 49		200.	-	Di (99) 93	H/xxv.5

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
201.	-	Di (99) 94		251.	-		
202.	-	Di (99) 95	H/xxvi.3,.4	252.	-		
203.	-	Di (99) 96	H/xxvi.3	253.	-		
204.	-	Di (99) 97	H/xxvi.3	254.	-		
205.	-	Di (99) 98	H/xxvi.4	255.	-		
206.	-	Di (99) 99	H/xxvi.4	256.	-		
207.	-	Di (99) 100	H/xxvi.4,.7	257.	-		
208.	-	Di (99) 101	H/xxvi.4	258.	-		
209.	-	Di (99) 102	H/xxvi.6,.7	259.	-		
210.	-	Di (99) 103	H/xxvi.7,.8	260.	-		
211.	-	Di (99) 104	H/xxvi.9	261.	-		
212.	-	Di (99) 105	H/xxvi.9+	262.	-		
213.	-	Di (99) 106	H/xxvii.2	263.	-		
214.	-	Di (99) 107		264.	-		
215.	-	Di (99) 108		265.	-		
216.	-	Di (99) 109		266.	-		
217.	-	Di (99) 110		267.	-		
218.	-	Di (99) 111		268.	-		
219.	-	Di (99) 112		269.	-		
220.	-	Di (99) 113		270.	-		
221.	-	Di (99) 114		271.	-		
222.	-	Di (99) 115		272.	-		
223.	-	Di (99) 116		273.	-		
224.	-	Di (99) 117	M/15a.2	274.	-		
225.	-	Di (99) 118	M/15a.1	275.	-		
226.	-	Di (99) 119	M/15a.1	276.	-		
227.	-	Di (99) 120		277.	-		
228.	-	Di (99) 121		278.	-		
229.	-	Di (99) 122		279.	-		
230.	-	Di (99) 123		280.	-		
231.	-	Di (99) 124		281.	-		
232.	-	Di (99) 125	W/59,63c	282.	-		
233.	-	Di (99) 126	W/63c,65	283.	-		
234.	-	Di (99) 127		284.	-		
235.	-	Di (99) 128		285.	-		
236.	-	Di (99) 129		286.	-		
237.	-	Di (99) 130		287.	-		
238.	-	Di (99) 131		288.	-		
239.	-	Di (99) 132		289.	-		
240.	-	Di (99) 133		290.	-		
241.	-	Di (99) 134		291.	-		
242.	-	Di (99) 135		292.	-		
243.	-	Di (99) 136		293.	-		
244.	-	Di (99) 137		294.	-		
245.	-	Di (99) 138		295.	-		
246.	-	Di (99) 139		296.	-		
247.	-			297.	-		
248.	-			298.	-		
249.	-			299.	-		
250.	-			300.	-		

VI CHAPTER 14 - "We Have Found the Messias"

Chapter 14 takes up the story of John the Baptist's witness to Jesus as the "Lamb of God" and the subsequent call of the first disciples. The account is based on John 1:19-51.

The chapter, now entitled "We have Found the Messias," was originally called "The First Disciples." This latter title also appears in Hanna's life of Christ as the heading of chapter 10 which covers the same topic.¹

Like Hanna, Ellen White covers the call of John, Andrew, Simon, Philip, and Nathanael. In neither account is there an attempt to reconcile the story as given in John's gospel with the record of Matthew and Mark. According to these two synoptic gospels the first two disciples called were Simon and Andrew, followed by James and John.² The setting for the call was not near the Jordan where John the Baptist was preaching but a fishing scene in Galilee. Ellen White treats the Galilee "calling" in chapter 25, "The Call by the Sea," but ties the invitation to discipleship with a preaching event recorded by Luke.³ It is of interest to note that Hanna does the same in a later chapter.⁴ Both Ellen White and Hanna in discussing the second calling bring out that the first summons to become fishers of men had not

¹William Hanna, Life of Christ, pages 100-110.

²Matthew 4:18-22 and Mark 1:16-20.

³Luke 5:1-11.

⁴Hanna, op. cit., pp. 204-212, "The Calling to the Apostolate of St. Peter, St. Andrew, St. James, St. John and St. Matthew."

"We Have Found the Messias"

resulted in full-time service.

Ellen White's earliest commentary on these verses from John's gospel is found in the January 21 and March 4, 1873, issues of the Review and Herald. Her remarks cover the major portion of her article on the "Life and Mission of John" and the first three paragraphs of "John's Mission and Death." These comments appear a few years later as the center section of chapter IV of SP, "The Mission of Christ."

The image of Christ as the ladder connecting heaven and earth occurs often in the writings of Ellen White. She frequently relates the ladder of which Christ spoke to Nathanael in the context of Nathanael's call to discipleship to the story of Jacob's ladder as presented in Genesis 28:12-15.

In Manuscript 13, 1884, entitled "The Ladder to Heaven," Ellen White introduces her topic with a reference to Christ's words spoken to Nathanael as recorded in John 1:51. After clearly identifying Christ as the ladder she turns to 2 Peter 1:1-4 and spends the next 12 pages commenting on the "ladder" of spiritual progress which Peter develops in verses 5-10 of the same chapter. She then returns to the ladder of Jacob's dream and in the final two and a half pages of the manuscript relates the two ladders to each other.

Portions of Manuscript 13, which we have in Ellen White's handscript, also appear in a sermon delivered at the

"We Have Found the Messiah"

Los Angeles camp meeting on May 10, 1884,¹ and in Our High Calling, a compilation of Ellen White writings.²

A brief use of this same manuscript material appears in a paragraph from Ellen White's piece in The Review and Herald of November 11, 1890.³ Selected comments very similar to the Manuscript 13 material are also to be found in an Ellen White letter from 1893.⁴

In the previous chapter we introduced some diary material written around 1897 but contained in a journal dated 1899. A portion of that diary [Di(99)], beginning on page 39, contains statements on the subject of this chapter. Just above the first line at the top of the page are the words, "Used in L.C." Since the material on the temptation of Christ as presented in chapter 13 ended on page 37 and our sentence numbers had reached 139, we arbitrarily began page 39 with sentence number 151. Page 38 of the diary is blank. In view of the scarcity of documents on the life of Christ in Ellen White's personal manuscript these sentences have a special importance for this study.

Several sentences taken from the previous writings of Ellen White, mentioned above, have been inserted into the DA text which follows. In some instances we are not sure if the earlier writings actually contributed to this chapter,

¹"The Vision at Bethel," ST, Vol. 10, No. 29, July 31, 1884, pages 450-451.

²The Ellen G. White Estate, Inc., (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Assoc., 1961), pp. 66-75.

³"The Mystic Ladder," RH, Vol. 67, No. 44, 1890, page 437.

⁴Letter P-47, 1893, pp. 10-12.

"We Have Found the Messias"

though the content is similar if not identical. In most cases some verbal similarities exist. In any case these earlier texts allow us to register Ellen White's use of sources in the production of her writings on the life of Christ.

Following the DA text we have added a separate section containing 69 sentences taken from Manuscript 13, 1884.¹ This material extends our knowledge of Ellen White's comments on Christ's conversation with Nathanael beyond what has been published in the DA text, and also reveals her use of sources at the handwritten level of the textual tradition.

Photocopies of the relevant portions of the Ellen White texts mentioned above, including her handwritten documents where they still exist, are included in Appendix D under chapter 14.

The source parallels we are listing for this chapter come from seven different texts representing six authors. Twice we have referred to Frederic W. Farrar, The Life of Christ,² which we designate as Farrar, LC. John Fleetwood, The Life of Our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ,³ we have included once. His parallel may be recognized by Fleetwood, LC. William Hanna's life of Christ from 1863 has been used so often it needs no further identification. Ingraham's

¹The 69 sentences involve 71 entries, because sentences 99 and 304 have been divided into two separate quotes.

²Farrar, LC (New York: Hurst & Company, 1874).

³Fleetwood, LC (Philadelphia: J. W. Bradley, 1860).

"We Have Found the Messias"

imaginative treatment of the life of Christ, The Prince of the House of David, was used in chapter 13. The two references which appear in this chapter are indicated by Ingraham, PHD. Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels by George Jones¹ has been quoted from before but only as a possible minor source. We will include over 40 references to Jones, LSFG, in listing the parallels for chapter 14. Quotations from two sermons of Henry Melvill are also introduced as source parallels. The sermon on "Experience the Test of Truth" will be identified by the book of sermons where it is found, The Golden Lectures.² We identify this work as Melvill, GL. His sermon on "Jacob's Vision and Vow," appears in Miscellaneous Sermons,³ which we have indicated by Melvill, MS.

¹Jones, LSFG (Philadelphia: J. C. Garriques & Co., 1868).

²Melvill, Henry, The Preacher in Print. Second Series. The Golden Lectures (London: James Paul: 1, Chapter House Court, n.d.). The pagination is puzzling but the sermon may be located under the date of its delivery, February 19, 1850.

³Melvill, Henry, Miscellaneous Sermons (London: "The Pulpit" Office, Glasshouse Yard, 1843), p. 285ff.

DA1/132 JOHN the Baptist was now preaching and baptizing at Bethabara, beyond Jordan. [J/23.7] (B1)

DA2/132 It was not far from this spot that God had stayed the river in its flow until Israel had passed over. [J/23.7] (P3)

DA3/132 A little distance from here the stronghold of Jericho had been overthrown by the armies of heaven. [J/23.7] (P3)

DA4/132 The memory of these events was at this time revived, and gave a thrilling interest to the Baptist's message. (I1)

DA5/132 Would not He who had wrought so wonderfully in ages past again manifest His power for Israel's deliverance? (I1)

DA6/132 Such was the thought stirring the hearts of the people who daily thronged the banks of the Jordan. (I1)

DA7/132 The preaching of John had taken so deep a hold on the nation as to demand the attention of the religious authorities. (I1)

DA8/132 The danger of insurrection caused every popular gathering to be looked upon with suspicion by the Romans, and whatever pointed toward an uprising of the people excited the fears of the Jewish rulers. [J/12/38] (P3)

DA9/132+ John had not recognized the authority of the Sanhedrin by seeking their sanction for his work; and he had reproved rulers and people, Pharisees and Sadducees alike. (I1)

DA10/133 Yet the people followed him eagerly. (I1)

DA11/133 The interest in his work seemed to be continually increasing. (I1)

23.7 Just below this place, where John was baptizing, God had divided the deep waters of the Jordan in its rapid flow, and had kept them divided till his people had passed over dry-shod; there, Jericho had fallen simply by his almighty will;. . . [Jones, LSFG]

12/38 Although the ascetic had not put himself forward as a leader, and good order had been maintained at the Jordan, yet the people were in an inflammable condition, and tumults might arise, in which case the Roman power would interfere, with vengeance upon the whole nation. [Jones, LSFG]

DA12/133 Though he had not deferred to them, the Sanhedrin accounted that, as a public teacher, he was under their jurisdiction. (11)

DA13/133 This body was made up of members chosen from the priesthood, and from the chief rulers and teachers of the nation. [J/3/37] (P2)

DA14/133 The high priest was usually the president. [J/3/37] (P1)

DA15/133 All its members were to be men advanced in years, though not aged; men of learning, not only versed in Jewish religion and history, but in general knowledge. [J/4,5/37] (P1)

DA16/133 They were to be without physical blemish, and must be married men, and fathers, as being more likely than others to be humane and considerate. [J/5/37] (P1)

DA17/133 Their place of meeting was an apartment connected with the temple at Jerusalem. [J/7/38] (P2)

DA18/133 In the days of Jewish independence the Sanhedrin was the supreme court of the nation, possessing secular as well as ecclesiastical authority. (11)

DA19/133 Though now subordinated by the Roman governors, it still exercised a strong influence in civil as well as religious matters. (11)

DA20/133 The Sanhedrin could not well defer an investigation of John's work. [J/11/38] (P2)

DA21/133 There were some who recalled the revelation made to Zacharias in the temple, and the father's prophecy that had pointed to his child as the Messiah's herald. (11)

3/37 This body, synedrion, assembly, consisted of seventy persons, with the addition of the high-priest as president; and were from the following classes of persons: 1. Officiating high-priest; 2. Ex-high-priests, and heads of the twenty-four classes of high-priests, called, by way of honor, chief-priests; 3. Such of the elders, i.e., princes of the tribes, heads of family associations, as were elected to this place, or put there by a nomination from the ruling executive authority; and 4. Appointments in a similar way from the scribes and learned men. [Jones, LSFG]

4/37 "It was required of these men that they should be religious, and learned in the arts and language; that they should have some skill in physic, arithmetic, astronomy and astrology; also to know what belonged to magic, sorcery and idolatry, so as to know how to judge them. [Jones, LSFG]

5/37 They were to be without maim or blemish of body; men of years but not extremely old; and to be fathers of families, that they might be acquainted with tenderness and compassion. [Jones, LSFG]

7/38 Their place of assembling was in a room by the courts of the Temple, and was so arranged that a portion of it projected into the priest's court, in order that it might partake of the sanctity of the place; and part was outside of it, so that the members could sit in the council, which no one could do in the court of the priests, except a king." [reference: "Lightfoot on the Temple"] [Jones, LSFG]

11/38 The Sanhedrin felt now, that it had become of the highest consequence to settle the important questions concerning John, which were agitating the public mind. [Jones, LSFG]

DA22/133 In the tumults and changes of thirty years, these things had in a great measure been lost sight of. (11)

DA23/133 They were now called to mind by the excitement concerning the ministry of John. [J/13/38] (P2)

DA24/133 It was long since Israel had had a prophet, long since such a reformation as was now in progress had been witnessed. [J/14/38] (P2)

DA25/133 The demand for confession of sin seemed new and startling. (Cf. Geikie, LC, 277.7) (11)

DA26/133 Many among the leaders would not go to hear John's appeals and denunciations, lest they should be led to disclose the secrets of their own lives. (11)

DA27/133 Yet his preaching was a direct announcement of the Messiah. (11)

DA28/133 It was well known that the seventy weeks of Daniel's prophecy, covering the Messiah's advent, were nearly ended; and all were eager to share in that era of national glory which was then expected. (11)

DA29/133 Such was the popular enthusiasm that the Sanhedrin would soon be forced either to sanction or to reject John's work. (11)

DA30/133 Already their power over the people was waning. (11)

DA31/133 It was becoming a serious question how to maintain their position. (11)

DA32/133 In the hope of arriving at some conclusion, they dispatched to the Jordan a deputation of priests and Levites to confer with the new teacher. [F/53.5] (P2)

DA33/133 A multitude were gathered, listening to his words, when the delegates approached. (11)

13,14/38 A wonderful prophet, too, this seemed to be, and the excitement was the greater from the lapse of centuries since a prophet had appeared. His annunciation of the kingdom of heaven as at hand was thrilling to every expectant heart: he was introducing a great revolution by initiating the crowds flocking to him, into a new religion; and this without authority given, or asked of the rulers.
[Jones, LSPG]

53.5 Prompted by curiosity, they despatched a deputation of priests and Levites to the Baptist, to demand of him who he was. [Fleetwood, LC]

DA34/133+ With an air of authority designed to impress the people and to command the deference of the prophet the haughty rabbis came. [J/41,42/42] (P2)

DA35/134 With a movement of respect, almost of fear, the crowd opened to let them pass. [J/40,41/42] (P2)

DA36/134 The great men, in their rich robes, in the pride of rank and power, stood before the prophet of the wilderness. [J/42/42] (P2)

DA37/134 "Who art thou?" they demanded. [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA38/134 Knowing what was in their thoughts, John answered, "I am not the Christ." [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA39/134 "What then? Art thou Elias?" [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA40/134 "I am not." [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA41/134 "Art thou that prophet?" "No." [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA42/134 "Who art thou? that we may give an answer to them that sent us." [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA43/134 What sayest thou of thyself?" [J/56-66/45] (B1)

DA44/134 "I am the voice of one crying in the wilderness, Make straight the way of the Lord, as said the prophet Esaias." [J/56-66/45] (B1)

40,41/42 The crowds gave way. Probably, in those haughty looks of the Pharisees they could read their own condemnation for being captivated by one not officially recognized, and not a Rabbi; their old reverence for priest and Levite, and additionally for Pharisees, conservators of the unwritten law with its mysterious, undefined power, crept through their hearts again, as they saw these men approach,--perhaps there to overwhelm all the Baptist's claims, and to hurl on his proselytes objurgations or even excommunications for having submitted to the new rite. [Jones, LSFG]

42/42 The deputation came in a manner to make impression of their authority, and to procure full and ready answers to their questions; bearing the phylacteries upon their brows and arms, and the wide fringes to their robes, as became Pharisees and men of rank. [Jones, LSFG]

56-66/45 "Who art thou?" the rulers asked.

The words were authoritative and abrupt. He answered, not their question, but to what he knew was in every person's mind.

"I am not the Christ."

"What then? art thou Elias?"

"I am not."

"Art thou that prophet?"

"No."

"Who art thou?--that we may give an answer to them that sent us."

"What sayest thou of thyself?"

"I am the voice of one crying in the wilderness, Make straight the way of the Lord, as said the prophet Esaias:"

[Jones, LSFG]

DA45/134 The scripture to which John referred is that beautiful prophecy of Isaiah: "Comfort ye, comfort ye My people, saith your God. (B2)

DA46/134+ Speak ye comfortably to Jerusalem, and cry unto her, that her appointed time is accomplished, that her iniquity is pardoned. . . . (B2)

DA47/135 The voice of him that crieth in the wilderness, Prepare ye the way of the lord, make straight in the desert a highway for our God. (B2)

DA48/135 Every valley shall be exalted, and every mountain and hill shall be made low: and the crooked shall be made straight, and the rough places plain: and the glory of the Lord shall be revealed, and all flesh shall see it together." Isa. 40:1-5, margin. (B2)

DA49/135 Anciently, when a king journeyed through the less frequented parts of his dominion, a company of men was sent ahead of the royal chariot to level the steep places and to fill up the hollows, that the king might travel in safety and without hindrance. [J/66/45] (P2)

DA50/135 This custom is employed by the prophet to illustrate the work of the gospel. (I1)

DA51/135 "Every valley shall be exalted, and every mountain and hill shall be made low." (B2)

DA52/135 When the Spirit of God, with its marvelous awakening power, touches the soul, it abases human pride. (I1)

DA53/135 Worldly pleasure and position and power are seen to be worthless. (I1)

DA54/135 "Imaginations, and every high thing that exalteth itself against the knowledge of God" are cast down; every thought is brought into captivity "to the obedience of Christ." 2 Cor. 10:5. (B2)

66/45. . . (the reply having allusion to a custom prevailing in those eastern countries, when a monarch was about to make a journey; at which times men were sent before to remove obstructions and to make level the roads). [Jones, LSG]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA55/135 Then humility and self-sacrificing love, so little valued among men, are exalted as alone of worth. (11)

DA56/135 This is the work of the gospel, of which John's message was a part. (11)

DA57/135 The rabbis continued their questioning: "Why baptizest thou then, if thou be not that Christ, nor Elias, neither that prophet?" (B2)

DA58/135 The words "that prophet" had reference to Moses. (11)

DA59/135 The Jews had been inclined to the belief that Moses would be raised from the dead, and taken to heaven. (11)

DA60/135 They did not know that he had already been raised. (11)

DA61/135 When the Baptist began his ministry, many thought that he might be the prophet Moses risen from the dead, for he seemed to have a thorough knowledge of the prophecies and of the history of Israel. (11)

DA62/135 It was believed also that before the Messiah's advent, Elijah would personally appear. (11)

DA63/135 This expectation John met in his denial; but his words had a deeper meaning. (11)

DA64/135 Jesus afterward said, referring to John, "If ye are willing to receive it, this is Elijah, which is to come." Matt. 11:14, R. V. (11)

DA65/135 John came in the spirit and power of Elijah, to do such a work as Elijah did. (11)

DA66/135 If the Jews had received him, it would have been accomplished for them. (11)

DA67/135 But they did not receive his message. (I1)

DA68/135 To them he was not Elijah. (I1)

DA69/135 He could not fulfill for them the mission he came to accomplish. (I1)

DA70/136 Many of those gathered at the Jordan had been present at the baptism of Jesus; but the sign then given had been manifest to but few among them. [H/12/101] (I2)

Di(99)156 Many were present at the baptism of John, but the revelation or sign given John they did not see. [H/12/101] (I2)

DA71/136 During the preceding months of the Baptist's ministry, many had refused to heed the call to repentance. (I1)

DA72/136 Thus they had hardened their hearts and darkened their understanding. (I1)

DA73/136 When Heaven bore testimony to Jesus at His baptism, they perceived it not. (I1)

DA74/136 Eyes that had never been turned to him that is invisible beheld not the revelation of the glory of God; ears that had never listened to His voice heard not the words of witness. (I1)

DA75/136 So it is now. (I1)

DA76/136 Often the presence of Christ and the ministering angels is manifest in the assemblies of the people, and yet there are many who know it not. (I1)

Di(99)159 His presence is among them, demonstrating his mission and angels that accompany him is [sic] with him in the very congregations, but they know him not. (I1)

12/101 That John needed to point him out in order to recognition [sic] confirms our belief, derived in the first instance directly from the narrative itself, that at the baptism none but John and Jesus heard the voice from heaven, or saw the descending dove. [Hanna, LC]

DA77/136 They discern nothing unusual. (I1)

Di(99)160 They realize nothing unusual. (I1)

DA78/136 But to some the Saviour's presence is revealed.
(I1)

Di(99)161 But to some, he is revealed; his presence
is felt. (I1)

DA79/136 Peace and joy animate their hearts. (I1)

Di(99)162 Gladness, peace and joy animates [sic]
their hearts. (I1)

DA80/136 They are comforted, encouraged, and blessed. (I1)

Di(99)163 They are comforted, they are encouraged,
they are blessed. (I1)

DA81/136 The deputies from Jerusalem had demanded of John,
"Why baptizest thou?" and they were awaiting his answer.
[H/9/101] (I2)

Di(99)154 The deputies obtained so little light in
regard to John they felt little interest to know who
this worthier than John was: "I baptize with water,
but there standeth one among you whom ye know not; he
it is who coming after me is preferred before me
whose shoes latchet I am not worthy to unloose."
[H/8,9/101] (P2)

DA82/136 Suddenly, as his glance swept over the throng, his
eye kindled, his face was lighted up, his whole being was
stirred with deep emotion. [J/19/96] (I2)

DA83/136 With outstretched hands he cried, "I baptize in
water: in the midst of you standeth One whom ye know not,
even He that cometh after me, the latchet of whose shoe I am
not worthy to unloose." John 1:27, R. V., margin. (B2)

Di(99)151 Hitherto John had spoken hesitatingly in
regard to Christ being the One for whose coming he
was preparing the way, for he had been promised he
should have a sign from heaven symbolizing who was
the one to come. [H/7/100] (P2)

8/101 From the day of his baptism Jesus had withdrawn John knew not whither, but now he sees him in the crowd, and says: "I baptize with water: but there standeth one among you, whom ye know not; he it is, who, coming after me, is preferred before me, whose shoe's latched I am not worthy to unloose." [Hanna, LC]

9/101 Having got so little to satisfy them as to who the Baptist was, it does not seem that the deputies from Jerusalem troubled themselves to make any inquiries as to who this other and greater than John was. [Hanna, LC]

19/96 And the Baptist's face again took the glow of inspiration. [Jones, LSFG]

7/100 Hitherto he had spoken indeterminately of one whom he knew not, the greater than he, who was to come after him; but now the sign from heaven had been given, the Spirit had been seen descending and abiding on Jesus. [Hanna, LC]

DA84/136 The message was distinct and unequivocal, to be carried back to the Sanhedrin. [J/72/46] (P2)

DA85/136 The words of John could apply to no other than the long-promised One. [J/71/46] (P2)

DA86/136 The Messiah was among them! [J/69,71/46] (P2)

DA87/136 In amazement priests and rulers gazed about them, hoping to discover Him of whom John had spoken. [J/70/46] (P2)

DA88/136 But He was not distinguishable among the throng. (I1)

DA89/136 When at the baptism of Jesus, John pointed to Him as the Lamb of God, a new light was shed upon the Messiah's work. (I1)

DA90/136 The prophet's mind was directed to the words of Isaiah, "He is brought as a lamb to the slaughter." Isa. 53:7. (B2)

DA91/136 During the weeks that followed, John with new interest studied the prophecies and the teaching of the sacrificial service. (I1)

DA92/136+ He did not distinguish clearly the two phases of Christ's work,--as a suffering sacrifice and a conquering king,--but he saw that His coming had a deeper significance than priests or people had discerned. (I1)

DA93/137 When he beheld Jesus among the throng on His return from the desert, he confidently looked for Him to give the people some sign of His true character. (I1)

Di(99)164 John is looking and expecting that on the return of Christ from the desert the one [sic] in their midst will give some sign that he will be recognized in his true character, but the prophet sees that Christ makes no move in this direction. (I1)

72/46 That was their answer, and such the intelligence that the emissaries were to carry back to Jerusalem, and to the Sanhedrim. [Jones, LSFG]

71/46 No one could doubt that John meant by this The Christ, the great Messiah that had been promised to the world. [Jones, LSFG]

69/46 Among them!! [Jones, LSFG]

70/46 And all interest in the officials and in John himself must have been lost, as men started and turned inquiring glances among the crowd, making scrutiny for him about whom the astounding announcement had been made. [Jones, LSFG]

DA94/137 Almost impatiently he waited to hear the Saviour declare his mission; but no word was spoken, no sign given. (I1)

DA95/137 Jesus did not respond to the Baptist's announcement of him, but mingled with the disciples of John, giving no outward evidence of His special work, and taking no measures to bring himself to notice. [H/1/100] (P2)

2SP53/61+ His long fast ended, the victory won, he returns to the banks of the Jordan, mingling again with the disciples of John, yet giving no outward evidence of his special work, and taking no measures to bring himself to notice. [H/1/100] (P1)

Di(99)166 John is waiting almost impatiently to hear his voice lifted up declaring himself, but Jesus is among them as a common personage all day. [H/1/100] (I2)

DA96/137 The next day John sees Jesus coming. [H/17/101] (B1)

DA97/137 With the light of the glory of God resting upon him, the prophet stretches out his hands, declaring, "Behold, the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world!" [H/17/101] (B1)

DA98/137 This is He of whom I said, After me cometh a man which is become before me. . . . [H/18/101] (B1)

DA99/137 And I knew him not; but that He should be made manifest to Israel, for this cause came I baptizing in water. . . . [H/19/101] (B1)

DA100/137 I have beheld the Spirit descending as a dove out of heaven; and it abode upon Him. [H/20/101] (B1)

DA101/137 And I knew Him not: but He that sent me to baptize in water, He said unto me, Upon whomsoever thou shalt see the Spirit descending, and abiding upon Him, the same is He that baptizeth with the Holy Spirit. [H/21/101] (B1)

1/100 From forty days in the desert, from the long fast, from the triple assault, from the great victory won, from the companionship of the ministering angels, Jesus returns to the banks of the Jordan, and mingles, unnoticed and unknown, among the disciples of the Baptist. [Hanna, LC]

17/101 The next day, therefore, as John sees Jesus coming to him, while yet he is some way off, he points to him, and says: "Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world! [Hanna, LC]

18/101 This is he of whom I said, After me cometh a man which is preferred before me; for he was before me. [Hanna, LC]

19/101 And I knew him not: but that he should be made manifest to Israel, therefore am I come baptizing with water....[sic] [Hanna, LC]

20/101 I saw the Spirit descending from heaven like a dove, and it abode upon him. [Hanna, LC]

21/101 And I knew him not: but he that sent me to baptize with water, the same said unto me, Upon whom thou shalt see the Spirit descending, and remaining on him, the same is he which baptizeth with the Holy Ghost. [Hanna, LC]

DA102/137 And I have seen, and have borne witness that this is the Son of God." John 1:29-34, R. V., margin.
[H/22/101] (B1)

DA103/137 Was this the Christ? (I1)

DA104/137 With awe and wonder the people looked upon the One just declared to be the Son of God. (I1)

Di(99)172 John did not proclaim him king of Israel, Messiah the Prince, but John declares him to be the Son of God. [H/24,25/101] (P1)

Di(99)173 He had heard the voice from the Infinite One saying, "This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased." [H/26/101] (V2)

Di(99)174 John was re-echoing the testimony of God himself. [H/27/101] (V2)

Di(99)175 John did not take in the full significance of the words of the Father. [H/28/101] (P1)

DA105/137 They had been deeply moved by the words of John. (I1)

DA106/137 He had spoken to them in the name of God. (I1)

DA107/137 They had listened to him day after day as he reproved their sins, and daily the conviction that he was sent of Heaven had strengthened. (I1)

DA108/137 But who was this One greater than John the Baptist? (I1)

DA109/137 In His dress and bearing there was nothing that betokened rank. [J/77/46] (I2)

DA110/137 He was apparently a simple personage, clad like themselves in the humble garments of the poor. [J/5/95] (P2)

22/101 And I saw, and bare record that this is the Son of God." [Hanna, LC]

24/101 There is no mention here of Jesus as Messiah, the Prince, the King of Israel. [Hanna, LC]

25/101 The record that John bears of him is, that he is the Son of God, the Lamb of God. [Hanna, LC]

26/101 He had lately heard the voice from heaven saying: "Thou art my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased." [Hanna, LC]

27/101 In giving him this title, in calling him the Son of God, John was but reechoing, as it were, the testimony of the Father. [Hanna, LC]

28/101 Taught thus to use and to apply it, it may be fairly questioned whether the Baptist in his first employment of it entered into the full significance of the term, as declarative of Christ's unity of nature with the Father. [Hanna, LC]

77/46 He came with no pomp, but quietly among them: no earthly parade of power, no attendance. .. but alone, in simplicity of dress and simplicity of manner. [Jones, LSFG]

5/95 For he to whom John pointed was a simple personage, in ordinary costume: one like themselves, except that grandeur of expression in face, and that dignity combined with simplicity and unassumingness of manner, which always belong to true greatness even in men. [Jones, LSFG]

DA111/137 There were in the throng some who at Christ's baptism had beheld the divine glory, and had heard the voice of God. (I1)

DA112/137 But since that time the Saviour's appearance had greatly changed. [I/141.7] (I2)

DA113/137 At His baptism they had seen His countenance transfigured in the light of heaven; now, pale, worn, and emaciated, He had been recognized only by the prophet John. [I/156.8,157.6] (I2)

DA114/137 But as the people looked upon Him, they saw a face where divine compassion was blended with conscious power. [J/79/46] (P3)

DA115/137 Every glance of the eye, every feature of the countenance, was marked with humility, and expressive of unutterable love. [J/79/46] [J/16/96] (P3)

DA116/137+ He seemed to be surrounded by an atmosphere of spiritual influence. (I1)

DA117/138 While his manners were gentle and unassuming, He impressed men with a sense of power that was hidden, yet could not be wholly concealed. [J/79/46,4-6/95,16/96] (P3)

DA118/138 Was this the One for whom Israel had so long waited? [J/5/95] (P3)

141.7 He stopped, and turned upon them a visage so pale, and marred with sadness and anguish, that they both stood still and gazed upon Him with amazement at beholding such a change. [Ingraham, PHD]

156.8 "He turned His pale countenance full upon me, and extended towards me His emaciated hands, while He smiled faintly, and blessed me and said: . . . [Ingraham, PHD]

157.6 Worn and emaciated by long abstinence, weak through suffering, He looked but the shadow of himself. [Ingraham, PHD, 157]

79/46 But the multitudes might have noticed the wonderful dignity and majesty on that brow; the quiet composure of manner, where conscious omnipotence calmly rested; the winningness of features, where unbounded love drew the lines, and fully impressed itself; and when he spake, the modulations of his voice, where gentleness and benevolence ruled, although at times that voice could take the impressive tones of command. [Jones, LSFG]

16/96 He knew all this, and so he came, not only as man, but as man in humility and in commonness among men: but yet, with the consciousness which he carried within him, what an impressiveness of internal power and grandeur there was to be recognized, on observation, as he appeared there among the astounded crowds about John; astounded by the seeming contradictions, such lowliness yet such greatness claimed for him by the Baptist and through John by heaven itself. [Jones, LSFG]

4,5/95 But was this the Christ? For he to whom John pointed was a simple personage, in ordinary costume: one like themselves, except that grandeur of expression in face, and that dignity combined with simplicity and unassumingness of manner, which always belong to true greatness even in men. [Jones, LSFG]

6/95 Here they produced a Presence which was indeed felt. [Jones, LSFG]

DA119/138 Jesus came in poverty and humiliation, that He might be our example as well as our Redeemer.
[J/13,15,16/96] (P2)

DA120/138 If He had appeared with kingly pomp, how could He have taught humility? how could He have presented such cutting truths as in the Sermon on the Mount? [J/13,15/96]
(P3)

DA(MS)114/178 Had he appeared with kingly pomp, followed by a retinue of the great men of the earth, how could he have taught humility? [J/13,15/96]
(P2)

DA121/138 Where would have been the hope of the lowly in life had Jesus come to dwell as a king among men? [J/15/96]
(P3)

DA122/138 To the multitude, however, it seemed impossible that the one designated by John should be associated with their lofty anticipations. [J/17/96] (P3)

DA123/138 Thus many were disappointed, and greatly perplexed. [J/17/96] (P3)

DA124/138 The words which the priests and rabbis so much desired to hear, that Jesus would now restore the kingdom to Israel, had not been spoken. (11)

DA125/138 For such a king they had been waiting and watching; such a king they were ready to receive. (11)

DA126/138 But one who sought to establish in their hearts a kingdom of righteousness and peace, they would not accept. (11)

DA127/138 On the following day, while two disciples were standing near, John again saw Jesus among the people.
[J/18/96] (P1)

DA128/138 Again the face of the prophet was lighted up with glory from the Unseen, as he cried, "Behold the Lamb of God!" [J/19/96] (V2)

13/96 Had Christ come in pomp and majesty, with the retinues of the great men of earth, there is many a heart at present doubting or repellant that would gladly open to receive him.

15/96 He was to be the Teacher and the Example as well as the Redeemer, and where, if such earthly pomp and circumstance had been around him, where could ever have been the force of such a sermon as that on the Mount, or of his parables, or of his injunctions respecting humility in soul and action, or indeed of all his great teachings felt now to be the life of the world? where that blessedness of fellowship recognized in him by the lowly in life? how could any of this have been, if he had come amid exaltations and had so dwelt on the earth? [Jones, LSFG]

17/96 They were amazed and confounded; they reasoned, doubted; yielded willingly to doubts, for they clung to the old expectation of coming Jewish earthly grandeur, unwilling to let it go. [Jones, LSFG]

18,19/96 On the following day, while two of John's disciples were standing near by, Jesus came in sight, and the Baptist's face again took the glow of inspiration, as he cried:

"Behold the Lamb of God!" [Jones, LSFG]

DA129/138 The words thrilled the hearts of the disciples.
[J/20/96] (V2)

DA130/138 They did not fully understand them. [H/55/104]
(P3)

DA131/138 What meant the name that John had given
Him,--"the Lamb of God"? [H/55/104] (P3)

DA132/138 John himself had not explained it. [H/53/104]
(P3)

DA133/138 Leaving John, they went to seek Jesus. (B1)

DA134/138 One of the two was Andrew, the brother of Simon;
the other was John the evangelist. [F/122.6] [H/61/104]
(P1)

DA135/138 These were Christ's first disciples. [H/68/105]
(I2)

DA136/138 Moved by an irresistible impulse, they followed
Jesus,--anxious to speak with Him, yet awed and silent, lost
in the overwhelming significance of the thought, "Is this
the Messiah?" [H/70/105] (I2)

DA137/138 Jesus knew that the disciples were following Him.
[H/72/105] (P3)

DA138/138 They were the first fruits of His ministry, and
there was joy in the heart of the divine Teacher as these
souls responded to His grace. [H/72/105] (I2)

DA139/138 Yet turning, He asked only, "What seek ye?"
[H/73/105] (B1)

DA140/138 He would leave them free to turn back or to speak
of their desire. [H/74/105] (P2)

20/96 The two disciples, how they were thrilled by the words! [Jones, LSFG]

55/104 Neither of these two men may know as yet in what sense he is the Lamb of God, nor how by him their sin is to be taken away; but both have felt their need of some one willing and able to guide their agitated hearts to a secure haven of rest, and they hope to find in him thus pointed out the one they need. [Hanna, LC]

53/104 Looking upon Jesus as he walked, he directed their attention to him by simply saying once again, "Behold the LAMB OF GOD!"--leaving it to their memory to supply all about him which in the course of the two preceding days he had declared. [Hanna, LC]

122.6 One of those two youths who thus came earliest to Christ was Andrew. The other suppressed his own name because he was the narrator, the beloved disciple, the Evangelist St. John. [Farrar, LC]

61/104 One of them is Andrew, better known to us by his brotherhood to Simon. [Hanna, LC]

68/105 He was one at least of the first two men who became followers of the Lamb; and that because of their having heard him described as the Lamb of God. [Hanna, LC]

70/105 The two disciples follow Jesus silently, respectfully, admiringly--anxious to address him, yet unwilling to obtrude. [Hanna, LC]

72/105 The instinct of that love which is already drawing them to him tells him that he is being followed for the first time by human footsteps, answering to warm-beating, anxious human hearts. [Hanna, LC]

73/105 He turns and says to them, "What seek ye?" [Hanna, LC]

74/105 A vague and general question, which left it open to them to give any answer that they pleased, to connect their movement with him or not. [Hanna, LC]

DA141/138 Of one purpose only were they conscious. (I1)

DA142/138 One presence filled their thought. (I1)

DA143/138 They exclaimed, "Rabbi, . . . where dwellest Thou?" [H/78/105] (B1)

DA144/138 In a brief interview by the wayside they could not receive that for which they longed. [H/76/105] (P1)

DA145/138 They desired to be alone with Jesus, to sit at His feet, and hear His words. [H/77/105] (P2)

DA146/139 "He saith unto them, Come and see. [H/79a/105] (B1)

DA147/139 They came and saw where He dwelt, and abode with Him that day." [H/79b/105] (B1)

DA148/139 If John and Andrew had possessed the unbelieving spirit of the priests and rulers, they would not have been found as learners at the feet of Jesus. (I1)

DA149/139 They would have come to Him as critics, to judge his words. (I1)

DA150/139 Many thus close the door to the most precious opportunities. (I1)

DA151/139 But not so did these first disciples. (I1)

DA152/139 They had responded to the Holy Spirit's call in the preaching of John the Baptist. (I1)

DA153/139 Now they recognized the voice of the heavenly Teacher. (I1)

DA154/139 To them the words of Jesus were full of freshness and truth and beauty. (I1)

78/105 "Rabbi"--they say to him, the first time doubtless that Jesus was ever so addressed--"where dwellest thou?"
[Hanna, LC]

76/105 It is not any short and hurried converse by the way that will satisfy their ardent longings. [Hanna, LC]

77/105 They would have hours with him, days with him alone in the seclusion of his home. [Hanna, LC]

79a/105 He saith to them, Come and see; [Hanna, LC]

79b/105 and they came and saw where he dwelt, and abode with him that day, for it was about the tenth hour. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA155/139 A divine illumination was shed upon the teaching of the Old Testament Scriptures. (I1)

DA156/139 The many-sided themes of truth stood out in new light. (I1)

DA157/139 It is contrition and faith and love that enable the soul to receive wisdom from heaven. (I1)

DA158/139 Faith working by love is the key of knowledge, and everyone that loveth "knoweth God." 1 John 4:7. (I1)

DA159/139 The disciple John was a man of earnest and deep affection, ardent, yet contemplative. [F/123.6] (P3)

DA160/139 He had begun to discern the glory of Christ,--not the worldly pomp and power for which he had been taught to hope, but "the glory as of the Only-begotten of the Father, full of grace and truth." John 1:14. (I1)

DA161/139 He was absorbed in contemplation of the wondrous theme. [H/87/106] (P3)

DA162/139 Andrew sought to impart the joy that filled his heart. [H/88/106] (I2)

DA163/139 Going in search of his brother Simon, he cried, "We have found the Messiah." (B2)

DA164/139 Simon waited for no second bidding. (I1)

DA165/139 He also had heard the preaching of John the Baptist, and he hastened to the Saviour. (I1)

DA166/139 The eye of Christ rested upon him, reading his character and his life history. [H/90/106] (P2)

123.6 How was it that these youths of Galilee, how was it that a John so fervid yet contemplative, a Peter so impetuous in his affections yet so timid in his resolves, were thus brought at once--brought, as it were, by a single look, by a single word--to the Saviour's feet? [Farrar, LC]

87/106 And there for all day long, and on into the quiet watches of the night, would he sit drinking in our Lord's first opening of his great message of mercy from the Father. [Hanna, LC]

88/106 Andrew has something of the restless, active spirit of his brother in him, and so no sooner has he himself attained a sure conviction that this is indeed the Christ whom he has found, than he hurries out to seek his own brother Simon and bring him to Jesus. [Hanna, LC]

90/106 The Lord looks upon Simon and sees all he is and all that he is yet to be. [Hanna, LC]

DA167/139 His impulsive nature, his loving, sympathetic heart, his ambition and self-confidence, the history of his fall, his repentance, his labors, and his martyr death,--the Saviour read it all, and He said, "Thou art Simon the son of Jona: thou shalt be called Cephas, which is by interpretation, A stone." [H/91/106] (P2)

DA168/139 "The day following Jesus would go forth into Galilee, and findeth Philip, and saith unto him, Follow Me." (B2)

DA169/139 Philip obeyed the command, and straightway he also became a worker for Christ. (I1)

DA170/139 Philip called Nathanael. (I1)

DA171/139 The latter had been among the throng when the Baptist pointed to Jesus as the Lamb of God. [J/99.3] (P2)

DA172/139 As Nathanael looked upon Jesus, he was disappointed. (I1)

DA173/139 Could this man, who bore the marks of toil and poverty, be the Messiah? (I1)

DA174/139 Yet Nathanael could not decide to reject Jesus, for the message of John had brought conviction to his heart. (I1)

DA175/140 At the time when Philip called him, Nathanael had withdrawn to a quiet grove to meditate upon the announcement of John and the prophecies concerning the Messiah. [H/107,108/107] (P3)

DA176/140 He prayed that if the one announced by John was the deliverer, it might be made known to him, and the Holy Spirit rested upon him with assurance that God had visited his people and raised up a horn of salvation for them. (I1)

91/106 His great confession, his three denials, his bitter repentance, his restoration, the great services rendered, the death like that of his Master he is to die, all are present to the thoughts of Jesus as he looks. "Thou art Simon," he says at once to him, as if he had known him from his youth;--"Simon, the son of Jona." [Hanna, LC]

99.3 There was among the throngs at the Jordan a man, Nathanael by name, belonging to Cana in Galilee, a town about eight miles north of Nazareth. [Jones, LSFG]

107,108/107 Before Philip called him, he had been under the fig-tree, the chosen place for meditation and prayer with the devout of Israel. There had he been pondering in his heart, wondering when the Hope of Israel was to come, and praying that it might be soon, when a friend comes and tells him that the very one he has been praying for has appeared. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA177/140 Philip knew that his friend was searching the prophecies, and while Nathanael was praying under a fig tree, Philip discovered his retreat. (11)

DA178/140 They had often prayed together in this secluded spot hidden by the foliage. (11)

DA179/140 The message, "We have found Him, of whom Moses in the law, and the prophets, did write," seemed to Nathanael a direct answer to his prayer. (11)

DA180/140 But Philip had yet a trembling faith. (11)

DA181/140 He added doubtfully, "Jesus of Nazareth, the son of Joseph." (11)

DA182/140 Again prejudice arose in Nathanael's heart. (11)

DA183/140 He exclaimed, "Can there any good thing come out of Nazareth?" (B2)

DA184/140 Philip entered into no controversy. [M/81.5]
(V2)

DA185/140 He said, "Come and see. (B2)

DA186/140 Jesus saw Nathanael coming to Him, and saith of him, Behold an Israelite indeed, in whom is no guile!" (B2)

DA187/140 In surprise Nathanael exclaimed, "Whence knowest Thou me? (B2)

DA188/140 Jesus answered and said unto him, Before that Philip called thee, when thou wast under the fig tree, I saw thee." (B2)

81.5 The reply of Philip is every way observable. He entered on no controversy, he attempted no discussion; he felt that the means which had been effectual with himself were most likely to be effectual with Nathanael; . . . [Melville, GL(50)]

DA189/140 It was enough. (11)

DA190/140 The divine Spirit that had borne witness to Nathanael in his solitary prayer under the fig tree now spoke to him in the words of Jesus. (11)

DA191/140 Though in doubt, and yielding somewhat to prejudice, Nathanael had come to Christ with an honest desire for truth, and now his desire was met. [H/113/107] (12)

DA192/140 His faith went beyond that of the one who had brought him to Jesus. [H/113/107] (12)

DA193/140 He answered and said, "Rabbi, Thou art the Son of God; Thou art the King of Israel." (B2)

DA194/140 If Nathanael had trusted to the rabbis for guidance, he would never have found Jesus. (11)

DA195/140+ It was by seeing and judging for himself that he became a disciple. (11)

DA196/141 So in the case of many today whom prejudice withholds from good. (11)

DA197/141 How different would be the result if they would "come and see"! (11)

DA198/141 While they trust to the guidance of human authority, none will come to a saving knowledge of the truth. (11)

DA199/141 Like Nathanael, we need to study God's word for ourselves, and pray for the enlightenment of the Holy Spirit. (11)

DA200/141 He who saw Nathanael under the fig tree will see us in the secret place of prayer. (11)

113/107 Nathanael comes with doubting mind, but a guileless heart; and so now, without dealing with it intellectually, the doubt is scattered by our Lord's quick glance penetrating into his inner spirit, and an instant and sure faith is at once planted in Nathanael's breast. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA201/141 Angels from the world of light are near to those who in humility seek for divine guidance. (11)

DA202/141 With the calling of John and Andrew and Simon, of Philip and Nathanael, began the foundation of the Christian church. [H/128/109] (P3)

DA203/141 John directed two of his disciples to Christ. [H/136/109] (P2)

DA204/141 Then one of these, Andrew, found his brother, and called him to the Saviour. [H/136/109] (P2)

DA205/141 Philip was then called, and he went in search of Nathanael. [H/136/109] (P2)

DA206/141 These examples should teach us the importance of personal effort, of making direct appeals to our kindred, friends, and neighbors. [H/137/109] (P2)

2SPI23/66 It teaches them the importance of personal effort, making direct appeals to relatives, friends and acquaintances. [H/137/109] (P1)

DA207/141 There are those who for a lifetime have professed to be acquainted with Christ, yet who have never made a personal effort to bring even one soul to the Saviour. [H/138/109+] (P2)

DA208/141 They leave all the work for the minister. (11)

DA209/141 He may be well qualified for his calling, but he cannot do that which God has left for the members of the church. (11)

DA210/141 There are many who need the ministration of loving Christian hearts. (11)

128/109 These five men were the first disciples of Jesus, and in the narrative of their becoming so we have the history of the infancy of the church of the living God, that great community of the saints, that growing and goodly company, swelling out to a multitude that no man can number, out of every kindred, and tongue, and people, and nation. [Hanna, LC]

136/109 By John speaking to two, Jesus to one, Andrew to one, Phillip to one. [Hanna, LC]

137/109 It is the same species of agency similarly employed which God has always most richly blessed; the direct, earnest, loving appeal of one man to his acquaintance, relative, or friend. [Hanna, LC]

138/109+ How many are there among us who have been engaged for years either in supporting by our liberality, or aiding by our actual service one or other of those societies whose object is to spread Christianity, but who may seldom if ever have endeavored by direct and personal address, to influence one human soul for its spiritual and eternal good! [Hanna, LC]

DA211/141 Many have gone down to ruin who might have been saved if their neighbors, common men and women, had put forth personal effort for them. [H/134/109] (I2)

DA212/141 Many are waiting to be personally addressed. [H/134/109] (I2)

DA213/141 In the very family, the neighborhood, the town, where we live, there is work for us to do as missionaries for Christ. (I1)

DA214/141 If we are Christians, this work will be our delight. (I1)

DA215/141 No sooner is one converted than there is born within him a desire to make known to others what a precious friend he has found in Jesus. (I1)

DA216/141 The saving and sanctifying truth cannot be shut up in his heart. (I1)

DA217/141 All who are consecrated to God will be channels of light. (I1)

DA218/141 God makes them His agents to communicate to others the riches of His grace. (I1)

DA219/141 His promise is, "I will make them and the places round about My hill a blessing; and I will cause the shower to come down in his season; there shall be showers of blessing." Ezek. 34:26. (I1)

DA220/141 Philip said to Nathanael, "Come and see." (I1)

DA221/141 He did not ask him to accept another's testimony, but to behold Christ for himself. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - SOURCES

134/109 Whatever these means and methods may be, in order to be effectual they must finally resolve themselves into direct individual address. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA222/141+ Now that Jesus has ascended to heaven, His disciples are His representatives among men, and one of the most effective ways of winning souls to Him is in exemplifying His character in our daily life. (11)

DA223/142 Our influence upon others depends not so much upon what we say as upon what we are. (11)

DA224/142 Men may combat and defy our logic, they may resist our appeals; but a life of disinterested love is an argument they cannot gainsay. (11)

DA225/142 A consistent life, characterized by the meekness of Christ, is a power in the world. (11)

DA226/142 The teaching of Christ was the expression of an inwrought conviction and experience, and those who learn of Him become teachers after the divine order. (11)

DA227/142 The word of God, spoken by one who is himself sanctified through it, has a life-giving power that makes it attractive to the hearers, and convicts them that it is a living reality. (11)

DA228/142 When one has received the truth in the love of it, he will make this manifest in the persuasion of his manner and the tones of his voice. (11)

DA229/142 He makes known that which he himself has heard, seen, and handled of the word of life, that others may have fellowship with him through the knowledge of Christ. (11)

DA230/142 His testimony, from lips touched with a live coal from off the altar, is truth to the receptive heart, and works sanctification upon the character. (11)

DA231/142 And he who seeks to give light to others will himself be blessed. (11)

DA232/142 "There shall be showers of blessing." (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA233/142 "He that watereth shall be watered also himself."
Prov. 11:25. (B2)

DA234/142 God could have reached His object in saving sinners without our aid; but in order for us to develop a character like Christ's, we must share in His work. (I1)

DA235/142 In order to enter into His joy,--the joy of seeing souls redeemed by His sacrifice,--we must participate in His labors for their redemption. (I1)

DA236/142 Nathanael's first expression of his faith, so full and earnest and sincere, fell like music on the ears of Jesus. [H/116/108] (P2)

DA237/142 And He "answered and said unto him, Because I said unto thee, I saw thee under the fig tree, believest thou? thou shalt see greater things than these."
[H/117a/108] (B1)

DA238/142 The Saviour looked forward with joy to His work in preaching good tidings to the meek, binding up the brokenhearted, and proclaiming liberty to the captives of Satan. (I1)

DA239/142 At thought of the precious blessings He had brought to men, Jesus added, "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man."
[H/117b/108] (B1)

DA240/142 Here Christ virtually says, On the bank of the Jordan the heavens were opened, and the Spirit descended like a dove upon Me. [H/118/108] (P1)

DA241/142 That scene was but a token that I am the Son of God. [H/119/108] (I2)

DA242/142 If you believe on Me as such, your faith shall be quickened. [H/120a/108] (V2)

116/108 There was something so fresh, so fervent, so full-hearted in the words, they fell so pleasantly on the ear of Jesus, that a bright vision rose before his eye of the richer things that were yet in store for all that believe on him. [Hanna, LC]

117a/108 First, he says to Nathanael individually, "Because I said unto thee, I saw thee under the fig-tree, believest thou? thou shalt see greater things than these;" [Hanna, LC]

117b/108 and then looking on the others, while still addressing himself to him, he adds, "Verily, verily I say unto you, hereafter, or rather from this time forward, ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man." [Hanna, LC]

118/108 You have heard, that a few weeks ago, on the banks of the river, the heavens opened for a moment above my head, and the Spirit was seen coming down like a dove upon me. [Hanna, LC]

119/108 That was but a sign. [Hanna, LC]

120a/108 Believe what that sign was meant to confirm; believe in me as the Lamb of God, the Saviour of the world, the baptizer with the Holy Ghost, and your eye of faith shall be quickened, [Hanna, LC]

DA243/142 You shall see that the heavens are opened, and are never to be closed. [H/120b/108] (P1)

DA244/142 I have opened them to you. [H/120b/108] (V2)

DA245/142+ The angels of God are ascending, bearing the prayers of the needy and distressed to the Father above, and descending, bringing blessing and hope, courage, help, and life, to the children of men. [H/120c/108] (P2)

2SP138/67 I have opened them for you, and the angels of God, that are united with me in the reconciliation between earth and Heaven, uniting the believers on the earth with the Father above, will be ascending, bearing the prayers of the needy and distressed from the earth to the Father above, and descending, bringing blessings of hope, courage, health, and life, for the children of men. [H/120c/108] (P1)

DA246/143 The angels of God are ever passing from earth to heaven, and from heaven to earth. (11)

DA247/143 The miracles of Christ for the afflicted and suffering were wrought by the power of God through the ministration of the angels. (11)

DA248/143 And it is through Christ, by the ministration of his heavenly messengers, that every blessing comes from God to us. (11)

DA249/143 In taking upon Himself humanity, our Saviour unites His interests with those of the fallen sons and daughters of Adam, while through His divinity He grasps the throne of God. [H/123/108] (P2)

DA250/143 And thus Christ is the medium of communication of men with God, and of God with men. [M/286a.9] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - SOURCES

120b/108 and you shall see those heavens standing continually open above my head--opened by me for you;
[Hanna, LC]

120c/108 and the angels of God--all beings and things that carry on the blessed ministry of reconciliation between earth and heaven, between the souls of believers below and the heavenly Father above--going up and bring blessings innumerable down, ascending and descending upon the Son of man. [Hanna, LC]

123/108 . . .---you shall see in me that ladder of all gracious communication between earth and heaven, my humanity fixing firmly the one end of that ladder on earth, in my divinity the other end of that ladder lost amid the splendors of the throne." [Hanna, LC]

286a.9 And what then more accurate than a delineation which should represent the Mediator under the image of a ladder, based on earth, but reaching to heaven, and thus affording a medium of communication between God and man? [Melvill, S(1843)]

"We Have Found the Messias"

PRE-DESIRE OF AGES WRITINGS OF ELLEN WHITE NOT UTILIZED IN THE DA TEXT

This special section of Ellen White texts and their literary source parallels has been added to allow us further to demonstrate Ellen White's use of sources in her writings on the life of Christ. We did not include this material under the DA text presentation because the Ellen White text is not close enough in verbal similarity to indicate it was used in the composition of the DA text even though her material reflects the same general content of this chapter.

Since the only source quoted in this special section is Melvill's sermon, we have not documented each source quotation. The sequence of sentences follows the Melvill text which is presented in consecutive order insofar as the content allows. We have not included the entire text of either Ellen White or Melvill, only those portions where they are similar or where we wished to preserve the immediate context.

MS(13)1 Here is made a revelation of Jesus Christ as the only connecting link between God and sinful man, that the repenting sinner may find pardon. (11)

MS(13)2 Christ spoke words to Nathanael which had reference to this mystic ladder: "Verily, verily, I say unto you, hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man." [John 1:51] [M/1,2/285] (B1)

MS(13)3 Here Christ associates Himself, as the Son of man, with the mystic ladder. [M/3a/285] (V2)

MS(13)4 The angels of God are ascending and descending on the one even as they did on the other. [M/3b/285] (V1)

MS(13)251 Let us consider this ladder which was presented to Jacob. [M/4/285] (I2)

MS(13)14 All the intercourse between heaven and earth since the fall is by the Ladder. [M/5a,8/285] (P2)

MS(13)252 The human race was cut off from intercourse with God. [M/8a/285] (V2)

MS(13)253 They may look at a paradise lost but could see no means of entering it and holding communion with heaven. [M/8b/285] (P2)

Melvill: "Jacob's Vision and Vow"

1/285 We would add to this, that our Savior, in his conversation with Nathanael, used language which seems undoubtedly to refer to the mystic ladder on which the patriarch gazed.

2/285 "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Hereafter you shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of Man."

3a/285 Here the Redeemer appears to identify himself, as the Son of Man, with the ladder:

3b/285 the angels are to ascend and descend on the one, even as they did on the other.

4/285 We may find occasion, in the sequel, to recur to this saying of Christ, and to examine it more at length.

5/285 At present, we simply adduce it as corroborating the opinion, that the ladder represented the Mediator; and that, as Abraham had been symbolically taught that the world should be redeemed through the sacrifice of a substitute, so was Jacob now symbolically instructed in regard of that substitute's nature and dignity.

6/285 But, of course, the great point remains yet to be examined, namely, whether the vision in question furnished an accurate representation of the promised deliverer.

7/285 And here we affirm at once, that, if the ladder seen by Jacob be regarded as a type of the Mediator, there is an appositeness in the figure which must commend itself to all thinking minds.

8a/285 Cut off by apostacy from all intercourse with what is yet glorious and undefiled in the universe, the human race lies naturally in wretchedness and loneliness;

8b/285 and, though it may cast eager looks at the bright heaven which is above, has no means of holding communion with the tenants, or gaining admission to the gladness, of domains which may be privileged with special manifestations of Deity.

ST(84)38 He could not climb the battlements of Heaven and enter the city of God; for there entereth into it nothing that defileth.
[M/9/285] (P1)

MS(13)254 The sin of Adam cut off all intercourse between heaven and earth. [M/11/285] (P1)

MS(13)255 Up to the moment of man's transgression of God's law there had been free communion between earth and heaven. [M/12/285] (P1)

ST(84)34 Up to the time of man's rebellion against the government of God, there had been free communion between God and man.
[M/12/285] (P2)

MS(13)256 They seemed connected by a path which Deity loved to traverse. [M/12/285] (V2)

ST(84)35 Heaven and earth had been connected by a path that the Lord loved to traverse.
[M/12/285] (V2)

MS(13)257 But transgression of God's law broke up this path and man separated from God. [M/13,14/285]
(P3)

9/285 Who of all our fallen line, is possessed of a power, or can frame an engine, through which he may ascend from a planet which labors beneath the provoked curse of God, and climb the battlements of the sky, and achieve entrance into the city, into which is to enter nothing that defileth?

10/285 Who is there, if the Almighty had dealt with this world according to its iniquities, and left it in the ruin threatened to transgression, that could have so found out God by the might of his reason, and so propitiated him by the might of his virtue, as to have renewed the broken friendship between the human and the divine, and opened a clear way for the passage of the earthly to the heavenly?

11/285 All of you, if believers in revelation, know and admit that the direct consequence of our forefather's sin was the suspension of all intercourse, except that carried on through the ministry of vengeance, between God and man.

12/285 Up to the moment of rebellion there had been free communion: earth and heaven seemed connected by a path which the very Deity loved to traverse; for he came down to the garden where our first parents dwelt, and held with them the most intimate converse.

13/285 But, in rebelling, man broke up, as it were, this path, rendering it impracticable that any should escape from the heritage on which evil had gained footing, and mount to bright lands where all was yet pure.

14/285 And we know of no more striking and accurate representation of the condition of our race, in its alienation from God, than that which should picture the earth as suddenly deprived of every channel of communication with other sections of the universe, so that it must wander on in appalling solitariness, a prison-house from which nothing human could soar, and which nothing divine could visit.

MS(13)258 As soon as Satan seduced man to disobedience of God's holy law, every link seemed broken which bound earth to heaven and finite man to the infinite God. [M/15a/286] (I2)

MS(13)259 Man might look to heaven, but how to attain? [M/15b/286] (P3)

MS(13)260 But joy to the world! (I1)

MS(13)261 The Son of God, the sinless One, the One perfect in obedience, becomes the channel through which the lost communion may be renewed, the way through which the lost paradise may be regained. [M/16/286] (I2)

MS(13)262 Through Christ, man's substitute and surety, man may keep the commandments of God. (I1)

MS(13)263 He may return to his allegiance and God will accept him. (I1)

MS(13)264 Christ is the ladder. (I1)

MS(13)155 Christ is the ladder. (I1)

MS(13)265 "By me if any man enter in, he shall be saved, and shall go in and out and find pasture." John 10:9. [M/18/286] (B1)

MS(13)266 This is the ladder, the base of it resting upon the earth, the top reaching to the highest heavens. [M/21/286] (P1)

MS(13)267 The broken links have been repaired. [M/19/286] (V1)

MS(13)268 A highway has been thrown up along which the weary and heavy laden may pass. [M/19/286] (V1)

MS(13)269 They may enter heaven and find rest. [M/19,20/286] (P1)

MS(13)270 The ladder is the medium of communication between God and man. [M/21/286] (V2)

15a/286 Ay, this was the earth, so soon as Satan had seduced man from allegiance; a lonely thing, which had snapped every link which bound it to what was holy and happy in creation:

15b/186 and, as it bore along the lost children of Adam, they might have gazed wistfully on lands just visible in the firmament, and which they knew to be radiant with the presence of their Maker: but where was the way across the vast expanse, where the mechanism by which they might scale the inaccessible heights?

16/286 And undoubtedly, if it be a just representation of our race, in its fallen estate, that it is cut off from all intercourse with God, and all access to heaven, it must be a just representation of the Mediator, that he is the channel through which the lost communion may be renewed, the way through which the lost paradise may be re-entered.

17/286 The world has not been left in its solitariness: for God "hath in these last days spoken unto us by his Son;" and through him we have "access to the Father."

18/286 We are not forced to remain in our exile and wretchedness: for Christ hath declared, "By me, if any man enter in, he shall be saved, and shall go in and out, and find pasture."

19/286 Yea, we can now thank the "Lord of heaven and earth," that the broken links have been repaired, so that the severed parts of creation may be again bound into one household; that a highway has been thrown up, along which the weary and heavy-laden may pass to that rest which remaineth for the people of God.

20/286 But it is only telling you truths, with which we may hope that the very youngest are acquainted, to tell you that it is Christ alone by whom all this has been effected, Christ alone through whom we can approach God, Christ alone through whom we can enter the kingdom of heaven.

21/286 And what then more accurate than a delineation, which should represent the Mediator under the image of a ladder, based on earth, but reaching to heaven, and thus affording a medium of communication between God and man?

MS(13)271 Through the mystic ladder the gospel was preached to Jacob. [M/24/286] (V1)

MS(13)272 As the ladder stretched from earth, reaching to the highest heavens, and the glory of God above the ladder, Christ in His divine nature reached immensity and was one with the Father. [M/27/286] (V2)

MS(13)273 As the ladder, though its top penetrated into heaven, its base was upon the earth, so Christ though¹ God, clothed His divinity with humanity and was in the world "found in fashion as a man." [M/28/286] (P1)

MS(13)274 The ladder would be of no useless [sic] if it rested not on the earth or if it reached not to the heavens. [M/29a/286] (V2)

MS(13)11 The mediation of Christ, He is the ladder. (I1)

MS(13)12 The foot on the earth in His human nature, the top in heaven in His divine nature. [M/29b/286] (P2)

MS(13)13 His human arm encircles the race while his divine arm lays hold upon the Infinite. [M/29b/286] (I2)

¹The EGW autograph reads "though." The 1959 typescript also reads "though" but an "r" has been added by hand, making the typed manuscript now read "through."

22/286 Oh, as Jacob lay upon the ground, an exile from his father's house, and without a friend or a companion, he was not an inappropriate figure of the human race, forced away by sin from the presence of their Maker, and with no associates to aid by their counsel, and cheer by their sympathy.

24/286 When, moreover, this expressive emblem of renewed intercourse between earth and heaven was accompanied by the voice of the living God, making mention of the deliverer in whom the world should be blessed, then might it be declared that the revelation was complete, and that through the mystic ladder was the Gospel preached to Jacob; for in this figure he could read that the seed of the woman would be the Mediator between God and man, "the repairer of the breach, the restorer of paths to dwell in," and who, as "the way, the truth, and the life," would "open the kingdom of heaven to all believers."

26/286 The emblem, however of the ladder is accurate in regard of the person, as well as the work, of the Redeemer.

27/286 As the ladder stretched into the heavens, and the very Deity occupied its summit, so Christ in his divine nature, penetrated immensity, and was one with the Father.

28/286 And as the ladder, though its top was on the sky, was set upon the earth, so Christ, though essentially God, took upon him flesh, and was "found in fashion as a man."

29a/286 The ladder would be useless, if it rested not on the ground, or if it reached not to the sky:

29b/286 and thus, had not Christ been both earthly and heavenly, both human and divine, he could not have been the Mediator, through whom the sinful may approach, and be reconciled to their Maker.

MS(13)275 God appeared in glory above the ladder, looking down with compassion on erring, sinful Jacob, addressing to him words of encouragement.
[M/30a/286] (I2)

MS(13)276 It is through Christ that the Father beholds sinful man. [M/30b/286] (V2)

MS(13)277 The ministering angels were communicating to the inhabitants of the earth through the medium of the ladder. [M/31/286] (P2)

MS(13)5 A constant correspondence is by means of the ladder kept up between heaven and earth, and the actions and affairs of this earth are all known in heaven. [M/33/287] (P3)

MS(13)6 The counsels of heaven are executed on earth and the doings of men are judged in heaven.
[M/34/287] (P3)

MS(13)7 Providence does its work gradually. (I1)

MS(13)8 The ladder man must climb are [sic] successive steps heavenward like the rounds of a ladder--step above step, upward to the wisdom of God, whose glory is at the upper end of the ladder. (I1)

MS(13)9 Angels rest not day or night from active service in the positions assigned them. [M/35/287] (P3)

MS(13)10 They ascend to bear their testimony of record of what they have done and of the state of individuals, and receive further orders; and descend to execute the orders they have received. [M/35/287] (I2)

30a/286 As God appeared standing above the ladder, looking down with complacency on his servant, and addressing him in gracious and encouraging words,

30b/286 so it is only in and through Christ that the Father beholds us with favor, and speaks to us the language of forgiveness and friendship.

31/287 In respect, moreover, of the angels, who were seen ascending and descending on the ladder, we cannot doubt that these celestial beings, though they now attend us as ministering spirits, would have held no communication with our race, had it remained unredeemed.

33/287 And it is evidently the drift of such expressions, that, by and through the mediation of Christ, the fellowship of the human race with other orders of being was to be restored, and men and angels were to be brought into association.

34/287 Indeed we know ourselves indebted to the Mediator for every blessing: if, therefore we regard angels as "the ministers of God which do his pleasure," and through whose instrumentality he carries on designs, whether of Providence or of grace, we must feel sure that we owe it exclusively to Christ, that these glorious creatures are busied with promoting our welfare.

35/287 And if then the continued descent and ascent of the angels mark, as we suppose it must, their coming down on commissions in which men have interest, and their returning to receive fresh instructions, there is peculiar fitness in the representation of their ascending and descending by a ladder which is figurative of Christ: it is a direct result of Christ's mediation, that angels are sent forth as "ministering spirits, to minister for them who shall be heirs of salvation;" and if then a ladder reaching from earth to heaven, be a just emblem of the Savior, it is in the nicest keeping with this emblem, that, up and down the ladder, should be rapidly passing the cherubim and the seraphim.

41/287 Besides, however we would avoid the straining a type, we own that the representation of Christ, under the figure of a ladder, appears to us to include the most exact references to the appointed mode of salvation.

MS(13)278 The only way that man can be saved is by clinging to Christ. [M/42/287] (P1)

MS(13)279 We ascend to heaven by climbing the ladder step by step the whole height of Christ's work. [M/43/287] (P1)

Lt(47)10.7 We are saved by climbing round after round of the ladder, looking to Christ, clinging to Christ, mounting step by step to the heights of Christ, so that He is made unto us wisdom and righteousness and sanctification and redemption. [M/42,43/287] (P1)

RH(90)59 If he ascends to heaven, it must be by mounting up step by step the whole height [sic] of Christ's work, so that Christ shall be his wisdom, righteousness, sanctification, and redemption. [M/43/287] (V2)

MS(13)156 By laying hold on Christ, climbing up by Christ, resolving to return to the Father above the ladder broken, contrite, subdued. [M/47/287] (P2)

MS(13)280 There must be a holding fast to Christ, a climbing up by the merits of Christ. [M/47/287] (V2)

ST(84)51 But we must have a firm hold on Christ, and keep on climbing. [M/47/287] (P1)

MS(13)281 To let go is to cease to climb, is to fall, to perish. [M/47/287] (P1)

ST(84)52 To look back is to become dizzy; to let go is to perish. [M/47/287] (V2)

MS(13)282 We are to mount by the Mediator and all the while to keep hold on the Mediator, ascending by successive steps, round above round, stretching the hand from one above the other. [M/48/287] (V2)

MS(13)283 In the work of redemption they have a knowledge of Jesus Christ by planting the feet on one round after another in perfect obedience to all the commandments of God. [M/48/287] (I2)

42/287 How do I look to be saved? by clinging to Christ.

43/287 How do I expect to ascend up to heaven? by mounting, step by step, the whole height of Christ's work, so that he is made unto me of God, "wisdom, and righteousness, and sanctification, and redemption."

44/287 It is no easy thing, the gaining eternal life through the finished work of the Mediator.

45/287 It is a vast deal more than the sitting with the prophet in his car of fire, and being borne aloft, without effort, to an incorruptible inheritance.

46/287 "The kingdom of heaven suffereth violence, and the violent take it by force."

47/287 There must be, if we may thus express it, a holding fast to Christ, and a climbing up by Christ: to look back is to grow dizzy, to let go is to perish.

48/287 And that we are to mount by the Mediator, and all the while, to keep hold on the Mediator; that we are, in short, to ascend by successive stages, stretching the hand to one line after another in the work of the Redeemer, and planting the foot on one step after another in the covenant made with us in Christ--what can more aptly exhibit this, than the exhibiting Christ as a ladder, set upon the earth that men may scale the heavens?

Lt(47)11.3 Mount up by the Mediator, keeping hold of the Mediator, reaching upward to one line of work after another, making no provision for the flesh, to fulfill the lusts thereof. [M/48/287] (I2)

MS(13)284 This is a necessity for each individual--striving and making progress at every step. [M/49/287] (P3)

ST(84)57 There is necessity for striving, and yet it will be of no avail unless we strive lawfully. [M/49/287] (P1)

MS(13)285 It is simply impossible to enter heaven without constant striving. [M/49/287] (P1)

MS(13)286 There is fearful peril in relaxing our efforts in spiritual diligence for a moment, for we are hanging, as it were, between heaven and earth. [M/49/287] (V2)

MS(13)287 We must keep the eye directed upward to God above the ladder. (I1)

MS(13)288 There is the question with men and women gazing heavenward, Can I obtain the mansions for the blessed? [M/50a/288] (P3)

MS(13)289 It is by being partakers of the divine nature. (I1)

MS(13)290 It is by escaping the pollutions "in the world through lust." (I1)

MS(13)291 It is by entering into the holiest by the blood of Jesus, laying hold of the hope set before me in the gospel. [M/50b/288] (V2)

MS(13)292 It is by fastening yourself to Christ and straining every nerve to leave the world behind, laboring to diminish by successive steps your distance from God, who is at the top of the ladder. [M/50c/288] (V2)

MS(13)293 In Christ and yet led by Christ; by believing and working--trusting in Jesus, yet working upon the plan of addition, holding onto Christ and constantly mounting to a greater nearness of God supported by the Surety and yet upward toward God. [M/50c,51/288a] (V2)

49/287 The necessity for our own striving, and yet the uselessness of all striving if not exerted in the right manner; the impossibility of our entering heaven except through Christ, and the equal impossibility of our entering it, without effort and toil; the fearful peril of our relaxing, for an instant, our spiritual vigilance and earnestness, seeing that we hang, as it were, between earth and heaven, and may be thrown, by a moment's carelessness, headlong to the ground; the completeness and singleness of the salvation which is in Jesus, so that, if we adhere to it, it is sufficient, . . .

50a/288 And now, as I stand upon the earth, the child of a fallen and yet redeemed race, and examine how I may escape the heritage of shame which is naturally my portion, and soar to that sky which woos me by its brightness,

50b/288 oh, I read of "entering into the holiest by the blood of Jesus," and of "laying hold upon the hope set before us," and of "following on to know the Lord," and of being "raised up, and being made to sit together in heavenly places in Christ,"--expressions which prove to me, that,

50c/288 if I would reach heaven, it must be through fastening myself to the Mediator, and yet straining every nerve to leave the world behind; leaning incessantly upon Christ, and yet laboring to diminish by successive steps my distance from God; being always "found in Christ," and yet "led by the Spirit," so as to be always on the advance.

51/288 But when I consider these scriptural combinations of believing and working, trusting in another and laboring for one's self, always having hold on Christ, and always mounting to greater nearness to God, always supported by the same suretyship and always pressing upward to the same point, I seem to have before me the exact picture of a man, who, with a steady eye, and a firm foot, and a staunch hand, climbs by a ladder some mighty precipice: he could make no way, whatever his strivings, without the ladder, and the ladder is utterly useless without his own strivings.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 14 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(13)294 When the successive steps have been reached, when the graces have been added one after another, the crowning grace is the perfect love of God--supreme love to God and love to our fellow men. (11)

MS(13)295 And then the abundant entrance into the kingdom of God. (11)

MS(13)296 We point you to the mansions Christ is preparing for all those who love Him. [M/124/291] (12)

MS(13)297 We point you to that city that hath foundations, whose builder and maker is God. [M/125/291] (B1)

MS(13)298 We show you its massive walls, with the twelve foundations of the city of God, and tell you that these walls must be scaled. [M/126/291] (V2)

MS(13)299 You look discouraged at the magnitude of the work before you. [M/ 126/291] (P2)

MS(13)299a How can we surmount walls that? [M/127/291] (V1)

MS(13)300 We point you to the ladder set up on earth, reaching to the city of God. [M/129/291] (P1)

MS(13)301 Plant your feet on the ladder. [M/131/291] (V2)

MS(13)302 Forsake your sins. [M/131/291] (V2)

ST(84)83 Forsake your sins, overcome your defects of character, and cling with all your powers to Jesus, the way, the truth, and the life. [M/131/291] (12)

MS(13)303 Climb step by step and you will reach God above the ladder, and the Holy City of God. (11)

123/291 But now we address you, in conclusion, as beings confined for a while to a narrow and inconsiderable scene, but whose home is far away, in those regions of light where Deity is specially manifested, and where the angel and the archangel have their abode.

124/291 We point you to the everlasting hills, whose glorious and gold-lit summits come out to the eye of faith from the mighty expanse; and we tell you that those hills must be climbed.

125/291 We point you to "a city which hath foundations," the "Jerusalem which is above;" we show you its stupendous walls stretching interminably upward; and we tell you that these walls must be scaled.

126/291 And you are staggered at the greatness of the demand.

127/291 How can we ascend hills which are not based on this earth; how surmount walls, of which no eye can take the altitude?

128/291 We lead you with us to Bethel, and bid you behold that on which the patriarch gazed.

129/291 There is a ladder, set up on the ground, but its top reaches to the summit of the mountain, and to the gate of the city.

130/291 Are you willing to go up, to leave the prison, and to seek the palace?

131/291 Then in the name of the living God, we bid you plant the foot on the first step of this ladder: forsake evil courses, break away from evil habits, and take part with the disciples of Christ.

132/292 Christ casteth out none who come unto him: and he who strives to turn from his iniquities at the call of his Savior, is beginning to lay hold on that propitiation, through the grasping of which in its several parts he will be gradually raised to the blessedness of immortality.

MS(13)304a For none who will resolutely mount up on the ladder will fail of everlasting life: . . .
[M/138/292] (V2)

MS(13)304b "For so an entrance shall be ministered unto you abundantly into the everlasting kingdom of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ." (11)

ST(84)85 None who shall persevere will fail of everlasting life. [M/138/292] (P1)

ST(84)86 Those who believe on Christ shall never perish, neither shall any pluck them out of his hand. [M/138/292] (V2)

133/292 Are you afraid of trusting yourselves to this ladder?

134/292 Thousands, in every age, have gone up by it to glory; and not a solitary individual has found it give way beneath him, however immense the burden of his sins.

135/292 And why afraid?

136/292 The ladder is He who is "able to save to the uttermost" all who would go unto God through him; and the angels are ascending and descending upon it, for they have charge over the righteous to keep them in all their ways; and the Almighty himself looks down on those who are climbing painfully upwards, that he may send them succor when the hand is relaxing, the foot falling.

137/292 I can answer for it, that everyone of you may, if he will, mount by this ladder, seeing that Christ took human nature, and thus united earth and heaven, as the substitute of all.

138/292 I can answer for it, that none who strive to mount by this ladder shall fail of everlasting life; for those who believe on Christ can never perish, neither shall any pluck them out of his hand.

139/292 The canopy of the sky seems lined with the "cloud of witnesses."

140/292 Those who have gone before are bidding us climb, through the one Mediator, to their lofty abode.

141/292 We come, we come.

142/292 Your call shall be obeyed.

143/292 Your voices animate us, as they steal down in solemn and beautiful cadence.

144/292 And God helping, there shall not be one of us who does not seek salvation through the blood and righteousness of Jesus; not one who shall not share with you the throne and the diadem.

"We Have Found the Messias"

Analysis

So far in our analysis of the first three chapters of the fifteen to be included in this study, we have not had the opportunity of applying the methods of investigation as originally planned. Our research did not turn up the textual evidence which would permit an analysis as complete as we had desired.

Chapter 14 presents a different situation. Ellen White used 250 sentences of the DA text to write upon the call of Christ's first disciples. We added to our evaluation 102 sentences from her previous writings, including two handwritten texts. Our survey, however, covered many additional articles in which she commented on John the Baptist's witness to Christ, the call of the first two disciples, and their response. With this amount of evidence we should be able to make a fair and reasonably accurate analysis.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

In looking at the DA text from a source-analytical viewpoint we will attempt to answer three questions. Were the writings of others used in composing the text of chapter 14? If so, to what degree were they used? Was this chapter developed through the use of Ellen White's earlier writings? If so, do these earlier writings show any literary dependency upon the writings of others? Finally how do these various sources relate to each other in terms of

"We Have Found the Messias"

content and literary dependency.

In our investigation of the 250 sentences in chapter 14 we credited 132 to Ellen White's independent literary work and 18 quotations from the Bible. The remaining 100 sentences show some degree of dependency upon seven literary sources from six authors.¹

According to Table 1 on page 229 these dependent sentences include five instances of Verbatim, nine Strict Paraphrase, 31 Simple Paraphrase, and 18 of Loose Paraphrase. There were 22 cases where the Bible was used through the influence of a source and 15 sentences of Partial Independence.

If we deduct the 18 Bible quotations and apply our rating scale to the remaining 232 sentences, the average dependency rate for the entire chapter is 1.34. Figuring the dependency upon the basis of only those sentences which show dependency the chapter average is 3.12. Nearly half the dependent sentences, or 45, registered from Simple Paraphrase to Verbatim. Table 2 on page 230 identifies Hanna and Jones as the two authors most heavily represented in chapter 14.

Ellen White apparently drew her parallels directly from Life Scenes from the Four Gospels. We found no use of this work by Jones in her earlier writings on the topic. About half of the parallels from Jones are found in the first 44

¹A full listing of the evaluations of these 250 sentences may be found in Appendix A under chapter 14.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 14

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1 Strict Verbatim V1	2 Verbatim V2	3 Strict Paraphrase P1	4 Simple Paraphrase P2	5 Loose Paraphrase P3	6 Source Bible B1	7 Partial Independence I2	8 Strict Independence I1	9 Bible B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	05	09	31	18	22	15	132	18	250
02. SP	00	00	03	00	00	00	00	00	00	03
03. MS(13)84	05	17	10	05	07	03	09	16	00	72
04. ST (84)	00	04	03	01	00	00	01	00	00	09
05. RH (90)	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
06. Lt(47)93	00	00	01	00	00	00	01	00	00	02
07. DA (MS)	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
08. Di (99)	00	02	02	02	00	00	02	06	00	14
TOTALS PRE-DA	05	24	19	09	07	03	13	(22)	(00)	102

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 14

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	18
02. Farrar	00	00	01	00	01	00	00	00	00
03. Fleetwood	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00
04. Hanna	00	02	03	13	07	13	11	00	00
05. Ingraham	00	00	00	00	00	00	02	00	00
06. Jones	00	02	04	17	10	09	02	00	00
07. Melvill, GL(50)	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	00
08. Melvill, MSI	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00
TOTALS DA Text	00	05	09	31	18	22	15	—	(18)
									118

"We Have Found the Messias"

sentences of the chapter. The remainder appear between sentences 109 and 129.

The parallels from Hanna's life of Christ appear to have been taken directly from Hanna's text as well as from Ellen White's earlier use of Hanna in her own writings. We found no earlier occurrence of the parallels for sentences 135-140, 143-147, and 166.

When we find only a single parallel from a source we are not so confident in our evaluation. Our research thus far seems to indicate that if Ellen White is using a source there is more than one parallel. For example we have listed DA32/133 as dependent upon Fleetwood's life of Christ even though the sentence is similar to DA81/136 which reflects the use of Hanna. Likewise we identified DA134/138 and DA159/139 as dependent upon Farrar's life of Christ when there is also some similarity to Hanna, particularly in the former sentence. A final single reference to a source is found in sentence DA184/142 where we show a parallel from a Melvill sermon "Experience the Test of Truth." Even though we have found incontrovertible evidence that Ellen White used Melvill in connection with her writings on the topic of this chapter we cannot be sure that this particular sentence has come from a Melvill sermon.

Sentences 112 and 113 of chapter 14 hold some special interest for our source analytical review. We have listed these two sentences as dependent partially on Ingraham's fictionalized account of the life of Christ. It may well

"We Have Found the Messiah"

be, however, that Ellen White is working out of her SP text and not consciously using Ingraham here.

We have strong reasons for concluding that this chapter of the DA is largely a rewriting of the SP material on the same topic (see below). In the analysis of chapter 13 we reproduced a portion of the same section of the SP text and the relevant Ingraham material as evidence that Ellen White was probably using Ingraham in her account of an incident that is not recorded in the gospel records nor is to be found in any of Ellen White's later writings. It is therefore quite possible, if not probable, that Ellen White is taking her literary construction of these two sentences from the earlier SP text at the place where in the writing of that account she was using Ingraham.¹

If this were the only reference which bore a resemblance to Ingraham we might be less confident in our claim for some dependence on Ingraham. Ingraham's influence appears in chapters 75 and 76, as well as in chapter 77, a chapter excluded by the random selection process.

On pages 234 and 235 we present the relevant portions of the DA text for chapter 77, the earlier SP text and the related material from Ingraham. We think that the similarities between these accounts, added to the textual evidence presented in the analysis of chapter 13, provides enough evidence to argue that further study needs to be made

¹Ingraham, J. H., The Prince of the House of David. . . (Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1888), copyrighted 1859, pages 141, 156, 157.

"We Have Found the Messias"

in comparing the writing of Ingraham and Ellen White. We also think the similarities between DA 112, 113 and the earlier SP sentences which reflect a possible use of Ingraham merit the evaluation of Partial Independence even though we have only two verses in our chapter which point to Ingraham.

A final conclusion must be postponed until further research can be done in both the SP and DA texts. When all is said and done, it must be recognized that we have only two sentences in this chapter which appear to reflect the use of Ingraham. And the Melvill material, as well as Ellen White's comparable parallels, actually relates to the temptation of Christ, the subject of chapter 13.

Ordinarily we would not extend the discussion of two parallels this far. Our reason for doing so lies in the nature of the source. Ingraham's account is obviously a work of fiction. The comment is presented in direct discourse rather than the usual indirect discourse of a third-person account. This feature alone would necessitate a certain amount of textual change because Ellen White's account is largely in indirect discourse. These changes alone, if indeed Ellen White used Ingraham, would make it more difficult to recognize and substantiate the parallel. These references also have the special interest of presenting details from the life of Christ which are not found in Scripture.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 77
In Pilate's Judgment Hall

148/729 - He ordered that the fetters of Christ should be unloosed, at the same time charging His enemies with roughly treating Him.

149/729 - Looking with compassion into the serene face of the world's Redeemer, he read in it only wisdom and purity.

3SP 113/136 - He looked with curiosity, mingled with an impulse of pity, upon the pale, sad face of the Saviour, which was marked with deep wisdom and purity.

152/729 - At the command of the king, the decrepit and maimed were then called in, and Christ was ordered to prove His claims by working a miracle.

153/729 - Men say that Thou canst heal the sick, said Herod.

154/729 - I am anxious to see that Thy widespread fame has not been belied.

156/729 - Again he commanded, Show us a sign that Thou hast the power with which rumor hath accredited Thee.

157/729 - But Christ was as one who heard and saw not.

168/730 - Again the priests and rulers, in great anxiety, urged their accusations against Him.

169/730 - Raising their voices, they declared, He is a traitor, a blasphemer.

170/730 - He works His miracles through the power given Him by Beelzebub, the Prince of the devils.

176/730 - But no sign from Jesus gave evidence that He heard a word.

177/730 - Herod was irritated by this silence.

178/730 - It seemed to indicate utter indifference to his authority.

179/730 - To the vain and pompous king, open rebuke would have been less offensive than to be thus ignored.

180/730 - Again he angrily threatened Jesus, who still remained unmoved and silent.

389.8 "Unbind him! By the staff of Jacob! he hath been roughly handled. . . ."

390.0 Herod regarded, with interest and looks of compassion, the pale and divinely-serene countenance of the prisoner; and seemed struck with the indescribable majesty of his aspect and bearing, and the purity of soul that beamed from his holy eyes.

390.4 ". . . I would fain behold thee do some miracle. Men say thou canst heal the sick, restore the maimed, and raise the dead! Does rumor belie thy powers? What! art thou silent? Dost thou not know who it is that speaks to thee? Come hither, fellow," he called to a Samaritan muleteer, who stood in the crowd, whose oval face and Jewish eyes showed him to be both of Assyrian and Israelitish descent, whose arm had been taken off by a sword, in a contest with Barabbas and his robbers; "come hither, and let this prophet prove his power and mission, by restoring thy arm whole, like as the other!"

390.7 The eyes of the Prophet moved not from their meditative look upon the ground.

391.0 "He is a deceiver! He performed his works through Beelzebub, who has now deserted him!" cried the priests.

391.6 "He is an accursed blasphemer! He calls himself the Son of God! He breaks the Sabbath-day! He is a foe to our religion! He would destroy the Temple!" was shouted by Abner, the priests, and the scribes.

390.8 "Art thou mocking us, thou false Christ?" cried the Tetrarch, angrily; "wilt thou neither speak nor act? If thou art not an impostor, do a miracle before us all, and we will believe in thee!"

390.9 Jesus remained motionless, yet preserved a firm, and majestic countenance, that made Him look more kingly than Herod.

391.1 "Nazarene," said Herod "I am a Jew, also. If thou wilt prove to me, by a sign that I will name, that thou art the Christ, I will not only become thy follower, but will let thee go free. Your silence is an insult to my power. .

"

391.7 "See the whirlwind thou hast raised, O Nazarene!" cried Herod, rising; "if thou art a Prophet, no harm can

The Desire of Ages

193/730 - Herod's face grew dark with passion.

194/730+ - Turning to the multitude, he angrily denounced Jesus an impostor.

195/731 - Then to Christ he said, If You will give no evidence of Your claim, I will deliver You up to the soldiers and the people.

196/731 - They may succeed in making You speak.

197/731 - If You are an impostor, death at their hands is only what You merit; if You are the Son of God, save Yourself by working a miracle.

3SP142/138 - Then turning to Jesus he angrily declared that if he refused to speak, he should be delivered into the hands of the soldiers, who would have little respect for his claims or his person; if he was an impostor it would be no more than he deserved; but if he was the Son of God he could save himself by working a miracle.

198/731 - No sooner were these words spoken than a rush was made for Christ.

199/731 - Like wild beasts, the crowd darted upon their prey.

3SP145/138 - At the suggestion of Herod, a crown was now plaited from a vine bearing sharp thorns, and this was placed upon the sacred brow of Jesus; and an old tattered purple robe, once the garment of a king, was placed upon his noble form, while Herod and the Jewish priests encouraged the insults and cruelty of the mob.

3SP146/138+ - Jesus was then placed upon a large block, which was derisively called a throne, an old reed was placed in his hand as a scepter, and, amid satanic laughter, curses, and jeers, the rude throng bowed to him mockingly as to a king.

3SP147/139 - Occasionally some murderous hand snatched the reed that had been placed in his hand, and struck him on the head with it, forcing the thorns into his temples, and causing the blood to flow down his face and beard.

they do thee; and if thou art an impostor, if they kill thee thou deservest thy fate! I give thee up into their hands! Save thyself, if thou be the Christ!"

391.9 Scarcely had Herod spoken these words, relinquishing Jesus into the hands of his foes, than, with a savage cry, as the famished jackals in the desert rush upon their prey, they rushed upon their victim.

392.3 "Nay," said Herod, on seeing this, "as he calls himself a king, remove the helmet and crown him, and robe him royally, and place a sceptre in his hand; and, lo! yonder block will make him a proper throne! We must show Pilate how we Jews serve men who usurp the power of his master, Caesar!"

392.5 No words could have better pleased the people, save such as would have sentenced Jesus to death. With a glad response, they began to put into execution the hint he had so wickedly given them. One of his men of war brought a cast-off robe of purple, which belonged to Herod, and, with loud shouts of laughter, and coarse jest, they robed Him in it, unresisting as the lamb wreathed for the sacrifice. Some one then untwined the creeping thorn, which grew on the outer wall, and twisting it into the shape of a crown, handed it over the heads of the men to Abner, whose hatred against Jesus proceeded from the well-known fact that among the changers of money, whom He drove from the Temple, was a younger brother, who was making, by his business, great gains for the avaricious priest, who, therefore, never forgave this act of the Prophet.

392.9 When Abner saw the crown, he smiled with malicious gratification, and nodded approvingly to the man, said, "This is what we needed! Nothing could have done better;" and with his two hands he placed it upon the head of Jesus, pressing, cruelly, the sharp thorns into his temples, till the blood trickled from a dozen wounds. Jesus made no complaint, but the pain forced large bright tears from his eyes, which rolled down his cheeks and fell along the purple robe like glittering pearls.

393.3 "Here is also a sceptre for our king!" exclaimed the Samaritan with one arm, using the one to reach a piece of reed, from which a Passover lamb had been slung, to those who were arraying Jesus. This was thrust into the Prophet's grasp, and He held it patiently. . . .

"We Have Found the Messias"

Our study of the sources behind chapter 14 also clearly shows that the DA text was basically a revision of that portion of the SP text which treats the same content. The SP foundation text has been taken from what we may roughly describe as the center section of Chapter IV, Vol. II, "The Mission of Christ." We have compared the two texts in Table A on page 237. Apart from a few exceptions,¹ the SP sentences beginning with sentence 54 on page 62 of SP, Vol. II, and ending with sentence 143 on page 67 are also found in the DA text in the same sequence beginning with sentence 32 on page 133 and ending with sentence 250 on page 143. Many of the sentences of the SP text have been carried over verbatim into the DA text. Others show some rewriting but their earlier identity as SP sentences is clearly visible.

A portion of Diary Book 32 was also used in the construction of the DA text of chapter 14. We were introduced to this handwritten text of Ellen White in our survey of pre-DA materials on the temptation of Christ as presented in chapter 13 but we found no reason to conclude that Ellen White had used those diary comments in composing the DA text of that chapter.

There can be no mistake, however, as to her use of pages 39-48 of this same diary material in the writing of chapter 14. The sentences from this diary, indexed as

¹For example, the very first sentence of the SP sequence appears some 60 sentences later in the DA text and the last sentence of the SP text appears as the third from the last sentence of the DA text. There are also a few sentences of the SP text not repeated in the DA text.

TABLE A

Listing of Parallel Sentences for Chapter 14

Spirit of Prophecy, II, Chapter IV and Desire of Ages

	<u>SP</u>	<u>DA</u>		<u>SP</u>	<u>DA</u>
001.	53/61	95/137	024.	103/65	175/140
002.	54/62	32/133	025.	106,107/65	176/140
003.	56/62	37/134	026.	109/65	183/140
004.	57/62	38/134	027.	110/65	185/140
005.	58,59/62	39/134	028.	111/65	186/140
006.	60/62	40/134	029.	112/65	187/140
007.	61,62/62	41/134	030.	113/65	188/140
008.	63/62	42/134	031.	114/65	193/140
009.	64/62	43/135	032.	118/66	202/141
010.	65,66/62	44/135	033.	123/66	206/141
011.	67/62	57/135	034.	124/66	207/141
012.	68/62	58/135	035.	125/66	208/141
013.	69/62	59/135	036.	126/66	209/141
014.	70/62	60/135	037.	134/67	239/142
015.	71/62	61/135	038.	135/67	240/142
016.	77/63	82/136	039.	136/67	241/142
017.	78/63	83/136	040.	137/67	242,243/142
018.	82/63	96,97/137	041.	138/67	244,245/142+
019.	83/63	98/137	042.	139/67	246/143
020.	84/63	99/137	043.	140/67	247/143
021.	85/63	100/137	044.	141/67	249/143
022.	86,87/63	101/137	045.	142/67	250/143
023.	88/64	102/137	046.	143/68	248/143

[See Appendix D for the text of The Spirit of Prophecy sentences.]

"We Have Found the Messias"

Di(99),¹ and arbitrarily numbered as beginning with sentence 151,² include at least 12 parallels with the DA text.³ Our study shows that the diary material was slightly edited for DA use.⁴

We have included both dependent and independent sentences from this diary material to show how the original manuscript material of Ellen White which we have taken

¹We have pointed out earlier that this diary book was written at least two years earlier than the date it carries (1899). It is also to be doubted that Ellen White would have copied in her diary what she had already published in the DA text. In addition, the notation on the handwritten text claims that the diary material was used in writing on the life of Christ and this clearly is a reference to the DA text which was published in 1898. We therefore have concluded that the following close parallels between DA and Di(99) indicate that the diary material was used in the construction of the DA text and not vice versa.

²See page 191 above for an explanation of the sentence numbers for the diary text.

³Compare for example DA70/136 and Di(99)156, DA76/136 with Di(99)159, DA77/136 with Di(99)160, DA78/136 with Di(99)161, DA79/136 with Di(99)162, DA80/136 with Di(99)163, and DA93/137 with Di(99)164.

⁴The full text of pages 37-48 of Diary Book 32 are presented in typescript in Appendix D under chapter 14. We are indebted to Tim Poirier of the White Estate office for the original typescript. We have slightly modified his work in a few places to accord with our reading of the autograph. Punctuation has been supplied, some spelling corrections have been made, and capitalization has been regularized. The sentences taken up into the DA text have been underlined. Though we have listed 15 sentences we are only claiming 12 as true parallels. We are uncertain about Di(99)151, 172 and 175.

We also indicate parallels between sentences 167-171 and invite the reader to compare the underlined portions of these sentences with DA96-104 and DA124-126. We did not list these sentences as parallel because of the Bible texts and the less-than-complete sentences involved. The context of the Bible texts in the former group of sentences in relation to the presentation of Hanna and the progression of the thematic development of the latter group do suggest to us however, that these sentences from Diary Book 32 must also be viewed as source parallels for the DA text.

"We Have Found the Messias"

directly from the autograph was at times modified and at other times taken over verbatim in the writing of the DA text.

The task of editing went on until actual publication time. Marian Davis early on warned C. H. Jones¹ about setting the type too soon. Early in 1897 she wrote:

No part of a book ought to be put in type until the book is completed. Especially is this true of Sr. White's books, since she does not write systematically, and at any stage we are likely to get fresh points on any part of the book, or matter that necessitates rearrangement.²

A special illustration of continual demand for editing may be noted in a Marian Davis letter dated a month earlier. Jones evidently was trying to finalize on the text of DA.

I fully agree with you that the "Life of Christ" should be closed up as soon as possible. But let me state the situation: Considerably more than a year ago, Sister White began writing on the trial and crucifixion of Christ. She has a number of manuscripts unfinished. It is her intention to gather these together as soon as possible and complete them for the book. . . . I have been almost consumed with anxiety to complete the book. I prepared some chapters on what material I had, thinking she would not write more on these subjects. She did write on them, however, and I had my work to do over.³

One example of such late editing occurs in this chapter under DA120/138 where we show that the earlier manuscript of DA, DA(MS)114/178 is closer to the source than is the final edition of the DA text.

The final stage of our source analysis of this chapter

¹C. H. Jones was publishing house manager at Pacific Press during the 1890s.

²Marian Davis letter to C. H. Jones, 4-11-97.

³Marian Davis letter to C. H. Jones, 3-11-97.

"We Have Found the Messias"

takes us to the sources used by Ellen White in producing these earlier writings on which the DA text was built.

The SP text contains a number of clear references to Hanna's life of Christ. Both 2SP53/61 and DA95/137 are dependent upon Hanna, sentence 1, page 100. Likewise 2SP123/66 and DA206/141 reflect Hanna 137/109. A similar use of Hanna is found in 2SP138/67 and DA245/142. In each of these three parallels the SP text exhibits greater dependency.¹ There are other instances where the SP text and the DA text are very similar if not identical and both show dependency on Hanna.²

The DA sentences taken from Diary Book 32, pages 39-48, also include a number of literary parallels from Hanna's work on the life of Christ.³ These parallels appear limited to Hanna and represent a different selection from Hanna than is found in the earlier SP parallels from Hanna. We have concluded that Ellen White was working directly with the Hanna text and not merely copying from her earlier SP material.

Source analysis must also give due consideration to

¹See Table 4 on page 241 for a list of several instances of this greater dependency for the earlier use of the source. [Note: Tables 3 and 4 are out of sequence in this chapter.]

²Cf. 2SP124/66 and DA207/141 or 2SP137/67 and DA243/142.

³These parallels may be found under lines 1-13 of the evaluations and sources schedule for chapter 14, Appendices B and C. Evaluations for the Di(99) sentences are also listed in Table 1, page 229. Several parallels involving Bible texts and partial sentences may be found in comparing this full textual portion of Diary Book 32 in Appendix D.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 14

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt.	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u>	Eval.
01. -	<u>DA81/136</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>Di(99)154</u>	<u>P2</u>	_____	_____
02. -	<u>DA95/137</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP53/61+</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
03. -	<u>DA206/141</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP123/66</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
04. -	<u>DA245/142</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP138/67</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01. -	<u>DA104/137</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>Di(99)172</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
01. -	_____	_____	<u>Di(99)173</u>	<u>V2</u>	_____	_____
02. -	<u>DA106/137</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>Di(99)174</u>	<u>V2</u>	_____	_____

"We Have Found the Messias"

what is not borrowed. We found independent material in the earlier SP text, as well as in the diary material from Book 32. There is also independent material in the DA text throughout the length of the chapter. Out of the 250 sentences of the chapter 132 or 53% of the total are to be credited to Ellen White.

This research project does not include the full study of the earlier writings of Ellen White even when they were used in the writing of the DA text. We do include some reference to them because they often more clearly reveal the sources behind the DA text, particularly when as in this chapter the DA text is so strongly based on the earlier Ellen White account. Our study of the sources behind chapter 14 clearly shows that further study needs to be made at the earlier stages of the text tradition, including where possible the serious review of Ellen White's original writings. When this investigation of the earlier writings is made we will be able to say more about the content of the later writings compared to the earlier materials.

As far as the DA text is concerned, we may notice that the independent sentences generally occur in small groups through the chapter. Except for four intrusions of a source or a Bible quote, the two long sections of independent material occur between sentences 50 and 81, and between sentences 212 and 236. The first section includes Bible commentary, history, spiritual and devotional comment, as well as practical application. The last group of

"We Have Found the Messiah"

independent sentences is largely devotional and practical in nature.

There is no apparent division of content between the independent sentences and those exhibiting literary dependency. The full list of sentence evaluations for this chapter may be found in Appendix A. Both dependent and independent sentences include theological, historical, descriptive, and devotional comment.

It was interesting to note among the parallels from Hanna in the earlier SP material as well as in the DA text those having to do with the inner thoughts of Christ. Ellen White does not place the words in quotation marks but she does write, "Christ virtually says."¹ If Ellen White used sources in speaking of such inaccessible information as the unexpressed thoughts of Christ, it is hard to imagine any type of comment that would by its nature be ruled out as being dependent on a literary source.

We have already indicated that our study does not include a thorough content analysis. Our general impression from the source analysis is that the DA text is largely the same as the earlier SP account. The treatment has been extended through further elaboration by Ellen White and the additional use of sources such as Jones and Hanna. The two slight differences we happened to notice concerned the calling of the beloved disciple John and the testimony to Jesus by the Baptist.

¹Cf. 2SP135/67 - 138/67 and DA240/142 - DA245/142.

"We Have Found the Messiah"

In the reference to the visit of the disciple John to the desert where Jesus was tempted, Ellen White comments on John's personal witness of Christ's countenance in its "emaciated" condition. She speaks of John as "one of the new disciples" who "had searched for Christ."¹ Yet in the DA text of this chapter we read that because of the change in the Saviour's appearance as a result of the temptation ordeal "He had been recognized only by the prophet John."² In the further comment on the meeting of Andrew and John with Jesus, the clear implication is that neither Andrew nor the disciple John had known Jesus previously.³

Another interesting item is to be found in DA89/136. Here Ellen White informs us that at the baptism of Jesus John the Baptist "pointed to Him as the Lamb of God." According to John 1:29 this declaration is made when Jesus comes to the Jordan some time after the baptism. There is no record of John making any such statement in the account of Jesus' baptism in Matt. 1:13-17, Mark 1:9-11, and Luke 3:21, 22. We did not notice this variation between Ellen White's comments in the SP text and the biblical record unless an ambiguous sentence like 2SP15/99 were to be so interpreted.

These differences are not important in themselves but the fact that such dichotomies do exist points to the need for latitudinal as well as longitudinal studies in the Ellen

¹Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, Chapter VII, p. 99.

²Desire of Ages, page 137 (sentences 112, 113).

³Ibid., p. 138.

"We Have Found the Messiah"

White writings. This prolific writer wrote over a long period of time. The chronological history of her writings on a given topic is perhaps of more importance than the multiplicity of her comment in various literary contexts. Our study of chapter 14 clearly reveals that some of Ellen White's writings actually form a literary tradition. These texts should be submitted to tradition criticism in the interest of better understanding the meanings she wished to convey.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Table 3, page 246, charts the distribution of sources for the pre-DA text materials. We have already discussed the Hanna parallels which were found in the diary materials of Book 32 and which also made their appearance in the DA text. Apart from the one parallel from Jones the remainder of the source parallels of the pre-DA text come from Melvill.

Subsequent to the publication of the SP text in 1877 Ellen White wrote a rather lengthy manuscript on "The Ladder to Heaven." In this manuscript, registered as MS 13, 1884, we found 73 parallels from Henry Melvill's sermon on "Jacob's Vision and Vow,"¹ but only one involved the DA text. The very last sentence of chapter 14 is very similar to Melvill/286a.9. None of the remaining 72 parallels show up in the DA text even though some are to be found in the

¹Melvill, Miscellaneous Sermons, op. cit.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 14

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. Hanna	00	02	05	02	00	00	02	00	00	11
02. Jones	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
03. Melvill	05	22	14	06	07	03	11	00	00	68
TOTALS Pre-DA	05	24	19	09	07	03	13	—	(00)	80

"We Have Found the Messias"

account of an Ellen White sermon as reported in The Signs of the Times, Vol. 10, No. 29, July 31, 1884 and The Review and Herald of Nov. 11, 1890.

We have included in our textual evidence 71 sentences from Manuscript 13, 1884. These sentences, 1-14, 155, 156, and 251-304b, refer mostly to Christ's statement to Nathanael at the time of Nathanael's call to discipleship and to Jacob's dream of the ladder at Bethel. The material falling between these sentences in the manuscript, as well as a few of the sentences just referred to, relate to Peter's so-called ladder of Christian graces as found in 2 Peter 1:4-11. A good portion of Manuscript 13, 1884, was published in 1961 in the "Morning Watch" readings for March 1-10 in the Ellen G. White compilation Our High Calling.

The 72 sentences of MS(13)84 treating Nathanael's calling occur mainly at the beginning and ending of the manuscript text. Of these, 16 or 22 per cent were evaluated as Strict Independence.¹ Out of the remaining 56 sentences, 32, or 44 per cent registered Strict Paraphrase, Simple Verbatim, or Strict Verbatim. Since the remainder of the manuscript did not concern our topic we did not carry out a parallel search for the complete document. Compared with the DA text these figures for Manuscript 13 indicate a high level of dependency.

Since so little of Ellen White's handwritten texts on the life of Christ has been preserved these few pages merit

¹See Table 1 above for the figures under MS(13)84.

"We Have Found the Messiah"

special interest.

It seems strange that Marian Davis would not have incorporated more of Manuscript 13 in the DA text, particularly when portions of it already were published in article form in The Signs of the Times, "The Vision of Bethel," and in The Review and Herald under the title of "The Mystic Ladder." Perhaps these captions suggested Old Testament content and on that basis were passed by. No doubt we have overlooked some of Ellen White's earlier articles for the same reason and we have concordances. The opening of the sermon as presented in ST would have led anyone to pass it by. The article begins with a long quote from Genesis 28. The first direct reference to the Nathanael experience with Jesus appears in sentence 43 even though parallels from MS 13 occur as early as sentence 34. There is no direct reference to Peter's ladder of Christian virtues in the 95 sentences of the sermon.

Ellen White evidently returned to the Melvill source when composing her sermon or the ST article. Sentence 38 clearly reflects Melvill's sermon (M/9/285) and does not appear in MS 13. Other sentences in the sermon are closer to Melvill than is the comparable sentence from MS 13, or contain verbal similarities with Melvill not to be found in the parallel sentence of MS 13 even when we are not able to register closer, overall dependency for the entire sentence.¹

¹Compare ST(84)52 with MS(13)281, ST(84)85,86 with MS(13)304a,b, and ST(84)35 with MS(13)256.

"We Have Found the Messias"

The RH article on "The Mystic Ladder" deals less with Jacob's dream and more with the theme of salvation only through Christ. A number of quotations from the gospel of John are used to support the argument that Christ is the only way to salvation.

There is no question that Ellen White was using MS 13 as well as Melvill's sermon in the composition of this article of 72 sentences and in Letter P-47-93.¹

In Table B on page 250 we have listed the parallels between the two journal articles where Ellen White comments on Christ as the "ladder," and MS 13. While there is some overlapping between the two published texts, it seems to us more likely to be accounted for by the use of the same literary sources, i.e., MS 13 and Melvill's sermon, than by Ellen White's use of the earlier sermon in ST when writing the later RH article.

The relevant sentences of MS 13, 1884 have been reproduced in typed form in Appendix D. We have corrected a few spelling errors and regularized the capitalization. The wording and syntax remain as found in Ellen White's handwritten text. It is this text that we have presented in our text evaluation above.

The only typescript of this manuscript available from the White Estate files is the copy made in 1959 by Martha Montgomery Odom. At the conclusion of the typed copy the

¹Letter to W. W. Prescott on Oct. 25, 1893. Compare RH(90)59 and Lt(47)10.7 with MS(13)279 and Lt(47)11.3 with MS(13)283.

Table B

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 14

Melvill Sermon, 1850	"Jacob's Vision and Vow"
Manuscript 13, 1884	"The Ladder to Heaven"
<u>Signs of the Times</u> , July 31, 1884	"The Vision of Bethel"
<u>Review & Herald</u> , November 11, 1890	"The Mystic Ladder"

	<u>Melvill, 1850</u>	<u>MS 13, 1884</u>	<u>ST, 1884</u>	<u>RH, 1890</u>
001. -	1,2	2	43,44	
002. -	3	3		12
003. -	4	4	34	13,14
004. -	33	5	40	
005. -	29	13	70	
006. -	11	254		41
007. -	12	255	34	
008. -	12	256	35	
009. -	13,14	257	36	16
010. -	15a	258		16
011. -	21	266		43
012. -	19	268		47
013. -	19,20	269		48
014. -	21	270	39	
015. -	27	272		51
016. -	30	276		55
017. -	31	277	40	
018. -	42	278	40	58
019. -	43	279	40	59
020. -	47	280	51	70
021. -	47	281	52	
022. -	48	282	54,55	61
023. -	48	283	56	60
024. -	49	284	57	60
025. -	49	286		69
026. -	--	287	53	
027. -	125	297	94	

"We Have Found the Messias"

following notation is to be found: "Copied from handwritten original as grammatically corrected. April 8, 1959. MMO."

We have indicated these "grammatical" changes in our footnotes. In our judgment the modifications to the text go beyond grammatical considerations. This is not to suggest that excessive liberties were taken by the copyist. We only wish to point out that the White Estate in faithfully representing the work of Ellen White did not hesitate, at least in this instance, also to engage in some editing of the original text after the author's death. Obviously the copyist was not working from the assumption of verbal inspiration.

Since we no longer have a copy of the original text of MS 13 as produced by Ellen White's literary assistants at the time of its composition, we have also included in Appendix D the two journal articles evidently developed, at least in part, from Manuscript 13. A comparison of these published works with the original manuscript allows us to study the dynamic process of the transmission of Ellen White's writings. We have, of course, no way of distinguishing the hand of Ellen White from that of her literary helpers in the modifications to her original text.

The source analytical studies in turning up two articles which at least in part were dependent on the same original manuscript points us once again in the direction of tradition analysis. Are there significant differences between the two phases of composition? If so, is it

"We Have Found the Messiah"

possible that the Christological concerns of the Minneapolis Conference of 1888 had any bearing on such changes?

These interesting questions lie outside the scope of our research. We can only point out at this juncture that chapter 14 has proved to be an important chapter for source analytical study.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

According to our sentence count the DA text is about 159 sentences longer than the SP account. Some of this enlargement is due to the opening section in which the parallels from Jones play an important role. We have not counted the independent sentences of the SP text, but it would appear that we have many more in the DA text. Actually we counted 40 more independent sentences in the DA text than the total sentences of all types in the SP account. Our figures, however, may be misleading. Part of the reason we have more sentences in the DA text is due to the shorter sentence structure in the DA text. We would have to count words to have an accurate comparison on the length.

The structure or arrangement of the DA text, however, appears to follow the development of the story as presented in John 1. Even when the source parallels are found to follow the consecutive sentence sequence of the source we cannot be sure the source controls this arrangement, for in the case of Jones and Hanna they appear to be following the

"We Have Found the Messias"

Scripture account as well.

The influence of the source is more apparent in the smaller units where the added comments on a given section, the elaboration of a particular point, or additional background description come in the same location of the DA text as in the source being used.

We should probably add here that the order of presentation of the DA text is not necessarily the work of Ellen White, particularly the chapter openings. We have evidence to show that her literary assistants had the freedom to change structure of a chapter or article. We have already noted in the previous chapter, as well as in our comments above, the changes made in the sentence structure in the process of preparing an article from manuscript material. This chapter presents an illustration from the DA text. On the following page we show how the earlier draft of the opening of chapter 14 differs from the final edition. The seventh paragraph was moved to the first and the previous first paragraph becomes the second. This kind of rearrangement of the composition is evidently referred to by Marian Davis in a letter to W. C. White.¹

In the first place, I have worked for a better opening to the chapters. . . . The chapters of the old manuscript began too often with some notice of Jesus going here or there, until the book seemed almost like a diary. That has been corrected. Then I have tried to begin both chapters and paragraphs with short sentences and indeed to simplify wherever possible, to drop out every needless word, and to make the work, as I have said, more compact and vigorous. On some

¹Letter of Marian Davis to W. C. White, 4-11-97.

"We Have Found the Messiah"

chapters I had fresh, live matter that will add greatly to the interest of the book.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The SP text is structured around the biblical story according to our brief analysis. The material from Diary Book 32, while using Hanna material, is rather short for evaluating its structure. We did note, however, that in the 11 sentences from Hanna it did not follow the order of Hanna's presentation.

The 71 sentences taken from Manuscript 13, 1884, present a slightly different picture. Though this material does not appear in the DA and there are places where Ellen White breaks with the order of Melvill, there are large sections where Ellen White's order of presentation follows that of Melvill.¹

To a lesser degree the same may be said for the two journal articles reviewed under source analysis above. In these compositions Ellen White is working primarily with her earlier manuscript and only occasionally using Melvill directly. As Table B indicates, however, the net effect is basically the same, though on a smaller scale, since she follows the general order of presentation as found in her earlier manuscript.

¹Cf. Appendix C on chapter 14.

Summary

The analysis of chapter 14 has led us into a rather involved process of source analysis, the main purpose of this research. The textual data has provided us with an illustration of nearly every type of source problem we could expect to encounter. The extent of our analysis requires a summary to highlight its major features.

1. The documents on file at the White Estate headquarters in Washington, D.C., include handwritten materials by Ellen White on the subject matter presented in chapter 14. Fourteen of the sentences from Diary Book 32, pages 39-48, on our topic were selected for the DA text. The Ellen White comments of Manuscript 13, 1884, with the exception of perhaps one sentence, were not used in this chapter although they had been published elsewhere earlier. In neither case did we find the original typescript or copy of the Ellen White autographs.

Since both texts later appear in published form we can only conclude that the original copies have been lost. Both documents show that Ellen White personally copied from literary sources. Hanna was used in the diary material and Melvill in Manuscript 13.

2. The DA text is largely a revision of the SP account in volume 2 beginning with sentence 52 on page 61 and continuing until sentence 143 on page 68. In terms of the number of sentences these 91 add up to being 159 sentences

"We Have Found the Messias"

shorter than the 250 of chapter 14 of DA. Some of the enlargement is due to an additional use of Hanna material and the opening sentences using Jones' work, Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels. Perhaps the greatest reason for the 2.75 times higher sentence count lies in the shorter length of the DA sentence. There are also 40 more independent sentences in the DA chapter than the total count of all the sentences listed in the SP for this chapter.

3. The content of the DA text is basically the same as that of the earlier materials. The difference is mainly in the extended comment of the later text and the application to personal Christian living which is in harmony with the stated purposes of the DA text and consistent with what we have found in our review of the earlier chapters.

4. We found no significant differences between the various accounts. The one interesting variation noted was the omission in the DA story of John's visit to Jesus in the wilderness of temptation prior to his being called as one of the first disciples. The DA account gives us no hint that it has any knowledge of this earlier contact as reported in the SP text. To the contrary, the DA reader is led to understand the Jordan meeting as the beginning of John's personal acquaintance with Jesus. And we are left to wonder why it is that only John the Baptist recognized Jesus in His changed state following the humiliation in the desert when the earlier account clearly indicates that only John, the new disciple, had actually seen Christ in his "pale" and

"emaciated" condition.

5. Out of the 250 sentences of chapter 14, 100 or 40 percent contained literary parallels from six authors and seven sources.

6. This chapter registered Strict Independent status against 132 or 53% of the total number of sentences. Bible quotations counted for 18 or 7 percent of the total text.

7. According to our evaluation scale the average dependency for all sentences apart from the use of Scripture amounts to 1.34. If we rate only those sentences showing some dependency, the average sentence dependency registers as 3.12.

8. The two sources accounting for the greatest number of parallels for chapter 14 were The Life of Christ by William Hanna and Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels by George Jones. The 49 parallels from Hanna and the 44 from Jones add up to 93 or 93% of the 100 sentences where dependency was registered. Copies of these two books bearing Ellen White's personal signature were found in her libraries at the time of her death. The work by Jones was among the books of her private library.

9. Seven parallels were credited to four authors and five sources. Even though we are limited in three sources to a single parallel we think the evidence merits a listing of these parallels since the authors are not strange to the Ellen White text. We list these minor sources for comparison purposes against the total textual evidence. As

"We Have Found the Messias"

independent parallels for this chapter they hardly merit mentioning.

Frederic Farrar's life of Christ furnished two parallels, John Fleetwood's account added another. Joseph Ingraham's work of fiction on The Prince of the House of David was credited with two interesting parallels and Henry Melvill was used once from each of two sermons. The lives of Christ by Farrar and Fleetwood were a part of Ellen White's personal library in 1915. One of Ingraham's fictionalized works, though not this particular book, and one of Melvill's sermon books were also a part of Ellen White's private library when her life ended.

10. With the exception of a single parallel from Jones, the pre-DA texts reviewed in connection with chapter 14 used Hanna's life of Christ and a sermon by Henry Melvill entitled "Jacob's Vision and Vow." We show only 11 parallels from Hanna in Table 3 but this total only represents a portion of the text of Di(99) which was used in writing the DA. There are many Hanna parallels to be found in the SP texts which are taken over into the DA text. We did not register those as SP parallels because they would also show up as DA parallels. We wanted to avoid duplication as much as possible. Since the SP material relevant to the content of this chapter did not include the entire text of the SP chapter we did not independently review the full SP text.

The Melvill source parallels were found in Manuscript

"We Have Found the Messiah"

13, 1884, a text apparently not used in the writing of chapter 14. The one sentence that made it into the DA text (the last sentence) was probably picked up from one of the articles evidently developed from the manuscript. It is still difficult to explain how Marian Davis or Ellen White could have missed the associated comments on this chapter's topic once they had picked up this one sentence. Perhaps the sentence is so basic Ellen White did not need to refer to what she had previously written to end her comment for this chapter.

The parallels from Melvill in this manuscript reveal a high degree of literary dependency. Of course we are only evaluating 72 sentences on the topic of our chapter and not the entire manuscript.

Further study should be made in the autograph material and in the otherwise earliest stage of the Ellen G. White text tradition if we want to really answer the question of Ellen White's use of sources.

The location of source parallels from sermons opens a whole new genre of literature for our source analytical studies of the Ellen G. White writings. It is much more difficult to trace through individual sermons for possible source parallels, particularly when life of Christ material may be found in a sermon on an Old Testament theme.

11. We found no significant difference between the general content of the DA text and that of the earlier writings. The practical and devotional material in the DA

"We Have Found the Messias"

text while not in SP to the same extent did appear in earlier manuscript material which was not included in the DA text.

12. We did not notice the independent sentences were of a special nature when compared to the dependent material. Ellen White at times extended her comments beyond those of the source but no particular change in the nature of her own work was noted apart from getting to the central point more directly and driving it home. The DA text makes the point in a more concise manner with shorter sentences. It remains to be determined however from her autographs as to how much of this is Ellen White's work and how much is to be credited to her literary assistants.

13. The arrangement of the DA text appears to follow the SP structure which in turn is very similar to the narrative development of John 1:19-51. The similarity to Hanna's structure may be explained on the same basis. In the subunits Ellen White is more likely to follow the source for a given time and then interject a series of her own comments.

14. Apart from the SP text which is largely to be viewed as the earlier edition of the DA text we only have the material from Diary Book 32 and Manuscript 13, 1884. The diary sentences came roughly between sentences 70 and 104 of the DA text and followed Hanna's structure for the most part. The same can be said of Manuscript 13. There were no long sections of independent material in the text

"We Have Found the Messiah"

portion relating to this chapter and, apart from three short series of sentences taken out of the major sequence, Ellen White's handwritten material follows the textual development of Melvill's sermon.

The two journal articles containing parallels from Melvill do in part reflect Melvill's arrangement but this is probably due to their dependence on MS 13 which in a number of sections follows Melvill's sermon sequence.

This chapter has provided a variety of data illustrating a number of characteristics of Ellen White's literary methods. The location of source parallels in sermons introduces a new challenge in our efforts to study Ellen White's use of sources. While this investigation made a limited attempt to cover this type of literature we no doubt overlooked many parallels particularly in the area of general devotional comments so typical of sermons.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	B1	051. -		I1
002. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	P3	052. -		I1
003. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	P3	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -	Bible	B2
005. -		I1	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -		I1	057. -	Bible	B2
008. -	Jones LSFG/12/38	P3	058. -		I1
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -		I1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -	Jones LSFG/3/37	P2	063. -		I1
014. -	Jones LSFG/3/37	P1	064. -		I1
015. -	Jones LSFG/4,5/37	P1	065. -		I1
016. -	Jones LSFG/5/37	P1	066. -		I1
017. -	Jones LSFG/7/38	P2	067. -		I1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -		I1	069. -		I1
020. -	Jones LSFG/11/38	P2	070. -	Hanna LC/12/101	I2
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -	Jones LSFG/13/38	P2	073. -		I1
024. -	Jones LSFG 14/38	P2	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -		I1
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -	Hanna LC/9/101	I2
032. -	Fleetwood LC/53.5	P2	082. -	Jones LSFG 19/96	I2
033. -		I1	083. -	Bible	B2
034. -	Jones LSFG/41,42/42	P2	084. -	Jones LSFG/72/46	P2
035. -	Jones LSFG/40,41/42	P2	085. -	Jones LSFG/71/46	P2
036. -	Jones LSFG/42/42	P2	086. -	Jones LSFG/69,71/46	P2
037. -	Jones LSFG/56-66/45	B1	087. -	Jones LSFG/70/46	P2
038. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	088. -		I1
039. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	089. -		I1
040. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	090. -	Bible	B2
041. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	091. -		I1
042. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	092. -		I1
043. -	LSFG/56-66	B1	093. -		I1
044. -	LSFG/56-66	B1	094. -		I1
045. -	Bible	B2	095. -	Hanna LC/1/100	P2
046. -	Bible	B2	096. -	Hanna LC/17/101	B1
047. -	Bible	B2	097. -	Hanna LC/17/101	B1
048. -	Bible	B2	098. -	Hanna LC/18/101	B1
049. -	Jones LSFG/66/45	P2	099. -	Hanna LC/19/101	B1
050. -		I1	100. -	Hanna LC/19/101	B1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	Hanna LC/21/101	B1	151.		I1
102.	Hanna LC/22/101	B1	152.		I1
103.		I1	153.		I1
104.		I1	154.		I1
105.		I1	155.		I1
106.		I1	156.		I1
107.		I1	157.		I1
108.		I1	158.		I1
109.	Jones LSFG/77/46	I2	159.	Farrar LC/123.6	P3
110.	Jones LSFG/5/95	P2	160.		I1
111.		I1	161.	Hanna LC/87/106	P3
112.	Ingraham PhD/141.7	I2	162.	Hanna LC/88/106	I2
113.	I/156.8,157.6	I2	163.	Bible	B2
114.	Jones LSFG/79/46	P3	164.		I1
115.	J/79/46,16/96	P3	165.		I1
116.		I1	166.	Hanna LC/90/100	P2
117.	J/4-6/95,79/46,16/96	P3	167.	Hanna LC/91/106	P2
118.	Jones LSFG/5/195	P3	168.	Bible	B2
119.	Jones LSFG/16,15/96	P2	169.		I1
120.	Jones LSFG/13,15/96	P3	170.		I1
121.	Jones LSFG/15/96	P3	171.	Jones LSFG/99.3	P2
122.	Jones LSFG/17/96	P3	172.		I1
123.	Jones LSFG/17/96	P3	173.		I1
124.		I1	174.		I1
125.		I1	175.	HannaLC/107,108/107	P3
126.		I1	176.		I1
127.	Jones LSFG/18/96	P1	177.		I1
128.	Jones LSFG/19/96	V2	178.		I1
129.	Jones LSFG/20/96	V2	179.		I1
130.	Hanna LC/55/104	P3	180.		I1
131.	Hanna LC/55/104	P3	181.		I1
132.	Hanna LC/53/104	P3	182.		I1
133.	Bible	B1	183.	Bible	B2
134.	Fa/122.6,H/61/104	P1	184.	Melvill GL (50)81.5	V2
135.	Hanna LC/68/105	I2	185.	Bible	B2
136.	Hanna LC/72/105	I2	186.	Bible	B2
137.	Hanna LC/72/105	P3	187.	Bible	B2
138.	Hanna LC/72/105	I2	188.	Bible	B2
139.	Hanna LC/73/105	B1	189.		I1
140.	Hanna LC/74/105	P2	190.		I1
141.		I1	191.	Hanna LC/113/107	I2
142.		I1	192.	Hanna LC/113/107	I2
143.	Hanna LC/78/105	B1	193.	Bible	B2
144.	Hanna LC/76/105	P1	194.		I1
145.	Hanna LC/77/105	P2	195.		I1
146.	Hanna LC/79a/105	B1	196.		I1
147.	Hanna LC/79b/105	B1	197.		I1
148.		I1	198.		I1
149.		I1	199.		I1
150.		I1	200.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -		
202. -	<u>Hanna LC/128/109</u>	P3	252. -		
203. -	<u>Hanna LC/136/109</u>	P2	253. -		
204. -	<u>Hanna LC/136/109</u>	P2	254. -		
205. -	<u>Hanna LC/136/109</u>	P2	255. -		
206. -	<u>Hanna LC/137/109</u>	P2	256. -		
207. -	<u>Hanna LC/138/109+</u>	P2	257. -		
208. -		I1	258. -		
209. -		I1	259. -		
210. -		I1	260. -		
211. -	<u>Hanna LC/134/109</u>	I2	261. -		
212. -	<u>Hanna LC/134/109</u>	I2	262. -		
213. -		I1	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -		I1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -		I1	267. -		
218. -		I1	268. -		
219. -		I1	269. -		
220. -		I1	270. -		
221. -		I1	271. -		
222. -		I1	272. -		
223. -		I1	273. -		
224. -		I1	274. -		
225. -		I1	275. -		
226. -		I1	276. -		
227. -		I1	277. -		
228. -		I1	278. -		
229. -		I1	279. -		
230. -		I1	280. -		
231. -		I1	281. -		
232. -		I1	282. -		
233. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	283. -		
234. -		I1	284. -		
235. -		I1	285. -		
236. -	<u>Hanna LC/116/108</u>	P2	286. -		
237. -	<u>Hanna LC/117a/108</u>	B1	287. -		
238. -		I1	288. -		
239. -	<u>Hanna LC/117b/108</u>	B1	289. -		
240. -	<u>Hanna LC/118/108</u>	P1	290. -		
241. -	<u>Hanna LC/119/108</u>	I2	291. -		
242. -	<u>Hanna LC/120a/108</u>	V2	292. -		
243. -	<u>Hanna LC/120b/108</u>	P1	293. -		
244. -	<u>Hanna LC/120b/108</u>	V2	294. -		
245. -	<u>Hanna LC/120c/108</u>	P2	295. -		
246. -		I1	296. -		
247. -		I1	297. -		
248. -		I1	298. -		
249. -	<u>Hanna LC/123/108</u>	P2	299. -		
250. -	<u>Melvill MS/286a.9</u>	P1	300. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 14

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	Di (99) 156	I2	70	052.	-	MS (13) 11	I1	250
002.	-	Di (99) 159	I1	76	053.	-	MS (13) 12	P2	250
003.	-	Di (99) 160	I1	77	054.	-	MS (13) 13	I2	250
004.	-	Di (99) 161	I1	78	055.	-	MS (13) 275	I2	250
005.	-	Di (99) 162	I1	79	056.	-	MS (13) 276	V2	250
006.	-	Di (99) 163	I1	79	057.	-	MS (13) 277	P2	250
007.	-	Di (99) 154	P2	81	058.	-	MS (13) 5	P3	250
008.	-	Di (99) 151	P2	83	059.	-	MS (13) 6	P3	250
009.	-	Di (99) 164	I1	93	060.	-	MS (13) 7	I1	250
010.	-	2SP 53/61+	P1	95	061.	-	MS (13) 8	I1	250
011.	-	Di (99) 166	I2	95	062.	-	MS (13) 9	P3	250
012.	-	Di (99) 172	P1	104	063.	-	MS (13) 10	I2	250
013.	-	Di (99) 173	V2	104	064.	-	MS (13) 278	P1	250
014.	-	Di (99) 174	V2	104	065.	-	MS (13) 279	P1	250
015.	-	Di (99) 175	P1	104	066.	-	Lt (47) 10.7	P1	250
016.	-	DA (MS) 114/178	P2	120	067.	-	RH (90) 59	V2	250
017.	-	2SP 123/66	P1	206	068.	-	MS (13) 156	I2	250
018.	-	2SP 138/67	P1	245	069.	-	MS (13) 280	V2	250
019.	-	MS (13) 1	I1	250	070.	-	ST (84) 51	P1	250
020.	-	MS (13) 2	B1	250	071.	-	MS (13) 281	P1	250
021.	-	MS (13) 3	V2	250	072.	-	ST (84) 52	V2	250
022.	-	MS (13) 4	V1	250	073.	-	MS (13) 282	V2	250
023.	-	MS (13) 251	I2	150	074.	-	MS (13) 283	I2	250
024.	-	MS (13) 14	P2	250	075.	-	Lt (47) 11.3	I2	250
025.	-	MS (13) 252	V2	250	076.	-	MS (13) 284	P3	250
026.	-	MS (13) 253	P2	250	077.	-	ST (84) 57	P1	250
027.	-	ST (84) 38	P1	250	078.	-	MS (13) 285	P1	250
028.	-	MS (13) 254	P1	250	079.	-	MS (13) 286	V2	250
029.	-	MS (13) 255	P1	250	080.	-	MS (13) 287	I1	250
030.	-	ST (84) 34	P2	250	081.	-	MS (13) 288	P3	250
031.	-	MS (13) 256	V2	250	082.	-	MS (13) 289	I1	250
032.	-	ST (84) 35	V2	250	083.	-	MS (13) 290	I1	250
033.	-	MS (13) 257	P3	250	084.	-	MS (13) 291	V2	250
034.	-	MS (13) 258	I2	250	085.	-	MS (13) 292	V2	250
035.	-	MS (13) 259	P3	250	086.	-	MS (13) 293	V2	250
036.	-	MS (13) 260	I1	250	087.	-	MS (13) 294	I1	250
037.	-	MS (13) 261	I2	250	088.	-	MS (13) 295	I1	250
038.	-	MS (13) 262	I1	250	089.	-	MS (13) 296	I2	250
039.	-	MS (13) 263	I1	250	090.	-	MS (13) 297	B1	250
040.	-	MS (13) 264	I1	250	091.	-	MS (13) 298	V2	250
041.	-	MS (13) 155	I1	250	092.	-	MS (13) 299	P2	250
042.	-	MS (13) 265	B1	250	093.	-	MS (13) 299a	V1	250
043.	-	MS (13) 266	P1	250	094.	-	MS (13) 300	P1	250
044.	-	MS (13) 267	V1	250	095.	-	MS (13) 301	V2	250
045.	-	MS (13) 268	V1	250	096.	-	MS (13) 302	V2	250
046.	-	MS (13) 269	P1	250	097.	-	ST (84) 83	I2	250
047.	-	MS (13) 270	V2	250	098.	-	MS (13) 303	I1	250
048.	-	MS (13) 271	V1	250	099.	-	MS (13) 304a	V2	250
049.	-	MS (13) 272	V2	250	100.	-	MS (13) 304b	I1	250
050.	-	MS (13) 273	P1	250	101.	-	ST (84) 85	V2	250
051.	-	MS (13) 274	V2	250	102.	-	ST (84) 86	V2	250

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 14

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	Di (99) 156	H/12/101	052.	-	MS (13) 11	
002.	-	Di (99) 159		053.	-	MS (13) 12	M/29b/286
003.	-	Di (99) 160		054.	-	MS (13) 13	M/29b/286
004.	-	Di (99) 161		055.	-	MS (13) 275	M/30a/286
005.	-	Di (99) 162		056.	-	MS (13) 276	M/30b/286
006.	-	Di (99) 163		057.	-	MS (13) 277	M/31/286
007.	-	Di (99) 154	H/8,9/101	058.	-	MS (13) 5	M/33/287
008.	-	Di (99) 151	H/7/100	059.	-	MS (13) 6	M/34/287
009.	-	Di (99) 164		060.	-	MS (13) 7	
010.	-	2SP 53/61+	H/1/100	061.	-	MS (13) 8	
011.	-	Di (99) 166	H/1/100	062.	-	MS (13) 9	M/35/287
012.	-	Di (99) 172	H/24,25/101	063.	-	MS (13) 10	M/35/287
013.	-	Di (99) 173	H/26/101	064.	-	MS (13) 278	M/42/287
014.	-	Di (99) 174	H/27/101	065.	-	MS (13) 279	M/43/287
015.	-	Di (99) 175	H/28/101	066.	-	Lt (47) 10.7	M/42,43/287
016.	-	DA(MS)114/178	J/13,15/96	067.	-	RH (90) 59	M/43/287
017.	-	2SP 123/66	H/137/109	068.	-	MS (13) 156	M/47/287
018.	-	2SP 138/67	H/120c/108	069.	-	MS (13) 280	M/47/287
019.	-	MS (13) 1		070.	-	ST (84) 51	M/47/287
020.	-	MS (13) 2	M/1,2/285	071.	-	MS (13) 281	M/47/287
021.	-	MS (13) 3	M/3a/285	072.	-	ST (84) 52	M/47/287
022.	-	MS (13) 4	M/3b/285	073.	-	MS (13) 282	M/48/287
023.	-	MS (13) 251	M/4/285	074.	-	MS (13) 283	M/48/287
024.	-	MS (13) 14	M/5,8/285	075.	-	Lt (47) 11.3	M/48/287
025.	-	MS (13) 252	M/8a/285	076.	-	MS (13) 284	M/49/287
026.	-	MS (13) 253	M/8b/285	077.	-	ST (84) 57	M/49/287
027.	-	ST (84) 38	M/9/285	078.	-	MS (13) 285	M/49/287
028.	-	MS (13) 254	M/11/285	079.	-	MS (13) 286	M/49/287
029.	-	MS (13) 255	M/12/285	080.	-	MS (13) 287	
030.	-	ST (84) 34	M/12/285	081.	-	MS (13) 288	M/50a/288
031.	-	MS (13) 256	M/12/285	082.	-	MS (13) 289	
032.	-	ST (84) 35	M/12/285	083.	-	MS (13) 290	
033.	-	MS (13) 257	M/13,14/285	084.	-	MS (13) 291	M/50b/288
034.	-	MS (13) 258	M/15a/286	085.	-	MS (13) 292	M/50c/288
035.	-	MS (13) 259	M/15b/286	086.	-	MS (13) 293	M/50c,51/288
036.	-	MS (13) 260		087.	-	MS (13) 294	
037.	-	MS (13) 261	M/16/286	088.	-	MS (13) 295	
038.	-	MS (13) 262		089.	-	MS (13) 296	M/124/291
039.	-	MS (13) 263		090.	-	MS (13) 297	M/125/291
040.	-	MS (13) 264		091.	-	MS (13) 298	M/125/291
041.	-	MS (13) 155		092.	-	MS (13) 299	M/126/291
042.	-	MS (13) 265	M/18/286	093.	-	MS (13) 299a	M/127/291
043.	-	MS (13) 266	M/21/286	094.	-	MS (13) 300	M/129/291
044.	-	MS (13) 267	M/19/286	095.	-	MS (13) 301	M/131/291
045.	-	MS (13) 268	M/19/286	096.	-	MS (13) 302	M/131/291
046.	-	MS (13) 269	M/19,20/286	097.	-	ST (84) 83	M/131/291
047.	-	MS (13) 270	M/21/286	098.	-	MS (13) 303	
048.	-	MS (13) 271	M/24/286	099.	-	MS (13) 304a	M/138/292
049.	-	MS (13) 272	M/27/286	100.	-	MS (13) 304b	
050.	-	MS (13) 273	M/28/286	101.	-	ST (84) 85	M/138/292
051.	-	MS (13) 274	M/29a/286	102.	-	ST (84) 86	M/138/292

VII CHAPTER 24 - "Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

The return of Jesus to the place of His childhood and youth is specifically treated in Luke 4:16-30 but parallels are to be found in Matthew 13:53-58 and Mark 6:1-6a where we read that Jesus returned to "His own country." The content of the narrative allows a commentator a variety of approaches to the text. The naming of the village as Nazareth leads one to reflect upon the childhood of Jesus. The Sabbath synagogue service and the reading of Scripture from the prophet Isaiah introduce the questions of Sabbath observance, the Jewish religion, Messianic expectations and Jesus' self-understanding as the Messiah. The rejection of Jesus by His people and His reaction to their rejection permit comment on the role of the Jewish nation in the purposes of God and how trust in God is rewarded with God's salvation.

Ellen White referred to this story in various contexts throughout her writing career. In her earliest use of this narrative she merely makes a general remark on the attempt of the crowd to throw Jesus over a precipice (1SG, p. 36). The first extended commentary on the Nazareth visit appears in Redemption Leaflet No. 1, 1877, as part of the material under "The Ministry of Christ," Chapter IV, pages 52-62. In The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, 1877, Chapter VII, Ellen White devotes the last fourth of the chapter on "The Marriage at Cana," pages 110-115, to this episode in the life of Christ. It is in these very similar accounts that

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

we notice the use of sources for the first time in connection with this story. But it is clear that some four years earlier Ellen White was reading Daniel March's account in Walks and Homes of Jesus.¹

In the February, 1873, issue of The Youth's Instructor Ellen White writes on Jesus as a youth in Nazareth. The article, entitled "The Life of Christ.--No. 3," forms part of the textual background for chapter 7 of The Desire of Ages, "As a Child." Since chapter 24 of the DA recalls the childhood of Jesus in the second paragraph and in sentences 8-18 of the Redemption Leaflet text, we introduce the DA text of this chapter with nine sentences from the Youth's Instructor article.

In addition to Walks and Homes of Jesus Ellen White used another work by March, Days of the Son of Man,² and Hanna's Life of Christ in her various writings on the rejection of Jesus at Nazareth.

In Diary Book 14, dated 1889-1890, we found five handwritten pages following the title, "Christ at Nazareth."³ The sentences quoted in the text presentation have been corrected in respect to punctuation and capitalization. These sentences are identified by Di(89). The full text of Ellen White's original writing on the

¹March, Daniel, Walks and Homes of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1866).

²March, Daniel, Days of the Son of Man (Philadelphia: J. C. McCurdy & Co., 1882).

³We found no transcription of this handwritten document other than the copy made in 1982. The pages in the diary are numbered 73-77.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

Nazareth rejection as found in Diary Book 14 may be found in uncorrected typescript form in Appendix D under the materials for chapter 24.

We shall have reason later to mention other articles by Ellen White on the topic of our chapter but one final reference should be included here. An 1889 letter to Howard and Madison Miller, Letter M-4-1889, includes some comment on the Nazareth experience. We begin our sentence numbers on page eight of the typescript which does not identify the copyist. The full text of the letter indicates that the letter has been generalized to make it applicable to others in addition to these two named individuals. We have corrected the spelling and punctuation errors because we have no way of being sure if the error represents the original text or the work of the copyist. Excerpts from the letter may be recognized by Lt(4). The full text from sentence 1 on page 8 through sentence 26 on page 11 and two sentences from pages 12 and 13 have been reproduced in Appendix D.

According to the earlier drafts of chapter 24, the title at one time was "Rejected at Nazareth." The final form of the title is the same as given in the earliest draft known to have existed. When we have an occasion to mention the textual evidence from this bound volume containing the earlier drafts of some of the chapters of the DA text we use the reference DA(MS) where the (MS) stands for the DA manuscript form or working draft of the text as contrasted

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

to the published text. The editorial note at the bottom of page 236 of DA is slightly misleading, however. The chapter is not based only on Luke 4:16-30. The title is a quote from Matthew 13:55 or Mark 6:3, and some of the comments of chapter 24 as well refer to the Matthean or Markan tradition. Ellen White and/or her literary sources appear to weave into one story the two accounts even though they also speak of a return visit later in Christ's ministry.

PRE-DESIRE OF AGES WRITINGS OF ELLEN WHITE NOT UTILIZED IN
THE DA TEXT

The following page has been added to the text presentation even though it does not relate directly to the literary form of chapter 24 of the DA text. These sentences from The Youth's Instructor, as well as one sentence from Redemption Leaflets No. 1, cover the same content as the DA text, and show how Ellen White used sources in writing on the life of Christ. Such earlier writings as these formed the scrapbooks developed by Marian Davis to assist Ellen White in the production of The Desire of Ages.

YI(73)16 How great must be the humiliation of the Son of God, that he should live in the despised and wicked town of Nazareth. [M/33/51+] (V2)

YI(73)17 The most holy place upon earth would have been greatly honored by the presence of the world's Redeemer a single year. [M/34a/52] (P1)

YI(73)18 The palaces of kings would have been exalted to receive Christ as a guest. [M/34b/52] (P2)

YI(73)19 But the Redeemer of the world passed by the courts of royalty, and made his home in a humble mountain village, for thirty years, thus conferring distinction upon despised Nazareth. [M/39-41/52,53] (P1)

YI(73)20 The Redeemer of the world passed up and down the hills and mountains, from the great plain to the mountain valley. [M/46/54] (P1)

YI(73)21 He enjoyed nature's beautiful scenery. (I1)

YI(73)22 He was delighted with the fields glowing with the beautiful flowers, and in listening to the birds of the air, and uniting his voice with them in their happy songs of praise. [M/47,48/54] (P2)

YI(73)23 The groves and mountains were his places of retreat for prayer, and frequently whole nights were spent in communion with his Father. [M/50,51/54] (P2)

YI(73)24 From the lofty mountains of Nazareth he looked forth upon a land that had waited a thousand years for his coming, and now he was not received. [M/53/54+] (V2)

IRL19/53 The treatment Christ received from the chief priests, scribes, and Pharisees, as he commenced his public ministry, and as the attention of the people was called to him, was the exhibition of the worst passions of the human heart. [M/60/55] (P1)

33/51+ How significant and awful the humiliation of the Son of God, that he should consent to live for so many years unhonored, unknown, in this rude, despised and wicked town. [March, WHJ]

34a/52 It would have been infinite condescension in him to have lived, for a single year, in the holiest place on earth; [March, WHJ]

34b/52 or to have maintained the state of kings in the most gorgeous palace ever built by human hands; . . . [March, WHJ]

39-41/52-53 He lived thirty years of his life in this depraved and despised Nazareth, that he might pour silent contempt upon the world's pride of place, and fortune, and fame. He passed by the renowned seats of wisdom, and glory, and empire, and made his home in this humble, mountain village, that his followers might learn to make any post of duty honorable by their own greatness and fidelity. It will take all the centuries of time, and the ages of eternity to measure the distinction which the name of Jesus has conferred upon this despised Nazareth. [March, WHJ]

46/54 Through these narrow streets, along these winding field-paths, up and down these terraced hill-sides, up and down the steep and stony road, from the great plain to the mountain valley, he passed as peasants now pass to their morning toil and their evening rest. [March, WHJ]

47,48/54 He listened to the birds of the air, the lark, the linnet, the nightingale and the turtle dove, whose voices are now heard in this valley. He delighted himself with the wild flowers that still make the meadows glow with their beauty. [March, WHJ]

50,51/54 These everlasting hills offered him their solitudes for a sanctuary. These wild olive groves, beyond the cultivated fields, covered him with their shadows when he spent the night alone in communion with his Father. [March, WHJ]

53/54+ From these lofty heights he looked forth upon a land that waited a thousand years for his coming, and received him not when he came. [March, WHJ]

60/55 The treatment which our Lord received when he attempted to begin his public ministry at Nazareth, is a sad and fearful exhibition of the worst passions of the human heart. [March, WHJ]

DA1/236 ACROSS the bright days of Christ's ministry in Galilee, one shadow lay. (I1)

DA2/236 The people of Nazareth rejected Him. (I1)

DA3/236 "Is not this the carpenter's son?" they said. (B2)

DA4/236 During His childhood and youth, Jesus had worshiped among His brethren in the synagogue at Nazareth. (I1)

DA5/236 Since the opening of His ministry He had been absent from them, but they had not been ignorant of what had befallen Him. [M/65/56] (P3)

Di(89)4 Curiosity had been aroused concerning him.
[M/65/56] (P2)

DA6/236 As He again appeared among them, their interest and expectation were excited to the highest pitch. (I1)

DA7/236 Here were the familiar forms and faces of those whom He had known from infancy. (I1)

DA8/236 Here were His mother, His brothers and sisters, and all eyes were turned upon him as He entered the synagogue upon the Sabbath day, and took His place among the worshipers. (I1)

DA9/236 In the regular service for the day, the elder read from the prophets, and exhorted the people still to hope for the Coming One, who would bring in a glorious reign, and banish all oppression. [M/71,88/57,59] (P3)

[Cf. 1RL/25,26/54]

DA10/236 He sought to encourage his hearers by rehearsing the evidence that the Messiah's coming was near. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

65/56 His fame had gone before him and his return awakened curiosity in Nazareth itself. [March, WHJ]

71/57 The service of song and prayer and reading the scriptures and exhortation was administered by the chief elder in the usual form. [March, WHJ]

88/59 They were looking for a Messiah who should come with the state of a king and the glory of a conqueror. [March, WHJ]

DA11/236 He described the glory of his advent, keeping prominent the thought that He would appear at the head of armies to deliver Israel.¹ [M/88-90/59] (I2)

1RL28/54 He taught them that Messiah would appear at the head of armies, to conquer the heathen, and deliver Israel from every oppressive yoke, destroying in wrath his enemies. [M/89,90/59] (P1)

Lt(4)10 The Jews expected the Messiah to come with pomp and ceremony as a great king. [M/88/59] (P1)

Lt(4)11 They looked for him to appear as a conqueror, to deliver Isreal [sic] from the Roman yoke. [M/88,90/59] (P1)

DA12/236 When a rabbi was present at the synagogue, he was expected to deliver the sermon, and any Israelite might give the reading from the prophets. [H/40,42/168] (I2)

DA13/236 Upon this Sabbath Jesus was requested to take part in the service. [M/18/95] (P3)

1RL29/54 At the close of the service of the minister, Jesus stood up with dignity, and requested them to bring him the book of the prophet Esaias. [M/72/57] (P2)

DA14/236 He "stood up to read. (B2)

DA15/236 And there was delivered unto Him a roll of the prophet Isaiah." Luke 4:16, 17, R. V., margin. (B2)

¹The first "He" refers to the elder of the synagogue, not Jesus.

89/59 He must appear at the head of armies, and his legions must fly as the clouds. [March, WHJ]

90/59 He must tread down the heathen in his wrath, and deliver Israel from every yoke. [March WHJ]

40,42/168 . . .the time has come for the second reading--that of some portion of the prophets,--when Jesus steps forth and stands in the reader's place. . . It is not a right belonging exclusively to priest or Levite; any Jew of any tribe might exercise it. [Hanna, LC]

18/95 When it came to the lesson for the day, selected from the prophecies of Isaiah, the leader, who was at liberty to call upon whom he pleased, seeing Jesus in the house invited him to take the elevated stand in the midst of the congregation and read. [March DSM]

72/57 At the close of the service, when the attendant of the synagogue was carrying back the book of the prophet Isaiah, from the pulpit in the centre of the house, . . Jesus stood up as he could do according to the usage of the service, and demanded that the scroll should be given him to read. [March, WHJ]

DA16/236+ The scripture which He read was one that was understood as referring to the Messiah: "The Spirit of the Lord is upon Me, Because He hath anointed Me to preach the gospel to the poor; He hath sent Me to heal the broken hearted, To preach deliverance to the captives, And recovering of sight to the blind, To set at liberty them that are bruised, To preach the acceptable year of the Lord." [H/51/169] (B1)

2SP162/111 The scripture which Jesus read was understood by all to refer to the coming Messiah and his work. [H/51/169] (V2)

DA17/237 "And He closed the roll, and gave it back to the attendant: . . . and the eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened on Him. . . . (B2)

1RL46/55 The eyes of the congregation were fastened upon him, as he stated that this prophecy was fulfilled in him. [M/83/59] (V2)

DA18/237 And all bare him witness, and wondered at the words of grace which proceeded out of His mouth." Luke 4:20-22, R. V., margin. (B2)

DA19/237 Jesus stood before the people as a living expositor of the prophecies concerning Himself. [M/73/57] (P2)

1RL50/55 Jesus stood himself the living and divine interpreter of the prophet's words in regard to himself. [M/73/57] (P1)

Lt(4)4 No man had before, ventured to assume as much, not the learned or noble of the earth, not even prophets or kings. [M/76/58] (P2)

DA20/237 Explaining the words He had read, He spoke of the Messiah as a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of captives, a healer of the afflicted, restoring sight to the blind, and revealing to the world the light of truth. [H/55/169] (P3)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

51/169 It was a Scripture universally understood to be descriptive of the coming Messiah, his office, and his work.
[Hanna, LC]

83/59 The eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened upon Jesus when he claimed that this great Messianic prophecy was fulfilled in him. [March, WHJ]

73/57 Unrolling the parchment and standing there, himself the living and divine interpreter of the prophet's words, he read, "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me," etc. [March, WHJ]

76/58 None of the prophets or kings or judges in the whole line of Jewish history had ventured to assume that exalted and awful name the MESSIAH. [March, WHJ]

2SP163a/111 And when the Saviour explained the words he had read, and pointed out the sacred office of the Messiah,--a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of the captives, a healer of the afflicted, restoring sight to the blind, and revealing to the world the light of truth, [H/55/169] (P3)

DA21/237 His impressive manner and the wonderful import of His words thrilled the hearers with a power they had never felt before. [M/41/98] (P3)

[Cf. 1RL48/55]

1RL52/56 The astonishment of the people was great.
[M/84/59] (V2)

2SP164/111 Jesus had not been educated in the school of the prophets, yet the most learned Rabbis could not speak with more confidence and authority than did this young Galilean. [H/57-58/169] (P2)

DA22/237 The tide of divine influence broke every barrier down; like Moses, they beheld the Invisible. (11)

DA23/237 As their hearts were moved upon by the Holy Spirit, they responded with fervent amens and praises to the Lord. (11)

2SP163b --the people were thrilled with the wisdom and power of his words and responded to them with fervent amens and praises to the Lord. [H/56/169] (P3)

Di(89)12 And the Spirit of the Lord was moving upon the hearts of the audience for they were impressed that these words were the words of God. (11)

Di(89)13 With thrilling power they struck upon every heart and brought forth fervent response. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

55/169 What followed, however, we may well believe to have been an exposition of the passage read, as containing an account of the true character, ends, and objects of his mission as the Christ of God; the telling who the poor were to whom he brought good tidings, who the bruised and the broken-hearted were whom he came to heal, who the bound were that he came to liberate, who the blind whose eyes he came to open, what the year was he came to usher in--the long year of grace which still runs on, in the course of which there is acceptance for all of us with God, through Christ. [Hanna, LC]

41/98 They sat in silence and in wonder as he spoke, for they had never heard such gracious words from human lips before. [March, DSM]

84/59 Their astonishment knew no bounds. [March WHJ]

56/169 As Jesus spake of these things--spake with such ease, such grace, such dignity--the first impression made upon the Nazarenes, his old familiar friends, was that of astonishment and admiration. [Hanna, LC]

57-58/169 He had got no other, no better education than that which the poorest of them had received. He had attended none of the higher schools in any of the larger towns, had sat at the feet of none of their chief rabbis to be instructed in the law; yet no rabbi of the schools could speak with greater fluency, greater authority, greater confidence. [Hanna, LC]

DA24/237 But when Jesus announced, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears," they were suddenly recalled to think of themselves, and of the claims of him who had been addressing them. [M/43,45/99] (P2)

2SP166/111 But when he announced: "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears," the minds of his hearers were brought back to consider what were this man's claims to the Messiahship--the highest position that man could occupy. [H/59a/170] (P2)

DA25/237 They, Israelites, children of Abraham, had been represented as in bondage. (I1)

DA26/237 They had been addressed as prisoners to be delivered from the power of evil; as in darkness, and needing the light of truth. [H/59b/170] (P3)

2SP167/111+ The interest of the congregation had been thoroughly awakened, and their hearts had been stirred with joy; but Satan was at hand to suggest doubts and unbelief, and they remembered who it was that addressed them as the blind, and the captives in bondage who needed special aid. [H/59a,b/170] (I2)

DA27/237 Their pride was offended, and their fears were roused. (I1)

DA28/237 The words of Jesus indicated that His work for them was to be altogether different from what they desired. (I1)

DA29/237 Their deeds might be investigated too closely. (I1)

DA30/237 Notwithstanding their exactness in outward ceremonies, they shrank from inspection by those clear, searching eyes. (I1)

DA31/237 Who is this Jesus? they questioned. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

43,45/99 . . . when he sat down and said, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears." . . . When they began to think who it was, and how great and awful was the mission which he had taken upon himself, their astonishment knew no bounds. [March, DSM]

59a/170 Soon, however, as from the mere manner, they began to turn their thoughts to the substance of this discourse, and began to realize what the position really was which Jesus was assuming--that it was nothing short of the very highest that ever any son of man was to reach; [Hanna, LC]

59b/170 that it was as the Lord's annointed Christ that he was speaking, and speaking to them as the poor, the blind, the captives, to whom he was to render such services--the admiration turns into envy. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA32/237 He who had claimed for Himself the glory of the Messiah was the son of a carpenter, and had worked at His trade with His father Joseph. [M/29/96] (P2)

1RL59/56 He was the son of a carpenter, working at the trade with his father Joseph. [M/29/96] (P1)

DA33/237 They had seen Him toiling up and down the hills, they were acquainted with His brothers and sisters, and knew His life and labors. [M/85-87/59] (P2)

1RL57/56 Many had seen Jesus in his humble, unpretending life. [M/85-86/59] (P1)

1RL58/56 His home was among the poor and lowly of the earth. [M/86,87/59] (P2)

1RL60/56 He had made no claims to distinction, or greatness. [M/87/59] (P2)

Lt(4)9 They did not expect Christ to come in this way [sic] his family connections were humble, pious people, but not distinguished for riches, learning, rank, or power. [M/86,87/59] (I2)

DA34/237 They had seen Him develop from childhood to youth, and from youth to manhood. (I1)

DA35/237 Although His life had been spotless, they would not believe that He was the promised One. (I1)

DA36/238 What a contrast between his teaching in regard to the new kingdom and that which they had heard from their elder! (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

29/96 And yet here was the Son of a carpenter, who had worked for days' wages at his trade in that town for many a year, putting himself forth before the assembly as that glorious and divine personage whose coming had been looked for with longing hearts four thousand years, and in whose kingdom all the nations of the earth should be blessed. [March, DSM]

85/59 They had seen Jesus a child in their streets. [March, WHJ]

86/59 His home was among the poor; he had pursued an humble and laborious occupation for years. [March, WHJ]

87/59 His family had never gained the distinction of learning, or riches, or rank, or power. [March, WHJ]

DA37/238 Jesus had said nothing of delivering them from the Romans. (11)

Di(89)22 They wanted a Mighty general a Military leader who with supernatural power should humiliate the Roman power and avenge their national wrongs and place the Jewish nation where they thought they deserved to be the exalted of the world. [M/56/100] (P3)

DA38/238 They had heard of His miracles, and had hoped that His power would be exercised for their advantage, but they had seen no indication of such purpose. (11)

2SP174/112 And they refused to believe him unless he gave them some marked sign. [H/64/170] (P2)

DA39/238 As they opened the door to doubt, their hearts became so much the harder for having been momentarily softened. [Cf. H/65,66/170] (11)

1SP175a/112 They opened their hearts to unbelief, and prejudice took possession of them, and blinded their judgment, (11)

DA40/238 Satan was determined that blind eyes should not that day be opened, nor souls bound in slavery be set at liberty. (11)

DA41/238 With intense energy he worked to fasten them in unbelief. (11)

DA42/238 They made no account of the sign already given, when they had been stirred by the conviction that it was their Redeemer who addressed them. (11)

1SP175b/112 so that they made no account of the evidence already given when their hearts had thrilled with the knowledge that it was their Redeemer who addressed them. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

56/100 He must put down the mighty from their seats, and exalt the men of low degree to the crowns of honor and the thrones of power. [March, DSM]

64/170 Before he asks us to believe any such thing of him, let him show us some sign from heaven; do some of those miracles that they say he has done elsewhere, particularly at Capernaum. [Hanna, LC]

65/170 If he wanted us, who have all known him so well from his childhood, to believe in him as a prophet, he should have come to us first, convinced us first, unfolded his credentials to us first, wrought his first miracles here in Nazareth. [Hanna, LC]

66/170 Jealousy heightens the offense that envy had created, and ere long the whole company in that synagogue is looking at him askance. [Hanna, LC]

DA43/238 But Jesus now gave them an evidence of his divinity by revealing their secret thoughts. [H/67/170] (I2)

2SP176/112 But Jesus now showed them a sign of his divine character by revealing the secrets of their minds. [H/67/170] (I2)

DA44/238 "He said unto them, Doubtless ye will say unto Me this parable, Physician, heal thyself: whatsoever we have heard done at Capernaum, do also here in Thine own country. [H/67/170] (B1)

[Cf. 2SP177/112]

DA45/238 And He said, Verily I say unto you, No prophet is acceptable in his own country. (B2)

DA46/238 But of a truth I say unto you, There were many widows in Israel in the days of Elijah, when the heaven was shut up three years and six months, when there came a great famine over all the land; and unto none of them was Elijah sent, but only to Zarephath, in the land of Sidon, unto a woman that was a widow. (B2)

DA47/238 And there were many lepers in Israel in the time of Elisha the prophet; and none of them was cleansed, but only Naaman, the Syrian." Luke 4:23-27, R. V. (B2)

DA48/238 By this relation of events in the lives of the prophets, Jesus met the questionings of his hearers. [H/67/170] (I2)

2SP181/113 Jesus read the inmost thoughts of those who were before him, and met their questioning with this relation of events in the lives of the prophets. [H/67/170] (I2)

DA49/238 The servants whom God had chosen for a special work were not allowed to labor for a hardhearted and unbelieving people. (I1)

DA50/238 But those who had hearts to feel and faith to believe were especially favored with evidences of his power through the prophets. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

67/170 Jesus sees this, and turning from his former subject of discourse, tells them that he sees and knows it, lays open their hearts to them, puts the very words into their lips that they were ready to utter, and proceeds to vindicate himself for not showing any special sign to his fellow-townsmen, by quoting two instances in which Elijah and Elisha, the two great workers of miracles among the prophets, passed over all their fellow countrymen to show favor to the Sidonian widow and the Syrian officer. [Hanna, LC]

DA51/238 In the days of Elijah, Israel had departed from God. (11)

DA52/238 They clung to their sins, and rejected the warnings of the Spirit through the Lord's messengers. (11)

DA53/238 Thus they cut themselves off from the channel by which God's blessing could come to them. (11)

DA54/238 The Lord passed by the homes of Israel, and found a refuge for His servant in a heathen land, with a woman who did not belong to the chosen people. (11)

DA55/238 But this woman was favored because she had followed the light she had received, and her heart was open to the greater light that God sent her through His prophet. (11)

DA56/239 It was for the same reason that in Elisha's time the lepers of Israel were passed by. (11)

DA57/239 But Naaman, a heathen nobleman, had been faithful to his convictions of right, and had felt his great need of help. (11)

DA58/239 He was in a condition to receive the gifts of God's grace. (11)

DA59/239 He was not only cleansed from his leprosy, but blessed with a knowledge of the true God. (11)

DA60/239 Our standing before God depends, not upon the amount of light we have received, but upon the use we make of what we have. (11)

DA61/239 Thus even the heathen who choose the right as far as they can distinguish it are in a more favorable condition than are those who have had great light, and profess to serve God, but who disregard the light, and by their daily life contradict their profession. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA62/239 The words of Jesus to His hearers in the synagogue struck at the root of their self-righteousness, pressing home upon them the bitter truth that they had departed from God and forfeited their claim to be His people. (11)

2SP190/114 Thus Jesus stood before the Jews, calmly revealing their secret thoughts, and pressing home upon them the bitter truth of their unrighteousness. (11)

DA63/239 Every word cut like a knife as their real condition was set before them. (11)

DA64/239 They now scorned the faith with which Jesus had at first inspired them. (11)

DA65/239 They would not admit that He who had sprung from poverty and lowliness was other than a common man. (11)

DA66/239 Their unbelief bred malice. (11)

[Cf. 1RL73/57]

DA67/239 Satan controlled them, and in wrath they cried out against the Saviour. [M/101/61] (12)

1RL74/57 Satan controlled their minds, and they cried out against him with wrath and hatred. [M/101/61] (12)

DA68/239+ They had turned from Him whose mission it was to heal and restore; now they manifested the attributes of the destroyer. (11)

DA69/240 When Jesus referred to the blessings given to the Gentiles, the fierce national pride of his hearers was aroused, and his words were drowned in a tumult of voices. (11)

DA70/240 These people had prided themselves on keeping the law; but now that their prejudices were offended, they were ready to commit murder. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

101/61 And so they cried out against him with wrath and cursing. [March, WHJ] .PA

DA71/240 The assembly broke up, and laying hands upon Jesus, they thrust Him from the synagogue, and out of the city. [M/102,104a,b/61] (P2)

1RL75/57 Their assembly broke up, and they laid hands upon Jesus, and thrust him out of the synagogue, out of their city, and would have rid the world of his presence, had they had power so to do. [M/102,104a,b/61] (P2)

DA72/240 All seemed eager for his destruction. [M/104c/61] (P1)

1RL76/57 All seemed eager to act a part in destroying him. [M/104c/61] (V2)

DA73/240 They hurried him to the brow of a precipice, intending to cast him down headlong. [M/104d/61] (V2)

1RL77/57 They hurried him to the brow of a steep precipice, intending to cast him headlong. [M/104d/61] (V2)

DA74/240 Shouts and maledictions filled the air. (I1)

DA75/240 Some were casting stones at Him, when suddenly He disappeared from among them. [M/105,106/61] (I2)

1RL80/57 Some were casting stones and dirt at him; but suddenly he disappeared out of their midst, they knew not how, or when. [M/105,106/61] (I2)

DA76/240 The heavenly messengers who had been by His side in the synagogue were with him in the midst of that maddened throng. (I1)

[Cf. 2SP201/114]

Di(89)37 Angels of heaven preserved his life and provided [?] a way out of the throng and he went on his way. (I1)

DA77/240 They shut Him in from His enemies, and conducted Him to a place of safety. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

102/61 Out of the synagogue, out of their city, out of the world would they cast him whose only offense was the meekness and plainness with which he had spoken the truth. [March WHJ]

104a/61 With one consent, and with deafening cries, they break up the assembly; [March, WHJ]

104b/61 they surround him; they lay hands upon him, [March, WHJ]

104c/61 every one eager to bear a part in destroying him; [March, WHJ]

104d/61 they hurry him forth to the brow of a precipice, near by the synagogue, that they may cast him down headlong. [March, WHJ]

105/61 But suddenly when they looked for him, he was not there. [March. WHJ]

106/61 He had passed through the midst of them and was gone. [March WHJ]

DA78/240 So angels protected Lot, and led him out safely from the midst of Sodom. (I1)

DA79/240 So they protected Elisha in the little mountain city. (I1)

DA80/240 When the encircling hills were filled with the horses and chariots of the king of Syria, and the great host of his armed men, Elisha beheld the nearer hill slopes covered with the armies of God,--horses and chariots of fire round about the servant of the Lord. (I1)

DA81/240 So, in all ages, angels have been near to Christ's faithful followers. (I1)

DA82/240 The vast confederacy of evil is arrayed against all who would overcome; but Christ would have us look to the things which are not seen, to the armies of heaven encamped about all who love God, to deliver them. (I1)

DA83/240 From what dangers, seen and unseen, we have been preserved through the interposition of the angels, we shall never know, until in the light of eternity we see the providences of God. (I1)

DA84/240 Then we shall know that the whole family of heaven was interested in the family here below, and that messengers from the throne of God attended our steps from day to day. (I1)

DA85/240 When Jesus in the synagogue read from the prophecy, He stopped short of the final specification concerning the Messiah's work. [H/106/173] (P2)

DA86/240 Having read the words, "To proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord," He omitted the phrase, "and the day of vengeance of our God." Isa. 61:2. [H/107/173] (B1)

DA87/240 This was just as much truth as was the first of the prophecy, and by His silence Jesus did not deny the truth. [H/108,109/173] (P3)

106/173 . . . instead of reading the number of verses ordinarily recited, he stopped where he did in his quotation from Isaiah. [Hanna, LC]

107/173 Had he gone on, he should have said, "to proclaim the acceptable year of the Lord, and the day of vengeance of our God." [Hanna, LC]

108-109/173 Why not go on, why pause thus in the middle of the sentence? Not assuredly that he meant either to deny or hide the truth, that the day of vengeance would follow upon the acceptable year, if the opportunities of that year were abused and lost . . . [Hanna, LC]

DA88/240 But this last expression was that upon which His hearers delighted to dwell, and which they were desirous of fulfilling. (I1)

DA89/240+ They denounced judgments against the heathen, not discerning that their own guilt was even greater than that of others. (I1)

DA90/241 They themselves were in deepest need of the mercy they were so ready to deny to the heathen. [H/109/173] (I2)

DA91/241 That day in the synagogue, when Jesus stood among them, was their opportunity to accept the call of Heaven. [H/109/173] (P2)

[Cf. 1RL86/57]

DA92/241 He who "delighteth in mercy" (Micah 7:18) would fain have saved them from the ruin which their sins were inviting. [H/109/173] (I2)

DA93/241 Not without one more call to repentance could He give them up. [M/109/62] (I2)

[Cf. 1RL89/58]

DA94/241 Toward the close of his ministry in Galilee, He again visited the home of His childhood. [M/109/62] (P2)

1RL88/58 At a later period he came to Nazareth for the last time. [M/109/62] (P1)

DA95/241 Since His rejection there, the fame of His preaching and His miracles had filled the land. [M/110/62] (P2)

1RL90/58 The fame of his miracles, and wisdom, and power, had spread everywhere, and many of the people of Nazareth had been witnesses of his wonderful miracles. [M/110/162] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

109/173 . . . but that then and now, it is his chosen and most grateful office to throw wide open the arms of the heavenly mercy, and invite all to throw themselves into them and be saved. [Hanna, LC]

109/62 In the course of the following winter, he came once more, and for the last time, to this secluded vale of Nazareth, after the people had had time to reflect and to repent of their madness. [March, WHJ]

110/62 He came when the fame of his mighty works had filled the whole land. . . . [March, WHJ]

Lt(4)21 After his fame had spread through the country to every region, after they had had time for their prejudice to subside, and reason to take control of their minds, he came again to test them, that they might redeem their past rejection of him.
[M/109,110/62] (I2)

DA96/241 None could now deny that he possessed more than human power. [M/115/62] (I2)

1RL92/58 These evidences had been witnessed by thousands. [M/115/62] (V2)

DA97/241 The people of Nazareth knew that He went about doing good, and healing all that were oppressed by Satan. (I1)

DA98/241 About them were whole villages where there was not a moan of sickness in any house; for He had passed through them, and healed all their sick. (I1)

1RL91/58 He had silenced and cast out demons, healed the sick, given sight to the blind, restored hearing to the deaf, and raised the dead to life.
[M/113,114/62] (P2)

DA99/241 The mercy revealed in every act of his life testified to his divine anointing. (I1)

DA100/241 Again as they listened to His words the Nazarenes were moved by the Divine Spirit. (I1)

DA101/241 But even now they would not admit that this Man, who had been brought up among them, was other or greater than themselves. [M/117/62] (P3)

Lt(4)24 With such tokens of his truth before them, would these blind, fanatical men see in Jesus nothing more than the carpenter of Nazareth, the son of Mary?
[M/117/62] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

[See above.]

115/62 And these evidences of his divine power had been witnessed by thousands. [March, WHJ]

113,114/62 He had given sight to the blind, and hearing to the deaf, and speech to the dumb. At Capernaum and at the neighboring hill-town of Nain, he had raised the dead to life. [March, WHJ]

117/62 But still the blinded and fanatical Nazarenes could see nothing but a carpenter in the son of Mary. [March, WHJ]

DA102/241 Still there rankled the bitter memory that while He had claimed for Himself to be the Promised One, He had really denied them a place with Israel; for He had shown them to be less worthy of God's favor than a heathen man and woman. (11)

DA103/241 Hence though they questioned, "Whence hath this Man this wisdom, and these mighty works?" they would not receive Him as the Christ of God. (11)

DA104/241 Because of their unbelief, the Saviour could not work many miracles among them. (11)

DA105/241 Only a few hearts were open to His blessing, and reluctantly He departed, never to return. (11)

DA106/241 Unbelief, having once been cherished, continued to control the men of Nazareth. (11)

DA107/241 So it controlled the Sanhedrin and the nation. (11)

DA108/241 With priests and people, the first rejection of the demonstration of the Holy Spirit's power was the beginning of the end. (11)

DA109/241 In order to prove that their first resistance was right, they continued ever after to cavil at the words of Christ. (11)

1RL95/58 They had committed themselves at the first to reject and insult him, and they retained their prejudices, and would not receive evidence, and be convinced that he was the Coming One, the Redeemer of Israel; for if they should then acknowledge him, they would condemn themselves. [M/118/62] (12)

Lt(4)25 At the begining [sic] of his ministry, they had taken their first steps in the rejection of Christ, they had committed themselves to the work and the will of Satan, and their pride was so strong, their prejudices so great, that at his second call, they would not acknowledge him as the Messiah although they had the most convincing proff [sic] of his divinity. [M/118/62] (12)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

118/62 Having once committed themselves to the rejection of Jesus, it was still too much for their pride to recognise in him the promised Redeemer of Israel, the Saviour of the world. [March, WHJ]

DA110/241 Their rejection of the Spirit culminated in the cross of Calvary, in the destruction of their city, in the scattering of the nation to the winds of heaven. (11)

DA111/241 Oh, how Christ longed to open to Israel the precious treasures of the truth! (11)

DA112/241+ But such was their spiritual blindness that it was impossible to reveal to them the truths relating to His kingdom. (11)

DA113/242 They clung to their creed and their useless ceremonies when the truth of Heaven awaited their acceptance. (11)

DA114/242 They spent their money for chaff and husks, when the bread of life was within their reach. (11)

DA115/242 Why did they not go to the word of God, and search diligently to know whether they were in error? (11)

DA116/242 The Old Testament Scriptures stated plainly every detail of Christ's ministry, and again and again He quoted from the prophets, and declared, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears." (11)

DA117/242 If they had honestly searched the Scriptures, bringing their theories to the test of God's word, Jesus need not have wept over their impenitence. (11)

DA118/242 He need not have declared, "Behold, your house is left unto you desolate." Luke 13:35. (B2)

DA119/242 They might have been acquainted with the evidence of his Messiahship, and the calamity that laid their proud city in ruins might have been averted. (11)

DA120/242 But the minds of the Jews had become narrowed by their unreasoning bigotry. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA121/242 The lessons of Christ revealed their deficiencies of character, and demanded repentance. (11)

DA122/242 If they accepted His teachings, their practices must be changed, and their cherished hopes relinquished. (11)

DA123/242 In order to be honored by Heaven, they must sacrifice the honor of men. (11)

DA124/242 If they obeyed the words of this new rabbi, they must go contrary to the opinions of the great thinkers and teachers of the time. (11)

DA125/242 Truth was unpopular in Christ's day. (11)

DA126/242 It is unpopular in our day. (11)

DA127/242 It has been unpopular ever since Satan first gave man a disrelish for it by presenting fables that lead to self-exaltation. (11)

DA128/242 Do we not today meet theories and doctrines that have no foundation in the word of God? (11)

DA129/242 Men cling as tenaciously to them as did the Jews to their traditions. (11)

DA130/242 The Jewish leaders were filled with spiritual pride. (11)

DA131/242 Their desire for the glorification of self manifested itself even in the service of the sanctuary. (11)

DA132/242 They loved the highest seats in the synagogue. (11)

DA133/242 They loved greetings in the market places, and were gratified with the sound of their titles on the lips of men. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA134/242 As real piety declined, they became more jealous for their traditions and ceremonies. (11)

DA135/242 Because their understanding was darkened by selfish prejudice, they could not harmonize the power of Christ's convicting words with the humility of His life. (11)

DA136/242 They did not appreciate the fact that real greatness can dispense with outward show. (11)

DA137/242 This Man's poverty seemed wholly inconsistent with His claim to be the Messiah. (11)

DA138/242 They questioned, If He was what He claimed to be, why was He so unpretending? (11)

DA139/242+ If He was satisfied to be without the force of arms, what would become of their nation? (11)

DA140/243 How could the power and glory so long anticipated bring the nations as subjects to the city of the Jews? (11)

DA141/243 Had not the priests taught that Israel was to bear rule over all the earth? and could it be possible that the great religious teachers were in error? (11)

DA142/243 But it was not simply the absence of outward glory in His life that led the Jews to reject Jesus. (11)

DA143/243 He was the embodiment of purity, and they were impure. (11)

DA144/243 He dwelt among men an example of spotless integrity. (11)

DA145/243 His blameless life flashed upon their hearts. (11)

DA146/243 His sincerity revealed their insincerity. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

DA147/243 It made manifest the hollowness of their pretentious piety, and discovered iniquity to them in its odious character. (11)

DA148/243 Such a light was unwelcome. (11)

DA149/243 If Christ had called attention to the Pharisees, and had extolled their learning and piety, they would have hailed Him with joy. (11)

DA150/243 But when He spoke of the kingdom of heaven as a dispensation of mercy for all mankind, He was presenting a phase of religion they would not tolerate. (11)

DA151/243 Their own example and teaching had never been such as to make the service of God seem desirable. (11)

DA152/243 When they saw Jesus giving attention to the very ones they hated and repulsed, it stirred up the worst passions of their proud hearts. (11)

DA153/243 Notwithstanding their boast that under the "lion of the tribe of Judah" (Rev. 5:5), Israel should be exalted to pre-eminence over all nations, they could have borne the disappointment of their ambitious hopes better than they could bear Christ's reproof of their sins, and the reproach they felt even from the presence of His purity. (11)

Lt(4)43a It is indeed human to err, and the wisest often make mistakes, [M/127/64] (V2)

Lt(4)43b but it is noble to confess error [sic], and not enclose the heart in prejudice, to make yourselves and others believe you have pursued a righteous [word unclear] (11)

Lt(4)44 You reject Christ by rejecting the message he sends; in so doing, you place yourselves under the control of the prince of darkness. [M/134/64] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 24 - SOURCES

127/64 It is indeed human to err, and the wisest often mistake. [March, WHJ]

128,134/64 But all other mistakes are as nothing compared with the one of rejecting Christ. . . . To reject Christ is to say, "Prison of despair be my habitation; Prince of darkness, reign over me forever." [March, WHJ]

Analysis

There is no way that all the evidence reviewed in connection with the textual study of even one chapter can be presented for the reader's appreciation. Time and staff limitations also force us to curtail our natural and legitimate desires to search for more information down many different avenues of interest opened to our attention by this study.

One very provocative challenge introduced to us forcefully by the study of this chapter is that of an internal source critical (analytical) study of Ellen White's writing on a given topic. Let us explain.

The reader no doubt has already noted how often we have had occasion to list the references to Ellen White's earlier writings on the topic of Christ's rejection at Nazareth. We have referred to an article in The Youth's Instructor, to Redemption Leaflet, No. 1, to Vol. II of The Spirit of Prophecy, to a letter written in 1889, and to some diary material. These writings exhibit the use of literary sources and apart from the YI article also appear to have been a part of that storehouse of writings from which the text of chapter 24 was generated.

In addition to these items, there is Manuscript 12b, 1896, entitled "Higher Education," where on pages 2 and 3 Ellen White comments on the Nazareth visit. Some of the sentences are very close to if not identical to the DA text. Others are similar in thought but not as close in verbal

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

expression.

Another text of interest is Manuscript 40, 1887. The earliest form of the writing consists of a 19-page handwritten copy which most likely is to be dated sometime in 1887. The only typed copy we have found of this manuscript is an unedited White Estate copy by Martha Montgomery Odom dated April 18, 1965. Excerpts from MS 40 appear as part of the general article by Ellen White in the ST, June 23, 1887. The material has been edited, given the caption, "No Cloak for Their Sin," and listed as originating in Basel, Switzerland. About four pages from the same manuscript were edited and shaped into another ST article. This second part of the manuscript was published under the title of "Jesus Rejected at Nazareth," and appeared under the date of June 16, 1887.

A final reference takes us to The Review and Herald, February 7, 1888, where Ellen White refers to the Nazareth experience in her remarks on "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth." The 97 sentences of the RH article and the ST item of 55 sentences on the visit to Nazareth have been photocopied and placed in Appendix D. In respect to the ST article we have also included the relevant sections of MS 40, 1887. The RH selection may be compared to the DA text.

What intrigues us is the way in which Ellen White takes a short and rather concise story and using literary sources as well as her own creative abilities develops several different applications. We would like to know, Which parts

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

remain basically stable and which parts undergo modification? How does the force or emphasis change according to the general thrust of the various article and book presentations? Does the story always play the same role in each composition? To what degree do the sentences change and what does this tell us about verbal inspiration and the proper way to interpret the Ellen G. White writings?

Obviously, these concerns lie beyond the scope of our investigation. What we have done is to provide a comparative listing of the parallel sentences between six earlier accounts and the DA text. In the following extended table, Table A, on pages 289 through 293 one can trace the use of a particular sentence from its earliest presentation in Redemption Leaflet, No. 1, to its final resting place in the DA text. We have not extended our search beyond 1898 but it is conceivable Ellen White could have continued the process until the time of her death in 1915. At any rate, the reader can use the various texts we have listed in our comparative study and those provided in Appendix D to extend our source critical evaluations beyond what we were able to do for this particular study.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Our tabulations as shown in Table 1, page 294, indicate that out of the 153 sentences of chapter 24 the evaluation of Strict Independence was applied to 112. Bible quotations totaled 9, leaving 32 as being in some degree dependent on a

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Redemption Leaflet No 1, Chapter IV, "The Ministry of Christ"
The Spirit of Prophecy, II, Chapter VII, "The Marriage at Cana"
The Signs of the Times, June 16, 1887, "Jesus Rejected at Nazareth"
 (See also MS 40, 1887)
 EGW Diary, Book 14, "Christ at Nazareth"
The Review and Herald, February 7, 1888, "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth"
 Letter 4, 1889, Letter to Howard and Madison Miller
The Desire of Ages, Chapter 24, "Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
001. -	1RL 1-7					Satan's activities move from direct to indirect attack.
002. -	8-18,20-22					Jesus' hometown, its reputation, part of His humiliation
003. -					Lt (4) 1	
004. -	1RL 19-M			Di(89)38	Lt (4) 2	DA 1-3
005. -	1RL 23	2SP 150		Di(89)1		DA 4
006. -	1RL 24	2SP 151	ST (87) 2	Di(89)2		
007. -				Di(89)4		DA 5
008. -						DA 6
009. -						DA 7
010. -				Di(89)5,6		DA 8
011. -	1RL 25-M	2SP 152				DA 9
012. -	1RL 26-M	2SP 153				DA10,11a
013. -	1RL 27	2SP 154				
014. -	1RL 28-M	2SP 155			Lt(4)10,12	DA 11b
015. -						DA 12-H
016. -	1RL 29-M	2SP 156		Di(89)3		DA 13
017. -	1RL 30				Lt (4) 5	DA 14
018. -	1RL 31			Di(89)7		DA 15
019. -		2SP162-H	ST (87) 5			DA 16a
020. -	1RL 32	2SP 157	ST (87) 3		Lt (4) 3	DA 16b
021. -	1RL 33	2SP 158				DA 17a
022. -	1RL 34	2SP 159	ST (87) 4			DA 17b
023. -	1RL 35	2SP 160	ST (87) 4			
024. -				Di(89)8		
025. -	1RL 36	2SP 161	ST (87) 6	Di(89)14		DA 18
026. -				Di(89)15		
027. -	1RL 37					
028. -	1RL 43					
029. -	1RL 44					
030. -	1RL 45					
031. -	1RL 46-M					
032. -	1RL 47					
033. -	1RL 50-M	2SP 165b		Di(89)9	Lt (4) 4	DA 19
034. -		2SP163a-H	ST (87) 6	Di(89)19a		DA 20
035. -	1RL 48-M	2SP 165a	ST (87) 7	Di(89)11		DA 21

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
036.	- 1RL 51	2SP 164-H				
037.	- 1RL 52					
038.	- 1RL 53			Di(89)12		DA 22
039.	- 1RL 54	2SP 163b	ST (87) 7	Di(89)13		DA 23
040.	-	2SP 166-H		Di(89)10		DA24 M/H
041.	-					DA 25
042.	-	2SP 167-H	11, 13			DA 26
043.	-					DA 27
044.	-			Di(89)19b		DA 28
045.	-			Di(89)20		DA 29
046.	-			20, 21		DA 30
047.	-			Di(89)26	Lt (4) 8	DA 31
048.	- 1RL 59-M	2SP 168	ST (87)13	Di(89)27	Lt (4) 4	DA 32
049.	- 57,58,60-M	2SP 169	ST (87)13	Di(89)28	Lt(4)13,14	DA 33
050.	-			Di(89)29		
051.	-					DA 34
052.	-					DA 35
053.	- 1RL 62	2SP 170	ST (87)13			DA 36
054.	- 1RL 61	2SP 171	ST (87)14	Di(89)22	Lt (4) 12	DA 37
055.	- 1RL 62	2SP 172	ST (87)15			
056.	- 1RL 63	2SP 173	ST (87)14			
057.	- 1RL 64,65			Di(89)23		DA 38
058.	-	2SP 174-H	ST (87)16			
059.	-	2SP 175a	ST (87)17	Di(89)25		DA 39
060.	-			Di(89)16		DA 40
061.	- 1RL 55,56			17, 18		DA 41
062.	-	2SP 175b	ST (87) 8	Di(89)24		DA 42
063.	- 1RL 66	2SP 176-H	ST (87)18	Di(89)30		DA 43
064.	- 1RL 38	2SP 177-H	ST (87)18	Di(89)31		DA 44
065.	- 1RL 39	2SP 178	ST (87)19	Di(89)32		DA 45
066.	- 1RL 40,41	2SP 179	ST (87)20			DA 46
067.	- 1RL 42	2SP 180	ST (87)21			DA 47
068.	-	2SP 181b				DA 48
069.	-	2SP 181a				
070.	- 1RL 67	2SP 182	ST (87)23			DA 49
071.	- 1RL 68	2SP 183				DA 50
072.	- 1RL 69	2SP 184				DA 51
073.	-					DA 52
074.	-					DA 53
075.	-	2SP 185				DA 54,55
076.	-	2SP 186	ST (87)34			DA 56
077.	-	2SP 187	ST (87)35			DA 57-59
078.	-					DA 60
079.	-	2SP 189	ST (87)36			DA 61
080.	-	2SP 190	ST (87)37			DA 62

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
081. -		2SP 191	ST (87)38			DA 63
082. -	<u>1RL 70,71</u>	2SP 192	ST (87)41			DA 64,65
083. -	<u>1RL 72</u>	2SP 193	ST (87)43			
084. -	<u>1RL 73</u>	2SP 194	ST (87)42			DA 66
085. -	<u>1RL 74-M</u>	2SP 195	ST (87)44			DA 67
086. -						DA 68
087. -				Di(89)33		DA 69
088. -				Di(89)39		DA 70
089. -				Di(89)40		
090. -				Di(89)41		
091. -	<u>1RL 75-M</u>	2SP 196		Di(89)35		DA 71
092. -				Di(89)36		
093. -	<u>1RL 76-M</u>	2SP 197				DA 72
094. -	<u>1RL 77-M</u>	2SP 198	ST (87)46			DA 73
095. -	<u>1RL 78</u>					
096. -	<u>1RL 79</u>	2SP 199	ST (87) 9	Di(89)34		DA 74
097. -	<u>1RL 80-M</u>	2SP 200	ST (87)47			DA 75
098. -	<u>1RL 81</u>	2SP 201-H	ST (87)48			DA 76
099. -	<u>1RL 82</u>	2SP 202				
100. -	<u>1RL 83</u>	2SP 203		Di(89)37		DA 77
101. -						DA 78
102. -						DA 79
103. -						DA 80
104. -						DA 81
105. -						DA 82
106. -						DA 83
107. -						DA 84
108. -	<u>1RL 84</u>					
109. -	<u>1RL 85</u>					
110. -						DA 85-H
111. -						DA 86-H
112. -						DA 87-H
113. -						DA 88
114. -						DA 89
115. -						DA 90-H
116. -	<u>1RL 86</u>					DA 91-H
117. -	<u>1RL 87</u>					
118. -						DA 92-H
119. -	<u>1RL 89-M</u>				Lt (4) 20	DA 93
120. -	<u>1RL 88</u>					DA 94
121. -	<u>1RL 90-M</u>				Lt(4)21-M	DA 95
122. -	<u>1RL 92-M</u>					DA 96
123. -					Lt (4) 22	DA 97
124. -	<u>1RL 91-M</u>					DA 98
125. -						DA 99

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
126. -					Lt(4)23	
127. -	<u>1RL 93</u>					DA 100
128. -	<u>1RL 94</u>				Lt(4)24-M	DA 101
129. -						DA 102
130. -						DA 103
131. -						DA 104
132. -						DA 105
133. -						DA 106
134. -						DA 107
135. -						DA 108
136. -	<u>1RL 95-M</u>				Lt(4)25-M	DA 109
137. -	<u>1RL 96</u>					
138. -	<u>1RL 97</u>					
139. -	<u>1RL 98</u>					
140. -	<u>1RL 98</u>					
141. -	<u>1RL 99</u>					
142. -	<u>1RL 100</u>					
143. -	<u>1RL 101</u>					
144. -						DA 110
145. -						DA 111
146. -						DA 112
147. -				RH 57		DA 113
148. -				RH 58		DA 114
149. -				RH 59		DA 115
150. -				RH 60		
151. -				RH 47		DA 116
152. -				RH 48		
153. -				RH 49		DA 117
154. -				RH 50		DA 118
155. -				RH 51		DA 119
156. -				RH 52		DA 120
157. -				RH 53		DA 121
158. -				RH 54		DA 122
159. -				RH 55		DA 123
160. -				RH 55		DA 124
161. -				RH 56		
162. -				RH 61		DA 125
163. -				RH 62		DA 126
164. -				RH 63		DA 127
165. -				RH 64		DA 128
166. -				RH 65		DA 129
167. -				RH 66		
168. -				RH 67		DA 130
169. -				RH 68		DA 131
170. -				RH 69		DA 132

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 24

	<u>1RL, 1877</u>	<u>2SP 1877</u>	<u>ST (87)</u>	<u>Di(89)/RH88</u>	<u>Lt (4)</u>	<u>DA 24</u>
171. -				RH 70		DA 133
172. -				RH 71		DA 134
173. -				RH 72		
174. -				RH 73		
175. -				RH 74		
176. -				RH 75		DA 135
177. -				RH 76		DA 136
178. -	<u>1RL 102</u>			RH 77		DA 137
179. -	<u>1RL 103</u>			RH 78		
180. -				RH 79		DA 138
181. -				RH 80		DA 139
182. -				RH 81		DA 140
183. -				RH 82		DA 141
184. -				RH 83		
185. -						DA 142
186. -						DA 153
187. -					43 a-M	
188. -					43 b-M	
189. -					<u>Lt(4)44-M</u>	
190. -	<u>1RL 104</u>					
191. -	<u>1RL 158</u>					
192. -						
193. -						
194. -						
195. -						
196. -						
197. -						
198. -						
199. -						
200. -						

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 24

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	01	01	10	08	03	09	112	09	153
02. YI (1873)	00	02	03	03	00	00	00	01	00	09
03. 1RL (1877)	00	05	06	05	01	00	04	00	00	21
04. 2SP (1877)	00	01	00	03	02	00	03	(03)	00	12
05. Di (89)	00	00	00	01	01	00	00	(03)	00	05
06. Lt (4) [89]	00	01	02	02	00	00	04	(01)	00	10
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	09	11	14	04	00	11	(08)	(00)	57

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

literary source. The list of evaluations for all 153 sentences is located in Appendix A.

The evaluations of these 32 dependent sentences were divided quite evenly among three categories. Partial Independence registered nine, Loose Paraphrase, eight, and ten rated as Simple Paraphrase. Of the remaining five sentences, three were labeled Source Bible, one Strict Paraphrase, and one Verbatim.

The dependency average for the entire chapter according to our rating scale is 0.63. The rate for the chapter figuring only those sentences indicating some dependency is 2.8. As Table 2 on page 296 shows, these 32 dependent sentences can be traced to three books by two authors. Nearly all of the parallels, however, appear to have originated with the earlier writings. Whenever we came upon a source parallel in the DA text we could be pretty sure we could find the same sentence, or virtually so, in an earlier Ellen White text. This dependency of Ellen White upon an earlier Ellen White source does not only show up in the text presentation but also in Table A above. Often the use of March by the RL text is repeated in the comparative sentence found in the SP text or the later DA material. Likewise the Hanna parallels reflected in the SP text are usually also picked up in the DA. Exceptions to this general pattern are sentences 12, 85, 86, 87, 90 and 92. Ellen White apparently also returned directly to Hanna's Life of Christ when she was working on this chapter.

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
		Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	--	09	09
02. Hanna LC	00	00	00	00	02	03	03	05	00	00	13
03. March DSM	00	00	00	00	02	02	00	00	00	00	04
04. March WHJ	00	01	01	01	06	03	00	04	00	00	15
TOTALS DA Text	00	01	01	10	08	03	09	--	(09)	41	

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

The DA text has slightly more parallels from March's two works than from Hanna's Life of Christ and the degree of dependency is greater for March as well. Most of the March parallels, 15 according to our count, came from Walks and Homes of Jesus.¹

We found some difficulty in comparing the length of the DA chapter with the earlier treatments of this Nazareth episode. The first full account of the story in 1RL contained 158 sentences, five more sentences than the DA text. Sentences 112-158 however, were more general in nature in keeping with the chapter's title, "The Ministry of Christ." Yet the same can be said for DA sentences 125-153. The RH article, "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth," which has many parallels with this DA chapter,² also stresses the more general negative response to the life and work of Jesus by the Jewish nation.

We must also recognize that Ellen White used sources in the earlier 1RL and 2SP accounts, and 73% of the sentences of chapter 24 were evaluated as Strict Independence. Even if one were to conclude that the later DA coverage of the Nazareth story was longer it is another matter to argue that the longer treatment is to be accounted for by extended borrowing from literary sources, as some have done. The evidence from her independent sentences and the multiple and varied earlier works that were to some degree utilized in

¹See Table 2, page 296.

²See Table A, pages 292-293. Note particularly how RH sentences 57-82 appear to supply the text for DA 113-141.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

the composition of this chapter do not support such claims.

In our comparison of the DA text with the earlier Ellen White as well as non- Ellen White sources we are usually impressed by the amount of duplication in content between the various Ellen White accounts. Her earlier and later accounts are often identical in thought and word. There is also great similarity between the thought of Ellen White and that of the literary sources even when we cannot show literary or verbal dependency. This latter agreement between Ellen White and her sources is so surprising to some that disagreements between the two accounts are not noticed. A fair evaluation requires us to register differences between the Ellen White writings as well as between her writings and the literary sources she used. Source criticism enables us to make such distinctions in literary expression. It is another step to ask for the same type of distinctions in content.

Since our major concern is with the source criticism of the DA text when compared with other writers, there is no opportunity to take seriously the question of source criticism within the Ellen White writings or content criticism between her writings and those she used. When we come across examples of such difference we are tempted to include their mention in passing if for no other reason than to stimulate further interest in such research.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

Two examples of such difference were noted in our study of this chapter.¹ According to 1RL29/54, 2SP156/110, Jesus "requested them to bring him" the Scripture to read. Yet according to Di(89)3 and DA13 "he was requested to take part in the service to read a passage." In the story as presented in ST(87), we are told he stood to read and the book was handed to him. There is no mention of a request on the part of either Jesus or the leaders of the synagogue. The apparent inconsistency is not limited to Ellen White. In Walks and Homes, 72/57, Jesus "demanded" that the book be given him but in Days of the Son of Man, 18/95, Jesus was "invited" to read the Isaiah selection.

Ellen White differs from her source in DA43 and 2SP176. Here she claims Jesus gave the people of Nazareth the sign they asked for even if they did not recognize it. Hanna on the other hand speaks of Jesus who "proceeds to vindicate himself for not showing any special sign."² A close reading of Ellen White and the sources will reveal many such instances where she departs from the source even where she is dependent on it.

Two final comments appear to be in order as we close this section on source analysis. There are times when the sources are so similar that definite identity is difficult

¹One difference noted may be due to an omission for brevity's sake or for the stated objective of leaving out of the DA account all non-biblical items. The comment in Di(89)36 that the mob debated for a while over the fate of Jesus was not in March or Hanna nor in any of Ellen White's other accounts of the episode.

²See under Hanna 67/170.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

to isolate. Take for example DA24/237. Here the DA text seems to echo March but the earlier parallel sentence from SP, 2SP166/111, appears closer to Hanna. One is not sure if the few words which throw the DA parallel to March are fortuitous and Ellen White is really using the SP text which in this chapter usually follows Hanna.

The confusion over the true literary source in such cases of nearly identical sentences from different sources introduces us to a special source analytical problem. The study of the New Testament synoptic gospels has faced a similar problem. How do we account for the parallels between Matthew, Mark, and Luke? Did Matthew copy from Mark or Mark from Matthew and when is Luke copying from Matthew and when from Mark? When Matthew and Luke agree with each other, who is copying from whom or are both copying a common source?

In our efforts to study Ellen White's use of sources we must also raise the question with reference to the sources themselves. Has Ellen White's source copied from an earlier writer? The concern over charges of plagiarism against Ellen White must push the question further back in source tradition study. Literary conventions are established by practice and not by external legal or ethical norms. The historical, literary, and cultural context of these 19th century lives of Christ needs to be explored before we can settle the issue of plagiarism for a given 19th century religious writer. More than once in this source critical

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

study we have faced the problem of sorting out the true source from among a number of similar sentence parallels.

We must also bear in mind that "Strict Independence" has to do with literary expression and not content. Both DA98 and DA109 have been evaluated as I1 but given the context and parallels from 1RL91 and 1RL95 it is obvious the content is echoing Walks and Homes of Jesus by March.

We have not traced the origins in Ellen White's earlier writings of the Strict Independence sentences. We have noted, however, that these too undergo modification. A few sentences from Diary Book 14, numbers 20, 21, for example, appear to have been picked up by the DA text.¹

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Our analysis of the DA text revealed that the source dependency for chapter 24 is largely due to the multiple earlier Ellen White parallels found in the previous writings used to compose the DA text. We have listed the parallels from these earlier texts but we cannot evaluate their dependency. The duplications in the Ellen White texts introduce duplicate parallels. We can, however, note the number of parallels found in the various earlier texts insofar as the content of these texts matched the DA content. We can also note the degree of dependency found between each given sentence and its source parallel and compare that dependency with the DA text even when the same

¹Cf. DA29,30.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

source sentence lies behind both texts.

Table 3 on page 303 makes it very clear the Walks and Homes of Jesus by March was credited as the source behind 37 of the 49 sentences showing dependency. Hanna's Life of Christ was used in nine dependent sentences. And though there are exceptions, generally the earlier text manifested the closer dependency.¹ A few examples have been listed in Table 4 on page 304.

We also may note the greater dependency of the earlier texts by noting the type of evaluations of these sentences even when the same sources are involved. According to Table 1, the DA text contained only one Verbatim and one Strict Paraphrase out of 32 sentences. The same table shows that in 49 sentences from the previous writings there were 9 Verbatim and 11 Strict Paraphrase.

In several sentences the differences between Ellen White's text and the source was clear enough to us to register Partial Independence even though verbal similarities would otherwise have led us to indicate greater dependency.²

Since the pre-DA texts contain so much material which later shows up in the DA text we need not repeat our

¹The full list of sentence evaluations and sources behind the 58 quotes from the earlier writings are provided in Appendices B and C. The "M" references for sources in Appendix C with sentences numbered 96 and above refer to The Days of the Son of Man by March.

²See DA11; Lt(4)9 under DA33; DA67; Lt(4)21 under DA95; 1RL95 and Lt(4)25 under DA109; Lt(4)43a and Lt(4)44 under DA153.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 24

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. EGM								08		08
02. Hanna LC	00	01	00	03	02	00	03	00	00	09
03. March DSM	00	00	01	01	01	00	00	00	00	03
04. March WJU	00	08	10	10	01	00	08	00	00	37
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	09	11	14	04	00	11	08	(00)	57

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 24

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt.	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u>	Eval.
01. -	<u>DA 11/236</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>1RL 28/84</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
02. -	<u>DA 16/236</u>	<u>B1</u>	<u>2SP162/111</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
03. -	<u>DA 19/237</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 50/55</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
04. -	<u>DA 32/237</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 59/56</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
05. -	<u>DA 72/240</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>1RL 76/57</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01. -	<u>DA 5/236</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>Di (89) 4</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
02. -	<u>DA 94/241</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 88/58</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
03. -	<u>DA 96/241</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>1RL 92/58</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
04. -	<u>DA 98/241</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>1RL 91/58</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
05. -	<u>DA 101/241</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>Lt (4) 24</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>
06. -	<u>DA 109/241</u>	<u>I1</u>	<u>Lt (4) 25</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>1RL95/58</u>	<u>I2</u>

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

analysis of those texts again. These earlier writings have a value, however, independent of their use as sources for chapter 24.

The letter of Ellen White to Howard and Madison Miller, Lt M-4-1889, shows that she was still returning to March twelve years after using March for 1RL.¹ We have included the sentences from this letter in Appendix D so that the reader may locate those portions appearing in our text presentation in their original context. The typed copy has been reproduced exactly as it appears in the original from the White Estate, but whose copyist was unidentified. We are not sure if the spelling errors which have been left uncorrected are those of the copyist or belong to the hand of Ellen White. Apart from Manuscript Release 906 we know of no published form of this material on Jesus' visit to Nazareth. The handwritten original on this text is no longer extant.

The only text on chapter 24 for which we have any handwritten pages from Ellen White is a portion of Diary Book 14, pages 73-77. A few sentences appear in our presentation of the DA text but it is not all that certain that Ellen White has made direct use of any source apart from her own earlier writings.

Twenty sentences from this diary have been included under Appendix D for chapter 24. We have provided some capitalization and have regularized the punctuation. The

¹Cf. Lt(4)9, 43, 44 for example.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

reader may note in this material that Ellen White had no serious trouble expressing herself in what is for the most part proper English. She also seems capable of adding still more comment on the Nazareth experience even though she has covered the same ground a number of times before. We have not located this diary material in any later published form.

We bring to a close the source criticism section of this analysis with a few particular notations relating to both the DA and the pre-DA text. DA44 is a Bible quotation from the narrative. But that the use of this particular text should appear just at this juncture in the commentary appears to us to be due to the influence of the source. On this basis we gave it a B1 rating. Once the Bible is introduced the other texts would naturally follow and therefore they were evaluated as B2. The fact that Ellen White goes off in an independent direction from the source just used once the quotations from the Bible end also lends support to our rating of B2.

DA48 does not contain any words used by Hanna but when comparing the sentence with 2SP181 and the parallels from Hanna clearly evident in the SP context, we gave the sentence the I2 rating.

When DA67 and 1RL74 are compared with M/101/61 the earlier text clearly shows closer dependency. Yet because Ellen White departs from the source in both sentences to add the thought of Satan's control over the minds of the people, we felt a fair evaluation must also indicate Ellen White's

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

independence in both sentences. On this basis we evaluated both as Partial Independence (I2). We met the same situation when comparing 1RL90 and Lt(4)21 with M/109,110/62.¹

A somewhat similar situation was faced in evaluating DA71 and 1RL75. 1RL75 has more words in common with the source but it is longer than the DA sentence. We took the comparative sentence length into consideration and on this basis gave both sentences the same evaluation.

A final note concerns DA96. The earlier text of 1RL92 is taken completely from March (M/115/62). We were tempted to rate this sentence as Strict Verbatim. But in view of the fact that a few words from the source were left out, we felt Verbatim (V2) to be a more accurate rating.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The order of presentation as found in chapter 24 is that of Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. We offer the following evidence for this claim.

The earlier draft of this chapter opened with the quote from Luke's gospel² which no longer appears in the DA text. The next draft opened with what was the second sentence and is now the fourth. Finally on a page insert dated December 20, 1897, three new sentences were added which become the opening paragraph of the published text.³ The rearrangement

¹See after DA95.

²Luke 4:16.

³Bound drafts, DA manuscript, pages 310a, -b, -c.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

of the text and introduction were no doubt due to Marian Davis' desire to present a more dramatic opening. In a letter to W. C. White¹ she described her intentions in this regard.

A comparison of the text of the rough draft of the DA text and the published text edition also shows further modifications to the text.

Table A as presented above shows how the various earlier accounts of Ellen White were utilized in the structuring of this chapter. Both 1RL and 2SP provided the basic form of the thematic development but these compositions were modified through transposition of sentences and the addition of new material. Ellen White added some paragraphs from the 1888 RH article as well as some new independent comments.

It is quite evident that March's order of presentation had some influence on the structure of chapter 24. March is approaching the narrative of the life of Jesus from a geographical perspective in Walks and Homes of Jesus. He relates the synoptic accounts of Jesus in Nazareth or his "own country" as two accounts and they may well be.² As two separate visits he puts one some time later than the other

¹Quoted above in the chapter 14 analysis, page 253f.

²Many students of the synoptic gospels interpret the textual evidence as two separate accounts of a single rejection. Other examples of this type of interpretation would be the two differing reports on the temptation of Jesus, the sermon on the mount, and the feeding of the five thousand.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

but covers both in the same chapter.

Ellen White, on the other hand, is presenting a chronological narrative. She does not cover the John the Baptist material in one chapter but in at least four different contexts. She has other chapters covering the ministry of Jesus where the second story could have been included. Nevertheless at sentence 94 she begins to tell of the visit of Jesus to Nazareth which took place "(t)oward the close of His ministry."

Perhaps a closer study of each chapter would uncover evidence that Ellen White is not consistent in her chronological scheme of presentation. But the evidence of this chapter does seem to speak for some redactional influence of March. We hasten to add, however, that over all the chapter is the work of Ellen White and Marian Davis. The grand purpose of witnessing for Christ and the gospel comes through time and again in Ellen White's personal materials and in her appeals. She is speaking of the Jews but one somehow can never overcome the impression that in this chapter she is also addressing the pietists and religious leaders of her times.

Redaction Analysis - the Pre-DA Text

The rather heavy use of earlier materials in the composition of the DA text for chapter 24 makes it impractical to insist on a clear separation of our analysis into the two categories of DA and pre-DA text. For this

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

reason we have included extensive comment on the pre-DA text under the DA text discussion.

Perhaps we are justified in separating out one of the earlier texts as further evidence of the influence of March even though this dependency is not apparent in the DA text which is built so strongly upon 1RL and 2SP.¹

In Letter M-4-1889 there is a section on the Nazareth visits. The comments are condensed yet both visits are included. The account opens with one sentence which is in a general way comparable to the opening section of the DA narrative though we could find no direct parallel in the previous materials as Table A clearly indicates. Ellen White writes: "The King of glory appeared in the form of a servant, clothed in the garb of humanity."²

The second and third sentences of March's chapter on Nazareth read as follows:

The Son of God has appeared upon the great mission of redemption, announced as King and Messiah by a multitude of the heavenly host, and yet he must be hidden from the world thirty years before he makes himself known. For so long a time he must live by toil, in dependence and obscurity, as if he were the least of the sons of men.³

Ellen White's short sentence has made the point of these two longer sentences. Her next sentence parallels that of 1RL19 which we have included in our text presentation just ahead of the DA text. It is clear from 1RL19 that March is

¹Hanna's work appears to provide filler material for basically a March arrangement as modified by Ellen White through combination of later writings.

²Letter M-4-1889, sentence 1, page 8.7.

³Daniel March, Walks and Homes of Jesus, page 45.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

being quoted even though Ellen White is now to sentence 60 in March's account. This second sentence of her letter to the Millers reads:

When he began his public ministry in Nazereth [sic], there was a sad and terrible exhibition of what human nature can and will be when Satan works on the heart.¹

The textual data for this chapter clearly shows that this letter contains March parallels. The quotes above were presented to show that Ellen White is beginning her use of March at the opening of his coverage of the Nazareth visit. What is not obvious from our textual evidence is the fact that sentences 43 and 44 of the Miller letter not only close Ellen White's account of the Nazareth story, but these two sentences parallel two sentences at the close of the March chapter on Nazareth. Sentence 44 of Letter 4, which we have located at the end of the DA text after sentence 153, is parallel to sentence M/134/64, the last sentence in the chapter.

Ellen White is able to move directly from the Nazareth story into her specific council for the Millers. Furthermore, she is able with slight modification to make this specific letter applicable for general use. We quote here the very next three sentences following sentence 44. The words in parentheses were added to the typed copy in what appears to us to be Ellen White's own handwriting.

Your spiritual discernment [sic] has been blunted.
God has sent messages of light to you (his people)

¹Letter M-4-1889, sentence 2, page 8.8.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

which would have been as healing balm had you (they) received them; but you (with others) did not do this. Like the men of Nazareth, you set yourselves to refuse the light, you exalted your own opinion and judgment as more valuable than the judgment of those whom God has made channels of light.¹

It would appear that Ellen White at times not only used the literary expressions of sources available to her but she also followed their order of presentation. At the same time she felt at liberty to add, omit, or rearrange the material to suit her own purposes. In the present example, the material from March, its beginning, ending, and some choice selections between, serve her larger purpose. She is looking for a suitable Bible story to help her drive home a point. March's treatment of the Nazareth story assists in telling the story. But Ellen White moves beyond March in the application of the story in her prophetic ministry to her church and to Christians in general.

Summary

The analysis of chapter 24 points up the need for further research in a number of areas. A fair evaluation of Ellen White's use of sources in reference to charges of plagiarism requires an investigation into the literary practices of her 19th century contemporaries. The close similarities between the sources raises the strong possibility that Ellen White was not alone in using the literary work of others.

¹Letter M-4-1889, page 13.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

We also noted the repeated use of Christ's rejection in articles of varying themes. A form critical study of these various accounts would bring to light the changes, if any, which take place in the telling of the story to different readers and for emphasizing diverse themes.

An analysis of the modifications in the textual tradition from the original handwritten text of Ellen White or the first copy through the history of its various published formulations during Ellen White's lifetime would shed light on the work of her literary assistants. But more importantly, it would provide implicit information as to Ellen White's understanding of the process of inspiration. The insights from such a study would also assist us who live after her death to interpret her writings in harmony with her own intentions.

In respect to the fourteen questions we are addressing to each of the fifteen chapters of our research project, the following information was supplied by chapter 24.

1. The only primary text to be found on the subject of Christ's rejection at Nazareth was a five-page section from Diary Book 14, 1889, 1890, pages 73-77. We have included five sentences in our list of Ellen White sentences but we cannot be sure as to what part this diary material played in the final composition of the DA text. The content of these pages is very similar to the earlier comments of Ellen White. A few sentences do not appear anywhere else as far

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

as we know.¹ There are also a few sentences that have undergone some change but appear to be the earlier form of some independent comments of Ellen White in the DA text.² Because of these affinities with the earlier writings we hesitate to claim independent source parallels for this diary material although we have done so in a few instances.

Letter M-4-1889 is not strictly speaking a primary text since it exists in typed not handwritten form. The errors in spelling and punctuation and Ellen White's added interlineations do, however, give it considerable value as a very early form of an Ellen White text. The source parallels to be found in this letter add to its value for our study.

2. There is no strong evidence for an expansion of Ellen White's treatment of the Nazareth visits of Jesus over the earlier accounts. The first extended coverage of 1RL had 158 sentences against the DA account of 153. We grant that the Redemption Leaflet narrative included a good number of sentences relating to the general ministry of Jesus, but so does the later DA account add a number of independent comments on the Jewish religious leaders.

When we add to this evidence the material from 2SP, Diary Book 14 sentences and the RH article of 1888 we should probably speak of a reduction in the DA with respect to Ellen White's overall writings on the topic. We should not,

¹Cf. sentences 8, 36.

²Compare Di(89)1 with DA4, Di(89)2,5,6 with DA8, Di(89)20,21 with DA29,30.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

however, overlook the influence of added material from a rereading of March¹ and the addition of Hanna parallels in the 2SP text on the later DA coverage. The rewriting of the earlier text often forces us to rate the sentence as independent when a source parallel in fact lies behind it. Until a thorough content analysis is completed we would argue that Ellen White's own comments account for as much enlargement over the previous writings as do her use of sources.

3. The content of the Nazareth account is basically the same in each of the texts insofar as our limited survey revealed. The difference between the various reports was the function of the story for Ellen White's direct purpose. Not all accounts mentioned both visits and some presentations were quite concise. The multiple uses of the Nazareth visit provides a good case study for a form and tradition study in the Ellen White writings. We should be able to trace the function of the story and its related form changes as it is applied to different audience or reader purposes.

4. We found no major differences between the DA text and the earlier writings. The one interesting variation had to do with whether Jesus requested or was asked to read the Scripture from the prophet Isaiah. The multiple accounts of the Nazareth visits were remarkably similar.

¹See comments on Lt(4)1889 under "Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text" above.

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

5. Chapter 24 contains 153 sentences of which 32 or 21% show some dependency.

6. Out of the total sentences, 112 or 73% were rated for Strict Independence. Nine sentences containing quotations from the Bible were not evaluated.

7. When the dependency rating scale is applied to the entire chapter the average dependency is 0.63. If we count only those sentences which register some degree of dependency, the average is 2.8.

8. Two sources accounted for most of the parallels of chapter 24. The Walks and Homes of Jesus by Daniel March was credited with supplying 15 parallels. This work was part of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death. The familiar Life of Christ by William Hanna accounted for 13 parallels.

9. Some of the text of March's work on the Walks and Homes of Jesus is very similar to his comments appearing in a second work, The Days of the Son of Man. We were able to distinguish at least four sentences which show dependency on this latter source.

10. These same sources were used by Ellen White in writing her earlier comments on the Nazareth visits. The dominant source is Walks and Homes by March. We found 37 parallels from this work. Most of these were in the Redemption Leaflet material though some parallels were found in Letter M-4-1889. The Hanna parallels in the pre-DA text were largely limited to Ellen White's commentary in Spirit

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

of Prophecy, Vol. II, where we found nine parallels.

11. Though the limitations of our evaluation criteria did not also allow for fine discrimination in our evaluations, generally the earlier parallels typically showed a higher degree of dependency.

12. We found no appreciable difference in the sentence content between the parallel and non-parallel sentences. The parallels included the early life of Jesus, historical background, attitudes of the Jewish people, and to a limited degree practical application. Ellen White often extended the comment beyond that of the source.

We did note one instance of Ellen White's opposing the source even while using it and a number of instances where she added to the source parallel certain comments not found in the source. Once again the evidence seems to clearly suggest that while Ellen White's writings are to a degree derivative they also have their original aspects.

13. The basic structure of chapter 24 appears to come from March through the earlier 1RL text. Like March she combines the two accounts of Jesus' visiting Nazareth or His "own country" into one narrative even when the DA text is generally chronological in its approach. March would be expected to mention both visits because he is writing a geographical account. Nevertheless the chapter as a completed work is to be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis who modified the basic structural pattern through the introduction of additional March material, Hanna

"Is Not This the Carpenter's Son?"

parallels, and independent comments drawn from various later published and unpublished articles and miscellaneous writings.

14. The pre-DA accounts do show Ellen White is indebted to the structural pattern of March in most instances because of her basic use of the earlier Redemption Leaflet text. This was especially noticed in the Miller letter of 1889. But Ellen White does not merely relate the story of Jesus' visit to Nazareth, and in some cases she does not treat both visits as does March. She is using the Nazareth rejection to illustrate the lessons she intends to impress upon the mind of the reader. Her articles are, therefore, more than a commentary on the Nazareth experience. She is writing for purposes of counsel and evangelical appeal. When the total Ellen White article is being considered we must insist its arrangement is not indebted to March. We should also remember that behind March is the basic biblical story to which March is also indebted.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -		I1
002. -		I1	052. -		I1
003. -	Bible	B2	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -	March WHJ/65/56	P3	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -		I1	058. -		I1
009. -	M/WHJ/71,88/57,59	P3	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -	M/WHJ/88-90/59	I2	061. -		I1
012. -	Hanna LC/40,42/168	I2	062. -		I1
013. -	M/DSM/18/95	P3	063. -		I1
014. -	Bible	B2	064. -		I1
015. -	Bible	B2	065. -		I1
016. -	Hanna LC/51/169	B1	066. -		I1
017. -	Bible	B2	067. -	M/WHJ/101/61	I2
018. -	Bible	B2	068. -		I1
019. -	M/WHJ/73/57	P2	069. -		I1
020. -	Hanna LC/55/169	P3	070. -		I1
021. -	M/DSM/41/98	P3	071. -	M/WHJ/102,104a,b/61	P2
022. -		I1	072. -	M/WHJ/104c	P1
023. -		I1	073. -	M/WHJ/104d/61	V2
024. -	M/DSM/43,45/99	P2	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -	M/WHJ/105,106/61	I2
026. -	Hanna LC/59a/170	P3	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -		I1
032. -	M/DSM/29/96	P2	082. -		I1
033. -	M/WHJ/88-87/59	P2	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -		I1	085. -	Hanna LC/106/173	P2
036. -		I1	086. -	Hanna LC/107/173	B1
037. -		I1	087. -	H/LC/108,109/173	P3
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
041. -		I1	091. -	Hanna LC/109/173	P2
042. -		I1	092. -	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
043. -	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	093. -	M/WHJ/109/62	I2
044. -	Hanna LC/67/170	B1	094. -	M/WHJ/109/62	P2
045. -	Bible	B2	095. -	M/WHJ/110/62	P2
046. -	Bible	B2	096. -	M/WHJ/115/62	P2
047. -	Bible	B2	097. -		I1
048. -	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	098. -		I1
049. -		I1	099. -		I1
050. -		I1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	M/WIJ/117/62	P3	151. -		I1
102. -		I1	152. -		I1
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -		I1	154. -		
105. -		I1	155. -		
106. -		I1	156. -		
107. -		I1	157. -		
108. -		I1	158. -		
109. -		I1	159. -		
110. -		I1	160. -		
111. -		I1	161. -		
112. -		I1	162. -		
113. -		I1	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -		I1	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -		I1	167. -		
118. -	Bible	B2	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -		I1	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -		I1	172. -		
123. -		I1	173. -		
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -		I1	181. -		
132. -		I1	182. -		
133. -		I1	183. -		
134. -		I1	184. -		
135. -		I1	185. -		
136. -		I1	186. -		
137. -		I1	187. -		
138. -		I1	188. -		
139. -		I1	189. -		
140. -		I1	190. -		
141. -		I1	191. -		
142. -		I1	192. -		
143. -		I1	193. -		
144. -		I1	194. -		
145. -		I1	195. -		
146. -		I1	196. -		
147. -		I1	197. -		
148. -		I1	198. -		
149. -		I1	199. -		
150. -		I1	200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 24

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	YI (73) 16	V2	---	051.	-	1RL 91/58	P2	98
002.	-	YI (73) 17	P1	---	052.	-	Lt (4) 24	P2	101
003.	-	YI (73) 18	P2	---	053.	-	1RL 95/58	I2	109
004.	-	YI (73) 19	P1	---	054.	-	Lt (4) 25	I2	109
005.	-	YI (73) 20	P1	---	055.	-	Lt (4) 43a	V2	153
006.	-	YI (73) 21	I1	---	056.	-	Lt (4) 43b	I1	153
007.	-	YI (73) 22	P2	---	057.	-	Lt (4) 44	I2	153
008.	-	YI (73) 23	P2	---	058.	-			
009.	-	YI (73) 24	V2	---	059.	-			
010.	-	1RL 19/53	P1	---	060.	-			
011.	-	Di (89) 4	P2	5	061.	-			
012.	-	1RL 25/26/54	P3	9	062.	-			
013.	-	1 RL 28/54	P1	11	063.	-			
014.	-	Lt (4) 10	P1	11	064.	-			
015.	-	Lt (4) 11	P1	11	065.	-			
016.	-	1RL 29/54	P2	13	066.	-			
017.	-	2SP 162/111	V2	16	067.	-			
018.	-	1RL 46/55	V2	17	068.	-			
019.	-	1RL 50/55	P1	19	069.	-			
020.	-	Lt (4) 4	P2	19	070.	-			
021.	-	2SP 163a/111	P3	20	071.	-			
022.	-	1RL/52/56	V2	21	073.	-			
023.	-	2SP 163b/111	P3	21	074.	-			
024.	-	2SP 164/111	P2	21	075.	-			
025.	-	Di (89) 12	I1	23	076.	-			
026.	-	Di (89) 13	I1	23	077.	-			
027.	-	2SP 166/111	P2	24	078.	-			
028.	-	2SP 167/111	I2	26	079.	-			
029.	-	1RL 59/56	P1	32	080.	-			
030.	-	1RL 57/56	P1	33	081.	-			
031.	-	1RL 58/56	P2	33	082.	-			
032.	-	1RL 60/56	P2	33	083.	-			
033.	-	Lt (4) 9	I2	33	084.	-			
034.	-	Di (89) 22	P3	37	085.	-			
035.	-	2SP 174/112	P2	38	086.	-			
036.	-	2SP 175a/112	I1	39	087.	-			
037.	-	2SP 175b/112	I1	42	088.	-			
038.	-	2SP 176/112	I2	43	089.	-			
039.	-	2SP 181/112	I2	48	090.	-			
040.	-	2SP 190/114	I1	62	091.	-			
041.	-	1RL 74/57	I2	67	092.	-			
042.	-	1RL 75/57	P2	71	093.	-			
043.	-	1RL 76/57	V2	72	094.	-			
044.	-	1RL 77/57	V2	73	095.	-			
045.	-	1RL 80/57	I2	75	096.	-			
046.	-	Di (89) 37	I1	76	097.	-			
047.	-	1RL 88/58	P1	94	098.	-			
048.	-	1RL 90/58	I2	95	099.	-			
049.	-	Lt (4) 21	I2	95	100.	-			
050.	-	1RL 92/58	V2	96	100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 24

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	YI (73) 16	M/33/51+	051.	-	1RL 91/58	M/113,114/62
002.	-	YI (73) 17	M/34a/52	052.	-	Lt (4) 24	M/117/62
003.	-	YI (73) 18	M/34b/52	053.	-	1RL 95/58	M/118/62
004.	-	YI (73) 19	M/39-41/52,53	054.	-	Lt (4) 25	M/118/62
005.	-	YI (73) 20	M/46/54	055.	-	Lt (4) 43a	M/127/64
006.	-	YI (73) 21		056.	-	Lt (4) 43b	
007.	-	YI (73) 22	M/47,48/54	057.	-	Lt (4) 44	M/134/64
008.	-	YI (73) 23	M/50,51/54	058.	-		
009.	-	YI (73) 24	M/53/54+	059.	-		
010.	-	1RL 19/53	M/60/55	060.	-		
011.	-	Di (89) 4	M/WHJ/65/56	061.	-		
012.	-	1RL 25,26/54	M/71,88/57,59	062.	-		
013.	-	1RL 28/54	M/89,90/59	063.	-		
014.	-	Lt (4) 10	M/88/59	064.	-		
015.	-	Lt (4) 11	M/88,90/59	065.	-		
016.	-	1RL 28/54	M/72/57	066.	-		
017.	-	2SP 162/111	H/51/169	067.	-		
018.	-	1RL 46/55	M/83/59	068.	-		
019.	-	1RL 50/55	M/73/57	069.	-		
020.	-	Lt (4) 4	M/76/58	070.	-		
021.	-	2SP/163a/111	H/55/169	071.	-		
022.	-	1RL/52/56	M/84/59	072.	-		
023.	-	2SP 163b/111	H/56/169	073.	-		
024.	-	2SP 164/111	H/57,58/169	074.	-		
025.	-	Di (89) 12		075.	-		
026.	-	Di (89) 13		076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 166/111	H/59a/170	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 167/111	H/59a,b/170	078.	-		
029.	-	1RL 59/56	M/29/96	079.	-		
030.	-	1RL 57/56	M/85,86/59	080.	-		
031.	-	1RL 58/56	M/86,87/59	081.	-		
032.	-	1RL 60/56	M/87/59	082.	-		
033.	-	Lt (4) 9	M/86,87/59	083.	-		
034.	-	Di (89) 22	M/56/100	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 174/112	H/64/170	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 175a/112		086.	-		
037.	-	2SP 175b/112		087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 176/112	H/67/170	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 181/113	H/67/170	089.	-		
040.	-	2SP 190/114		090.	-		
041.	-	1RL 74/57	M/101/61	091.	-		
042.	-	1RL 75/57	M/102,104a,b/61	092.	-		
043.	-	1RL 76/57	M/104c/61	093.	-		
044.	-	1RL 77/57	M/104d/61	094.	-		
045.	-	1RL 80/57	M/105/61	095.	-		
046.	-	Di (89) 37		096.	-		
047.	-	1RL 88/58	M/109/62	097.	-		
048.	-	1RL 90/58	M/110/62	098.	-		
049.	-	Lt (4) 21	M/109,110/62	099.	-		
050.	-	1 RL 92/58	M/115/62	100.	-		

VIII CHAPTER 37 - The First Evangelists

According to the notation at the bottom of the first page of chapter 37, Ellen White's comments to follow are based upon Matthew 10, Mark 6:7-11, and Luke 9:1-6. In these verses the synoptic gospels record the commission of Jesus to the twelve apostles as He sends them forth on their first missionary tour. The account of Matthew takes 42 verses to introduce the disciples as apostles and to present a long discourse from Jesus. Ellen White follows Matthew rather than Mark and Luke who merely record the event. Luke has more to say when he speaks of the sending out of the seventy in chapter 10.

Ellen White does not specifically address this topic in Spiritual Gifts. She does speak of the healing ministry of Jesus on page 37 of chapter V on "The Ministry of Jesus" but nowhere treats the sending out of the twelve.

The earliest extended Ellen White comment on the sending out of the twelve appears in the last 24 sentences of Spirit of Prophecy, II, chapter XIX, "Other Parables." The account begins with sentences 159 and 160 which are very similar to what also is found in Redemption Leaflet, No. 3, published with 2SP in 1877.

Ellen White referred to this first independent missionary journey of the apostles in various published articles throughout the formative years of the Adventist missionary movement. Understandably the missionary activities of Jesus and of His disciples would provide the

The First Evangelists

ideal models for Ellen White as she sought to inspire the Adventists with the necessary zeal for transforming a small missionary people into a worldwide evangelistic force.

Some choice words from Steps to Christ¹ were used in the DA text to speak of Jesus' example in ministry. Since these sentences, with one exception, appear to have been lifted verbatim from SC we have only included as pre-DA text the one sentence from that portion of the SC material not found in the DA text. The abbreviation SC is used to identify that sentence.

Marian Davis evidently had in her scrapbook four articles from The Review and Herald relating to the sending out of the first evangelists. We do not in every instance repeat the earlier text if a source is not involved or if the DA text is an exact duplication of the earlier text. We do, however, make references to these earlier articles. These previously published writings play an important role in the study of how the literary tradition of the Ellen White writings utilizes Bible themes in different ways to serve different purposes. This variety of application serves to inform our method of interpreting the Ellen White writings. But primarily our concern is to note how the combination of these earlier writings results in the

¹Mrs. E. G. White, Steps to Christ (Battle Creek, Mich.: Review and Herald Publishing Co., 1896), pages 11, 12. The earlier edition of this work as published by Fleming H. Revell in 1892 did not contain the chapter on "God's Love for Man" where the sentences later used in the DA text make their first appearance in the writings of Ellen White.

The First Evangelists

formation of the DA text which is our specific focus in this study.

Three of the four RH articles to which we are referring are entitled, "Christ's Instruction to His Followers." This series is presented in the April 19, 26, and May 3, 1892, issues and all three parts carry the notation "Sermon of North Fitzroy, Australia, Jan. 9, 1892." The fourth RH selection appeared under date of November 7, 1893, and carried the title, "Come Ye Yourselves Apart, . . . and Rest Awhile."

Our search for Ellen White's earlier comments on the theme of chapter 37 led us also to the article, "Co-Workers with Christ," RH, March 23, 1897. We did not include any sentences from this material in our text presentation. The date is close to the publication date of the DA text and the text does not advance our knowledge of Ellen White's use of sources. Many of the sentences in this article are similar in content to what Ellen White has written before and represent her independent work.¹

We are fortunate to have in our possession the earlier draft of some of the DA chapters. In this manuscript which we call DA(MS), chapter 37 was numbered as 36 and carried the title "The Apostles' First Mission." Our text presentation will include some sentences from this earlier draft which do not appear in the published DA text.

¹Interested readers may compare sentence 7 with DA18/350, 12 with DA47/351, 14 with DA45/351, 31ff. with DA56-61/351,352, and 39 with DA19/350.

The First Evangelists

The literary sources mentioned in the evaluation of literary dependency for chapter 37 include the familiar Life of Christ by William Hanna and The Great Teacher by John Harris. In respect to the latter source, however, we will be using the 1870 edition which contained some comments not found in the 1836 publication used earlier. We indicate the edition by [Harris, GT(1870)].

Other sources making their appearance in this chapter involve literary works by Cumming, Miller, and Pentecost.¹ In each instance the quotation will be identified by the author's name followed by the initials of his work.²

¹John Cumming, Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Matthew (Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett, Proctor, and Worthington, 1855); J. R. Miller, Week-Day Religion (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1880); George F. Pentecost, Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments Covering the International Sunday School Lessons for 1889 (New York: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1888) and Bible Studies I. Studies in the Pentateuch. II. Studies in the Life of Christ. The International Sunday School Lessons for 1894 (New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1893).

²[Cumming, SR-M], [Miller, W-DR], [Pentecost, BS(89)] and [Pentecost, BS(94)].

DA(MS)15/471 "And Jesus went about all the cities and villages, teaching in their synagogues, and preaching the gospel of the kingdom, and healing every sickness and every disease among the people." [Mt. 9:35] (B2)

DA(MS)17/471 Jesus looked with pity upon them. [H/3/268] (B1)

[Cf. Mt. 9:36a]

3RL96/59 Jesus looked upon the retreating multitude with yearning compassion. [H/3/268] (B1)

2SP159/255 In looking abroad over the various fields where he had labored, Jesus was filled with compassion for those scattered ones who had accepted him as their Saviour, and looked to him for the bread of life. [H/3/268] (B1)

DA(MS)18/471 They were as sheep without a shepherd. [H/4/268] (B1)

[Cf. Mt. 9:36b]

3RL97/59 He felt that they were as scattered sheep without a shepherd. [H/4/268] (B1)

2SP160/255+ They seemed to him like sheep to be left without a shepherd, when he should ascend to Heaven. [H/4/268] (B1)

DA(MS)20/471 The teachers of Israel were seeking their own glory. (11)

3RL98/59 The priests, who should have been teachers in Israel, were but machines for performing unmeaning ceremonies and repeating the law they did not themselves understand nor practice. (11)

DA(MS)22/471 The time of his own stay on earth was short, and the work was great. (11)

3RL102/59 The Saviour knew that his days of personal effort for men upon earth were numbered. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

3/268 He looked on the multitudes that gathered round him with a singular compassion. [Hanna, LC]

4/268 Spiritually to his eye they were as sheep scattered abroad, who when he left them would be without a shepherd.
[Hanna, LC]

DA(MS)25/471 To his disciples he said, "The harvest truly is plenteous, but the laborers are few; pray ye therefore the Lord of the harvest, that he will send forth laborers into his harvest." [Mt. 9:37,38] [H/5,6/268] (B1)

[Cf. 2SP162]

DA1/349 THE apostles were members of the family of Jesus, and they had accompanied Him as He traveled on foot through Galilee. (11)

RH(93)1 The disciples were members of the family of Jesus, and he arranged that they should accompany him as he traveled on foot through the length and breadth of Palestine. (11)

DA2/349 They had shared with Him the toils and hardships that overtook them. (11)

RH(93)2 They partook with him of the simple food provided for their physical sustenance, and shared with him in the hardships, toils, and emergencies that overtook them. (11)

DA3/349 They had listened to His discourses, they had walked and talked with the Son of God, and from His daily instruction they had learned how to work for the elevation of humanity. (11)

DA4/349 As Jesus ministered to the vast multitudes that gathered about Him, His disciples were in attendance, eager to do His bidding and to lighten His labor. (11)

DA5/349 They assisted in arranging the people, bringing the afflicted ones to the Saviour, and promoting the comfort of all. (11)

DA6/349 They watched for interested hearers, explained the Scriptures to them, and in various ways worked for their spiritual benefit. (11)

DA7/349 They taught what they had learned of Jesus, and were every day obtaining a rich experience. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

5,6/268 "The harvest," said he to his disciples, "truly is plenteous, but the laborers are few. Pray ye therefore the Lord of the harvest, that he will send forth laborers into his harvest." [Hanna, LC]

DA8/349 But they needed also an experience in laboring alone. (Il)

DA9/349 They were still in need of much instruction, great patience and tenderness. (Il)

DA10/349 Now, while He was personally with them, to point out their errors, and counsel and correct them, the Saviour sent them forth as His representatives. (Il)

DA11/349 While they had been with Him, the disciples had often been perplexed by the teaching of the priests and Pharisees, but they had brought their perplexities to Jesus. (Il)

DA12/349 He had set before them the truths of Scripture in contrast with tradition. (Il)

DA13/349 Thus He had strengthened their confidence in God's word, and in a great measure had set them free from their fear of the rabbis and their bondage to tradition. (Il)

DA14/349+ In the training of the disciples the example of the Saviour's life was far more effective than any mere doctrinal instruction. (Il)

DA15/350 When they were separated from Him, every look and tone and word came back to them. (Il)

DA16/350 Often when in conflict with the enemies of the gospel, they repeated His words, and as they saw their effect upon the people, they rejoiced greatly. (Il)

DA17/350 Calling the twelve about Him, Jesus bade them go out two and two through the towns and villages. [H/17/269] (B1)

RH(93)3 Jesus sent his disciples forth by two and two into all the towns and villages that he himself purposed to visit. (Il)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

17/269 Jesus takes the twelve, and dividing them into pairs, sends them away from him two and two; delivering to them, as he sends them forth, the address contained in the tenth chapter of the gospel of St. Matthew. [Hanna, LC]

2SP163/256 As yet the disciples had little experience in preaching the practical truths received from their Lord; but they had been his companions for several months, and he had occasionally sent them forth to labor by themselves for a short time, to prepare them for their future mission when he should no longer be with them. [H/8,9/268] (I2)

DA18/350 None were sent forth alone, but brother was associated with brother, friend with friend. (I1)

2SP164/256 But he now separated them in pairs, and sent them away from him in different directions. [H/17/269] (P2)

DA19/350 Thus they could help and encourage each other, counseling and praying together, each one's strength supplementing the other's weakness. [P/67.3] (P2)

[Cf. RH(97)39]

DA20/350 In the same manner He afterward sent forth the seventy. (I1)

DA21/350 It was the Saviour's purpose that the messengers of the gospel should be associated in this way. [P/67.3] (P3)

RH(92)48 Can we not see the wisdom of having two go together to preach the gospel? [P/67.3] (I2)

DA22/350 In our own time evangelistic work would be far more successful if this example were more closely followed. [P/67.3] (I2)

DA23/350 The disciples' message was the same as that of John the Baptist and of Christ Himself: "The kingdom of heaven is at hand." [H/23/269] (I2)

2SP165/256 He delegated to them the power of working miracles, but they were in no case to employ this power for their own exaltation or advantage. [H/24/269] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

8,9/268 . . . but there were those twelve men whom he had chosen, who had for many months been continually by his side. He can send them; not permanently, for as yet they were comparatively unqualified for the work. [Hanna, LC]

17/269 Jesus takes the twelve, and dividing them into pairs, sends them away from him two and two; delivering to them, as he sends them forth, the address contained in the tenth chapter of the gospel of St. Matthew. [Hanna, LC]

67.3 He sends them forth by twos, that they may be helpers of each other's faith and courage and bearers of each other's burdens. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

67.3 There is great wisdom in this--a wisdom that we do not always follow, either in our work for Jesus or in the ordering of our individual lives. [Pentecost, BS(88,89)]

23/269 They were simply to proclaim the advent of the kingdom, leaving the works and words of Jesus to point out the place in that kingdom which he occupied. [Hanna, LC]

24/269 The power of working miracles they were for the time to enjoy, but they were not to use it, as they might easily have done, for any selfish or mercenary purpose. [Hanna, LC]

2SP166a/256 They were to be gone but a few days,
[H/26/269] (V2)

2SP166b/256 and they were not sent among strangers
on this first tour, but among their brethren
[H/27/269] (P1)

2SP166c/256 who were to prepare their way that they
might have access to the people, many of whom
earnestly desired to know more of the doctrines of
Christ. [H/28/269] (I2)

DA24/350 They were to enter into no controversy with the
people as to whether Jesus of Nazareth was the Messiah; but
in His name they were to do the same works of mercy as He
had done. [H/20,21/269] (I2)

DA25/350 He bade them, "Heal the sick, cleanse the lepers,
raise the dead, cast out devils: freely ye have received,
freely give." [H/25/269] (B1)

DA26/350 During His ministry Jesus devoted more time to
healing the sick than to preaching. (I1)

DA27/350 His miracles testified to the truth of His words,
that He came not to destroy but to save. [H/343.1] (P3)

DA28/350 His righteousness went before Him, and the glory
of the Lord was His rearward. (I1)

DA29/350 Wherever He went, the tidings of His mercy
preceded Him. [H/343.4] (P2)

DA30/350 Where He had passed, the objects of His compassion
were rejoicing in health, and making trial of their
new-found powers. [H/343.5a,5b] (V2)

DA31/350 Crowds were collecting around them to hear from
their lips the works that the Lord had wrought. [H/343.5b]
(P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

26/269 They were to be absent but a few days. [Hanna, LC]

27/269 They were going, not among strangers or enemies, but among friends and brethren. [Hanna, LC]

28/269 The more easily and expeditiously they get through their work the better. [Hanna, LC]

20,21/269 But he personally was not to be the burden of their message. They were not to announce his advent as the Messiah. [Hanna, LC]

25/269 As freely as they got, they were to give. [Hanna, LC]

343.1 But the object he aimed at, and the truths he taught, were both of a benevolent nature; and the miracles he performed in confirmation of those truths partook of the same character. [Harris, GT]

343.4 Wherever he came, disease and suffering fled from his presence. His path might be traced from place to place in lines of life, and health, and joy. [Harris, GT]

343.5a Where he had passed, the restored might be seen, making trial of their new-found powers; . . . [Harris, GT]

343.5b . . . listeners, formed into groups to hear the tale of healing; and the delighted objects of his compassion, rehearsing, with earnestness, what had passed, imitating his tones, and even trying to convey an idea of his condescending ways. [Harris, GT]

DA32/350 His voice was the first sound that many had ever heard, His name the first word they had ever spoken, His face the first they had ever looked upon. [H/343.7] (V2)

DA33/350 Why should they not love Jesus, and sound His praise? (I1)

DA34/350 As He passed through the towns and cities He was like a vital current, diffusing life and joy wherever He went. [H/343.9] (V2)

DA(MS)58/474 As he passed through the towns and cities, he was like a vital current, an element of life, diffusing light and joy, wherever he went. [H/343.9] (V2)

DA35/350 The followers of Christ are to labor as He did. (I1)

DA36/350 We are to feed the hungry, clothe the naked, and comfort the suffering and afflicted. (I1)

DA37/350 We are to minister to the despairing, and inspire hope in the hopeless. (I1)

DA38/350 And to us also the promise will be fulfilled, "Thy righteousness shall go before thee; the glory of the Lord shall be thy rearward." Isa. 58:8. (B2)

DA39/350+ The love of Christ, manifested in unselfish ministry, will be more effective in reforming the evildoer than will the sword or the court of justice. (I1)

DA40/351 These are necessary to strike terror to the lawbreaker, but the loving missionary can do more than this. (I1)

DA41/351 Often the heart will harden under reproof; but it will melt under the love of Christ. (I1)

343.7 His voice was the first sound which many of them heard; his name the first word they had pronounced; his blessed form the first sight they had ever beheld. [Harris, GT]

343.9 He went through the land like a current of vital air, an element of life, diffusing health and joy wherever he appeared. [Harris, GT]

DA42/351 The missionary cannot only relieve physical maladies, but he can lead the sinner to the Great Physician, who can cleanse the soul from the leprosy of sin. (11)

DA43/351 Through His servants, God designs that the sick, the unfortunate, those possessed of evil spirits, shall hear His voice. (11)

DA44/351 Through His human agencies He desires to be a Comforter such as the world knows not. (11)

DA45/351 The disciples on their first missionary tour were to go only to "the lost sheep of the house of Israel." (11)

[Cf. RH(92)40]

DA46/351 If they had now preached the gospel to the Gentiles or the Samaritans, they would have lost their influence with the Jews. [P/401.8] (P3)

[Cf. RH(92)41]

DA47/351 By exciting the prejudice of the Pharisees they would have involved themselves in controversy which would have discouraged them at the outset of their labors. [P/401.8] (12)

DA48/351 Even the apostles were slow to understand that the gospel was to be carried to all nations. (11)

DA49/351 Until they themselves could grasp this truth they were not prepared to labor for the Gentiles. (11)

DA50/351 If the Jews would receive the gospel, God purposed to make them His messengers to the Gentiles. (11)

DA51/351 Therefore they were first to hear the message. (11)

DA52/351 All over the field of Christ's labor there were souls awakened to their need, and hungering and thirsting for the truth. (11)

401.8 Besides, it would have been a great tactical mistake, so far as his purpose to win the Jews was concerned, had he aroused their deep and bitter prejudices by putting the Samaritans on the same level with them in proclaiming himself as their Messiah. Neither the Jews, the Samaritans, nor the Gentiles were yet ready for the universal proclamation of the gospel. [Pentecost, BS(94)]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA53/351 The time had come to send the tidings of His love to these longing hearts. (11)

DA54/351 To all these the disciples were to go as His representatives. (11)

DA55/351 The believers would thus be led to look upon them as divinely appointed teachers, and when the Saviour should be taken from them they would not be left without instructors. (11)

[Cf. 2SP161/256]

DA56/351 On this first tour the disciples were to go only where Jesus had been before them, and had made friends.
[H/19,27/269] (P3)

DA57/351 Their preparation for the journey was to be of the simplest kind. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)32]

DA58/351 Nothing must be allowed to divert their minds from their great work, or in any way excite opposition and close the door for further labor. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)33]

DA59/351 They were not to adopt the dress of the religious teachers, nor use any guise in apparel to distinguish them from the humble peasants. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)34]

DA60/351 They were not to enter into the synagogues and call the people together for public service; their efforts were to be put forth in house-to-house labor. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)35]

DA61/351 They were not to waste time in needless salutations, or in going from house to house for entertainment. [H/37/269] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

19/269 It was to be confined strictly to Galilee--to the narrow district that they had already frequently traversed in their Master's company. [Hanna, LC]

27/269 They were going, not among strangers or enemies, but among friends and brethren. [Hanna, LC]

37/269 They were to salute the house in which such resided, to enter it, and if well-received, were to remain in it, not going from house to house, wasting their time in multiplied or prolonged formalities and salutations by the way. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA62/351 But in every place they were to accept the hospitality of those who were worthy, those who would welcome them heartily as if entertaining Christ Himself. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)36]

DA63/351 They were to enter the dwelling with the beautiful salutation, "Peace be to this house." Luke 10:5. (11)

DA64/351+ That home would be blessed by their prayers, their songs of praise, and the opening of the Scriptures in the family circle. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)36b]

DA65/352 These disciples were to be heralds of the truth, to prepare the way for the coming of their Master. (11)

[Cf. RH(97)37]

DA66/352 The message they had to bear was the word of eternal life, and the destiny of men depended upon their reception or rejection of it. (11)

2SP167/256 In sending out his disciples, Jesus instructed them, upon entering a town or city, to seek those who were of good repute and abide with them during the time in which they labored in that locality; for the influence of such persons would be beneficial to the cause. [H/36/269] (P3)

DA67/352 To impress the people with its solemnity, Jesus bade His disciples, "Whosoever shall not receive you, nor hear your words, when ye depart out of that house or city, shake off the dust of your feet. [H/38a/270] (B1)

2SP168/256+ But if the disciples were not received by those to whom they went, they were to shake off even the dust from their feet against the house that was closed against them, or the city that refused to hear their message. [H/38a/270] (P2)

2SP169/257 This act was calculated to impress the people with the importance of the gospel message, and with the fact that it could not be slighted or rejected with impunity [sic]. [H/38b/270] (P2)

36/269 On entering any town or village, their first inquiry was to be for the susceptible, the well-disposed, about whom, after the excitement consequent upon Christ's former visits, some information might easily be obtained. [Hanna, LC]

37/269 They were to salute the house in which such resided, to enter it, and if well-received, were to remain in it, not going from house to house, wasting their time in multiplied or prolonged formalities and salutations by the way. [Hanna, LC]

38a/270 Wherever rejected, they were to shake off the dust of their feet against that house or city; [Hanna, LC]

38b/270 and to create a profound impression of the importance of the errand on which they were despatched, [sic] Jesus closes the first part of his address to them by saying, "Verily, I say unto you, it shall be more tolerable for the land of Sodom and Gomorrah, in the day of judgment, than for that city." [Hanna, LC]

DA68/352 Verily I say unto you, It shall be more tolerable for the land of Sodom and Gomorrah in the day of judgment, than for that city. [H/38b/270] (B1)

2SP170/257 The great Teacher declared to his disciples, with startling emphasis, that it would be more tolerable for Sodom and Gomorrah in the day of Judgment than for the city that refused to hear them. [H/38b/270] (B1)

DA69/352 Now the Saviour's eye penetrates the future; He beholds the broader fields in which, after His death, the disciples are to be witnesses for Him. [H/40-47/270] (P2)

DA70/352 His prophetic glance takes in the experience of His servants through all the ages till He shall come the second time. [H/46/270] (P3)

DA71/352 He shows His followers the conflicts they must meet; He reveals the character and plan of the battle. [H/308a] (P1)

DA72/352 He lays open before them the perils they must encounter, the self-denial that will be required. [H/308b] (P3)

DA73/352 He desires them to count the cost, that they may not be taken unawares by the enemy. [H/308c] (I2)

DA74/352 Their warfare is not to be waged against flesh and blood, but "against the principalities, against the powers, against the world rulers of this darkness, against the spiritual hosts of wickedness in the heavenly places." Eph. 6:12, R. V. (I1)

DA75/352 They are to contend with supernatural forces, but they are assured of supernatural help. [H/308d] (P2)

DA76/352 All the intelligences of heaven are in this army. [H/308e] (P3)

DA77/352 And more than angels are in the ranks. [H/308e] (V2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

40/270 But limited as it was, the task now committed to them carried in it the germ, the type of that larger apostolic work for which, by the gift of the Spirit, they were to be qualified, and in which, for so many years after their Master's death, they were to be engaged. [Hanna, LC]

41/270 And so, after speaking of the one, Jesus passes on to the other, the nearer and narrower mission sinking out of sight as his eye rests on the farther and broader mission that lay before them. [Hanna, LC]

46/270 The fact thus solemnly affirmed pointing, in the destruction of Jerusalem, to the close of that very period over which Christ's prophetic eye was now ranging; "Verily I say unto you, Ye shall not have gone over the cities of Israel, till the Son of man be come." [Hanna, LC]

47/270 But now the whole earthly mission of the twelve presents itself to the Saviour's eye but as the preface and prelude to that continuous, abiding work of witnessing for him upon this earth to which each separate disciple of the cross is called. [Hanna, LC]

48/270 Dropping, therefore, all directions and allusions referring exclusively to the apostles and to apostolic times, Jesus, in the closing and larger portion of the address, from the twenty-fourth to the forty-second verse, speaks generally of all true discipleship to himself upon this earth: foretelling its fortunes, describing its character, its duties, its encouragements, and its rewards. [Hanna, LC]

49/270 Jesus would hold out no false hopes--would have no one become his upon any false expectations. [Hanna, LC]

50/270 Misconception, misrepresentation, ill-treatment of one kind or other, his true and faithful followers must be prepared to meet--to meet without surprise, without complaint, without resentment. [Hanna, LC]

308a while he ever enlarges on the conflict, presents his followers with a plan of the battle,

[Cf. Hanna/48,50/270+]

308b points out its imminent hazards,

[Cf. Hanna/49,50/270+]

308c and exhorts them, before entering on it, to "count the cost,"

DA78/352 The Holy Spirit, the representative of the Captain of the Lord's host, comes down to direct the battle.
[H/308f] (P3)

DA79/352 Our infirmities may be many, our sins and mistakes grievous; but the grace of God is for all who seek it with contrition. [H/308g] (I2)

DA80/352 The power of Omnipotence is enlisted in behalf of those who trust in God. [H/308g] (P3)

DA81/353 "Behold," said Jesus, "I send you forth as sheep in the midst of wolves; be ye therefore wise as serpents, and harmless as doves." (B2)

DA82/353 Christ Himself did not suppress one word of truth, but He spoke it always in love. [M/7/187] (P1)

[Cf. SC5/12]

DA83/353 He exercised the greatest tact, and thoughtful, kind attention in His intercourse with the people.
[M/1/187] (P1)

DA84/353 He was never rude, never needlessly spoke a severe word, never gave needless pain to a sensitive soul.
[M/2,3,4/187] (P1)

DA85/353 He did not censure human weakness. [M/5/187]
(P1)

DA86/353 He fearlessly denounced hypocrisy, unbelief, and iniquity, but tears were in His voice as He uttered His scathing rebukes. [M/8/187] (I2)

DA87/353 He wept over Jerusalem, the city He loved, that refused to receive Him, the Way, the Truth, and the Life.
[M/9/187] (I2)

DA88/353 They rejected Him, the Saviour, but He regarded them with pitying tenderness, and sorrow so deep that it broke His heart. [M/9/187] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

308d he at the same time assures them of such supernatural succors as shall enable their weakness to do the deeds of Omnipotence, . . .

308e he reminds them that they struggle for an invisible world, that they fight in the fellowship with all the children of light, that more than angels are in their ranks

308f --for he promises them the abundant aid of the Eternal Spirit.

308g Their infirmities may be numerous, their sins may be might [sic?], their ignorance may seem invincible; but an almighty Agent is employed for the special purpose of piercing that ignorance, overpowering that sinfulness, and surrounding them with an element of light and holiness. [Harris, GT(1870)]

7/187 He never suppressed the truth, but he uttered it always in love. [Miller, W-DR]

1/187 A true appreciation of the story of the teachings of the gospel will reveal the fact that our Lord himself exercised the most beautiful and thoughtful tact in all his mingling among the people. [Miller, W-DR]

2/187 He was utterly incapable of rudeness. [Miller, W-DR]

3/187 He never needlessly spoke a harsh word. [Miller, W-DR]

4/187 He never gave needless pain to a sensitive heart. [Miller, W-DR]

5/187 He was most considerate of human weakness. [Miller, W-DR]

8/187 Even the terrible woes he pronounced against unbelief and hypocrisy I do not believe were spoken in the tones of thunder trembling with rage which men impart to their anathemas. [Miller, W-DR]

9/187 I think we must read them in the light of his tears over the city of his love, which had rejected him, pulsing and tremulous with divine and sorrowing tenderness. [Miller, W-DR]

SC13/12 His life was one of self-denial and thoughtful care for others. [M/10/187] (P1)

DA89/353 Every soul was precious in His eyes. [M/12/187]
(V2)

DA90/353 While He always bore himself with divine dignity, He bowed with tenderest regard to every member of the family of God. [M/13/187] (P2)

DA91/353 In all men He saw fallen souls whom it was His mission to save. [M/14/187] (P2)

DA92/353 The servants of Christ are not to act out the dictates of the natural heart. (11)

DA93/353 They need to have close communion with God, lest, under provocation, self rise up, and they pour forth a torrent of words that are unbecoming, that are not as dew or the still showers that refresh the withering plants. (11)

DA94/353 This is what Satan wants them to do; for these are his methods. (11)

DA95/353 It is the dragon that is wroth; it is the spirit of Satan that is revealed in anger and accusing. (11)

DA96/353 But God's servants are to be representatives of Him. (11)

DA97/353 He desires them to deal only in the currency of heaven, the truth that bears His own image and superscription. (11)

DA98/353 The power by which they are to overcome evil is the power of Christ. (11)

DA99/353 The glory of Christ is their strength. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

10/187 His whole life tells of most considerate thoughtfulness. [Miller, W-DR]

11/187 He had a wondrous reverence for human life. [Miller, W-DR]

12/187 Every scrap of humanity was sacred and precious in his eyes. [Miller, W-DR]

13/187 He bore himself always in an attitude of tenderest regard for every one. [Miller, W-DR]

14/187 How could it be otherwise, since he saw in every one a lost being whom by love he might win and rescue, or whom by a harsh word he might drive for ever beyond hope? [Miller, W-DR]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA100/353 They are to fix their eyes upon His loveliness.
(11)

DA101/353 Then they can present the gospel with divine tact and gentleness. (11)

DA102/353 And the spirit that is kept gentle under provocation will speak more effectively in favor of the truth than will any argument, however forcible. (11)

DA103/353 Those who are brought in controversy with the enemies of truth have to meet, not only men, but Satan and his agents. (11)

DA104/353 Let them remember the Saviour's words, "Behold, I send you forth as lambs among wolves." Luke 10:3. (B2)

DA105/353 Let them rest in the love of God, and the spirit will be kept calm, even under personal abuse. (11)

DA106/353 The Lord will clothe them with a divine panoply.
(11)

DA107/353 His Holy Spirit will influence the mind and heart, so that their voices shall not catch the notes of the baying of the wolves. (11)

DA108/354 Continuing His instruction to His disciples, Jesus said, "Beware of men." (11)

DA109/354 They were not to put implicit confidence in those who knew not God, and open to them their counsels; for this would give Satan's agents an advantage. (11)

DA110/354 Man's inventions often counterwork God's plans.
(11)

DA111/354 Those who build the temple of the Lord are to build according to the pattern shown in the mount,--the divine similitude. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA112/354 God is dishonored and the gospel is betrayed when His servants depend on the counsel of men who are not under the guidance of the Holy Spirit. (11)

DA113/354 Worldly wisdom is foolishness with God. (11)

DA114/354 Those who rely upon it will surely err. (11)

DA115/354 "They will deliver you up to councils, . . . yea and before governors and kings shall ye be brought for My sake, for a testimony to them and to the Gentiles." Matt. 10:17, 18, R. V. (B2)

DA116/354 Persecution will spread the light. (11)

DA117/354 The servants of Christ will be brought before the great men of the world, who, but for this, might never hear the gospel. (11)

DA118/354 The truth has been misrepresented to these men. (11)

DA119/354 They have listened to false charges concerning the faith of Christ's disciples. (11)

DA120/354 Often their only means of learning its real character is the testimony of those who are brought to trial for their faith. (11)

DA121/354 Under examination these are required to answer, and their judges to listen to the testimony borne. (11)

DA122/354 God's grace will be dispensed to His servants to meet the emergency. (11)

DA123/354 "It shall be given you," says Jesus, "in that same hour what ye shall speak. (B2)

DA124/354 For it is not ye that speak, but the Spirit of your Father which speaketh in you." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA125/354 As the Spirit of God illuminates the minds of His servants, the truth will be presented in its divine power and preciousness. (I1)

DA126/354 Those who reject the truth will stand to accuse and oppress the disciples. (I1)

DA127/354 But under loss and suffering, even unto death, the Lord's children are to reveal the meekness of their divine Example. (I1)

DA128/354 Thus will be seen the contrast between Satan's agents and the representatives of Christ. (I1)

DA129/354 The Saviour will be lifted up before the rulers and the people. (I1)

DA130/354 The disciples were not endowed with the courage and fortitude of the martyrs until such grace was needed. (I1)

DA131/354 Then the Saviour's promise was fulfilled. (I1)

DA132/354 When Peter and John testified before the Sanhedrin council, men "marveled; and they took knowledge of them, that they had been with Jesus." Acts 4:13. (B2)

DA133/354 Of Stephen it is written that "all that sat in the council, looking steadfastly on him, saw his face as it had been the face of an angel." (B2)

DA134/354 Men "were not able to resist the wisdom and the spirit by which he spake." Acts 6:15, 10. (B2)

DA135/354+ And Paul, writing of his own trial at the court of the Caesars, says, "At my first defense no one took my part, but all forsook me. . . . (B2)

DA136/355 But the Lord stood by me, and strengthened me; that through me the message might be fully proclaimed, and that all the Gentiles might hear: and I was delivered out of the mouth of the lion." 2 Tim. 4:16, 17, R. V. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

DA137/355 The servants of Christ were to prepare no set speech to present when brought to trial. (11)

DA138/355 Their preparation was to be made day by day in treasuring up the precious truths of God's word, and through prayer strengthening their faith. (11)

DA139/355 When they were brought into trial, the Holy Spirit would bring to their remembrance the very truths that would be needed. (11)

DA140/355 A daily, earnest striving to know God, and Jesus Christ whom He has sent, would bring power and efficiency to the soul. (11)

DA141/355 The knowledge obtained by diligent searching of the Scriptures would be flashed into the memory at the right time. (11)

DA142/355 But if any had neglected to acquaint themselves with the words of Christ, if they had never tested the power of His grace in trial, they could not expect that the Holy Spirit would bring His words to their remembrance. (11)

DA143/355 They were to serve God daily with undivided affection, and then trust Him. (11)

DA144/355 So bitter would be the enmity to the gospel that even the tenderest earthly ties would be disregarded. (11)

DA145/355 The disciples of Christ would be betrayed to death by the members of their own households. (11)

DA146/355 "Ye shall be hated of all men for My name's sake," He added; "but he that shall endure unto the end, the same shall be saved." Mark 13:13. (B2)

DA147/355 But He bade them not to expose themselves unnecessarily to persecution. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

DA148/355 He Himself often left one field of labor for another, in order to escape from those who were seeking His life. (I1)

DA149/355 When He was rejected at Nazareth, and His own townsmen tried to kill Him, He went down to Capernaum, and there the people were astonished at His teaching; "for His word was with power." Luke 4:32. (I1)

DA150/355 So His servants were not to be discouraged by persecution, but to seek a place where they could still labor for the salvation of souls. (I1)

DA151/355 The servant is not above his master. [H/51/271] (P1)

DA152/355 The Prince of heaven was called Beelzebub, and His disciples will be misrepresented in like manner. [H/52/271] (P1)

DA153/355 But whatever the danger, Christ's followers must avow their principles. (I1)

DA154/355 They should scorn concealment. [H/54/271] (P1)

DA155/355 They cannot remain uncommitted until assured of safety in confessing the truth. (I1)

DA156/355 They are set as watchmen, to warn men of their peril. (I1)

DA157/355 The truth received from Christ must be imparted to all, freely and openly. [H/56/271] (P3)

2SP171a/257 Jesus enjoins his disciples to make known to others those truths which he had spoken to their ears alone, [H/56/271] (P2)

DA158/355 Jesus said, "What I tell you in darkness, that speak ye in light: and what ye hear in the ear, that preach ye upon the housetops." [H/57/271] (B1)

The Desire of Ages -- Chapter 37 - SOURCES

51/271 The disciple need not hope to be above his Master, the servant above his Lord. [Hanna, LC]

52/271 "If they have called the master of the house Beelzebub, how much more them of his household?" [Hanna, LC]

54/271 With the disciples there shall be no concealment of any kind. [Hanna, LC]

56/271 True, there were things that he addressed alone to the apostles' ear in private, but the secrecy and reserve so practised by him was meant to be temporary and transient. [Hanna, LC]

57/271 "What I tell you thus in darkness, that speak ye in the light; and what ye hear in the ear, that preach ye upon the housetops." [Hanna, LC]

2SP171b saying, "What I tell you in darkness, that speak ye in light; and what ye hear in the ear, that preach ye upon the house-tops." [H/57/271] (B1)

DA159/356 Jesus Himself never purchased peace by compromise. (11)

DA160/356 His heart overflowed with love for the whole human race, but He was never indulgent to their sins. (11)

DA161/356 He was too much their friend to remain silent while they were pursuing a course that would ruin their souls,--the souls He had purchased with His own blood. (11)

DA162/356 He labored that man should be true to himself, true to his higher and eternal interest. (11)

DA163/356 The servants of Christ are called to the same work, and they should beware lest, in seeking to prevent discord, they surrender the truth. (11)

DA164/356 They are to "follow after the things which make for peace" (Rom. 14:19); but real peace can never be secured by compromising principle. (11)

DA165/356 And no man can be true to principle without exciting opposition. (11)

DA166/356 A Christianity that is spiritual will be opposed by the children of disobedience. [H/59/271] (B1)

DA167/356 But Jesus bade His disciples, "Fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul." [H/59/271] (B1)

2SP173a/257 They are to go on unmindful of the opposition of men, seeking only to please God in whose hands they are: [H/58/271] (P3)

2SP173b/257 "And fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul; but rather fear Him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell." [H/59/271] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

58/271 The doing so may imperil life, the life of the body; but what of that? [Hanna, LC]

59/271 "Fear not them which kill the body, but are not able to kill the soul; but rather fear him which is able to destroy both soul and body in hell." [Hanna, LC]

2SP172/257 Knowing the rebuffs and persecution they are to meet in the ministry upon which they are now about to enter, he strengthens them for the work by assuring them that in all their coming toils and dangers, God will watch over them. [H/60/271] (I2)

DA168/356 Those who are true to God need not fear the power of men nor the enmity of Satan. [H/64a/271] (I2)

2SP174/257 They are to go forward, bearing their testimony of truth, and leave their fate with their Heavenly Father. [H/63,64a/271] (P1)

DA169/356 In Christ their eternal life is secure. (I1)

DA170/356 Their only fear should be lest they surrender the truth, and thus betray the trust with which God has honored them. (I1)

DA171/356 It is Satan's work to fill men's hearts with doubt. (I1)

DA172/356 He leads them to look upon God as a stern judge. (I1)

DA173/356 He tempts them to sin, and then to regard themselves as too vile to approach their heavenly Father or to excite His pity. (I1)

DA174/356 The Lord understands all this. (I1)

DA175/356 Jesus assures His disciples of God's sympathy for them in their needs and weaknesses. (I1)

DA176/356 Not a sigh is breathed, not a pain felt, not a grief pierces the soul, but the throb vibrates to the Father's heart. (I1)

DA177/356 The Bible shows us God in His high and holy place, not in a state of inactivity, not in silence and solitude, but surrounded by ten thousand times ten thousand and thousands of thousands of holy intelligences, all waiting to do His will. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

60/271 But even the life of the body shall be watched over,
not suffered needlessly to perish. [Hanna, LC]

64a/271 Leave your fate then in his hands, and whatever
that may be, be open, be honest, be full, be fearless in
the testimony ye bear, . . . [Hanna, LC]

63/271 The head whose very hairs are numbered by him, your
Father will not see lightly or uselessly cut off. [Hanna,
LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA178/356 Through channels which we cannot discern He is in active communication with every part of His dominion. (I1)

DA179/356 But it is in this speck of a world, in the souls that He gave his only-begotten Son to save, that His interest and the interest of all heaven is centered. (I1)

DA180/356 God is bending from His throne to hear the cry of the oppressed. (I1)

DA181/356 To every sincere prayer He answers, "Here am I." (I1)

DA182/356 He uplifts the distressed and downtrodden. (I1)

DA183/356 In all our afflictions He is afflicted. (I1)

DA184/356 In every temptation and every trial the angel of His presence is near to deliver. (I1)

DA185/356 Not even a sparrow falls to the ground without the Father's notice. [H/61/271] (P1)

2SP175/257 Jesus comforts them with a knowledge of the divine care that watches over their lives, saying, "Are not two sparrows sold for a farthing? and one of them shall not fall on the ground without your Father. [H/61/271] (B1)

2SP176/257 But the very hairs of your head are all numbered. [H/61/271] (B1)

2SP177/257+ Fear ye not therefore; ye are of more value than many sparrows. [H/62/271] (B1)

2SP178/258 And finally, he crowns his instruction and encouragement with the grand assurance of eternal reward to those who accept the Son of God and obey his teachings, and of denunciation to those who reject them: "Whosoever therefore shall confess me before men, him will I confess also before my Father which is in Heaven. [H/64b/271] (I2)

2SP179/258 But whosoever shall deny me before men, him will I also deny before my Father which is in Heaven. [H/65/271] (B1)

61/271 Not a single sparrow, though worth but half a farthing, falls to the ground without God's knowledge, not a hair of your head but is numbered by him. [Hanna, LC]

62/271 "Fear ye not therefore, ye are of more value than many sparrows." [Hanna, LC]

64b/271 . . .for "Whosoever shall confess me before men, him will I confess before my Father which is in heaven. [Hanna, LC]

65/271 But whosoever shall deny me before men, him will I deny before my Father which is in heaven." [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA186/356 Satan's hatred against God leads him to hate every object of the Saviour's care. (11)

DA187/356+ He seeks to mar the handiwork of God, and he delights in destroying even the dumb creatures. (11)

DA188/357 It is only through God's protecting care that the birds are preserved to gladden us with their songs of joy. (11)

DA189/357 But He does not forget even the sparrows. (11)

DA190/357 "Fear ye not therefore, ye are of more value than many sparrows." [H/62/271] (B1)

DA191/357 Jesus continues: As you confess Me before men, so I will confess you before God and the holy angels. [H/64b/271] (B1)

DA192/357 You are to be My witnesses upon earth, channels through which My grace can flow for the healing of the world. (11)

DA193/357 So I will be your representative in heaven. (11)

DA194/357 The Father beholds not your faulty character, but He sees you as clothed in My perfection. (11)

DA195/357 I am the medium through which Heaven's blessings shall come to you. (11)

DA196/357 And everyone who confesses Me by sharing My sacrifice for the lost shall be confessed as a sharer in the glory and joy of the redeemed. (11)

DA197/357 He who would confess Christ must have Christ abiding in him. (11)

DA198/357 He cannot communicate that which he has not received. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

[See page 342, above]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA199/357 The disciples might speak fluently on doctrines, they might repeat the words of Christ Himself; but unless they possessed Christlike meekness and love, they were not confessing Him. (11)

DA200/357 A spirit contrary to the spirit of Christ would deny Him, whatever the profession. (11)

DA201/357 Men may deny Christ by evilspeaking, by foolish talking, by words that are untruthful or unkind. (11)

DA202/357 They may deny Him by shunning life's burdens, by the pursuit of sinful pleasure. (11)

DA203/357 They may deny Him by conforming to the world, by uncourteous behavior, by the love of their own opinions, by justifying self, by cherishing doubt, borrowing trouble, and dwelling in darkness. (11)

DA204/357 In all these ways they declare that Christ is not in them. (11)

DA205/357 And "whosoever shall deny Me before men," He says, "him will I also deny before My Father which is in heaven." [H/65/271] (B1)

DA206/357 The Saviour bade His disciples not to hope that the world's enmity to the gospel would be overcome, and that after a time its opposition would cease. [H/66/271] (P3)

DA207/357 He said, "I came not to send peace, but a sword." [H/67/271] (B1)

DA208/357 This creating of strife is not the effect of the gospel, but the result of opposition to it. [C/87.8] (P2)

DA209/357 Of all persecution the hardest to bear is variance in the home, the estrangement of dearest earthly friends. [H/69/271] (P3)

65/271 But whosoever shall deny me before men, him will I deny before my Father which is in heaven." [Hanna, LC]

66/271 Times of outward persecution may not last, but think not that on this earth there shall ever be perfect peace. [Hanna, LC]

67/271 "I came not to send peace, but a sword," . . . [Hanna, LC]

87.8 Now the direct design and tendency of the Gospel is to promote peace; but it will be the occasion, or the incidental effect, not the direct effect, of the Gospel, that sin will rise up against holiness, impurity against purity, the lover of the world against the lover of God, the lover of the praise of men against him who loveth the praise of God only; [Cumming, SC, I]

69/271 And to no severer trial shall my followers be subject, than when it is not force but affection, the affection of the nearest and dearest on earth, that would draw them away from me, or tempt them to be unfaithful to my cause. [Hanna]

DA210/357 But Jesus declares, "He that loveth father or mother more than Me is not worthy of Me: and he that loveth son or daughter more than Me is not worthy of Me."
[H/72/272] (B1)

DA211/357 And he that taketh not his cross, and followeth after Me, is not worthy of Me." [H/74/272] (B1)

DA212/357 The mission of Christ's servants is a high honor, and a sacred trust. (I1)

DA213/357+ "He that receiveth you," He says, "receiveth Me, and he that receiveth Me receiveth Him that sent Me."
[H/78/272] (B1)

DA214/358 No act of kindness shown to them in His name will fail to be recognized and rewarded. (I1)

DA215/358 And in the same tender recognition He includes the feeblest and lowliest of the family of God: "Whosoever shall give to drink unto one of these little ones"--those who are as children in their faith and their knowledge of Christ--"a cup of cold water only in the name of a disciple, verily I say unto you, he shall in nowise lose his reward."
[H/80/272] (B1)

DA216/358 Thus the Saviour ended His instruction. (I1)

DA217/358 In the name of Christ the chosen twelve went out, as He had gone, "to preach the gospel to the poor, . . . to heal the brokenhearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised, to preach the acceptable year of the Lord." Luke 4:18, 19. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 37 - SOURCES

72/272 . . . "that he that loveth father and mother more than me is not worthy of me, and he that loveth son or daughter more than me is not worthy of me. [Hanna, LC]

74/272 But he that taketh not up the cross for me, even as I have taken up the cross for him; he that will not deny himself, and in the exercise of that self-denial take up his cross daily and follow me; "he is not worthy of me, he cannot be my disciple." [Hanna, LC]

78/272 "He that receiveth you receiveth me; he that receiveth me receiveth him that sent me." [Hanna, LC]

80/272 For so it is, and ever shall be, not simply by great men going out upon great embassies and speaking words of power to gathered multitudes, or by great assemblies propounding or enforcing great and solemn truths, that the kingdom of Jesus Christ is advanced, but by all, the high and low, and rich and poor, and weak and strong, who bear his name, looking upon themselves as his missionaries here on earth, sent by him even as he was sent by his Father; sent, that they may be to one another what he has been to them, seeking each other's good, willing to communicate, imparting, each doing a little in one way or other to these littles making up that vast and ever multiplying agency by which the empire of the Redeemer over human spirits is being continually enlarged.

Analysis

When chapter 37 in the earlier working draft of the first third of the DA text (identified there as chapter 36) is compared with present DA text one is tempted to conclude that chapter 37 was originally planned to follow chapter 24 as does our study by happenstance. The first 14 sentences repeat sentences now found in the Nazareth narrative.¹ These verses would make a logical introduction to "The Apostles' First Mission," as chapter 36 was entitled, because in Mark's gospel the sending out of the twelve, Mark 6:7-11, follows the account of Jesus' rejection at Nazareth, verses 1-6.

A second option for the opening of this chapter on the first missionary tour evidently involved setting forth the context for the Matthew account of the story. There is clear evidence that Ellen White is following the narrative account of Matthew in chapter 37. It would be natural for her to reach back into Matthew 9 for painting in the background with a few broad strokes of her literary brush, particularly when there is such a beautiful text to introduce her to them in Matthew 9:35 which speaks in a general way of Jesus' ministry.

For some reason this second option was also set aside because the DA text as published opened with sentence 26 of the earlier draft. It is interesting to note, however, that

¹Cf. DA(MS)1/470 with DA94/241, 3/470 with 93/241, 4/470 with 95,96/241, 5-14/470-471 with 97-105/241. The DA

The First Evangelists

Hanna's commentary on this episode in the life of Christ also begins with reference to these same verses from Matthew 9:35ff. Incidentally, Hanna called his chapter "The Mission of the Twelve."¹

The remainder of the earlier draft is generally the same as the published text except for slight editing. The modifications appear to involve more deletions than additions.

The DA text of 217 sentences appears to be largely the work of Ellen White. We evaluated 146 sentences as her independent writing and 12 as quotations from the Bible. The special nature of this chapter invites some specific observations to which we now turn.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Some degree of dependency was found in 59 of the 217 sentences of chapter 37. According to Table 1, page 348, these dependent sentences involved 5 Verbatim, 10 Strict Paraphrase, 9 Simple Paraphrase, 3 Loose Paraphrase, 14 Bible Source, and 9 Partial Independence.² The average dependency rate for all sentences apart from biblical quotations is .92. If we exclude the independent sentences the average for the 59 dependent sentences is 3.2.

The figures on the distribution of sources for the 59 dependent sentences, as per Table 2 on page 349, show Hanna

Manuscript sentences are given in Appendix D.

¹Chapter IX of The Life of Christ, 1863.

²Bible quotations counted for 12 sentences.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 37

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	05	10	09	12	14	09	146	12	217
02. 2SP (77)	00	01	03	04	02	09	04	00	00	23
03. 3RL (77)	00	00	00	00	00	02	00	02	00	04
04. SC (90)	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
05. RH (92)	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	00	00	01
06. RH (93)	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	03	00	03
07. DA(MS)[97]	00	01	00	00	00	03	00	02	01	07
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	02	04	04	02	14	05	(07)	(01)	39

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 37

Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01.Bible									(11)	11
02.Harris GT	00	03	00	02	01	00	00	--	00	06
03.HarrisGT(1870)	00	01	01	01	04	00	02	--	00	09
04.Cumming SR-M	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	--	00	01
05.Hanna LC	00	00	05	01	05	14	03	--	01	29
06.Miller W-DR	00	01	04	03	00	00	02	--	00	10
07.Pentecost BS89	00	00	00	01	01	00	01	--	00	03
08.Pentecost BS94	00	00	00	00	01	00	01	--	00	02
TOTALS DA Text	00	05	10	09	12	14	09	--	(12)	71

The First Evangelists

as the major source. A closer look, however, indicates that 14 of the 29 dependent sentences involve Bible quotations. Both Ellen White and Hanna follow the discourse of Jesus as presented in chapter 10 of Matthew's gospel. We readily admit that some of our ratings are problematic. We used such criteria as change from direct to indirect discourse, introduction of a quote after general commentary and use of partial quotes as keys to when Ellen White is likely to have been influenced by Hanna in her use of the text of Scripture. If we were to discount the sentences using Bible quotations we would have more sentences attributed to Harris than to Hanna.

Though we shall have reason below to mention Hanna as the major source appearing in the pre-DA material, we feel constrained to repeat this caution for the source criticism (analysis) of chapter 37. Ellen White and Hanna are in basic agreement with the narrative discourse of Matthew 10. The nature of the discourse on practical policies of public and personal ministry encourage and invite additional commentary. Missionary sermons were popular in the 19th century of frontier America and the expanding foreign missionary programs of Protestant churches. There would be no dearth of sermonic material available to Ellen White.

The Adventist Church was also in the prime of its missionary outreach. Ellen White herself had gone to Europe in 1885 and the DA text was written while she was once again involved in the mission work of Adventists in Australia.

The First Evangelists

Commentary on evangelism and mission activity would be in harmony with what must have formed the basis of much of the writing and speaking of Ellen White during the eighties and nineties of the last century. The heavy concentration of Ellen White's independent comment as found in this chapter should not come as a surprise when we take into consideration the special burden of this chapter. Perhaps Ellen White's great concern for the mission outreach of the church is reflected in the repetition which occurs in the chapter.¹

There is also some uncertainty in attributing the five parallels to George Pentecost's works. Ellen White's usual pattern has been, according to the evidence of this study, to use a given source several times in a particular writing. And when the dependency is not high, i.e., not Verbatim or even Strict Paraphrase, the claim of dependency is all the more tentative. The same cautions are to be raised against the one sentence credited to Cumming.

On the other hand there are similarities between Ellen White's sentences and that of these sources. In addition, these authors were not unknown to Ellen White. Her private library at the time of her death included Cumming's similar work on John's gospel and her office library contained copies of Pentecost's Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments for the years 1887 to 1893.

¹Compare for example DA28/350 with DA38/350, DA81 with DA104 and DA159 with DA164.

The First Evangelists

In sentences DA27-34 and 71-80 John Harris' study of the characteristics of Jesus' ministry is being utilized. The latter group of sentences which are influenced by his 1870 edition are not found in the 1836 edition of The Great Teacher. The parallels to sentences 27-30 were located in the earlier text of Harris though they may also appear in the later edition under a different pagination. Our study indicated Ellen White was using Harris directly in the composition of these sentences. At least we found no earlier writing of Ellen White where these sentences occurred.

It is very likely, however, that Ellen White's use of Miller in DA82-91 comes from her earlier work, Steps to Christ, page 12. Apart from her omission of sentence 13, the DA text duplicates the text of Steps to Christ. J. R. Miller as an author is represented in Ellen White's office library in 1915 but through another of his books.¹ When the parallels from Miller's text on Week-Day Religion are compared to the SC or DA text there is no reason to doubt Ellen White's dependency on this 1880 work on practical religion.

Apart from Ellen White's use of the Miller material from Steps to Christ, our evidence points to her direct use of the writings of Cumming, Hanna, Harris, and Pentecost in the writing of chapter 37. We do admit, however, that at

¹J. R. Miller, Home-making (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1912).

The First Evangelists

times we found it difficult to establish for certain which source was being used. For example DA70-72 contain elements similar to comparable comments by Hanna as well as Harris, particularly sentences 71 and 72.¹ To avoid confusion in the tabulations we have listed the source as Harris. But time and again the parallels between the sources tempt us to initiate a study of literary borrowing among Ellen White's contemporaries. Such an investigation should be undertaken to inform us on the literary practices of writers on religion in the 19th century. Only when we have a realistic and fairly comprehensive understanding of the literary conventions followed by her contemporaries can we with justification evaluate Ellen White's position relative to the question of plagiarism.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The figures from Table 1 above list 39 sentences evaluated from Ellen White's previous writings. Of the 39, seven were judged to be original with Ellen White and one was a quote from Scripture. The remaining 31 dependent sentences involved 14 references from Scripture which were attributed to the influence of the source and five sentences of Partial Independence. There were 12 sentences listed from Loose Paraphrase to Verbatim.

Most of the earlier parallels may be attributed to

¹Cf. Hanna 48,50/270 and the Harris reference as given.

The First Evangelists

Hanna as Table 3, page 355, clearly indicates. These earlier writings, reaching from The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II and Redemption Leaflets, No. 3, through several RH articles to the earlier draft of the DA text were hardly used in the composition of chapter 37. Ellen White apparently took some sentences from these earlier materials but, as it turns out, most of these sentences appear to be her own compositions. The sentences involving source parallels were generally not picked up for the DA text. Those that were have been so modified as to be hardly recognized. Where we have indentified such usage the earlier writing usually reflects greater dependency even when our criteria of evaluation do not permit such fine distinctions.¹ The evaluations for each of the 39 sentences may be found in Appendix B.

Our source analysis has not entailed a serious content study, even though content does play a significant role. We have used content analysis to distinguish between a paraphrase of basically the same thought and a new or contrasting element of content. In the former dependency is evaluated; in the latter we stress literary dependency. The very nature of a study of source parallels leads one to emphasize similarities over dissimilarities. Often obvious agreements are noted and the more subtle disagreements between two writers are overlooked. We have two examples of

¹Cf. DA34 with DA(MS)58/474, DA157/355 with 2SP171a, and DA168 with 2SP174.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 37

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01.Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	01
02.Harris, GT	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
03.Hanna, LC	00	01	03	04	02	14	04	00	00	28
04.Miller W-DR	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
05.Pentecost BS89	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	00	00	01
06.E. G. White	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	07	00	07
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	02	04	04	02	14	05	07	(01)	39

The First Evangelists

such differences between Ellen White and Hanna in this chapter.

Under DA17 and 2SP163/256 Ellen White says Jesus had earlier sent the disciples away "to labor by themselves for a short time." Hanna on the other hand in 8,9/268 speaks of them being "continually by his side" before this first missionary tour. It is also clear from the context that Ellen White has been using Hanna, yet under DA60/351 she explains that the ministry of the apostles was not to involve public meetings in synagogues. Hanna's comment, 14/268, speaks of the disciples entering the synagogues as part of their ministry.

Perhaps as investigations such as this one locate the sources Ellen White used, further study can be given to a comparison of content, noting the agreements and differences between these literary sources and Ellen White's writings.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The high percentage of independent sentences scattered throughout chapter 37 speaks against Ellen White's being dependent upon a source for the chapter's structure. We have already pointed out that this composition is following the arrangement of Matthew 10. The structural elements parallel to Hanna's chapter on "The Mission of the Twelve" are to be explained on the basis of two writers following the same source rather than on one copying the other. Further evidence in favor of this argument is to be found in

The First Evangelists

the numerous instances of Ellen White's commenting on verses of Scripture which Hanna merely lists without comment. We have also noted that while the earlier DA manuscript opens with a reference to the context of Matthew 10 as does Hanna, the published text does not. Finally, Ellen White concludes her chapter when she reaches the closing verses of Matthew 10 whereas Hanna, the only serious contender for the position of influencing the structure of chapter 37, does not.

There are some small sections of the DA text which do follow the order of theme development as found in the source for those sentences involved. For example, the sentences taken from two pages of Harris' editions of The Great Teacher follow in the DA text the order of Harris. The selections from Miller with the exception of one sentence follow the order of Miller's text. The same general similarity of sentence order is found between Ellen White's use of Hanna and the sequence of those same sentences in Hanna's text. Appendix A includes a complete list of source references and evaluations for chapter 37.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The only earlier writing of Ellen White on the subject of chapter 37, long enough to permit a study of its structure and clearly containing source parallels, is the material from The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II. The 23 sentences of the 2SP text follow Hanna's arrangement. We

The First Evangelists

must also add, however, that this redactional similarity is not entirely due to a dependence upon Hanna. Both writers are in the main following the order of events and comments as presented in the biblical records. We refer the reader to Appendix C for a comparative list and to Matthew 10 as the primary source for Ellen White's structure of the SP account.

Summary

The summary for chapter 37 follows the pattern used for each of the 15 chapters of the DA text surveyed in this investigation.

1. There are no handwritten primary documents to support the DA text or the earlier writings treating the first missionary tour of the twelve apostles.

2. The DA text represents an expansion of Ellen White's previous coverage of the topic under study but this enlargement is not due to the use of sources. Nearly every one of the 24 sentences of 2SP involve the use of Hanna. There is proportionately less of Ellen White's independent work in the earlier text than in the DA text. It is also true that some additional material has come from a second look at Hanna as well as from the works of Harris and Miller. But the extended commentary of the DA text and the RH articles of a few years earlier appears to be the result of Ellen White's own literary work. She was fond of writing on the need for and character of mission activities. She

The First Evangelists

also found the subject of this chapter ideal for making some practical comments and suggestions for Christians in general. This latter intention was in harmony with her stated objectives in producing her "life of Chirst."

3. The earlier comments of any length making use of the text of 2SP employed the story of sending out the 12 disciples to illustrate the point of her sermon or article. In one article developed from a sermon she comments on Acts 1:4-8. The second part of her sermon refers to the experience of the disciples as she comments directly on Matt. 10:16, a portion of Jesus' discourse to the twelve before they departed on their short tour. The third section develops the theme of another verse from the discourse of Jesus as presented in Matthew 10. A fourth reference to this missionary journey in Galilee opens her comments on the theme of "Come Ye Yourselves Apart, . . . And Rest Awhile." But nowhere does she provide the consistent structure of a commentary on Matthew 10 as is found in chapter 37 of the DA text.

4. Insofar as the comments of Ellen White were focused on Matthew 10, we found no significant differences. We should point out, however, that since Ellen White's comments in these RH articles involved few source parallels we had no reason to submit these articles to serious content analysis.

5. Chapter 37 has 217 sentences, 59 of which, or 27 percent, show some literary dependence.

6. We evaluated 146 sentences or 67% of the total as

The First Evangelists

Strict Independence. There were 12 sentences excluded from the evaluation totals on the basis of independent Bible quotations.

7. According to the rating scale we are using in each chapter the average degree of dependency for the 59 sentences is 3.2. If we include the total number of sentences apart from the biblical quotations the average dependency is .92.

8. Most of the parallels reflected in chapter 37 have been attributed to William Hanna's Life of Christ.

9. Miller's work on Week-Day Religion supplied 10 parallels in the pre-DA textual materials and The Great Teacher by John Harris was credited with 15 parallels taken from two separate editions.¹ Six parallels were found in two collections of Bible Studies by George Pentecost and in John Cumming's commentary on Matthew.²

10. William Hanna's work on the life of Christ also furnished most of the source parallels for the earlier writings of Ellen White on this chapter's topic. These parallels appear for the most part in 2SP159/255 - 2SP179/258 and in some of the sentences of the earlier DA manuscript which were not included in the published DA text.

11. The earlier texts exhibited closer dependency than

¹Our sources involved the 1836 as well as the 1870 editions. It is possible that the 1870 work also includes the material we found in the 1836 edition.

²The works have been more fully described in the introduction to this chapter.

The First Evangelists

did the later DA texts in those sentences where the same source parallel was involved. Yet in respect to the use of sources by the DA text overall, we found greater dependency in the later text. For example, the DA text contained five Verbatim parallels against only two for the earlier texts. Again, the DA text included 10 Strict Paraphrase when the pre-DA text registered only four.¹

Perhaps these results are to be expected when we remember that the DA text involved 59 source parallels and the pre-DA text only 31. Furthermore, our study indicated that Ellen White did not depend heavily on the earlier writings in producing the DA text.² This means that Ellen White returned to a direct use of sources in her composition of this chapter.

The parallels in both the DA and pre-DA texts are of the same type. They include descriptive, historical, theological, devotional, and practical.

12. We did not find any substantive difference between the dependent and independent sentences of chapter 37. What is different seems to be the amount of certain types of comments found in the independent sentences. Ellen White's material speaks more often to the practical concerns she was anxious to address and to the spiritual lessons to be derived from these reflections on Jesus' commission to the 12 apostles. She also gives more stress to the supernatural

¹For further comparisons consult Tables 2 and 3 above.

²The major exception to this pattern was Ellen White's use of her earlier comments from Steps to Christ.

The First Evangelists

aspects of the Christian's missionary activities.

13. The redaction of the DA text is the work of Ellen White and/or Marian Davis as the new writings of Ellen White were combined with some earlier material on the basis of the main structure of Matthew 10. The smaller sub-units of the chapter do reflect dependency on the sources.

14. The only earlier writing treating the topic of chapter 37 was that portion of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, which involved 24 sentences. Though parallels from Hanna occur in the 2SP text, the order of thematic development is largely based upon the Matthew 10 account as is Hanna's. The other previous writings use the account of the first missionary tour to serve other themes. The redaction of these articles goes beyond the structure of Matthew 10.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.		I1	054.		I1
005.		I1	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.	Hanna LC/19,27/269	P3
007.		I1	057.		I1
008.		I1	058.		I1
009.		I1	059.		I1
010.		I1	060.		I1
011.		I1	061.	Hanna LC/37/269	P1
012.		I1	062.		I1
013.		I1	063.		I1
014.		I1	064.		I1
015.		I1	065.		I1
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.	Hanna LC/17/269	B1	067.	Hanna LC/38a/269	B1
018.		I1	068.	Hanna LC/38b/269	B1
019.	Pentecost 67.3	P2	069.	Hanna LC/40-47/270	P2
020.		I1	070.	Hanna LC/46/270	P3
021.	Pentecost 67.3	P3	071.	Harris GT/308a	P1
022.	Pentecost 67.3	I2	072.	Harris GT/308b	P3
023.	Hanna LC/23/269	I2	073.	Harris GT/308c	I2
024.	Hanna LC/20,21/269	I2	074.		I1
025.	Hanna LC/25/269	B1	075.	Harris GT/308d	P2
026.		I1	076.	Harris GT/308e	P3
027.	Harris GT/343.1	P3	077.	Harris GT/308e	V2
028.		I1	078.	Harris GT/308f	P3
029.	Harris GT/343.4	P2	079.	Harris GT/308g	I2
030.	Harris GT/343.5a,5b	V2	080.	Harris GT/308g	P3
031.	Harris GT/343.5b	P2	081.	Bible	B2
032.	Harris GT/343.7	V2	082.	Miller 7/187	P1
033.		I1	083.	Miller 1/187	P1
034.	Harris GT/343.9	V2	084.	Miller 2,3,4/187	P1
035.		I1	085.	Miller 5/187	P1
036.		I1	086.	Miller 8/187	I2
037.		I1	087.	Miller 9/187	I2
038.		I1	088.	Miller 9/187	P2
039.		I1	089.	Miller 12/187	V2
040.		I1	090.	Miller 13/187	P2
041.		I1	091.	Miller 14/187	P2
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.		I1	093.		I1
044.		I1	094.		I1
045.		I1	095.		I1
046.	Pentecost 401.8	P3	096.		I1
047.	Pentecost 401.8	I2	097.		I1
048.		I1	098.		I1
049.		I1	099.		I1
050.		I1	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Hanna LC 51/271	P1
102. -		I1	152. -	Hanna LC 52/271	P1
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -	Bible	B2	154. -	Hanna LC 54/271	P1
105. -		I1	155. -		I1
106. -		I1	156. -		I1
107. -		I1	157. -	Hanna LC 56/271	P3
108. -		I1	158. -	Hanna LC 57/271	B1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -		I1	162. -		I1
113. -		I1	163. -		I1
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -	Bible	B2	165. -		I1
116. -		I1	166. -		I1
117. -		I1	167. -	Hanna LC 59/271	B1
118. -		I1	168. -	Hanna LC 64a/271	I2
119. -		I1	169. -		I1
120. -		I1	170. -		I1
121. -		I1	171. -		I1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -	Bible	B2	173. -		I1
124. -	Bible	B2	174. -		I1
125. -		I1	175. -		I1
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -		I1	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -		I1	180. -		I1
131. -		I1	181. -		I1
132. -	Bible	B2	182. -		I1
133. -	Bible	B2	183. -		I1
134. -	Bible	B2	184. -		I1
135. -	Bible	B2	185. -	Hanna LC/61/271	P1
136. -	Bible	B2	186. -		I1
137. -		I1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -		I1	189. -		I1
140. -		I1	190. -	Hanna LC/62/271	B1
141. -		I1	191. -	Hanna LC/64b/271	B1
142. -		I1	192. -		I1
143. -		I1	193. -		I1
144. -		I1	194. -		I1
145. -		I1	195. -		I1
146. -	Bible	B2	196. -		I1
147. -		I1	197. -		I1
148. -		I1	198. -		I1
149. -		I1	199. -		I1
150. -		I1	200. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -		
202. -		I1	252. -		
203. -		I1	253. -		
204. -		I1	254. -		
205. -	Hanna LC/65/271	B1	255. -		
206. -	Hanna LC/66/271	P3	256. -		
207. -	Hanna LC/67/271	B1	257. -		
208. -	C/87.8	P2	258. -		
209. -	Hanna LC/69/271	P3	259. -		
210. -	Hanna LC/72/272	B1	260. -		
211. -	Hanna LC/74/272	B1	261. -		
212. -		I1	262. -		
213. -	Hanna LC/78/272	B1	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -	Hanna LC/80/272	B1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -	Bible	B2	267. -		
218. -			268. -		
219. -			269. -		
220. -			270. -		
221. -			271. -		
222. -			272. -		
223. -			273. -		
224. -			274. -		
225. -			275. -		
226. -			276. -		
227. -			277. -		
228. -			278. -		
229. -			279. -		
230. -			280. -		
231. -			281. -		
232. -			282. -		
233. -			283. -		
234. -			284. -		
235. -			285. -		
236. -			286. -		
237. -			287. -		
238. -			288. -		
239. -			289. -		
240. -			290. -		
241. -			291. -		
242. -			292. -		
243. -			293. -		
244. -			294. -		
245. -			295. -		
246. -			296. -		
247. -			297. -		
248. -			298. -		
249. -			299. -		
250. -			300. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 37

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	DA(MS)15/471	B2	_____	051.	-	_____	_____	_____
002.	-	DA(MS)17/471	Bl	_____	052.	-	_____	_____	_____
003.	-	3RL 96/59	Bl	_____	053.	-	_____	_____	_____
004.	-	2SP 159/255	Bl	_____	054.	-	_____	_____	_____
005.	-	DA(MS)18/471	Bl	_____	055.	-	_____	_____	_____
006.	-	3RL 97/59	Bl	_____	056.	-	_____	_____	_____
007.	-	2SP 160/255	Bl	_____	057.	-	_____	_____	_____
008.	-	DA(MS)20/471	I1	_____	058.	-	_____	_____	_____
009.	-	3RL 98/59	I1	_____	059.	-	_____	_____	_____
010.	-	DA(MS)22/471	I1	_____	060.	-	_____	_____	_____
011.	-	3RL 102/59	I1	_____	061.	-	_____	_____	_____
012.	-	DA(MS)25/471	Bl	_____	062.	-	_____	_____	_____
013.	-	RH (93) 1	I1	1	063.	-	_____	_____	_____
014.	-	RH (93) 2	I1	2	064.	-	_____	_____	_____
015.	-	RH (93) 3	I1	17	065.	-	_____	_____	_____
016.	-	2SP 163/256	I2	17	066.	-	_____	_____	_____
017.	-	2SP 164/256	P2	18	067.	-	_____	_____	_____
018.	-	RH (92) 48	I2	21	068.	-	_____	_____	_____
019.	-	2SP 165/256	P1	23	069.	-	_____	_____	_____
020.	-	2SP 166a/256	V2	23	070.	-	_____	_____	_____
021.	-	2SP 166b/256	P1	23	071.	-	_____	_____	_____
022.	-	2SP 166c/256	I2	23	072.	-	_____	_____	_____
023.	-	DA(MS)58/474	V2	34	073.	-	_____	_____	_____
024.	-	2SP 167/256	P3	66	074.	-	_____	_____	_____
025.	-	2SP 168/256+	P2	67	075.	-	_____	_____	_____
026.	-	2SP 169/257	P2	67	076.	-	_____	_____	_____
027.	-	2SP 170/257	Bl	68	077.	-	_____	_____	_____
028.	-	SC 13/12	P1	88	078.	-	_____	_____	_____
029.	-	2SP 171a/257	P2	157	079.	-	_____	_____	_____
030.	-	2SP 171b/257	Bl	158	080.	-	_____	_____	_____
031.	-	2SP 173a/257	P3	167	081.	-	_____	_____	_____
032.	-	2SP 173b/257	Bl	167	082.	-	_____	_____	_____
033.	-	2SP 172/257	I2	167	083.	-	_____	_____	_____
034.	-	2SP 174/257	P1	168	084.	-	_____	_____	_____
035.	-	2SP 175/257	Bl	185	085.	-	_____	_____	_____
036.	-	2SP 176/257	Bl	185	086.	-	_____	_____	_____
037.	-	2SP 177/257	Bl	185	087.	-	_____	_____	_____
038.	-	2SP 178/257	I2	185	088.	-	_____	_____	_____
039.	-	2SP 179/258	Bl	185	089.	-	_____	_____	_____
040.	-	_____	_____	_____	090.	-	_____	_____	_____
041.	-	_____	_____	_____	091.	-	_____	_____	_____
042.	-	_____	_____	_____	092.	-	_____	_____	_____
043.	-	_____	_____	_____	093.	-	_____	_____	_____
044.	-	_____	_____	_____	094.	-	_____	_____	_____
045.	-	_____	_____	_____	095.	-	_____	_____	_____
046.	-	_____	_____	_____	096.	-	_____	_____	_____
047.	-	_____	_____	_____	097.	-	_____	_____	_____
048.	-	_____	_____	_____	098.	-	_____	_____	_____
049.	-	_____	_____	_____	099.	-	_____	_____	_____
050.	-	_____	_____	_____	100.	-	_____	_____	_____

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 37

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	DA(MS)15/471	Bible	051.	-		
002.	-	DA(MS)17/471	H/3/268	052.	-		
003.	-	3RL 96/59	H/3/268	053.	-		
004.	-	2SP 159/255	H/3/268	054.	-		
005.	-	DA(MS)18/471	H/4/268	055.	-		
006.	-	3RL 97/59	H/4/268	056.	-		
007.	-	2SP 160/255	H/4/268	057.	-		
008.	-	DA(MS)20/471		058.	-		
009.	-	3RL 98/59		059.	-		
010.	-	DA(MS)22/471		060.	-		
011.	-	3RL 102/59		061.	-		
012.	-	DA(MS)25/471	H/5-6/268	062.	-		
013.	-	RH (93) 1		063.	-		
014.	-	RH (93) 2		064.	-		
015.	-	RH (93) 3		065.	-		
016.	-	2SP 163/256	H/8,9/268	066.	-		
017.	-	2SP 164/256	H/17/269	067.	-		
018.	-	RH (92) 48	P/67.3	068.	-		
019.	-	2SP 165/256	H/24/269	069.	-		
020.	-	2SP 166a/256	H/26/269	070.	-		
021.	-	2SP 166b/256	H/27/269	071.	-		
022.	-	2SP 166c/256	H/28/269	072.	-		
023.	-	DA(MS)58/474	H/GT/343.9	073.	-		
024.	-	2SP 167/256	H/36/269	074.	-		
025.	-	2SP 168/256+	H/38a/269	075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 169/257	H/38b/269	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 170/257	H/38b/269	077.	-		
028.	-	SC 13/12	M/10/187	078.	-		
029.	-	2SP 171a/257	H/56/271	079.	-		
030.	-	2SP 171b/257	H/57/271	080.	-		
031.	-	2SP 173a/257	H/58/271	081.	-		
032.	-	2SP 173b/257	H/59/271	082.	-		
033.	-	2SP 172/257	H/60/271	083.	-		
034.	-	2SP 174/257	H/63,64a/271	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 175/257	H/61/271	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 176/257	H/61/271	086.	-		
037.	-	2SP 177/257	H/62/271	087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 178/257	H/64b/271	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 179/258	H/65/271	089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

IX CHAPTER 39 - "Give Ye Them to Eat"

The random selection of chapter 39 results in an unnatural and arbitrary independence for a narrative that is actually introduced by chapter 38.

According to the editor's note, Ellen White's comments on "Give Ye Them to Eat" are based upon Matthew 14:13-21, Mark 6:32-44, Luke 9:10-17, and John 6:1-13. But the first verse of each of the synoptic gospels is included in those verses given as Bible references for the comments on chapter 38, "Come Rest Awhile." In her earliest treatment of this experience from the life of Christ Ellen White left the narrative intact as one story. The first three sentences of chapter XX of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume II, "The Loaves and Fishes," address the background and setting for the story of the feeding of the five thousand. These few remarks form the background to what is now chapter 38.

Similarly, at sentence 57 in the 2SP account Ellen White turns to the Johannine account, John 6:14ff, and discusses the attempt of the people, with the cooperation of the disciples, to make Jesus King of the Jews. This material as well as her comments on Jesus' departure into the mountain for solitary communion with His Father forms part of chapter 40 in the DA account. Thus what introduced and concluded the story of the feeding of the five thousand in the first treatment by Ellen White is used differently in the DA. The former serves as the substance of DA chapter 38 and the latter as the introduction of DA chapter 40, "A

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

Night on the Lake." Ellen White addressed this lake episode in 2SP, chapter XXI, under the caption of "Walking on the Water."

The rearrangement of the episodes in the various writings of Ellen White and the arbitrary divisions in her account, divisions which do not always match the narrative units of the gospel accounts, lead to unavoidable overlaps in the commentary. There is some difficulty in deciding which sentences actually belong to the commentary of a previous chapter or legitimately serve as the introduction or "bridge" to the new content to be discussed.

In our judgment the first few sentences of the 2SP account on "The Loaves and Fishes" really form the basis for DA, chapter 38, and so are omitted from consideration with chapter 39.

One other substantial commentary of Ellen White on the feeding of the five thousand from writings dating earlier than 1898, the date of the DA text, was the two-part series in The Signs of the Times. Under the dates of August 12 and 19 of 1897 there appeared an article entitled "Feeding the Five Thousand." Sentences from this account will be indicated by ST(97).

In the presentation of the textual evidence for the evaluations of chapter 39 we will refer to seven sources. The reader will readily recognize such references as Hanna, LC¹ and March, WHJ². We have also previously referred to

¹William Hanna, The Life of Christ, 1863. ²On next pg.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

Farrar, LC,¹ and to Pentecost, BS.² Cumming, SR-J refers to Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. John.³ A number of parallels will be listed as coming from a sermon by Francis Wayland on the topic of "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth." These sentences are identified by Wayland, SBC.⁴

Two final comments may prove helpful to the reader in evaluating the textual evidence. The Ellen White comments from 2SP are not limited to the episode of feeding the five thousand. Her emphasis on the healing of the sick and her comment on feeding the people lest they "faint by the way," come from the feeding of the four thousand as presented in . Matthew 15:29-39 and Mark 8:1-9.⁵

Occasionally we include a quotation from a source without specifically identifying it as a parallel. There are times when the context, some verbal similarities, and general development of presentation suggest the probability of a parallel. At times we were influenced by the fact that Ellen White is known to have had the book in her private

²Daniel March, Walks and Homes of Jesus, 1866.
¹Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ, 1874.
²George Pentecost, Bible Studies(88), 1888.
³John Cumming, Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. John (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1856). Hereafter this series of commentaries will be referred to as Sabbath Readings--John.
⁴Francis Wayland, Salvation by Christ. A Series of Discourses on Some of the Most Important Doctrines of the Gospel (Boston: Gould and Lincoln, 1859). Future references to this work will carry the title Salvation by Christ.
⁵Cf. 2SP5,6/259 and 2SP36/261.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

library at the time of her death. Such readings have a value if only to illustrate the nature of the research task. In addition they provide evidence that the ideas being presented are not unique to Ellen White.

The following authors and their works have been quoted among the sources but the quotations do not carry an evaluation: John Cumming, p. 317.1 (listed as LLM);¹ Farrar, (LC), p. 304.4;² Hanna (LC), 25,30-32/278; John Hutchinson, p. 85.7 (listed as OLS);³ John R. Macduff, pp. 215.8, 215.9, and 216.1 (listed as BTS).⁴

We have consistently tried to limit the claim of source parallel to those sentences where verbatim words occur or where such verbal parallels appear in the immediate context of the source.

¹John Cumming, Foreshadows. Lectures on our Lord's Miracles (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1854).

²Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ (New York: Hurst & Company, 1874).

³John Hutchinson, Our Lord's Signs in St. John's Gospel (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1892).

⁴John R. Macduff, Brighter than the Sun; or Christ the Light of the World (New York: Robert Carter and Brothers, 1878).

DA1/364 CHRIST had retired to a secluded place with His disciples, but this rare season of peaceful quietude was soon broken. (11)

DA2/364 The disciples thought they had retired where they would not be disturbed; but as soon as the multitude missed the divine Teacher, they inquired, "Where is He?" (11)

DA3/364 Some among them had noticed the direction in which Christ and His disciples had gone. (11)

ST(97)3 Some among them had noticed the direction in which Christ and his disciples had gone, and soon an immense crowd was looking for Christ. (11)

DA4/364 Many went by land to meet them, while others followed in their boats across the water. [M/2b/99] (P2)

2SP4/259 The news spread from city to city that Jesus was crossing the sea; and many who were eager to see and hear him flocked to the place where it was thought that his boat would land, while others followed him over the water in boats. [M/2b/99]
(12)

DA5/364 The Passover was at hand, and, from far and near, bands of pilgrims on their way to Jerusalem gathered to see Jesus. [M/3/99] (P2)

DA6/364 Additions were made to their number, until there were assembled five thousand men besides women and children. (11)

DA7/364 Before Christ reached the shore, a multitude were waiting for Him. (11)

2SP5/259 So when Jesus and his disciples landed they found themselves in the midst of a multitude of people, pressing forward on all sides to meet them. [H/22/278] (P3)

2b/99 as they continued to gather on foot and in boats from all the neighboring towns, [March, WHJ]

3/99 The crowd of people was greatly increased by additions from the annual caravan of pilgrims on their way to Jerusalem to attend the great national feast of the Passover. [March, WHJ]

2SP6/259 Hundreds of the sick and maimed had been brought for Jesus to relieve, and were disposed upon the ground in positions favorable to arrest his attention. [H/22/278] (I2)

DA8/364 But He landed unobserved by them, and spent a little time apart with the disciples. (I1)

DA9/364 From the hillside He looked upon the moving multitude, and His heart was stirred with sympathy. (I1)

DA10/364 Interrupted as He was, and robbed of His rest, He was not impatient. (I1)

2SP8/259 The Saviour could not here find the rest he sought, for the waiting company commanded his attention; their needs enlisted his immediate sympathy and aid. [H/23/278] (P3)

DA11/364 He saw a greater necessity demanding His attention as He watched the people coming and still coming. [M/2/99] (I2)

2SP9/259 He could not steal away with his disciples to secure the coveted retirement, and disappoint this expectant people. [M/1/99] (I2)

DA12/364 He "was moved with compassion toward them, because they were as sheep not having a shepherd." [M/2/99] (B1)

DA13/364 Leaving His retreat, He found a convenient place where He could minister to them. (I1)

DA14/364+ They received no help from the priests and rulers; but the healing waters of life flowed from Christ as He taught the multitude the way of salvation. [P/8/3] (I2)

2SP14/259 He was so pressed upon by the multitude that he went a little apart upon a grassy eminence, where he could be seen and heard by all the people. [M/5/99+] (I2)

22/278 Another hour or so carries them to the spot at which Christ and his apostles land, where many, having outstripped the boat, are ready to receive them, and where more and more still come, bearing their sick along with them. [Hanna, LC]

23/278 It was somewhat of a trial to have the purpose of the voyage apparently thus baffled, the seclusion sought after thus violated; but if felt at all, it sat light upon a heart which, turning away from the thought of self, was filled with compassion for those who were "as sheep not having a shepherd." [Hanna, LC]

1/99 Not to be wholly deprived of the object for which he had withdrawn from Capernaum, Jesus endeavored to steal away from the crowd and secure a little retirement with his disciples. [March, WHJ]

2/99 But he was moved with compassion for the multitude as they continued to gather, on foot and in boats, from all the neighboring towns, and they seemed to him as **sheep having no shepherd.** [March, WHJ]

8/3 The rulers and religious people of the day were selfish and proud, and habitually neglected the poor and common people, much as the rich and well-to-do people do to-day. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

5/99+ Taking his seat upon the grassy hill-side, where he could be seen and heard by the vast assemblage, he continued to speak and to heal the sick that were brought to him, until the sun began to sink low behind the hills of Galilee. [March, WHJ]

2SP15/259+ Here he taught them through the entire day, and healed all the sick and afflicted that were brought to him. [M/5/99+] (P2)

DA15/365 The people listened to the words of mercy flowing so freely from the lips of the Son of God. (11)

DA16/365 They heard the gracious words, so simple and so plain that they were as the balm of Gilead to their souls.
(11)

DA17/365 The healing of His divine hand brought gladness and life to the dying, and ease and health to those suffering with disease. (11)

DA18/365 The day seemed to them like heaven upon earth, and they were utterly unconscious of how long it had been since they had eaten anything. (11)

DA19/365 At length the day was far spent. (11)

DA20/365 The sun was sinking in the west, and yet the people lingered. [F/303.1] (P1)

DA21/365 Jesus had labored all day without food or rest.
(11)

DA22/365 He was pale from weariness and hunger, and the disciples besought Him to cease from His toil. (11)

DA23/365 But He could not withdraw Himself from the multitude that pressed upon Him. (11)

DA24/365 The disciples finally came to Him, urging that for their own sake the people should be sent away. (11)

DA25/365 Many had come from far, and had eaten nothing since morning. (11)

215.8 We may well believe how many gracious words would come out of His mouth. Never did hours pass more pleasantly. [Macduff, BTS]

303.1 The day wore on; already the sun was sinking towards the western hills, yet still the multitude lingered, charmed by that healing voice and by those holy words. [Farrar, LC]

25, 30-32/278 But now another kind of solicitude seizes on the disciples. . . . The day declined; the evening shadows lengthened; yet, as if never satisfied, that vast company still clung to Jesus, and made no movement to depart. The disciples grew anxious. They came at last to Jesus, and said, "This is a desert place, and the time is now past; **send the multitude away**, that they may go into the country round about and into the villages, and lodge, and buy bread for themselves, for they have **nothing to eat.**" [Hanna, LC]

DA26/365 In the surrounding towns and villages they might be able to buy food. [W/245.1] (P2)

DA27/365 But Jesus said, "Give ye them to eat," and then, turning to Philip, questioned, "Whence shall we buy bread, that these may eat?" (B2)

2SP36/261 He inquired of Philip concerning the probability of obtaining bread for so large a number, that they might not return to their homes unrefreshed nor faint by the way. (B2)

DA28/365 This He said to test the faith of the disciple. (I1)

DA29/365 Philip looked over the sea of heads, and thought how impossible it would be to provide food to satisfy the wants of such a crowd. [H/35/278] (P3)

DA30/365 He answered that two hundred pennyworth of bread would not be nearly enough to divide among them, so that each might have a little. [H/35/278] (B1)

DA31/365 Jesus inquired how much food could be found among the company. [H/36/278] (P1)

DA32/365 "There is a lad here," said Andrew, "which hath five barley loaves, and two small fishes: but what are they among so many?" (B2)

DA33/365 Jesus directed that these be brought to Him. [H/38,39/279] (B1)

DA34/365 Then He bade the disciples seat the people on the grass in parties of fifty or a hundred, to preserve order, and that all might witness what He was about to do. [H/40/279] (P1)

2SP46/262 This marshaling of five thousand people into companies, was at length satisfactorily accomplished, and they were all seated in the presence of the Saviour. [H/42,43/279] (P1)

245.1 To purchase food in the surrounding towns and villages would be difficult. . . [Wayland, SBC]

35/278 Philip runs his eye over the great assemblage, and making a rough estimate of what would be required, he answered, "Two hundred pennyworth of bread would not be sufficient for them, that every one might 'get a little;' shall we go and buy as much?" [Hanna, LC]

36/278 Jesus asked how much food they had among themselves, without needing to go to make any further purchase. [Hanna, LC]

37/278 Andrew, another native of Bethsaida, who had been scrutinizing the crowd, discovering some old acquaintances, said, "There is a lad here, who has five barley loaves and two small fishes; but what are they among so many? [Hanna, LC]

38/278 "Bring them to me," said Jesus. [Hanna, LC]

39/279 They brought them. [Hanna, LC]

40/279 "Make the men," he said, "sit down by fifties in a company"--an order indicative of our Lord's design that there might be no confusion and that the attention of all might be directed to what he was about to do. [Hanna, LC]

42/279 The marshalling of five thousand men, besides women and children, into such an orderly array, must have taken some time. [Hanna, LC]

43/279 The people, however, quietly consented to be so arranged, and company after company sat down, till the whole were seated in the presence of the Lord, who all the while has stood in silence watching the operation, with that scanty stock of provisions in his hand. [Hanna, LC]

DA35/365 When this was accomplished, Jesus took the food, "and looking up to heaven, He blessed, and brake, and gave the loaves to His disciples, and the disciples to the multitude." (B2)

DA36/365 "And they did all eat, and were filled. (B2)

DA37/365 And they took up twelve baskets full of the fragments, and of the fishes." (B2)

DA38/365 He who taught the people the way to secure peace and happiness was just as thoughtful of their temporal necessities as of their spiritual need. [P/9.5] (P2)

DA39/365 The people were weary and faint. (I1)

DA40/365 There were mothers with babes in their arms, and little children clinging to their skirts. (I1)

DA41/365 Many had been standing for hours. (I1)

DA42/365+ They had been so intensely interested in Christ's words that they had not once thought of sitting down, and the crowd was so great that there was danger of their trampling on one another. (I1)

DA43/366 Jesus would give them a chance to rest, and He bade them sit down. (I1)

DA44/366 There was much grass in the place, and all could rest in comfort. (B2)

DA45/366 Christ never worked a miracle except to supply a genuine necessity, and every miracle was of a character to lead the people to the tree of life, whose leaves are for the healing of the nations. [C/2,4a/89] (P1)

DA46/366+ The simple food passed round by the hands of the disciples contained a whole treasure of lessons. (I1)

9.5 Having healed their bodies, and doubtless taught them spiritual things, he will not withhold the lesser gift of temporary refreshment. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

215.9 The crowd are faint and weary. They have tasted nothing all day. [Macduff, BTS]

2,4a/89 Jesus never wrought a miracle unless at the bidding of a providential necessity. . . .And every miracle of Christ, too, was essentially redemptive; [Cumming SR-J]

DA47/367 It was humble fare that had been provided; the fishes and barley loaves were the daily food of the fisher folk about the Sea of Galilee. (11)

DA48/367 Christ could have spread before the people a rich repast, but food prepared merely for the gratification of appetite would have conveyed no lesson for their good. (11)

DA49/367 Christ taught them in this lesson that the natural provisions of God for man had been perverted. (11)

DA50/367 And never did people enjoy the luxurious feasts prepared for the gratification of perverted taste as this people enjoyed the rest and the simple food which Christ provided so far from human habitations. [F/303.3] (12)

DA51/367 If men today were simple in their habits, living in harmony with nature's laws, as did Adam and Eve in the beginning, there would be an abundant supply for the needs of the human family. (11)

DA52/367 There would be fewer imaginary wants, and more opportunities to work in God's ways. (11)

DA53/367 But selfishness and the indulgence of unnatural taste have brought sin and misery into the world, from excess on the one hand, and from want on the other. (11)

DA54/367 Jesus did not seek to attract the people to Him by gratifying the desire for luxury. (11)

DA55/367 To that great throng, weary and hungry after the long, exciting day, the simple fare was an assurance not only of His power, but of His tender care for them in the common needs of life. (11)

DA56/367 The Saviour has not promised His followers the luxuries of the world; their fare may be plain, and even scanty; their lot may be shut in by poverty; but His word is pledged that their need shall be supplied, and He has promised that which is far better than worldly good,--the abiding comfort of His own presence. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

304.4 It was a humble but a sufficient, and to hungry wayfarers a delicious meal. [Farrar, LC]

303.3 . . . would find themselves in the darkness, hungry and afar from every human habitation. [Farrar, LC]

DA57/367 In feeding the five thousand, Jesus lifts the veil from the world of nature, and reveals the power that is constantly exercised for our good. (11)

DA58/367 In the production of earth's harvest God is working a miracle every day. [C/5,6/89] (P1)

DA59/367 Through natural agencies the same work is accomplished that was wrought in the feeding of the multitude. [C/8/89] (P3)

ST(97)51 But it takes just as much power to prepare the harvest which men garner as to make a few barley loaves serve for so many thousands. [C/8/89] (P1)

DA60/367 Men prepare the soil and sow the seed, but it is the life from God that causes the seed to germinate. [C/6/89] (P2)

ST(97)45 The soil is cultivated, and the seed is put into the ground. [C/6/89] (P1)

DA61/367 It is God's rain and air and sunshine that cause it to put forth, "first the blade, then the ear, after that the full corn in the ear." Mark 4:28. [C/6,7/89] (I2)

ST(97)46 Then God, through his miracle-working power, sends the rain and sunshine, causing the seed to send forth, first the blade, then the ear, and then the corn in the ear. [C/6,7/89] (P2)

DA62/367 It is God who is every day feeding millions from earth's harvest fields. [C/7,8/89] (P2)

ST(97)48 In this way God feeds thousands, and ten times ten thousand, a multitude which can not be numbered. [C/6,8/89] (P2)

DA63/367 Men are called upon to co-operate with God in the care of the grain and the preparation of the loaf, and because of this they lose sight of the divine agency. (11)

317.1 In this miracle there is a grand apocalypse. He draws aside that all but impenetrable and mysterious mantle, which conceals the Creator from the creature in the mist of his creation; Cumming, LLM]

5/89 But we say such only are miracles; but the truth is, there is as great a miracle going on every day. [Cumming. SR-J]

6/89 The fact that you place a little seed into the soil, and that seed by the influence of the air, the rain, the sunshine, the ammonia and carbon in the soil, should grow up into a stalk, and produce golden fruits in autumn, and contribute to the feeding of ten times ten thousand, this is as great a miracle every bit. [Cumming, SR-J]

7/89 The contrast between the seed in the soil, and a loaf upon your table is as complete as between five loaves here and the feeding of as many thousand; but we are accustomed to the one, and we call it nature; we are not accustomed to the other, and we are constrained to admit that it is the Lord of nature. [Cumming, SR-J]

8/89 But the fact is, the former is just as miraculous as the latter; and it needs as much of Deity to translate spring into harvest, as it needed of Deity to transform a few barley loaves into food for so many thousands. [Cumming, SR-J]

9/89 The fact is, we are surrounded with miracles; but they are so common that we cease to see the hand that does them. [Cumming, SR-J; Cumming treats this idea also in LLOL, 183; LLM, 313; SR-M, 124.8+]

ST(97)47 Thus the materials are provided from which man, using his God-given faculties, prepares the loaf which is placed upon the table. [C/6,7/89] (P2)

ST(97)49 But men are accustomed to this process, and they drop God out of their thoughts, thinking that they themselves are doing the work. [C/7/89] [C/2/90] (P2)

DA64/367+ They do not give God the glory due unto His holy name. (11)

DA65/368 The working of His power is ascribed to natural causes or to human instrumentality. [C/2/90] (P2)

ST(97)54 But God, full of mercy and compassion, constantly cares for us; and because there is no cessation of his goodness, because we are surrounded by his miracles, we cease to appreciate his continually increasing mercies. [C/1/90] (P2)

ST(97)55 Fixing our eyes upon human instrumentalities, we give the glory to men, and ascribe the miracles of God to natural causes. [C/2/90] (P2)

DA66/368 Man is glorified in place of God, and His gracious gifts are perverted to selfish uses, and made a curse instead of a blessing. (11)

ST(97)56 Men allow the enemy of God to lead them to glorify men in the place of praising their Creator. (11)

ST(97)57 They banish God from their thoughts, and act as did the inhabitants of the Noatic world, polluting the earth by their sins. [C/2/90] (12)

DA67/368 God is seeking to change all this. (11)

DA68/368 He desires that our dull senses shall be quickened to discern his merciful kindness and to glorify Him for the working of His power. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

1/90 We get so many mercies that we cease to be thankful; we are so surrounded with miracles that we cease to see them. [Cumming, SR-J]

2/90 For our mercies we give thanks to the instrument; the miracles of God we attribute to the laws of nature; and in both we try, designedly or undesignedly, to banish God from the world, and work creation without him. [Cumming, SR-J]

DA69/368 He desires us to recognize Him in His gifts, that they may be, as He intended, a blessing to us. (11)

DA70/368 It was to accomplish this purpose that the miracles of Christ were performed. (11)

DA71/368 After the multitude had been fed, there was an abundance of food left. (11)

DA72/368 But He who had all the resources of infinite power at His command said, "Gather up the fragments that remain, that nothing be lost." [C/9,10/88] (B1)

DA73/368 These words meant more than putting the bread into the baskets. (11)

DA74/368 The lesson was twofold. (11)

DA75/368 Nothing is to be wasted. [C/10/88] (P2)

DA76/368 We are to let slip no temporal advantage. (11)

DA77/368 We should neglect nothing that will tend to benefit a human being. [C/11c/88] (P2)

DA78/368 Let everything be gathered up that will relieve the necessity of earth's hungry ones. [C/11c/88] (P2)

DA79/368 And there should be the same carefulness in spiritual things. (11)

DA80/368 When the baskets of fragments were collected, the people thought of their friends at home. (11)

DA81/368 They wanted them to share in the bread that Christ had blessed. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

9/88 There is something beautiful in the admonition,
"Gather up the fragments." [Cumming, SR-J]

10/88 He who had all the resources of infinitude at his
command, would not waste a fragment! [Cumming, SR-J]

11c/88 . . . the Lord of all plenty, the Maker, Creator,
and Proprietor of all, would not allow one fragment to fall
that would be useful to a single human being, or that could
be gathered up and collected for the benefit of others that
were not there. [Cumming, SR-J]

DA82/368 The contents of the baskets were distributed among the eager throng, and were carried away into all the region round about. (11)

DA83/368 So those who were at the feast were to give to others the bread that comes down from heaven, to satisfy the hunger of the soul. (11)

DA84/368 They were to repeat what they had learned of the wonderful things of God. (11)

DA85/368 Nothing was to be lost. (11)

DA86/368 Not one word that concerned their eternal salvation was to fall useless to the ground. (11)

DA87/368 The miracle of the loaves teaches a lesson of dependence upon God. (11)

ST(97)32 This miracle was evidence that Jesus is the world's Redeemer, that he possesses omnipotent power; and it is also a most precious lesson of his beneficence. [C/12/88]
(12)

DA88/368 When Christ fed the five thousand, the food was not nigh at hand. (11)

DA89/368 Apparently He had no means at His command. (11)

DA90/368 Here He was, with five thousand men, besides women and children, in the wilderness. (11)

DA91/368 He had not invited the large multitude to follow Him; they came without invitation or command; but He knew that after they had listened so long to His instruction, they would feel hungry and faint; for He was one with them in their need of food. (11)

DA92/368 They were far from home, and the night was close at hand. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

12/88 Now this miracle has two aspects,--first, the evidence of omnipotent power, and, secondly, what was in all the miracles of Jesus, the evidence of infinite benevolence.
[Cumming, SR-J]

DA93/368 Many of them were without means to purchase food. (11)

DA94/368 He who for their sake had fasted forty days in the wilderness would not suffer them to return fasting to their homes. (11)

DA95/368 The providence of God had placed Jesus where He was; and He depended on His heavenly Father for the means to relieve the necessity. [W/8/246] (P1)

DA96/369 And when we are brought into strait places, we are to depend on God. [W/9/246] (P3)

DA97/369 We are to exercise wisdom and judgment in every action of life, that we may not, by reckless movements, place ourselves in trial. (11)

DA98/369 We are not to plunge into difficulties, neglecting the means God has provided, and misusing the faculties He has given us. [W/10/246] (V2)

DA99/369 Christ's workers are to obey His instructions implicitly. (11)

DA100/369 The work is God's, and if we would bless others His plans must be followed. (11)

DA101/369 Self cannot be made a center; self can receive no honor. (11)

DA102/369 If we plan according to our own ideas, the Lord will leave us to our own mistakes. [W/10/246] (P2)

DA103/369 But when, after following His directions, we are brought into strait places, He will deliver us. [W/11/246] (P2)

216.1 Though He refused to change stones into bread for Himself when He was hungry, He always thought of others. He did not like the idea of that crowd having been there all these long hours in the burning sun of an April day, without tasting a morsel of food. [Macduff, BTS]

8/246 The providence of God had, however, placed him in his present circumstances, and he might therefore properly look to PROVIDENCE for deliverance. [Wayland, SBC]

9/246 This event, then, furnishes the rule by which we are to be governed. [Wayland, SBC]

10/246 When we plunge ourselves into difficulty, by a neglect of the means or by a misuse of the faculties which God has bestowed upon us, it is to be expected that he will leave us to our own devices. [Wayland, SBC]

11/246 But when, in the honest discharge of our duties, we find ourselves in circumstances beyond the reach of human aid, we then may confidently look up to God for deliverance. [Wayland, SBC]

DA104/369 We are not to give up in discouragement, but in every emergency we are to seek help from Him who has infinite resources at his command. (I1)

DA105/369 Often we shall be surrounded with trying circumstances, and then, in the fullest confidence, we must depend upon God. [W/11/246] (P2)

DA106/369 He will keep every soul that is brought into perplexity through trying to keep the way of the Lord. [W/12/246] (P2)

ST(97)102 The path of duty, tho it may not always be pleasant to the natural feelings, is the only path of safety. [W/14/246] (P1)

ST(97)103 When the Lord tests us with trials, he does not leave us to the will of the enemy. [W/13/246] (P1)

ST(97)104 He has appointed a way of escape for us; but our faith in his pledged word must be exercised. [W/13/246] (I2)

DA107/369 Christ has bidden us, through the prophet, "Deal thy bread to the hungry," and "satisfy the afflicted soul;" "when thou seest the naked, that thou cover him," and "bring the poor that are cast out to thy house." Isa. 58:7-10. (B2)

DA108/369 He has bidden us, "Go ye into all the world, and preach the gospel to every creature." Mark 16:15. (B2)

DA109/369 But how often our hearts sink, and faith fails us, as we see how great is the need, and how small the means in our hands. (I1)

DA110/369 Like Andrew looking upon the five barley loaves and the two little fishes, we exclaim, "What are they among so many?" (I1)

DA111/369 Often we hesitate, unwilling to give all that we have, fearing to spend and to be spent for others. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

12/246 He will always take care of us while we are in the spot where he has placed us. [Wayland, SBC]

13/246 When he appoints for us trials, he also appoints for us the means of escape. [Wayland, SBC]

14/246 The path of duty, though it may seem arduous, is ever the path of safety. [Wayland, SBC]

DA112/369 But Jesus has bidden us, "Give ye them to eat."
(11)

DA113/369 His command is a promise; and behind it is the same power that fed the multitude beside the sea. (11)

DA114/369 In Christ's act of supplying the temporal necessities of a hungry multitude is wrapped up a deep spiritual lesson for all His workers. (11)

DA115/369 Christ received from the Father; He imparted to the disciples; they imparted to the multitude; and the people to one another. (11)

DA116/369 So all who are united to Christ will receive from Him the bread of life, the heavenly food, and impart it to others. (11)

DA117/369 In full reliance upon God, Jesus took the small store of loaves; and although there was but a small portion for His own family of disciples, He did not invite them to eat, but began to distribute to them, bidding them serve the people. [W/17/246] (12)

DA118/369+ The food multiplied in His hands; and the hands of the disciples, reaching out to Christ, Himself the Bread of Life, were never empty. (11)

DA119/370 The little store was sufficient for all. (11)

DA120/370 After the wants of the people had been supplied, the fragments were gathered up, and Christ and His disciples ate together of the precious, Heaven-supplied food. (11)

DA121/370 The disciples were the channel of communication between Christ and the people. (11)

DA122/370 This should be a great encouragement to His disciples today. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

17/246 Though his whole store was barely sufficient to supply the wants of his immediate family, he began to share it with the thousands who surrounded him. [Wayland, SBC]

85.7 The disciples are represented by the other evangelists as the chosen means of communication between our Lord and the people; [Hutchinson, OLS]

DA123/370 Christ is the great center, the source of all strength. (I1)

DA124/370 His disciples are to receive their supplies from Him. (I1)

DA125/370 The most intelligent, the most spiritually minded, can bestow only as they receive. (I1)

DA126/370 Of themselves they can supply nothing for the needs of the soul. (I1)

DA127/370 We can impart only that which we receive from Christ; and we can receive only as we impart to others. (I1)

DA128/370 As we continue imparting, we continue to receive; and the more we impart, the more we shall receive. (I1)

DA129/370 Thus we may be constantly believing, trusting, receiving, and imparting. (I1)

DA130/370 The work of building up the kingdom of Christ will go forward, though to all appearance it moves slowly and impossibilities seem to testify against advance. (I1)

DA131/370 The work is of God, and He will furnish means, and will send helpers, true, earnest disciples, whose hands also will be filled with food for the starving multitude.
[W/22/247] (I2)

DA132/370 God is not unmindful of those who labor in love to give the word of life to perishing souls, who in their turn reach forth their hands for food for other hungry souls. (I1)

DA133/370 In our work for God there is danger of relying too largely upon what man with his talents and ability can do. [W/33/247] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

22/247 If the work be of God, he will furnish us with helpers as fast as they are needed. [Wayland, SBC]

16/246 We can more easily maintain ourselves in the most difficult position, God being our helper, than in apparent security **relying** on our own **strength**. [Wayland, SBC]

33/247 If I mistake not, it suggests to us that in works of benevolence we are accustomed to rely too much on human and too little on divine aid. [Wayland, SBC]

DA134/370 Thus we lose sight of the one Master Worker. (11)

DA135/370 Too often the worker for Christ fails to realize his personal responsibility. (11)

DA136/370 He is in danger of shifting his burden upon organizations, instead of relying upon Him who is the source of all strength. [W/248.2] (P2)

DA137/370 It is a great mistake to trust in human wisdom or numbers in the work of God. (11)

DA138/370 Successful work for Christ depends not so much on numbers or talent as upon pureness of purpose, the true simplicity of earnest, dependent faith. (11)

DA139/370 Personal responsibilities must be borne, personal duties must be taken up, personal efforts must be made for those who do not know Christ. (11)

DA140/370 In the place of shifting your responsibility upon someone whom you think more richly endowed than you are, work according to your ability. (11)

DA141/370 When the question comes home to your heart, "Whence shall we buy bread, that these may eat?" let not your answer be the response of unbelief. (11)

DA142/370 When the disciples heard the Saviour's direction, "Give ye them to eat," all the difficulties arose in their minds. (11)

DA143/370+ They questioned, Shall we go away into the villages to buy food? (11)

DA144/371 So now, when the people are destitute of the bread of life, the Lord's children question, Shall we send for someone from afar, to come and feed them? (11)

248.2 Every one is apt thus to forget his own personal duty, and rely upon the labor of others, and it is well if he does not put his organization in the place of God himself. [Wayland, SBC]

DA145/371 But what said Christ? (I1)

DA146/371 "Make the men sit down," and He fed them there. (I1)

DA147/371 Commune with Him. (I1)

DA148/371 Bring your barley loaves to Jesus. (I1)

DA149/371 The means in our possession may not seem to be sufficient for the work; but if we will move forward in faith, believing in the all-sufficient power of God, He Himself will provide the means for its accomplishment. (I1)

DA150/371 If the work be of God, He Himself will provide the means for its accomplishment. [W/22/247] (P2)

DA151/371 He will reward honest, simple reliance upon Him. [W/23/247] (P1)

DA152/371 The little that is wisely and economically used in the service of the Lord of heaven will increase in the very act of imparting. (I1)

DA153/371 In the hand of Christ the small supply of food remained undiminished until the famished multitude were satisfied. [W/18/247] (P2)

DA154/371 If we go to the Source of all strength, with our hands of faith outstretched to receive, we shall be sustained in our work, even under the most forbidding circumstances, and shall be enabled to give to others the bread of life. (I1)

DA155/371 The Lord says, "Give, and it shall be given unto you." (B2)

DA156/371 "He that soweth sparingly shall reap also sparingly; and he that soweth with blessings shall reap also with blessings. . . . (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

22/247 If the work be of God, he will furnish us with helpers as fast as they are needed. [Wayland, SBC]

23/247 In all ages, God has rewarded abundantly simple trust in him, and has bestowed upon it the highest honor. [Wayland, SBC]

18/247 Small as was his provision at the commencement, it remained unconsumed until the deed of mercy was done, and the wants of the famishing host were supplied. [Wayland, SBC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA157/371 And God is able to make all grace abound unto you; that ye, having always all sufficiency in everything, may abound unto every good work: as it is written,--"He hath scattered abroad, he hath given to the poor: His righteousness abideth forever. (B2)

DA158/371 "And He that supplieth seed to the sower and bread for food, shall supply and multiply your seed for sowing, and increase the fruits of your righteousness: ye being enriched in everything unto all liberality, which worketh through us thanksgiving to God." Luke 6:38; 2 Cor. 9:6-11, R. V., margin. (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 39 - SOURCES

Analysis

Our analysis of chapter 39 is the seventh in the series of 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages to be evaluated for literary dependency. Thus far, each chapter has had its own special literary character. This chapter is no exception.

One of the first peculiarities to strike our interest was the tension between the Spirit of Prophecy text and the DA account as well as within the DA itself in respect to Jesus' taking some rest with His disciples. A second question of discord was raised when we compared the 2SP text with the Scripture accounts. A third problem to be faced concerned the dependency between the DA text published in December of 1898 and the ST articles dated in August of 1897. These are only three out of a number of intriguing features challenging the source critical analysis of this chapter.

The theme of chapter 39 has to do with the feeding of the 5,000. This is the only miracle from the public ministry of Christ to be found in all four gospels. The similarities and differences between the four accounts have been the subject of source critical studies on the synoptic gospels. Two of the synoptic accounts, those of Matthew and Mark, also include a story of Jesus feeding 4,000.¹ Part of the tension to be found in Ellen White's comments may be due to the difficulties involved in trying to create some kind

¹Cf. Matthew 15:32-39 and Mark 8:1-10.

of harmony among these varying reports.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

In this chapter of 158 sentences Ellen White exhibits a large degree of independence. We credited 107 sentences to her Strict Independence. Aside from 12 direct references to Scripture on her own initiative we found parallels to six sources in the remaining 39 sentences. These dependent sentences have been broken down in Table 1, page 386, into the various categories of dependency.

The majority of parallels, 20 out of 37, were classified as Simple Paraphrase. Partial Independence and Strict Paraphrase registered six and five respectively with Loose Paraphrase and Source Bible accounting for seven more source parallels, three for the former and four for the latter. One parallel rated in the Verbatim class. According to the evaluation scale the entire chapter shows an average of .92 dependency where all sentences other than independent Bible quotations are included. When only the dependent sentences are rated the average dependency jumps to 3.43.

The source furnishing the most source parallels for the DA text was a discourse or sermon by Francis Wayland, "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth." Wayland's series of sermons is not listed in the compilation furnished by the White Estate office.¹ John Cumming's commentary on the

¹Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier and Ron Graybill, A

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 39

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
01. DA	00	01	05	20	03	04	06	107	12	158
02. 2SP (77)	00	00	01	01	02	00	05	00	00	09
03. St (97)	00	00	04	06	00	00	03	02	00	15
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	00	05	07	02	00	08	(02)	(00)	24

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

gospel of John was used in 11 sentences. The 13 remaining readings are spread through the writings of familiar authors as Table 2, page 388, indicates.

According to the library list compiled from the inventory made at the time of her death,¹ Cumming was a favorite author of Ellen White. She had at this time three of his works, including the one used in this chapter, in her private library. Four other books by Cumming were in the office library.

John Cumming was not only a prolific writer, he also repeated himself in his works. His comments on the content of this chapter were so similar in several works that we had difficulty deciding which source furnished the parallel.²

We had the same type of problem when using the works of Daniel March. The story of this miraculous feeding appears in Walks and Homes of Jesus, published in 1866, under the heading of "Capernaum," chapter III. In a later work, Days of the Son of Man, published in 1882, virtually the same material is presented under the topic of "The Synagogue." Unless persuaded by the peculiarities of the text itself we have favored the earlier work as the source used by Ellen

Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries (E. G. White Estate, April, 1982), hereafter to be referred to as EGW Bibliography.

¹Ibid.

²Cf. Cumming, SR-J 5/8 with The Life and Lessons of our Lord, Unfolded and Illustrated (London: John F. Shaw & Co., 1870), p. 183; Foreshadows, Lectures on Our Lord's Miracles (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1854), p. 313 and Sabbath Evening Readings in the New Testament. St. Matthew (Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett, Proctor, and Worthington, 1855), page 124.8.

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	12	12
02. Cumming SR-J	00	00	02	06	01	01	01	00	00	11
03. Farrar LC	00	00	01	00	00	00	01	00	00	02
04. Hanna LC	00	00	00	02	01	02	00	00	00	05
05. March WHJ	00	00	00	02	00	01	01	00	00	04
06. Pentecost BS	00	00	00	01	00	00	01	00	00	02
07. Wayland SBC	00	01	02	09	01	00	02	00	00	15
TOTALS DA Text	00	01	05	20	03	04	06	—	(12)	51

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

White. We know she had a copy of Walks and Homes of Jesus in her personal library in 1915.

Our survey of the previous writings of Ellen White on the subject of this chapter uncovered two earlier accounts on which Marian Davis obviously drew in the composition of chapter 39. Most of the 51 sentences of chapter XX of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, and the 184 sentences of two-part article in The Signs of the Times on "Feeding the Five Thousand"¹ appear in identical or modified form in this chapter. The ST material is also indebted to the earlier 2SP presentation. We have listed the parallel sentences between 2SP, chapter XX, the ST articles of 1897, and the DA text in Table A on pages 390 through 392.

Since our major concern lies with Ellen White's use of literary sources other than her own we are assuming that the DA text of 1898 was written after the ST article of 1897.²

¹ST, August 12, 19, 1897. With the exception of sentences 6-29, the material from 2SP may also be found in The Signs of the Times, May 10, 1883, "Power and Humility of Jesus." Chapter XX of Spirit of Prophecy II, plus a portion of what now appears in DA, chapter 40, may be found in La Vie de Christ, chapter XXVII, "Multiplication des Pains."

²We cannot be absolutely sure that the DA text is dependent on the ST(97) text because we have no date for the original composition of either text. Usually the publication of a journal article followed closely after its production. Ellen White was often under the pressure of time in preparing her material for the various church journals. At the same time, she would have prepared her manuscripts for the DA months before its publication date of December, 1898. She is very likely to have been working on both tasks at the same time during her Australian years.

In a letter to Dr. Kellogg dated October 25, 1894 she wrote: "All articles that appear under my signature are fresh, new writings from my pen." [Letter 41, 1895] If this comment applies to the ST article we still are faced with the question of dependency. The ST article could have

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Sent. No.	2SP	ST(97)	DA	Sent. No.	2SP	ST(97)	DA
001.	1	1		031.	31	37	(28)
002.	2	2		032.	32	39	(29)
003.	3		1	033.	33	40	(17)
004.	4		(2) ¹	034.	34	41	(18)
005.	5	3	(3)	035.	35	42	(19)
006.	6	4	(4)	036.	36	43	
007.	7		5	037.	37	44	(33)
008.	8	7	(4)	038.	38	14(45)	(20)
009.	9	5	(7)	039.	39		21
010.	10	6		040.	40	46	
011.	11		8	041.	41	47	(22)
012.	12		(9)	042.	42	48-50	
013.	13	8	(6)	043.	43	51a	(23)
014.	14	9	(7)	044.	44	51b	24
015.	15	10-12		045.	45	52-56	
016.	16	13	(8)	046.	46		25
017.	17	14	(9)	047.	47		26
018.	18		10	048.	48		27
019.	19		11	049.	49		
020.	20		12	050.	50		28
021.	21		13	051.	51		29
022.	22	15	(14)	052.	52		30
023.	23	16-20		053.	53		31
024.	24	21a	15	054.	54		32
025.	25	21b		055.	55		33
026.	26		21-24	056.	56		34
027.	27	22	(25)	057.	57		35
028.	28	23-25		058.	58		
029.	29		26	059.	59		36, 37
030.	30	36	(16)	060.	60		38

¹Parentheses and brackets have been used to indicate when the later version of the parallel sentence has been modified. For example, on line 5 sentence 3 of ST(97) exhibits some changes over sentence 3 of 2SP and sentence 3 of the DA text contains some differences from sentence 3 of ST(97). The changes are evaluated on the basis of the first edition of the sentence involved, and modifications are indicated by the alternation of parentheses and brackets. Where the sentence number is given without parentheses or brackets the sentence may be considered to be a duplicate (or very nearly so) of a previous form of the sentence. Usually such a sentence duplicates the last form of the sentence though this is not always the case.

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Sent. No.	2SP	ST (97)	DA	Sent. No.	2SP	ST (97)	DA
061.	61	39	50	106.	106	38	(94)
062.	62	40	51	107.	107	93	(95)
063.	63	41	52	108.	108	94	96
064.	64	42	53	109.	109	95	97
065.	65	43		110.	110	96	98
066.	66		54	111.	111		99-101
067.	67		55	112.	112	97	(102)
068.	68		56	113.	113	98	(103)
069.	69		57	114.	114	99	(104)
070.	70	44		115.	115	100	(105)
071.	71		58	116.	116	101	106
072.	72	51	59	117.	117	102-104	
073.	73	45	60	118.	118		107-113
074.	74	46	61	119.	119	137	(114)
075.	75	48	62	120.	120	138	115
076.	76	47, 49	(63)	121.	121	139	(116)
077.	77	50	64	122.	122	140	
078.	78	51		123.	123	141	(117)
079.	79	52	(65)	124.	124	142	118
080.	80	53-55		125.	125	143	(119)
081.	81		66	126.	126	144	
082.	82	56-60		127.	127	145	
083.	83		67-70	128.	128		120
084.	84	61	71	129.	129	146	(121)
085.	85	62	72	130.	130	147	(122)
086.	86	73	73	131.	131	148	123
087.	87	63	74	132.	132	149	124
088.	88	64	75	133.	133	150-152	
089.	89	65	76	134.	134	153	125
090.	90	66	77	135.	135	154	(126)
091.	91	67	78	136.	136	155	(127)
092.	92		79-82	137.	137	156	128
093.	93	68	(83)	138.	138	157	129
094.	94	69	84	139.	139	107	(130)
095.	95	70	85	140.	140	108	(131)
096.	96	71	86	141.	141	109	132
097.	97	72-81		142.	142	110-112	
098.	98	82-86		143.	143	113	133
099.	99	87, 88	(87)	144.	144	114	134
100.	100	89	88	145.	145	115	(135)
101.	101	90	89	146.	146	116	(136)
102.	102	91	90	147.	147	117	(137)
103.	103	92	(91)	148.	148	118	(138)
104.	104		92	149.	149	123	139
105.	105		93	150.	150	119	(140)

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 39

<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>	<u>Sent.</u> <u>No.</u>	<u>2SP</u>	<u>ST (97)</u>	<u>DA</u>
151.	151		120-128	196.			
152.	152		141-148	197.			
153.	153		129-136	198.			
154.	154		158-177	199.			
155.	155		178 (149)	200.			
156.	156		179 150	201.			
157.	157		180 151	202.			
158.	158		181 152	203.			
159.	159		182 153	204.			
160.	160		183	205.			
161.	161		184 154	206.			
162.	162		155-158	207.			
163.	163	57-111		208.			
164.				209.			
165.				210.			
166.				211.			
167.				212.			
168.				213.			
169.				214.			
170.				215.			
171.				216.			
172.				217.			
173.				218.			
174.				219.			
175.				220.			
176.				221.			
177.				222.			
178.				223.			
179.				224.			
180.				225.			
181.				226.			
182.				227.			
183.				228.			
184.				229.			
185.				230.			
186.				231.			
187.				232.			
188.				233.			
189.				234.			
190.				235.			
191.				236.			
192.				237.			
193.				238.			
194.				239.			
195.				240.			

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

The sources used in the composition of the earlier 2SP and ST material were the same major ones as used for the DA text. We would expect this duplication in the use of the same sources since there are so many text parallels between the DA sentences and Ellen White's previous writings. The distribution of source parallels in the earlier texts is provided in Table 3 on page 394.

been developed from the DA chapter with special additions and omissions, particularly the former, for application to the ST readership. According to this hypothesis, Ellen White would have added 26 sentences when under pressure to prepare the manuscript for the DA text. Why would she not have just lifted the entire chapter from the DA manuscript and published it as a two-part article. After all, both publications had the same readership, the general public.

It seems more reasonable to conclude that Ellen White wrote the material as part of her material on the life of Christ. It was then published in the ST. The two-part article was later edited, shortened, and revised for the DA text. This hypothesis would account for the condensing and for the addition of more descriptive material. W. C. White appealed to Marian Davis to eliminate the discursive in favor of more description. Marian Davis wrote W. C. White August 9, 1897, saying:

Your references to "descriptive" and "discursive" chapters seems [sic] to indicate that you wish the latter were wholly or in part removed from the book. Every bit of descriptive matter has been used so far as possible. As to the "discursive," probably not one-twentieth that was in the L. C. MS has been used in the book. The chapters have been accepted by yourself and Sister White. To throw them out now would involve greater responsibility than I dare to take. . . . The only person with whom I am at liberty to consult is Elder Haskell. . . . I cannot get his consent to the omission of even one [chapter]. If it seems necessary to throw out some of these chapters, could you not select them, or find someone to do so. . . .

Postscript: The work of revising and condensing has, I hope, made most of the "discursive" chapters somewhat more compact and direct. Perhaps they will not be found to be quite so objectionable as before.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 39

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. EGM	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	02	01	03
02. Cumming SR-J	00	00	02	06	00	00	02	00	00	10
03. Hanna LC	00	00	01	00	02	00	01	00	00	04
04. March WHJ	00	00	00	01	00	00	03	00	00	04
05. Wayland SBC	00	00	02	00	00	00	01	00	00	03
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	00	05	07	02	00	07	02	(01)	24

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

If we compare the degree of dependency between the DA text and the two previous accounts of the miracle of feeding the five thousand, the earlier texts usually show greater dependency.¹

Before taking up the matter of redaction analysis we should at least clarify the earlier comment which had to do with differences of content between the various accounts.

In the 2SP record Ellen White presents Jesus and His disciples as unable to make their retreat as planned. When they arrive at the landing the crowd was already there and pressing the Lord for healing. He is so engulfed in the throng that finally Jesus resorts to teaching them from a boat. Peter, who earlier had been with Jesus on land, is now asked to bring his boat to shore to accommodate Jesus. We read nothing about Jesus leaving the boat but soon the feeding miracle takes place, evidently on the grassy mound where Ellen White had earlier located Jesus.²

According to three gospel accounts Jesus does reach His retreat before the multitude find Him. He leaves His retirement to minister to the people. There is a suggestion in Mark 6:33 that a number of people arrived at the landing site before Jesus reached the shore. The ST account agrees with the majority witness of the gospels. The opening

¹Cf. DA59 [P3] with ST(97)51 [P1], DA60 [P2] with ST(97)45 [P1], and DA61 [I2] with ST(97)46 [P2]. Occasionally we find an exception as in DA4 when compared to the earlier text of 2SP.

²2SP, XX, sentences 1-51, pages 258-262.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

sentence of the text of ST and DA locates Jesus in "a secluded place with His disciples. . ." The DA text, however, goes on to say that a crowd had gathered before Jesus reached the shore yet He is able to land "unobserved by them, and spent a little time apart with the disciples."¹ This tension in the DA text may be an effort to utilize the 2SP account and yet be true to the gospel records. For whatever reason, the ST commentary, though obviously using the earlier 2SP material, makes no mention of the crowd meeting Jesus at the shore. We may also explain the apparent contradiction as Ellen White's attempt to harmonize all four accounts. March also seems to contradict himself in his attempt to bring some unity into the conflicting reports. Hanna accomplishes the harmony by omitting any reference to Jesus' actually finding the solitude He desired.²

Ellen White's introduction of Peter and his boat is evidently lifted from the earlier experience when Jesus teaches the multitude in parables as He sits in a boat near the shore.³ We did not find a similar combination of these two episodes in the sources Ellen White has evidently used in developing her commentary on this miracle feeding.

One further illustration of this conflict in the accounts is found in the Spirit of Prophecy text. In

¹DA, page 364, sentences 7 and 8.

²Cf. March, Days of the Son of Man, p. 183, and Hanna, Life of Christ, p. 278.

³Cf. Matt. 13:1,2, Mark 4:1,2, and especially Luke 5:1-3.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

2SP36/261 Jesus is credited with asking Philip for information on where food could be obtained for the multitude so that the people may not "faint in the way." The conversation with Philip as presented in John 6:5 does not include this explanation for His request. These remarks of Jesus are recorded in Scripture as referring to the feeding of the four thousand and are qualified as being addressed to all the disciples.¹ March makes use of this same comment of Jesus in connection with the feeding of the five thousand but he does not limit the conversation to Jesus and Philip.²

Many interpreters of the New Testament argue that all six accounts of a feeding miracle refer to one episode rather than two miracle feedings. It is doubtful that Ellen White would have held this viewpoint. It is interesting to note, nevertheless, that neither Ellen White nor Hanna gives serious attention to the miracle of feeding the four thousand.³

Finally, the content of the source parallels shows a variation according to the author but not strictly between what is dependent and what may be attributed to Ellen White. March was used largely for descriptive material as was also Hanna. But Hanna supplied practical and spiritual comment as did also the parallels from Wayland and Cumming. Ellen

¹Matt. 15:32 and Mark 8:1-3.

²March, op. cit., p. 184.

³Ellen White in DA 403,404 makes a passing reference to the miracle in one paragraph. We found no heading in Hanna's life of Christ treating this event.

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

White's independent material covered all content areas. If there was any unique element in Ellen White's treatment it was her personal application and appeal to the reader.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

We found several brief references to the feeding of the five thousand in a number of manuscripts and articles. Since the only major coverage of this miracle to appear in writings earlier than the DA text have already been discussed under source analysis of the DA text, we may move into redaction analysis.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The arrangement of chapter 39 follows the general narrative development of the gospel accounts. There are sections where Ellen White seems to be also influenced by Hanna,¹ Wayland, and Cumming. The presence of so much independent literary material and the combination of various sources, however, lead us to credit Ellen White and Marian Davis with the compositional form of the chapter. Perhaps a content analysis would show more parallels to Hanna than does our source analysis based upon literary parallels.

¹DA32 reflects the account as given in John's gospel. DA33 speaks to a command of Jesus not found in this gospel nor in the gospel of Mark which is probably reflected in DA31. The comment of Jesus is only found in Matt. 14:18. Both Hanna and Ellen White move directly from John's gospel in LC37 and DA32 to the command of Christ given in Matthew, LC38 and DA33. This is only one example of where Ellen White apparently was influenced by a source even though she is also using Scripture.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The structure of The Spirit of Prophecy text behind this chapter is clearly that of Ellen White. Her incorporation of elements foreign to the gospel narratives is different from that of the sources on which she is partially dependent. The two-part article from ST is so similar in structure to the DA text we are forced to credit its editorial arrangement to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis as well.

Our study of chapter 39 has underscored the need for further content analysis. We need to check the similarities of theme presentations between Ellen White's writings and that of her sources. In addition, and this is of special importance, we should note the special contribution of Ellen White's commentary. What does she add or omit? What is the distinctive contribution of her commentary on this miracle story?

We may also conclude from this review of her comments on biblical passages that Ellen White does not write as an exegete. She does not attempt to illuminate the meaning of the text. Rather, she approaches the passage from a dynamic point of view. She allows the text to have various emphases.

For example, the first 56 sentences of the DA text cover the entire episode including some practical and spiritual lessons. With sentence 57 Ellen White begins to draw lessons which relate the natural and supernatural

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

worlds. At sentence 71 a third approach is taken. Here she builds on the values of thrift and unselfishness. Sentence 87 moves us back to the beginning of the event to stress dependence upon God. The great spiritual truth of union with God and Christ is introduced with sentence 114. The final application of the miracle is taken up with sentence 130. In this last section of the account Ellen White speaks of the missionary lessons to be drawn from the experience of Jesus and His disciples. The chapter closes with four Scripture quotations in support of this final theme.

The basic story is presented in 56 sentences. The additional commentary takes nearly twice as much text, 102 sentences. The reader is not allowed merely to catch a glimpse of what happened 1900 years ago. One is caught up into the various meanings which transcend that moment in past time and invited to enter into similar experiences with the same resurrected Christ as His power energizes the believing Christian living in the present.

Summary

Ellen White's three major treatments of the one public miracle of Christ to be mentioned in all four gospels challenge us to further study. There is the need for a careful and thorough comparison of her content with that of her sources. This is not the only chapter to have triggered the desire for content analysis. Secondly, we have been exposed to what appears to have been an independent and

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

rather dynamic use of Scripture. We are led to ask three questions. Is this usage, as presented in chapter 39, typical of Ellen White? If so, what may we legitimately conclude as to her method of interpreting Scripture? And thirdly, how does our understanding of her interpretive method inform our method for interpreting her writings and the Scriptures?

We turn now from the special concerns raised by chapter 39 to the common questions being addressed to all 15 chapters.

1. No primary sources remain today for the DA text on chapter 39 or for the two earlier writings utilized in the composition of this chapter. A few comments on the feeding of the five thousand appear in Letter B-47-91 and Manuscript 47, 1894. They do not appear to have influenced the literary form of the text of DA though the thoughts are similar.

2. The DA text represents a reduction of the commentary from the various earlier writings of Ellen White. We counted 56 sentences from 2SP, XX, and 184 sentences from a two-part series in ST(97). The DA text totals 158 sentences. The DA text omits some of the Bible references used earlier as well as some duplicated material.

3. Since the pre-DA texts were largely used in the composition of the DA text we would not expect significant differences between the DA text and Ellen White's earlier

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

materials. The DA text as well as the ST(97) text omitted the references to Jesus teaching from a boat which appear in the 2SP account.

4. Two differences were noted in the DA text over against the earlier accounts' concern. There is the attempt in chapter 39 of harmonizing the 2SP record of Jesus' not taking a retreat with His disciples, reflecting the Markan difference, with the ST(97) treatment which states (along with Matthew, Luke, and John) that Jesus did retire with His disciples to a place of solitude. Secondly, the DA text (as does ST(97)) omits the references in 2SP to Jesus teaching the multitude from a boat anchored just off shore.

5. The text of chapter 39 has 158 sentences, of which 40, or 25 percent, were seen to exhibit some degree of literary dependence.

6. Out of the 158 sentences, 106, or 67 percent, registered Strict Independence. Twelve other sentences consisted of Bible quotations and were omitted from the evaluation.

7. According to our dependency scale the dependency rate for the 40 sentences measured 3.5. The degree of dependency for all sentences (less the Bible quotations) was .97.

8. Francis Wayland's discourse on "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth" was used in 15 parallels. A second major source for this chapter was John Cumming's Sabbath Evening Readings. St. John. This book was listed in the

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

inventory of Ellen White's private library in 1915 and contributed 12 parallels.

9. Four sources to which references have been made earlier were also used to some degree in the writing of this chapter. These are Hanna (Life of Christ), March (Walks and Homes of Jesus), Farrar (Life of Christ) and Pentecost (Bible Studies (88)). We listed without evaluation one possible parallel from Hutchinson, Our Lord's Signs in St. John's Gospel.

10. Since the pre-DA materials treating and fully covering the miracle of the feeding were used in composing the DA text, the sources for the earlier writings also serve as sources for this chapter and are indicated under (8) and (9) above.

11. The same library sources were used in composing the pre-DA and the DA texts. The literary parallels included narrative background, description, theology, and practical spiritual lessons.

12. We found no significant difference between the dependent and independent sentences of chapter 39 in respect to type of content. Ellen White developed the practical spiritual lessons to a greater degree than did her sources.

13. The arrangement of the chapter follows the story outline as found in Scripture. Once the episode has been treated Ellen White begins to draw out several interpretations, some of which are briefly elaborated in Hanna. The final structure of the chapter, however, differs

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

from Hanna's and must be credited to Ellen White and/or Marian Davis, her editorial assistant.

The literary subunits follow the literary source being used in that section of the chapter. Within each of these thematic elements, however, Ellen White adds her own comment. The finished chapter exhibits a skeleton form reflecting the influence of the Bible and the sources; yet the modifications and additions of Ellen White, particularly in the post-narrative comment, mark the work as her own.

14. The pre-DA accounts differ in their structural arrangement and content. In 2SP, chapter XX, Ellen White includes material from another episode when Jesus teaches from a boat. She also extends the chapter to include the attempt of the people to make Christ king and Jesus' departure to spend the night in prayer.

The two-part article in ST appears to be directed more specifically to church workers. To support the object lessons extrapolated from the miracle story, Ellen White refers to the experience of the early church and the counsels of the apostle Paul.

The DA account selects narrative elements and practical lessons from the two earlier writings and combines them with additional comment to form this chapter. The completed work appears well suited to the purposes set forth for this publication. The DA is not a revision of Ellen White's earlier treatment of the life of Christ. It is a new work for a special audience. It is indeed derivative, both in

"Give Ye Them to Eat"

regard to her previous writings and the literary works of others. At the same time it is a new and original production that merits its own special place in the literature on the life of Christ.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.	March DSM 2b/183	P2	054.		I1
005.	March DSM 3/183	P2	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.		I1	057.		I1
008.		I1	058.	Cumming SR-J 5,6/89	P1
009.		I1	059.	Cumming SR-J 8/89	P3
010.		I1	060.	Cumming SR-J 6/89	P2
011.	March WHJ 1/99	I2	061.	Cumming SR-J 6,7/89	I2
012.	March WHJ 2/99	B1	062.	Cumming SR-J 7,8/89	P2
013.		I1	063.		I1
014.	Pentecost BS 8/3	I2	064.		I1
015.		I1	065.	Cumming SR-J 2/90	P2
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.		I1	067.		I1
018.		I1	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.		I1
020.	Farrar LC 303.1	P1	070.		I1
021.		I1	071.		I1
022.		I1	072.	Cumming SR-J9,10/88	B1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.		I1	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.	Cumming SR-J 10/88	P2
026.	Wayland SBC 245.1	P2	076.		I1
027.	Bible	B2	077.	Cumming SR-J 11c/88	P2
028.		I1	078.	Cumming SR-J 11c/88	P2
029.	Hanna LC 35/278	P3	079.		I1
030.	Hanna LC 35/278	B1	080.		I1
031.	Hanna LC 36/278	P1	081.		I1
032.	Bible	B2	082.		I1
033.	Hanna LC 38,39/279	B1	083.		I1
034.	Hanna LC 40/279	P2	084.		I1
035.	Bible	B2	085.		I1
036.	Bible	B2	086.		I1
037.	Bible	B2	087.		I1
038.	Pentecost BS 9.5	P2	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.		I1	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.		I1	093.		I1
044.	Bible	B2	094.		I1
045.	Cumming SR-J2,4a/89	P1	095.	Wayland SBC 8/246	P1
046.		I1	096.	Wayland SBC 9/246	P3
047.		I1	097.		I1
048.			098.	Wayland SBC 10/246	V2
049.		I1	099.		I1
050.	Farrar LC 303.3	I2	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Wayland SBC 23/247	P1
102. -	Wayland SBC 10/246	P2	152. -		I1
103. -	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	153. -	Wayland SBC 18/247	P2
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	155. -	Bible	B2
106. -	Wayland SBC 12/246	P2	156. -	Bible	B2
107. -	Bible	B2	157. -	Bible	B2
108. -	Bible	B2	158. -	Bible	B2
109. -		I1	159. -		
110. -		I1	160. -		
111. -		I1	161. -		
112. -		I1	162. -		
113. -		I1	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -		I1	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -	Wayland SBC 17/246	I2	167. -		
118. -		I1	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -		I1	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -		I1	172. -		
123. -		I1	173. -		
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -	Wayland SBC 22/247	I2	181. -		
132. -		I1	182. -		
133. -	Wayland SBC 33/247	P2	183. -		
134. -		I1	184. -		
135. -		I1	185. -		
136. -	Wayland SBC 248.2	P2	186. -		
137. -		I1	187. -		
138. -		I1	188. -		
139. -		I1	189. -		
140. -		I1	190. -		
141. -		I1	191. -		
142. -		I1	192. -		
143. -		I1	193. -		
144. -		I1	194. -		
145. -		I1	195. -		
146. -		I1	196. -		
147. -		I1	197. -		
148. -		I1	198. -		
149. -		I1	199. -		
150. -	Wayland SBC 22/247	P2	200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 39

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	ST (97) 3	I1	3	051.	-			
002.	-	2SP 4/259	I2	4	052.	-			
003.	-	2SP 5/259	P3	7	053.	-			
004.	-	2SP 6/259	I2	7	054.	-			
005.	-	2SP 8/259	P3	10	055.	-			
006.	-	2SP 9/259	I2	11	056.	-			
007.	-	2SP 14/259	I2	14	057.	-			
008.	-	2SP 15/259	P2	14	058.	-			
009.	-	2SP 36/261	B2	27	059.	-			
010.	-	2SP 46/262	P1	34	060.	-			
011.	-	ST (97) 51	P1	59	061.	-			
012.	-	ST (97) 45	P1	60	062.	-			
013.	-	ST (97) 46	P2	61	063.	-			
014.	-	ST (97) 48	P2	62	064.	-			
015.	-	ST (97) 47	P2	63	065.	-			
016.	-	ST (97) 49	P2	63	066.	-			
017.	-	ST (97) 54	P2	65	067.	-			
018.	-	ST (97) 55	P2	65	068.	-			
019.	-	ST (97) 56	I1	66	069.	-			
020.	-	ST (97) 57	I2	66	070.	-			
021.	-	ST (97) 75	I2	86	071.	-			
022.	-	ST (97) 102	P1	106	072.	-			
023.	-	ST (97) 103	P1	106	073.	-			
024.	-	ST (97) 104	I2	106	074.	-			
025.	-				075.	-			
026.	-				076.	-			
027.	-				077.	-			
028.	-				078.	-			
029.	-				079.	-			
030.	-				080.	-			
031.	-				081.	-			
032.	-				082.	-			
033.	-				083.	-			
034.	-				084.	-			
035.	-				085.	-			
036.	-				086.	-			
037.	-				087.	-			
038.	-				088.	-			
039.	-				089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 39

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	ST (97) 3		051.	-		
002.	-	2SP 4/259	M/2b/99	052.	-		
003.	-	2SP 5/259	H/22/278	053.	-		
004.	-	2SP 6/259	H/22/278	054.	-		
005.	-	2SP 8/259	H/23/278	055.	-		
006.	-	2SP 9/259	M/1/99	056.	-		
007.	-	2SP 14/259	M/5/99+	057.	-		
008.	-	2SP 15/259	M/5/99+	058.	-		
009.	-	2SP 36/261	Bible	059.	-		
010.	-	2SP 46/262	H/42,43/279	060.	-		
011.	-	ST (97) 51	C/8/89	061.	-		
012.	-	ST (97) 45	C/6/89	062.	-		
013.	-	ST (97) 46	C/6,7/89	063.	-		
014.	-	ST (97) 48	C/6,8/89	064.	-		
015.	-	ST (97) 47	C/6,7/89	065.	-		
016.	-	ST (97) 49	C/7/89	066.	-		
			C/2/90	067.	-		
017.	-	ST (97) 54	C/1/90	068.	-		
018.	-	ST (97) 55	C/2/90	069.	-		
019.	-	ST (97) 56		070.	-		
020.	-	ST (97) 57	C/2/90	071.	-		
021.	-	ST (97) 75	C/12/88	072.	-		
022.	-	ST (97) 102	W/14/246	073.	-		
023.	-	ST (97) 103	W/13/246	074.	-		
024.	-	ST (97) 104	W/13/246	075.	-		
025.	-			076.	-		
026.	-			077.	-		
027.	-			078.	-		
028.	-			079.	-		
029.	-			080.	-		
030.	-			081.	-		
031.	-			082.	-		
032.	-			083.	-		
033.	-			084.	-		
034.	-			085.	-		
035.	-			086.	-		
036.	-			087.	-		
037.	-			088.	-		
038.	-			089.	-		
039.	-			090.	-		
040.	-			091.	-		
041.	-			092.	-		
042.	-			093.	-		
043.	-			094.	-		
044.	-			095.	-		
045.	-			096.	-		
046.	-			097.	-		
047.	-			098.	-		
048.	-			099.	-		
049.	-			100.	-		
050.	-						

X CHAPTER 46 - He Was Transfigured

The brief chapter on the transfiguration draws on the gospel records as found in Matthew 17:1-8, Mark 9:2-8, and Luke 9:28-36.

Apart from an occasional reference to this episode when discussing such topics as the prayer life of Jesus or the death of Moses, Ellen White's treatment of the transfiguration is limited to her two earlier accounts of the life of Christ. In Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I, chapter VI is dedicated to this event. Most of the 51 sentences of this chapter, however, deal with the earthly life and death of Moses. A few sentences are given to the life and translation of Elijah. Only the first five and the last six sentences comment on the actual transfiguration experience. These eleven sentences are largely descriptive with no extensive elaboration. We found no indication of the use of sources in the composition of this short survey.

The primary source from the previous writings of Ellen White for the composition of chapter 46 is found in chapter XXVIII of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II. The 77 sentences of this commentary on "The Transfiguration" begin by setting the stage for the actual mountain-top incident. The first 29 sentences treat the first announcement of His passion by Christ following the confession of Peter. This content is covered by Ellen White in chapter 45 of DA, "The Foreshadowing of the Cross." Likewise, the last nine sentences of the SP account introduce us to the exorcism

He Was Transfigured

miracle that takes place at the foot of the mountain when Jesus and the three disciples descend the next morning. This episode is treated in chapter 47 of DA, "Ministry."

In our listing of the source parallels from the pre-DA textual materials we have included some sentences from these opening and closing portions of the SP account even though the content does not parallel that of DA chapter 46. Since our evaluations of the DA text are made independent of and do not include the evaluations of the earlier texts, these additional sentences will not distort our findings for chapter 46. These extra sentences do, however, have a related value. The source parallels they contain and the larger context of the SP coverage of the transfiguration provide additional evidence that Ellen White was using Walks and Homes of Jesus by Daniel March when writing the SP account. In chapter V of this work March opens his discussion of "Tabor," his location for the mount of transfiguration, with comments on Jesus' earlier remarks to the disciples on the cross and His sufferings. He also closes his chapter with some references to the healing of "the lunatic child" (p. 170) and relevant spiritual lessons to be drawn from these experiences associated with the mountain of transfiguration.

In addition to March's work dating from 1866 and which we have already introduced as March WHJ, six other sources will be represented in the text presentation. The lives of Christ by William Hanna, John Fleetwood, and George Jones as

He Was Transfigured

well as the sermons of Henry Melvill have appeared in chapters already reviewed. The reference, Cumming, SR-Mt, is used to identify the Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Matthew.¹ We have referred to W. R. Nicoll's life of Christ as Nicoll, LC.²

¹John Cumming, Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Matthew (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1855), hereafter referred to as Sabbath Readings--Matthew.

²W. R. Nicoll, The Incarnate Saviour. A Life of Jesus Christ (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1881), hereafter referred to as Life of Christ.

2SP1/324 As the time drew near when Jesus was to suffer and die, he was more frequently alone with his disciples.

2SP2/324 After teaching the people all day, he would repair with his disciples to a retired place and pray and commune with them.

2SP3/324 He was weary, yet he had no time to rest, for his work on earth was hastening to a close, and he had much to do before the final hour arrived.

2SP4/324+ He had declared to his disciples that he would establish his kingdom so firmly on earth that the gates of hell should not prevail against it.
[M/16/146] (V2)

2SP5/325 Jesus, in view of his approaching trial, gathered his disciples about him and opened their minds regarding his future humiliation and shameful death at the hands of his persecutors.

2SP6/325 The impulsive Peter could not for a moment endure the thought, and insisted that it could not be.

2SP7/325 Jesus solemnly rebuked Peter's unbelief in suggesting that prophecy should not be fulfilled in the sacrifice of the Son of God.

2SP8/325 Jesus then proceeded to explain to his disciples that they also must suffer for his name, bear the cross in following him, and endure a corresponding humiliation, reproach, and shame with that of their Master, or they could never share his glory. [M/22/147] (P1)

2SP9/325 His sufferings must be followed by theirs, and his crucifixion must teach them that they should be crucified to the world, resigning all hope of its pomp and pleasure. [M/23/147] (P1)

16/146 He had just told them, in the most solemn and explicit terms, that he would establish his kingdom in the earth so firmly that the gates of hell should not prevail against it. [March, WHJ]

17/147 He had commended Peter for declaring his confidence in his divine character. [March, WHJ]

18/147 He had said, that his Father in heaven had made that revelation to the believing disciple. [March, WHJ]

19/147 He had claimed the crown and accepted the title of God's anointed Son. [March, WHJ]

20/147 And now he says that he must go to Jerusalem, submit to shame and torture, and be put to death. [March, WHJ]

21/147 Now he rebukes Peter with the utmost severity, for daring to hint that such a dreadful thing could not come to pass. [March, WHJ]

22/147 After having excited their hopes to the highest pitch, he even goes on to tell them that they too must bear the cross and suffer shame, or they can never share his glory. [March, WHJ]

23/147 His own suffering must be completed in them, and his crucifixion to the world must be perpetuated in the experience of his disciples for all time. [March, WHJ]

2SP10/325 Previous to this declaration, Jesus had frequently spoken to his disciples of his future humiliation, and he had resolutely discouraged all their hopes of his temporal aggrandizement; but they had so long been accustomed to look upon Messiah as one who would reign as a mighty king, that it had been impossible for them to relinquish entirely their glowing expectations.

2SP11/325 But now the words of Jesus were unmistakable.

2SP12/325 He was to live, a humble, homeless wanderer, and to die the death of a malefactor.

2SP13/325 Sadness oppressed their hearts, for they loved their Master; but doubt also harassed their minds, for it seemed incomprehensible that the Son of God should be subjected to such cruel humiliation.

2SP14/325+ They could not understand why he should voluntarily go to Jerusalem to meet the treatment which he told them he should there receive.
[M/27/148] (P1)

2SP15/326 They were deeply grieved that he should resign himself to such an ignominious fate, and leave them in greater darkness than that in which they were groping before he revealed himself to them.

2SP16/326 The thought suggested itself to their minds that they might take him by force to a place of security, but they dared not attempt this as he had repeatedly denounced all such projects as the suggestions of Satan. [M/28/148] (I2)

2SP17/326 In the midst of their gloom they could not refrain from comforting themselves occasionally with the thought that some unforeseen circumstance might avert the fearful doom that awaited their Lord.

2SP18/326 Thus they sorrowed and doubted, hoped and feared, for six long, gloomy days. [M/32/148] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - SOURCES

24/147 Six days intervened between the time of making these startling disclosures to his followers and the transfiguration. [March, WHJ]

25/147 To them, the days were full of sadness and perplexity. [March, WHJ]

26/147 They had many reasonings with themselves, as they journeyed southward from Cesarea Philippi beside the waters of Merom, and along the shores of the sea of Galilee, toward the fatal city, where ignominy and death awaited their Master. [March, WHJ]

27/148 As they went on day after day from village to village, and from one province to another, it must have seemed passing strange to them, that he could go, voluntarily and unbidden, to meet the very doom which would be the ruin of all their hopes, and grief to all their hearts. [March, WHJ]

28/148 They could not venture to remonstrate, or to dissuade him from his purpose; for he had already denounced all such interference as suggestions of Satan. [March, WHJ]

29/148 They could not renounce all hope that he might yet prove himself to be the Son of the Highest, because he was daily putting forth his mighty power in such works as no mere man could do. [March, WHJ]

30/148 Their minds were still dazzled and allured by the glory and riches which they hoped to enjoy with him in his earthly kingdom. [March, WHJ]

31/148 And yet all the while he was leading them towards the scene of his rejection and shame, his crucifixion and death. [March, WHJ]

32/148 Six days are past by them in utter perplexity and sorrow. [March, WHJ]

2SP19/326 Jesus was acquainted with the grief and perplexity of his disciples, and he designed to give them additional proof of his Messiahship, in order that their faith might not utterly fail them in the severe ordeal to which they were soon to be subjected. [M/33/148] (P2)

DA1/419 EVENING is drawing on as Jesus calls to His side three of His disciples, Peter, James, and John, and leads them across the fields, and far up a rugged path, to a lonely mountainside. [M/34,40/149,150] (P2)

2SP20/326 As the sun was setting he called his three most devoted disciples to his side, and led them out of the noisy town, across the fields, and up the steep side of a mountain. [M/37,40/150] (P1)

DA2/419 The Saviour and his disciples have spent the day in traveling and teaching, and the mountain climb adds to their weariness. [M/46/150] (V2)

2SP22/326 He had taught the people and healed the sick throughout the entire day; but he sought this high elevation because he could there find retirement from the crowds that continually sought him, and time for meditation and prayer. [M/46,39/150] (I2)

DA3a/419 Christ has lifted burdens from mind and body of many sufferers; He has sent the thrill of life through their enfeebled frames; [M/47/150] (P1).

DA3b/419 but He also is compassed with humanity, and with His disciples He is wearied with the ascent. [M/48/151] (P1)

2SP23/326 He was very weary, and was much fatigued in toiling up the steep ascent. [M/48/150] (P1)

2SP24/326 The disciples were also tired, and, although they were accustomed to this practice of retiring into the solitudes for prayer, they could not help wondering that Jesus should attempt to climb this rugged mountain, after such a day of fatigue. [M/46,39/150] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - SOURCES

33/148 And now the time has come when the disciples must receive some additional testimony to the Messiahship of their beloved Master, or they will lose all faith in his divine mission; they will no longer look to him as the one to redeem Israel. [March, WHJ]

34/149 It is drawing towards evening. [March, WHJ]

37/149 The snowy heights of distant Hermon are reddening in the glow of the setting sun. [March, WHJ]

38/149 Mount Carmel casts its lengthening shadows far up the plain of Esdraelon. [March, WHJ]

39/150 The deep silence which settles down upon the solitudes of nature, invites to retirement, meditation and prayer. [March, WHJ]

40/150 And now the Master calls the three favorite disciples to himself, and makes his way out of the noisy town, across the open fields and the wild pasture lands, and up the steep ascent of the mountain. [March, WHJ]

41/150 It is a rounded and dome-like elevation, pushed up to a great height, out of the bosom of the plain. [March, WHJ]

42/150 The evening cloud sweeps beneath the summit, and the light of the setting sun lingers long upon the top, after it has left the plain below. [March WHJ]

46/150 He has spent the day in travel and in teaching, and this mountain climb at night adds a heavy weight to the weariness that demanded rest before the evening came. [March WHJ]

47/150 His hand has lifted the burden of infirmity from many shoulders, and sent the thrill of life into many a worn and wasted frame. [March, WHJ]

48/150 But he himself is as much fatigued with the steep ascent as the impetuous Peter or the gentle John. [March WHJ]

DA4/419 The light of the setting sun still lingers on the mountain top, and gilds with its fading glory the path they are traveling. [M/42/150] (P1)

DA5/419 But soon the light dies out from hill as well as valley, the sun disappears behind the western horizon, and the solitary travelers are wrapped in the darkness of night. [H/16,17/330] [M/55/152] (P2)

DA6/419 The gloom of their surroundings seems in harmony with their sorrowful lives, around which the clouds are gathering and thickening. (I1)

DA7/419 The disciples do not venture to ask Christ whither He is going, or for what purpose. [M/49/151] (V2)

DA8/419 He has often spent entire nights in the mountains in prayer. [M/50/151] (P1)

DA9/419 He whose hand formed mountain and valley is at home with nature, and enjoys its quietude. (I1)

DA10/419 The disciples follow where Christ leads the way; yet they wonder why their Master should lead them up this toilsome ascent when they are weary, and when He too is in need of rest. [M/51/151] (P3)

DA11/419 Presently Christ tells them that they are now to go no farther. (I1)

DA12/419+ Stepping a little aside from them, the Man of Sorrows pours out His supplications with strong crying and tears. [M/67,68/154] (P2)

DA13/420 He prays for strength to endure the test in behalf of humanity. [M/71/154] (P1)

16,17/330 The sun sinks in the west beneath the waters of the Great Sea as the top of the mountain is reached. Night begins to draw its mantle round them, wrapping in obscurity the world below. [Hanna, LC]

55/152 Far away in the west, the waves of the Mediterranean glow, like molten gold, where the sun has sunk beneath the horizon. [March WHJ]

49/151 They do not ask him whither he is going, or for what purpose he leads them away to the solitude of the mountain just as night is setting in, and they all need repose and protection in the homes which they have left behind. [March WHJ]

50/151 They have known him many times to spend the whole night in desert places, or upon lonely mountains in prayer, and they do not need to ask him for what purpose he leads them forth from the noisy crowd or the quiet homes of men at the evening hour. [March WHJ]

51/151 They go because he asks their company; and yet they think it strange that he must needs add this lonely watching in the chill air of night, to the weariness and exhaustion of the day. March [WHJ]

67,68/154 To such a place the Man of sorrows goes to spend the whole night in prayer. And as his supplication continues hour after hour, with strong crying and many tears, the disciples grow weary with watching and they fall asleep. March, WHJ]

71/154 They have only tried to divert his mind from such that they may watch with him while he prays for strength to meet the terrible conflict, they slept as they slept again in Gethsemane, leaving him to bear his great agony alone. [March WHJ]

2SP30/327 Hour after hour, with tears and importunity, he supplicated for strength to bear his afflictions and for grace to be bestowed upon his disciples that they might bear the terrible trials that awaited them in the future. [M/68,71/154] (I2)

DA14/420 He must himself gain a fresh hold on Omnipotence, for only thus can He contemplate the future. (I1)

DA15/420 And He pours out His heart longings for His disciples, that in the hour of the power of darkness their faith may not fail. (I1)

DA16/420 The dew is heavy upon His bowed form, but He heeds it not. [M/66/154] (I2)

DA17/420 The shadows of night gather thickly about Him, but He regards not their gloom. (I1)

DA18/420 So the hours pass slowly by. (I1)

DA19/420 At first the disciples unite their prayers with His in sincere devotion; but after a time they are overcome with weariness, and, even while trying to retain their interest in the scene, they fall asleep. [M/68/154] (I2)

DA20/420 Jesus has told them of His sufferings; He has taken them with Him that they might unite with Him in prayer; even now He is praying for them. [M/70,71/154] (I2)

DA21/420 The Saviour has seen the gloom of His disciples, and has longed to lighten their grief by an assurance that their faith has not been in vain. (I1)

DA22/420 Not all, even of the twelve, can receive the revelation He desires to give. (I1)

DA23/420 Only the three who are to witness His anguish in Gethsemane have been chosen to be with Him on the mount. [C/163.9] (P2)

66/154 The dew falls like rain at evening, and the morning wind will come from perpetual snows. [March WHJ]

68/154 And as his supplication continues hour after hour, with strong crying and many tears, the disciples grow weary with watching and they fall asleep. [March WHJ]

70,71/154 He has told them of the great woe that will come upon him before another summer begins. They have only tried to divert his mind from such gloomy anticipations; and now, when he has taken them aside with him while he prays for strength to meet the terrible conflict, they sleep as they slept again in Gethsemane, leaving him to bear his great agony alone. [March WHJ]

163.9 And these three, too, were selected to witness that agony and bloody sweat in the garden of Gethsemane; and they needed to see this great glory, that they might descend from the Mount, and be prepared to endure that so great agony. [Cumming, SR, I]

DA24/420+ Now the burden of His prayer is that they may be given a manifestation of the glory He had with the Father before the world was, that His kingdom may be revealed to human eyes, and that His disciples may be strengthened to behold it. [M/72/155] (P2)

DA25/421 He pleads that they may witness a manifestation of his divinity that will comfort them in the hour of His supreme agony with the knowledge that He is of a surety the Son of God and that his shameful death is a part of the plan of redemption. [M/72/155] (P2)

DA26/421 His prayer is heard. [M/73/155] (P1)

DA27/421 While He is bowed in lowliness upon the stony ground, suddenly the heavens open, the golden gates of the city of God are thrown wide, and holy radiance descends upon the mount, enshrouding the Saviour's form. [M/74,75/155] (P2)

DA28/421 Divinity from within flashes through humanity, and meets the glory coming from above. (I1)

DA29/421 Arising from His prostrate position, Christ stands in godlike majesty. [M/75,76/155] (P2)

DA30/421 The soul agony is gone. [M/75/155] (P2)

DA31/421 His countenance now shines "as the sun," and His garments are "white as the light." [M/76/155] (I2)

2SP39/328 He arises from his prostrate position, and stands in God-like majesty; the soul-agony is gone from his countenance, which now shines with a serene light, and his garments are no longer coarse and soiled, but white and glittering like the noon-day sun. [M/75,76/155] (P2)

DA32/421 The disciples, awaking, behold the flood of glory that illuminates the mount. [M/77/155] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - SOURCES

72/155 Their indifference must have been the more distressing to him for the reason that he was praying especially for such a manifestation of his glory before their eyes as would heal their unbelief, and help them to be reconciled to the humiliation and death which awaited him at Jerusalem. [March, WHJ]

73/155 And the mighty Mediator is not left to pray unheard. [March, WHJ]

74,75/155 Suddenly, as if the golden gates of heaven had been thrown wide, and the splendor of the eternal throne had been poured upon the holy mount, the bending suppliant is clothed with a glory above the brightness of the sun. No longer prostrate in an agony of prayer, he seems to sit enthroned amid the radiance of light ineffable. [March WHJ]

221.2 the Divinity in Christ glowed forth through his mortal frame [Jones, LSFG] (Cf. Fleetwood, LOL 182.2 and others)

75/155 No longer prostrate in an agony of prayer, he seems to sit enthroned amid the radiance of light ineffable. [March, WHJ]

76/155 His countenance wears the aspect of serene and godlike majesty, and his garments shine like the drifted snow beneath the noonday sun. [March, WHJ]

77/155 The sleeping disciples are wakened by the flood of glory covering the whole mount. [March WHJ]

2SP40/328 The sleeping disciples are awakened by the flood of glory that illuminates the whole mount.
[M/77/155] (V2)

DA33/421 In fear and amazement they gaze upon the radiant form of their Master. [M/78/155] (P2)

2SP41/328 They gaze with fear and amazement upon the shining garments and radiant countenance of their Master. [M/78/155] (P1)

2SP56/330 But as they suddenly awake from profound slumber, and behold the sublime vision before them, they are filled with rapture and awe. [M/82/156]
(P1)

DA34/421 As they become able to endure the wondrous light, they see that Jesus is not alone. [M/78/155] (I2)

DA35/421 Beside Him are two heavenly beings, in close converse with Him. [[H/30/331] (P2)

2SP37/328 But God selects Moses and Elijah to visit Christ and converse with him in regard to his coming sufferings at Jerusalem. [H/31/331] (B1)

DA36/421 They are Moses, who upon Sinai had talked with God; and Elijah, to whom the high privilege was given--granted to but one other of the sons of Adam--never to come under the power of death. [M/79/155] (I2)

2SP44/328+ They are Moses, who talked with God face to face amid the thunder and lightnings of Sinai, and Elijah, that prophet of God who did not see death, but was conducted to Heaven in a chariot of fire.
[M/79/155] (P2)

2SP45/329 These two, whom God had seen fit to favor above all others who ever lived upon earth, were delegated by the Father to bring the glory of Heaven to his Son, and comfort him, talking with him concerning the completion of his mission, and especially of his sufferings to be endured at Jerusalem. [M/79/155+] (I2)

78/155 Gazing with wonder and alarm upon the shining robes and the changed countenance of their Master, they see that he is not alone. [March WHJ]

82/156 The disciples are confused and bewildered by the sudden waking and by the awful vision. [March, WHJ]

30/331 It was given them to listen to, and so far to understand, the converse they were holding with Jesus, as to know that they were speaking to him about the decease he was to accomplish at Jerusalem. [Hanna, LC]

79/155+ The great lawgiver, who conversed with Jehovah amid the thunders and the darkness of Sinai, and the mighty prophet who was taken up in a chariot of fire have come down from their heavenly rest to pay their homage to their King and to talk with him of the appointed completion of his mission, while his disciples sleep. [March WHJ]

DA37/421 Upon Mount Pisgah fifteen centuries before, Moses had stood gazing upon the Land of Promise. (11)

DA38/421 But because of his sin at Meribah, it was not for him to enter there. (11)

DA39/421 Not for him was the joy of leading the host of Israel into the inheritance of their fathers. (11)

DA40/421 His agonized entreaty, "I pray Thee, let me go over, and see the good land that is beyond Jordan, that goodly mountain, and Lebanon" (Deut. 3:25), was refused. (B2)

DA41/421 The hope that for forty years had lighted up the darkness of the desert wanderings must be denied. (11)

DA42/421 A wilderness grave was the goal of those years of toil and heart-burdening care. (11)

DA43/421 But He who is "able to do exceeding abundantly above all that we ask or think" (Eph. 3:20), had in this measure answered His servant's prayer. (11)

DA44/421 Moses passed under the dominion of death, but he was not to remain in the tomb. (11)

DA45/421 Christ Himself called him forth to life. (11)

DA46/421 Satan the tempter had claimed the body of Moses because of his sin; but Christ the Saviour brought him forth from the grave. Jude 9. (11)

DA47/421 Moses upon the mount of trasfiguration was a witness to Christ's victory over sin and death. (11)

DA48/421+ He represented those who shall come forth from the grave at the resurrection of the just. (11)

98b.7 Moses died and was buried, yet he appeared in his own, though glorified body; and thus represented those saints who are to come up from the grave and stand with Christ in a re-animated and spiritual form. Elias, on the contrary, died not, but was translated without passing through the sepulchre; hence, he was the representative of those saints, who, living when Christ shall appear, shall be changed without seeing corruption. [Melvill, S(43)]

DA49/422 Elijah, who had been translated to heaven without seeing death, represented those who will be living upon the earth at Christ's second coming, and who will be "changed, in a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trump;" when "this mortal must put on immortality," and "this corruptible must put on incorruption." I Cor. 15:51-53. (I1)

DA50/422 Jesus was clothed with the light of heaven, as He will appear when He shall come "the second time without sin unto salvation." (I1)

DA51/422 For He will come "in the glory of His Father with the holy angels." Heb. 9:28; Mark 8:38. (I1)

DA52/422 The Saviour's promise to the disciples was now fulfilled. (I1)

2SP74/336 Previous to his transfiguration, Jesus had told his disciples that there were some then with him who should not see death until they should see the kingdom of God come with power. (I1)

2SP75/336 In the transfiguration on the mount, this promise was fulfilled, for they there saw the kingdom of Christ in miniature. (I1)

DA53/422 Upon the mount the future kingdom of glory was represented in miniature,--Christ the King, Moses a representative of the risen saints, and Elijah of the translated ones. (I1)

DA54/422 The disciples do not yet comprehend the scene; but they rejoice that the patient Teacher, the meek and lowly One, who has wandered to and fro a helpless stranger, is honored by the favored ones of heaven. [M/97/158] (I2)

2SP58/330 For a brief space the disciples behold their Lord glorified and exalted before their eyes, and honored by the radiant beings whom they recognize as the favored ones of God. [M/97/158] (I2)

97a.8 Now, our idea of the transfiguration is simply that this was a type of Christ's second advent; so that what was exhibited in miniature on Tabor, that august scene in unmeasured magnificence hath yet to overawe this congregation. We principally ground this upon the sayings of Christ, which in all the three accounts of the evangelists, immediately precede the account of the Transfiguration: "Verily, I say unto you, there be some standing here which shall not taste death till they see the Son of man coming in his Kingdom." [Melvill, S(43)]

97/158 This meek and lowly Jesus, who, for two years and a half had been going to and fro a homeless wanderer through all Judaea, is disclosed on the holy mount as the son of the Highest, to whom the patriarchs and prophets of the olden time render homage, in whom the mighty spirits of the blessed world recognize their King. [March, WHJ]

DA55/422 They believe that Elijah has come to announce the Messiah's reign, and that the kingdom of Christ is about to be set up on the earth. [F/5/182] (P2)

2SP59/330+ They believe that Elias has now come, according to prophecy, and the kingdom of Christ is to be set up on earth. [F/5/182] (P2)

DA56/422 The memory of their fear and disappointment they would banish forever. (I1)

DA57/422 Here, where the glory of God is revealed, they long to tarry. (I1)

DA58/422 Peter exclaims, "Master, it is good for us to be here: and let us make three tabernacles; one for Thee, and one for Moses, and one for Elias." (B2)

2SP60/331 Even in the first glow of his amazement, Peter plans for accommodating Christ and the ancient worthies. [M/81/156] [F/1/183] (P2)

DA59/422 The disciples are confident that Moses and Elijah have been sent to protect their Master, and to establish His authority as king. (I1)

DA60/422 But before the crown must come the cross. [M/8/145] (P2)

DA61/422 Not the inauguration of Christ as king, but the decease to be accomplished at Jerusalem, is the subject of their conference with Jesus. [M/102/159] (I2)

DA62/422 Bearing the weakness of humanity, and burdened with its sorrow and sin, Jesus walked alone in the midst of men. (I1)

5/182 This disciple imagined that Jesus had now assumed his proper dignity, that Elias was come, according to Malachi's prediction, and the Messiah's kingdom was at length begun. [Fleetwood, LC]

81/156 And these ancient worthies are fully aware of the awful tragedy to be accomplished at Jerusalem, the announcement of which from the lips of their Master had so greatly tasked their faith and afflicted their hearts. [March WHJ]

1/183 Accordingly, he thought it was necessary to provide some accommodation for his Master and his august assistants, . . . [Fleetwood, LC]

8/145 The cross was borne by the king, that his redeemed subjects might share his crown. [March WHJ]

172.5 Let us build **three tabernacles** where we may live and worship for ever." He would, like most of us, have the crown without the cross. [Cumming, SR-Mt]

102/159 The decease, which Christ was to accomplish at Jerusalem, was already known to the inhabitants of heaven. [March, WHJ]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA63/422 As the darkness of the coming trial pressed upon Him, He was in loneliness of spirit, in a world that knew Him not. (I1)

DA64/422 Even His loved disciples, absorbed in their own doubt and sorrow and ambitious hopes, had not comprehended the mystery of His mission. (I1)

DA65/422 He had dwelt amid the love and fellowship of heaven; but in the world He had created, He was in solitude. (I1)

DA66/422 Now heaven had sent its messengers to Jesus; not angels, but men who had endured suffering and sorrow, and who could sympathize with the Saviour in the trial of His earthly life. [N/42.2] (P2)

DA67/422 Moses and Elijah had been colaborers with Christ. (I1)

DA68/422 They had shared his longing for the salvation of men. (I1)

DA69/422 Moses had pleaded for Israel: "Yet now, if Thou wilt forgive their sin--; and if not, blot me, I pray Thee, out of Thy book which Thou hast written." Ex. 32:32. (B2)

DA70/422+ Elijah had known loneliness of spirit, as for three years and a half of famine he had borne the burden of the nation's hatred and its woe. (I1)

DA71/425 Alone he had stood for God upon Mount Carmel. (I1)

DA72/425 Alone he had fled to the desert in anguish and despair. (I1)

DA73/425 These men, chosen above every angel around the throne, had come to commune with Jesus concerning the scenes of his suffering, and to comfort Him with the assurance of the sympathy of heaven. (I1)

240.6 Since He could not speak even to His own disciples of His great death, how welcome it must have been for Him to commune with Moses and Elias, who could speak of it with the calm wisdom and satisfying sympathy of Heaven! [Nicol1, LC]

242.1 We know from other parts of the gospel what solace our Lord found in the sympathy of heaven. Though Pharisees might frown and jeer when sinners were saved, there were mirth and music in the presence of the angels of God. Here He was not ministered to by angels. Those who spoke to Him knew more than angels could of His sorrow in His work, and of the meaning of death. Still it is the sympathy of heaven that is here given as a cordial to help Him on. [Nicol1, LC]

[Cf. DA66/422 and Nicol1, LC above]

DA74/425 The hope of the world, the salvation of every human being, was the burden of their interview. (11)

DA75/425 Through being overcome with sleep, the disciples heard little of what passed between Christ and the heavenly messengers. [F/2/182] (P3)

2SP55/330 By permitting themselves to be so overcome by sleep, the disciples had lost the conversation between the Heavenly messengers and the glorified Redeemer. [F/2/182] (P2)

DA76/425 Failing to watch and pray, they had not received that which God desired to give them,--a knowledge of the sufferings of Christ, and the glory that should follow. (11)

DA77/425 They lost the blessing that might have been theirs through sharing His self-sacrifice. (11)

DA78/425 Slow of heart to believe were these disciples, little appreciative of the treasure with which Heaven sought to enrich them. (11)

DA79/425 Yet they received great light. (11)

DA80/425 They were assured that all heaven knew of the sin of the Jewish nation in rejecting Christ. (11)

DA81/425 They were given a clearer insight into the work of the Redeemer. (11)

DA82/425 They saw with their eyes and heard with their ears things that were beyond the comprehension of man. (11)

DA83/425 They were "eyewitnesses of His majesty" (2 Peter 1:16), and they realized that Jesus was indeed the Messiah, to whom patriarchs and prophets had witnessed, and that He was recognized as such by the heavenly universe. [M/97/158] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - SOURCES

2/182 The disciples, it seems, did not see the beginning of this transfiguration; happening to fall asleep at the time of prayer, they lost that pleasure, together with a great part of the conversation which these two prophets held with the only-begotten Son of God. [Fleetwood, LC]

97/158 [Jesus] is disclosed on the holy mount as the son of the Highest, to whom the patriarchs and prophets of the olden time render homage, in whom the mighty spirits of the blessed world recognize their King. [March WHJ]

DA84/425 While they were still gazing on the scene upon the mount, "a bright cloud overshadowed them: and behold a voice out of the cloud, which said, This is My beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased; hear ye Him." (B2)

DA85/425 As they beheld the cloud of glory, brighter than that which went before the tribes of Israel in the wilderness; as they heard the voice of God speak in awful majesty that caused the mountain to tremble, the disciples fell smitten to the earth. [M/86,90/157] (P1)

2SP66/331 When the disciples beheld the awful cloud of glory, brighter than that which went before the tribes of Israel in the wilderness, and when they heard the voice of God peal from the cloud, in accents of majesty that caused the mount to tremble as if shaken from its foundation, they could not endure the grandeur that oppressed their senses, and fell smitten to the ground. [M/86,90/157] (P1)

DA86/425 They remained prostrate, their faces hidden, till Jesus came near, and touched them, dispelling their fears with His well-known voice, "Arise, and be not afraid." [H/42-44/332] (P1)

2SP67/331 Thus they remained upon their faces, not daring to look up, till Jesus approached and raised them from the ground, dispelling their fears with his well-known, cheering voice, saying, "Arise, and be not afraid." [F/9/183] (P1)

DA87/425 Venturing to lift up their eyes, they saw that the heavenly glory had passed away, the forms of Moses and Elijah had disappeared. [H/46/332] (P2)

DA88/425 They were upon the mount, alone with Jesus. [H/46/332] (P1)

2SP71/336 In a brief space of time the favored disciples had beheld the extremes of glory and of grief. [M/169.3] (I2)

86,90/157 And while he is yet speaking, the awful cloud of the Shechinah's glory that went before the tribes in the wilderness, overshadows them, and out of the cloud comes the divine voice which had spoken from the tabernacle of Moses and from the temple of Solomon. . . . When the disciples, smitten to the ground by the terror of "the voice from the excellent glory," lift up their eyes again, they see no man but Jesus only. [March, WHJ]

42-44/332 Jesus comes, touches them. The touch restores their strength. He says, "Arise, and be not afraid." [Hanna, LC]

9/183 . . . they fell on their faces, and continued in that posture till Jesus approached, raised them up, and dispelled their fears, saying unto them, "Arise, and be not afraid." [Fleetwood, LC]

46/332 The voices have ceased, the forms have vanished, the glory is gone; they are alone with Jesus as at the first. [Hanna, LC]

169.3 These two utmost extremes of glory and of grief, the heavenly transfiguration and the earthly toil and sorrow, etc. March, WHJ]

2SP72/336 Jesus, descending the mount where he had been transfigured by the glory of God, where he had talked with the messengers of Heaven, and been proclaimed the Son of God by the Father's voice issuing from the radiant glory, meets a revolting spectacle, a lunatic child, with countenance distorted, gnashing its teeth in spasms of agony which no mortal could relieve. [M/170.3] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 46 - SOURCES

170.3 At the foot of the mount is seen the lunatic child, with distorted and deathlike countenance, gnashing his teeth and convulsed with agony; [March WHJ]

He Was Transfigured

Analysis

Ellen White covers the story of the transfiguration in one of the shortest chapters of her life of Christ. The 88 sentences of chapter 46 form 89 units of evaluation since we divided sentence 3 into two parts. According to our study 48 sentences have been identified as Ellen White's own work and three sentences involve biblical quotations. It is possible that some of these sentences were influenced by a literary source according to our source analysis.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Table 1 on page 424 shows that Ellen White used a literary source for 38 of the 89 sentences we list for chapter 46. These dependent sentences measured out as either Strict Paraphrase (15) or Simple Paraphrase (11) for the most part. Eight units were rated as showing Partial Independence and two sentences met the criteria for Verbatim and Loose Paraphrase. According to the value we have arbitrarily placed on these varying degrees of dependency, the overall dependency of the entire chapter is 1.64. When only the actual dependent sentences are tallied the average rate of dependency is 3.7. In terms of percentage, 54 percent of the chapter's contents is independent and 43 percent dependent.

These dependent sentences are to be attributed largely to the work of one literary source. A synopsis of the literary parallels located for chapter 46 appears in Table 2

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 46

Ellen White Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. DA	V1 Strict Verbatim	00	02	11	15	02	00	08	48	03	89
	V2 Verbatim										
	P1 Strict Paraphrase										
	P2 Simple Paraphrase										
	P3 Loose Paraphrase										
	B1 Source Bible										
	I2 Partial Independence										
	I1 Strict Independence										
	B2 Bible										
02. 2SP		00	02	09	07	00	01	08	02	00	29
TOTALS PRE-DA		00	02	09	07	00	01	08	(02)	(00)	29

He Was Transfigured

on page 426. The Walks and Homes of Jesus by Daniel March furnished 30 of the 38 parallels with the remaining eight scattered among Cumming's commentary on Matthew and three lives of Christ.¹

A few sentences of chapter 46 exhibited verbal parallels with sources known to have been used by Ellen White elsewhere in the composition of DA but nevertheless were not rated as dependent. Sentences 49 and 53 of DA contained verbal similarities when compared to a few sentences from Henry Melvill's sermon on "The Transfiguration," preached in 1834.² The content, however, was so common and the parallel terms so typical of commentary on this topic that literary dependency did not appear conclusive. We have listed the quotations from Melvill nevertheless and have included the underlining. The reader can judge for him-/herself as to dependency.

Other examples where we have included possible parallels without evaluation may be found in connection with DA28 where we quote from George Jones;³ DA60 where a sentence from John Cumming's life is very close to the

¹The lives of Christ by John Fleetwood and William Hanna have been discussed in the earlier chapters of this study. W. Robertson Nicoll's work was introduced in the opening section of this chapter. March covers much of the same ground in his chapter on "The Holy Mount," The Days of the Son of Man (New York: A. D. F. Randolph, 1881). His revisions clearly show, however, that Ellen White here is dependent on Walks and Homes of Jesus.

²Henry Melvill, Miscellaneous Sermons, Vol. I (London: "The Pulpit" Office, Glasshouse Yard, 1843).

³George Jones, Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels, 3rd ed. (Philadelphia: J. C. Garrigues & Co., 1868).

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 46

Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
TEXT	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Partial Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
01. Bible									03	03
02. Cumming SR-Mc	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
03. Fleetwood LC	00	00	00	01	01	00	00	00	00	02
04. Hanna LC	00	00	02	02	00	00	00	00	00	04
05. March WHJ	00	02	09	10	01	00	08	00	00	30
06. Nicoll LC	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
TOTALS DA Text	00	02	11	15	02	00	08	—	(03)	41

He Was Transfigured

parallel we list from March; and DA66 where a second quote from Nicoll is left without evaluation.

A close scrutiny of such similarities between the various accounts being compared will clearly reveal the complexity of literary comparison, especially if one wants to avoid "parallelomania" (seeing parallels where none really exist). The situation is further complicated when you add the biblical text and Ellen White's earlier comment(s). Take for example DA86 and 2SP67 which follows immediately. The early text shows a greater degree of dependency upon Fleetwood than does the later DA text if you discount the addition of "touched them." In both sentences the Bible is also being quoted briefly. The only gospel to report these words of Jesus is Matthew. But Matthew is also the only evangelist to record that Jesus "touched them," an expression not found in Fleetwood.

We know that Ellen White is using the Bible in this chapter as well as Hanna and Fleetwood. March does not elaborate on this detail of the story. We also know that she is working with her earlier material. Now how are all these sources to be separated out so that we may with some degree of confidence identify the one source behind this particular sentence? Our solution was to indicate by including 2SP67 that Ellen White is reworking her earlier text which used Fleetwood and adding some detail from Hanna. We therefore list the special source for DA86 as Hanna. Ellen White would not have needed to use the Bible here

He Was Transfigured

because we have no independent biblical quotation and the Bible is already being quoted by Hanna. The fact that Ellen White uses Hanna in the following two sentences, DA87 and 88, would appear to confirm our choice of Hanna over the Bible for the source of DA86.

We readily admit that the evidence is not above confutation. We only argue that if we are limited to using one source for each sentence except where that seems impossible,¹ the more likely solution was the Hanna option.

We have already pointed out above that this chapter is largely based on chapter XXVIII of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II.² Our analysis of the dependent sentences of this earlier writing revealed that March's Walks and Homes of Jesus is the major literary source. Our tabulation presented in Table 3, page 429, lists 23 parallels from March and four from Fleetwood and Hanna. We have not evaluated all 77 sentences of the earlier text but those included in our analysis usually rate the same as or higher than the DA text when it comes to literary dependency. We have listed in Table 4, page 430 those where the content is similar enough to allow this kind of comparison. There are exceptions, however, as the second section of the table shows.

In several of the previous chapters of our study we have included a table listing the parallel sentences between

¹Cf. 2SP60 following DA58.

²See page 406.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 46

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
		VL Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Partial Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. EGM		00	00	00	00	00	00	00	02	00	02
02. Fleetwood LC		00	00	01	02	00	00	00	00	00	03
03. Hanna, LC		00	00	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	01
04. March WHJ		00	02	08	05	00	00	08	00	00	23
TOTALS Pre-DA		00	02	09	07	00	01	08	02	(00)	29

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 46

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt.	Eval.	Pre- <u>DA</u>	Eval.
01. -	<u>DA 1/419</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP 20/326</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
02. -	<u>DA 32/421</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>2SP 40/328</u>	<u>V2</u>	_____	_____
03. -	<u>DA 33/421</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP 41/328</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
04. -	<u>DA 36/421</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>2SP 44/328</u>	<u>P2</u>	_____	_____
05. -	<u>DA 55/422</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>2SP 59/330</u>	<u>P2</u>	_____	_____
06. -	<u>DA 75/425</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>2SP 55/330</u>	<u>P2</u>	_____	_____
07. -	<u>DA 85/425</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>2SP 66/331</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____
08. -	<u>DA 86/425</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>2SP 67/331</u>	<u>P1</u>	_____	_____

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01. -	<u>DA 2/419</u>	<u>V2</u>	<u>2SP 22/326</u>	<u>I2</u>	_____	_____
02. -	<u>DA12,13/419</u>	<u>P1,P2</u>	<u>2SP 30/327</u>	<u>I2</u>	_____	_____

the DA text and the earlier writings of Ellen White used in the composition of the later DA text. That data for this chapter may be found under Table A on page 432.

This dependency of the DA text on earlier materials from the pen of Ellen White, particularly The Spirit of Prophecy, should not surprise us. In a letter to W. C. White, Marian Davis, Ellen White's major literary assistant for the production of The Desire of Ages, wrote:

Whatever plan we follow, there is much work to be done if the book [Desire of Ages] is finished at all as it should be. Considering that the very cream has been taken from a large part of the old book [The Spirit of Prophecy], and has been put into everybody's hands, it seems a pity that this new work should have nothing fresh for many of its most important chapters. It seems a pity too, that the most important part of the book should be the part to be hurried and slighted. Again, the chapters as they stand in the old book need a thorough revision and rearrangement for the new. You know what criticisms this will excite. If we can add fresh matter it will help the case. I do not write these things to complain of difficulties, but because I think, so far as possible, we should understand the situation just as it is.¹

It is clear from this comment of Marian Davis and from the general introduction to this investigation that the objectives in producing this new life of Christ included both the necessities of including the old material and adding "fresh matter." The writers also recognized the need for a "rearrangement" of the chapters.

The comparison provided by Table A reveals that the intentions for the new publication are supported by the evidence from chapter 46. We have also included a few

¹Marian Davis letter to Elder W. C. White, August 9, 1897.

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 46

	<u>2SP</u>	<u>DA</u>		<u>2SP</u>	<u>DA</u>
001.	[1-19]	Chapt. 45	046.	58	(54)
002.	20	(1) ¹	047.	59	(55)
003.	21-25	(2,3)	048.		56
004.	26	(4)	049.		57
005.	27	(5)	050.	60	(58)
006.	28	6	051.	62,63	(59)
007.		7	052.	64	(60)
008.		8	053.		61
009.		9	054.		62
010.		10	055.		63
011.		11	056.		64
012.	29,30	(12,13)	057.		65
013.		14	058.	46	(66)
014.		15	059.		67
015.	31	16,17	060.		68
016.	32	18	061.		69
017.	33	(19)	062.	47	(70-72)
018.	34	(20)	063.		
019.		21	064.		
020.		22	065.	45,46	(73)
021.		23	066.		74
022.	35	(24,25)	067.	55	(75)
023.	36	(26)	068.		76
024.	37		069.		77
025.	38	(27)	070.		78
026.		28	071.		79
027.	39,57	(29-31)	072.		80
028.	40	(32)	073.		81
029.	41	33	074.		82
030.	42	(34)	075.		83
031.	43	(35)	076.	65,76	(84)
032.	44,45	(36)	077.	66	(85)
033.		37	078.	67	(86)
034.	49,51a	(38)	079.	68	(87,88)
035.		39	080.		88
036.		40	081.	[69-73]	Chapt. 47
037.	51b	(41)	082.		
038.	52	(42)	083.		
039.		43	084.		
040.	53	(44)	085.		
041.	54	(45,46)	086.		
042.	77	(47-49)	087.		
043.		50	088.		
044.		51	089.		
045.	74,75	(52,53)	090.		

¹Parentheses indicate modification of earlier text form.

He Was Transfigured

verses from the opening and closing of the SP chapter on the transfiguration to show how the arrangement of the chapter differs in the two books on the life of Christ. We also added some sentences from the opening of March's chapter to show that Ellen White was following the thought development of March even when she departs from him in the literary expression. Of course it should also be recognized that both writers are following the general line of Matthew's narration of the events leading up to the transfiguration.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The only major treatment of the transfiguration of Jesus not used as source material for chapter 46 and written earlier than the DA text is found in Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I, chapter VI. We did not find that Ellen White used literary sources in writing the 51 sentences of the SG material on the topic under consideration.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The arrangement of chapter 46 follows the general outline of Luke's gospel for the transfiguration story. The introduction and closing of the earlier SP text have been omitted and in a few places the basic order of the major portion of the account varies from the former commentary as Table A reveals.

Hanna does not develop the narrative in chapter XVI of his life of Christ. He first presents the basic story and

He Was Transfigured

then raises a series of questions which he then proceeds to answer. Only occasionally did his work serve the interests of Ellen White.

From Appendix A we may note that March is used heavily in the first 36 sentences of the DA text. The sentences from March appear in approximately the same order as they exist in his text. But this agreement is largely due to the nature of the content which follows the biblical narrative. In these sentences we read of Christ's going up the mountain with His disciples (1-11), His praying (12-26), the transfiguration (27-31), and the disciples awaking to see the glorious sight (32-36).

At this juncture Ellen White begins to elaborate on the text. She comments on the life and work of Moses and Elijah (37-49), the meaning of their appearance with reference to Christ's second coming (50-53), the misunderstanding of the disciples (54-60), the real purpose of the appearance of the Old Testament worthies (61-84), and then wraps up the story with the testimony of the Father and the resulting fright of the apostles (84-88).

We therefore conclude that the redaction of chapter 46 is the work of Ellen White and Marian Davis. Of course the earlier SP text also played a role in the chapter arrangement even if its order needed revision.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The only pre-DA text of Ellen White treating the

He Was Transfigured

transfiguration was her coverage in Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II. Our studies show that Ellen White should be credited with the structuring of this earlier text. Appendices B and C show that source parallels influenced 27 of the 77 sentences of the SP text on the transfiguration. The remaining 50 sentences, or 65% of the chapter, give Ellen White plenty of room to stamp her individuality on the basic form of the chapter. We would not want to rule out the influence of March on the general limits of the SP account. We have already indicated above that the transfiguration story in 2SP begins and ends as does the account of March in Walks and Homes of Jesus.

We draw our analysis to a close with a brief reference to the chapter's content and literary dependency. The dependent sentences are heaviest in the narrative sections. The sources appear to be most helpful in the descriptive areas. Ellen White departs from the use of sources in her development of the appearance of Moses and Elijah and in her comments on the real purpose of the revelation. It is not that she is always independent when developing the discursive sections. It is just more likely that the majority of her independent work will be found in such passages.

One interesting departure from March occurs in DA27. March uses the qualification "as if" when referring to the opening of the golden gates of heaven. Ellen White declares that "the golden gates are thrown wide."

He Was Transfigured

Ellen White's text often distills the essence from the descriptive material of the source and allows the action of the narrative to move more swiftly. One example of this concise treatment is found in DA7 and DA8 when compared to March49/151. The duplication is avoided and the description is kept crisp and free of too many details.

Summary

Chapter 46 is short and specifically limited to the transfiguration episode in the life of Christ. The opening sentence takes Jesus and the three disciples, Peter, James, and John to an unidentified mountain. After 87 additional sentences the story closes with the same four on the mountain. The return trip to the valley floor and the healing of the boy with an "unclean spirit" are left to chapter 47.

Our study of this brief account by Ellen White yields the following data.

1. There are no extant handwritten or even typescript manuscripts of chapter 46.

2. The only earlier writings Marian Davis could have located for developing a new chapter on this topic was chapter VI of Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I and chapter XXVIII of Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II. The two earlier accounts involved together 40 sentences more than the 88 sentences of the DA text. Since the transfiguration chapter is only eleven sentences longer in DA than in 2SP we can hardly

He Was Transfigured

speak of an expansion of the story, particularly when the tendency of the DA text is toward shorter sentences. There are only nine more source parallels in the DA text than are to be found in the SP text. The question of expansion is more aptly applied to the enlarged SP text over the former SG text, than to the DA text. The SP account took 26 additional sentences and shows 27 literary parallels when compared to the SG text of 51 sentences and no literary parallels. The actual transfiguration narrative is much expanded in SP over the eleven verses of SG and the source parallels are heaviest in this section. The comments on Moses and Elijah are fewer in the SP account than in the earlier SG chapter on the transfiguration.

3. The DA text is limited strictly to the story of the transfiguration. The SP chapter includes content that in the DA account is covered by chapters 45 and 47. Chapter 46 is definitely a revision and rearrangement of the earlier text of SP.

4. There are no significant differences in the content of the DA text when compared to the earlier material apart from the fact that the SP text does not limit itself to the transfiguration experience.

5. We found 43 percent of the 89 sentences,¹ or 38 sentences, exhibiting some degree of literary dependency.

6. After excluding the three quotations from the Bible

¹Chapter 46 has 88 sentences, but sentence 3 was divided into two parts making a total of 89 evaluation units.

He Was Transfigured

we evaluated 48 sentences, or 54 percent of the chapter, as independent.

7. According to the evaluation scale for literary dependency the average rate of dependency for the 38 sentences involving parallels was 3.7. When all sentences are included in the evaluation the average dependency rate dropped to 1.6.

8. The main literary source used in the composition of this chapter was Walks and Homes of Jesus by Daniel March. It was used in 30 of the 41 dependent sentences.

9. Some limited use was made in chapter 46 of four writers other than March. Hanna's Life of Christ furnished four parallels, Fleetwood's The Life of our Lord and Saviour supplied two, and Cumming's Sabbath Readings - Matthew and Nicoll's life of Christ, The Incarnate Saviour, each provided one.

10. The SP chapter on the transfiguration also depended on March's Walks and Homes of Jesus for 23 of its parallels. A few sentences were dependent on the lives of Christ written by John Fleetwood and William Hanna.

11. Since the content of the DA text is for the most part a revision of the SP account it is not surprising to find the same sources being used in generally the same way. The earlier text is often found to be either equal to or more dependent than the later DA text. We also found parallels in the DA text not present in the earlier account. Ellen White must have returned to the same source used

He Was Transfigured

earlier when writing the new revision.

12. Dependent and independent sentences appear to treat the same content. No type of content can be ruled out as a possible candidate for exhibiting literary dependency. This chapter did show more dependency, however, in the descriptive sentences than in the discursive comment.

13. The literary arrangement of chapter 46 appears to follow the general pattern of the Lukan account. Ellen White elaborates on the meaning of the experience for Jesus and His disciples more so and in a different way than do the sources. She draws lessons which were meaningful for Christ and for the disciples. The reader must identify with the disciples to obtain the lesson. March, on the other hand, more directly relates the lessons to the spiritual experience of the reader.

14. The outer limits of the chapter on the transfiguration in 2SP agree with March. Both begin with the confession of Peter, the announcement of the passion, and then come to the story of the transfiguration. Both end with reference to the healing miracle at the foot of the mountain following the transfiguration. The SP account differs in omitting the long section on spiritual lessons to be drawn from the story but otherwise is close to March on the transfiguration itself. This similarity in reporting the basic story is perhaps due to both writers' following Scripture rather than to Ellen White's using the order of March.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 46

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	M/34,40/149,150	P2	049. -		I1
002. -	March WHJ/46/150	V2	050. -		I1
003a. -	March WHJ/47/150	P1	051. -		I1
003b. -	March WHJ/48/150	P1	052. -		I1
004. -	March WHJ/42/150	P1	053. -		I1
005. -	March WHJ/55/152	P2	054. -	March WHJ/97/158	I2
	(HannaLC/16,17/330)		055. -	Fleetwood LC/5/182	P2
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -	March WHJ/49/151	V2	057. -		I1
008. -	March WHJ/50/151	P1	058. -	Bible	B2
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -	March WHJ/51/151	P3	060. -	March WHJ/8/145	P2
011. -		I1	061. -	March WHJ/102/159	I2
012. -	March WHJ/67,68/154	P2	062. -		I1
013. -	March WHJ/71/154	P1	063. -		I1
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -		I1
016. -	March WHJ/66/154	I2	066. -	Nicoll/ISLJC/42.2	P2
017. -		I1	067. -		I1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -	March WHJ/68/154	I2	069. -		I1
020. -	March WHJ/70,71/154	I2	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -	Cumming SR-Mt/163.9	P2	073. -		I1
024. -	March WHJ/72/155	P2	074. -		I1
025. -	March WHJ/72/155	P2	075. -	Fleetwood LC/2/182	P3
026. -	March WHJ/73/155	P1	076. -		I1
027. -	March WHJ/74,75/155	P2	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -	March WHJ/75,76/155	P2	079. -		I1
030. -	March WHJ/75/155	P2	080. -		I1
031. -	March WHJ/76/155	I2	081. -		I1
032. -	March WHJ/77/155	P1	082. -		I1
033. -	March WHJ/78/155	P2	083. -	March WHJ/97/158	P1
034. -	March WHJ/78/155	I2	084. -	Bible	B2
035. -	Hanna LC/30/331	P2	085. -	March WHJ/86,90/157	P1
036. -	March WHJ/79/155	I2	086. -	Hanna LC/42-44/332	P1
037. -		I1	087. -	Hanna LC/46/332	P2
038. -		I1	088. -	Hanna LC/46/332	P1
039. -		I1	089. -		
040. -	Bible	B2	090. -		
041. -		I1	091. -		
042. -		I1	092. -		
043. -		I1	093. -		
044. -		I1	094. -		
045. -		I1	095. -		
046. -		I1	096. -		
047. -		I1	097. -		
048. -		I1	098. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 46

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	2SP 4/324+	V2	—	051.	-	—	—	—
002.	-	2SP 8/325	P1	—	052.	-	—	—	—
003.	-	2SP 9/325	P1	—	053.	-	—	—	—
004.	-	2SP 14/325+	P1	—	054.	-	—	—	—
005.	-	2SP 16/326	I2	—	055.	-	—	—	—
006.	-	2SP 18/326	P2	—	056.	-	—	—	—
007.	-	2SP 19/326	P2	—	057.	-	—	—	—
008.	-	2SP 20/326	P1	1	058.	-	—	—	—
009.	-	2SP 22/326	I2	2	059.	-	—	—	—
010.	-	2SP 23/326	P1	3b	060.	-	—	—	—
011.	-	2SP 24/326	I2	3b	061.	-	—	—	—
012.	-	2SP 30/327	I2	12	062.	-	—	—	—
013.	-	2SP 39/328	P2	31	063.	-	—	—	—
014.	-	2SP 40/328	V2	32	064.	-	—	—	—
015.	-	2SP 41/328	P1	33	065.	-	—	—	—
016.	-	2SP 56/330	P1	33	066.	-	—	—	—
017.	-	2SP 37/328	Bl	35	067.	-	—	—	—
018.	-	2SP 44/328	P2	36	068.	-	—	—	—
019.	-	2SP 45/329	I2	36	069.	-	—	—	—
020.	-	2SP 74/336	I1	52	070.	-	—	—	—
021.	-	2SP 75/336	I1	52	071.	-	—	—	—
022.	-	2SP 58/330	I2	54	072.	-	—	—	—
023.	-	2SP 59/330+	P2	55	073.	-	—	—	—
024.	-	2SP 60/331	P2	58	074.	-	—	—	—
025.	-	2SP 55/330	P2	75	075.	-	—	—	—
026.	-	2SP 66/331	P1	85	076.	-	—	—	—
027.	-	2SP 67/331	P1	86	077.	-	—	—	—
028.	-	2SP 71/336	I2	88	078.	-	—	—	—
029.	-	2SP 72/336	I2	88	079.	-	—	—	—
030.	-	—	—	—	080.	-	—	—	—
031.	-	—	—	—	081.	-	—	—	—
032.	-	—	—	—	082.	-	—	—	—
033.	-	—	—	—	083.	-	—	—	—
034.	-	—	—	—	084.	-	—	—	—
035.	-	—	—	—	085.	-	—	—	—
036.	-	—	—	—	086.	-	—	—	—
037.	-	—	—	—	087.	-	—	—	—
038.	-	—	—	—	088.	-	—	—	—
039.	-	—	—	—	089.	-	—	—	—
040.	-	—	—	—	090.	-	—	—	—
041.	-	—	—	—	091.	-	—	—	—
042.	-	—	—	—	092.	-	—	—	—
043.	-	—	—	—	093.	-	—	—	—
044.	-	—	—	—	094.	-	—	—	—
045.	-	—	—	—	095.	-	—	—	—
046.	-	—	—	—	096.	-	—	—	—
047.	-	—	—	—	097.	-	—	—	—
048.	-	—	—	—	098.	-	—	—	—
049.	-	—	—	—	099.	-	—	—	—
050.	-	—	—	—	100.	-	—	—	—

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 46

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	2SP 4/324+	M/16/146+	050.	-		
002.	-	2SP 8/325	M/22/147	051.	-		
003.	-	2SP 9/325	M/23/147	052.	-		
004.	-	2SP 14/325+	M/27/148	053.	-		
005.	-	2SP 16/326	M/28/148	054.	-		
006.	-	2SP 18/326	M/32/148	055.	-		
007.	-	2SP 19/326	M/33/148+	056.	-		
008.	-	2SP 20/326	M/37,40/150	057.	-		
009.	-	2SP 22/326	M/46,39/150	058.	-		
010.	-	2SP 23/326	M/48/150	059.	-		
011.	-	2SP 24/326	M/46,39/150	060.	-		
012.	-	2SP 30/327	M/68,71/154	061.	-		
013.	-	2SP 39/328	M/75,76/155	062.	-		
014.	-	2SP 40/328	M/77/155	063.	-		
015.	-	2SP 41/328	M/78/155	064.	-		
016.	-	2SP 56/330	M/82/156	065.	-		
017.	-	2SP 37/328	H/30/331	066.	-		
018.	-	2SP 44/328	M/79/155	067.	-		
019.	-	2SP 45/329	M/79/155+	068.	-		
020.	-	2SP 74/336		069.	-		
021.	-	2SP 75/336		070.	-		
022.	-	2SP 58/330	M/97/158	071.	-		
023.	-	2SP 59/330+	F/5/182	072.	-		
024.	-	2SP 60/331	M/81/156	073.	-		
			(F/1/183)	074.	-		
025.	-	2SP 55/330	F/2/182	075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 66/331	M/86,90/157	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 67/331	F/9/183	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 71/336	M/169.3	078.	-		
029.	-	2SP 72/336	M/170.3	079.	-		
030.	-			080.	-		
031.	-			081.	-		
032.	-			082.	-		
033.	-			083.	-		
034.	-			084.	-		
035.	-			085.	-		
036.	-			086.	-		
037.	-			087.	-		
038.	-			088.	-		
039.	-			089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		

In her chapter on "Blessing the Children" Ellen White highlights one of the incidents on the journey of Jesus from Galilee, through Perea, to Jerusalem. The long trip which Luke alone covers is first presented in overview in chapter 53, the previous chapter in our study. One of the parables told on the journey, "The Good Samaritan," is the subject of chapter 54. The question of the Pharisees on the coming of the kingdom of God becomes the topic of chapter 55, a short work of 82 sentences based on Luke's comments in Luke 17:20ff. Chapter 56 on the children being blessed by Jesus is treated in Luke 18:15-17 and the next DA chapter on the rich young ruler corresponds to the verses immediately following in Luke 18:18-23.¹

The little story on the mothers bringing their children to Jesus is lifted out of a series of incidents on a long journey and given special significance in the DA text. The earlier narratives on the life of Christ as contained in Spiritual Gifts and Spirit of Prophecy do not mention this event.

Chapter 56 appears to have been written specifically for the DA text. The previous writings of Ellen White do not contain one article on the blessing of the children. She does refer to the episode in a variety of articles on the topic of motherhood. Some of these earlier references

¹Cf. Mark 10:13-16 and 17-22; Matthew 19:13-15 and Matthew 19:16-22.

Blessing the Children

are fragmentary, consisting of a thought or two paralleling a comment now found expressed at times slightly differently in chapter 56.¹

No manuscripts were found in Ellen White's handwriting for the text of this chapter. There are a few manuscripts containing references to Jesus blessing the children. The earliest manuscript reference to the blessing of the children appears on page 8 of Manuscript 1, 1867. Further comment on the topic may be found in Manuscript 12, 1895, pages 11-13, Manuscript 27, 1896, pages 2 and 3, and in Letter S-31 of 1898, pages 2 and 3.

Most of Ellen White's earlier comments on the blessing of the children are to be found in her articles published in the Health Reformer.² Sentences 61-66 of chapter 56 are first found in HR Volume 31, #7, July, 1896, sentences 8-12 of "Self-Discipline Necessary to Parents." DA27-30, and DA35,36 appear in sentences 1, 2, 50-56 of "The Mother's Duty - Christ her Strength," Health Reformer, Vol. 12, No. 8 (Aug. 1877), pp. 234, 235. The same article was republished in ST, Vol. 3, No. 46 (Nov. 29, 1877). These particular sentences were also published later in ST, Vol. 12, No. 35 (Sept. 9, 1886) and elsewhere.³

¹Cf. 4T 141.9 (Testimony 26, 1876) with DA42,43; 4T 142.1+ with DA39,40; Gospel Workers (1892 ed.) 261.7 with DA4.

²The Health Reformer was first published in August of 1866 at The Western Health-Reform Institute, Battle Creek, Michigan. Our references are taken from Ellen G. White Health Reformer Articles, 2nd edition (Payson, Arizona: Leaves-of-Autumn Books, 1979).

³Cf. The Adventist Home (Nashville: Southern

Blessing the Children

Sentences 7-23 of the DA text were evidently taken from "The Christian Mother a Coworker with God," ST, April 9, 1896, sentences 9-28.

We have presented the relevant portions of these earlier articles in Appendix D. By comparing the parallels one can see how the DA text has either reproduced or modified the earlier material.

The text presentation of chapter 56 differs in format from the previous chapters of this study. The Ellen White text is presented on the page facing right. Except for one sentence, no source text has been included. The one source quotation from Geikie appears following sentence 5 and is marked off by two dotted horizontal lines.¹

Publishing Association, 1952), p. 204, and The Bible Echo, September 1, 1893, under "Cheering Words for Mothers."

¹The dotted lines indicate that the Ellen White text has been interrupted by the insertion of a source quotation.

DA1/511 JESUS was ever a lover of children. (11)

DA2/511 He accepted their childish sympathy and their open, unaffected love. (11)

DA3/511 The grateful praise from their pure lips was music in His ears, and refreshed His spirit when oppressed by contact with crafty and hypocritical men. (11)

DA4/511 Wherever the Saviour went, the benignity of His countenance, and His gentle, kindly manner won the love and confidence of children. (11)

DA5/511 Among the Jews it was customary for children to be brought to some rabbi, that he might lay his hands upon them in blessing; but the Saviour's disciples thought His work too important to be interrupted in this way. [G/645.5] (12)

.....

645.5 A beautiful custom led parents to bring their children at an early age to the Synagogue, that they might have the prayers and blessings of the elders. "After the father of the child," says the Talmud, "had laid his hands on his child's head, he led him to the elders, one by one, and they also blessed him, and prayed that he might grow up famous in the Law, faithful in marriage, and abundant in good works." Children were thus brought, also, to any Rabbi of special holiness, and hence they had been presented already more than once before Jesus. [Geikie, LC]

.....

DA6/511 When the mothers came to Him with their little ones, the disciples looked on them with disfavor. (11)

DA7/511 They thought these children too young to be benefited by a visit to Jesus, and concluded that He would be displeased at their presence. (11)

DA8/511 But it was the disciples with whom He was displeased. (11)

DA9/511 The Saviour understood the care and burden of the mothers who were seeking to train their children according to the word of God. (11)

DA10/511 He had heard their prayers. (11)

DA11/511 He Himself had drawn them into His presence. (11)

DA12/511 One mother with her child had left her home to find Jesus. (11)

DA13/511 On the way she told a neighbor her errand, and the neighbor wanted to have Jesus bless her children. (11)

DA14/511 Thus several mothers came together, with their little ones. (11)

DA15/511+ Some of the children had passed beyond the years of infancy to childhood and youth. (11)

DA16/512 When the mothers made known their desire, Jesus heard with sympathy the timid, tearful request. (11)

DA17/512 But He waited to see how the disciples would treat them. (11)

DA18/512 When He saw them send the mothers away, thinking to do Him a favor, He showed them their error, saying, "Suffer the little children to come unto Me, and forbid them not: for of such is the kingdom of God." (11)

DA19/512 He took the children in His arms, He laid His hands upon them, and gave them the blessing for which they came. (11)

DA20/512 The mothers were comforted. (11)

DA21/512 They returned to their homes strengthened and blessed by the words of Christ. (11)

DA22/512 They were encouraged to take up their burden with new cheerfulness, and to work hopefully for their children. (11)

DA23/512 The mothers of today are to receive His words with the same faith. (11)

DA24/512 Christ is as verily a personal Saviour today as when He lived a man among men. (11)

DA25/512 He is as verily the helper of mothers today as when He gathered the little ones to His arms in Judea. (11)

DA26/512 The children of our hearths are as much the purchase of His blood as were the children of long ago. (11)

DA27/512 Jesus knows the burden of every mother's heart. (11)

DA28/512 He who had a mother that struggled with poverty and privation sympathizes with every mother in her labors. (11)

DA29/512 He who made a long journey in order to relieve the anxious heart of a Canaanite woman will do as much for the mothers of today. (11)

DA30/512 He who gave back to the widow of Nain her only son, and who in His agony upon the cross remembered His own mother, is touched today by the mother's sorrow. (11)

DA31/512 In every grief and every need He will give comfort and help. (11)

DA32/512 Let mothers come to Jesus with their perplexities. (11)

DA33/512 They will find grace sufficient to aid them in the management of their children. (11)

DA34/512 The gates are open for every mother who would lay her burdens at the Saviour's feet. (11)

DA35/512 He who said, "Suffer the little children to come unto Me, and forbid them not," still invites the mothers to lead up their little ones to be blessed by Him. (11)

DA36/512 Even the babe in its mother's arms may dwell as under the shadow of the Almighty through the faith of the praying mother. (11)

DA37/512 John the Baptist was filled with the Holy Spirit from his birth. (11)

DA38/512 If we will live in communion with God, we too may expect the divine Spirit to mold our little ones, even from their earliest moments. (11)

DA39/512 In the children who were brought in contact with Him, Jesus saw the men and women who should be heirs of His grace and subjects of His kingdom, and some of whom would become martyrs for His sake. (11)

DA40/515 He knew that these children would listen to Him and accept Him as their Redeemer far more readily than would grown-up people, many of whom were the worldly-wise and hardhearted. (11)

DA41/515 In His teaching He came down to their level. (11)

DA42/515 He, the Majesty of heaven, did not disdain to answer their questions, and simplify His important lessons to meet their childish understanding. (11)

DA43/515 He planted in their minds the seeds of truth, which in after years would spring up, and bear fruit unto eternal life. (11)

DA44/515 It is still true that children are the most susceptible to the teachings of the gospel; their hearts are open to divine influences, and strong to retain the lessons received. (11)

DA45/515 The little children may be Christians, having an experience in accordance with their years. (11)

DA46/515 They need to be educated in spiritual things, and parents should give them every advantage, that they may form characters after the similitude of the character of Christ. (11)

DA47/515 Fathers and mothers should look upon their children as younger members of the Lord's family, committed to them to educate for heaven. (11)

DA48/515 The lessons that we ourselves learn from Christ we should give to our children, as the young minds can receive them, little by little opening to them the beauty of the principles of heaven. (11)

DA49/515 Thus the Christian home becomes a school, where the parents serve as underteachers, while Christ Himself is the chief instructor. (11)

DA50/515 In working for the conversion of our children, we should not look for violent emotion as the essential evidence of conviction of sin. (11)

DA51/515 Nor is it necessary to know the exact time when they are converted. (11)

DA52/515 We should teach them to bring their sins to Jesus, asking His forgiveness, and believing that He pardons and receives them as He received the children when He was personally on earth. (11)

DA53/515 As the mother teaches her children to obey her because they love her, she is teaching them the first lessons in the Christian life. (11)

DA54/515 The mother's love represents to the child the love of Christ, and the little ones who trust and obey their mother are learning to trust and obey the Saviour. (11)

DA55/515 Jesus was the pattern for children, and He was also the father's example. (11)

DA56/515 He spoke as one having authority, and His word was with power; yet in all His intercourse with rude and violent men He did not use one unkind or discourteous expression. (11)

DA57/515 The grace of Christ in the heart will impart a heaven-born dignity and sense of propriety. (11)

DA58/515 It will soften whatever is harsh, and subdue all that is coarse and unkind. (11)

DA59/515 It will lead fathers and mothers to treat their children as intelligent beings, as they themselves would like to be treated. (11)

DA60/516 Parents, in the training of your children, study the lessons that God has given in nature. (11)

DA61/516 If you would train a pink, or rose, or lily, how would you do it? (11)

DA62/516 Ask the gardener by what process he makes every branch and leaf to flourish so beautifully, and to develop in symmetry and loveliness. (11)

DA63/516 He will tell you that it was by no rude touch, no violent effort; for this would only break the delicate stems. (11)

DA64/516 It was by little attentions, often repeated. (11)

DA65/516 He moistened the soil, and protected the growing plants from the fierce blasts and from the scorching sun, and God caused them to flourish and to blossom into loveliness. (11)

DA66/516 In dealing with your children, follow the method of the gardener. (11)

DA67/516 By gentle touches, by loving ministrations, seek to fashion their characters after the pattern of the character of Christ. (11)

DA68/516 Encourage the expression of love toward God and toward one another. (11)

DA69/516 The reason why there are so many hardhearted men and women in the world is that true affection has been regarded as weakness, and has been discouraged and repressed. (11)

DA70/516 The better nature of these persons was stifled in childhood; and unless the light of divine love shall melt away their cold selfishness, their happiness will be forever ruined. (11)

DA71/516 If we wish our children to possess the tender spirit of Jesus, and the sympathy that angels manifest for us, we must encourage the generous, loving impulses of childhood. (11)

DA72/516 Teach the children to see Christ in nature. (11)

DA73/516 Take them out into the open air, under the noble trees, into the garden; and in all the wonderful works of creation teach them to see an expression of His love. (11)

DA74/516 Teach them that He made the laws which govern all living things, that He has made laws for us, and that these laws are for our happiness and joy. (11)

DA75/516+ Do not weary them with long prayers and tedious exhortations, but through nature's object lessons teach them obedience to the law of God. (11)

DA76/517 As you win their confidence in you as followers of Christ, it will be easy to teach them of the great love wherewith He has loved us. (11)

DA77/517 As you try to make plain the truths of salvation, and point the children to Christ as a personal Saviour, angels will be by your side. (11)

DA78/517 The Lord will give to fathers and mothers grace to interest their little ones in the precious story of the Babe of Bethlehem, who is indeed the hope of the world. (11)

DA79/517 When Jesus told the disciples not to forbid the children to come to Him, He was speaking to His followers in all ages,--to officers of the church, to ministers, helpers, and all Christians. (11)

DA80/517 Jesus is drawing the children, and He bids us, Suffer them to come; as if He would say, They will come if you do not hinder them. (11)

DA81/517 Let not your un-Christlike character misrepresent Jesus. (11)

DA82/517 Do not keep the little ones away from Him by your coldness and harshness. (11)

DA83/517 Never give them cause to feel that heaven will not be a pleasant place to them if you are there. (11)

DA84/517 Do not speak of religion as something that children cannot understand, or act as if they were not expected to accept Christ in their childhood. (11)

DA85/517 Do not give them the false impression that the religion of Christ is a religion of gloom, and that in coming to the Saviour they must give up all that makes life joyful. (11)

DA86/517 As the Holy Spirit moves upon the hearts of the children, co-operate with His work. (Il)

DA87/517 Teach them that the Saviour is calling them, that nothing can give Him greater joy than for them to give themselves to Him in the bloom and freshness of their years. (Il)

DA88/517 The Saviour regards with infinite tenderness the souls whom He has purchased with His own blood. (Il)

DA89/517 They are the claim of His love. (Il)

DA90/517 He looks upon them with unutterable longing. (Il)

DA91/517 His heart is drawn out, not only to the best-behaved children, but to those who have by inheritance objectionable traits of character. (Il)

DA92/517 Many parents do not understand how much they are responsible for these traits in their children. (Il)

DA93/517 They have not the tenderness and wisdom to deal with the erring ones whom they have made what they are. (Il)

DA94/517 But Jesus looks upon these children with pity. (Il)

DA95/517 He traces from cause to effect. (Il)

DA96/517 The Christian worker may be Christ's agent in drawing these children to the Saviour. (Il)

DA97/517 By wisdom and tact he may bind them to his heart, he may give them courage and hope, and through the grace of Christ may see them transformed in character, so that of them it may be said, "Of such is the kingdom of God." (Il)

Blessing the Children

Analysis

The 97 sentences of chapter 56 contain only one literary parallel according to our comparative study. Cunningham Geikie's work on the life of Christ probably furnished some background information on the Jewish custom of mothers bringing their children to be blessed by the rabbis. The majority of the sentences of this chapter comment on verses 15 and 16 of Luke 18. Ellen White extends the discussion beyond the limits of the two verses to give practical and spiritual counsel on the training and education of children. We have already noted under our introduction to chapter 56 that the earlier material used to develop this chapter came from various articles on the home and the Christian mother.

Hanna's narrative account of the life of Christ, a work often used by Ellen White, dedicates slightly more than two pages to this episode. His emphasis is on the displeasure of the disciples over this action of the Jewish mothers and about Jesus' statement on the nature of the kingdom of God.¹ Daniel March in Days of the Son of Man gives less than one page to report on this event. Farrar and Edersheim allow one page and John Fleetwood does not mention the story.

We can hardly expect Ellen White to have used the typical literary sources for this chapter that we find utilized elsewhere in the DA text. The sources she

¹Luke 18:17.

Blessing the Children

generally used did not discuss the incident to any great length and the few remarks they did make did not cover the perspectives she wanted to address. Ellen White's feminine point of view might have played a role here. She was a mother. She had written a great deal on the topic of the Christian mother and her children. She had used the story of Jesus' blessing the children in support of her position when writing in her column on the family and the home. It would be expected that when she turned the point of view around to focus on the story of Jesus, her comments would stress the elements of motherhood and the role of the child.

It is very possible that Ellen White used literary sources in the composition of this chapter. We know she used the works of other writers in her articles for the Health Reformer. She goes so far at times as to make explicit reference to her use of sources.¹ If she depended on the works of others for any sentences in chapter 56 it is likely her source had to do with motherhood, the raising of children, or the home. Such content would not ordinarily be found in a book covering the life of Christ. Our research was limited, however, to works on the life of Christ.

¹In "Exercise for Invalids," HR, July, 1868, she refers to "Moore's Rural New-Yorker." The article on "Death In-doors," RH, April, 1871, contains a very long quote from Hall's Journal of Health. Another long selection appears in RH, May, 1871, from an article by Fanny B. Johnson on Laws of Life which Ellen White recommends for reading. For a final example we refer to the article on "Words to Christian Mothers," HR, Oct. 1871 in which she uses a number of sources but does not always identify the name of the author. This article has been reproduced in Appendix D.

Blessing the Children

It may be shown in the future that Ellen White used sources for this chapter. Our report at this stage of the investigation has no evidence for such a claim apart from the one sentence. Accordingly, the literary dependency of one sentence in 97 is one percent and the independence of chapter 56 rates 99%. Using the evaluation rates for the one sentence of Partial Independence, the rate of dependency is .01 for all sentences and for the dependent sentence it is 1.0.

We have no need to discuss source or redaction analysis in respect to this chapter. The use of sources is so minimal as to be almost negligible. The redaction appears to be the work of Ellen White or Marian Davis in preparing the DA text. The structure of chapter 56 was not derived from the earlier articles since they were written for practical counsel on home life and motherhood.

The analysis of chapter 56 leaves us with two interesting questions for further investigation. Did Ellen White use literary sources from another genre of literature in the composition of chapter 56? We have no other chapter in our study on a topic which basically lies outside the typical narrative on the life of Christ. Are there other such chapters in the DA text? A second concern centers on Ellen White's use of sources. How do we explain Ellen White's clear admission of using the writings of others in the Health Reformer articles when elsewhere we have no such obvious reference to source materials?

Blessing the Children

Summary

Ellen White's comments on the incident of Jesus blessing the children do not follow the typical pattern which has emerged from our survey of the other chapters in this study. Apart from one sentence we found no use of sources and the spiritual lessons developed from the three verses of Scripture move far beyond the normal commentaries on this experience in the life of Christ. The summary questions being addressed to each chapter in this investigation do not in every instance apply. We do, nevertheless, list each point and offer whatever data are available from our analysis.

1. There are no primary or handwritten documents to support the text of chapter 56. The few manuscripts found in typewritten form treated the topic in a limited fashion but contained no literary parallels to sources or to the DA text.

2. Approximately one-third of the chapter may be found in the earlier writings of Ellen White. The DA text does seem to be an expansion over the previous coverage of the topic. Further content analysis, however, should be given to both the DA and pre-DA texts. The emphasis of Ellen White is different from that of Scripture and it may well be that Ellen White's work in the DA text is a reduction of her writings on mothers and the training and education of their children.

3. The content of the pre-DA text used the Bible

Blessing the Children

incident to illustrate and model the principles for Christian homes and motherhood. The DA text emphasized the episode in the life of Jesus and His disciples and then applied the lessons. The earlier articles were more general in their coverage and might include the story of Jesus as one example among other biblical stories and teachings.

4. We found no significant differences in the various writings on the topic of chapter 56. This summary statement should be understood, however, with the following qualification. No careful study was given to the content of chapter 56 and the earlier writings on the topic because the thrust of Ellen White's remarks were outside the life of Christ and no source parallels were involved.

5. Chapter 56 contained one sentence exhibiting the use of a source. One sentence out of 97 results in a dependency of about one percent.

6. The literary independence of the chapter measures 99%, or 96 sentences out of the 97.

7. According to the evaluation scale being used and the rating of Partial Independence given to the one sentence where the influence of a source was apparent, the degree of dependency of the 97 sentences is .01 and for the one dependent sentence the degree of dependency is 1.0.

8. Chapter 56 exhibits only one parallel from the many lives of Christ surveyed. Obviously, we must conclude that there is no major source behind Ellen White's treatment of Jesus blessing the children.

Blessing the Children

9. The one source parallel comes from Cunningham Geikie's Life of Christ.

10. No source parallels were found in our review of the earlier literature of Ellen White on the topic of chapter 56.

11. This question [i.e., a comparative study of the dependency of the DA text to that of the pre-DA text for this chapter] does not apply to chapter 56.

12. This question [having to do with the type of content covered with respect to the sources for this chapter] does not apply to chapter 56.

13. The redaction of the DA text is the work of Ellen White who worked on such matters in association with Marian Davis.

14. The redaction of the pre-DA text must also be credited to Ellen White. We have no evidence of the influence of sources. No doubt her editorial assistants also worked on the structure of her articles in preparing them for publication.

Chapter 56 has challenged our study on two fronts. Are we to conclude that Ellen White wrote an entire chapter independent of any literary parallels apart from the one sentence? Secondly, how can we explain Ellen White's references to sources in her articles in the Health Reformer when such documentation of borrowed materials does not appear elsewhere in her writings for the public? Is the difference in her style to be accounted for by the way in

Blessing the Children

which the sources are employed, i.e., verbatim quotes rather than paraphrase, or are there other reasons? And in respect to the first issue, do we have other chapters in the DA where this degree of independence exists?

The answers to these questions lie beyond the scope of this study. Our survey specifically relates to the life of Christ and these questions concern Ellen White's writings on topics generally treated outside narrative accounts of the life of Christ. Further study should be given these concerns, nevertheless. The answers do have a bearing on the basic issue of Ellen White's literary practices.

Ellen White divides the Passover celebration of Christ into two chapters. Chapter 71, "A Servant of Servants," has as its focus the feet-washing episode. Chapter 72 follows with a commentary on the Lord's Supper entitled "In Remembrance of Me." The content of the two chapters overlaps as the editors of the DA text indicate in the margin.¹

Some duplication is to be expected when the narrative treats two aspects of the same celebration in two separate accounts. Unfortunately for us, the random selection of chapters limits our coverage to the second part only.

In our search for possible literary parallels we put our emphasis on the communion service, the focus of chapter 72. The narrowing of the field may have led us to overlook some sources.

On the other hand we must remember that the Passion story has been the focus of the gospel proclamation since the cross of Jesus Christ. There are countless books, sermons and devotional works highlighting the closing scenes of our Lord's life on earth. The Lord's Supper forms the basis of weekly meditations as Christians meet to celebrate the communion service. There is no end to the materials which could be reviewed for possible literary parallels.

Our research was largely confined to the general works on the life of Christ which held the possibility for

¹Both chapters include comments from Luke 22:14-18.

"In Remembrance of Me"

parallels in Ellen White's treatment of other episodes covered in the gospels. We did not initiate a special search in the literature devoted specifically to the communion service. Occasionally we selected a text focusing on the Passion Week because our study includes five chapters on this period of Christ's sojourn on earth.

The reader will find sixteen writers represented in the source selections of the text presentation. The familiar works of William Hanna, John Harris, and Daniel March appear as well as the narrative lives of Christ by Frederic Farrar, Cunningham Geikie, George Jones, and Johann Lange. We have also included the Bible Studies by George Pentecost for both 1888 and 1889. In addition to these sources previously mentioned in our investigation, chapter 72 introduces us to eight other 19th century works: Edward Bickersteth, A Scripture Help (SH);¹ Robert Boyd, The World's Hope (WH);² Charles Deems, Who Was Jesus? (WWJ);³ Alfred Edersheim, The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah (LTJM);⁴ Ezekiel Hopkins, The Whole Works of Ezekiel Hopkins (W);⁵ Stephen Olin, The Works of Stephen Olin (W);⁶ and Charles Stanford, The Evening of Our Lord's Ministry (ELM).⁷ John Cumming is well known from his commentaries on the gospels. In this chapter we include an excerpt from the third series of his Minor Works.⁸

¹Edward Bickersteth, A Scripture Help (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publishers, 1843).

²Robert Boyd, The World's Hope; or, The Rock of Ages (Chicago: H. S. Goodspeed & Co., 1873).

³Charles F. Deems, Who Was Jesus? (New York: J. Howard

"In Remembrance of Me"

Ellen White's earliest presentation of the celebration of the Passover festival by Jesus and the disciples appears in Spiritual Gifts, Volume 1, chapter VII, under the topic of "The Betrayal of Christ." No direct use of this material is to be found in the DA text of chapter 72. A sentence or two from the third volume of this early work of Ellen White may have found their way into the DA text.¹ In this context she is commenting on the celebration by the children of Israel of the first Passover in the land of Egypt.

It was customary for Ellen White to tie the feet-washing service to the communion service. Her articles usually cover both aspects of the upper-room meeting in a single presentation. For example, in The Spirit of Prophecy, III, chapter VI she writes on "The Passover Supper." The first 20 sentences cover the betrayal agreement of Judas with the Jewish religious leaders. Sentences 21-41 refer mainly to the feet-washing incident covered in chapter 71 of the DA text. The next 35 sentences treat the communion service. The same chapter on the

Brown, 1880).

⁴Alfred Edersheim, The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah (New York: E. R. Herrick & Company, 1886).

⁵Ezekiel Hopkins, The Whole Works of Ezekiel Hopkins (Edinburgh: A. & C. Black, 1841).

⁶Stephen Olin, The Works of Stephen Olin. Volume I. Sermons and Sketches (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854).

⁷Charles Stanford, The Evening of Our Lord's Ministry Being Preludes to 'Voices from Calvary.' (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1886).

⁸John Cumming, Cumming's Minor Works. Third Series (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1855).

¹Cf. Spiritual Gifts, III (1864), p. 225.7 with DA9/652 and p. 227.9 with DA14/653. The SG material on the Passover may also be found in Signs of the Times, March 25, 1880.

"In Remembrance of Me"

Passover continues to relate the words of Jesus to the disciples after the supper is ended and the small band makes its way to the garden of Gethsemane. A number of sentences from the center section of this chapter are found in chapter 72 of the DA text as our analysis will show.

We are not at all confident that we have located all the miscellaneous items that went into Marian Davis' scrapbook or compilation of earlier Ellen White articles on the content of chapter 72. We did locate the choice sentences of DA199-201/661 in The Bible Echo of September 15, 1892, under an article on "The Great Sacrifice."¹ The thoughts of these sentences, however, are not directly related to the Passover service. They speak to the cross of Jesus Christ and to the meaning of His death to which the communion service also points.

Three previous writings of Ellen White on the topic of this chapter are Manuscript 35, 1897, "The Ordinances of the Lord's House"; pages 4-6 of Manuscript 47, 1897, entitled "Judas," and the RH article of June 22, 1897, on "The Ordinances." These writings and their use in the DA text will be carefully reviewed in the analysis to follow. Ellen White published a series of articles in the RH issues for May 31, June 7, 14, 28, and July 5 of 1898. The May 31 and June 7 numbers offer the full text of Manuscript 35, 1897,

¹The Bible Echo and Signs of the Times was published in Australia by the church for the interest of church members and the general public as the full title of the journal indicates.

"In Remembrance of Me"

dated April 6, 1897. The 528 sentences of this five-part series do contain a good number of parallels with the sentences of chapter 72. We cannot be sure, however, that these articles were written before the composition of chapter 72. The publication date of the last article, July 5, is only 5 months earlier than the publication of the full text of The Desire of Ages. It is more likely the series of RH articles were developed from materials being prepared for the DA text. We do know the first two articles of the series were a verbatim presentation of a text Ellen White had written a year earlier.

The reader is invited to note carefully the presentation of the source parallels which follows. Even though portions of the DA sentences and the associated parallels may be underlined, not every possible parallel has been so evaluated. In a number of instances Ellen White has been given full credit for the origin of the sentence even when some similarities exist between her literary expression and that of the source parallel listed. The rating of Strict Independence for Ellen White in such cases of apparent parallel constructions is intentional on our part for reasons to be given below.

We open the textual presentation with a few sentences from 3SP which pick up the story at any earlier stage than does the treatment in DA chapter 72. These sentences from 3SP also clearly indicate Ellen White was using Hanna in 1878.

3SP22/83 At length, in a voice of touching sadness, he addressed them thus: "With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer."
[H/1/613] (B1)

3SP23/83 He clearly foresaw the events which were to transpire in the near future. [H/2/613] (P1)

3SP27/83 This was virtually the last passover that was ever to be celebrated; for type was to meet antitype in the slaying of the Lamb of God for the sins of the world. [H/8/613] (P2)

3SP28/83+ Christ was soon to receive his full baptism of suffering; but the few quiet hours between him and Gethsemane were to be spent for the benefit of his disciples. [H/3/613] (P2)

3SP29/84 "And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer; for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God."
[H/10a/613] (B1)

3SP30/84 And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves; for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine, until the kingdom of God shall come.
[H/10b/613] (B1)

DA1/652 "THE Lord Jesus the same night in which He was betrayed took bread: and when He had given thanks, He brake it, and said, Take, eat: this is My body, which is broken for you: this do in remembrance of Me. (B2)

1/613 It was after the strife and the feet-washing, and coincident with the circulation of the first of these passover cups, that our Lord used the words recorded in the fifteenth, sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth verses of the twenty-second chapter of St. Luke: "And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer." [Hanna, LC]

2/613 Clear before the Saviour's eye were all the scenes of the impending midnight hour in the garden, the next forenoon in the judgment-hall, the afternoon upon the cross. [Hanna, LC]

8/163 He knew that this was virtually the last Jewish passover: that with the offering up of himself in the great sacrifice of the following day that long line of passover celebrations that had run now through fifteen hundred years, was to be brought to its close. [Hanna, LC]

3/613 He stood touching the very edge of these great sufferings. The baptism that he had to be baptized with was now at hand--and how was he straitened till it was accomplished!--a few quiet hours lay between him and his entrance into the cloud. [Hanna, LC]

10a/613 "With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer: for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God. [Hanna, LC]

10b/613 And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves: for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine until the kingdom of God shall come. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA2/652 After the same manner also He took the cup, when He had supped, saying, This cup is the new testament in My blood: this do ye, as oft as ye drink it, in remembrance of Me. (B2)

DA3/652 For as often as ye eat this bread, and drink this cup, ye do show the Lord's death till He come." 1 Cor. 11:23-26. (B2)

DA4/652 Christ was standing at the point of transition between two economies and their two great festivals. (I1)

DA5/652 He, the spotless Lamb of God, was about to present Himself as a sin offering, that He would thus bring to an end the system of types and ceremonies that for four thousand years had pointed to His death. [M/3/307] (P2)

DA6/652 As He ate the Passover with His disciples, He instituted in its place the service that was to be the memorial of His great sacrifice. [M/3,4/307] (P1)

DA7/652 The national festival of the Jews was to pass away forever. [M/3,4/307] (P2)

DA8/652 The service which Christ established was to be observed by His followers in all lands and through all ages. [M/4/307] (P1)

DA9/652 The Passover was ordained as a commemoration of the deliverance of Israel from Egyptian bondage. [P/123.2] (P1)

DA10/652 God had directed that, year by year, as the children should ask the meaning of this ordinance, the history should be repeated. (I1)

DA11/652 Thus the wonderful deliverance was to be kept fresh in the minds of all. (I1)

54.9 These words mark the line of transition from the old Passover to the new; from the remembrance feast of the Exodus to that which is to keep up an unutterably more sacred memory, and to signalize deliverance from what was beyond all conception a more awful bondage. One economy was about to close; another was about to open . . . [Stanford, ELM]

3/307 Just about to offer himself, the pure and spotless Lamb of God, in the great and only efficacious sacrifice for sin, he finishes the sacrifices of four thousand years by eating the Passover with his disciples. [March, WHJ]

4/307 In place of the national festival which the Jewish people had observed from the days of Moses, he institutes a memorial service, to be kept by his followers of every nation to the end of time. [March, WHJ]

611.3 The Passover was the feast commemorative of the deliverance of the nation from the Egyptian bondage. [Deems, WWJ]

123.2 After the Passover feast proper was ended, the Lord took some remnant of the unleavened bread, and the cup out of which they had all been drinking, and proceeded to institute a new ordinance; which in all time should prove a blessing to true disciples, and forever commemorate the sacrifice and blessings of the true Passover. The old passover was a memorial of Israel's deliverance from an earthly bondage. The sacrifice of the true Passover, and the memorial supper symbolizing it, brought in a redemption from sin and all its dread consequences. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

DA12/652+ The ordinance of the Lord's Supper was given to commemorate the great deliverance wrought out as the result of the death of Christ. [P/123.2] (P3)

DA13/653 Till He shall come the second time in power and glory, this ordinance is to be celebrated. (11)

DA14/653 It is the means by which His great work for us is to be kept fresh in our minds. (11)

DA15/653 At the time of their deliverance from Egypt, the children of Israel ate the Passover supper standing, with their loins girded, and with their staves in their hands, ready for their journey. [L/126.7] [F/568.9] (P2)

DA16/653 The manner in which they celebrated this ordinance harmonized with their condition; for they were about to be thrust out of the land of Egypt, and were to begin a painful and difficult journey through the wilderness. (11)

DA17/653 But in Christ's time the condition of things had changed. (11)

DA18/653 They were not now about to be thrust out of a strange country, but were dwellers in their own land. (11)

DA19/653 In harmony with the rest that had been given them, the people then partook of the Passover supper in a reclining position. [J/342.5] (P3)

DA20/653 Couches were placed about the table, and the guests lay upon them, resting upon the left arm, and having the right hand free for use in eating. [F/561.2] (P1)

DA21/653 In this position a guest could lay his head upon the breast of the one who sat next above him. [J/342.7] (P1)

568.9 The central custom of the feast was the hasty eating of the Paschal lamb, with unleavened bread and bitter herbs, in a standing attitude, with loins girt and shoes upon the feet, as they had eaten hastily on the night of their deliverance. [Farrar, LC]

126.7 The celebrants ate it originally in travelling costume, standing, their staves in their hands. [Lange, LOLJC]

342.5 the company assembled and took their places around the table, reclining on couches, (the posture of freemen), to show that they had got out of servitude into freedom. [Jones, LSFG]

561.2 The couches or cushions, each large enough to hold three persons were placed around three sides of one or more low tables of gayly painted wood, each scarcely higher than stools. . . . Each guest reclined at full length, leaning on his left elbow, that his right hand might be free. [Farrar, LC]

342.7 They leaned on the left arm, a cushion or bolster under the shoulder assisting to ease the posture; . . . As they reclined slantingly to the table, so as to bring each man's head before the chest of the one next behind him, if the former wished to speak to the latter, especially if it was anything secret, he leaned his head back on the bosom of the other. [Jones, LSFG]

492.7 We also know, that, as the Jewish Law directed, they reclined on pillows around a low table, each resting on his left hand, so as to leave right free. [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA22/653 And the feet, being at the outer edge of the couch, could be washed by one passing around the outside of the circle. (11)

DA23/653 Christ is still at the table on which the paschal supper has been spread. (11)

DA24/653 The unleavened cakes used at the Passover season are before Him. (11)

DA25/653 The Passover wine, untouched by fermentation, is on the table. (11)

DA26/653 These emblems Christ employs to represent His own unblemished sacrifice. (11)

DA27/653 Nothing corrupted by fermentation, the symbol of sin and death, could represent the "Lamb without blemish and without spot." 1 Peter 1:19. (11)

DA28/653 "And as they were eating, Jesus took bread, and blessed it, and brake it, and gave it to the disciples, and said, Take, eat; this is My body. (B2)

DA29/653 And He took the cup, and gave thanks, and gave it to them, saying, Drink ye all of it; for this is My blood of the new testament, which is shed for many for the remission of sins. (B2)

DA30/653 But I say unto you, I will not drink henceforth of this fruit of the vine, until that day when I drink it new with you in My Father's kingdom." (B2)

DA31/653 Judas the betrayer was present at the sacramental service. (11)

DA32/653 He received from Jesus the emblems of His broken body and His spilled blood. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

DA33/653 He heard the words, "This do in remembrance of Me." (11)

DA34/653 And sitting there in the very presence of the Lamb of God, the betrayer brooded upon his own dark purposes, and cherished his sullen, revengeful thoughts. (11)

DA35/653 At the feet washing, Christ had given convincing proof that He understood the character of Judas. (11)

DA36/653+ "Ye are not all clean" (John 13:11), He said. (B2)

DA37/654 These words convinced the false disciple that Christ read his secret purpose. (11)

DA38/654 Now Christ spoke out more plainly. (11)

DA39/654 As they were seated at the table He said, looking upon His disciples, "I speak not of you all: I know whom I have chosen: but that the scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with Me hath lifted up his heel against Me." (B2)

DA40/654 Even now the disciples did not suspect Judas.
[H/33/615] (P2)

DA41/654 But they saw that Christ appeared greatly troubled. [H/16/614] (P2)

DA42/654 A cloud settled over them all, a premonition of some dreadful calamity, the nature of which they did not understand. [H/16/614] (12)

DA43/654 As they ate in silence, Jesus said, "Verily I say unto you, that one of you shall betray Me." [H/19,20/614] (P2)

33/615 He had returned look for look, as they at first scanned each other; no face calmer or less confused; no one suspecting Judas. [Hanna, LC]

16/614 When the washing of the feet was over, and Jesus sat down, and the repast began, they all noticed that there was a cloud upon their Master's countenance, and the disciple who, sitting next to him could best read the expression of his face, saw that he "was troubled in spirit." [Hanna, LC]

712.8 The supper now began, but the spirit of Jesus was still clouded and troubled by the presence of the traitor. [Geikie, LC]

19,20/614 Christ breaks the silence into which, in the sadness of his spirit, he had fallen; he speaks in tone and manner quite different from those of his ordinary colloquial address. And he "testified and said, Verily, verily I say unto you, that one of you which eateth with me shall betray me!" [Hanna, LC]

DA44/654 At these words amazement and consternation seized them. (11)

DA45/654 They could not comprehend how any one of them could deal treacherously with their divine Teacher. (11)

DA46/654 For what cause could they betray Him? and to whom? [H/21,22/614] (P1)

DA47/654 Whose heart could give birth to such a design? (11)

DA48/654 Surely not one of the favored twelve, who had been privileged above all others to hear His teachings, who had shared his wonderful love, and for whom He had shown such great regard by bringing them into close communion with Himself! [H/23/614] (P2)

DA49/654 As they realized the import of His words, and remembered how true His sayings were, fear and self-distrust seized them. [H/29/614] (I2)

DA50/654 They began to search their own hearts to see if one thought against their Master were harbored there. [P/121.9] (P2)

DA51/654 With the most painful emotion, one after another inquired, "Lord, is it I?" [G/713.1] (P2)

DA52/654 But Judas sat silent. (11)

DA53/654 John in deep distress at last inquired, "Lord, who is it?" (11)

21,22,/614 Betray him! how? for what? to what?
Betray such a Master at such a time! [Hanna, LC]

23/614 Bad enough for any common disciple to use the means and opportunities that acquaintance gave to effect his ruin; but for one of them, his own familiar friends, whom he has drawn so closely round his person, upon whom he has lavished such affection--for one of those admitted to this most sacred of meals, the holiest seal of the nearest earthly bond; for one of the twelve to betray him! [Hanna, LC]

29/614 there is none so bold and over-confident, not even Peter, as at once to think and say of himself that there was no possibility it could be he, but that all, not without some secret wonder and self-distrust, put in turn the question, "Lord, is it I?" [Hanna, LC]

121.9 Overwhelmed with the shame of this thing which the Lord had spoken, and not knowing who it was of them, they each for himself began to question his own heart. [Pentecost, BS(88)]

713.1 One by one, they began to ask, "Lord, is it I?" "It is one," replied Jesus, "who dips with me into the dish. . . . Words thus general only increased the pain and emotion of all. [Geikie, LC]

DA54/654 And Jesus answered, "He that dippeth his hand with Me in the dish, the same shall betray Me. (B2)

DA55/654 The Son of man goeth as it is written of Him: but woe unto that man by whom the Son of man is betrayed! it had been good for that man if he had not been born." (B2)

DA56/654 The disciples had searched one another's faces closely as they asked, "Lord, is it I?" [H/24/614] (P2)

DA57/654 And now the silence of Judas drew all eyes to him. (I1)

DA58/654 Amid the confusion of questions and expressions of astonishment, Judas had not heard the words of Jesus in answer to John's question. (I1)

DA59/654 But now, to escape the scrutiny of the disciples, he asked as they had done, "Master, is it I?" (I1)

DA60/654 Jesus solemnly replied, "Thou hast said." (B2)

DA61/654 In surprise and confusion at the exposure of his purpose, Judas rose hastily to leave the room. (I1)

DA62/654 "Then said Jesus unto him, That thou doest, do quickly. . . . (B2)

DA63/654 He then having received the sop went immediately out: and it was night" (B2)

DA64/654 Night it was to the traitor as he turned away from Christ into the outer darkness. [H/56/616] (P2)

DA65/654 Until this step was taken, Judas had not passed beyond the possibility of repentance. (I1)

24/614 they . . . look "one on another, doubting of whom he spake"--fixing searching looks on all around, to see whether any countenance showed the confusion of felt guilt, etc. [Hanna, LC]

54,55,56/616 "That thou doest," said Jesus to him, "do quickly." He arose and went out immediately; and it was night. And into that night he went carrying a blacker night within his own dark breast. [Hanna, LC]

DA66/654+ But when he left the presence of his Lord and his fellow disciples, the final decision had been made. (11)

DA67/655 He had passed the boundary line. [P/155.9] (P1)

DA68/655 Wonderful had been the long-suffering of Jesus in His dealing with this tempted soul. (11)

DA69/655 Nothing that could be done to save Judas had been left undone. (11)

DA70/655 After he had twice covenanted to betray his Lord, Jesus still gave him opportunity for repentance. [H/89/618] (12)

DA71/655 By reading the secret purpose of the traitor's heart, Christ gave to Judas the final, convincing evidence of His divinity. (11)

DA72/655 This was to the false disciple the last call to repentance. [H/89/618] (P1)

DA73/655 No appeal that the divine-human heart of Christ could make had been spared. (11)

DA74/655 The waves of mercy, beaten back by stubborn pride, returned in a stronger tide of subduing love. (11)

DA75/655 But although surprised and alarmed at the discovery of his guilt, Judas became only the more determined. [H/90/618] (P3)

DA76/655 From the sacramental supper he went out to complete the work of betrayal. (11)

DA77/655 In pronouncing the woe upon Judas, Christ also had a purpose of mercy toward His disciples. (11)

155.9 Satan now entered into Judas' heart, and the case was past redemption. [Pentecost, BS(89)]

89/618 That in dealing with him as he did in the guest-chamber, he was giving him another and last opportunity of repentance I do most thoroughly believe. [Hanna, LC]

90/618 That a **purpose of mercy** lay embedded in our Lord's treatment of Judas is not disproved by the fact, that instead of working anything like repentance, it stirred up the malicious feelings to an intenser activity. [Hanna, LC]

DA78/655 He thus gave them the crowning evidence of His Messiahship. [H/64/616] (P1)

DA79/655 "I tell you before it come," He said, "that, when it is come to pass, ye may believe that I AM." [H/65/616] (I2)

DA80/655 Had Jesus remained silent, in apparent ignorance of what was to come upon Him, the disciples might have thought that their Master had not divine foresight, and had been surprised and betrayed into the hands of the murderous mob. [H/67/616+] (P1)

DA81/655 A year before, Jesus had told the disciples that He had chosen twelve, and that one was a devil. [H/71/617] (P1)

DA82/655 Now His words to Judas, showing that his treachery was fully known to his Master, would strengthen the faith of Christ's true followers during His humiliation. [H/71/617] (I2)

DA83/655 And when Judas should have come to his dreadful end, they would remember the woe that Jesus had pronounced upon the betrayer. (I1)

3SP73/87 The withdrawal of Judas was a relief to all present. (I1)

3SP74/87 The Saviour's face lighted immediately, and the oppressive shadow was lifted from the disciples, as they saw the peace of Heaven return to the pale, worn countenance of their Lord. [M/8/308] (P2)

DA84/655 And the Saviour had still another purpose. (I1)

DA85/655 He had not withheld His ministry from him whom He knew to be a traitor. (I1)

64/616 We have Christ's own authority for saying that one of his reasons for acting as he did towards Judas was to afford to the other apostles an evidence of his Messiahship.
[Hanna, LC]

65/616 "I speak not of you all," he had said; "I know whom I have chosen: but that the Scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me. Now I tell you before it come, that, when it is come to pass, ye may believe that I am he." [Hanna, LC]

67/616+ Had nothing been said beforehand by Jesus, had everything run the course it did, their Master remaining apparently in profound ignorance of how his arrest in the garden was to be brought about, then to the apostles' eyes this mystery would have hung around the whole procedure: that Jesus had been deceived, had suffered a traitor to enter unknown and undetected into the innermost circle of his friends; [Hanna, LC]

71/617 Yet when all is over, and they recall what their Master had said a year before his death, that one of them was a devil, and remember especially the sayings of the quest-chamber, how vividly would the conviction come home to the minds of the apostles, that they had to do with one from whom no secrets were hidden, before whose all-seeing eye every heart lay naked and bare! [Hanna, LC]

8/308 No sooner has the dark shadow of the traitor's presence left the room, than the troubled cloud passes from the face of Jesus and he turns to his remaining disciples with the light of heaven in his look. [March WHJ]

DA86/655 The disciples did not understand His words when He said at the feet washing, "Ye are not all clean," nor yet when at the table He declared, "He that eateth bread with Me hath lifted up his heel against Me." John 13:11, 18. (11)

DA87/655 But afterward, when His meaning was made plain, they had something to consider as to the patience and mercy of God toward the most grievously erring. (11)

DA88/655 Though Jesus knew Judas from the beginning, He washed his feet. (11)

DA89/655 And the betrayer was privileged to unite with Christ in partaking of the sacrament. (11)

DA90/655 A long-suffering Saviour held out every inducement for the sinner to receive him, to repent, and to be cleansed from the defilement of sin. (11)

DA91/655 This example is for us. (11)

DA92/655 When we suppose one to be in error and sin, we are not to divorce ourselves from him. (11)

DA93/655+ By no careless separation are we to leave him a prey to temptation, or drive him upon Satan's battleground. (11)

DA94/656 This is not Christ's method. (11)

DA95/656 It was because the disciples were erring and faulty that He washed their feet, and all but one of the twelve were thus brought to repentance. (11)

DA96/656 Christ's example forbids exclusiveness at the Lord's Supper. (11)

DA97/656 It is true that open sin excludes the guilty. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

DA98/656 This the Holy Spirit plainly teaches. 1 Cor. 5:11. (I1)

DA99/656 But beyond this none are to pass judgment.
[C/35.4] (P1)

DA100/656 God has not left it with men to say who shall present themselves on these occasions. (I1)

DA101/656 For who can read the heart? (I1)

DA102/656 Who can distinguish the tares from the wheat?
[C/35.4] (P1)

DA103/656 "Let a man examine himself, and so let him eat of that bread, and drink of that cup." (B2)

DA104/656 For "whosoever shall eat this bread, and drink this cup of the Lord, unworthily, shall be guilty of the body and blood of the Lord." (B2)

DA105/656 "He that eateth and drinketh unworthily, eateth and drinketh damnation to himself, not discerning the Lord's body." 1 Cor. 11:28, 27, 29. (B2)

DA106/656 When believers assemble to celebrate the ordinances, there are present messengers unseen by human eyes. (I1)

DA107/656 There may be a Judas in the company, and if so, messengers from the prince of darkness are there, for they attend all who refuse to be controlled by the holy Spirit. (I1)

DA108/656 Heavenly angels also are present. (I1)

DA109/656 These unseen visitants are present on every such occasion. (I1)

35.4+ Surely there is here a striking precedent for us to imitate; and yet one that is most difficult to imitate. . . Our Lord has set us the example of judging men, not by our suspicions or our construction, but by their deeds; . . . Those at a communion table are just like those who stand at the baptismal font, or who make profession of the truths of the everlasting Gospel--a mixed body. The visible Church is not to be in this dispensation co-extensive with the spiritual and true Church. The tares and the wheat are so mingled together, that if men attempted to separate they are sure to do mischief; our Lord did not weed the first communion. [Cumming, MW(3)]

DA110/656 There may come into the company persons who are not in heart servants of truth and holiness, but who may wish to take part in the service. (11)

DA111/656 They should not be forbidden. (11)

DA112/656 There are witnesses present who were present when Jesus washed the feet of the disciples and of Judas. (11)

DA113/656 More than human eyes beheld the scene. (11)

DA114/656 Christ by the Holy Spirit is there to set the seal to His own ordinance. (11)

DA115/656 He is there to convict and soften the heart. (11)

DA116/656 Not a look, not a thought of contrition, escapes His notice. (11)

DA117/656 For the repentant, brokenhearted one He is waiting. (11)

DA118/656 All things are ready for that soul's reception. (11)

DA119/656 He who washed the feet of Judas longs to wash every heart from the stain of sin. (11)

DA120/656 None should exclude themselves from the Communion because some who are unworthy may be present. (11)

DA121/656 Every disciple is called upon to participate publicly, and thus bear witness that he accepts Christ as a personal Saviour. (11)

DA122/656 It is at these, His own appointments, that Christ meets His people, and energizes them by His presence. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

DA123/656 Hearts and hands that are unworthy may even administer the ordinance, yet Christ is there to minister to His children. (I1)

DA124/656 All who come with their faith fixed upon him will be greatly blessed. (I1)

DA125/656 All who neglect these seasons of divine privilege will suffer loss. (I1)

DA126/656 Of them it may appropriately be said, "Ye are not all clean." (I1)

DA127/656+ In partaking with His disciples of the bread and wine, Christ pledged Himself to them as their Redeemer. (I1)

DA128/659 He committed to them the new covenant, by which all who receive Him become children of God, and joint heirs with Christ. (I1)

DA129/659 By this covenant every blessing that heaven could bestow for this life and the life to come was theirs. (I1)

DA130/659 This covenant deed was to be ratified with the blood of Christ. (I1)

DA131/659 And the administration of the Sacrament was to keep before the disciples the infinite sacrifice made for each of them individually as a part of the great whole of fallen humanity. (I1)

DA132/659 But the Communion service was not to be a season of sorrowing. (I1)

DA133/659 This was not its purpose. (I1)

DA134/659 As the Lord's disciples gather about His table, they are not to remember and lament their shortcomings.
[B/565.1] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

RH(97)65 We do not come to the ordinances of the Lord's house merely as a form. [B/565.1] (P2)

RH(97)66 We do not make it our business, as we gather around the table of our Lord, to ponder about and mourn over our shortcomings. [B/565.1] (P1)

DA135/659 They are not to dwell upon their past religious experience, whether that experience has been elevating or depressing. [B/565.1] (P2)

RH(97)69 We do not come with our minds diverted to our past experience in the religious life, whether that experience is elevating or depressing. [B/565.1] (P1)

DA136/659 They are not to recall the differences between them and their brethren. [B/565.1] (I2)

RH(97)70 We do not come to revive in our minds the ill-treatment we have received at the hands of our brethren. [B/565.1] (I2)

DA137/659 The preparatory service has embraced all this. (I1)

DA138/659 The self-examination, the confession of sin, the reconciling of differences, has all been done. (I1)

DA139/659 Now they come to meet with Christ. [B/565.1] (P2)

RH(97)72 We have assembled now to meet with Jesus Christ, to commune with him. [B/565.1] (P1)

RH(97)73 Every heart is to be open to the bright beams of the Son of Righteousness. [B/565.1] (I2)

RH(97)74 Our minds and hearts are to be fixed on Christ as the great center on whom our hopes of eternal life depend. [B/565.1] (I2)

565.1 We do not come there to perform a church ceremony. We do not come to dwell upon our own feelings, emotions and shortcomings, for that would be to remember ourselves rather than Jesus. We do not come to think over our past experiences of religion, however good these may have been, for that would be to remember only our past remembrances of Jesus. We come not to think of the faults of our brethren, for there every heart should be brimming over with love. We are to meet with Jesus in the midst, upon whom all hearts are to be fixed, [Boyd, WH]

DA140/659 They are not to stand in the shadow of the cross, but in its saving light. (I1)

DA141/659 They are to open the soul to the bright beams of the Sun of Righteousness. (I1)

DA142/659 With hearts cleansed by Christ's most precious blood, in full consciousness of His presence, although unseen, they are to hear His words, "Peace I leave with you, My peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you." John 14:27. (I1)

DA143/659 Our Lord says, Under conviction of sin, remember that I died for you. [B/566.2] (P1)

DA144/659 When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for My sake and the gospel's, remember My love, so great that for you I gave My life. [B/566.2] (P2)

RH(97)92 When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for my sake and the gospel's, remember that my love was so great that I gave my life for you. [B/566.2] (P2)

DA145/659 When your duties appear stern and severe, and your burdens too heavy to bear, remember that for your sake I endured the cross, despising the shame. [B/566.2] (P1)

DA146/659 When your heart shrinks from the trying ordeal, remember that your Redeemer liveth to make intercession for you. [B/566.2] (I2)

DA147/659 The Communion service points to Christ's second coming. (I1)

DA148/659 It was designed to keep this hope vivid in the minds of the disciples. (I1)

DA149/659 Whenever they met together to commemorate His death, they recounted how "He took the cup, and gave thanks, and gave it to them, saying, Drink ye all of it; for this is My blood of the new testament, which is shed for many for the remission of sins. (B2)

566.2 . . . he has instituted outward tokens of his love, . . . saying "Remember me. Under a consciousness of guilt, remember I died for you. In the furnace of affliction, remember I am with you. When under the sifting power of Satan's temptations, remember I am praying for you. When duties stern and severe are laid upon you, and you are ready to shrink from the cross, remember that for you I endured the Cross and despised the shame." And when death comes to clasp you in his skeleton arms, and when heart and flesh fail, and nature shrinks back in dismay, remember that your Redeemer liveth. [Boyd, WH]

DA150/659 But I say unto you, I will not drink henceforth of this fruit of the vine, until that day when I drink it new with you in My Father's kingdom." (B2)

DA151/659 In their tribulation they found comfort in the hope of their Lord's return. (11)

DA152/659 Unspeakably precious to them was the thought, "As often as ye eat this bread, and drink this cup, ye do show the Lord's death till He come." 1 Cor. 11:26. (B2)

DA153/660 These are the things we are never to forget. (11)

DA154/660 The love of Jesus, with its constraining power, is to be kept fresh in our memory. (11)

DA155/660 Christ has instituted this service that it may speak to our senses of the love of God that has been expressed in our behalf. (11)

DA156/660 There can be no union between our souls and God except through Christ. (11)

DA157/660 The union and love between brother and brother must be cemented and rendered eternal by the love of Jesus. (11)

DA158/660 And nothing less than the death of Christ could make His love efficacious for us. (11)

DA159/660 It is only because of His death that we can look with joy to His second coming. (11)

133.6 In condescension to human weakness, our Savior was pleased to ordain in his Church a perpetual institution that should set forth to the senses of men the one great event on which, and on their right apprehension and use of it, their salvation should depend. [Olin, W]

134.8 Addressed to the senses, and appealing strongly to the imagination and the heart, this impressive rite, etc. [Olin, W]

140.7 With similar vivacity and impressiveness does it symbolize the intimacy of the believer's union with Christ. [Olin, W]

141.3 This act of communion inculcates, with no less emphasis, the intimate union of Christians with each other. They are together brought into contact with their common Savior. [Olin, W]

DA160/660 His sacrifice is the center of our hope. (I1)

DA161/660 Upon this we must fix our faith. (I1)

DA162/660 The ordinances that point to our Lord's humiliation and suffering are regarded too much as a form. (I1)

DA163/660 They were instituted for a purpose. (I1)

DA164/660 Our senses need to be quickened to lay hold of the mystery of godliness. (I1)

DA165/660 It is the privilege of all to comprehend, far more than we do, the expiatory sufferings of Christ. (I1)

DA166/660 "As Moses lifted up the serpent in the wilderness," even so has the Son of man been lifted up, "that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have eternal life." John 3:14, 15. (B2)

DA167/660 To the cross of Calvary, bearing a dying Saviour, we must look. (I1)

DA168/660 Our eternal interests demand that we show faith in Christ. (I1)

DA169/660 Our Lord has said, "Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of man, and drink His blood, ye have no life in you. . . . (B2)

DA170/660 For My flesh is meat indeed, and My blood is drink indeed." John 6:53-55. (B2)

DA171/660 This is true of our physical nature. (I1)

DA172/660 To the death of Christ we owe even this earthly life. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

DA173/660 The bread we eat is the purchase of His broken body. (11)

DA174/660 The water we drink is bought by His spilled blood. (11)

DA175/660 Never one, saint or sinner, eats his daily food, but he is nourished by the body and the blood of Christ. (11)

DA175/660 The cross of Calvary is stamped on every loaf. (11)

DA176/660 It is reflected in every water spring. (11)

DA177/660 All this Christ has taught in appointing the emblems of His great sacrifice. (11)

DA178/660 The light shining from that Communion service in the upper chamber makes sacred the provisions for our daily life. (11)

DA179/660 The family board becomes as the table of the Lord, and every meal a sacrament. (11)

DA180/660 And how much more are Christ's words true of our spiritual nature. (11)

DA181/660 He declares, "Whoso eateth My flesh, and drinketh My blood, hath eternal life." (B2)

DA182/660 It is by receiving the life for us poured out on Calvary's cross, that we can live the life of holiness. (11)

DA183/660 And this life we receive by receiving His word, by doing those things which He has commanded. (11)

DA184/660 Thus we become one with Him. (11)

440.75 His people are to turn every act into devotion; to make every meal sacramental, a token and pledge of infinite love. [Harris, GT]

111.9+ He eats his flesh and drinks his blood, believing on an incarnate Saviour, he makes his atoning sacrifice the food of his soul: resorting to that as the support of his hope, as he does to daily food for the support of his body. He enjoys the communion of his body and of his blood, when he receives the Lord's supper. . . . Believers are thus one with Christ, and with each other, as the bread, though distributed, is part of one loaf. [Bickersteth, SH]

DA185/660 "He that eateth My flesh," He says, "and drinketh My blood, dwelleth in Me, and I in him. (B2)

DA186/660+ As the living Father hath sent Me, and I live by the Father: so he that eateth Me, even he shall live by Me." John 6:54, 56, 57. (B2)

DA187/661 To the holy Communion this scripture in a special sense applies. (I1)

DA188/661 As faith contemplates our Lord's great sacrifice, the soul assimilates the spiritual life of Christ. (I1)

DA189/661 That soul will receive spiritual strength from every Communion. (I1)

DA190/661 The service forms a living connection by which the believer is bound up with Christ and thus bound up with the Father. (I1)

DA191/661 In a special sense it forms a connection between dependent human beings and God. (I1)

DA192/661 As we receive the bread and wine symbolizing Christ's broken body and spilled blood, we in imagination join in the scene of Communion in the upper chamber. (I1)

DA193/661 We seem to be passing through the garden consecrated by the agony of Him who bore the sins of the world. (I1)

DA194/661 We witness the struggle by which our reconciliation with God was obtained. (I1)

DA195/661 Christ is set forth crucified among us. (I1)

123.6 We eat the flesh of the Son of Man, and drink his blood; assimilate his life and righteousness, even as we eat the bread of corn, and assimilate it for our life and strength by the natural process of alimentation.
[Pentecost, BS(88)]

149a.8 If we can but exercise faith in this great ordinance, these things will be really present to us. There we shall see Christ crucified before our eyes; yea, and crucified as truly and really to our faith, as ever he was to the sense of others. Our faith can carry us into the garden, and make us watch with him in his agony, and observe every drop of blood that the sense of his Father's wrath strained through him. [Ezekiel Hopkins, WW]

DA196/661 Looking upon the crucified Redeemer, we more fully comprehend the magnitude and meaning of the sacrifice made by the Majesty of heaven. (11)

DA197/661 The plan of salvation is glorified before us, and the thought of Calvary awakens living and sacred emotions in our hearts. (11)

DA198/661 Praise to God and the Lamb will be in our hearts and on our lips; for pride and self-worship cannot flourish in the soul that keeps fresh in memory the scenes of Calvary. (11)

DA199/661 He who beholds the Saviour's matchless love will be elevated in thought, purified in heart, transformed in character. (11)

DA200/661 He will go forth to be a light to the world, to reflect in some degree this mysterious love. (11)

DA201/661 The more we contemplate the cross of Christ, the more fully shall we adopt the language of the apostle when he said, "God forbid that I should glory, save in the cross of our Lord Jesus Christ, by whom the world is crucified unto me, and I unto the world." Gal. 6:14. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 72 - SOURCES

Analysis

The analysis of chapter 72 has proven to be more difficult than any of the preceding chapters. The complications have arisen from two factors. On the one hand there is the special nature of the content and on the other we have the way in which Ellen White has handled the material.

In terms of the former, the story of the Last Supper is part of the Passion Week. This part of the gospel story is the most important section. All four evangelists report the events of this special week in which Christ was crucified. So many of the other incidents in the life of Jesus point forward to the cross event. In the words and actions of Jesus during the last week of His life and ministry leading to the cross are to be found the very essence of the gospel story. The themes of this special week in the life of Jesus have been at the center of countless sermons, devotions, and books. And in the series of events which transpired from Palm Sunday till the death of Christ on Good Friday, none captures the imagination or speaks to the meaning of the cross event as does this last supper, the inauguration of what all Christians since the cross refer to as the Lord's Communion.

This particular incident in the week of special events is not like the birth or death of Christ celebrated in the liturgy of the church once a year. The communion celebration is repeated in the Christian church daily,

"In Remembrance of Me"

weekly, and in some churches only slightly less frequently. Countless homilies, spiritual lessons, practical exhortations, and devotional meditations have been developed, repeated, recorded, and published on the meaning of this Christian worship service and experience. It is the one Christian devotional experience where the senses of taste and smell are added to those of sight, hearing, and touch, thus affording the opportunity for full participation of the mind, body, and soul in the worship of the Lord.

The countless repetitions, the accumulated memories, the familiar hymns, and the multiple experiences in every Christian's life have combined to produce such a common stock of phrases and of interpretations that it becomes hardly possible to isolate any words or expressions in terms of originality or dependence.

Apart from the lives of Christ Ellen White had read, each one covering this topic as part of the complete story, we have no idea of the devotional works which would have caught her eye through the years. But we must also bear in mind the many communion services she would have attended and the messages she would have heard on the topic of our chapter.

We did not include many devotional books in our survey of possible sources and neither did we survey Adventist writers for articles on this or any other topic covered in the 15 chapters of our study. The content of this particular chapter would make a likely subject for comparing

"In Remembrance of Me"

the remarks of Ellen White with Adventist writers in a search for literary parallels.¹ But this provocative possibility lies too far beyond the limits of the investigation for us to explore for this report.

The veritable plethora of texts on a topic so well known to Christians and particularly to so devotional a Christian as Ellen White did not only raise problems for evaluation of Ellen White's literary dependency; it also raised havoc in identifying the source of the dependency. We found so much duplication of literary expression among the writers we were not always sure as to the one source she was using, if indeed she was borrowing in an instance of a given parallel. The writers exhibiting such parallels among themselves did not always identify their sources.

Once again we are driven to raise the fundamental question that lies at the base of this study, though not directly addressed in this research. What were the literary conventions followed by Seventh-day Adventists and other Christian writers of the nineteenth century in their use of religious literary sources, particularly in the area of devotional comment? It would appear that a comparison of devotional works on the subject of the communion service might be useful in establishing a nineteenth century model

¹Ellen White admitted to the use of other SDA writers in the introduction to the 1911 edition of The Great Controversy. This dependency of Ellen White on Adventist writers has been demonstrated by Don McAdams, Ron Graybill, and Walter Rea. See Introduction, Part I, above for details.

"In Remembrance of Me"

for what is permitted by common consent and what would be unacceptable and understood as plagiarism.

In addition to these problems relating to the content of this chapter, the evaluation process had to struggle with Ellen White's treatment of the subject matter.

To the best of our knowledge, apart from a few isolated comments, her previous writings on the Lord's Supper may be found in four texts. We have provided in Table A, pages 524-526, a list of the sentences in these documents which parallel the DA text. We do not claim that we have listed all the possible parallels. There are at times three variations of a given sentence. Some sentences while on the same thought are so different in expression we could not be sure we had a parallel. In other cases there appeared to be duplication of a given thought and/or expression in the same article. We do feel, nevertheless, that we have listed most of the more obvious parallels. In the table the numbers on the far left merely indicate the entry number(s) in sequence. These numbers can be used to identify a particular parallel since not every DA sentence has a separate entry. Some sentences are combined. The table has five major columns, the earliest being the list of sentences from The Spirit of Prophecy, III, dated 1878. Manuscript 35, dated April 6, 1897, follows in the second column, and the relevant portion of Manuscript 47, 1897, is represented in column three. Column four lists the sentences for The Review and Herald article under date of June 22, 1897, and

TABLE A

LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 72

(EXCLUDES ISOLATED SENTENCES)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>MS 35/1897</u>	<u>MS 47/97</u>	<u>RH 6/22/97</u>	<u>DA 72</u>
001. -		1-10 Lk 22			
002. -		11		1	
003. -					1-3 1Cor.11
004. -		13		3	
005. -		14		4	(4)*
006. -					5
007. -		12		2	(6)
008. -		15		5	(7,8)
009. -	225.7				(9)
010. -		First and Last Passovers Compared			10-23
011. -		Non-Fermentation of Emblems			24-27
012. -		16 Lk 22		6	(28) Mt.26
013. -		17 Lk 22		7	(29) Mt.26
014. -		18 Lk 22		8	
015. -		19 Lk 22		9	
016. -		20 Jn 13		10	
017. -					30 Mt. 26
018. -		21		11	(31,32)
019. -		Judas and Christ's Prediction of His Betrayal			33-40
020. -	42				(41)
021. -	43				42
022. -	44				43
023. -	45				(44)
024. -	46				45
025. -	47				46
026. -	48				47
027. -	49				(48)
028. -	50				(49)
029. -	51				(50)
030. -	52				(51)
031. -	53				52
032. -	54				(53)
033. -	54				54
034. -	55				55
035. -	56				56
036. -	56				(57)
037. -	57				(58)
038. -	58				(59)
039. -	59				(60)
040. -	60				(61)

*The parentheses indicate some modification of the text over the previous text form(s).

TABLE A - CHAPTER 72
(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>MS 35/1897</u>	<u>MS 47/97</u>	<u>RH 6/22/97</u>	<u>DA 72</u>
041. -	60				(62)
042. -		22		12	
043. -		24		14	
044. -		25		15	
045. -					63
046. -					64
047. -		26		16	(65)
048. -		27		17	(66,67)
049. -	61				(68)
050. -					69
051. -	62				(70)
052. -	63				(71)
053. -	63				(72)
054. -					73
055. -					74
056. -	64,65				(75)
057. -	66	23		13	(76)
058. -	67				(77)
059. -	67				(78)
060. -	68				
061. -	69				79
062. -	70				(80)
063. -	71a				81
064. -	71b				(82)
065. -	72				83
066. -	73-76				
067. -					84-87
068. -		65,66	24		88
069. -			25		(89)
070. -		Christ's Method our Example			90-95
071. -		42	(26a)	(21)	(96)
072. -		Open Sin Excludes Participation			97-99
073. -		70			(100)
074. -		68	(26b)	38	(101)
075. -		67	(27)		(102)
076. -		143	1 Cor. 11:28, 27, 29		103-105
077. -			28		(106)
078. -			29		(107)
079. -			30		(108)
080. -		31,32			
081. -		33			(109)
082. -		64	34		(110)
083. -		64	35		(111)
084. -			36		(112)
085. -			37		113
086. -		72		42	(114)

TABLE A - CHAPTER 72
(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>MS 35/1897</u>	<u>MS 47/97</u>	<u>RH 6/22/97</u>	<u>DA 72</u>
087. -		73		43	115
088. -					116-119
089. -		69			120
090. -		43		(22)	(121)
091. -		79		(49)	(122)
092. -		80		(50)	(123)
093. -					(124)
094. -					125,126
095. -		28		(18a)	(127)
096. -		28		(18b)	(128)
097. -		28		(18c)	(129)
098. -		29		(19)	(130)
099. -		30-40 - Heb. 10:1-12			
100. -		41			131,132,133
101. -		113		(66)	(134)
102. -		116		(69)	(135)
103. -		117		(70)	(136)
104. -				67	(137)
105. -		45-53 Jn 13			
106. -		54-55 Feet Washing			
107. -		56-60 Jn 13			
108. -					138
109. -		61-63 Lessons From Feet Washing			
110. -		119		(72)	(139)
111. -				75	(140)
112. -		120		(73)	(141)
113. -		121		(74)	
114. -		123		(76)	(142)
115. -				91	(143)
116. -				92	(144)
117. -		159		94	(145)
118. -				95	(146)
119. -		Service Points to 2nd Advent			147-152
120. -				79	(153)
121. -		135		(80)	(154)
122. -				82	(155)
123. -		126			(156)
124. -		127			(157)
125. -					158-160
126. -		146			(161)
127. -		76		(46)	(162)
128. -		169			(163)
129. -		The Sufferings of Christ			164-167
130. -		To "Eat the Flesh" and "Drink the Blood..."			168-182
131. -			99		(183)
132. -		Becoming One With Christ and Each Other			184-192
133. -		Contemplating the Cross of Christ			193-201

"In Remembrance of Me"

the last column against the right margin holds the sentences from the DA text.

At times the DA text will be identical with Manuscript 35. In certain instances it will agree with the Review article. Sometimes all three of these texts will agree and at other times the DA text will stand alone.

The reader will note that in no instance do we have a parallel among all five texts. The 3SP text usually stands alone with the DA text as does also Manuscript 47.

It does seem clear that for a good number of parallels the Review text and that of DA were derived from the earlier Manuscript 35.¹ When we also take into consideration that Manuscript 35, 1897, was virtually reproduced in published form as parts I and II of the six-part series on "The Lord's Supper and the Ordinance of Feet-Washing," in RH of May 31 and June 7, 1898, we have three differing published versions of the same manuscript content. As we have argued earlier, it should be obvious from this evidence that neither Ellen White nor her literary assistants believed in verbal inspiration. We have provided the full text of the four documents compared in Table A and of the two Review articles where Manuscript 35 appears in published form in Appendix D. The reader may check our parallels as listed by comparing the numbered sentences of the texts given in Appendix D with the DA sentences as listed above in the text presentation for this chapter.

¹From our research and that of the White Estate office

"In Remembrance of Me"

There are two additional characteristics of Ellen White's commentary which we should mention before turning to source analysis.

Thus far in our study we have found Ellen White to exhibit greater literary independence in her discursive material than where she is being descriptive. The content of this chapter lends itself more readily to discursive comments. More than 50 percent of the textual presentation of the Lord's Supper in Matthew, Mark, and Luke and about 40 percent of John's account consists of sayings of Jesus. And Jesus is talking about the meaning of this occasion. We can therefore expect a good deal of Ellen White's devotional, spiritual, and theological commentary in this chapter. The nature of the content agrees with the genre of literature Ellen White most often composed.

Finally, we had difficulty in isolating Ellen White's comments on the Lord's Supper, which is the subject of chapter 72, from her remarks on the feet-washing service, the topic of chapter 71 of the DA text. The SP text covers both incidents in the chapter entitled "The Passover." Manuscript 35 and the RH article of June 22, 1897, also treat both ordinances. The six-part series in the RH of 1898, which we are viewing as post-DA articles, also addresses both services.

Perhaps this overlap in the accounts of the

it is apparent that the handwritten text of Manuscripts 35 and 47 are no longer extant.

"In Remembrance of Me"

feet-washing and communion services may account for some of the duplication evident in this chapter. Compare "to be kept fresh in the minds of all" in DA11/652 with "to be kept fresh in our minds" of DA14/652 and "to be kept fresh in our memory" of DA154/660. Another incidence of duplication occurs between DA31-32/653 and DA89/655.

It was natural for Ellen White to handle the two incidents together since as an Adventist she celebrated both ordinances each time she participated in the communion. And although the feet-washing is not recorded in the gospels as being associated with the bread and wine, both are related to the Passover supper. Even though Ellen White separates the two events in her DA commentary, within each chapter she speaks of "ordinance" in the plural and refers to both services in her remarks.

We have endeavored to distinguish between the services where necessary for evaluation and for listing the appropriate parallels in Table A above. It is possible, however, that we have missed some source parallels by our limitation of the major research to writings on the communion experience independent of the feet-washing service.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Literary dependency is exhibited in 40 of the 201 sentences of chapter 72. The Bible was quoted in 25 sentences in addition to quotations incorporated into Ellen

"In Remembrance of Me"

White's own commentary.¹ Table 1, page 531, lists 14 of the 40 parallels as being Strict Paraphrase, 16 Simple Paraphrase, and the remaining 10 as Loose Paraphrase or Partial Independence. The average dependency for the full chapter of 201 sentences is .75. If we figure only the dependent sentences, excluding the Scriptural quotations, the average rate is 3.75.

Nine writers are represented in the text of chapter 72 with Hanna furnishing the most parallels. Evidently Ellen White returned to Hanna for the DA text even when she had earlier borrowed from Hanna in writing 3SP. Outside of the 17 sentences dependent on Hanna's life of Christ, we found some dependency on March, Cumming, Jones, Lange, Farrar, Geikie, and Pentecost. The summary of these evaluation details on these parallels is shown in Table 2, page 532. The individual sentence evaluations and the correlation of the sources and the DA sentences may be found in Appendix A.² In addition to these writers, all of whom have furnished parallels in the chapters already reviewed, a new source is introduced in the comparison of this chapter. Robert Boyd's work on The World's Hope, or The Rock of Ages provided eight parallels and was listed as part of Ellen White's office library at the time of her death in 1915.

Throughout the text presentation the reader will notice

¹When Ellen White's comments are more than just a brief introduction to the Bible text we usually evaluate the sentence as her work even though Scripture is included.

²The full description of these works has been presented as part of the introduction to this chapter.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 72

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
TEXT	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	TOTAL
01. DA	00	00	14	16	03	00	07	136	25	201
02. 3SP (83)	00	00	01	03	00	03	00	01	00	08
03. RH (97)	00	00	03	02	00	00	03	00	00	08
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	00	04	05	00	03	03	(01)	(--)	16

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 72

Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	25	25
02. Cumming MW	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
03. Hanna LC	00	00	04	07	01	00	05	00	00	17
04. March WHJ	00	00	02	02	00	00	00	00	00	04
05. Jones LSFG	00	00	01	00	01	00	00	00	00	02
06. Lange LOLJC	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
07. Boyd WH	00	00	02	04	00	00	02	00	00	08
08. Farrar LC	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
09. Geikie, LC	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
10. Pentecost BS	00	00	02	01	01	00	00	00	00	04
TOTALS DA Text	00	00	14	16	03	00	07	—	(25)	65

"In Remembrance of Me"

that at times parallels have been suggested as possible sources even when Ellen White is given full credit for the composition of the DA text. The reasons for our listing these sources vary in details but generally follow the same line of argumentation.

DA4 has verbal similarities with a quotation from Charles Stanford.¹ The ideas are also parallel. But with only two verbatim words and no other use of this writer we felt the evidence was too weak for a claim of dependency. The ideas and terms did not appear as "special" in the light of the voluminous writings on this topic. The quotation does merit our interest, however, and suggests that further consideration of this writer as a possible literary source is warranted.²

The problem of whether to accept the quote from Who Was Jesus? by Charles Deems is likewise over the question of an isolated quotation. In this instance the sentence of Deems is very close to being a verbatim copy. It is clearly a closer parallel than is the quote from Pentecost which was selected because the Bible Studies by George Pentecost shows up elsewhere in the DA text, including this chapter. The quotations from Deems and Pentecost also demonstrate the point made earlier. The sources at times bear such striking similarity with each other that we are at a loss to know

¹Consult the introduction to this chapter for bibliographical data on these sources.

²Similarly DA155-157 and The Works of Stephen Olin, as well as DA181-184 and Sabbath Hours by Bickersteth.

"In Remembrance of Me"

which source is being used. Perhaps Ellen White at times is merely placing her feet in the same stream in which many others are wading.

For DA15 we listed the parallel as Lange rather than Farrar, which we also quote, because of the reference to "standing" and the plural form of the following phrase, neither of which is in the text of Exodus 12:11. The Farrar quote, while including the reference to standing, does not otherwise move beyond the Exodus text.

We cannot be sure if this type of analysis is adequate for distinguishing between very similar comments. But in the case of having multiple parallels, such as we also have with DA20 and DA41,42, some method of discrimination has to be employed if we want to limit the sentence to having one source. Obviously the evaluations of sentences of this nature are as problematic as the sentences themselves.

A final reference on the specific evaluations of chapter 72 brings us to DA79. The location of the Bible quotation right where Hanna places it and between sentences 78 and 80 when Ellen White appears to use Hanna would ordinarily lead us to rate the sentence as (B1) Source Bible. But a careful scrutiny of the verse of Scripture clearly shows Ellen White is also making a special use of the text for her purpose. She omits the final personal pronoun, "He," and leaves the resulting "I am" in upper case for emphasis. The King James Version of John 13:19 has the "he" in italics to indicate the pronoun is not in the Greek

"In Remembrance of Me"

text. The Bible does not have the "I am" expression in upper case. Ellen White's construction makes the Bible quote serve her interest in emphasizing that Jesus is pointing out His messiahship. In view of Ellen White's departure from both Hanna's use of the text and the text form in Scripture, we have marked the sentence as Partial Independence.

Since the earlier writings of Ellen White on the subject of chapter 72 were incorporated into the DA text we have the same sources in both the earlier and later writings. Table 3 on page 536 identifies the sources used and the types of dependent sentences found in these earlier texts. The individual sentence evaluations and the sources involved are given in Appendices B and C. Apart from her comments in 3SP Ellen White apparently worked on the DA text at about the same time she wrote Manuscript 35. We are probably safe in conjecturing that Manuscripts 35 and 47 were specifically written for the life of Christ project. The DA text no doubt represents the editorial work of Marian Davis working with these manuscripts, the earlier text of 3SP, and the edited RH article of June 22, 1897, which also originated from Manuscript 35.

The sources used by Ellen White in commenting upon the communion service have been accounted for in the texts utilized in composing the DA text. We found no earlier writing exhibiting source parallels which was not also used in the DA text. Since these sources have already been

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 72

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
01. BGM	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	00	01
02. Hanna LC	00	00	01	02	00	03	00	00	00	06
03. March WHJ	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
04. Boyd WH	00	00	03	02	00	00	03	00	00	08
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	00	04	05	00	03	03	01	(00)	16

"In Remembrance of Me"

mentioned under the DA text there is no need for further analysis of the pre-DA documents.

In view of the rather limited use of a good number of different sources there is no one source with enough parallels to have influenced the arrangement of chapter 72. The list of source parallels as given in Appendix A points up the lack of dominance by any one source for the total chapter. The redaction of chapter 72 will have to be credited to Marian Davis and/or Ellen White. In a given section of the chapter, sentences 134-146, it would appear that Boyd's structure apparently exercised some influence.

Summary

The study of chapter 72 has challenged us to further research among the religious writers of the nineteenth century. The location of undocumented literary parallels among the writers on the Passover meal leads us to ask about literary conventions of the day. Evidently Ellen White is not the only writer using the works of others without admission and without giving source credits.

The lack of heavy dependence upon sources in the discursive materials encourages us to extend the search for parallels beyond the lives of Christ. And for this particular topic upon which much has been written, we will include in our search the Adventist writers Ellen White no doubt read and even listened to as she regularly celebrated "the ordinances of the Lord's house" from time to time.

"In Remembrance of Me"

Thus far, however, it appears that we can make the following points on the basis of the evidence of this chapter.

1. There are no handwritten documents to support the text of chapter 72 or the text of the previously written materials. The closest we may come to primary materials appears to be the two manuscripts in the form of type-copies. Manuscript 35 carries the date of April 6, 1897, and is 12 pages (174 sentences) long. Manuscript 45 is undated apart from its index number of MS 45, 1897. The copy we worked from indicated that it was "recopied November 24, 1963." Pages 4-6 covered the topic of this chapter. The previous pages relate to chapter 76 to be discussed later in this report.

2. In terms of the length of chapter 72 when compared to the combined length of the earlier materials we have a reduction in length of exposition. The 35 (generally longer) sentences of 3SP and the 174 sentences of manuscript 35 together total 209 or eight more than the 201 sentences of the DA text. But when we note the duplication in content between these two texts and consider the length of Ellen White's individual treatment, the text of the DA account with 201 sentences is slightly longer than the 174 sentences of Manuscript 35 and nearly twice as long as the 108 sentences of the RH article of June 22, 1897. The DA gives more attention to the background, less attention to the feet-washing by comparison with chapter 72, and much more

"In Remembrance of Me"

emphasis to the spiritual lessons to be drawn from the communion service, sentences 164-192. There is also the new material on comparing the first and last passovers and contemplating the cross of Christ, sentences 193-201.

3. The content of the DA text generally duplicated the content of the earlier text where it was treating the same material. The differences are found first in the feet-washing commentary that in the earlier writings was combined with the account of the communion service. This material on the service of humility is separated to form a new chapter, "A Servant of Servants," or chapter 71. Additional differences have been noted under (2) above.

4. We found no significant differences in the content when the texts were treating the same topic. So much of the previous texts were taken up into the DA account that we have extensive duplication in content.

5. Chapter 72 contains 40 sentences in which literary dependency is evident to some extent. When rated against the total of 201 sentences the rate of dependency for the chapter is 20 percent.

6. Literary independence has been indicated for 136 of the 201 sentences or 68 percent of the chapter. Biblical quotes accounted for 25 sentences or 12 percent of the chapter.

7. The rate of dependency for the 40 dependent sentences is 3.75. The degree of dependency for the entire chapter is .75.

"In Remembrance of Me"

8. The major source used in chapter 72 was William Hanna. Seventeen of the 40 parallels have been attributed to his Life of Christ.

9. The World's Hope or The Rock of Ages by Robert Boyd furnished eight parallels; Walks and Homes by Daniel March and Bible Studies by George Pentecost were responsible for four parallels apiece and the works of Cumming, Jones, Lange, Farrar, and Geikie accounted for the other seven. Apart from Boyd we have encountered these minor sources in our study of the earlier DA chapters.

Seven other writers appear in the presentation of the source parallels for this chapter but no claim is made here for Ellen White's usage of their works.

10. The same sources appear in the pre-DA materials of Ellen White on the topic of this chapter. This duplication of sources is to be expected in view of the duplication of text between the DA and the earlier writings. Boyd's work is reflected in eight sentences in these previously written texts, Hanna provided six parallels, and March's influence is clearly to be seen in one sentence.

11. Ellen White expanded her commentary in the DA text over what she had written before. She evidently returned to March's and Hanna's works from her earlier use of these writers when composing the 3SP text. But since apart from the 1878 SP text her previous writings all date from 1897 and were largely incorporated into the DA text, it is to be expected that the parallels from the DA text are very

"In Remembrance of Me"

similar to the earlier parallels. The same sources are represented in both the earlier texts and the DA. We will need to raise this question again if we find sources for some of the new material appearing in the DA text.

12. The majority of the parallels appear in the recounting of the Passover story and in the description of the scene. Apart from the parallels from Boyd's work Ellen White is generally on her own when commenting on the spiritual lessons to be drawn and on the theological interpretation of the event. Unless other sources are found, it would appear that Ellen White is more often on her own in this chapter when it comes to the discursive commentary.

13. The redaction of chapter 72 is the work of Ellen White and/or Marian Davis. The parallels are too few and too scattered to have seriously influenced the structure of the chapter. Obviously the gospel account would provide a basic order to her narrative. In one or two of the smaller units the text of the source evidently provided some influence on the thought development. In other portions, even though parallels were present, Ellen White is in control of the arrangement of her material.

14. We did not study the entire chapter of the 3SP text and therefore cannot speak to its redaction. The text of Manuscript 35 and the RH article of June 22, 1897, exhibit too much independent material of Ellen White's to allow us to credit their structural arrangement to someone

"In Remembrance of Me"

else's work. As we have indicated before, these two texts cover both ordinances and appear to follow the basic order of traditional Christianity. Ellen White just interrupts the flow of the narrative as she moves through the accounts to draw her spiritual lessons and add her theological commentary.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	Bible	B2	051. -	Geikie LC/713.1	P2
002. -	Bible	B2	052. -		I1
003. -	Bible	B2	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -	Bible	B2
005. -	March WHJ/3/307	P2	055. -	bible	B2
006. -	March WHJ/3,4/307	P1	056. -	Hanna LC/24/614	P2
007. -	March WHJ/3,4/307	P2	057. -		I1
008. -	March WHJ/4/307	P1	058. -		I1
009. -	Pentecost(85)/123.2	P1	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -	Bible	B2
011. -		I1	061. -		I1
012. -	Pentecost(88)/123.2	P3	062. -	Bible	B2
013. -		I1	063. -	Bible	B2
014. -		I1	064. -	Hanna LC/56/616	P2
015. -	Lange LOLJC/126.7	P2	065. -		I1
016. -		I1	066. -		I1
017. -		I1	067. -	Pentecost(89)/155.9	P1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -	Jones LSFG/342.5	P3	069. -		I1
020. -	Farrar LC/561.2	P1	070. -	Hanna LC/89/618	I2
021. -	Jones LSFG/342.7	P1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -	Hanna LC/89/618	P1
023. -		I1	073. -		I1
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -	Hanna LC/90/618	P3
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -	Bible	B2	078. -	Hanna LC/64/616	P1
029. -	Bible	B2	079. -	Hanna LC/65/616	I2
030. -	Bible	B2	080. -	Hanna LC/67/616	P1
031. -		I1	081. -	Hanna LC/71/617	P1
032. -		I1	082. -	Hanna LC/71/617	I2
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -		I1	085. -		I1
036. -	Bible	B2	086. -		I1
037. -		I1	087. -		I1
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -	Bible	B2	089. -		I1
040. -	Hanna LC/33/615	P2	090. -		I1
041. -	Hanna LC/16/614	P2	091. -		I1
042. -	Hanna LC/19/614	I2	092. -		I1
043. -	Hanna LC/19,20/614	P2	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -		I1
045. -		I1	095. -		I1
046. -	Hanna LC/21,22/614	P1	096. -		I1
047. -		I1	097. -		I1
048. -	Hanna LC/23/614	P2	098. -		I1
049. -	Hanna LC/29/614	I2	099. -	Cumming MW(3)/35.4	P1
050. -	Pentecost(88)121.9	P2	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.		I1	151.		I1
102.	Cumming MW(3)/35.4	P1	152.	Bible	B2
103.	Bible	B2	153.		I1
104.	Bible	B2	154.		I1
105.	Bible	B2	155.		I1
106.		I1	156.		I1
107.		I1	157.		I1
108.		I1	158.		I1
109.		I1	159.		I1
110.		I1	160.		I1
111.		I1	161.		I1
112.		I1	162.		I1
113.		I1	163.		I1
114.		I1	164.		I1
115.		I1	165.		I1
116.		I1	166.	Bible	B2
117.		I1	167.		I1
118.		I1	168.		I1
119.		I1	169.	Bible	B2
120.		I1	170.	Bible	B2
121.		I1	171.		I1
122.		I1	172.		I1
123.		I1	173.		I1
124.		I1	174.		I1
125.		I1	175.		I1
126.		I1	176.		I1
127.		I1	177.		I1
128.		I1	178.		I1
129.		I1	179.		I1
130.		I1	180.		I1
131.		I1	181.	Bible	B2
132.		I1	182.		I1
133.		I1	183.		I1
134.	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	184.		I1
135.	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	185.	Bible	B2
136.	Boyd WH/565.1	I2	186.	Bible	B2
137.		I1	187.		I1
138.		I1	188.		I1
139.	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	189.		I1
140.		I1	190.		I1
141.		I1	191.		I1
142.		I1	192.		I1
143.	Boyd WH/566.2	P1	193.		I1
144.	Boyd WH/566.2	P2	194.		I1
145.	Boyd WH/566.2	P1	195.		I1
146.	Boyd WH/566.2	I2	196.		I1
147.		I1	197.		I1
148.		I1	198.		I1
149.	Bible	B2	199.		I1
150.	Bible	B2	200.		I1
			201.		I1

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 72

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	3SP 22/83	H/1/613	051.	-		
002.	-	3SP 23/83	H/2/613	052.	-		
003.	-	3SP 27/83	H/8/613	053.	-		
004.	-	3SP 28/83	H/3/613	054.	-		
005.	-	3SP 29/84	H/10a/613	055.	-		
006.	-	3SP 30/84	H/10b/613	056.	-		
007.	-	3SP 73/87		057.	-		
008.	-	3SP 74/87	M/8/308	058.	-		
009.	-	RH (97) 65	BoydWH/565.1	059.	-		
010.	-	RH (97) 66	BoydWH/565.1	060.	-		
011.	-	RH (97) 69	Boyd/565.1	061.	-		
012.	-	RH (97) 70	Boyd/565.1	062.	-		
013.	-	RH (97) 72	Boyd/565.1	063.	-		
014.	-	RH (97) 73	Boyd/565.1	064.	-		
015.	-	RH (97) 74	Boyd/565.1	065.	-		
016.	-	RH (97) 92	Boyd/566.2	066.	-		
017.	-			067.	-		
018.	-			068.	-		
019.	-			069.	-		
020.	-			070.	-		
021.	-			071.	-		
022.	-			072.	-		
023.	-			073.	-		
024.	-			074.	-		
025.	-			075.	-		
026.	-			076.	-		
027.	-			077.	-		
028.	-			078.	-		
029.	-			079.	-		
030.	-			080.	-		
031.	-			081.	-		
032.	-			082.	-		
033.	-			083.	-		
034.	-			084.	-		
035.	-			085.	-		
036.	-			086.	-		
037.	-			087.	-		
038.	-			088.	-		
039.	-			089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 72

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	3SP 22/83	Bl		051.	-			
002.	-	3SP 23/83	P1		052.	-			
003.	-	3SP 27/83	P2		053.	-			
004.	-	3SP 28/83	P2		054.	-			
005.	-	3SP 29/84	Bl		055.	-			
006.	-	3SP 30/84	Bl		056.	-			
007.	-	3SP 73/87	I1	83	057.	-			
008.	-	3SP 74/87	P2	83	058.	-			
009.	-	RH (97) 65	P2	134	059.	-			
010.	-	RH (97) 66	P1	134	060.	-			
011.	-	RH (97) 69	P1	135	061.	-			
012.	-	RH (97) 70	I2	136	062.	-			
013.	-	RH (97) 72	P1	139	063.	-			
014.	-	RH (97) 73	I2	139	064.	-			
015.	-	RH (97) 74	I2	139	065.	-			
016.	-	RH (97) 92	P2	144	066.	-			
017.	-				067.	-			
018.	-				068.	-			
019.	-				069.	-			
020.	-				070.	-			
021.	-				071.	-			
022.	-				072.	-			
023.	-				073.	-			
024.	-				074.	-			
025.	-				075.	-			
026.	-				076.	-			
027.	-				077.	-			
028.	-				078.	-			
029.	-				079.	-			
030.	-				080.	-			
031.	-				081.	-			
032.	-				082.	-			
033.	-				083.	-			
034.	-				084.	-			
035.	-				085.	-			
036.	-				086.	-			
037.	-				087.	-			
038.	-				088.	-			
039.	-				089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 75

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. DA	00	06	68	41	02	13	38	168	15	351
02. 3SP	00	00	18	11	02	01	06	07	03	48
03. RH (91)	00	00	01	02	00	00	01	00	00	04
04. RH (92)	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
05. Di (94)	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	15	00	15
06. MS (51)	00	06	30	24	00	07	16	20	13	116
07. MS (102)	00	00	01	01	00	00	01	29	04	36
08. MS (104)	00	00	02	03	00	01	05	09	04	24
09. MS (111)	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	18	00	18
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	06	52	42	02	09	29	(98)	(24)	262

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 75

Desire of Ages Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
TEXT	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2	TOTAL
01. Bible									15	15
02. Bennett LHJC	00	00	02	04	00	01	01	00	00	08
03. Harris GT	00	01	01	00	00	00	01	00	00	03
04. Krummacher SS	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
05. Ingraham PHD	00	01	07	07	00	00	02	00	00	17
06. Hanna LC	00	01	25	11	01	04	22	00	00	64
07. March WHJ	00	00	03	01	00	00	00	00	00	04
08. Hall HPONT	00	01	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
09. Jones LSFG	00	00	00	00	00	00	01	00	00	01
10. Farrar LC	00	01	20	17	00	07	10	00	00	55
11. Geikie LC	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	00	01
12. Deems WHJ	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
13. Kitto DBI	00	01	02	00	00	01	00	00	00	04
14. EdersheimLTJM	00	00	00	01	01	00	01	00	00	03
15. Andrews LOL	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	00	02
TOTALS DA Text	00	06	68	41	02	13	38	—	(15)	183

Christ furnished some literary assistance for 55 sentences. The only other major source for this chapter was J. H. Ingraham. His imaginative work presenting letters written from an eye-witness account of the life of Jesus evidently influenced 17 sentences of the DA text. Eleven sources are credited with 32 additional parallels.

The average rate of dependence for the entire chapter when including all sentences is 1.8. When we exclude the Strict Independence sentences the average dependency rate for the total dependent sentences is 3.63.

We must not conclude that all these source parallels were initiated through the writing of chapter 75. The dependency of the DA text is largely the result of the literary dependency of the earlier writings which went into the composition of this chapter.

We have listed in six columns in Table A, pages 616 - 623, the six earlier writings of Ellen White that were edited by Marian Davis and compiled into the formation of chapter 75 of The Desire of Ages. In the seventh or last column on the right margin of Table A the sentence numbers of the DA text are given in numerical sequence as they occur in chapter 75 and as they are listed in Appendix A for this chapter. Our analysis shows that 263 or 75 percent of the 350 sentences composing chapter 75 have an earlier history in previously written works of Ellen White. Of the remaining 87 sentences (25%), only 25 (7% of the chapter total) contain source parallels. The other 64 sentences

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas involved 61 Strict Independence and three Bible quotations.¹ If the overall dependency of chapter 75 is to be found in 168 sentences or 48 percent of the text and only seven percent of the newly written materials involved dependency, then we conclude that approximately 41 (40.9) percent or 143 sentences (168 less 25) of the chapter involving source parallels is due to the use of earlier textual materials.

Further, this extensive use of Ellen White's earlier writings should not be understood as mere duplication of content. Some of these writings produced in the decade preceding the publication of The Desire of Ages were expressly written for the anticipated work on the life of Christ. And since at least one of these earlier manuscripts was never (according to our knowledge) independently published, the parallels between it and the DA text should not be viewed as repetition. We do not usually consider the parallels between a first draft and the final draft of a written work to be "duplication." The very process of writing necessitates such restatement.

It is to be expected that the sources would have been used to a greater extent in the production of the constituent texts than in the editing and compilation stage of composing the chapters of the DA text. For this reason

¹These sentences are: 5, 8-12, 14-19, 23, 26, 27, 33, 37, 42, 48, 49-70, 75, 77, 78, 81, 82, 84-86, 89, 110-112, 115, 117, 126, 130, 134, 135, 150, 155, 166, 171, 179, 186-192, 219, 221-223, 226, 273, 308, 315, 320, 322, 323, 325-327, 329, and 332-334. The independent Bible quotations are found in sentences 86, 134, and 166.

alone a thorough study of the use of sources in the composition of chapter 75 must include an analysis of these earlier texts. We therefore turn now to a general review of these pre-DA materials before treating some specific characteristics of Ellen White's use of sources, features which occur in both the earlier writings and in the DA text.

Source Analysis of the Pre-DA text

We have earlier mentioned that the trial of Jesus, particularly the denial of Peter, was a popular subject for Ellen White. Apparently there was no dearth of material for Marian Davis to use in structuring the basic content for chapter 75. We cannot be certain, of course, that our notebook of Ellen White comment on the subject matter of this chapter includes all that Marian Davis had available. Our list includes chapter VIII of Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I; chapters VII, VIII, and IX of Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III; Redemption Leaflet No. 5; MS 1, 1878, pp. 20, 21; MS 1, 1880, p. 16; "The Character of Peter," RH for April 7, 1891; "The Privilege of the Follower of Christ," part II, RH for July 12, 1892; Diary Book No. 18 (1894), p. 43; Manuscripts 51, 101, 102, 104, and 111 of 1897; "Peter's Fall," ST for Nov. 11, 1897; and Manuscript 109, 1898.

We cannot always be sure about the specific text behind each DA sentence that shows some dependency upon an earlier stage of the text tradition. Ellen White often repeats herself in her writings. Other sentences appear to be

variations of the same basic sentence. We have tried to indicate these types of similarities and differences with the use of parentheses and brackets in Table A. When the sentence is modified in form from its earliest appearance in Mrs. White's works parentheses are used. A second change to the same sentence is indicated by brackets. Subsequent changes are shown by alternating use of these symbols. When the sentence is basically the same as its immediate previous use no symbol is used. None of these differences, however, is so major as to exclude the earliest form from being the base form from which the later sentence developed. We have included the texts of these earlier accounts in Appendix D. A careful study of the various forms of the same basic sentence would argue against a verbal inspiration view for the Ellen G. White writings.

In addition to the six earlier texts listed in Table A below, Table 1 on page 610 includes two RH articles. Among the 27 sentences of Ellen White on "The Character of Peter,"¹ we found four sentences which contain parallels with Hanna's Life of Christ. These sentences appear to be the source for sentence 261 and also furnish details about the denial of Peter which are not carried over into the DA narrative.² It is only as we gather together all of Ellen

¹RH, Vol. 68, No. 14 (April 7, 1891).

²A similar example may be shown from the independent comments of Ellen White. In SG, I, p. 51, we read that when "They spit in his face . . . He meekly raised his hand, and wiped it off." This vivid descriptive detail does not appear in 3SP, p. 122, or in the DA text where the same humiliating abuse is recounted (p. 715).

TABLE A

SENTENCE PARALLELS IN ELLEN G. WHITE WRITINGS FOR CHAPTER 75
(EXCLUDES ISOLATED SENTENCES)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u> (1897)	<u>MS 102</u> (1897)	<u>MS 104</u> (1897)	<u>MS 111</u> (1897)	<u>DA</u>
1		(1)				[1]
1/106						(2)
2/106						(3)
3a/106		(2)				[4]
						5
3b/106						6
4/106						(7)
						8
						9
						10
						11
						12
127						(13)
						14
						15
						16
						17
						18
						19
85						(20)
88,89						(21)
86,87						(22)
						23
90		18				(24)
93						(25)
						26
						27
93						(28)
94						(29)
91		19				30
		22				31
98						(32)
						33
		23				34
		127				35
		128				(36)

The sentences under 3SP come from three chapters and are to be identified as follows: sentences 1-6/106 refer to the last six sentences of chapter VII, "In the Garden;" sentences 1-13/127 refer to the first 13 sentences of chapter IX, "Condemnation of Jesus," (sentences 12, 13 are actually on page 128); all other sentences (indexed with a number only) refer to chapter VIII, "In the Judgment Hall," and are numbered in sequence 1-203, beginning with sentence one on page 107.

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u>	<u>MS 102</u>	<u>MS 104</u>	<u>MS 111</u>	<u>DA</u>
						37
95		(20)				[38]
96						39
97						40
98		(21)				[41]
						42
100						(43)
101		(28)				[44]
102						(45)
		31				(46)
		33				(47)
						48
						49
						50
						51
						52
						53
						54
						55
						56
						57
						58
						59
						60
						61
						62
						63
						64
						65
						66
						67
						68
						69
						70
		36				(71)
82						(72)
82						(73)
10a/127						(74)
						75
10b/127						76
						77
						78
11/127						(79)
12/127						80
						81

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u>	<u>MS 102</u>	<u>MS 104</u>	<u>MS 111</u>	<u>DA</u>
						82
13/127						(83)
						84
						85
						86
		39				(87)
		37				(88)
						89
1,2						(90)
84,3						(91)
106						(92)
120						(93)
121						94
119						(95)
110						(96)
110						(97)
110						(98)
116						(99)
107						100
109						101
111						102
112						103
113						104
114a						105
114b						106
115						107
117						108
118						109
						110
						111
						112
		42				(113)
		43				114
						115
128a						(116)
						117
128b						118
131		117				(119)
132		(115)				[120]
133		(115)				[121]
		45				(122)
		50				(123)
		50				(124)
		51				(125)
						126

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u>	<u>MS 102</u>	<u>MS 104</u>	<u>MS 111</u>	<u>DA</u>
134						(127)
135						(128)
136						(129)
						130
137						131
139						132
146						133
						134
						135
151		(52)				[136]
152		(53)				137
		54				(138)
		55				(139)
		56				(140)
		57a				141
		59				(142)
		60				143
157		(61)				144
		62				(145)
		63				(146)
158a		(65)				147
158b, 159						148
160		(67)				[149]
						150
2/127						151
3/127						(152)
1/127b						153
161a						154
						155
5/127						(156)
166, 6/127						(157)
4/127						158
7/127						(159)
162, 161b						(160)
163		(68)				161
164a						162
164b						163
165a						164
165b						165
						166
167a						167
167b						168
167c			(14)			[169]
			15			170
						171

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u>	<u>MS 102</u>	<u>MS 104</u>	<u>MS 111</u>	<u>DA</u>
			27			(172)
			28			173
			31			174
			32			175
			33			176
			34			177
			35			178
						179
			36			180
			37			181
172a		(69)	38			[182]
172b			(39)			183
173		70	40			184
174		71	(41)			185
						186
						187
						188
						189
						190
						191
						192
			44			193
	11		(45)		45	194
	10		(46)		[44]	195
			48, 49			(196)
			47			(197)
			53			(198)
			54			199
	12a				46	200
					47	201
					48	202
	13				(49)	203
	14a				(50)	204
	14b				(51)	205
			61			206
			62			207
			63			208
			64			209
			65			210
			66			211
			67			212
			68			(213)
			69a			214
			69b			(215)
			82			216

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u> (1897)	<u>MS 102</u> (1897)	<u>MS 104</u> (1897)	<u>MS 111</u> (1897)	<u>DA</u>
			102			217
			103, 104a			(218)
						219
			104b			220
						221
						222
						223
		72				224
		73, 74				(225)
						226
		75a				227
		75b				228
		99				229
		100, 101				(230)
		102				231
		103				(232)
		105				233
		106				(234)
4		(80)				[235]
		84				(236)
6/107						(237)
7		(86)				238
8						(239)
9						(240)
10						(241)
11		(87)				[242]
12a						243
12b						244
13a						245
13b				(93)		[246]
				94		247
14		(88)		[95]		248
15				96		249
16				97		250
17		(89)		98		251
18				99		252
19, 20				100		253
69						254
70						(255)
71						256
72						257
73						258
22a						(259)
22b						(260)
74						(261)

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u> (1897)	<u>MS 102</u> (1897)	<u>MS 104</u> (1897)	<u>MS 111</u> (1897)	<u>DA</u>
75						(262)
76						263
77						264
78						265
23						(266)
24						(267)
26b				(109)		268
26a						269
27						270
28				110		271
29						(272)
						273
31				114		(274)
32		(90)		115		275
33a				116		276
33b		(91)		116		(277)
34		(92)		117		(278)
35a		(94)		118		279
35b		(93)		[119]		280
36				120		(281)
37				121		282
		96		(122,124)		[283]
38a						(284)
38b						(285)
38c						(286)
39						287
40						288
44						289
45						(290)
46,47						291
48						292
49						293
50		(95,98)				294
51				(125)		295
52a				(126)		296
56						297
53						298
54						(299)
55						300
57						(301)
58						302
59				(126,127)		[303]
60						(304)
61,62						305
61,62						306

TABLE A - CHAPTER 75
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>DI (94)</u>	<u>MS 51</u> <u>(1897)</u>	<u>MS 102</u> <u>(1897)</u>	<u>MS 104</u> <u>(1897)</u>	<u>MS 111</u> <u>(1897)</u>	<u>DA</u>
68						(307)
						308
63						309
63						310
64, 65						(311)
65						312
66a						(313)
66b						314
						315
		122				316
		123a				(317)
		123b				(318)
		124				(319)
						320
175c						321
						322
						323
176, 177						(324)
						325
						326
						327
		134				(328)
						329
		136				330
		137				(331)
						332
						333
						334
185						335
187						336
187a						337
187b						338
188						339
200						(340)
201, 202						(341)
203						342
190a						343
190b						(344)
190c						(345)
191						346
(192)						347
193						348
198a						349
198b						350

White's comments on a given subject that we are able to appreciate both the unique elements in each account, by way of additions or deletions, and the common features which characterize her repeated treatment of the same topic.

The RH article on "The Privilege of the Follower of Christ"¹ contained only one parallel not already noted in the other writings. Sentence 77 of this same article had some striking similarities to the account by Ingraham.²

The review of the earlier writings did not include an evaluation of each document in full. Our primary concern was to locate source parallels at a stage in the editing process closer to the point of origin. Table 3 on the following page (625) lists the various writers providing these parallels. There were, however, other reasons to list the parallel texts from earlier writings. The comparison of the different forms of the same sentence would provide some insights for understanding the editorial work of the literary assistants and/or Ellen White's personal editing. At times the earlier text form is so different from the DA text that our only sure means of identifying the content of the earlier text with the DA text is through the similarities between the associated sentences in the same context. A final reason for including earlier sentences even when no source parallels have been found has to do with our efforts to understand Ellen White's method of writing.

¹RH, Vol. 69, No. 28 (July 12, 1892).

²Cf. DA283. We would not have listed this single parallel from this two-part article had not Ingraham been used otherwise in this same chapter.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 75

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
		V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	
01. EGM	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	97	24	121
02. Bennett	00	00	00	02	00	00	00	01	00	00	03
03. Ingraham	00	00	00	00	02	00	00	00	00	00	02
04. Hanna	00	00	00	14	15	02	02	10	00	00	43
05. March	00	00	00	07	00	00	00	02	00	00	09
06. Farrar	00	00	05	29	25	00	07	16	00	00	82
07. Kitto	00	00	01	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	02
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	06	52	43	02	09	29	97	(24)	262	

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

For example, the manuscripts of Ellen White on chapter 75 as well as the journal articles and earlier publications are all in typescript or printed form. They exist in their earliest stage available to us as edited documents. It is not possible to tell from these documents in typescript if and to what extent they agree with what Ellen White wrote out in her own hand. When we have a handwritten script, such as Diary Book 14, a part of which was taken up into the DA text, we can compare the work of Ellen White with the later work of her secretaries.

Through comparative analysis we are able to study the degree to which, if any, her writings were changed by her literary assistants. Since we have so little of Ellen White's published works in handwritten form it is of value to check on the faithfulness of her assistants in representing what we know to be her own literary production. There is also another benefit to be derived from a study of her handwritten materials. We are able to evaluate Ellen White as a writer in her own right.¹

Diary Book 18, dated 1894, contains 15 sentences on the trial of Jesus before the Sanhedrin. All 15 register as Strict Independence (11) and evidently were copied into MS

¹Informed students of her writings are aware that Ellen White deplored her own writing skills and on at least one occasion thought of giving up all attempts to write. Current opinion on Ellen White as a writer varies all the way from those who depreciate her writing skills and/or claim that all literary credit should be given to her husband and others who served as her "ghost writers" to those who argue that she had a miraculous gift for literary expression.

102 and MS 111 of 1897. The sentences which finally made their way into the DA text are found in the text presentation under DA sentences 194, 195, 200, 203, and 205. A photocopy of the 15 sentences as they appear in Ellen White's diary journal appears in Appendix D. A comparison of the original script of Ellen White and Manuscript 111 shows that the editing has improved the style, grammar, and syntax of the original. The thoughts of the original version, however, have been faithfully preserved with the majority of the original text still in place and in the same structural arrangement. In this case the text of Ellen White has undergone only minimal editing.

The major Ellen White text for the composition of chapter 75 is Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III. This dependency upon the previous work is not a happenstance. In a letter to W. C. white on August 9, 1897, Marian Davis wrote:

Considering that the very cream has been taken from a large part of the old book, and has been put into every-body's hands, it seems a pity that this new work should have nothing fresh for many of its most important chapters. It seems a pity too, that the most important part of the book should be the part to be hurried and slighted. Again, the chapters as they stand in the old book need a thorough revision and rearrangement for the new.¹

When the sentence numbers of the "old book," Spirit of Prophecy, are compared with the column of sentence numbers for the DA text the "rearrangement" as well as the "fresh" sections of material become obvious.² Out of the 222

¹W. C. W. Letter Book 10-A, p. 51.

sentences of 3SP, chapters VII, VIII, and IX on the topics covered in DA chapter 75, 161 (or 73% of the text) are taken over in some form into the DA text.¹

Not every sentence of the SP text utilized in the DA text has been included in the text presentation. We incorporated those sentences involving source parallels where the dependency was clearer or greater than in the DA text. Table 4 on page 629 offers a sample comparison of dependency evaluations between various earlier texts and the DA text. We also included the SP sentences when sources were used for comments not included in the later DA text or to show the context and thought development even when no dependency was evident in the verbal expressions. When the SP text was duplicated in the DA material the earlier text material was not evaluated. We merely evaluated the later DA text which is the major text base for this study. The earlier identical (or nearly so) text can be located through Table A where the sentence parallels are listed.

Appendix C shows nearly every dependent sentence of the 3SP text we evaluated to reflect Hanna's Life of Christ. A few parallels were found to have come from the writings of March and Bennett.² Other source parallels are to be found in the SP text where it has been duplicated in the DA text.

²The "rearrangement" of the SP account will be discussed under Redaction Analysis below.

¹The complete list of SP sentences used in the DA text may be found in Table A.

²Cf. Appendix C, chapter 75, entries 2, 3, 4, 53, 58, 59, 61, 186, and 188.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 75

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	DA Text	Eval.	Pre-DA Txt.	Eval.	Pre-DA	Eval.
01. -	1/698	P1	MS(51)1	V2		
02. -	2/698	P2			3SP1/106	P1
03. -	3/698	P1			3SP2/106	P1
04. -	4/698	P2	MS(51)2	P1	3SP3/106	P1
05. -	7/698	P2			3SP4/106	P1
06. -	20/699	P1			3SP85/113	P2
07. -	24/699	P1	MS(51)18	P1		
08. -	29/699	P1			3SP94/114	P2
09. -	31/699	P2	MS(51)22	P2		
10. -	34/699	P2	MS(51)23	P2		
11. -	36/699	V2	MS(51)128	V2		
12. -	40/699	I1			3SP97/114	I1
13. -	71/703	I2	MS(51)36	V2		
14. -	87/703	P1	MS(51)39	P1		
15. -	113/705	P2	MS(51)42	P2		
16. -	114/705	P1	MS(51)43	P1		
17. -	119/705	I2	MS(51)117	P1		
18. -	141/706	P1	MS(51)57	P1		
19. -	149/706	I2	MS(51)67	P1		
20. -	182/708	P1	MS(51)69	B1	3SP172/120	P2
21. -	230/710	I2	MS(51)100	P2		
00. -			MS(51)101	I1		
22. -	236/710	P1	MS(51)84	I2	3SP4/107	P1
23. -	280/712	P1	MS(104)119	P1	3SP35/109	P1
24. -	303/713	I2	MS(104)126	P2		
00. -			MS(104)127	I1		
25. -	317/714	P2	MS(51)123a	P1		
26. -	318/714	P1	MS(51)123b	P2		
27. -	319/714	P2	MS(51)124	P1		
28. -	320/714	P2	"	"		

These will have to be traced out through a comparison of Appendix A and Table A.¹

The comments of Marian Davis calling for "fresh" material and a "thorough revision" of the "most important chapters" might partially explain why Ellen White produced five manuscripts on the subjects covered in chapter 75 during 1897.² We use the qualifier, "partially," because Ellen White had been writing on this new "life of Christ" for a number of years. In fact, one of the more important of these five manuscripts, MS 51, 1897, carries the date of May 20, nearly three months ahead of Marian's plea to W. C. White.³

Manuscript 51 is entitled "In the Judgment Hall" and covers the trial of Jesus before the Jewish leaders and before Pilate. Since Ellen White also treats the encounter with Pilate in chapter 77 we only include the first 141 sentences of the manuscript in our discussion here.

The striking feature of this manuscript is its dependency on The Life of Christ by Frederic Farrar. We have included in the text presentation only those sentences from Farrar where the verbal parallels clearly indicate the

¹For example compare 3SP, chapter VIII, sentences 185-188 and DA, chapter 75, sentences 335-339 where Ingraham is the source.

²The copyist signed MS 51 as M. V. H. The White Estate office has identified the initials as Minnie Hawkins.

³Another manuscript on the topic of "Peter's Fall and Restoration" is dated September 8, 1898, only three months before The Desire of Ages was published by Pacific Press Publishing Company. We did not include this manuscript in our study because of its late date. We could not be sure it was not generated from the pre-publication text of DA.

dependency. The tabulations presented in Table 3, page 625, show that among the 82 parallels found in the 141 sentences, five were evaluated as Verbatim, 29 as Strict Paraphrase and 25 as Simple Paraphrase. Seven Bible quotations and 16 Partial Independence complete the list of dependent sentences. The full picture on the literary dependence of Manuscript 51 cannot be convincingly shown through the sentence evaluations alone. We have therefore reproduced the first nine pages of the manuscript (141 sentences) as well as the full text of Farrar for this part of the passion narrative in Appendix D. We invite the reader to compare the two documents for similarity of ideas and thematic arrangement. At times Ellen White will condense in one sentence several sentences of Farrar.

Table 1, page 610, should be consulted for the more complete picture of MS 51. The text includes some parallels other than those credited to Farrar. We evaluated six sentences as Verbatim, 30 as Strict Paraphrase, 24 as Simple Paraphrase, seven as Source Bible, and 16 as Partial Independence. The 141 sentences also contain 20 sentences and 13 Bible quotations credited fully to Ellen White.

Table A lists 75 sentences from MS 51 in parallel with the DA text, of which 31 also parallel the earlier SP account. Apart from the common use of Bible quotations all parallels between MS 51 and 3SP show a modification of the earlier text. The different arrangement of the similar sentences would suggest that MS 51 is not attempting to

revise the SP text. The sentence sequence of MS 51 generally follows the development of the Farrar text.¹ The parallels between MS 51 and the earlier SP account which used Hanna as a source could have resulted from the common Bible storyline. There is, of course, the possibility that Farrar used Hanna as a source.

The study of possible literary dependency between the sources utilized by Ellen White would not only help us in our efforts to untangle the web of relationships between the earlier writings of Ellen White. Such an investigation would also shed more light on the literary practices of the nineteenth century, particularly in respect to the issue of plagiarism.

Of the 44 sentences containing material common to MS 51 and chapter 75 of the DA but not to the earlier SP text, 30 show dependency upon Farrar's account.² Five sentences have been credited to other sources and seven sentences have been evaluated as Strict Independence.³ The dependency of MS 51 is more than partial. Of the 30 sentences showing dependency upon Farrar, 1 is registered as Verbatim, 9 as Simple Paraphrase, and 13 as Strict Paraphrase. It is quite evident that part of the "freshness" brought to the new life of Christ is due to the infusion of new literary material

¹See Appendix C and D under chapter 75 for the comparison between Manuscript 51 and Farrar's text.

²In two instances two sentences of MS 51 were combined into one DA sentence making the sentence count of the DA text 42 rather than 44.

³Compare the MS 51 and DA columns of Table A with Appendix A and C on chapter 75.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas from additional sources. In the case of the MS 51 Farrar is the chief contributor.

A second manuscript written on the trial of Jesus in 1897 is indexed as MS 101, 1897, and dated September 26. The 14-page document contains 210 sentences, 100 of which would apply to chapter 75. Yet, strangely enough, we have found no sources for the writing nor have we located any parallels in the DA text. It is possible that the title, "The True High Priest," led Marian Davis to assume that this manuscript did not treat the earthly life of Christ. Had she read the text she would have immediately noticed the references to Caiaphas and his part in the trial of Jesus.

Manuscript 101 was copied by Maggie Hare (M. H.) and also includes comment on the trial before Pilate and the crucifixion. We have not compared those portions of the document with chapters 77 and 78 of the DA text since the content of these chapters lies beyond the scope of this research project. We have included the first four pages of MS 101 in Appendix D for two reasons. These four pages contain Ellen White material on the topic of our chapter and should be available for further study of source dependency. We are not aware that this text appears elsewhere in published form.

Manuscript 102, 1897, is dated September 26, the same date given to MS 101. It was copied by the same secretary, Maggie Hare (M. H.) and carries the stamped signature of "E. G. White." The seven-and-one-half-page document contains

118 sentences and bears the title, "Caiaphas."

According to our analysis of its content, 38 sentences of MS 102 were taken for the DA composition. Table A shows that most of these sentences represent new material not previously covered in the SP text or earlier manuscripts.¹ The striking feature of this manuscript is its literary independence. As shown in Table 1, we found only three sentences indicating any literary borrowing.

We have included the full text of MS 102 in Appendix D for the same reasons we offered above in respect to MS 101. In addition, the reader can compare the manuscript form of the sentence with the published form in chapter 75. The arrangement of the content between the two presentations on Caiaphas can also be compared. More will be said on this point under the redaction analysis below.

The use of MS 102 by the DA text indicates that Ellen White is also to be credited with contributing to the "freshness" of the new edition of the life of Christ. She not only employs sources in her writings, she adds her own independent comment in the production of new material. This latter aspect of her work should not be overlooked or depreciated even though as a source study the non-original material gets the greater attention.

A fourth manuscript dated in 1897 (the third with a September date) is MS 104. According to the date and

¹Five sentences reflect the earlier texts of Diary Book 14 and MS 51.

initials appearing at the end of the text, it was first copied by Minnie Hawkins on September 7, 1897. The 10-page document of 152 sentences is in fragile condition today but may be easily read through the "recopied" text made on December 12, 1963. The first copy bears the (stamped) signature of "E. G. White."

The text of MS 104 entitled "Condemned by the Jews," opens with quotations from Scripture. In fact, the first two pages contain 29 sentences, 24 of which are taken from the Bible. The sentences of MS 104 taken over by the DA text begin with sentence 90 and have to do with the denials of Peter. Table A shows that most of these sentences are also to be found in 3SP, chapter VIII. There is some dependency on MS 51, 1897, as well. Evidently Ellen White herself referred back to her earlier writings in the composition of new manuscripts.¹

The sections of MS 104, 1897, not appearing in the DA text include, in addition to the Bible quotations already mentioned, thoughts relative to the implications to be drawn from the experience of Jesus by those who will in the last days undergo trials and persecution for their faith. Ellen White also comments on the demonic elements at work behind the scenes in bringing the faithful servants of God to trial.

¹It is possible, of course, that Ellen White extended to her literary assistants the privilege of preparing new compositions from her previous writings. This explanation for the duplication of the earlier materials does not account for new content also found in the later manuscript.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

The full text of MS 104, 1897, may be found in Appendix D. There the reader can trace the free flow of Ellen White's thought as she develops the various lessons to be learned from the trial of Jesus. The condemnation of Jesus is not her main concern. The trial is rather the model, the paradigm, from which she draws or illustrates the teachings for those endeavoring to live faithful Christian lives in the domain of the evil one.

Ellen White's references to the tactics of Satan, the experience of Cain and her appeal to study the book of Revelation may serve to explain why so few source parallels were found in the lives of Christ we examined. Manuscript 104, 1897, contained only six dependent sentences, two of which were Strict Paraphrase and three registered as Simple Paraphrase. One sentence involved a Bible quotation apparently influenced by a source and five were evaluated as Partial Independence. We listed 13 parallels, including four Scripture quotations as Strictly Independent.¹

The fifth and last document on the trial of Jesus before the Sanhedrin written by Ellen White prior to the publication of The Desire of Ages is Manuscript 111, 1897. This lengthy treatise of 27 pages was copied by Maggie Hare on October 7 of that year. The title of the text suggests a rather broad topic, "Our Substitute and Surety." Eight

¹This data also appears in Table 1. We remind the reader that these figures do not represent the evaluation of the full text of Manuscript 104. These earlier texts were searched for their use of sources, not for their independence.

sentences beginning with sentence 44 are also to be found in chapter 75 beginning with sentence 194.¹ There is more to be found in the chapter on the trial of Jesus but in our judgment the DA text does not reflect any use of those comments. In the short section on the trial of Jesus we found no use of literary sources. The sentences parallel to the DA text and/or to the earlier diary material were judged to be Ellen White's work as Table 1 on page 610 indicates. Many of the thoughts, however, are similar to what may be found in the 3SP text and in the earlier manuscripts.

The interesting feature of MS 111, 1897, is its use of material from Ellen White's diary journal. Table A shows parallels between MS(111), 1897; MS(102), 1897; Diary Book 18, 1894; and the DA text. Beyond these sentences Manuscript 111 has some additional parallels with Diary Book 18 which do not appear in chapter 75. These appear in the text presentation beginning with Diary sentence 15 following sentence 205 of the DA text. When the text of the diary is compared with that of Manuscript 111 and both of these with the later DA text we have a text tradition, even though only a few sentences in length, which allows us to trace the words of Ellen White from the original handwritten stage through the copy and corrected level to the final published text. The sample does not involve the use of sources

¹Manuscript 111 also includes commentary on the topics covered in chapters 64, 73, 78, 79, 80, and 81 of the DA text. Since these chapters are not part of the 15 chosen for this study we have not analyzed the full text of the manuscript.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas according to our search but it does offer one illustration of the freedom as well as the control to which the text is subject. Obviously Ellen White and her assistants did not hold to inerrancy and verbal inspiration for the Ellen G. White writings.

The reader will find the text of MS 111, 1897, in Appendix D as well as the other texts to which we have referred. A comparison of sentence with sentence will show the nature and limits of the textual changes which have been made at each stage. In these sentences the modifications for the most part have to do with syntax and style.

In the foregoing discussion we have reviewed the sources used in the composition of chapter 75 and the earlier Ellen White writings on the same topic, and their use of sources. We found Farrar's life of Christ to have furnished most of the parallels in the pre-DA writings. The 82 sentences reflecting Farrar were nearly twice the number of parallels attributed to Hanna. The few parallels remaining were spread among four other sources.¹ Before turning to an analysis of the chapter's content and arrangement in comparison with the earlier writings and the sources involved, let us examine some single sentences. What can we learn from their individual evaluation?

As a general rule we have found that the earlier writings show a greater degree of literary dependency than

¹See Table 3, page 629, and Appendices B and C for additional details on the pre-DA sources.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas the later DA text. The text of 3SP on the Jewish trial of Jesus is more often closer to Hanna's Life of Christ than is the DA text. The same can be said for Manuscript 51, 1897, which is largely dependent upon Farrar's work.¹ When, however, the DA text shows an independent use of literary sources, we will often find closer parallels than is to be noticed for the edited material from earlier Ellen White writings.²

The multiplicity of combinations and the variations in the way the earlier sentences were edited for the new composition militate against finding a single pattern of accommodation.

At times one sentence from an earlier text will be split into two sentences for the DA text.³ Then again two sentences from an earlier writing will be combined into one sentence for the DA text.⁴

On occasion the earlier constructions are more verbose than the DA text but the actual use of the source is the

¹Out of 28 sentences from the DA text listed in Table 4 on page 629, only two registered a closer dependency than did the comparable sentences from MS 51 and 3SP. In three instances where the DA sentence combined material from both earlier documents the dependency for the DA text was the same or closer than either.

²See for example DA5/698 (P1), DA6/698 (P2), DA8/698 (P3), DA10/198 (V2), DA11/698 (P1), DA12/698 (P1), and DA21/699 (P1).

³See DA319/714, DA320/714 and MS(97)124. Under numbers 27 and 28 of Table 4 the resulting DA sentences are given a (P2) evaluation against a (P1) rating for the earlier sentence.

⁴See items 21 and 24 of Table 4, p. 629. Two additional examples of this phenomenon are to be found in DA sentences 230 and 303.

same. In such instances the DA text will be rated at a higher level of dependency because the paraphrasism is more strict than in the earlier writing. To be more precise, the higher dependency rating in such sentences reflects the lesser amount of additional comment by the writer rather than a greater use of the literary source. There are also sentences where the DA text is shortened yet basically the same,¹ where it expands the earlier sentence,² where it reworks the earlier text but remains basically the same,³ where it adds independent comment to the earlier text,⁴ and where it is a verbatim use of the earlier material.⁵

For these reasons the evaluations are not entirely consistent if measured by some specific quantifying measuring stick. The degree of dependency is affected by the relative use of a source and the relative involvement of the writer in adding to, omitting from, or otherwise modifying the text of the literary source. Once again we would stress that the major point of the investigation is to show the nature and scope of Ellen White's use of sources. The presentation of the various texts should largely suffice for that purpose even if our efforts to quantify or otherwise evaluate literary dependency fall short of our projected ideal.

¹Cf. DA113.

²Cf. DA119.

³Cf. DA87.

⁴Cf. DA71.

⁵Cf. DA114, DA280.

Redaction Analysis - The Desire of Ages

The chapter under study is divided into four major sections. Sentences 1-86 cover what Ellen White describes as "a preliminary trial" before Annas, the father-in-law of Caiaphas and the former high priest. Her comments include a discussion of Jewish and Roman law as it applied to the trial of Jesus, the attitude of Jesus, the viewpoint of the angels, and the problem facing the Jewish leaders by virtue of the Passover crowds in Jerusalem. The second and longest portion of the chapter is dedicated to the more formal trial before Caiaphas and the Sanhedrin. The informal questioning of Jesus by Annas and Caiaphas while the council members were gathering, the meeting of the council with its charges, replies of Jesus, and the rending of Caiaphas' robe occupy the next 139 sentences. The third division involving 89 sentences covers Jesus' maltreatment in the guardroom while waiting for the break of day, but devotes its major attention to Peter's denial of Jesus. The fourth major literary component of the chapter offers a commentary on the second appearance of Jesus before the Sanhedrin, His final condemnation, mockery, and abuse. This section covers the final 36 sentences of the chapter.

This arrangement of the trial of Jesus and the related incident of Peter's denials is quite in line with conservative harmonies of the gospel accounts. According to A. T. Robertson, "The Jewish trial comprised three stages, the preliminary examination by Annas . . . , the informal

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

trial by the Sanhedrin, probably before dawn, and the formal trial after dawn."¹ Others would view the reference in the gospel of John² to the appearance before Annas as a variant tradition of the trial of Jesus before the Jewish authorities and not a separate hearing before Annas.³

Our concern here is not to establish the correct chronology for the various aspects of the trial of Jesus nor even to argue for one harmony of the four gospel accounts of Jesus' trial as being the one solution that takes into consideration all the variables. We are interested in presenting a brief overview of the problem any commentary on the life of Christ faces when trying to make one story out of differing traditions. For it is not only the gospel of John that presents some unique elements.

In Matthew and Mark⁴ we have basically the same story on the trial and Peter's denial of his Lord. Luke, however, presents some major shifts in the arrangement of the materials.⁵ According to his account Jesus is taken from the garden directly to the house of the high priest where He is mocked and abused. The Sanhedrin is not involved and there is no trial during the night. He immediately moves into the story of Peter's denials and follows with the condemnation of Jesus by the Sanhedrin after dawn of the

¹A. T. Robertson, A Harmony of the Gospels (New York: Harper & Row, 1922), page 209, footnote.

²John 18:12-14, 19-23.

³Cf. Kurt Alaud, editor, Synopsis of the Four Gospels (United Bible Societies, 1982), pages 301-307.

⁴Matthew 26:57-75; Mark 14:53-72.

⁵Luke 22:54-71.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas next day. In addition to these differences in the major movements of the story there are other features which undergo rearrangement. In Luke the maltreatment of Jesus takes place in the house of Caiaphas and not at the end of the informal trial at night after the high priest rends his garments. The details of the denial of Jesus by Peter differ in all four gospels.

With such variation in the biblical accounts of the trial of Jesus and the denials of Peter it should not disturb us to discover that Ellen White and the sources she used do not always agree with each other in their attempts to arrange the differing elements into one continuous narrative.

Our analysis of the story line of the DA text would suggest Ellen White or Marian Davis is following the traditional conservative arrangement which takes the account of John of the preliminary trial and follows with the narrative as agreed on by Matthew and Mark. To this basic narrative structure is added some extended commentary on Jesus' attitude under abuse and insult and that of the angels of heaven. In the second segment she extends her own commentary to include the thoughts of Caiaphas as Jesus stood before him, and she devotes considerable space to the significance of Caiaphas' act of rending his robes.

Among a number of extrabiblical details that are described throughout the story, two caught our attention in the third part of the narrative. There is no mention in any

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

one of the gospels that Jesus is held over until dawn in the guardroom where He is further mistreated. The Scriptures also give no indication that Peter went to Gethsemane when "he went out, and wept bitterly."¹ The former detail may be found in Farrar's commentary on the life of Christ and the latter is developed by Hanna in his narrative on The Life of Christ.² One further extrabiblical notation merits our interest for a number of reasons. We have reference to Ellen White's comments in the last major sub-section of chapter 75 on the shameful treatment of Jesus.

Sentences 331-350 of The Desire of Ages describe what Ellen White calls "the third scene of abuse and mockery, worse even than that received from the ignorant rabble."³ Evidently she is referring here to cruelty to which He was exposed while in the guardroom following the condemnation by the Sanhedrin during the night. In DA230/710 she speaks of "the ignorant rabble" who "took license to manifest all the satanic elements of their nature." This incidence of "abuse and mockery" forms the subject of Ellen White's closing comments of chapter 75. The occasion follows the "third condemnation" of Jesus by "the Jewish authorities."⁴ Specifically she is speaking of the actions of the Sanhedrin meeting early on the morning of Friday, the day of the Roman trials by Pilate and the crucifixion which follows. This

¹Luke 22:62. See also Matthew 26:75 and Mark 4:72.

²See also DA229-DA234 and DA296-DA303 and the accompanying source references.

³DA331/714.

⁴DA329/714.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas meeting of the Sanhedrin is reported briefly in three gospels.¹ In neither of these reports is there any mention of Jesus' receiving abuse. In fact, the references to the blindfold, the slap in the face, the spitting in the face of Jesus, and the mocking cry of "Prophecy unto us, thou Christ, Who is he that smote thee?" are taken from the various accounts of the informal session of the council during the night.²

Apart from this last section on the abuse of Jesus the composition of chapter 75 basically follows the arrangement of Matthew and Mark with the addition of the earlier preliminary trial as John's gospel is interpreted to present. Because of the uncertainty of what John refers to in the short visit before Annas which also involves the high priest, Caiaphas, certain interpreters also speak of a "preliminary examination by Caiaphas."³ Ellen White likewise includes a special meeting of Annas, Caiaphas, and Jesus when these Jewish authorities "questioned Jesus" while waiting for the Sanhedrin to convene.⁴

Chapter 75 with its special arrangement of the various biblical accounts can perhaps best be explained by appealing to Ellen White's practice and that of Marian Davis to use various "lives" of Christ and harmonies of the Gospels.⁵

¹Matthew 27:1, 2; Mark 15:1, and Luke 22:66-71.
²Matthew 26:67, 68; Mark 14:65, and Luke 22:63-65.
³Samuel J. Andrews, The Life of Our Lord Upon the Earth (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1891), p. 505.

⁴DA91/703.

⁵See Part B of the Introduction, pages 157-159, for further comment on this point.

The chronology of this particular chapter appears to have been influenced by the chronological order of Samuel Andrews' life of Christ.

Under Part VII, "From the arrival at Bethany to the Resurrection," Andrews outlines the sequence of events as follows:

The general order of events immediately following the arrest is plain: 1. The Lord is led to Annas. 2. He is sent by Annas to Caiaphas the high priest. 3. He is brought before the Sanhedrin, tried and condemned. 4. During this period Peter three times denies the Lord. But there are some points of controversy: 1. Before whom, Annas or Caiaphas, was the first examination held? 2. What was the nature of this examination? 3. The competence of the court and the legality of the trial. 4. When and where did the denials of Peter take place?¹

In a note summarizing the activities of Friday morning Andrews writes:

After the Sanhedrin had pronounced Him guilty of blasphemy, and so worthy of death, it suspends its session to meet at the break of day. During this interval Jesus remains in the high priest's palace, exposed to all the ridicule and insults of his enemies, who spit upon Him, and smite Him. As soon as it is day the Sanhedrin again assembles, and after hearing His confession that He is the Christ, formally adjudges Him to death. Binding Him, they led Him away to the Roman governor Pontius Pilate, that he may execute the sentence.²

Apart from some disagreement over the nature of the appearance before Annas as recorded by John, the only major difference between what we can reconstruct from the gospel accounts and Andrews' arrangement is the placing of another attack on the person of Jesus following the formal condemnation on Friday morning.

¹Samuel Andrews, op. cit., p. 505.

²Ibid., p. 521.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

Ellen White's comments on this cruel treatment of Jesus contain literary parallels from Ingraham's work on the life of Christ.¹ In this more imaginative presentation of the life of Jesus the trial scenes are compressed into one trial before Caiaphas. There is no separate formal trial after dawn. Therefore the abuse of Jesus which follows the informal night trial of the Sanhedrin becomes for Ingraham the event that just precedes the trial before Pilate.

The arrangement of Ingraham's account may have led Ellen White to place a final torture scene following the Friday morning trial session. Her commentary on this experience of Jesus contains, however, verbatim remarks taken from her earlier account in Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III. It is very possible that the writings of Ellen White used to form much of the text of this chapter also influence its compositional arrangement. Before concluding our remarks on the redaction of chapter 75 it might prove helpful to study the order of events as presented by these earlier texts.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

In Spiritual Gifts, I, Chapter VIII, Ellen White recounts "The Trial of Jesus." It is unclear just when her commentary moves from the Jewish trial to the appearances of Jesus before Pilate. The account of 63 sentences includes some material on Judas as well as on the denials of Peter.

¹J. H. Ingraham, The Prince of the House of David (Philadelphia: G. G. Evans, 1859).

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

In addition, four verses describing the abuse of Jesus in connection with the trial before Pilate¹ follow the record of Peter's denials.² Very little is said about the trial itself, whether before Annas, Caiaphas, or the formal appearance before the Sanhedrin on Friday morning. Many details which are to be found in the later accounts do not appear here. It is therefore surprising to note that two features of the SG narrative are not preserved in the later writings of Ellen White on the trial of Jesus. In the midst of her description of the physical abuse of Jesus, including comments found later in the SP text and the DA, are these words commenting on the spitting in His face: "He meekly raised his hand, and wiped it off."³ There are also nine sentences treating the reactions of His disciples as they witnessed the trial of Jesus.⁴ There is no indication in the Gospel accounts that any of the disciples, other than Peter and John, were able to enter the palace of the high priest where so much of the action took place.

The thematic nature and abbreviated scope of the SG narrative leads us to conclude that it did not play any significant role in influencing the structure of the DA text for chapter 75.

The Jewish trials of Jesus occupy 222 sentences of volume three of Spirit of Prophecy. The narrative begins

¹John 19:1-3.

²SG I, p. 50.

³SG I, p. 51.

⁴SG I, pp. 51, 52.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

with the final six verses of chapter VII which treat the short appearance before Annas following the arrest in the garden. The next 202 sentences compose the greater part of chapter VIII, "In the Judgment Hall." The last 43 sentences of chapter VII cover the attempt of Judas to obtain the release of Jesus from Caiaphas. This part of the trial episode is left to chapter 76 of the DA text. The SP account of the trial of Jesus before the Jews concludes with the first 13 sentences of chapter IX, "Condemnation of Jesus." This latter chapter has reference to the sentence of Pilate and not that of the Sanhedrin in formal session on Friday morning.

The general structure of the Spirit of Prophecy narrative may be outlined as follows: 1. The movement of Jesus from the garden to the house of Annas for a brief appearance before the former high priest and on to Caiaphas' palace. 2. A brief transitional paragraph placing Jesus in the palace of Caiaphas being falsely accused and tormented. 3. A long segment (73 sentences) commenting on the denials of Peter and how the disciples of Jesus could have prepared themselves for trials and temptations. 4. Twenty-two sentences comparing John's attitude with that of Peter as both witnessed the "mock trial" of Jesus. 5. The questioning of Jesus by Annas and Caiaphas while awaiting the arrival of the other members of the Sanhedrin. 6. The major portion of chapter VII, 79 verses, covers the trial of Jesus before the informal assembly of the Sanhedrin. 7.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

The confession of Jesus and the reaction of the high priest and others. 8. The abuse of Jesus by the Jewish leaders and the people in attendance. 9. The motives in making His confession. 10. Why the Jews hastened to Pilate with their special prisoner.

We have pointed out earlier that one of the specific purposes behind the writing of the DA was to revise "the old book."¹ When the sequence of sentence numbers for the texts of 3SP and DA are compared, it is very obvious that the order of the SP text has not been followed.² SP commentary on the private questioning by Annas and Caiaphas is in the DA text located at the time of Jesus' appearance before Annas alone. The episode of Peter's denials is not discussed in the DA text until the informal midnight trial is completed. The DA text also has a separate formal trial of Jesus by the Sanhedrin and much of the description of the abuse of Jesus by the rabble and the Jewish leaders themselves is presented following the daylight trial rather than coming after the midnight session as given in the SP text.

There are some minor content changes as well in the SP text when compared to the early SG account. There is more written on the abuse of Jesus but no mention of His wiping the spittle from His face. Where in the earlier text Peter merely leaves the judgment hall weeping, the DA text

¹See above, page 627.

²See Table A, pages 616-623.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas describes his return to Gethsemane and to the very spot where Jesus prayed. This detail is not mentioned in the Gospel accounts. The SP story has a third crowing of the cock¹ as against two crowings for the DA text and the Markan account.²

The majority of source parallels found in 3SP come from March and Hanna. These two writers furnished many parallels for the writings of Ellen White. It is conceivable that the structure of the 3SP text and/or the DA text was patterned after their coverage of our topic. Our study does not support this supposition. In Hanna Peter's denials are treated in isolation from the trial before the Sanhedrin.³

In respect to the Jewish trials, Hanna combines the appearance before Annas with the preliminary examination by Annas and Caiaphas while the council members were gathering and has this incident immediately following the garden arrest. Hanna also has two incidents of abuse. Officials slapped, blindfolded, mocked, and spit upon Jesus during the hearing before Annas and Caiaphas. A second "outburst of violence" followed the condemnation of Caiaphas at the informal trial.⁴ Hanna does not mention a third occasion for foul play which Jesus had to endure following the formal condemnation.⁵ March does not describe the trial scenes of Jesus.

¹3sp34/109.

²Matthew 26:74, Luke 22:60, and John 18:27 record one crowing of the cock.

³William Hanna, The Life of Christ, pp. 653-662.

⁴Ibid., pp. 665, 668.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

The three remaining source documents treating the content of chapter 75 at some length are MSS 51, 102, and 104. In none of these manuscripts is there a broad enough coverage to have influenced the construction of the entire chapter. The longer of the three, MS 51, dedicates the first 35 sentences to the appearance of Jesus before Annas. The following 35 sentences treat the informal trial before Caiaphas. Eight more sentences have to do with the insults Jesus received at the hands of the mob and guardroom personnel. The transitional paragraph follows, leading from the abuse of the people to the denial by Peter. The three denials are handled in 13 sentences.

Following the Peter episode, MS 51 returns to the experience of Jesus while in the guardroom waiting for the dawn. The commentary subtly shifts to the reasons for the animosity of the people against Jesus and returns to a trial scene. It is not clear from the text when and where this trial takes place. The condemnation and abuse which follow are described as the third of such events. The 37 sentences involved in this major segment of MS 51 are followed by four sentences relating to the morning trial by the Sanhedrin. It is uncertain if these final sentences are meant to recapitulate the third trial and condemnation or speak of still a fourth judgment against Christ.

Some of the difficulties of following the chronological

⁵Ibid., p. 668. Cf. sentence 2, section IV, p. 672, for a possible reference to additional violence.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas
sequence of events as presented in MS 51 may be cleared up
by consulting the major source utilized in the composition
of the document.

In Table B which follows on page 654 we have listed the
sentences of MS 51 by number in the order in which they
appear in the text. In a parallel column the sentences from
Farrar's life of Christ are listed according to the sequence
number and page where they occur in that text.¹ The
sentences listed on the same horizontal line contain similar
content. Table B has been constructed from the data
provided in Appendix C to show where the arrangement of MS
51 reflects a similar order of presentation in Farrar's
narrative.

The table shows that 79 sentences or sentence units out
of the 137 sentences of MS 51 treating the content of
chapter 75 contain parallels to Farrar's text. Most of
these parallels also follow the same sequential order.
Farrar's commentary on the life of Jesus could have
influenced the organization of the DA text insofar as MS 51
has been incorporated into chapter 75.

According to Farrar, there were three trials "which our
Lord underwent at the hands of the Jews, the first
only--that before Annas . . . the second--that before
Caiaphas . . . the third--that before the Sanhedrin."² The
narrative of Farrar also speaks of the abuse of Jesus on the

¹Frederic W. Farrar, The Life of Christ (New York:
Hurst & Company, 1874).

²Farrar, op. cit., p. 596.

TABLE B

SENTENCE PARALLELS BETWEEN MANUSCRIPT 51 AND FARRAR'S LIFE OF CHRIST

No.	-	MS(51) 1897	FARRAR 1891	No.	-	MS (51) 1897	FARRAR 1891
001.	-	1	10/596	041.	-	53	94b/604
002.	-	2	10/596	042.	-	55	95/605
003.	-	3	30/599	043.	-	56	97/605
004.	-	4a	35/600	044.	-	57	97, 98/605
005.	-	4b	37/600	045.	-	58	99, 100/605
006.	-	5	39/600	046.	-	59	101/605
007.	-	6	43, 44/600	047.	-	61	105/605
008.	-	8	46/601	048.	-	62	107/605
009.	-	9	45/601	049.	-	63	108/605
010.	-	10	45/601	050.	-	64	109a/605
011.	-	11	47, 48/601	051.	-	65	109b/605
012.	-	14	50/601	052.	-	67	110/605
013.	-	15	51/601	053.	-	69	116-120/606
014.	-	16	52/601	054.	-	72	2/608
015.	-	18	53/601	055.	-	73	2/608
016.	-	19	54-55/601	056.	-	74	3/608
017.	-	21	57-58/601	057.	-	75	3/608
018.	-	22	59a/602	058.	-	78	1/608
019.	-	23	59b/602	059.	-	80	6, 7/608
020.	-	26	62/602	060.	-	81	6/608
021.	-	28	63/602	061.	-	90	33, 36/611
022.	-	32	65/602	062.	-	96	42-44/611
023.	-	33	66/602	063.	-	97	44/612
024.	-	36	68a/602	064.	-	99	52/612
025.	-	37	68b, 69/602	065.	-	100	52/612
026.	-	38	70/602	066.	-	102	52/612
027.	-	39	71, 72/603	067.	-	103	53/612
028.	-	40	76/603	068.	-	104	57/613
029.	-	41	78/603	069.	-	115	71/615
030.	-	42	79/603	070.	-	117	72/615
031.	-	43	82/604	071.	-	122	78/615
032.	-	44	83/604	072.	-	123a	77/615
033.	-	45	84/604	073.	-	123b	79a/615
034.	-	46	85a/604	074.	-	124	79b/615
035.	-	47	85a/604	075.	-	127	80/615
036.	-	48	85b/604	076.	-	128	80/615
037.	-	49	88a/604	077.	-	134	91/616
038.	-	50	88b/604	078.	-	136	92b/617
039.	-	51	92/604	079.	-	137	93/617
040.	-	52	94a/604				

Sentences 7, 12-13, 20, 24-25, 27, 29-31, 34-35, 54, 60, 66, 70-71, 76-77, 79, 82-89, 91-95, 98, 101, 105-114, 116, 118-121, and 135 do not contain parallels from Farrar. They are quotes from Scripture, sentences containing parallels from other sources, or are sentences we have evaluated as Strict Independence.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas way to the guardroom and leads us into the Peter episode. Once the story of Peter's denials is told we are taken back to the guardroom where Jesus is the victim of violence while the priests await the dawn.¹

Finally, Farrar clearly describes the early morning trial of Jesus as the third condemnation followed by "a second derision resembling the first, but even more full of insult, and worse to bear than the former. . . ."2

From the foregoing analysis of the pre-DA texts it is evident that the literary sources contribute more than verbal expressions. These sources also influence the thematic development of the subsections of the narrative and, in the case of MS 51 for example, may also impact upon the composition of a major division of a document.

We must not overlook the role Scripture plays in providing the basic skeleton for the various lives of Christ, including The Desire of Ages. At the same time it must be admitted that where the Scriptures do not present a unified story, interpreters are left to construct the story in a way which in their thinking takes into account all the variables. These writers may take strict notice of the historical, chronological, and geographical aspects of the biblical narrative, as do Andrews and Farrar, or they may

¹Ibid., pp. 606, 612.

²Ibid., p. 617. It is uncertain as to what Farrar means by the term "derision." It might only refer to contempt and ridicule over the Messianic claims of Jesus. We do know from Farrar's description of the "first derision" (p. 613) the abuse included physical violence.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas take certain liberties with the text in the interest of appealing to faith and devotion. Perhaps Ingraham should be classified among those of the latter interest.

It does seem reasonable to conclude that the arrangement of the DA text was based primarily on the record provided by the four Gospels. Our analysis would also suggest that the emphasis on the preliminary trial before Annas which opens the chapter, and the abuse following the Sanhedrin trial on Friday morning, the feature that closes chapter 75, are so positioned due to the influence of the lives of Christ by Andrews and Farrar. Marian Davis evidently combined the order of events suggested by Andrews with the structure presented by Manuscript 51 which had been influenced by Farrar's text.

Our discussion so far has focused on the influence of the sources on the arrangement of the text. We should not overlook, however, the contribution made by the independent Ellen White material. The majority of the sentences we have evaluated as Strict Independence occur as added statements scattered throughout the SP text, MS 51, and the final DA text. These remarks often expand the commentary found in the literary source or relate to the thoughts of Jesus, to the viewpoints of the angels, to the intentions of the evil one, or to the moral, spiritual, and devotional lessons to be learned from the experience of Jesus.¹

¹Out of the 138 sentences of MS 51 which treat the content of chapter 75 we found 21 scattered independent comments of Ellen White.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

The redaction analysis also indicates that Ellen White contributed segments of material which function as building blocks in the arrangement of her compositions. Her texts do not merely take over the order of the literary source. The impact of her own literary activity may be easily recognized.¹

Sentences 54-70 of the DA text refer to the attitude of Jesus and the concern of the angels over the abuse Jesus suffered at the hand of His Jewish tormentors. Twelve sentences beginning with DA74 enlarge upon the reasons why the Jewish leaders were so anxious to rush the trial of Jesus.²

A third major addition of Ellen White presents the thoughts of Caiaphas when Jesus makes the confession of His identity.³ In these sentences Marian Davis has selected material from MS 102, 1897. While in a few places one may find reflections of Hanna's work, the commentary is that of Ellen White.

The largest section of independent material is found in Ellen White's exposition on the significance of Caiaphas in tearing his priestly robes. The DA text is based upon the diary journal of 1894 and further expansion on the topic in MS 102, 1897.⁴ The earlier remarks of Ellen White have been

¹Cf. Appendix A, chapter 75.

²Some of her comments may be traced back to 3SP10-13/127.

³DA161/707 - 181/708.

⁴Some of the comment from the diary of 1894 may also be found in MS 111, 1897. See Table A (pp. 616-623) for the sentence parallels involved.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas edited for chapter 75 but even so 37 sentences (over 10% of the chapter) have been dedicated to that feature (of Caiaphas and the priestly robes) of the narrative.¹

There are 12 sentences of Ellen White comment regarding the failure of Peter and the other disciples to prepare for the temptations they were to experience in connection with the trial and crucifixion of Jesus. This small segment was largely taken over from volume three of The Spirit of Prophecy. The 3SP text has not been included in the text presentation because our research did not turn up any source parallels for these sentences. Table A indicates that about half the 3SP sentences are taken over verbatim.²

A final contribution of Ellen White material to the creation of literary subsections for chapter 75 appears in the last nine sentences where she refers to the abuse of Jesus following His last appearance before Caiaphas and the Sanhedrin.³ These sentences make their first appearance in 3SP as Table A shows. Ellen White builds on the work of Ingraham here but adds some specific details on the treatment Jesus received.

Our analysis of the redaction of chapter 75 led us to the study of the order of events as presented in the previously written documents used by Marian Davis in the formation of the chapter. It seems that while the order of the separate individual writings lying behind the DA text

¹DA186/708 - 222/709.

²The DA sentences are 304/713 - 315/714.

³DA342/715 - 350/715.

exercised a measure of influence, Marian Davis also exercised some independence in the combination of the materials from the earlier writings into the larger composition. She evidently sought the assistance of other writers as she worked on the life of Christ even as Ellen White used sources in the arrangement of the earlier materials. We can only conclude that a study of the influence of literary sources in the writing of chapter 75 must go beyond the impact of the sources in the literary expressions of the DA text. It must include an appreciation for their effect on the literary structure of the text.

The recognition of literary dependency has been emphasized in this study because it was the main purpose of the investigation. Many may find the use of sources greater than they had anticipated. This focus on source dependency in the Ellen White writings must, however, be balanced by the acknowledgment of Ellen White's independent commentary, her selection of sources and the way in which these sources are used or set aside. Credit must also be given to Marian Davis the "book-maker." It was her task to select the comments to be used in the DA text, to decide whether and how to combine the earlier expressions into new sentence constructions, and to establish their relative importance in the thematic development of the chapter by selecting the amount of text for each episode.

It remains uncertain to us if and to what degree Marian Davis was aware of the role literary sources played in Ellen

White's writing practices. She appears to have made her selections of text from the earlier documents without regard to whether the text was largely independent Ellen White material or was largely laced with source parallels.

Finally, the place of the Scriptures should be highlighted. Ellen White, her sources, Marian Davis, and the writers she read for assistance all turned to the Gospels as the basic source document. This common literary source, which for chapter 75 involved all four Gospels, would unavoidably lead to the creation of many unintentional literary parallels.

Content analysis is not a major emphasis of this investigation but one cannot avoid receiving impressions from reading and re-reading the chapter. According to our impressions Ellen White goes beyond the descriptive commentary of the sources to stress motivations, attitudes, and character. She looks beyond the view as seen by the natural eye to encompass the viewpoints of those who see from afar, from the angels and from the evil one. She also moves beyond the speech and actions to the motives and attitudes of the main characters, of Jesus, of Caiaphas, and of Peter. Some of these same concerns are addressed by sources but not generally with the emphasis found in Ellen White's writings. Since The Desire of Ages was written to lead people into the acceptance and/or greater appreciation of Jesus as man's Saviour, Ellen White also stresses the sufferings of Jesus and the selfless love which motivated

His life.

Ellen White follows the pattern of her sources in moving beyond the scope of the biblical narrative. The times, places, and characters are so described and presented as to enable the reader to sense the dynamics of the actions, the tensions of the situation, and various forces involved. At times this leads both Ellen White and the writers she read to take positions not all that clear from the Gospels, such as a preliminary trial by Annas alone and a final period of extreme abuse following the morning trial or at least following the sufferings experienced in the guardroom.

There are times when Ellen White's comments appear to be in direct conflict with Scripture as in 3SP34/109 and again as late as 1897 and MS 104, sentence 117. In this instance it is only a matter of the cock crowing three times. The gospel writers do not agree among themselves but no gospel speaks of a third crowing.

The analysis of chapter 75 has been long and involved. Perhaps such an extended examination is to be expected when one is faced with a review of 350 sentences, their sources, and five earlier Ellen White texts and their possible sources. In any case, our task of comparing 15 chapters of the DA text necessitates that we raise the same questions for each chapter regardless of length. We will be especially interested to discover if our conclusions for this longest chapter of The Desire of Ages differs markedly from the summaries of the other 14 chapters.

Summary

The conclusions drawn from our study of chapter 75 will be summarized in 14 rather concise statements. The order and format for these summary statements have been outlined in Part I of the Introduction. The conclusions are presented as answers to the 14 separate questions being addressed to each of the 15 chapters. The final summary statement for the entire research project will attempt to compile the data from each of these chapters for each specific question. The statements are identified by a number which corresponds to the number of the question presented in the introduction and to the conclusions of each chapter having to do with that particular question. If chapter 75 does not furnish any information for answering one of the questions, a statement to that effect will follow the number given for that specific question.

1. There are no extant handwritten manuscripts of the text of chapter 75. Neither do we possess any typescript manuscript of this chapter at any stage of its development. The one long section of the DA text not found in any earlier material does not exist in any form other than the published DA text.¹

We do have some primary source material for portions of the DA text which were taken from Ellen White's earlier writings and from textual materials no doubt being written

¹We have reference here to sentences 48-70.

specifically for the new work on the life of Christ. We have 15 sentences from Diary Book 14, 1894, in Ellen White's manuscript. Five of these 15 sentences touching the topics of chapter 75 made their way into the DA text. In addition to these sentences in her original manuscript we have four manuscripts as copied and edited by Ellen White's secretaries, portions of which were used in the construction of this chapter.¹ All four manuscripts date from 1897.²

2. Even though chapter 75 is the longest chapter of the 15 to be studied it represents only about 58 percent increase over the length of 3SP.³ The 128 additional sentences of coverage for the DA text is a relatively small increase when we take into consideration 15 sentences from Diary Book 14, 138 sentences from MS 51, 64 sentences from MS 101,⁴ 130 sentences in MS 102, 153 in MS 104, and 92 in MS 111, not to mention the articles Ellen White had written on Peter's denials. There is of course a great deal of duplication in these various texts as Table A clearly shows. There is also duplication of content between the 3SP text and the earlier SG material. And since the additional writings of Ellen White provided an opportunity for more independent expression as well as for the use of additional

¹MSS 51, 102, 104, and 111.

²The earliest form we found for MS 104 was a "recopied" edition made in 1963.

³This figure is based on 222 sentences for 3SP and 350 for chapter 75.

⁴We have listed only 64 since those sentences have been reproduced in Appendix D. We estimate nearly 100 sentences from this manuscript touch on the content of chapter 75.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

source material we cannot attribute the expansion of comment to merely an increase in source parallels. The DA text therefore represents a reduction or condensation of Ellen White's writings on the trials of Jesus and Peter's denials.

3. When we compare the content of the DA text with that of the earlier writings we must keep three points in mind. Firstly, it must be remembered that the only previously written full coverage of the trial of Jesus before the Jews is to be found in 3SP. Secondly, both 3SP and chapter 75 are following the basic storyline as reported in the four Gospels. Thirdly, the manuscripts produced in 1897 were no doubt written to fill out certain aspects of the story for the DA text being compiled. They were produced as supplementary to begin with and we would be out of place to compare them against a text meant to be comprehensive. The emphases of these later writings might assist us in recognizing the perceived weakness of the earlier 3SP treatment.

4. The thematic development of 3SP and chapter 75 are similar in most aspects of their overall structure as indicated under (3) above. Their differences are apparent in two ways. In respect to order 3SP presents the denials of Peter before it discusses the trial before Caiaphas sometime during the night. It also concludes the narrative on the Jewish trials with a commentary on Jesus' confession and why the Jewish authorities were rushing the condemnation. The DA text discusses Peter's denials after

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas recounting the night trial and closes the chapter with the abuse of Jesus following the morning appearance before the Sanhedrin.

The two full presentations by Ellen White also differ in the later addition of materials. The DA text gives more coverage to the preliminary trial before Annas and the abuse Jesus suffered on that occasion. Another expansion of the earlier SP account has to do with the reaction of Caiaphas to Jesus' comment on the Son of man coming as judge. The commentary on Caiaphas' thoughts and the significance of his act in tearing his priestly robes is largely Ellen White's independent material as presented in MS 102.

Two minor expansions have to do with a description of the movement of Jesus to the guardroom and his violent handling there and the description of the formal trial on Friday morning.

5. Chapter 75 contains 168 sentences or 48 percent of the text registering some degree of literary dependence.

6. We rated another 48 percent or 168 sentences as Strict Independence. If we added the 38 sentences estimated as showing Partial Independence, the total number of sentences showing some degree of independence would be 206 or 59 percent of the chapter. We excluded 15 sentences quoting Scripture, or 4 percent of the text, from these calculations.

7. According to the dependency rating scale the degree of dependency for the entire chapter when including all

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas sentences is 1.8. When the Strict Independence sentences are excluded, the average dependency for all dependent sentences is 3.63.

8. Three sources play a major role in contributing to the writing of this chapter. Hanna's Life of Christ was used in 64 sentences, Farrar's Life of Christ is reflected in 55 sentences, and The Prince of the House of David by Ingraham was operative in 17 constructions.

9. Minor use was made of 11 writers if our evaluations of parallels is correct. They include the familiar sources such as Harris (GT), March (WHJ), Jones (LSFG), Geikie (LC), and Edersheim (LTJM) as well as less known (to us) sources such as Bennett (LHJC), Krummacher (SS), Hall (HPONT), Deems (WHJ), Kitto (DBI), and Andrews (LOC).¹

10. The previously written works of Ellen White which deal with the content of chapter 75 contain 82 parallels from Farrar and 43 parallels from Hanna. The former show up mostly in Manuscript 51, 1897, and the latter in 3SP. To a much lesser extent March, Bennett, Ingraham, and Kitto were also used in these earlier writings.

11. It is difficult to compare the dependency of the DA text with that of the pre-DA text for this chapter. Usually by the time the DA text is edited the parallels from the earlier documents are lost and the dependency is much less evident in the later edited text. That difference is

¹These works have been fully identified in the introduction to this chapter and may also be found in the Bibliography which accompanies this research report.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas
not so marked for chapter 75.

When we compare the DA text of 168 dependent sentences and the pre-DA text with 141, the figures match quite closely. Applying the rating scale to the totals as found in Tables 2 and 3 the average dependency for the DA text is 3.63 and for the pre-DA text it is 3.69.

This agreement in dependency is due to the DA text taking over so much of the earlier material with little modification and to some direct use of sources by the DA text.

12. The sources utilized in the composition of the DA text provided background and descriptive material. They assist in the illumination of the historical context. At times they may also refer to the motives, attitudes, and character of the personalities involved and may even allude to the viewpoint of angels and the inner thoughts of these individuals. But it is in respect to these more intimate and subtle drives and the spiritual aspects of the experiences and encounters that Ellen White brings to bear her special contribution. It is in respect to these latter concerns and the appeal to the Christian response of devotion that her independence is most often to be recognized.

13. The redaction of chapter 75 is primarily based on the record found in the four Gospels. She has added a major expansion on the reaction of Caiaphas to the confession of Jesus, including the significance of the tearing of his

priestly robe. As to the general arrangement of the text and what she does with the visit before Annas which only John records but does not elaborate, the DA text appears to be indebted to Andrews and Farrar. The description of a violent reaction of the people, including the Jewish leaders, following the Friday morning appearance before the Sanhedrin is most likely to be attributed to Ingraham's influence and partly also to Farrar. It is not at all clear from the three synoptic gospels that any abuse followed this trial. We should probably hold Marian Davis responsible for the arrangement of the chapter.

The arrangement of the literary subunits are the result of a combination of forces. We have the basic story line of Scripture. We also have the influence of the major sources. Marian Davis was also involved as the materials furnished by Ellen White were combined under her hand. Ellen White also played a significant role as she chose to expand on the preliminary trial and to develop a long sequence of comments on the inner thoughts of Jesus, of Caiaphas, and the theological and spiritual significance of Caiaphas' robe. It might be possible to draw the lines of responsibility more sharply if one were to undertake a more careful scrutiny of the content. That objective, however, lies outside the scope of this project.

14. The redaction of MS 51 was largely influenced by Farrar as Table B will show. The only other major treatment of the full content of chapter 75 by Ellen White was

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas presented in the text of 3SP. In this earlier work Hanna was used heavily. A major difference to be noted in 3SP when compared with both MS 51 and the DA text is in the placement of the denials by Peter. In 3SP the Peter episode is placed before the discussion of the informal questioning by Caiaphas and Annas and before the night trial by the Sanhedrin. Ellen White just introduces the content of chapter VIII and the appearance of Jesus before the assembly when she turns to the story of Peter's denial. Since Hanna covers the experience of Peter in the chapter preceding his recounting of the judgment hall episode it would appear that Hanna has partly influenced the structure of 3SP. No doubt the Scriptures were also used by Ellen White in establishing the order of this early text.

It was probably such factors as the placement of Peter's denials and the internal problem of three crowings of the cock that led to the recognition that the "old book" needed revision. Hence the addition of later manuscripts on the topic and the composition of chapter 75.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	<u>Farrar LC/10/596</u>	P1	051. -	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	I2
002. -	<u>Bennett LHJC/361.2</u>	P2	052. -	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	P1
003. -	<u>Bennett LHJC/361.1</u>	P1	053. -	<u>Bennett LHJC/364.6</u>	P2
004. -	<u>Farrar LC/10/596</u>	P2	054. -		I1
005. -	<u>Geikie LC/744.9</u>	P1	055. -		I1
006. -	<u>March WHJ/7/310</u>	P2	056. -		I1
007. -	<u>March WHJ/7/310</u>	P1	057. -		I1
008. -	<u>Edersheim LTJM547.7</u>	P3	058. -		I1
009. -	<u>Edersheim LTJM547.7</u>	P2	059. -		I1
010. -	<u>Hanna LC/10/633</u>	V2	060. -		I1
011. -	<u>Andrews LOL/511.2</u>	P1	061. -		I1
012. -	<u>Andrews LOL/511.2</u>	P1	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -		I1
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -		I1
016. -		I1	066. -		I1
017. -		I1	067. -		I1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -		I1	069. -		I1
020. -	<u>Hanna LC/17b/664</u>	P1	070. -		I1
021. -	<u>Deems WWJ/641.9</u>	P1	071. -	<u>Farrar LC/68a/602</u>	I2
022. -	<u>Deems WWJ/641.9</u>	P1	072. -	<u>Hanna LC/48/666</u>	P1
023. -		I1	073. -	<u>Hanna LC/11/663</u>	P2
024. -	<u>Hanna LC/16,17a/664</u>	P1	074. -		I1
025. -	<u>Hanna LC/18,19/664</u>	P2	075. -		I1
026. -	<u>Hanna LC/20/664</u>	P2	076. -		I1
027. -	<u>Hanna LC/23/664</u>	P2	077. -		I1
028. -	<u>Hanna LC/23,24/664</u>	P1	078. -		I1
029. -	<u>Hanna LC/24/664</u>	P1	079. -		I1
030. -	<u>Hanna LC/25/664</u>	B1	080. -		I1
031. -	<u>Farrar LC/59a/602</u>	P2	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -	<u>Farrar LC/59b/602</u>	P2	084. -		I1
035. -	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	P1	085. -		I1
036. -	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	V2	086. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
037. -		I1	087. -	<u>Farrar LC/69,70/602</u>	P1
038. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	088. -	<u>Farrar LC/69/602</u>	P1
039. -	<u>Hanna LC/29/665</u>	P1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -	<u>March WHJ/1,8/310</u>	P1
041. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	091. -	<u>Hanna LC/12,16/663</u>	I2
042. -	<u>Hanna LC/34/665</u>	P1	092. -	<u>Hanna LC/46/666</u>	P1
043. -	<u>Hanna LC/36/665</u>	I2	093. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.2,7</u>	P2
044. -	<u>Hanna LC/37/665</u>	P2	094. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.7</u>	P2
045. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	095. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.7</u>	P1
046. -		I1	096. -		I1
047. -	<u>Hanna LC/42-44/666</u>	I2	097. -		I1
048. -		I1	098. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/360.7</u>	V2
049. -		I1	099. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/361.1</u>	P2
050. -	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	V2	100. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.3</u>	P1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	Ingraham PHD/359.3	I2	151.	Hall HPONT/575a.5	V2
102.	Ingraham PHD/360.7	I2	152.		I1
103.		I1	153.	Krummacher SS/178.3	P1
104.		I1	154.	Hanna LC/64/667	I2
105.	Ingraham PHD/360.8	P1	155.		I1
106.	Ingraham PHD 361.1	P2	156.		I1
107.	Edersheim LTNJ/558.5	I2	157.		I1
108.		I1	158.	Bible	B2
109.		I1	159.		I1
110.		I1	160.	Krummacher SS/176.9	P1
111.		I1	161.		I1
112.	Hanna LC/50/666	I2	162.		I1
113.	Farrar LLC/79/603	P2	163.		I1
114.	Farrar LC/82/604	P1	164.		I1
115.		I1	165.		I1
116.	Hanna LC/49/666	P2	166.	Bible	B2
117.		I1	167.	Hanna LC/70/667	P1
118.		I1	168.		I1
119.	Hanna LC/50/666	I2	169.	Hanna LC/70/667	I2
120.	Farrar LC/71/615	P2	170.		I1
121.		I1	171.		I1
122.		I1	172.		I1
123.	Farrar LC/88b/664	P1	173.		I1
124.		I1	174.		I1
125.	Bennett LHJC/365.9	B1	175.		I1
126.		I1	176.		I1
127.	Bible	B2	177.		I1
128.		I1	178.		I1
129.		I1	179.		I1
130.		I1	180.		I1
131.		I1	181.		I1
132.		I1	182.	Farrar LC/116-120/606	P1
133.		I1	183.	Bible	B2
134.	Bible	B2	184.	Bible	B2
135.		I1	185.	Bible	B2
136.		I1	186.		I1
137.	Hall HPONT 574b.8	P1	187.		I1
138.		I1	188.		I1
139.	Farrar LC/95/605	P1	189.		I1
140.	Kitto DBI/407.9	P1	190.		I1
141.	Farrar LC/97,98/605	P1	191.	Bennett LHJC/369.2	P2
142.	Farrar LC/101/605	P1	192.		I1
143.	Kitto DBI/408.3	V2	193.		I1
144.	Kitto DBI/408.3	P1	194.		I1
145.	Farrar LC/107/605	P2	195.		I1
146.	Farrar LC/107,108/605	B1	196.	Farrar LC/606	I2
147.	Farrar LC/109b/605	P1	197.		I1
148.	Kitto DBI/407.9	B1	198.		I1
149.	Jones LSEF/362.4	I2	199.		I1
150.	Farrar LC/113/606	P1	200.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -	Bible	B2
202. -		I1	252. -	Hanna LC/24,30/654	P1
203. -		I1	253. -		I1
204. -		I1	254. -	Farrar LC/10/609	P2
205. -		I1	255. -	Hanna LC/79/656	I2
206. -		I1	256. -	Hanna LC/78-80/656	P1
207. -		I1	257. -	Hanna LC/80/656	P1
208. -		I1	258. -		I1
209. -		I1	259. -	Hanna LC/71,74/656	P2
210. -		I1	260. -	Hanna LC/69,70/656	I2
211. -	Farrar LC/606	P2	261. -	Hanna LC/56-60/655	P1
212. -		I1	262. -	Hanna LC/87/656	I2
213. -		I1	263. -	Hanna LC/87/656	P2
214. -		I1	264. -	Hanna LC/87/656	P1
215. -	Bennett LHJC/372.7	P1	265. -	Hanna LC/87/656	I2
216. -	Bennett LHJC/372.7	I2	266. -		I1
217. -		I1	267. -	Hanna LC/64/655	P3
218. -		I1	268. -	Hanna LC/70/656	I2
219. -		I1	269. -		I1
220. -		I1	270a. -	Hanna LC/73/656	P1
221. -		I1	270b. -	Bennett LHJC/377.2	P2
222. -		I1	271. -		I1
223. -	Farrar LC/2/608	P2	272. -	Bible	B2
224. -	Farrar LC/2/608	P1	273. -		I1
225. -	Farrar LC/3/608	P2	274. -	Farrar LC/33,36/611	B1
226. -	Farrar LC/8/608	I2	275. -	Bible	B2
227. -	Farrar LC/3/608	I2	276. -		I1
228. -		I1	277. -		I1
229. -	Farrar LC/52/612	I2	278. -	Bible	B2
230. -	Farrar LC/52/612	I2	279. -		I1
231. -	Farrar LC/53/612	P1	280. -	HannaLC/87-100/656+	P1
232. -	Farrar LC/53/612	P1	281. -		I1
233. -		I1	282. -	HannaLC/101,102/657	I2
234. -		I1	283. -	Farrar LC/42-44/612	P2
235. -	Farrar LC/6/608	P1	284. -	Hanna LC/93,94/657	P1
236. -	March WHJ/10/311	P1	285. -	Hanna LC/93,94/657	P1
237. -	Farrar LC/9/609	P1	286. -	Hanna LC/113/658	I2
238. -		I1	287. -	Hanna LC/114/658	I2
239. -	Farrar LC/10/609	I2	288. -	Hanna LC/108/658	I2
240. -	Farrar LC/15/609	P1	289. -	Hanna LC/119/658	P1
241. -	Hanna LC/8/653	P1	290. -	Hanna LC/106/657	P2
242. -	Hanna LC/8,10/653,4	B1	291. -	Hanna LC/120/658	B1
243. -	Hanna LC/9/653	P1	292. -	Hanna LC/112/658	P2
244. -	Hanna LC/9/653	P2	293. -		I1
245. -	Hanna LC/11,12/654	P1	294. -	Hanna LC/121/658	P1
246. -	Hanna LC/13-16/654	I2	295. -	HannaLC/122,123/659	I2
247. -	Farrar LC/17/609	P2	296. -	Hanna LC/126/659	P1
248. -	Hanna LC/17/654	B1	297. -		I1
249. -	Hanna LC/17,18/654	P1	298. -	Hanna LC/126/659	I2
250. -	Hanna LC/21,22/654	I2	299. -		I1
			300. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
301. -		I1	351. -		
302. -		I1	352. -		
303. -	<u>Hanna LC/126/659</u>	I2	353. -		
304. -		I1	354. -		
305. -		I1	355. -		
306. -		I1	356. -		
307. -		I1	357. -		
308. -		I1	358. -		
309. -		I1	359. -		
310. -		I1	360. -		
311. -		I1	361. -		
312. -		I1	362. -		
313. -		I1	363. -		
314. -		I1	364. -		
315. -		I1	365. -		
316. -	<u>Farrar LC/78/615</u>	I2	366. -		
317. -	<u>Farrar LC/77/615</u>	P2	367. -		
318. -	<u>Farrar LC/79a/615</u>	P1	368. -		
319. -	<u>Farrar LC/79b/615</u>	P2	369. -		
320. -	<u>Farrar LC/79b/615</u>	P2	370. -		
321. -		I1	371. -		
322. -	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	P1	372. -		
323. -		I1	373. -		
324. -	<u>Farrar LC/86,87/616</u>	BI	374. -		
325. -	<u>Farrar LC/88/616</u>	BI	375. -		
326. -	<u>Farrar LC/89/616</u>	BI	376. -		
327. -	<u>Farrar LC/90/616</u>	BI	377. -		
328. -	<u>Farrar LC/91/616</u>	BI	378. -		
329. -	<u>Farrar LC/92a/616</u>	I2	379. -		
330. -	<u>Farrar LC/92b/616</u>	P2	380. -		
331. -	<u>Farrar LC/93/617</u>	P1	381. -		
332. -	<u>Farrar LC/93/617</u>	P2	382. -		
333. -		I1	383. -		
334. -		I1	384. -		
335. -	<u>Hanna LC/82/668</u>	I2	385. -		
336. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/361.7</u>	P1	386. -		
337. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.8</u>	P1	387. -		
338. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.9</u>	P2	388. -		
339. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.9</u>	P2	389. -		
340. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/367.3</u>	P1	390. -		
341. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/367.4</u>	P2	391. -		
342. -		I1	392. -		
343. -		I1	393. -		
344. -		I1	394. -		
345. -		I1	395. -		
346. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/368.7</u>	P1	396. -		
347. -		I1	397. -		
348. -		I1	398. -		
349. -		I1	399. -		
350. -		I1	400. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	MS (51) 1	V2	1	051.	-	MS (51) 34	I1	52
002.	-	3SP 1/106	P1	2	052.	-	MS (51) 35	I1	52
003.	-	3SP 2/106	P1	3	053.	-	3SP 103/115	I2	53
004.	-	3SP 3/106	P1	4	054.	-	MS (51) 36	V2	71
005.	-	MS (51) 2	P1	4	055.	-	MS (51) 39	P1	87
006.	-	MS (51) 3	P2	4	056.	-	MS (51) 37	P1	88
007.	-	MS (51) 4a	P1	4	057.	-	MS (51) 38	P2	88
008.	-	MS (51) 4b	P2	4	058.	-	3SP 1/107	P1	90
009.	-	MS (51) 5	P2	4	059.	-	3SP 2/107	P1	90
010.	-	MS (51) 6	P2	4	060.	-	3SP 84/113	P2	91
011.	-	MS (51) 7	B2	4	061.	-	3SP 3/107	P1	91
012.	-	MS (51) 8	I2	4	062.	-	MS (51) 40	P1	112
013.	-	MS (51) 9	V2	4	063.	-	MS (51) 41	I2	112
014.	-	MS (51) 10	P1	4	064.	-	MS (51) 42	P2	113
015.	-	MS (51) 11	P2	4	065.	-	MS (51) 43	P1	114
016.	-	MS (51) 12	I1	4	066.	-	MS (51) 117	P1	119
017.	-	MS (51) 13	I1	4	067.	-	MS (51) 44	I2	119
018.	-	MS (51) 14	I2	4	068.	-	MS (51) 115	P2	120
019.	-	MS (51) 15	P1	4	069.	-	MS (51) 45	B1	122
020.	-	MS (51) 16	P1	9	070.	-	MS (51) 46	P1	122
021.	-	MS (51) 17	I1	9	071.	-	MS (51) 47	I2	122
022.	-	3SP 85/113	P2	20	072.	-	MS (51) 48	P1	122
023.	-	3SP 86/113	P2	22	073.	-	MS (51) 49	I2	122
024.	-	MS (51) 18	P1	24	074.	-	MS (51) 50	P2	123
025.	-	3SP 93/114	P2	26	075.	-	MS (51) 51	P1	125
026.	-	3SP 94/114	P2	29	076.	-	MS (51) 52	I2	136
027.	-	MS (51) 19	B1	30	077.	-	MS (51) 53	P1	137
028.	-	MS (51) 22	P2	31	078.	-	MS (51) 54	I1	138
029.	-	MS (51) 23	P2	34	079.	-	MS (51) 55	P2	139
030.	-	MS (51) 127	P1	35	080.	-	MS (51) 56	P2	140
031.	-	MS (51) 128	V2	36	081.	-	MS (51) 57	P2	141
032.	-	3SP 95/114	B2	38	082.	-	MS (51) 58	P2	141
033.	-	MS (51) 20	B2	38	083.	-	MS (51) 59	P1	142
034.	-	3SP 96/114	P1	39	084.	-	MS (51) 60	V2	143
035.	-	3SP 97/114	I1	40	085.	-	MS (51) 61	P2	144
036.	-	3SP 98/114	I1	41	086.	-	MS (51) 62	P2	145
037.	-	MS (51) 21	B1	41	087.	-	MS (51) 63	B1	146
038.	-	MS (51) 24	I1	41	088.	-	MS (51) 64	I2	146
039.	-	MS (51) 25	I1	41	089.	-	MS (51) 65	V2	147
040.	-	3SP 99/114	I2	42	090.	-	MS (51) 66	P2	148
041.	-	MS (51) 26	P2	42	091.	-	MS (51) 67	P1	149
042.	-	3SP 100/114	P2	43	092.	-	3SP 161/119	I2	155
043.	-	MS (51) 27	I1	43	093.	-	3SP 166/120	P1	157
044.	-	3SP 101/114+	P2	44	094.	-	MS (51) 68	I1	161
045.	-	MS (51) 28	P2	44	095.	-	3SP 167/120	P3	169
046.	-	MS (51) 29	I1	44	096.	-	MS (102) 14	P2	169
047.	-	MS (51) 30	I1	44	097.	-	MS (102) 15	I1	170
048.	-	MS (51) 31	I1	46	098.	-	MS (102) 27	I1	172
049.	-	MS (51) 32	I2	46	099.	-	MS (102) 28	I1	173
050.	-	MS (51) 33	P1	47	100.	-	MS (102) 31	I1	174

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
101.	-	MS (102) 32	I1	175	151.	-	MS (111) 88	I1	205
102.	-	MS (102) 33	I1	176	152.	-	Di (94) 2	I1	205
103.	-	MS (102) 34	I1	177	153.	-	MS (111) 89	I1	205
104.	-	MS (102) 35	I1	178	154.	-	Di (94) 3	I1	205
105.	-	MS (102) 36	I1	180	155.	-	MS (111) 90	I1	205
106.	-	MS (102) 37	I1	181	156.	-	MS (111) 91	I1	205
107.	-	3SP 172/120	P2	182	157.	-	MS (102) 61	I1	206
108.	-	MS (51) 69	B1	182	158.	-	MS (102) 62	I1	207
109.	-	MS (102) 38	B2	182	159.	-	MS (102) 63	I1	208
110.	-	MS (102) 39	B2	183	160.	-	MS (102) 64	I1	209
111.	-	MS (51) 70	B2	184	161.	-	MS (102) 65	I1	210
112.	-	MS (102) 40	B2	184	162.	-	MS (102) 66	P2	211
113.	-	3SP 174/121	B2	184	163.	-	MS (102) 67	I1	212
114.	-	MS (51) 71	B2	184	164.	-	MS (102) 68	I1	213
115.	-	MS (102) 41	B2	184	165.	-	MS (102) 69	P1	215
116.	-	MS (102) 44	I1	193	166.	-	MS (102) 82	I2	216
117.	-	Di (94) 11	I1	194	167.	-	MS (102) 102	I1	217
118.	-	MS (102) 45	I1	194	168.	-	MS (102) 103	I1	218
119.	-	MS (111) 45	I1	194	169.	-	MS (102) 104	I1	220
120.	-	Di (94) 10	I1	195	170.	-	MS (51) 73	P2	223
121.	-	MS (102) 46	I1	195	171.	-	MS (51) 72	P1	224
122.	-	MS (111) 44	I1	195	172.	-	MS (51) 74	P2	225
123.	-	MS (102) 48	I1	196	173.	-	MS (51) 75	I2	228
124.	-	MS (102) 49	I1	196	174.	-	MS (51) 99	I2	228
125.	-	MS (102) 47	I1	197	175.	-	MS (51) 100	I2	230
126.	-	MS (102) 53	I1	198	176.	-	MS (51) 101	I1	230
127.	-	MS (102) 54	I1	199	177.	-	MS (51) 102	P1	231
128.	-	Di (94) 12	I1	200	178.	-	MS (51) 103	P1	232
129.	-	MS (111) 46	I1	200	179.	-	MS (51) 104	I2	232
130.	-	MS (111) 47	I1	201	180.	-	MS (51) 105	I1	233
131.	-	MS (111) 48	I1	202	181.	-	MS (51) 106	I1	234
132.	-	Di (94) 13	I1	203	182.	-	MS (51) 76	I1	234
133.	-	MS (111) 49	I1	203	183.	-	MS (51) 77	I1	234
134.	-	MS (111) 50	I1	204	184.	-	MS (51) 78	P1	234
135.	-	Di (94) 14	I1	205	185.	-	MS (51) 79	I1	234
136.	-	MS (111) 51	I1	205	186.	-	3SP 4/107	P1	236
137.	-	Di (94) 15	I1	205	187.	-	MS (51) 80	P1	236
138.	-	Di (94) 16	I1	205	188.	-	3SP 5/107	P1	236
139.	-	Di (94) 17	I1	205	189.	-	MS (51) 81	P1	236
140.	-	MS (111) 82	I1	205	190.	-	MS (51) 82	I1	236
141.	-	Di (94) 18	I1	205	191.	-	MS (51) 83	B2	236
142.	-	MS (111) 83	I1	205	192.	-	MS (51) 84	I2	236
143.	-	MS (111) 84	I1	205	193.	-	3SP 6/107	P1	237
144.	-	Di (94) 19	I1	205	194.	-	MS (51) 85	B2	237
145.	-	MS (111) 85	I1	205	195.	-	MS (51) 86	I1	238
146.	-	Di (94) 20	I1	205	196.	-	3SP 9/107	P1	240
147.	-	MS (211) 86	I1	205	197.	-	3SP 10/107	P1	241
148.	-	Di (94) 21	I1	205	198.	-	3SP 11/108	B1	242
149.	-	MS (111) 87	I1	205	199.	-	MS (51) 87	B2	242
150.	-	Di (94) 1	I1	205	200.	-	MS (104) 93	I2	246

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
201.	-	MS (104) 94	P2	247	251.	-	MS (51) 98	P1	294
202.	-	3SP 14/108	P1	248	252.	-	MS (104) 125	I2	295
203.	-	MS (51) 88	B2	248	253.	-	3SP 52/110+	P2	303
204.	-	MS (104) 95	B1	248	254.	-	MS (104) 126	P2	303
205.	-	MS (104) 96	P1	249	255.	-	MS (104) 127	I1	303
206.	-	MS (104) 97	I2	250	256.	-	MS (51) 122	I2	316
207.	-	MS (51) 89	B2	251	257.	-	MS (51) 123a	P1	317
208.	-	MS (104) 98	B2	251	258.	-	MS (51) 123b	P2	318
209.	-	MS (104) 99	P1	252	259.	-	MS (51) 124	P1	319
210.	-	MS (104) 100	I1	253	260.	-	MS (51) 134	B1	328
211.	-	3SP 221/108	I2	260	261.	-	MS (51) 136	P2	330
212.	-	RH (91) 42	P2	261	262.	-	MS (51) 137	P1	331
213.	-	RH (91) 43	P2	261					
214.	-	MS (104) 109	I1	268					
215.	-	MS (104) 110	I1	271					
216.	-	RH (91) 39	P2	271					
217.	-	3SP 29/109	P2	272					
218.	-	3SP 30/109	I2	272					
219.	-	RH (91) 41	I2	272					
220.	-	MS (104) 114	B2	274					
221.	-	MS (51) 90	B2	275					
222.	-	MS (104) 115	B2	275					
223.	-	3SP 33/109	I1	277					
224.	-	MS (51) 91	B2	277					
225.	-	MS (104) 116	I1	277					
226.	-	3SP 34/109	I1	278					
227.	-	MS (51) 92	B2	278					
228.	-	MS (104) 117	I1	278					
229.	-	MS (51) 94	B2	279					
230.	-	MS (104) 118	B2	279					
231.	-	3SP 35/109	P1	280					
232.	-	MS (51) 93	B2	280					
233.	-	MS (104) 119	I2	280					
234.	-	3SP 36/109	I1	281					
235.	-	MS (104) 120	I1	281					
236.	-	MS (104) 121	I2	282					
237.	-	RH (92) 77	P2	283					
238.	-	MS (51) 96	P1	283					
239.	-	MS (51) 97	I2	283					
240.	-	MS (104) 122	I1	283					
241.	-	MS (104) 123	I1	283					
242.	-	MS (104) 124	P2	283					
243.	-	3SP 38a/109	P1	286					
244.	-	3SP 38b/109+	P1	286					
245.	-	3SP 38c/110	I2	286					
246.	-	3SP 45/110	P2	290					
247.	-	3SP 41/110	P3	292					
248.	-	3SP 42/110	P1	292					
249.	-	3SP 43/110	I1	292					
250.	-	MS (51) 95	B2	294					

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	MS (51) 1	F/10/596	051.	-	MS (51) 34	
002.	-	3SP 1/106	M/6/310	052.	-	MS (51) 35	
003.	-	3SP 2/106	B/361.1	053.	-	3SP 103/115	M/319.0
004.	-	3SP 3/106	M/6,7/310	054.	-	MS (51) 36	F/68a/602
005.	-	MS (51) 2	F/10//596	055.	-	MS (51) 39	F/171,72/603
006.	-	MS (51) 3	F/30/599	056.	-	MS (51) 37	F/68b,69/602
007.	-	MS (51) 4a	F/35/600	057.	-	MS (51) 38	F/70/602
008.	-	MS (51) 4b	F/37/600	058.	-	3SP 1/107	M/1,8/310
009.	-	MS (51) 5	F/39/600	059.	-	3SP 2/107	M/8/310
010.	-	MS (51) 6	F/43,44/600+	060.	-	3SP 84/113	H/12,16/663
011.	-	MS (51) 7	Bible	061.	-	3SP 3/107	M/311.0
012.	-	MS (51) 8	F/46/60	062.	-	MS (51) 40	F/76/603
013.	-	MS (51) 9	F/45/601	063.	-	MS (51) 41	F/78/603
014.	-	MS (51) 10	F/45/601	064.	-	MS (51) 42	F/79/603
015.	-	MS (51) 11	F/47,48/601	065.	-	MS (51) 43	F/82/604
016.	-	MS (51) 12		066.	-	MS (51) 117	F/72/615
017.	-	MS (51) 13		067.	-	MS (51) 44	F/83/604
018.	-	MS (51) 14	F/50/601	068.	-	MS (51) 115	F/71/615
019.	-	MS (51) 15	F/51/601	069.	-	MS (51) 45	F/84/604
020.	-	MS (51) 16	F/52/601	070.	-	MS (51) 46	F/85a/604
021.	-	MS (51) 17		071.	-	MS (51) 47	F/85a/604
022.	-	3SP 85/113	H/17b/664	072.	-	MS (51) 48	F/85b/604
023.	-	3SP 86/113	H/17b/664	073.	-	MS (51) 49	F/88a/604
024.	-	MS (51) 18	F/53/601	074.	-	MS (51) 50	F/88b/604
025.	-	3SP 93/114	H/18-20/664	075.	-	MS (51) 51	F/92/604
026.	-	3SP 94/114	H/24/664	076.	-	MS (51) 52	F/94a/604
027.	-	MS (51) 19	F/54,55/601	077.	-	MS (51) 53	F/94b/604
028.	-	MS (51) 22	F/59a/602	078.	-	MS (51) 54	
029.	-	MS (51) 23	F/59b/602	079.	-	MS (51) 55	F/95/605
030.	-	MS (51) 127	F/80/615	080.	-	MS (51) 56	F/97/605
031.	-	MS (51) 128	F/80/615	081.	-	MS (51) 57	F/97,98/605
032.	-	3SP 95/114	Bible	082.	-	MS (51) 58	F/99,100/605
033.	-	MS (51) 20	Bible	083.	-	MS (51) 59	F/101/605
034.	-	3SP 96/114	H/29/665	084.	-	MS (51) 60	K/408.3
035.	-	3SP 97/114		085.	-	MS (51) 61	F/105/605
036.	-	3SP 98/114		086.	-	MS (51) 62	F/107/605
037.	-	MS (51) 21	F/57,58/601	087.	-	MS (51) 63	F/108/605
038.	-	MS (51) 24		088.	-	MS (51) 64	F/109a/605
039.	-	MS (51) 25		089.	-	MS (51) 65	F/109a/605
040.	-	3SP 99/114	F/62/602	090.	-	MS (51) 66	K/408.3
041.	-	MS (51) 26	F/62/602	091.	-	MS (51) 67	F/110/605
042.	-	3SP 100/114	H/36/665	092.	-	3SP 161/119	H/64/667
043.	-	MS (51) 27		093.	-	3SP 166/120	H/69/667
044.	-	3SP 101/114+	H/37/665	094.	-	MS (51) 68	
045.	-	MS (51) 28	F/63/602	095.	-	3SP 167/120	H/70/667
046.	-	MS (51) 29		096.	-	MS (102) 14	H/70/667
047.	-	MS (51) 30		097.	-	MS (102) 15	
048.	-	MS (51) 31		098.	-	MS (102) 27	
049.	-	MS (51) 32	F/65/602	099.	-	MS (102) 28	
050.	-	MS (51) 33	F/66/602	100.	-	MS (102) 31	

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No. -	Text	Sources	No. -	Text	Sources
101.	- MS (102) 32		151.	- MS (111) 88	
102.	- MS (102) 33		152.	- Di (944) 2	
103.	- MS (102) 34		153.	- MS (111) 89	
104.	- MS (102) 35		154.	- Di (94) 3	
105.	- MS (102) 36		155.	- MS (111) 90	
106.	- MS (102) 37		156.	- MS (111) 91	
107.	- 3SP 172/120	H/72-79/667	157.	- MS (102) 61	
108.	- MS (51) 69	F/116-120/606	158.	- MS (102) 62	
109.	- MS (102) 38	Bible	159.	- MS (102) 63	
110.	- MS (102) 39	Bible	160.	- MS (102) 64	
111.	- MS (51) 70	Bible	161.	- MS (102) 65	
112.	- MS (102) 40	Bible	162.	- MS (102) 66	F/606
113.	- 3SP 174/121	Bible	163.	- MS (102) 67	
114.	- MS (51) 71	Bible	164.	- MS (102) 68	
115.	- MS (102) 41	Bible	165.	- MS (102) 69	B/372.9
116.	- MS (102) 44		166.	- MS (102) 82	B/372.9
117.	- Di (94) 11		167.	- MS (102) 102	
118.	- MS (102) 45		168.	- MS (102) 103	
119.	- MS (111) 45		169.	- MS (102) 104	
120.	- Di (94) 10		170.	- MS (51) 73	F/2/608
121.	- MS (102) 46		171.	- MS (51) 72	F/2/608
122.	- MS (111) 44		172.	- MS (51) 74	F/3/608
123.	- MS (102) 48		173.	- MS (51) 75	F/3/608
124.	- MS (102) 49		174.	- MS (51) 99	F/52/612
125.	- MS (102) 47		175.	- MS (51) 100	F/52/612
126.	- MS (102) 53		176.	- MS (51) 101	
127.	- MS (102) 54		177.	- MS (51) 102	F/53/612
128.	- Di (94) 12		178.	- MS (51) 103	F/53/612
129.	- MS (111) 46		179.	- MS (51) 104	F/57/613
130.	- MS (111) 47		180.	- MS (51) 105	
131.	- MS (111) 48		181.	- MS (51) 106	
132.	- Di (94) 13		182.	- MS (51) 76	
133.	- MS (111) 49		183.	- MS (51) 77	
134.	- MS (111) 50		184.	- MS (51) 78	F/1/608
135.	- Di (94) 14		185.	- MS (51) 79	
136.	- MS (111) 51		186.	- 3SP 4/107	M/10/311
137.	- Di (94) 15		187.	- MS (51) 80	F/67/608
138.	- Di (94) 16		188.	- 3SP 5/107	M/10/311
139.	- Di (94) 17		189.	- MS (51) 81	F/6/608
140.	- MS (111) 82		190.	- MS (51) 82	
141.	- Di (94) 18		191.	- MS (51) 83	Bible
142.	- MS (111) 83		192.	- MS (51) 84	M/10/311
143.	- MS (111) 84		193.	- 3SP 6/107	H/1-4/653
144.	- Di (94) 19		194.	- MS (51) 85	Bible
145.	- MS (111) 85		195.	- MS (51) 86	
146.	- Di (94) 20		196.	- 3SP 9/107	H/5,6/653
147.	- MS (111) 86		197.	- 3SP 10/107	H/8/653
148.	- Di (94) 21		198.	- 3SP 11/108	H/8,10/693,4
149.	- MS (111) 87		199.	- MS (51) 87	Bible
150.	- Di (94) 1		200.	- MS (104) 93	H/13-16/654

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
201.	-	MS (104) 94	F/17/609	251.	-	MS (51) 98	H/121/658
202.	-	3SP 14/108	H/17/654	252.	-	MS (104) 125	H/122,123/659
203.	-	MS (51) 88	Bible	253.	-	3SP 52/110+	H/126/659
204.	-	MS (104) 95	H/17/654	254.	-	MS (104) 126	H/126/654
205.	-	MS (104) 96	H/17,18/654	255.	-	MS (104) 127	
206.	-	MS (104) 97	H/21,22/654	256.	-	MS (51) 122	F/78/615
207.	-	MS (51) 89	Bible	257.	-	MS (51) 123a	F/77/615
208.	-	MS (104) 98	Bible	258.	-	MS (51) 123b	F/79a/615
209.	-	MS (104) 99	H/24,30/654	259.	-	MS (51) 124	F/79b/615
210.	-	MS (104) 100		260.	-	MS (51) 134	F/91/616
211.	-	3SP 22/108	H/69-74/656	261.	-	MS (51) 136	F/92b/617
212.	-	RH (91) 42	H/56-63/655	262.	-	MS (51) 137	F/93/617
213.	-	RH (91) 43	H/56/655				
214.	-	MS (104) 109					
215.	-	MS (104) 110					
216.	-	RH (91) 39	H/29-30/654				
217.	-	3SP 29/109	H/35/654				
218.	-	3SP 30/109	H/31,32/654				
219.	-	RH (91) 41	H/41/655				
220.	-	MS (104) 114	Bible				
221.	-	MS (51) 90	F/33,36/611				
222.	-	MS (104) 115	Bible				
223.	-	3SP 33/109					
224.	-	MS (51) 91	Bible				
225.	-	MS (104) 116					
226.	-	3SP 34/109					
227.	-	MS (51) 92	Bible				
228.	-	MS (104) 117					
229.	-	MS (51) 94	Bible				
230.	-	MS (104) 118	Bible				
231.	-	3SP 35/109	H/87-100/656+				
232.	-	MS (51) 93	Bible				
233.	-	MS (104) 119	H/87-100/656+				
234.	-	3SP 36/109					
235.	-	MS (104) 120					
236.	-	MS (104) 121	H/101,102/657				
237.	-	RH (92) 77	I/364.8				
238.	-	MS (51) 96	F/42-44/612				
239.	-	MS (51) 97	F/44/612				
240.	-	MS (104) 122					
241.	-	MS (104) 123					
242.	-	MS (104) 124	I/364.8				
243.	-	3SP 38a/109	H/93,94/657				
244.	-	3SP 38b/109+	H/93,94/657				
245.	-	3SP 38c/110	H/113/658				
246.	-	3SP 45/110	H/106/657				
247.	-	3SP 41/110	H/112/658				
248.	-	3SP 42/110	H/107/658				
249.	-	3SP 43/110					
250.	-	MS (51) 95	Bible				

XIV CHAPTER 75 - Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

Chapter 75 is the longest chapter from the 15 selected for this investigation. It is also the one chapter selected at random from the 15 to be the "test chapter" for the research project.¹ In many ways the reader will find it quite typical of what has been found in the study of the earlier chapters.

We have handwritten diary comments from the pen of Ellen White, the use of sources in the writing of manuscript typescript and journal articles, literary independence and dependence for the DA text, a tradition of earlier compositions behind the composition of this chapter, an illustration of how the earlier writings were edited and revised for use in The Desire of Ages, and an example of how Ellen White used Scripture and the imagination of other writers in her own Scriptural commentary. There are also those passages where Ellen White exhibits her freedom to move beyond Scripture and her sources to emphasize a special dimension of the story or to impress upon the reader a spiritual or moral lesson.

This chapter also shares in the intricacies and complexities which characterize a number of the chapters already studied. An account of the trial of Jesus before the Jewish religious authorities is present in each of the

¹The original purpose for the establishing of a test chapter was fully discussed under Introduction II.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

four gospels but they are not in agreement on every point. Ellen White's earlier accounts also do not always agree with the DA presentation. In the process of selecting excerpts from the earlier Ellen White writings and moving among the various gospel accounts duplications, omissions, and rearrangement resulted. The reader is urged to review carefully the analysis which follows the text presentation. In the complicated task of tracing the interrelationships of the various texts of the Scriptures, Ellen White, and the literary sources we may have erred. We have, however, endeavored to include the textual evidence in the text presentation or in Appendix D and text references in Appendices A, B, C. This documentation should permit the evaluations to be checked for their accuracy and the analysis to be extended beyond the limits of this investigation.

The biblical narratives supporting the basic story line of chapter 75 are found in Matthew 26:57-27:10; Mark 14:53-15:1; Luke 22:54-23:1; and John 18:13-28. These verses should be reviewed carefully in connection with Ellen White's comments on the trial of Jesus. The order of presentation as well as the expansion of her commentary may reflect the influence of a source or her own independent style even when the content is fundamentally based on Scripture. The harmonization of the four differing gospel accounts is not biblical, strictly speaking. Our concern is

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas
to compare Ellen White's arrangement of the four accounts
into one continuous narrative with the way other writers
have written the story line.

Chapter VIII of Spiritual Gifts, I, contains the
earliest connected account of Ellen White on "The Trial of
Christ." The portion comparable to chapter 75 begins with
sentence 1 on page 49 and continues to sentence 62 on page
53. We did not find source parallels in this material nor
any direct literary use of the SG text in the DA account.
For these reasons we have not included the SG sentences in
the text. The literary structure of the SG coverage will be
discussed below under redaction analysis.

Ellen White included some comments on Peter's denial of
Jesus in Letter 54, 1874.¹ This material was published as
part of Testimony 24 in 1875.² The next full treatment of
the trial of Jesus is found in The Spirit of Prophecy, III.
The story begins in chapter VII, "In the Garden," sentences
1-6 on page 106. Chapter VIII, "In the Judgment Hall," uses
203 sentences to cover the trial of Jesus before the Jewish
authorities. The first 13 sentences of chapter IX,
"Condemnation of Jesus," form a transition unit. These two
paragraphs conclude Ellen White's remarks on the Jewish
trial and introduce the reader to the appearances of Jesus
before Pilate and Herod which are covered by chapter 77 of
the DA text.

¹Written Oct. 24, 1874, to a Brother Lee.

²Cf. 3T 416.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

Space considerations have not allowed us to include the entire text of 3SP on the trial of Jesus before the Sanhedrin. It will be clear from the analysis to follow, however, that the DA text is heavily dependent upon the earlier SP account. The sentences we have listed demonstrate Ellen White's use of March and Hanna, particularly the latter, in this first major treatment of the trial of Jesus.

The denial of Peter is often referred to in the Ellen White writings.¹ Her comment in these manuscripts and articles on the actual denial are generally quite brief. It is not unusual to find also some reference to Judas' betrayal as well. The experiences of Peter and Judas serve as illustrations of the general Christian concerns being addressed in the articles.

We did find, however, five manuscripts plus one diary selection which merit special recognition. These previously written materials allow us to view Ellen White's writings on this chapter at a pre-DA stage and to reconstruct some elements of the process which eventually led to the completed DA text.

These earlier materials also aid us in the location of source parallels in the writings of Ellen White. If the DA,

¹Cf. MS 1, 1878, pp. 20, 21 (very similar to MS 1, 1880); 4T 488; RH, Nov. 16, 1886; RH, Feb. 26, 1895; ST, July 16, 1896; and TM, p. 267 (originally published as Series A, #6, 1896).

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

at least in part, is a composition derived from the editing and compiling of several earlier Ellen G. White writings on the same subject, the use or non-use of sources would be more obvious in these earlier individually composed articles and manuscripts. The study of these separate texts of earlier days should also permit us to analyze the independent and dependent materials from the pen of Ellen White which never made it into the DA text or perhaps were never published in any form.

Manuscript 51, 1897, is entitled "In the Judgment Hall" and carries the date of May 20. The initials at the end of the text are "M. V. H.," standing for Minnie Hawkins. Sentences 1-141 have to do with the subject of DA chapter 75. Beginning with sentence 142 the material has to do with DA chapter 76, "Judas."¹ Apart from the use of one paragraph in the Ellen White comments under John 18:20, 21 of the SDA Bible Commentary, Volume 5, p. 1148, and the sentences taken over into the DA text, we found no evidence that this manuscript has ever been published.

Ellen White evidently developed two manuscripts containing material on Caiaphas in September of 1897. Over the initials of "M. H." or Maggie Hare we have Manuscript 101, dated September 26, 1897. The title of this 14-page composition is "The True High Priest." The first 100 sentences (approximately) would appear to correspond with

¹The full text of each of these five manuscripts and one diary selection insofar as they treat the content of this chapter may be found under Appendix D for chapter 75.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas the content of chapter 75. The remaining 110 sentences are closer to the content of chapters 77 and 78. We found no published form of this manuscript.¹ It does not appear that Marian Davis utilized the text of this manuscript in the composition of chapter 75.

A second manuscript copied by Maggie Hare and dated September 26, 1897, carries the title, "Caiaphas." This document, indexed as Manuscript 102, 1897, contains 118 sentences or approximately three typewritten pages of text. The reader will notice that we included portions of this manuscript in the text presentation to illustrate how certain of its sentences were combined with other materials to form sections of the DA texts.²

Our search efforts and those of Timothy Poirier of the White Estate office have failed to uncover any original work of Ellen White on these manuscripts relating to chapter 75.³ As a result, we have no way of establishing which sentences are virtually what Ellen White wrote and which have undergone some change through the editorial work of her literary assistants.

The fourth manuscript (104) treating the condemnation of Jesus and written in 1897 is entitled, "Condemned by the Jews." The earliest form of the text available for our

¹Our search was limited to the section of the text on Caiaphas.

²Manuscript 102, 1897, is quoted in part in the SDA Bible Commentary, Vol. 5, p. 1105. See also The Youth's Instructor, June 7, 1900.

³See below under our discussion of Manuscript 111, 1897, for a possible exception.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

study is a faded typewritten text evidently produced by Minnie Hawkins on September 7, 1897. The file copy most accessible is the "recopied" edition of December 12, 1963. This document of nearly ten pages contains 153 sentences, a good number of which date back to 3SP. Some portions, such as the comments on Peter's denials, are also to be found in the DA text.

The fifth and final Ellen White manuscript on the trial of Jesus before the Jewish authorities is a long treatise of 27 pages covering or touching upon chapters 64, 73, 75, 78, 79, 80, and 81 of the DA text. The first five pages or 91 sentences are of special interest for our study. This lengthy work was given the title, "Our Substitute and Surety" and was copied by Maggie Hare on October 7, 1897.

The text comparisons which follow will show that a number of sentences from Manuscript 111, 1897, found their way into chapter 75. Some of these sentences and others not utilized by Marian Davis in the DA text may be traced back to one of Ellen White's diary journals. Several pages are missing from the diary at the very location where the trial of Jesus is being discussed. Enough of the text remains, however, to permit us to follow the text from the diary, to the manuscript form, to the published DA text. The diary material is from a journal now indexed as Book 18 and carrying the date of 1894.¹

¹A photocopy of the diary text may be found in Appendix D for chapter 75 following the text of Manuscript 111, 1897.

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas

A few comments of Ellen White on the denial of Peter have been traced to two articles appearing in the Review and Herald. The reference RH(91) is used for sentences taken from the April 7, 1891, issue under the article entitled "The Character of Peter." The other reference, RH(92), refers to part II of "The Privilege of the Followers of Christ." Part I of this series appeared in the July 5, 1892, issue and Part II appeared under the date of July 12, 1892. Similar comments may be found in a Signs of the Times presentation on "Peter's Fall," November 11, 1897.

If chapter 75 is to be representative of the DA text in general, we should expect to find a number of literary sources behind the DA text. Indeed this is the case. To help the reader understand the symbols used for titles, we list by way of introduction each of the sources having at least one literary parallel in this chapter. We also provide the bibliographical documentation for those who wish to read the full text of the sources we have identified.¹ We are listing the sources in chronological sequence beginning with the literary source dated earliest.² The

¹Many of these lives of Christ went through multiple printings. Some editions involved revisions and changes in pagination. Please note the publication date of the respective work for locating the text used in this research report.

²Ordinarily we would not repeat the bibliographical information for those works to which reference has been made in the earlier chapters. We are repeating such data here, however, because this chapter will be circulated as an "independent" chapter illustrating the nature and method of the research project.

letters enclosed by brackets refer to the title of the work. These letters follow the last name of the author of the source quotation. Since authors often wrote more than one book we need more than just the writer's name to identify the particular literary source document.

The literary sources for chapter 75 are: James Bennett, Lectures on the History of Jesus Christ, 2 vols., 2nd edition (London: F. Westley & A. H. Davis, 1828), [LHJC]; John Harris, The Great Teacher (Amherst: J. S. & C. Adams, 1836), [GT]; Friedrich W. Krummacker, The Suffering Saviour (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855), [SS]; J. H. Ingraham, The Prince of the House of David (Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1888), [PHD]; William Hanna, The Life of Christ (New York: American Tract Society, 1863), [LC]; Daniel March, Walks and Homes of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1866), [WHJ]; Joseph Hall, Scripture History; or Contemplations on the Historical Passages of the Old and New Testaments (New York: American Tract Society, 1868), [HPONT]; George Jones, Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels (Philadelphia: J. C. Garrigues & Co., 1868), [LSFG]; Frederic W. Farrar, The Life of Christ (New York: Hurst & Co., 1874), [LC]; Cunningham Geikie, The Life and Words of Christ (New York: United States Book Company, (1879), [LC]; Charles F. Deems, Who Was Jesus (New York: J. Howard Brown, 1880), [WWJ]; John Kitto, Daily Bible Illustrations, Vol. III (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1881), [DBI]; Alfred Edersheim, The Life and Times

Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas
of Jesus the Messiah, 2 vols. (New York: E. R. Herrick &
Co., 1886), [LTJM]; and Samuel J. Andrews, The Life of Our
Lord upon the Earth Considered in its Historical,
Chronological, and Geographical Relations (New York:
Charles Scribner's Sons, 1891), [LOL].

Full documentation of translators, alternate titles, et
cetera, may be found by consulting the bibliography of this
report.

In several instances we have listed a source parallel
opposite a DA sentence which has been evaluated as
independent. At times we have included more than one
literary parallel for the DA sentence. The multiple
listings will permit the reader to enter more fully into the
nature of this research project by checking our evaluations
against other possibilities.

Manuscript 51 includes a number of sentences not
specifically related to the content of chapter 75 as the DA
text now reads. Rather than moving these sentences to a
separate section independent of the DA text, thereby
splitting MS 51 into several sections and frustrating
contextual considerations, we chose to mark the unrelated
portions of MS 51 by enclosing such sentences between broken
lines in the left margins. With the full text of MS 51
present the reader will be able to appreciate how the
manuscript was edited for the DA text, and also how sources
were used in its composition. Diary(94) and MS 111,
beginning on page 583, are treated in a similar manner.

DA1/698 OVER the brook Kedron, past gardens and olive groves, and through the hushed streets of the sleeping city, they hurried Jesus. [F/10/596] (P1)

MS(51)1 It was past midnight when Jesus was hurried from the garden of Gethsemane, through the hushed streets of the sleeping city, to the palace of the high priest. [F/10/596] [M/5/310] (V2)

DA2/698 It was past midnight, and the cries of the hooting mob that followed Him broke sharply upon the still air. [B/361.2] (P2)

3SP1/106 Jesus was hurried off by the hooting mob. [M/6/310] (P1)

DA3/698 The Saviour was bound and closely guarded, and He moved painfully. [B/361.1] (P1)

3SP2/106 He moved painfully, for his hands were tightly bound and he was closely guarded. [B/361.1] (P1)

DA4/698 But in eager haste His captors made their way with Him to the palace of Annas, the ex-high priest. [F/12/596] (P2)

3SP3/106 He was first conducted to the house of Annas, the father-in-law of the high priest, the man whose counsel was sought and carried out by the Jewish people as the voice of God. [M/6,7/310] (P1)

MS(51)2 This palace was occupied by the principle actors in the plan of [sic] obtain possession of Christ,--Annas, and his son-in-law [sic], Caiaphas. [F/11/596] (P1)

MS(51)3 Beacuse [sic] Jesus had rebuked the hypocrisy and avarice of the chief priests and rulers, they evidenced a most bitter hatred against him. [F/30/599] (P2)

10/596 Midnight was already passed as they hurried Him, from the moonlit shadows of green Gethsemane, through the hushed streets of the sleeping city, to the palace of the High Priest. [Farrar, LC]

5/310 It is now past midnight. . . [March, WHJ]

361.2 Their torches blaze around, and the midnight rabble that attends such seizures, follow, hooting and insulting his sacred majesty, his divine dignity, and unrivalled worth. [Bennett, LHJC]

6/310 First walking painfully with bound hands amid the rude and merciless mob, Jesus is hurried down and up the steep path through the city gate to the house of Annas. March, WHJ]

361.1 Behold the Son of God, with his hands tied behind him, and his feet fettered, so that he moved slowly, and with pain, while a guard of soldiers, and a posse of constables, with staves and clubs, surround him. [Bennett, LHJC]

12/596 They led him to Annas first. [Farrar, LC]

7/310 Not for a formal trial did they bring him there, but only that the old father-in-law of the high priest, the man whose counsel was of the highest authority in the nation, might have the dreadful satisfaction of seeing Jesus of Nazareth a prisoner. [March, WHJ]

11/596 It seems to have been jointly occupied by the prime movers in this black iniquity, Annas and his son-in-law, Joseph Caiaphas. [Farrar, LC]

360.5 From Gethsemane, they led our Lord across the valley of Jehoshaphat, as it was called, and over the brook Kedron, into Jerusalem, by the sheep-gate, and up to the house of Annas, who was father-in-law to Caiaphas the high priest. [Bennett, LHJC]

30/599 It is most remarkable, and, so far as I know, has scarcely ever been noticed, that, although the Pharisees undoubtedly were actuated by a burning hatred against Jesus, and were even so eager for His death, as to be willing to co-operate with the aristocratic and priestly Sadducees-- [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)4a The Sadducees were still more bitter,
[F/35/600] (P1)

MS(51)4b although Jesus had not directed against
them so plain and decided a reproof as against the
Pharisees. [F/37/600] (P2)

MS(51)5 But it was at His second act of cleansing
the temple, that their most bitter enmity was
aroused. [F/39/600] (P2)

MS(51)6 In his act in interfering with the
merchandise in the temple court, he set aside and
condemned all the arrangement which to them was great
gain. [F/43,44/600,601] (P2)

MS(51)7 He told them that they had made the temple
courts a den of thieves. (B2)

MS(51)8 By their extortion and dishonesty, they had
made the service of God contemptible. [F/46/601]
(I2)

MS(51)9 Avarice was the besetting sin of the Jews.
[F/45/601] (V2)

35/600 There seems, indeed, to be a hitherto unnoticed circumstance which, while it would kindle to the highest degree the fury of the Sadducees, would rather enlist in Christ's favor the sympathy of their rivals. [Farrar, LC]

37/600 Morally insignificant--the patrons and adherents of opinions which had so little hold upon the people that Jesus had never directed against them one tithe of the stern denunciation which He had levelled at the Pharisees--they had played but a very minor part in the opposition which had sprung up round the Messiah's steps. [Farrar, LC]

39/600 Whence, then, this sudden outburst of the very deadliest and most ruthless opposition? It is a conjecture that has not yet been made, but which the notices of the Talmud bring home to my mind with strong conviction, that the rage of these priests was mainly due to our Lord's words and acts concerning that House of God which they regarded as their exclusive domain, and, above all, to his second public cleansing of the Temple. [Farrar, LC]

43/600 But again, it may be asked, Is there any reason beyond this bold infraction of their authority, this indignant repudiation of an arrangement which they had sanctioned, which would have stirred up the rage of these priestly families? [Farrar, LC]

44/601 Yes--for we may assume from the Talmud that it tended to wound their avarice, to interfere with their illicit and greedy gains. [Farrar, LC]

46/601 It was they who had founded the chanujoth--the famous four shops under the twin cedars of Olivet--in which were sold things legally pure, and which they had manipulated with such commercial cunning as artificially to raise the price of doves to a gold coin apiece, until the people were delivered from this gross imposition by the indignant interference of a grandson of Hillel. [Farrar, LC]

45/601 Avarice--the besetting sin of Judas--the besetting sin of the Jewish race--seems also to have been the besetting sin of the family of Hanan. [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)10 It was on this point that Judas was overcome. [F/45/601] (P1)

MS(51)11 The erection of stalls for sales brought in great profits, and any interference with these plans for extortion and commercial income, was an act that would not be tolerated. [F/47,48/601] (P2)

MS(51)12 And now that Jesus was within their power, all feelings of sympathy and humanity went out of their hearts. (I1)

MS(51)13 They were fiends. (I1)

MS(51)14 The bitter contempt and hatred which the ex-High priest had for Jesus, was illy concealed when he accosted him. [F/50/601] (I2)

MS(51)15 But he was forced to keep his intense malice under cover as much as possible. [F/51/601] (P1)

DA5/698 Annas was the head of the officiating priestly family, and in deference to his age he was recognized by the people as high priest. [G/744.9] (P1)

DA6/698 His counsel was sought and carried out as the voice of God. [M/7/310] (P2)

DA7/698 He must first see Jesus a captive to priestly power. [M/7/310] (P2)

3SP4/106 Annas craved the fearful satisfaction of first seeing Jesus of Nazareth a bound captive. [M/7/310] (P1)

47/601 There is every reason to believe that the shops which had intruded even under the Temple porticoes were not only sanctioned by their authority, but even managed for their profit. [Farrar, LC]

48/601 To interfere with these was to rob them of one important source of that wealth and worldly comfort to which they attached such extravagant importance. [Farrar, LC]

49/601 There was good reason why Hanan, the head representative of "the viper brood," as a Talmudic writer calls them, should strain to the utmost his cruel prerogative of power to crush a Prophet whose actions tended to make him and his powerful family at once wholly contemptible and comparatively poor. [Farrar, LC]

50/601 Such then were the feelings of bitter contempt and hatred with which the ex-High Priest assumed the initiative in interrogating Jesus. [Farrar, LC]

51/601 The fact that he dared not avow them--nay, was forced to keep them wholly out of sight--would only add to the intensity of his bitterness. [Farrar, LC]

744.9 On reaching Jerusalem, Jesus was first led to the mansion of Hanas, the head of the reigning priestly family, either in deference to his recognized influence, or because, as the oldest high priest, he was still recognized as the rightful, if not legal, dignitary. [Geikie, LC]

7/310 Not for a formal trial did they bring him there, but only that the old father-in-law of the high priest, the man whose counsel was of the highest authority in the nation, might have the dreadful satisfaction of seeing Jesus of Nazareth a prisoner. [March, WHJ]

DA8/698 He must be present at the examination of the prisoner, for fear that the less-experienced Caiaphas might fail of securing the object for which they were working. [E/547.7] (P3)

DA9/698 His artifice, cunning, and subtlety must be used on this occasion; for, at all events, Christ's condemnation must be secured. [E/547.7] (P2)

MS(51)16 They had no legal right to take this matter in hand at this time. [F/52/601] (P1)

MS(51)17 They knew they had no charge against Christ by which they could hold him a prisoner or condemn him as a malefactor; but they designed, in secret consultation, to charge him with guilt, and thus draw something from his own lips which they could with their own additions, their wresting and perversion, so construe as to make stand against him. (11)

DA10/698 Christ was to be tried formally before the Sanhedrin; but before Annas He was subjected to a preliminary trial. [H/10/633] (V2)

DA11/698 Under the Roman rule the Sanhedrin could not execute the sentence of death. [A/511.2] (P1)

DA12/698 They could only examine a prisoner, and pass judgment, to be ratified by the Roman authorities. [A/511.2] (P1)

DA13/698+ It was therefore necessary to bring against Christ charges that would be regarded as criminal by the Romans. (11)

DA14/699 An accusation must also be found which would condemn Him in the eyes of the Jews. (11)

547.7 He [Annas] was as resolutely bent on His Death as his son-in-law, though with his characteristic cunning and coolness, not in the hasty, bluff manner of Caiaphas. [Edersheim, LTJM]

52/601 Even his method of procedure seems to have been as wholly illegal as was his assumption, in such a place and at such an hour, of any legal function whatever. [Farrar, LC]

10/663 It was in this hall, and before Annas, that Jesus was subjected to that preliminary informal examination recorded in the eighteenth chapter of the gospel of St. John, ver. 19-24. He was to be formally tried, with show at least of law, before the Sanhedrim, the highest of the Jewish courts; but this could not be done at once. [Hanna, LC]

511.2 While the Sanhedrin had power to try those charged with capital offenses, it had no power to execute the sentence of death. "It was only in cases in which such sentence of death was pronounced, that the judgement required to be ratified by the authority of the procurator." (Schuerer). [Andrews, LOL]

311.7 The sentence of the Sanhedrim must now be confirmed, and executed by the civil power, or it will be of no effect. [March, WHJ]

15/664 But they could not act without their colleagues, nor pronounce any sentence which they might call upon the Roman governor at once to ratify and execute. [Hanna, LC]

DA15/699 Not a few among the priests and rulers had been convicted by Christ's teaching, and only fear of excommunication prevented them from confessing Him. (11)

DA16/699 The priests well remembered the question of Nicodemus, "Doth our law judge any man, before it hear him, and know what he doeth?" John 7:51. (11)

DA17/699 This question had for the time broken up the council, and thwarted their plans. (11)

DA18/699 Joseph of Arimathaea and Nicodemus were not now to be summoned, but there were others who might dare to speak in favor of justice. (11)

DA19/699 The trial must be so conducted as to unite the members of the Sanhedrin against Christ. (11)

DA20/699 There were two charges which the priests desired to maintain. [H/17b/664] (P1)

3SP85/113 They brought two charges against him, by one or both of which they meant to effect his condemnation. [H/17b/664] (P2)

DA21/699 If Jesus could be proved a blasphemer, He would be condemned by the Jews. [D/641.9] (P1)

DA22/699 If convicted of sedition, it would secure His condemnation by the Romans. [D/641.9] (P1)

3SP86/113 One was that he was a disturber of the peace, the leader of a rebellion. [H/17b/664] (P2)

DA23/699 The second charge Annas tried first to establish. (11)

DA24/699 He questioned Jesus concerning His disciples and His doctrines, hoping the prisoner would say something that would give him material upon which to work. [H/16,17a/664] (P1)

17b/664 . . . and pointing to the two main charges to be afterwards brought against him, of being a disturber of the public peace, and a teacher of blasphemous doctrines.
[Hanna, LC]

641.9 It will be perceived that his persecutors desired to obtain evidence against him on two counts,--first blasphemy; secondly, sedition: on the first they could condemn him to death as lord spiritual, and on the second the Roman power could execute him. [Deems, WWJ]

16,17a/664 . . . Annas may prepare the way by sounding Christ, in a far-off, unofficial, conversational manner, and may perhaps extract from his replies some good material upon which the court may afterward proceed. Calling Jesus before him, he puts to him some questions about his disciples and his doctrine; [Hanna, LC]

MS(51)18 The High priest questioned him in regard to his doctrines. [F/ 53/601] (P1)

DA25/699 He thought to draw out some statement to prove that He was seeking to establish a secret society, with the purpose of setting up a new kingdom. [H/18,19/664] (P2)

DA26/699 Then the priests could deliver Him to the Romans as a disturber of the peace and a creator of insurrection. [H/20/664] (P2)

3SP93/114 Jesus was well aware that his questioner designed to draw some statement from him which should awaken the fears of the Roman authorities that he was seeking to establish a secret society with the purpose of finally setting up a new kingdom. [H/18-20/664] (P2)

DA27/699 Christ read the priest's purpose as an open book. [H/23/664] (P2)

DA28/699 As if reading the inmost soul of His questioner, He denied that there was between Him and His followers any secret bond of union, or that He gathered them secretly and in the darkness to conceal His designs. [H/23,24/664] (P1)

DA29/699 He had no secrets in regard to His purposes or doctrines. [H/24/664] (P1)

3SP94/114 He therefore plainly stated to Annas that he had no secrets in regard to his purpose or doctrines. [H/24/664] (P2)

DA30/699 "I spake openly to the world," He answered; "I ever taught in the synagogue, and in the temple, whither the Jews always resort; and in secret have I said nothing." [H/25/664] (B1)

53/601 Anxious, at all hazards, to trump up some available charges of secret sedition, or of unorthodox teaching, he questioned Jesus of His disciples and of His doctrine.
[Farrar, LC]

18,19/664 First, then about his disciples: Annas would like to know what this gathering of men around him meant; this forming them into a distinct society. By what bond or pledge to one another were the members of this new society united; what secret instructions had they got; what hidden objects had they in view? [Hanna, LC]

20/664 Though Christ might not reveal the secrets of this combination, yet, let it but appear--as by his very refusal to give the required information it might be made to do--that an attempt was here being made to organize a confederation all over the country, how easy it would be to awaken the jealousy of the Roman authorities, and get them to believe that some insurrectionary plot was being hatched which it was most desirable at once to crush, by cutting off the ringleader. [Hanna, LC]

23/664 Penetrating at once his design, knowing thoroughly what his real meaning and purposes were, our Lord utterly and indignantly denies the charge that was attempted thus to be fastened on him. [Hanna, LC]

24/664 Neither as to his disciples, nor as to his doctrine--neither as to the instructions given to his followers, nor as to the bonds of their union and fellowship with one another, had there been anything of the concealed or the sinister; not one doctrine for the people without, and another for the initiated within; no meetings under cloud of night in hidden places for doubtful or dangerous objects. [Hanna, LC]

25/664 "I spake," said Jesus, "openly to the world; I ever taught in the synagogue and in the temple, whither the Jews always resort; and in secret"--that is, in the sense in which I know that you mean and use the term secret--"have I said nothing; why askest thou me?" [Hanna, LC]

MS(51)19 But the answer was calmly given, "I spake openly to the world; I ever taught in the synagogue; and in the temple, whither the Jews always resort; and in secret have I said nothing. [F/54,56/601] (B1)

DA31/699 The Saviour contrasted His own manner of work with the methods of His accusers. [F/59a/602] (P2)

MS(51)22 Jesus would contrast [?] his manner of work with that of his accusers. [F/59a/602] (P2)

DA32/699 For months they had hunted Him, striving to entrap Him and bring him before a secret tribunal, where they might obtain by perjury what it was impossible to gain by fair means. (I1)

DA33/699 Now they were carrying out their purpose. (I1)

DA34/699 The midnight seizure by a mob, the mockery and abuse before He was condemned, or even accused, was their manner of work, not His. [F/59b/602] (P2)

MS(51)23 This midnight seizure by a mob, this cruel mockery and abuse before he was even accused or condemned, was their mannner, not his. [F/59b/602] (P2)

DA35/699 Their action was in violation of the law. [F/80/615] (P1)

MS(51)127 They had violated every principle of the law. [F/80/615] (P1)

DA36/699 Their own rules declared that every man should be treated as innocent until proved guilty. [F/80/615] (V2)

MS(51)128 Their own rule of action declared that every criminal should be treated as innocent until his guilt was apparent. [F/80/615] (V2)

DA37/699 By their own rules the priests stood condemned. (I1)

54/601 The answer, for all its calmness, involved a deep reproof. [Farrar, LC]

55/601 "I have spoken openly to the world; I ever taught in the synagogue and in the Temple, where all the Jews come together, and in secret I said nothing. [Farrar, LC]

59a/602 The emphatic repetition of the 'I,' and its unusually significant position at the end of the sentence, show that a contrast was intended; as though He had said, [Farrar, LC]

59b/602 "This midnight, this sedition, this secrecy, this indecent mockery of justice, are yours, not mine. [Farrar, LC]

80/615 But He would not repeat it, in spite of their insistence, because He knew that it was open to their wilful misinterpretation, and because they were acting in flagrant violation of their own express rules and traditions, which demanded that every arraigned criminal should be regarded and treated as innocent until his guilt was actually proved. [Farrar, LC]

DA38/699 Turning upon His questioner, Jesus said, "Why askest thou Me?" (B2)

3SP95/114 Turning upon his interrogator he said with startling emphasis, "Why askest thou me?" (B2)

MS(51)20 Why askest thou me? (B2)

DA39/699 Had not the priests and rulers sent spies to watch His movements, and report His every word? [H/29/665] (P1)

3SP96/114 Had not the priests and rulers sent spies to watch his movements and report his every word? [H/29/665] (P1)

DA40/699+ Had not these been present at every gathering of the people, and carried to the priests information of all His sayings and doings? (I1)

3SP97/114 Had they not been present at every gathering of the people, and carried information of all his sayings and doings on these occasions to the priests? (I1)

DA41/700 "Ask them which heard Me, what I have said unto them," replied Jesus; "behold, they know what I said." (B2)

3SP98/114 "Ask them that heard me, what I have said," replied Jesus; and his words were a rebuke to Annas, who had hunted him for months, striving to entrap him, and to bring him before a secret tribunal, in which the people could have no voice, that he might obtain by perjury what it was impossible to gain by fair means. (I1)

MS(51)21 "Ask them which heard me," pointing to those around him "what I have said unto them: behold, they know what I said." [F/57,58/601] (B1)

MS(51)24 His work was open to all. (I1)

MS(51)25 He had nothing in his doctrines that he concealed. (I1)

DA42/700 Annas was silenced by the decision of the answer. [H/34/665] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

56/601 **Why askest thou me?"** [Farrar, LC]

28,29/665 **"Why askest thou me?"** Art thou really so ignorant as thou pretendest to be; thou who hast had thy spies about me for well-nigh three years, tracking my footsteps, watching my actions, reporting my words? [Hanna, LC]

30,31/665 **"Why askest thou me?"** Dost thou really care to know, as these questions of thine would seem to indicate? then go, **"ask them which heard me, what I have said unto them: behold they know what I said."** [Hanna, LC]

57/601 **Ask those who have heard me what I said to them.** [Farrar, LC]

58/601 Lo! these"--pointing, perhaps to the bystanders--
"know what I said to them." [Farrar, LC]

34/665 It seems to have silenced the high priest. [Hanna, LC]

3SP99/114 The words of Jesus were so close and pointed that the high priest felt that his very soul was being read by his prisoner. [F/62/602] (I2)

MS(51)26 Thus he rebuked their position, and unveiled the hypocrisy of the Sadducees. [F/62/602] (P2)

DA43/700 Fearing that Christ would say something regarding his course of action that he would prefer to keep covered up, he said nothing more to Him at this time. [H/36/665] (I2)

3SP100/114 Though Annas was filled with hatred against Jesus at these words, he disguised it until a more fitting opportunity presented itself of giving vent to his malice and jealousy. [H/36/665] (P2)

MS(51)27 His accusers sought to turn the conversation by falling back upon the dignity of their position. (I1)

DA44/700 One of his officers, filled with wrath as he saw Annas silenced, struck Jesus on the face, saying, "Answerest Thou the high priest so?" [H/37/665] (P2)

3SP101/114+ But one of the servants of the high priest, assuming that his master was not treated with due respect, struck Jesus in the face, saying, "Answerest thou the high priest so?" [H/37/665] (P2)

MS(51)28 "Answerest thou the high priest so?" said one, while he smote the sacred face with his hand. [F/63/602] (P2)

MS(51)29 How did angels of God look upon this scene, and see their loved Commander smitten by sacriligious [sic] hands? (I1)

MS(51)30 They longed to take Jesus away from these wicked men. (I1)

DA45/700 Christ calmly replied, "If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil: but if well, why smitest thou Me?" (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

62/602 Even the minions of Annas felt the false position of their master under this calm rebukey; they felt that before the transparent innocence of this youthful Rabbi of Nazareth the hoary hypocrisy of the crafty Sadducee was abashed. [Farrar, LC]

36/665 Whatever resentment he cherished at being checked and spoken to in such a manner, he refrained from any expression of it, biding the hour when all his bitter pent-up hatred of the Nazarene might find fitter and fuller vent. [Hanna, LC]

37/664 But there was one of his officers who could not so restrain himself, who could not bear to see his master thus, as he thought, insulted, and who, in the heat of his indignation, struck Christ with the palm of his hand-- [Hanna, LC]

38/664 but when that first stroke was inflicted, with the question, "Answerest thou the high priest so?" Jesus did not receive it in silence. [Hanna, LC]

63/602 "Answerest thou the High Priest so?" said one of them with a burst of illegal insolence; and then, unreprieved by this priestly violator of justice, he profaned with the first infamous blow the sacred face of Christ. [Farrar, LC]

39/665 He answered the question by another: "If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?" [Hanna, LC]

DA46/700 He spoke no burning words of retaliation. (I1)

MS(51)31 But Jesus did not retaliate. (I1)

MS(51)32 This insult was a part of the humiliation he was to bear. [F/65/602] (I2)

DA47/700 His calm answer came from a heart sinless, patient, and gentle, that would not be provoked. [H/42-44/666] (I2)

MS(51)33 There was no resentment in his voice as he reproved the illegal act: "If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?" [F/66/602] (P1)

DA48/700 Christ suffered keenly under abuse and insult. (I1)

DA49/700 At the hands of the beings whom He had created, and for whom He was making an infinite sacrifice, He received every indignity. (I1)

DA50/700 And He suffered in proportion to the perfection of His holiness and His hatred of sin. [H/340.2] (V2)

DA51/700 His trial by men who acted as fiends was to Him a perpetual sacrifice. [H/340.2] (I2)

DA52/700 To be surrounded by human beings under the control of Satan was revolting to Him. [H/340.2] (P1)

MS(51)34 At last Jesus entrenched himself in silence. (I1)

MS(51)35 He saw that nothing would avail in such company, and before such a tribunal, where neither conscience or fear of God had any control, but whose worse passions were fired with intense hatred. (I1)

DA53/700 And He knew that in a moment, by the flashing forth of His divine power, He could lay His cruel tormentors in the dust. [B/364.6] (P2)

65/602 The insult was borne with noble meekness. [Farrar, LC]

42-44/666 More difficult, also, than any silence, to imitate that gentle answer. The lips might be sealed, while the heart was burning with anger. But it was out of the depths of a perfect patience, a gentleness which nothing could irritate, that the saying came: "If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?" [Hanna, LC]

66/602 but He, the Son of God--He who was infinitely above all apostles and all angels--with no flash of anger, with no heightened tone of natural indignation, quietly reproved the impudent transgressor with the words, "If I spoke evil, bear witness concerning the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?" [Farrar, LC]

340.2 . . . '(He) suffered, being tempted,' suffered in proportion to the perfection of his holiness, and the depth of his aversion to sin; but though his residence in an atmosphere of sin was revolting to his purity, though the presence of depravity made his continuance here a perpetual sacrifice, his love induced him to submit, . . . [Harris, GT]

67/602 It was clear that nothing more could be extorted from Him; that before such a tribunal He would brook no further question. [Farrar, LC]

364.6 Christ could, though his hands were bound, have struck the man to death; as he, with a word or a look, lately brought a host to the dust. [Bennett, LHJC]

3SP103/115 The Majesty of Heaven might have summoned to his aid legions of loyal angels to protect him against the malignity of his enemies; but it was his mission, in the character of humanity, meekly to endure taunts and stripes, leaving an example of patient forbearance to the children of men.
[M/319.1] (I2)

DA54/700 This made the trial the harder to bear. (I1)

DA55/700 The Jews were looking for a Messiah to be revealed in outward show. (I1)

DA56/700 They expected Him, by one flash of overmastering will, to change the current of men's thoughts, and force from them an acknowledgment of His supremacy. (I1)

DA57/700 Thus, they believed, He was to secure his own exaltation, and gratify their ambitious hopes. (I1)

DA58/700 Thus when Christ was treated with contempt, there came to Him a strong temptation to manifest His divine character. (I1)

DA59/700 By a word, by a look, He could compel His persecutors to confess that He was Lord above kings and rulers, priests and temple. (I1)

DA60/700 But it was His difficult task to keep to the position He had chosen as one with humanity. (I1)

DA61/700 The angels of heaven witnessed every movement made against their loved Commander. (I1)

DA62/700 They longed to deliver Christ. (I1)

DA63/700 Under God the angels are all-powerful. (I1)

DA64/700 On one occasion, in obedience to the command of Christ, they slew of the Assyrian army in one night one hundred and eighty-five thousand men. (I1)

319.1 He could summon legions of God's mighty angels to his assistance with a word. He could doom all his enemies to everlasting destruction in a moment. [March, WHJ]

DA65/700 How easily could the angels, beholding the shameful scene of the trial of Christ, have testified their indignation by consuming the adversaries of God! (I1)

DA66/700 But they were not commanded to do this. (I1)

DA67/700+ He who could have doomed His enemies to death bore with their cruelty. (I1)

DA68/703 His love for His Father, and His pledge, made from the foundation of the world, to become the Sin Bearer, led Him to endure uncomplainingly the coarse treatment of those He came to save. (I1)

DA69/703 It was a part of His mission to bear, in His humanity, all the taunts and abuse that men could heap upon Him. (I1)

DA70/703 The only hope of humanity was in this submission of Christ to all that He could endure from the hands and hearts of men. (I1)

DA71/703 Christ had said nothing that could give His accusers an advantage; yet He was bound, to signify that He was condemned. [F/68a/602] (I2)

MS(51)36 Then he was bound, signifying that he was condemned, though un heard [sic] and unsentenced. [F/68a/602] (V2)

DA72/703 There must, however, be a pretense of justice. [H/48/666] (P1)

DA73/703 It was necessary that there should be the form of a legal trial. [H11/663] (P2)

DA74/703 This the authorities were determined to hasten. (I1)

DA75/703 They knew the regard in which Jesus was held by the people, and feared that if the arrest were noised abroad, a rescue would be attempted. (I1)

68a/602 Bound, in sign that He was to be condemned--though unheard and unsentenced [Farrar, LC]

48/666 That the appearance of justice may be preserved, they must have witnesses; [Hanna, LC]

11/663 He was to be formally tried, with show at least of law, before the Sanhedrim, the highest of the Jewish courts; but this could not be done at once. [Hanna, LC]

DA76/703 Again, if the trial and execution were not brought about at once, there would be a week's delay on account of the celebration of the Passover. (11)

DA77/703 This might defeat their plans. (11)

DA78/703 In securing the condemnation of Jesus they depended largely upon the clamor of the mob, many of them the rabble of Jerusalem. (11)

DA79/703 Should there be a week's delay, the excitement would abate, and a reaction would be likely to set in. (11)

DA80/703 The better part of the people would be aroused in Christ's favor; many would come forward with testimony in His vindication, bringing to light the mighty works He had done. (11)

DA81/703 This would excite popular indignation against the Sanhedrin. (11)

DA82/703 Their proceedings would be condemned, and Jesus would be set free, to receive new homage from the multitudes. (11)

DA83/703 The priests and rulers therefore determined that before their purpose could become known, Jesus should be delivered into the hands of the Romans. (11)

DA84/703 But first of all, an accusation was to be found. (11)

DA85/703 They had gained nothing as yet. (11)

DA86/703 Annas ordered Jesus to be taken to Caiaphas. (B2)

DA87/703 Caiaphas belonged to the Sadducees, some of whom were now the most desperate enemies of Jesus.
[F/69a,71/602] (P1)

69a/602 Caiaphas, like his father-in-law, was a Sadducee--
[Farrar, LC]

71/602 There . . . a few of the most desperate enemies of
Jesus among the Priests and Sadducees were met. [Farrar,
LC]

MS(51)39 Some of the most desperate enemies of Jesus were among the Sadducees, and who with the priests and rulers composed the Sanhedrim. [F/71,72/603] (P1)

DA88/703 He himself, though wanting in force of character, was fully as severe, heartless, and unscrupulous as was Annas. [F/69/602] (P1)

MS(51)37 Annas had him taken to Caiaphas, his son-in-law, a Sadducee, fully as severe, heartless and unscrupulous as himself, but wanting in force of character. [F/68b,69/602] (P1)

MS(51)38 In his house Jesus was again illegally criticised. [F/70/602] (P2)

DA89/703 He would leave no means untried to destroy Jesus. (I1)

DA90/703 It was now early morning, and very dark; by the light of torches and lanterns the armed band with their prisoner proceeded to the high priest's palace. [M/1,8/310] (P1)

3SP1/107 THE armed band, with their prisoner, threaded the dark and narrow streets, guided by torches and lanterns, for it was yet early morning and very dark. [M/1,8/310] (P1)

3SP2/107 Amid insult and mockery, the Saviour was hurried to the palace of the officiating high priest, Caiaphas. [M/8/310] (P1)

DA91/703 Here, while the members of the Sanhedrin were coming together, Annas and Caiaphas again questioned Jesus, but without success. [H/12,16/663] (I2)

3SP84/113 While the members of the Sanhedrim council were being called together, Annas and Caiaphas the priest questioned Jesus, with the purpose of provoking him to make some statement which they could use to his disadvantage. [H/12,16/663] (P2)

3SP3/107 Here he was coarsely accused by his persecutors, and sneeringly questioned by the priest, and reviled by the whole assembly. [M/9/311] (P1)

72/603 To form a session of the Sanhedrim there must at least have been twenty-three members present. [Farrar, LC]

68b/602 --Annas sent Him across the court-yard to Joseph Caiaphas, his son-in-law, who, not by the grace of God, but by the grace of the Roman Procurator, was the titular High Priest. [Farrar, LC]

69/602 Caiaphas, like his father-in-law, was a Sadducee--equally astute and unscrupulous with Annas, but endowed with less force of character and will. [Farrar, LC]

70/602 In his house took place the second private and irregular stage of the trial. [Farrar, LC]

1/310 . . . The armed band appears. . . [March, WHJ]

8/310 Then out again into the dark, narrow streets, finding their way by the uncertain light of lanterns and torches, they hurry their unresisting victim with insults and mockery to the palace of Caiaphas. [March, WHJ]

12,16/663 Some time was needed to call the members of that court together, and to consult as to the conduct of the trial. . . .While the messengers, however, are despatched to summon them, and the members of the Sanhedrim are gathering, Annas may prepare the way by sounding Christ, in a far-off, unofficial, conversational manner, and may perhaps extract from his replies some good material upon which the court may afterward proceed. [Hanna, LC]

9/311 Here he is questioned by the high priest, testified against by false witnesses, smitten by the officers, reviled by the whole assembly,. . . [March, WHJ]

DA92/703 When the council had assembled in the judgment hall, Caiaphas took his seat as presiding officer.
[H/46/666] (P1)

DA93/703 On either side were the judges, and those specially interested in the trial. [I/359.2,.7] (P2)

DA94/703+ The Roman soldiers were stationed on the platform below the throne. [I/359.7] (P2)

DA95/704 At the foot of the throne stood Jesus. [I/359.7] (P1)

DA96/704 Upon Him the gaze of the whole multitude was fixed. (I1)

DA97/704 The excitement was intense. (I1)

DA98/704 Of all the throng He alone was calm and serene.
[I/360.7] (V2)

DA99/704 The very atmosphere surrounding Him seemed pervaded by a holy influence. [I/361.1] (P2)

DA100/704 Caiaphas had regarded Jesus as his rival.
[I/359.3] (P1)

DA101/704 The eagerness of the people to hear the Saviour, and their apparent readiness to accept His teachings, had aroused the bitter jealousy of the high priest. [I/359.3] (I2)

DA102/704 But as Caiaphas now looked upon the prisoner, he was struck with admiration for His noble and dignified bearing. [I/360.7] (I2)

DA103/704 A conviction came over him that this Man was akin to God. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

46/666 But now at last the whole council has assembled, Caiaphas has taken his seat as president, and they go more formally to work. [Hanna, LC]

359.2 A score of the elders and chief priests were standing about him, their dark, eager faces earnestly watching the entrance, to get a look at the approaching Prophet [Ingraham, PHD]

359.7 The Roman soldiers, with clanging steel, marched in, and arrayed themselves on either side of the High Priest's throne, leaving Jesus standing alone before its footstool. [Ingraham, PHD]

360.7 He alone, of all that countless host, He alone was calm--serene--fearless! [Ingraham, PHD]

361.1 Jesus remained unmoved. His bearing was marked by a certain divine dignity, while an expression of holy resignation sat upon his features. He looked like Peace, incarnate in the form of man! A soft influence seemed to flow from his presence, producing a universal but momentary emotion of sympathy. [Ingraham, PHD]

359.3 Among the most eager of all these was Caiaphas himself, who regarded the eloquent Nazarene as his rival in the eyes of the whole people, and had, therefore, long thirsted for his destruction. [Ingraham, PHD]

359.4 As Jesus serenely entered, led by the sorrowful AEmilius, Caiaphas bent his tall, gaunt form forward, thrust his neck and huge head in advance, and with keen eyes, and sharp, scrutinizing glances, surveyed Him whom he jealously looked upon as his foe! [Ingraham, PHD]

360.7 Caiaphas gazed upon Him, as He stood before his footstool, betraying in his glance admiration mingled with resentment. [Ingraham, PHD]

DA104/704 The next instant he scornfully banished the thought. (I1)

DA105/704+ Immediately his voice was heard in sneering, naughty tones demanding that Jesus work one of His mighty miracles before them. [I/360.8] (P1)

DA106/705 But his words fell upon the Saviour's ears as though He heard them not. [I/361.1] (P2)

DA107/705 The people compared the excited and malignant deportment of Annas and Caiaphas with the calm, majestic bearing of Jesus. [E/558.5] (I2)

DA108/705 Even in the minds of that hardened multitude arose the question, Is this man of godlike presence to be condemned as a criminal? (I1)

DA109/705 Caiaphas, perceiving the influence that was obtaining, hastened the trial. (I1)

DA110/705 The enemies of Jesus were in great perplexity. (I1)

DA111/705 They were bent on securing His condemnation, but how to accomplish this they knew not. (I1)

DA112/705 The members of the council were divided between the Pharisees and the Sadducees. [H/50/666] (I2)

MS(51)40 And as the very existence of the priestly rule, was, they thought, endangered by the teachings of Christ, they would resort to any means to get him out of the way. [F/76/603] (P1)

MS(51)41 They tried many ways of waylaying and entangling him; and accused him of secret apostasy. [F/78/603] (I2)

DA113/705 There was bitter animosity and controversy between them; certain disputed points they dared not approach for fear of a quarrel. [F/79/603] (P2)

360.8 "So, then," he spoke, with haughty irony, 'thou art Jesus, the far-famed Galilean Prophet! Men say thou canst raise the dead! We would fain behold a miracle. [Ingraham, PHD]

361.1 Jesus remained unmoved. [Ingraham, PHD]

558.5 And to this result the majestic calm of Christ's silence must have greatly contributed. [Edersheim, LTJM]

[See 50/666 Hanna, LC below]

76/603 If so, it would have been the most likely of them all, at the present crisis, to embrace the most violent measures against One whose teaching now seemed to endanger the very existence of priestly rule. [Farrar, LC]

78/603 Instead of trying, as Hanan had done, to overawe and entangle Jesus with insidious questions, and so to involve Him in a charge of secret apostasy, they now tried to brand Him with the crime of public error. [Farrar, LC]

79/603 In point of fact their own bitter divisions and controversies made the task of convicting Him a very difficult one. [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)42 They were themselves in bitter animosity and controversy with one another, jealous, and daring not to approach certain points for fear of getting into a brawl with the Pharisees. [F/79/603] (P2)

DA114/705 With a few words Jesus could have excited their prejudices against each other, and thus have averted their wrath from Himself. [F/82/604] (P1)

MS(51)43 With a few words Jesus could have awakened the prejudices which existed between them and thus have averted their wrath from himself. [F/82/804] (P1)

DA115/705 Caiaphas knew this, and he wished to avoid stirring up a contention. (I1)

DA116/705 There were plenty of witnesses to prove that Christ had denounced the priests and scribes, that He had called them hypocrites and murderers; but this testimony it was not expedient to bring forward. [H/49/666] (P2)

DA117/705 The Sadducees in their sharp contentions with the Pharisees had used to them similar language. (I1)

DA118/705 And such testimony would have no weight with the Romans, who were themselves disgusted with the pretensions of the Pharisees. (I1)

DA119/705 There was abundant evidence that Jesus had disregarded the traditions of the Jews, and had spoken irreverently of many of their ordinances; but in regard to tradition the Pharisees and Sadducees were at swords' points; and this evidence also would have no weight with the Romans. [H/50/666] (I2)

MS(51)117 He had also disregarded their traditions; but on this the Pharisees and Sadducees were at sword's point. [F/72/615] (P1)

MS(51)44 But there was one thing one [sic] which they were united,--their hatred for Christ, and their desire to put him to death. [F/83/604] (I2)

82/604 But Jesus, infinitely nobler than His own noblest Apostle, would not foment these latent animosities, or evoke for His own deliverance a contest of these slumbering prejudices. [Farrar, LC]

49/666 They could have got plenty of witnesseses to testify as to Christ's having within the last few days openly denounced themselves, the members of the Sanhedrim, as fools and blind, hypocrites, a very generation of vipers; but to have convicted Christ upon that count or charge would have given to their proceedings against him the aspect of personal revenge. [Hanna, LC]

50/666 They could have got plenty of witnesses to testify as to Christ's having often broken and spoken slightly of ordinances and traditions of the Pharisees; but there were Sadducees among their own members, and the council might thus have been divided. [Hanna, LC]

72/615 His rejection of oral tradition involved a question on which Sadducees and Pharisees were at a deadly feud. [Farrar, LC]

83/604 He did not disturb the temporary compromise which united them in a common hatred against Himself. [Farrar, LC]

DA120/705 Christ's enemies dared not accuse Him of Sabbathbreaking, lest an examination should reveal the character of His work. [F/71/615] (P2)

MS(51)115 The charge of the Jews that he had broken the Sabbath of the fourth commandment had been made against him; but the work had been done to relieve suffering humanity and in working miracles, and they dared not come upon this ground for evidence. [F/71/615] (P2)

DA121/705 If His miracles of healing were brought to light, the very object of the priests would be defeated. (I1)

DA122/705 False witnesses had been bribed to accuse Jesus of inciting rebellion and seeking to establish a separate government. (I1)

MS(51)45 To gain this end they sought false witness against him. [F/84/604] (B1)

MS(51)46 We may see the same spirit manifested to-day. [F/85a/604] (P1)

MS(51)47 There will be a corrupt union formed between corrupt men, who will seek and employ false witnesses which will be obtained of those whose wrong course of action has been reprov'd. [F/85a/604] (I2)

MS(51)48 The devil is not at a loss to supply the necessity. [F/85b/604] (P1)

MS(51)49 Under the influence of the chief priests and rulers, the agents of Satan were willing, for the money offered them, to testify to any lie. [F/88a/604] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

51/666 They could have got plenty of witnesses to testify as to Christ's frequent profanation of the Sabbath; but how should they deal with those miracles, in or connected with the performance of which so many of these cases of profanation of the Sabbath had occurred? [Hanna, LC]

71/615 His violations of the Sabbath, as they called them, were all connected with miracles, and brought them, therefore upon dangerous ground. [Farrar, LC]

84/604 Since, therefore, they had nothing else to go upon, the Chief Priests and the entire Sanhedrin "sought false witness"--such is the terribly simple expression of the Evangelists--"sought false witness against Jesus to put Him to death." [Farrar, LC]

85a/604 Many men, with a greedy, unnatural depravity, seek false witness--mostly of the petty, ignoble, malignant sort; [Farrar, LC]

85b/604 and the powers of evil usually supply it to them. [Farrar, LC]

88a/604 Setting aside these absurd inventions, we learn from the Gospels that though the agents of these priests were eager to lie, [Farrar, LC]

DA123/705 But their testimony proved to be vague and contradictory. [F/88b/604] (P1)

DA124/705 Under examination they falsified their own statements. (I1)

MS(51)50 Yet their testimony was so false and contradictory; it reveals itself so plainly as a tissue of lies manufactured by the priests and rulers, that the judges, unjust, and without conscience as they were could not make their stories of any weight, or cause them to bear against Christ. [F/88b/604] (P2)

DA125/705 Early in His ministry Christ had said, "Destroy this temple, and in three days I will raise it up." [B/365.9] (B1)

MS(51)51 The words they claimed to hear him say, "Destroy this temple, and in three days I will raise it up again," were misstated. [F/92/604] (P1)

DA126/705 In the figurative language of prophecy, He had thus foretold His own death and resurrection. (I1)

DA127/705 "He spake of the temple of His body." John 2:19, 21. (B2)

DA128/705 These words the Jews had understood in a literal sense, as referring to the temple at Jerusalem. (I1)

DA129/705+ Of all that Christ had said, the priests could find nothing to use against Him save this. (I1)

DA130/706 By misstating these words they hoped to gain an advantage. (I1)

88b/604 yet their testimony was so false, so shadowy, so self-contradictory, that it all melted to nothing, and even those unjust and bitter judges could not with any decency accept it. [Farrar, LC]

365.9 They went back to the commencement of his ministry, and appealed to an expression they drew from him, when asking, "What sign showest thou that thou hast authority to cleanse the temple?" Because he said, "Destroy this temple, and in three days, I will raise it up," they accuse him of an intention to destroy the temple. [Bennett, LHJC]

91/604 According to one version His expression had been, "I can destroy this Temple;" according to another, "I will destroy this Temple." [Farrar, LC]

92/604 The fact was that He had said neither, but "Destroy this Temple;" and the imperative had but been addressed, hypothetically, to them. [Farrar, LC]

93/604 They were to be the destroyers; He had but promised to rebuild. [Farrar, LC]

DA131/706 The Romans had engaged in rebuilding and embellishing the temple, and they took great pride in it; any contempt shown to it would be sure to excite their indignation. (I1)

DA132/706 Here Romans and Jews, Pharisees and Sadducees, could meet; for all held the temple in great veneration. (I1)

DA133/706 On this point two witnesses were found whose testimony was not so contradictory as that of the others had been. (I1)

DA134/706 One of them, who had been bribed to accuse Jesus, declared, "This fellow said, I am able to destroy the temple of God, and to build it in three days." (B2)

DA135/706 Thus Christ's words were misstated. (I1)

DA136/706 If they had been reported exactly as He spoke them, they would not have secured His condemnation even by the Sanhedrin. (I1)

MS(51)52 It was perjury, having no semblance to the truth. [F/94a/604] (I2)

DA137/706 Had Jesus been a mere man, as the Jews claimed, His declaration would only have indicated an unreasonable, boastful spirit, but could not have been construed into blasphemy. [H/574b.8] (P1)

MS(51)53 They hoped to construe this into a charge of blasphemy, but they failed even here. [F/94b/604] (P1)

DA138/706 Even as misrepresented by the false witnesses, His words contained nothing which would be regarded by the Romans as a crime worthy of death. (I1)

94a/604 It was just one of those perjuries which was all the more perjured, because it bore some distant semblance to the truth: [Farrar, LC]

574b.8 Had those words been spoken, they contained no crime; had he been such as they supposed him, a mere man, the speech had carried a semblance of ostentation, no semblance of blasphemy. [Hall, HPONT]

94b/604 and by just giving a different nuance to his actual words they had, with the ingenuity of slander, reversed their meaning, and hoped to found upon them a charge of constructive blasphemy. [Farrar, LC]

559.4 It is, indeed, true, that, viewed as a Jewish charge, it might have been difficult, if not impossible, to construe a capital crime out of such charges, [Edersheim, LTJM]

MS(51)54 And becaus [sic] they could find nothing whereby they might fasten condemnation upon him, they became furious, fearing that after all Jesus might not be delivered into their hands. (11)

DA139/706 Patiently Jesus listened to the conflicting testimonies. [F/95/605] (P2)

MS(51)55 Patiently, and without one expression of revenge, Jesus listened to their conflicting testimony. [F/95/605] (P2)

DA140/706 No word did He utter in self-defense. [K/407.9] (P1)

MS(51)56 He was perfectly silent, answering not a word to their accusations. [F/97/605] (P2)

DA141/706 At last His accusers were entangled, confused, and maddened. [F/97,98/605] (P1)

MS(51)57 At last His accusers were entangled, confused, and maddened; they had nothing that they could make stand as a charge against Jesus. [F/97,98/605] (P1)

MS(51)58 That silence was terrible for them to endure. [F/99,100/605] (P2)

DA142/706 The trial was making no headway; it seemed that their plottings were to fail. [F/101/605] (P1)

MS(51)59 They saw that their plottings were liable to fail. [F/101/605] (P1)

DA143/706 Caiaphas was desperate. [K/408.3] (V2)

MS(51)60 Caiaphas was desperate. [K/408.3] (V2)

95/605 But even this semblable perjury utterly broke down, and Jesus listened in silence while His disunited enemies hopelessly confuted each other's testimony. [Farrar, LC]

407.9 Jesus meanwhile had not condescended to put himself upon his defence. [Kitto, DBI]

97/605 He simply suffered His false accusers and their false listeners to entangle themselves in the hideous coil of their own malignant lies, and the silence of the innocent Jesus atoned for the excuses of the guilty Adam. [Farrar, LC]

98/605 But that majestic silence troubled, thwarted, confounded, maddened them. [Farrar, LC]

99/605 It weighed them down for the moment with an incubus of intolerable self-condemnation. [Farrar, LC]

100/605 They felt, before that silence, as if they were the culprits, He the judge. [Farrar, LC]

101/605 And as every poisoned arrow of their carefully-provided perjuries fell harmless at his feet, as though blunted on the diamond shield of His white innocence, they began to fear lest, after all, their thirst for His blood would go unslaked, and their whole plot fail. [Farrar, LC]

408.3 On this Caiaphas became desperate, and adopted a resource which our own rules of evidence would declare most infamous. . . It was that of putting the prisoner upon his oath to answer questions, framed for his own crimination [sic]. [Kitto, DBI]

DA144/706 One last resort remained; Christ must be forced to condemn Himself. [K/408.3] (P1)

MS(51)61 He was determined to act. [F/105/605] (P2)

DA145/706 The high priest started from the judgment seat, his face contorted with passion, his voice and demeanor plainly indicating that were it in his power he would strike down the prisoner before him. [F/107/605] (P2)

MS(51)62 Statring [sic] from the judgment seat, his face contorted with passion, and voice and demeanor plainly indicating that were it in his power, he would strike down the Son of god, he exclaimed, "Answerest thou nothing" [F/107/605] (P2)

DA146/706 "Answerest Thou nothing?" he exclaimed; "what is it which these witness against Thee?" [F/107,108/605] (B1)

MS(51)63 What is it that these witness against thee?" [F/108/605] (B1)

MS(51)64 Jesus knew the nature of the men surrounding him, and the impotent madness of his accusers because they could not find occasion against him. [F/109a/605] (I2)

DA147/706 Jesus held His peace. [F/109b/605] (I2)

MS(51)65 But he remained in silence. [F/109b/605] (V2)

DA148/706 "He was oppressed, and He was afflicted, yet He opened not His mouth: He is brought as a lamb to the slaughter, and as a sheep before her shearers is dumb, so He openeth not His mouth." Isaiah 53:7. [K/407.9] (B1)

MS(51)66 The high priest was afraid that all their purposes were to be defeated unless they could make Jesus utter his own condemnation. [K/408.3] (P2)

105/605 It was intolerable. [Farrar, LC]

106/605 Then Caiaphas was overcome with a paroxysm of fear and anger. [Farrar, LC]

107/605 Starting up from his judgment seat, and striding into the midst--with what a voice, with what an attitude we may well imagine!--"Answerest Thou nothing?" he exclaimed. [Farrar, LC]

108/605 "What is it that these witness against Thee?" [Farrar, LC]

109a/605 Had not Jesus been aware that these His judges were willfully feeding on ashes and seeking lies, He might have answered; [Farrar, LC]

109b/605 but now His awful silence remained unbroken. [Farrar, LC]

407.9 He did not vindicate his character or statement. He asked nothing; He explained nothing. "He was as a lamb dumb before the shearers; and He opened not his mouth. [Kitto, DBI]

[See Kitto, DBI, 408.3 above]

DA149/706 At last, Caiaphas, raising his right hand toward heaven, addressed Jesus in the form of a solemn oath: "I adjure Thee by the living God, that Thou tell us whether Thou be the Christ, the Son of God." [J/362.4] (I2)

MS(51)67 standing over the prisoner as though he would annihilate him, he said, "I adjure thee by the living God, that thou tell us whether thou be the Christ, the Son of God". [F/110/605] (P1)

DA150/706 To this appeal Christ could not remain silent. [F/113/606] (P1)

DA151/706 There was a time to be silent, and a time to speak. [H/575a.5] (V2)

DA152/706 He had not spoken until directly questioned. (I1)

DA153/706 He knew that to answer now would make His death certain. [K/178.3] (P1)

DA154/706 But the appeal was made by the highest acknowledged authority of the nation, and in the name of the Most High. [H/64/667] (I2)

DA155/706 Christ would not fail to show proper respect for the law. (I1)

3SP161/119 Thus appealed to by the highest acknowledged authority in the nation, and in the name of the Most High, Jesus, to show proper respect for the law, answered, "Thou hast said." [H/64/667] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

63/667 Using the accustomed Jewish formula for administering an oath--a formula recited by the judge, and accepted without repetition by the respondent--"I adjure thee," said the high priest, "by the living God, that thou tell us whether thou be the Christ, the Son of God."
[Hanna, LC]

362.4 . . . he commenced with their most solemn form of adjuration or oath. [Jones, LSFG]

110/605 Then, reduced to utter despair and fury, this false High Priest--with marvelous inconsistency, with disgraceful illegality--still standing as it were with a threatening attitude over his prisoner, exclaimed, "I adjure Thee by the living God to tell us"--what? whether Thou art a malefactor? whether Thou hast secretly taught sedition? whether Thou hast openly uttered blasphemy?--no, but (and surely the question showed the dread misgiving which lay under all their deadly conspiracy against Him)--"whether Thou art the Christ, the Son of God?" [Farrar, LC]

113/606 Yet so adjured, and to such a question, Jesus could not be silent; on such a point He could not leave Himself open to misinterpretation. [Farrar, LC]

575a.5 "There is a time to speak, and a time to keep silence." [Hall, HPONT]

178.3 He knows that his answer will cause his death, but he dares no longer refrain. [Krummacher, SS]

64/667 Appealed to thus solemnly, by the first magistrate of his nation, sitting in presidency over the highest of its courts, our Lord keeps silence no longer.
[Hanna, LC]

DA156/706 More than this, His own relation to the Father was called in question. (11)

DA157/706+ He must plainly declare His character and mission. (11)

3SP166/120 This voluntary confession of Jesus, claiming his Sonship with God, was made in the most public manner, and under the most solemn oath.
[H/69/667] (P1)

DA158/707 Jesus had said to His disciples, "Whosoever therefore shall confess Me before men, him will I confess also before My Father which is in heaven." Matt. 10:32.
(B2)

DA159/707 Now by His own example He repeated the lesson.
(11)

DA160/707 Every ear was bent to listen, and every eye was fixed on His face as He answered, "Thou hast said."
[K/176.9] (P1)

DA161/707 A heavenly light seemed to illuminate His pale countenance as He added, "Nevertheless I say unto you, Hereafter shall ye see the Son of man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven." (11)

MS(51)68 Jesus saith unto him, Thou hast said: nevertheless I say unto you, Hereafter shall ye see the Son of man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven." (11)

DA162/707 For a moment the divinity of Christ flashed through His guise of humanity. (11)

DA163/707 The high priest quailed before the penetrating eyes of the Saviour. (11)

69/667 It is our Lord's own free and full confession, his public and solemn assertion of his claim to the Messiahship, and Sonship to God. [Hanna, LC]

176.9 Every heart beats audibly, and every eye is fixed on the accused. [Krummacher, SS]

114/606 In the days of His happier ministry, when they would have taken Him by force to make Him a King--in the days when to claim the Messiahship in their sense would have been to meet all their passionate prejudices half way, and to place Himself upon the topmost pinnacle of their adoring homage--in those days He had kept His title of Messiah utterly in the background; but now, at this awful decisive moment, when death was near--when, humanly speaking, nothing could be gained, everything must be lost, by the avowal--there thrilled through all the ages--thrilled through that Eternity, which is the synchronism of all the future, and all the present, and all the past--the solemn answer, "I am; and ye shall see the Son of Man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming with the clouds of heaven." [Farrar, LC]

DA164/707 That look seemed to read his hidden thoughts, and burn into his heart. (I1)

DA165/707 Never in afterlife did he forget that searching glance of the persecuted Son of God. (I1)

DA166/707+ "Hereafter," said Jesus, "shall ye see the Son of man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven." (B2)

DA167/708 In these words Christ presented the reverse of the scene then taking place. [H/70/667] (P1)

DA168/708 He, the Lord of life and glory, would be seated at God's right hand. (I1)

DA169/708 He would be the judge of all the earth, and from His decision there could be no appeal. [H/70/667] (I2)

3SP167/120 In it he presented to the minds of those present a reversal of the scene then being enacted before them, when he, the Lord of life and glory, would be seated at the right hand of God, the supreme Judge of Heaven and earth, from whose decision there could be no appeal. [H/70/667] (P3)

MS(102)14 At that day Christ, then standing before his judges, will be the Judge. [H/70/667] (P2)

DA170/708 Then every secret thing would be set in the light of God's countenance, and judgment be passed upon every man according to his deeds. (I1)

MS(102)15 Every secret thing will be set in the light of God's countenance. (I1)

DA171/708 The words of Christ startled the high priest. (I1)

DA172/708 The thought that there was to be a resurrection of the dead, when all would stand at the bar of God, to be rewarded according to their works, was a thought of terror to Caiaphas. (I1)

70/667 Jesus will now openly, not only take to himself his own name, assume his office, and assert his Divine prerogatives, but in doing so he will let those earthly dignitaries, who have dragged him thus to their tribunal, before whose judgment-seat he stands, know that the hour is coming which shall witness a strange reversal of their relative positions--he being seen sitting on the seat of power, and they, with all the world beside, seen standing before his bar, as on the clouds of heaven he comes to judge all mankind. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(102)27 But the idea that there was to be a resurrection of the dead, when all would stand at the bar of God, to be rewarded according to their works, was a thought of terror to Caiaphas. (11)

DA173/708 He did not wish to believe that in future he would receive sentence according to his works. (11)

MS(102)28 He did not wish to think that in future he would receive sentence according to his works. (11)

DA174/708 There rushed before his mind as a panorama the scenes of the final judgment. (11)

MS(102)31 There rushed before his mind as a panorama the scenes of the final judgment. (11)

DA175/708 For a moment he saw the fearful spectacle of the graves giving up their dead, with the secrets he had hoped were forever hidden. (11)

MS(102)32 For a moment he saw the fearful spectacle of the graves giving up their dead, with the secrets he had hoped were hidden forever. (11)

DA176/708 For a moment he felt as if standing before the eternal Judge, whose eye, which sees all things, was reading his soul, bringing to light mysteries supposed to be hidden with the dead. (11)

MS(102)33 For a moment he felt as though he were standing before the eternal Judge, whose eye, which sees all things, was reading his soul, bringing to light mysteries supposed to be hidden with the dead. (11)

DA177/708 The scenes passed from the priest's vision. (11)

MS(102)34 The scene passed from the priest's vision. (11)

DA178/708 Christ's words cut him, the Sadducee, to the quick. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(102)35 Christ's words cut him, the Sadducee, to the quick. (I1)

DA179/708 Caiaphas had denied the doctrine of the resurrection, the judgment, and a future life. (I1)

DA180/708 Now he was maddened by satanic fury. (I1)

MS(102)35 He was maddened by Satanic fury. (I1)

DA181/708 Was this man, a prisoner before him, to assail his most cherished theories? (I1)

MS(102)37 Was this man, a prisoner before him, to assail his most cherished theories? (I1)

DA182/708 Rending his robe, that the people might see his pretended horror, he demanded that without further preliminaries the prisoner be condemned for blasphemy.
[F/116-120/606] (P1)

3SP172/120+ The high priest, in order to give those present the impression that he was jealous for the insulted majesty of Heaven, rent his garments, and, lifting his hands toward heaven as if in holy horror, said, in a voice calculated to rouse the excited people to violence, "He hath spoken blasphemy; what further need have we of witnesses? behold, now ye have heard his blasphemy. [H/72-79/667] (P2)

MS(51)69 Then the high priest rent his clothes, saying, He hath spoken blasphemy, what further need have we of witness? behold, now ye have heard his blasphemy. [F/116,120/606] (B1)

MS(102)38 "The high priest rent his clothes, saying, He hath spoken blasphemy; what further need have we of witnesses? (B2)

DA183/708 "What further need have we of witnesses?" he said; "behold, now ye have heard His blasphemy. (B2)

MS(102)39 Behold, now ye have heard his blasphemy." (B2)

116/606 In overacted and ill-omened horror, the unjust judge who had thus supplemented the failure of the perjuries which he had vainly sought--the false High Priest rending his linen robes before the True--demanded of the assembly His instant condemnation. Farrar, LC]

117/607 "Blasphemy!" he exclaimed; "what further need have we of witnesses? [Farrar, LC]

118/607 See, now ye heard his blasphemy! [Farrar, LC]

119/607 What is your decision?" [Farrar, LC]

120/607 And with the confused tumultuous cry, "He is ish maveth," "A man of death," "Guilty of death," the dark conclave was broken up, and the second stage of the trial of Jesus was over.

72,74-79/667 The high priest, as soon as he drank in the real meaning of the words which fell on his astonished ear, grasped his mantle, and rent it in real or feigned horror, exclaiming, "He hath spoken blasphemy." . . . "What further need then," says the president of the court to his brother judges, "have we of witnesses? Now ye have heard his blasphemy. What think ye?" "What need we," they say to him, taking up his own words, "any further witnesses? for we ourselves have heard it out of his own mouth." And they "answered and said, He is guilty of death." See Deut. 13:5; 18:20. The unanimous judgment of the court is delivered, (Mark 14:64,) and the sentence of death is pronounced. [Hanna, LC]

DA184/708 What think ye?" (B2)

MS(51)70 What think ye? (B2)

MS(102)40 "What think ye?" (B2)

DA185/708 And they all condemned Him. (B2)

3SP174/121 The answer of the judges was, "He is guilty of death." (B2)

MS(51)71 They answered and said, He is guilty of death." (B2)

MS(102)41 "And they all condemned him." (B2)

DA186/708 Conviction mingled with passion led Caiaphas to do as he did. (I1)

DA187/708 He was furious with himself for believing Christ's words, and instead of rending his heart under a deep sense of truth, and confessing that Jesus was the Messiah, he rent his priestly robes in determined resistance. (I1)

DA188/708 This act was deeply significant. (I1)

DA189/708 Little did Caiaphas realize its meaning. (I1)

DA190/708 In this act, done to influence the judges and secure Christ's condemnation, the high priest had condemned himself. (I1)

DA191/708 By the law of God he was disqualified for the priesthood. [B/369.2] (P2)

DA192/708 He had pronounced upon himself the death sentence. (I1)

DA193/708 A high priest was not to rend his garments. (I1)

MS(102)44 The high priest was not to rend his garment. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

369.2 By this action, therefore, the high priest
declared his priesthood null and void; [Bennett, LHJC]

DA194/708 By the Levitical law, this was prohibited under sentence of death. (I1)

Di(94)11 If he disregard this law he was to die. (I1)

MS(102)45 By the Levitical law, this was prohibited under penalty of death. (I1)

MS(111)45 He who disregarded this law was to die. (I1)

DA195/708 Under no circumstances, on no occasion, was the priest to rend his robe. (I1)

Di(94)10 That the priests under any circumstances were not to remove his priestly turban or to uncover his head or to rend his priestly robe. (I1)

MS(102)46 Under no circumstances, on no occasion, was the high priest to rend his garment. (I1)

MS(111)44 Under no circumstances were the priests to remove their turbans or rend their robes. (I1)

DA196/708+ It was the custom among the Jews for the garments to be rent at the death of friends, but this custom the priests were not to observe. [F/606] (I2)

MS(102)48 It was the general custom for the garments to be rent at the death of friends. (I1)

MS(102)49 The only exception to this was in the case of the high priest. [F/606] (P1)

DA197/709 Express command had been given by Christ to Moses concerning this. Lev. 10:6. (I1)

MS(102)47 Express command was given by Christ to Moses, that this should not be done. (I1)

DA198/709 Everything worn by the priest was to be whole and without blemish. (I1)

MS(102)53 This law was made because everything worn by the high priest was to be whole and without blemish. (I1)

Footnote #3, 606 This was forbidden to the High Priest in cases of mourning (Lev. x.6; xxi.10); but the Jewish Halacha considered it lawful in cases of blasphemy, (gidduph) (1Macc. xi.71; Jos. B.J. ii.15, sec.4.) [Farrar, LC]

DA199/709 By those beautiful official garments was represented the character of the great antitype, Jesus Christ. (Il)

MS(102)54 By these beautiful official garments was represented the character of the great antitype, Jesus Christ. (Il)

DA200/709 Nothing but perfection, in dress and attitude, in word and spirit, could be acceptable to God.

Di(94)12 Nothing but perfection in dress, and attitude words and spirit could be acceptable to God, and represent in the earthly priesthood the sacredness of the heavenly service, and the Worship of God who is holy and whose greatness and glory and perfection must be as far as possible represented by the earthly service. (Il)

MS(111)46 Nothing but perfection, in dress and attitude, in word and spirit, could be acceptable to God. (Il)

DA201/709 He is holy, and His glory and perfection must be represented by the earthly service. (Il)

MS(111)47 He is holy, and his glory and perfection must be represented by the earthly service. (Il)

DA202/709 Nothing but perfection could properly represent the sacredness of the heavenly service. (Il)

MS(111)48 Nothing but perfection could properly represent the sacredness of the heavenly service. (Il)

DA203/709 Finite man might rend his own heart by showing a contrite and humble spirit. (Il)

Di(94)13 Man [sic] finite man may rend his own heart by a contrite and broken Spirit. (Il)

MS(111)49 Finite man might rend his own heart by showing a contrite and humble spirit. (Il)

DA204/709 This God would discern. (Il)

MS(111)50 This God would discern. (Il)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

MS(111)50 This God would discern. (11)

DA205/709 But no rent must be made in the priestly robes, for this would mar the representation of heavenly things. (11)

Di(94)14 God could discern this but the priestly garments must represent no break not one marring feature because this would spoil this figure of the perfection of heavenly things. (11)

MS(111)51 But no rent must be made in the priestly robes, for this would mar the representation of heavenly things. (11)

Di(94)15 These things are to [sic] great for me to handle. (11)

Di(94)16 Yet some things I must mention. (11)

Di(94)17 I must ease my mind of its burden in presenting them to others. (11)

MS(111)82 These things are too great for me to handle, but I must mention some things, to ease my mind of its burden. (11)

Di(94)18 The danger of many who claim to be Christians rending their garments making an outside show of remorse and repentance [sic] when the heart is not softened or broken or contrite; this is the reason there are so continuous failures in those who claim to be Christians. (11)

MS(111)83 Many who claim to be Christians are in danger of rending their garments, making an outward show of remorse and repentance when their hearts are not softened or contrite. (11)

MS(111)84 This is the reason why so many continue to make failures in the Christian life. (11)

Di(94)19 Outward appearance of sorrow is manifested for wrong doing but their repentance [sic] is not the repentance that needeth not to be repented of. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

MS(111)85 An outward appearance of sorrow is manifested for wrong, but their repentance is not that repentance that needeth not to be repented of. (11)

Di(94)20 May the Lord God grant his church true contrition for sin. (11)

MS(111)86 May God grant to his church true contrition for sin. (11)

Di(94)21 O that we may feel the great necessity in all our outward appearance to reveal the true inwardness of the soul. (11)

MS(111)87 O that we may feel the necessity of revealing true sorrow for wrong doing. (11)

Di(94)1¹ My soul is pained, constantly I sorrow, because of the evidence before me of the superficial conversions of many who claim to be Christians. (11)

MS(111)88 My soul is constantly pained because of the evidence that I have of the superficial conversion of those who claim to be children of God. (11)

Di(94)2 The question arises in my mind do these persons have any sense of the infinite sacrifice made in their behalf. (11)

MS(111)89 The question arises in my mind, Do these have any sense of the infinite sacrifice made in their behalf.

Di(94)3 It was a priceless sacrifice of Him the one solitary victim to which all the Jewish economy, all the appointed ceremonial offerings made was very impressively pointing to the One complete offering for the sins of the world . . . (11)

¹Sentences 1, 2, and 3 of Diary Book 18 beginning at this point are taken from page 45 of the diary. The previous sentences from this diary, numbered 10-21 appear on page 43. Since page 44 is missing from Diary Book 18, we did not continue the previous sequence of sentence numbers.

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

MS(111)90 It was a priceless gift, the sacrifice of one who was the foundation of the Jewish economy. (11)

MS(111)91 All the offerings that were made pointed to Christ, the one complete offering for the sins of the world. (11)

DA206/709 The high priest who dared to appear in holy office, and engage in the service of the sanctuary, with a rent robe, was looked upon as having severed himself from God. (11)

MS(102)61 The high priest who dared to appear in holy office, and engage in the service of the sanctuary, with a rent robe, was looked upon as having severed himself from God. (11)

DA207/709 By rending his garment he cut himself off from being a representative character.

MS(102)62 By rending his garment, he cut himself off from being a representative character.

DA208/709 He was no longer accepted by God as an officiating priest. (11)

MS(102)63 Virtually, he was no longer accepted by God as an officiating priest. (11)

DA209/709 This course of action, as exhibited by Caiaphas, showed human passion, human imperfection. (11)

MS(102)64 This course of action as exhibited by Caiaphas, showed human passion, human imperfection. (11)

DA210/709 By rending his garments, Caiaphas made of no effect the law of God, to follow the tradition of men. (11)

MS(102)65 By rending his garment, Caiaphas made of none effect the law of God to follow the tradition of men. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

DA211/709 A man-made law provided that in case of blasphemy a priest might rend his garments in horror at the sin, and be guiltless. [F/606] (P2)

MS(102)66 A man made law provided that in case of blasphemy, a priest might rend his garments in horror at the sin, and be guiltless. [F/606] (P2)

DA212/709 Thus the law of God was made void by the laws of men. (I1)

MS(102)67 Thus the law of God was made void by the laws of men. (I1)

DA213/709 Each action of the high priest was watched with interest by the people; and Caiaphas thought for effect to display his piety. (I1)

MS(102)68 Each action of the high priest was watched with interest by many; and Caiaphas thought for effect to show his great outward piety. (I1)

DA214/709 But in this act, designed as an accusation against Christ, he was reviling the One of whom God had said, "My name is in Him." Ex. 23:21. (I1)

DA215/709 He himself was committing blasphemy. [B/372.7] (P1)

MS(102)69 But by his very act he was committing blasphemy against God. [B/372.7] (P1)

DA216/709 Standing under the condemnation of God, he pronounced sentence upon Christ as a blasphemer. [B/372.7] (I2)

MS(102)82 Standing under the condemnation of God, he pronounced sentence on Christ as a blasphemer. [B/372.7] (I2)

DA217/709 When Caiaphas rent his garment, his act was significant of the place that the Jewish nation as a nation would thereafter occupy toward God. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

Footnote #3, 606 This was forbidden to the High Priest in cases of mourning (Lev. x.6; xxi.10); but the Jewish Halacha considered it lawful in cases of blasphemy, gidduph (1Macc. xi.71; Jos. B.J. ii.15, sec.4. [Farrar, LC]

372.7 But by this stroke the charge of blasphemy, for which they condemned and executed Christ, is thrown back upon his judges and executioners. [Bennett, LHJC]

MS(102)102 When Caiaphas rent his garments, his action was significant of the place that the Jewish nation as a nation would in future occupy toward God. (11)

DA218/709 The once favored people of God were separating themselves from Him, and were fast becoming a people disowned by Jehovah. (11)

MS(102)103 As a whole, the Jewish nation had apostatized. (11)

DA219/709 When Christ upon the cross cried out, "It is finished" (John 19:30), and the veil of the temple was rent in twain, the Holy Watcher declared that the Jewish people had rejected Him who was the antitype of all their types, the substance of all their shadows. (11)

DA220/709 Israel was divorced from God. (11)

MS(102)104 The once favored people of God had become divorced from him. (11)

DA221/709 Well might Caiaphas then rend his official robes, which signified that he claimed to be a representative of the great High Priest; for no longer had they any meaning for him or for the people. (11)

DA222/709 Well might the high priest rend his robes in horror for himself and for the nation. (11)

DA223/710 The Sanhedrin had pronounced Jesus worthy of death; but it was contrary to the Jewish law to try a prisoner by night. [F/2/608] (P2)

MS(51)73 And yet the priests had decalred [sic] that he was worthy of death. [F/2/608] (P2)

DA224/710 In legal condemnation nothing could be done except in the light of day and before a full session of the council. [F/2/608] (P1)

2/608 From this moment He was regarded by all the apparitors of the Jewish Court as a heretic, liable to death by stoning; and was only remanded into custody to be kept till break of day, because by daylight only, and in the Lishcat Haggazzith, or Hall of Judgment, and only by a full session of the entire Sanhedrin, could He be legally condemned. [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)72 In legal condemnation nothing could be done until the light of day and before a full session of the Sanhedrim. [F/2/608] (P1)

DA225/710 Notwithstanding this, the Saviour was now treated as a condemned criminal, and given up to be abused by the lowest and vilest of humankind. [F/3/608] (P2)

MS(51)74 He was now considered fit to receive abuse from the lowest and vilest of human kind. [F/3/608] (P2)

DA226/710 The palace of the high priest surrounded an open court in which the soldiers and the multitude had gathered. [F/8/608] (I2)

DA227/710 Through this court, Jesus was taken to the guardroom, on every side meeting with mockery of His claim to be the Son of God. [F/3/608] (I2)

DA228/710 His own words, "sitting on the right hand of power," and, "coming in the clouds of heaven," were jeeringly repeated. (I1)

MS(51)75 He was taken from the outer court to the guard room, on every side meeting with taunts and jeers, and cruel mockery in regard to his claims to be the Son of God; "sitting on the throne of his glory," and "coming in the clouds of heaven," was [sic] tauntingly and mockingly, repeated. [F/3/608] (I2)

DA229/710 While in the guardroom, awaiting His legal trial, He was not protected. [F/52/612] (I2)

MS(51)99 While waiting for his legal trial in the guard room, Christ was not protected. [F/52/612] (I2)

DA230/710 The ignorant rabble had seen the cruelty with which He was treated before the council, and from this they took license to manifest all the satanic elements of their nature. [F/52/612] (I2)

3/608 And since now they looked upon Him as a fit person to be insulted with impunity, He was haled through the court-yard to the guard-room with blows and curses, in which it may be that not only the attendant menials, but even the cold but now infuriated Sadducees took their share.
[Farrar, LC]

8/608 As far as we can infer from the various narratives, the palace in Jerusalem, conjointly occupied by Annas the real, and Caiaphas the titular High Priest, seems to have been built round a square court, and entered by an arched passage or vestibule; and on the farther side of it, probably up a short flight of steps, was the hall in which the committee of the Sanhedrin had met. [Farrar, LC]

52/612 For, in the guard-room to which He was remanded to await the break of day, all the ignorant malice of the religious hatred, all the narrow vulgarity of brutal spite, all the cold innate cruelty which lurks under the abjectness of Oriental servility, was let loose against Him. [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)100 The malice of the ignorant, the brutal cruelty with which He had been treated was assumed by them as a liberty. [F/52/612] (P2)

MS(51)101 They made manifest the Satanic in their character. (I1)

DA231/710 Christ's very nobility and godlike bearing goaded them to madness. [F/53/612] (P1)

MS(51)102 His very nobility and God-like bearing goaded them to madness. [F/53/612] (P1)

DA232/710 His meekness, His innocence, His majestic patience, filled them with hatred born of Satan. [F/53/612] (P1)

MS(51)103 His meekness, His innocence, His majestic bearing fulfilled [sic] them with a madness born of Satan. [F/53/612] (P1)

MS(51)104 Defenseless and alone, as a sheep before her shearers is dumb, so He opened not His mouth. [F/57/613] (I2)

DA233/710 Mercy and justice were trampled upon. (I1)

MS(51)105 Justice and mercy were trampled upon. (I1)

DA234/710 Never was criminal treated in so inhuman a manner as was the Son of God. (I1)

MS(51)106 Never was criminal treated in so merciless and inhuman a manner as was Jesus, the world's Redeemer. (I1)

MS(51)76 How little did these Pharisees and Sadducees, these priests and rulers, understand the prophecies which they were in the very act of fulfilling to the letter. (I1)

MS(51)77 What intense blindness comes to the human mind that has turned from light, rejected evidence, and closed himself in with the impenetrable wall of prejudice. (I1)

53/612 His very meekness, His very silence, His very majesty--the very stainlessness of His innocence, the very grandeur of His fame--every divine circumstance and quality which raised Him to a height so infinitely immeasurable above His persecutors--all these made Him an all the more welcome victim for their low and devilish ferocity.
[Farrar, LC]

57/613 So they whiled away the dark cold hours till the morning, revenging themselves upon His impassive innocence for their own present vileness and previous terror; and there, in the midst of that savage and wanton varletry, the Son of God, bound and blindfold, stood in His long and silent agony, defenceless and alone. [Farrar, LC]

MS(51)78 For two thousand years the Jews had looked and waited for the Messiah, and this is the reception he receives at their hands. [F/1/608] (Pl)

MS(51)79 That nation which should have received him as the greatest blessing that heaven can bestow upon a fallen race, refused him, and gave him over to the mob for them to insult and mock and curse. (Il)

DA235/710 But a keener anguish rent the heart of Jesus; the blow that inflicted the deepest pain no enemy's hand could have dealt. [F/6/608] (Pl)

DA236/710 While He was undergoing the mockery of an examination before Caiaphas, Christ had been denied by one of His own disciples. [M/10/311] (Pl)

3SP4/107 But while enduring this mockery of an examination, the Saviour's heart was pierced by a keener pang than it was in the power of his enemies to inflict. [M/10/311] (Pl)

MS(51)84 And while thus insulted and mocked, Peter, his boldest disciple, is denying that he knows the man who has been his beloved Teacher,--the one he had owned to be the Son of the living God, and having the words of eternal life, when many of his fellow disciples were offended at Christ's words, and walked no more with him. [M/10/311] (I2)

MS(51)80 But that which caused Christ's soul the keenest anguish was that which he had foretold Peter would come. [F/6,7/608] (Pl)

3SP5/107 It was when he heard his beloved disciple deny him with cursing and swearing. [M/10/311] (Pl)

MS(97)81 He heard the denial of Peter; he heard the wicked oaths, and this made more intensely bitter his cup of anguish. [F/6/608]

MS(51)82 Christ is now in his deepest humiliation; he is greeted with jeers; smitten by cruel hands, yet he utters no word of retaliation. (Il)

MS(51)83 They spit [-?-] in the face of the Lord Jesus. (B2)

1/608 And this was how the Jews at last received their promised Messiah--longed for with passionate hopes during two thousand years; since then regretted in bitter agony for well-nigh two thousand more! [Farrar, LC]

6/608 And as He was led past that fire He heard--what was to Him a more deadly bitterness than any which His brutal persecutors could pour into His cup of anguish--He heard His boldest Apostle denying Him with oaths. [Farrar, LC]

10/311 And while he is subjected to such mockery from his enemies, the heart of Jesus is pierced with a deeper pang, by hearing his own honored and foremost disciple Peter deny, with bitter oaths and rude blasphemy, that he ever knew him. [March, WHJ]

7/608 For during these two sad hours of His commencing tragedy, as He stood in the Halls of Annas and of Caiaphas, another moral tragedy, which He had already prophesied, had been taking place in the outer court. [Farrar, LC]

51/612 And it was this crime, committed against Him by the man who had first proclaimed Him as the Christ--who had come to Him over the stormy water--who had drawn the sword for Him in Gethsemane--who had affirmed so indignantly that he would die with Him rather than deny Him--it was this denial, confirmed by curses, that Jesus heard immediately after He had been condemned to death, and at the very commencement of His first terrible derision. [Farrar, LC]

DA237/710 After deserting their Master in the garden, two of the disciples had ventured to follow, at a distance, the mob that had Jesus in charge. [F/9/609] (P1)

3SP6/107 After deserting their Master in the garden, two of the disciples regained their presence of mind and ventured to follow, at a distance, the mob that had Jesus in charge. [H/1-4/653] (P1)

MS(51)85 "Then took they him, and led him, and brought him into the high priests [sic] house. (B2)

DA238/710 These disciples were Peter and John.

MS(51)86 And Peter followed afar off. (B2)

DA239/710 The priests recognized John as a well-known disciple of Jesus, and admitted him to the hall, hoping that as he witnessed the humiliation of his Leader, he would scorn the idea of such a one being the Son of God. [F/10/609] (I2)

DA240/710 John spoke in favor of Peter, and gained an entrance for him also. [F/15/609] (P1)

3SP9/107 John, having secured himself an entrance, spoke in behalf of his companion, Peter, and gained the same favor for him. [H/5,6/653] (P1)

DA241/710 In the court a fire had been kindled; for it was the coldest hour of the night, being just before the dawn. [H/8/653] (P1)

3SP10/107+ The coldest hour of the night was that preceding the dawn, and a fire had been lighted in the hall. [H/8/653] (P1)

DA242/710 A company drew about the fire, and Peter presumptuously took his place with them. [H/10/654] [B/375.8] (B1)

3SP11/108 Around this a company were gathered; and Peter presumptuously took his place with the rest by the fire, and stood warming himself. [H/8,10/653+] [B/375.8] (B1)

9/609 Timidly, and at a distance, two only of the Apostles had so far recovered from their first panic as to follow far in the rear of the melancholy procession. [Farrar, LC]

1-3/653 When they saw their Master bound and borne away, all the disciples forsook him and fled. Two of them, however, recovered speedily from their panic. Foremost now, and bravest of them all, John first regained his self-possession, and returning on his footsteps followed the band which conveyed Jesus to the residence of the high priest. [Hanna, LC]

4/653 Coming alone, and so far behind the others, he might have found some difficulty in getting admission. [Hanna, LC]

10/609 One of these--the beloved disciple--known perhaps to the High Priest's household as a young fisherman of the Lake of Galilee--had found ready admittance, with no attempt to conceal his sympathies or his identity. [Farrar, LC]

15/609 But John, regretting that he should be debarred from the entrance, and judging perhaps of his friend's firmness by his own, exerted his influence to obtain admission for him. [Farrar, LC]

5,6/653 . . . but John had some acquaintance with the domestics of the high priest, and so got entrance; . . . He went, therefore, and spoke to the portress, who at his instance allowed Peter to pass in. [Hanna, LC]

8/653 It was the coldest hour of the night, the hour that precedes the dawn, and the servants and officers had kindled a fire in the upper end of the hall where they were gathered. [Hanna, LC]

10/654 So stepping boldly forward, and sitting down among the men who were warming themselves around the fire, he made himself one of them. [Hanna, LC]

[See B/375.8 below]

MS(51)87 And when they had kindled a fire in the midst of the hall, and were set down together, Peter sat down among them. (B2)

DA243/710 He did not wish to be recognized as a disciple of Jesus. [H/9/653] (P1)

DA244/710 By mingling carelessly with the crowd, he hoped to be taken for one of those who had brought Jesus to the hall. [H/9/653] (P2)

DA245/710 But as the light flashed upon Peter's face, the woman who kept the door cast a searching glance upon him. [H/11,12/654] (P1)

DA246/710+ She had noticed that he came in with John, she marked the look of dejection on his face, and thought that he might be a disciple of Jesus. [H/13-16/654] (I2)

MS(104)93 The look of dejection on Peter's face suggested to the woman the thought that this was one of the disciples of Christ. [H/13-16/654] (I2)

DA247/711 She was one of the servants of Caiaphas' household, and was curious to know. [F/17/609] (P2)

MS(104)94 She was one of the servants of Caiaphas' household, and was curious to know. [F/17/609] (P2)

DA248/711 She said to Peter, "Art not thou also one of this Man's disciples?" [H/17/654] (B1)

3SP14/108 She interrogated him in a taunting manner: "Art not thou also one of this man's disciples?" [H/17/654] (P1)

MS(51)88 And a certain maid beheld him as he sat by the fire, and said, This man was also with him. (B2)

MS(104)95 She said to Peter, "Art thou not also one of this man's disciples?" [H/16b/654] (B1)

375.8 But in this hall, to which Peter went, to sit down and await the end, the servants had kindled a fire; for it was cold. . . . There were gathered round that fire a promiscuous multitude, officers of the priesthood, domestic servants of the high priest, Roman soldiers, and officious Jews, offering their services; but all enemies of Jesus, and among them, Peter, though much out of place. Better had he been in some secret place bewailing his sins, and asking pardon, first for his presumptuous professions, and then for his cowardly flight. [Bennett, LHJC]

9/653 Peter did not wish to be recognized, and the best way he thought to preserve his incognito was to put at once the boldest face he could upon it; act as if he had been one of the capturing band and had as good a right to be there as others of that mixed company, as little known in this palace as himself. [Hanna, LC]

11,12/654 The woman who kept the door was standing near. The strong light of the kindling fire, falling upon that group of faces, her eye fell upon Peter's. [Hanna, LC]

13-16/654 That surely, it occurred to her as she looked at it, was the face of the man whom she had admitted a few minutes ago, of whose features she had caught a glimpse as he passed by. She looks again, and looks more earnestly. . . Her first impression is confirmed. It is John's friend; that Galilean's friend; some friend too, no doubt of this same Jesus. [Hanna, LC]

17/609 The portress, after the admission of those concerned in the capture, seems to have been relieved (as was only natural at that late hour) by another maid, and advancing to the group of her fellow-servants, she fixed a curious and earnest gaze on the dubious stranger as he sat full in the red glare of the firelight, and then, with a flash of recognition, she exclaimed, "Why, you, as well as the other, were with Jesus of Galilee." [Farrar, LC]

16b/654 . . . she waits till she has caught his eye, and going up to him she says: "Art not thou also one of this man's disciples?" a short, abrupt, peremptory, unexpected challenge. [Hanna, LC]

DA249/711 Peter was startled and confused; the eyes of the company instantly fastened upon him. [H/17,18/654] (P1)

MS(104)96 Peter was startled and confused; the eyes of the company instantly fastened upon him.
[H/17,18/654] (P1)

DA250/711 He pretended not to understand her; but she was persistent, and said to those around her that this man was with Jesus. [H/21,22/654] (I2)

MS(104)97 He pretended not to understand her, but she was persistent, and said to those around her that this man was with Jesus. [H/21,22/654] (I2)

DA251/711 Peter felt compelled to answer, and said angrily, "Woman, I know Him not." (B2)

MS(51)89 And he denied him, saying, Woman, I know him not. (B2)

MS(104)98 Peter felt compelled to answer, and said angrily, "Woman, I know him not." (B2)

DA252/711 This was the first denial, and immediately the cock crew. [H/24,30/654] (P1)

MS(104)99 This was the first denial, and immediately the cock crew. [H/24,30/654] (P1)

DA253/711 O Peter, so soon ashamed of thy Master! so soon to deny thy Lord! (I1)

MS(104)100 O Peter! so soon ashamed of thy Master! so soon to cowardly deny thy Lord! (I1)

DA254/711 The disciple John, upon entering the judgment hall, did not try to conceal the fact that he was a follower of Jesus. [F/10/609] (P2)

DA255/711 He did not mingle with the rough company who were reviling his Master. [H/79/656] (I2)

17/654 It takes Peter entirely by surprise. [Hanna, LC]

18/654 It throws him wholly off his guard. [Hanna, LC]

19/654 There they are the eyes of all those men around now turned inquiringly upon him; [Hanna, LC]

21/610 And thus it was that the mere curious question of an inquisitive young girl startled him by its very suddenness into a quick denial of his Lord. [Farrar, LC]

21/654 The woman, however, wont believe him when he says that he does not understand her question. [Hanna, LC]

22/654 Both to himself and to others around her, she reaffirms her first belief. [Hanna, LC]

23/654 Peter has to back his first falsehood by a second and a third: "Woman, I am not one of this man's disciples; I know him not." [Hanna, LC]

24/654 Peter's first denial of his Master. [Hanna, LC]

30/654 A cock now crows without. [Hanna, LC]

10/609 One of these--the beloved disciple--known perhaps to the High Priest's household as a young fisherman of the Lake of Galilee--had found ready admittance, with no attempt to conceal his sympathies or his identity. [Farrar, LC]

78/656 Yet never once is John questioned or disturbed. [Hanna, LC]

79/656 And why, but because he had joined none of their companies, had attempted no disguise; his speech was not heard betraying him. [Hanna, LC]

DA256/711 He was not questioned, for he did not assume a false character, and thus lay himself liable to suspicion.
[H/78-80/656] (P1)

DA257/711+ He sought a retired corner secure from the notice of the mob, but as near Jesus as it was possible for him to be. [H/80/656] (P1)

DA258/712 Here he could see and hear all that took place at the trial of his Lord. (I1)

DA259/712 Peter had not designed that his real character should be known. [H/71,74/656] (P2)

DA260/712 In assuming an air of indifference he had placed himself on the enemy's ground, and he became an easy prey to temptation. [H/69,70/656] (I2)

3SP22/108 In the first place Peter had not designed that his real character should be known; and, in assuming an air of indifference, he placed himself on the enemy's ground, and became an easy subject to Satan's temptation. [H/69-74/656] (I2)

DA261/712 If he had been called to fight for his Master, he would have been a courageous soldier; but when the finger of scorn was pointed at him, he proved himself a coward.
[H/56-60/655] (P1)

RH(91)42 Peter had been ready to take up arms in defense of Christ, but to acknowledge the Lord when he was the object of scorn and derision, was more than he had courage to do.
[H/56-63/655] (P1)

RH(91)43 He was a moral coward, and with curses and oaths he denied that he knew his Master. [H/56/655] (P2)

80/656 Had you looked for him you would have found him in some quiet shaded nook of that quadrangle, as near his Master as he could get, yet inviting no scrutiny, exposing himself to no detection. [Hanna, LC]

69/656 What harm can there be in his appearing for the time as **indifferent** to Christ's fate as any of these officers and servants among whom he sits? [Hanna, LC]

70/656 That free and easy gait of theirs he **assumes**; goes in with all they say; perhaps tries to join with them in their coarse, untimely mirth. [Hanna, LC]

71/656 First easy yet fatal step, this taking on a **character** not his own. [Hanna, LC]

74/656 It was the rash act of sitting down with these men at that fireside, that assumption of the mask, the attempt to appear to be what he was not, which set Peter upon the slippery edge of that slope, down which to such a depth he afterwards descended. [Hanna, LC]

56/655 It was in **moral courage**, not physical, that Peter failed. [Hanna, LC]

59/655 Had there been any open danger to be faced, can we doubt that he **would** gallantly have faced it? [Hanna, LC]

60/655 Had his Master called him to stand by his side in some open conflict with his enemies, would Peter have forsaken him? [Hanna, LC]

61/655 His was one of but two swords in the garden; those two against all the swords and other weapons of that multitude. [Hanna, LC]

62/655 But even against such odds, Peter, bold as a lion, drew his sword, and had the use of it been allowed would have fought it out till he had died by his Master's side. [Hanna, LC]

63/655 But it is altogether a new and unexpected state of things, this willing surrender of himself by Jesus into the hands of his enemies; this refusal, almost rebuke, of any attempt at rescue or defence. [Hanna, LC]

DA262/712 Many who do not shrink from active warfare for their Lord are driven by ridicule to deny their faith. [H/87/656] (I2)

DA263/712 By associating with those whom they should avoid, they place themselves in the way of temptation. [H/87/656] (P2)

DA264/712 They invite the enemy to tempt them, and are led to say and do that of which under other circumstances they would never have been guilty. [H/87/656] (P1)

DA265/712 The disciple of Christ who in our day disguises his faith through dread of suffering or reproach denies his Lord as really as did Peter in the judgment hall. [H/87/656] (I2)

DA266/712 Peter tried to show no interest in the trial of his Master, but his heart was wrung with sorrow as he heard the cruel taunts, and saw the abuse He was suffering. (I1)

DA267/712 More than this, he was surprised and angry that Jesus should humiliate Himself and His followers by submitting to such treatment. [H/64/655] (P3)

DA268/712 In order to conceal his true feelings, he endeavored to join with the persecutors of Jesus in their untimely jests. [H/70/656] (I2)

MS(104)109 And Peter took a place among the multitude. (I1)

DA269/712 But his appearance was unnatural. (I1)

DA270a/712 He was acting a lie, [H/73/656] (P1)

DA270b/712 and while seeking to talk unconcernedly he could not restrain expressions of indignation at the abuse heaped upon his Master. [B/377.2] (P2)

87/656 In this matter, then, of denying our Lord and Master Jesus Christ, let us not be high-minded, but fear; and, taking our special warning from that first false step of Peter, should we ever happen to be thrown into the society of those who bear no liking to the name or the cause of the Redeemer, let us beware lest, hiding in inglorious shame our faces from him, we be tempted to say or to do what for us, with our knowledge, would be a far worse thing to say or do, than what was said and done by Peter, in his ignorance within the high priest's hall. [Hanna, LC]

64/655 It unsettles, it overturns all Peter's former ideas of his Master's power, and of the manner in which that power was to be put forth. [Hanna, LC]

70/656 That free and easy gait of theirs he assumes; goes in with all they say; perhaps tries to join with them in their coarse, untimely mirth. [Hanna, LC]

73/656 The acted lie precedes the spoken one; prepares for it, almost necessitates it. [Hanna, LC]

377.2 Peter's consciousness of guilt, his uneasiness at his conduct, his anxiety about his Master, his horror at the abuse poured upon the Saviour, all marked his countenance. [Bennett, LHJC]

DA271/712 Attention was called to him the second time, and he was again charged with being a follower of Jesus. (I1)

MS(104)110 But attention was called to him the second time, and he was again charged with being a follower of Jesus. (I1)

RH(91)39 Did he now move nearer to his Lord?--No, he pushed his way out to the porch, seeking to escape the prying eyes of the enemies of his Lord; but again he was recognized, and another said to him, "This fellow was also with Jesus of Nazareth." [H/29-30/654] (P2)

DA272/712 He now declared with an oath, "I do not know the Man." (B2)

3SP29/109 He now denied the accusation with an oath. [H/35/654] (P2)

3SP30/109 The cock crew the second time; but Peter heard it not, for he was now thoroughly intent upon carrying out the character which he had assumed. [H/31,32/654] (I2)

RH(91)41 Peter was irritated that he could not find an escape from the eyes of his enemies; he returned again to the hall, where he could better view the trial, but he stood among the mockers and revilers of Christ, and the third time he was recognized, and they said to him, "Surely thou also art one of them; for thy speech bewrayeth thee." [H/41/655] (I2)

DA273/712 Still another opportunity was given him. (I1)

DA274/712 An hour had passed, when one of the servants of the high priest, being a near kinsman of the man whose ear Peter had cut off, asked him, "Did not I see thee in the garden with Him?" [F/33,36/611] (B1)

29/654 Those prying eyes disturb. [Hanna, LC]

30/654 As soon as conveniently he can, without attracting notice, he rises and retires into the shadow of the porch, through which in entering he had passed. [Hanna, LC]

35/654 He does so with an oath, declaring, "I do not know the man." [Hanna, LC]

31/654 A cock now crows without. [Hanna, LC]

32/654 He hears but heeds it not. [Hanna, LC]

32/611 But now flight seemed impossible, for it would only confirm suspicion; so with desperate, gloomy resolution he once more--with feelings which can barely be imagined--joined the unfriendly and suspicious group who were standing round the fire. [Farrar, LC]

41/655 He is out in the hall again, standing talking with the others; no glare of light upon his face, yet little thinking all the while that by his very talking he is supplying another mode of recognition. [Hanna, LC]

33,36/611 A whole hour passed: for him it must have been a fearful hour, and one never to be forgotten. . . . It is evident that, in spite of denial and of oath, they wholly distrust and despise him; and at last one of the High Priest's servants--a kinsman of the wounded Malchus--once more strongly and confidently charged him with having been with Jesus in the garden, taunting him, in proof of it, with the misplaced gutterals of his provincial dialect. [Farrar, LC]

38/655 A full hour has passed. [Hanna, LC]

MS(104)114 One of the servants of the high priest, being a near kinsman to the man whose ear Peter had cut off, asked him, "Did I not see thee in the garden with him?" (B2)

DA275/712 "Surely thou art one of them: for thou art a Galilean, and thy speech agreeth thereto." (B2)

MS(51)90 And about the space of one hour after another confidently affirmed, saying, Of a truth this fellow was also with him; for he is a Galilean. [F/33,36/611] (B1)

MS(104)115 "Surely thou art one of them; for thou art a Galilean, and thy speech agreeth thereto." (B2)

DA276/712 At this Peter flew into a rage. (I1)

DA277/712 The disciples of Jesus were noted for the purity of their language, and in order fully to deceive his questioners, and justify his assumed character, Peter now denied his Master with cursing and swearing. (I1)

3SP33/109 At this, Peter flew into a rage, and to fully deceive his questioners, and to justify his assumed character, he denied his Master with cursing and swearing. (I1)

MS(51)91 And Peter said, Man, I know not what thou sayest. (B2)

MS(104)116 At this Peter flew into a rage, and to fully deceive his questioners, and to justify his assumed character, he denied his Master with cursing and swearing. (I1)

DA278/712 Again the cock crew. (B2)

3SP34/109 And immediately the cock crew the third time. (I1)

MS(51)92 And immediately while he yet spake, the cock crew. (B2)

MS(104)117 And immediately the cock crew the third time. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

DA279/712 Peter heard it then, and he remembered the words of Jesus, "Before the cock crow twice, thou shalt deny Me thrice." Mark 14:30. (I1)

MS(51)94 And Peter remembered the word of the Lord, how he had said unto him, Before the cock crow thou shalt deny me thrice. (B2)

MS(104)118 Peter heard it then, and he remembered the words of Jesus, "Before the cock crow thou shalt deny me thrice." (B2)

DA280/712+ While the degrading oaths were fresh upon Peter's lips, and the shrill crowing of the cock was still ringing in his ears, the Saviour turned from the frowning judges, and looked full upon His poor disciple.
[H/87-100/656+] (P1)

3SP35/109 Peter heard it then; and while the degrading oaths were fresh upon his lips, and the shrill crowing of the cock was yet ringing in his ears, the Saviour turned his face from the frowning judges, and looked full upon his poor disciple.
[H/87-100/656+] (P1)

MS(51)93 And the Lord turned and looked upon Peter. (B2)

MS(104)119 Christ was weary and faint from fasting when the denial of Peter reached Him; and while the degrading oaths were fresh upon his lips, and the shrill crowing of the cock was yet ringing in his ears, the Saviour turned His face from the frowning judges and looked full upon His poor disciple.
[H/87-100/656+] (P1)

DA281/713 At the same time Peter's eyes were drawn to his Master. (I1)

3SP36/109 At the same time Peter's eyes were involuntarily fixed upon his Master. (I1)

MS(104)120 At the same time Peter's eyes were involuntarily fixed upon his Master. (I1)

DA282/713 In that gentle countenance he read deep pity and sorrow, but there was no anger there. [H/101,102/657] (I2)

87,88/656 The oaths with which he sealed his third denial were yet fresh on Peter's lips, when a second time the cock crew. And that shrill sound was yet ringing in his ears when "the Lord turned and looked upon Peter." [Hanna, LC]

99,100/657 "The Lord turned." He turned from facing those scowling judges; . . . [Hanna, LC]

101/657 Was that a look of anger; of unmingled, unmitigated rebuke? [Hanna, LC]

MS(104)121 He read in that gentle countenance deep pity and sorrow; but there was no anger there.
[H/101,105/657] (I2)

DA283/713 The sight of that pale, suffering face, those quivering lips, that look of compassion and forgiveness, pierced his heart like an arrow. [F/42-44/612] (P2)

RH(92)77 Then the Lord turned, and looked on Peter with a look of pitying compassion mingled with grief, and that look broke Peter's heart. [I/364.8] (P2)

MS(51)96 That look was enough; it pierced the heart of Peter like an arrow. [F/42-44/612] (P1)

MS(51)97 The eloquent angusish [sic] of the Master he had loved and served was a picture so vivid, that he could not efface it from his memory. [F/44/612] (I2)

MS(104)122 That face pale with suffering, those quivering lips, seemed to speak to Peter. (I1)

MS(104)123 "Not know Me, Peter?" (I1)

MS(104)124 The look was blended with pity, compassion, and forgiveness for the unfaithful one; and it pierced Peter's heart like an arrow.
[I/364.8] (P2)

DA284/713 Conscience was aroused. [H/93,94/657] (P1)

DA285/713 Memory was active. [H/93,94/657] (P1)

DA286/713 Peter called to mind his promise of a few short hours before that he would go with his Lord to prison and to death. [H/113/658] (I2)

3SP38a/109 Peter was conscience-smitten;
[H/93,94/657] (P1)

3SP38b/109+ his memory was aroused; [H/93,94/657] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

105/657 Doubtless there was reproach in the look which Jesus bent upon Peter; gentle reproach, all the more powerful because of its gentleness. [Hanna, LC]

42/612 Blessed are those on whom, when He looks in sorrow, the Lord looks also with love! [Farrar, LC]

43/612 It was enough. [Farrar, LC]

44/612 Like an arrow through his inmost soul, shot the mute eloquent anguish of that reproachful glance. [Farrar, LC]

364.8 He caught his Master's eyes bent upon him, with a tender and reproofing gaze, so full of sorrowing compassion, mingled with forgiveness, that I saw Peter start as if smitten with lightning. [Ingraham, PHD]

93/657 . . . which our Lord was pleased to contrive and employ for stirring the sluggish memory and quickening the dead conscience of the apostle. [Hanna, LC]

94/657 And sluggish memories, dead consciences, are they not often thus awakened by striking outward providences cooperating with the word and with the Spirit? [Hanna, LC]

113/658 Instantly there flashed upon his memory those words of prophetic warning, spoken a few hours before in the quest-chamber. [Hanna, LC]

3SP38c/110 he recalled to mind his promise of a few short hours before, that he would go to prison or to death for his Lord. [H/113/658] (I2)

DA287/713 He remembered his grief when the Saviour told him in the upper chamber that he would deny his Lord thrice that same night. [H/114/658] (I2)

DA288/713 Peter had just declared that he knew not Jesus, but he now realized with bitter grief how well his Lord knew him, and how accurately He had read his heart, the falseness of which was unknown even to himself. [H/108/658] (I2)

DA289/713 A tide of memories rushed over him. [H/119/658] (I2)

DA290/713 The Saviour's tender mercy, His kindness and long-suffering, His gentleness and patience toward His erring disciples,--all was remembered. [H/106/657] (P2)

3SP45/110 He remembered the Saviour's tender mercy, his kindness and long-suffering, the patience with which he dealt with his followers. [H/106/657] (P2)

DA291/713 He recalled the caution, "Simon, behold, Satan hath desired to have you, that he may sift you as wheat: but I have prayed for thee, that thy faith fail not." Luke 22:31, 32. [H/120/658] (B1)

DA292/713 He reflected with horror upon his own ingratitude, his falsehood, his perjury. [H/112/658] (P2)

3SP41/110 He groaned in spirit as he realized that not only was his Master enduring the bitterest humiliation at the hands of his enemies, but he was suffering additional dishonor at the hands of one of his disciples, who had forsaken and refused to acknowledge him in the hour of his trial. [H/112/658] (P3)

114/658 Thrice had Jesus forewarned him, that before the cock crew twice, he should thrice deny him. [Hanna, LC]

108/658 It told the apostle how well He, of whom he had just been saying that he knew him not, knew him; how thoroughly he knew him when he forewarned him of his fall. [Hanna, LC]

119/658 But now, as if the awakened memory, by the very fulness and vividness of their recall, would repair the past forgetfulness, he sees all, hears all again. [Hanna, LC]

106/657 But that reproach, quickly as it was perceived, and keenly as it was felt, formed but a veil to the tender, forgiving, sympathizing love which the Master felt for the erring disciple. [Hanna, LC]

120/658 Those words of warning are anew ringing in his ears, and as he thinks how fearfully exact the fulfilment of those forgotten predictions of his Master has been, a sense of guilt and shame oppresses him. [Hanna, LC]

112/658 He felt, as it fell upon him, that it was the look of one, not angrily complaining of injury, not indignantly demanding redress, but only desiring that Peter might feel how unkindly, ungratefully, ungenerously he had acted towards such a Master; of one who wished him above all things to be assured that if he but saw and felt his error, there were readiness and room enough in his heart to receive him back at once and fully into favor--to forgive all, forget all, be all to him he had ever been. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - ELLEN G. WHITE

3SP42/110 The look of Christ conveyed volumes to the repentant Peter. [H/107/658] (P1)

3SP43/110 He read in that glance sorrow, love, and pardon. (I1)

DA293/713 Once more he looked at his Master, and saw a sacrilegious hand raised to smite Him in the face. (I1)

DA294/713 Unable longer to endure the scene, he rushed, heartbroken, from the hall. [H/121/658] (P1)

MS(51)95 And Peter went out, and wept bitterly. (B2)

MS(51)98 And he rushed from the company, his heart broken, repentant, remorseful, agonized. [H/121/658] (P1)

DA295/713 He pressed on in solitude and darkness, he knew not and cared not whither. [H/122,123/659] (I2)

MS(104)125 He fled from the now crowded courts, he cared not where. [H/122/659] (I2)

DA296/713 At last he found himself in Gethsemane. [H/126/659] (P1)

DA297/713 The scene of a few hours before came vividly to his mind. (I1)

DA298/713 The suffering face of his Lord, stained with bloody sweat and convulsed with anguish, rose before him. [H/126/659] (I2)

DA299/713 He remembered with bitter remorse that Jesus had wept and agonized in prayer alone, while those who should have united with Him in that trying hour were sleeping. (I1)

107/658 Volumes of pity and compassion lay enfolded in that look. [Hanna, LC]

121/658 He can bear that look no longer; he turns and hurries out of the hall, seeking a place to shed his bitter tears--tears not like those of Judas, of dismal and hopeless remorse, but of genuine and unaffected repentance. [Hanna, LC]

47/612 Flinging the fold of his mantle over his head, he too, like Judas, rushed forth into the night. [Farrar, LC]

48/612 Into the night, but not as Judas; into the unsunned outer darkness of miserable self-condemnation, but not into the midnight of remorse and of despair; into the night, but, as has been beautifully said, it was "to meet the morning dawn." [Farrar, LC]

122/659 He goes out alone, but whither? [Hanna, LC]

123/659 It was still dark. . . . [Hanna, LC]

125/659 Such deep and bitter grief as his seeks solitude; and where could he find a solitude so suitable as that which his Lord and Master had so loved? [Hanna, LC]

[See below]

DA300/713 He remembered His solemn charge, "Watch and pray, that ye enter not into temptation." Matt. 26:41. (I1)

DA301/713 He witnessed again the scene in the judgment hall. (I1)

DA302/713 It was torture to his bleeding heart to know that he had added the heaviest burden to the Saviour's humiliation and grief. (I1)

DA303/713 On the very spot where Jesus had poured out His soul in agony to His Father, Peter fell upon his face, and wished that he might die. [H/126/659] (I2)

3SP52/110+ At last he found himself in the garden of Gethsemane, where a short time before he had slept while the Saviour wrestled with the powers of darkness. [H/126/659] (P2)

MS(104)126 At last he found himself in the garden of Gethsemane and in the very spot where Jesus had poured out His soul in agony to His Father. [H/126/659] (P2)

MS(104)127 He fell on his face stricken and wounded, and so overwhelmed with what he had done that he wished he could die there. (I1)

DA304/713 It was in sleeping when Jesus bade him watch and pray that Peter had prepared the way for his great sin. (I1)

DA305/713+ All the disciples, by sleeping in that critical hour, sustained a great loss. (I1)

DA306/714 Christ knew the fiery ordeal through which they were to pass. (I1)

DA307/714 He knew how Satan would work to paralyze their senses that they might be unready for the trial. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

126/659 We picture him as visiting alone the garden of Gethsemane, not now to sleep while his Lord is suffering; but to seek out the spot which Jesus had hallowed by his agony, to mingle his tears with the great drops of blood which had fallen down to the ground. [Hanna, LC]

DA308/714 Therefore it was that He gave them warning. (I1)

DA309/714 Had those hours in the garden been spent in watching and prayer, Peter would not have been left to depend upon his own feeble strength. (I1)

DA310/714 He would not have denied his Lord. (I1)

DA311/714 Had the disciples watched with Christ in His agony, they would have been prepared to behold His suffering upon the cross. (I1)

DA312/714 They would have understood in some degree the nature of His overpowering anguish. (I1)

DA313/714 They would have been able to recall His words that foretold His sufferings, His death, and His resurrection. (I1)

DA314/714 Amid the gloom of the most trying hour, some rays of hope would have lighted up the darkness and sustained their faith. (I1)

DA315/714 As soon as it was day, the Sanhedrin again assembled, and again Jesus was brought into the council room. (I1)

DA316/714 He had declared Himself the Son of God, and they had construed His words into a charge against Him. [F/78/615] (I2)

MS(51)122 But Christ had declared himself to be the Son of God, and they construed his own words into a charge against him. [F/78/615] (I2)

DA317/714 But they could not condemn Him on this, for many of them had not been present at the night session, and they had not heard His words. [F/77/615] (P2)

MS(51)123a Still, they could not condemn him on this, for half of them had not heard these words [sic] [F/77/615] (P1)

78/615 In answer to the adjuration of Caiaphas, He had solemnly admitted that He was the Messiah and the Son of God. [Farrar, LC]

76,77/615 The problem before them was to convert the ecclesiastical charge of constructive blasphemy into a civil charge of constructive treason. . . . Not half the members of the Sanhedrin had been present at the hurried, nocturnal, and therefore illegal session in the house of Caiaphas; yet if they were all to condemn Him by a formal sentence, they must all hear something on which to found their vote. [Farrar, LC]

DA318/714 And they knew that the Roman tribunal would find in them nothing worthy of death. [F/79a/615] (P1)

MS(51)123b and they knew that the Roman tribunal would find nothing in them to accuse him of guilt and secure his condemnation. [F/79a/615] (P2)

DA319/714 But if from His own lips they could all hear those words repeated, their object might be gained. [F/79b/615] (P2)

DA320/714 His claim to the Messiahship they might construe into a seditious political claim. [F/79b/615] (P2)

MS(97)124 But if, from his own lips they could all hear the same words, they might construe them into a political seditious claim, [sic] [F/79b/615] (P1)

DA321/714 "Art Thou the Christ?" they said, "tell us." (I1)

DA322/714 But Christ remained silent. [F/80/615] (P1)

DA323/714 They continued to ply Him with questions. (I1)

DA324/714 At last in tones of mournful pathos He answered, "If I tell you, ye will not believe and if I also ask you, ye will not answer Me, nor let Me go." [F/86,87/616] (B1)

DA325/714 But that they might be left without excuse He added the solemn warning, Hereafter shall the Son of man sit on the right hand of the power of God." [F/88/616] (B1)

DA326/714 "Art Thou then the Son of God?" they asked with one voice. [F/89/616] (B1)

DA327/714 He said unto them, "Ye say that I am." [F/90/616] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

79a/615 The latter declaration would have been meaningless as a charge against Him before the tribunal of the Romans; . . . [Farrar, LC]

79b/615 . . . but if He would repeat the former, they might twist it into something politically seditious. [Farrar, LC]

80/615 But He would not repeat it, in spite of their insistence, because He knew that it was open to their wilful misinterpretation, and because they were acting in flagrant violation of their own express rules and traditions, which demanded that every arraigned criminal should be regarded and treated as innocent until his guilt was actually proved. [Farrar, LC]

86,87/616 But at last, to end a scene at once miserable and disgraceful, Jesus spoke. "If I tell you," He said, "ye will not believe; and if I ask you a question, you will not answer me." [Farrar, LC]

88/616 Still, lest they should have any excuse for failing to understand who He was, He added in tones of solemn warning, "But henceforth shall the Son of Man sit on the right hand of the power of God." [Farrar, LC]

89/616 "Art thou, then," they all exclaimed, "the Son of God?" [Farrar, LC]

90/616 "Ye say that I am," He answered, in a formula with which they were familiar, and of which they understood the full significance. [Farrar, LC]

DA328/714 They cried out, "What need we any further witness? for we ourselves have heard of His own mouth."
[F/91/616] (B1)

MS(51)134 Then they cried out as the malignant Caiaphas, "What need we any further witness? for we ourselves have heard of our [sic] own mouth."
[F/91/616] (B1)

DA329/714 And so by the third condemnation of the Jewish authorities, Jesus was to die. [F/92a/617] (I2)

DA330/714 All that was now necessary, they thought, was for the Romans to ratify this condemnation, and deliver Him into their hands. [F/92b/617] (P2)

MS(51)136 They tought [sic] that all that was now necessary, was for Pilate to ratify this condemnation, and deliever [sic] him into their hands. [F/92b/617] (P2)

DA331/714 Then came the third scene of abuse and mockery, worse even than that received from the ignorant rabble.
[F/93/617] (P1)

MS(51)137 And then came the third scene of shameful abuse and mockery, worse, tenfold worse than that received from the ignorant and unenlightened.
[F/93/617] (P1)

DA332/714 In the very presence of the priests and rulers, and with their sanction, this took place. [F/93/617] (P2)

DA333/714 Every feeling of sympathy or humanity had gone out of their hearts. (I1)

DA334/714+ If their arguments were weak, and failed to silence His voice, they had other weapons, such as in all ages have been used to silence heretics,--suffering, and violence, and death. (I1)

DA335/715 When the condemnation of Jesus was pronounced by the judges, a satanic fury took possession of the people.
[H/82/668] (I2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

91/616 And then they too cried out, as Caiaphas had done before, "What further need have we of witness? for we ourselves heard from His own mouth." [Farrar, LC]

92a/617 And so in this third condemnation by Jewish authority-- [Farrar, LC]

92b/617 a condemnation which they thought that Pilate would simply ratify, and so appease their burning hate--ended the third stage of the trial of our Lord. [Farrar, LC]

93/617 And this sentence also seems to have been followed by a second derision resembling the first, but even more full of insult, and worse to bear than the former, inasmuch as the derision of Priests, and Elders, and Sadducees is even more repulsively odious than that of menials and knaves. [Farrar, LC]

82/668 The pronouncing of the sentence from the bench was the signal for a horrible outburst of violence in the hall below. [Hanna, LC]

DA336/715 The roar of voices was like that of wild beasts.
[I/361.7] (P1)

DA337/715 The crowd made a rush toward Jesus, crying, He is guilty, put Him to death! [I/366.8] (P1)

DA338/715 Had it not been for the Roman soldiers, Jesus would not have lived to be nailed to the cross of Calvary.
[I/366.9] (P2)

DA339/715 He would have been torn in pieces before his judges, had not Roman authority interfered, and by force of arms restrained the violence of the mob. [I/366.9] (P2)

DA340/715 Heathen men were angry at the brutal treatment of one against whom nothing had been proved. [I/367.3] (P1)

DA341/715 The Roman officers declared that the Jews in pronouncing condemnation upon Jesus were infringing upon the Roman power, and that it was even against the Jewish law to condemn a man to death upon his own testimony. [I/367.4] (P2)

DA342/715 This intervention brought a momentary lull in the proceedings; but the Jewish leaders were dead alike to pity and to shame. (I1)

DA343/715 Priests and rulers forgot the dignity of their office, and abused the Son of God with foul epithets. (I1)

DA344/715 They taunted Him with His parentage. (I1)

DA345/715 They declared that His presumption in proclaiming Himself the Messiah made him deserving of the most ignominious death. (I1)

DA346/715 The most dissolute men engaged in infamous abuse of the Saviour. [I/368.7] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

361.7 The noise of their rage, so great was the madness of the people, is described as having been like the roaring of wild beasts of the wilderness, rushing to the banquet of a fresh battle-field. [Ingraham, PHD]

366.8 "He is guilty of death!" cried Abner, in a hoarse voice, . . . "This was followed by a loud outcry for his death and several vile fellows also spat upon Him, . . . [Ingraham, PHD]

366.9 and, but for the protection of AEmilius and his soldiers, they would have torn Him in pieces. [Ingraham, PHD]

367.3 "Is this Jewish justice! cried AEmilius, indignantly, to Caiaphas. 'Do you condemn and kill a man without witness? [Ingraham, PHD]

367.4 Stand back, for Romans are not used to see men condemned without law. Back, fellows--or your blood will flow sooner than his for which you thirst!' [Ingraham, PHD]

368.4 . . . while Caiaphas strove to appease the wrath of AEmilius, who insisted that the fate of Jesus should be left with Pilate, the Procurator. After brief consultation with the chief-priests, elders, and scribes, Caiaphas consented; [Ingraham, PHD]

368.7 "When AEmilius, aided by the authority of Caiaphas, at length came where Jesus had been dragged, they found Him standing blindfolded among a crowd of the basest fellows of Jerusalem, who were diverting themselves by slapping his cheeks, and asking Him to tell by his divine knowledge of all things, who did it? [Ingraham, PHD]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA347/715 An old garment was thrown over His head, and His persecutors struck Him in the face, saying, "Prophecy unto us, Thou Christ, Who is he that smote Thee?" (11)

DA348/715 When the garment was removed, one poor wretch spat in His face. (11)

DA349/715 The angels of God faithfully recorded every insulting look, word, and act against their beloved Commander. (11)

DA350/715 One day the base men who scorned and spat upon the calm, pale face of Christ will look upon it in its glory, shining brighter than the sun. (11)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 75 - SOURCES

Analysis

The following analysis of chapter 75 does not attempt to defend the evaluations of the DA sentences or those of the previously written articles and manuscripts on the trial of Jesus before the Jewish authorities. We leave it to the reader to check our evaluations against the criteria presented in the introduction to this research report. The 351 sentences of the DA text and the 262 sentences of Ellen White's earlier writings present too many variations and subtle distinctions for that kind of an approach. There is also an unavoidable subjective aspect to the evaluations which at times frustrates our best efforts to be consistent.

Our intention here is rather to point to various characteristics of the literary independence and dependence of the DA text. We would hope that our review of the textual data would lead the reader to place the text in sharper focus. By raising specific questions we permit the text to speak for itself. Hopefully some patterns of Ellen White's use of sources will emerge. These general images of Ellen White's literary methods can be checked against the analyses of the other 14 chapters. A final comparison of the 15 chapters will provide us with both general and special information. We will be able to note which characteristics are commonly shared by most if not all of the chapters and which elements appear as unique to a given chapter.

We begin our review of the textual data by centering

our attention on the individual sentence units. Once we have studied the dependency or independence of the sentences of the DA and pre-DA text tradition we will turn to the larger literary units. By larger we mean the thematic units of the narrative and their arrangement in the construction of chapter 75.

Source Analysis of the DA text

We have credited Ellen White with 168 of the 351¹ sentences of chapter 75. Table 1 on page 610 lists the other types of sentences as follows: 6 are registered as Verbatim; 68 as Strict Paraphrase; 41 as Simple Paraphrase; 2 as Loose Paraphrase, 13 as Source Bible; 38 as Partial Independence (or Partial Dependence); and 15 as borrowed from Scripture. If we discount the use of the Bible we have 48 percent or 168 sentences showing some dependence and another 48 percent showing Strict Independence. When the 38 sentences registering Partial Independence are added to the 168 sentences of Strict Independence, we have 206 sentences or 59 percent of the chapter indicating some independence.

Fourteen sources contributed to chapter 75. According to Table 2, page 611, William Hanna's Life of Christ was used for 64 sentences while Frederic Farrar's Life of

¹As published the chapter has 350 sentences. We have split sentence 270 into two separate literary units making our total 351. Since we list sentence 270 as 270a and 270b we are able to have all other sentence numbers correspond to the number of sentences for the published DA text.

Unlike the other chapters of The Desire of Ages being reviewed in this research, chapter 76 presents a character study of the life of one of the disciples of Jesus. In this insightful work on the betrayer of Jesus, Ellen White draws on the various references to Judas in the gospel records to construct a composite account of a life which could have fulfilled another destiny.

The arrangement of the chapter opens with the recognition of Judas as betrayer of Jesus and then takes the reader back to the time Judas joined the little band of disciples. The long story of Judas' basic character weakness is traced through the various episodes and in each event the attitudes and motives of Judas are chronicled. Finally, after once again reading of Judas at the trial of Jesus we are led beyond the present focus of the narrative sequence to the scene of Judas' death, an event alluded to in the trial account but nowhere presented in Scripture with the detail found in Ellen White's commentary.

Prior to the composition of chapter 76 Ellen White had written at various times on the life of Judas. The earliest account is found in Spiritual Gifts, pages 52 and 53. In the 15 sentences found in chapter VIII on "The Trial of Jesus," Ellen White restricts her comments to the attitudes and actions of Judas in seeking the release of Jesus at the trial before Caiaphas.¹ We did not find any source

Judas

parallels in the SG text or any apparent use of these sentences in the DA text. Since the content reappears in the later Spirit of Prophecy writings we omitted the SG material from our text presentation.

The narrative material on Judas was found in three chapters of The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III. Apart from a few sentences from chapter VII, "In the Garden,"² the major contribution of the SP text to the DA, chapter 76, may be found in chapter VI, "The Passover Supper,"³ and in chapter VIII, "In the Judgment Hall."⁴ Only those sentences treating the experience of Judas and utilized in the composition of the chapter under study, however, will appear in our text presentation or be listed in the comparative table.⁵

In addition to the SP material, several articles and manuscripts were produced by Ellen White prior to the writing of chapter 76.⁶ In 1893 The Signs of the Times

¹Sentences 41-55.

²Sentences 157-162, pp. 105, 106.

³Sentences 3-20.

⁴Sentences 204-246.

⁵We have tried to list all such EGW parallels in Table A. The SP sentences involving greater literary dependency upon other sources will also usually be found in the text presentation. Additional EGW parallels may be found by comparing the SP chapters with their DA counterparts, i.e., "The Passover Supper" of SP III with either "A Servant of Servants" or "In Remembrance of Me" of DA.

⁶References to Judas may be found in Letter 63, 1893, pages 9 and 10; Letter 51a, 1895, page 11; and Letter 153a, 1897. These letters and miscellaneous references to Judas in various journal articles were not of a substantial enough nature to warrant their presentation in this report.

Judas

published a piece on "The Character to Be Tested," which portrays Judas as an example of one who failed the test of Satan's temptations.¹ One year later the same journal contained an article on "A Lesson from the Experience of Judas."² Here we are shown the fruitage of a life lived without learning from the life of Christ.

These two articles do not appear to have directly influenced the writing of chapter 76 except perhaps in the style of the chapter's composition.³ But they do contain some sentences which were later incorporated into Manuscript 120, 1897, a document used in the composition of the DA text. Since through their use in this later text they form part of the literary tradition behind chapter 76, we have included them in Appendix D.

Ellen White wrote at least four manuscripts during 1897 which contain commentary on the life of Judas. Manuscript 28, dated April 22, 1897, by the copyist Minnie Hawkins, carries the title, "Judas." Portions of this text appeared in two issues of the Review and Herald for 1897 and in chapter 76 of DA.⁴

A second manuscript from the year of 1897 deals with Judas' reaction to the last effort of Christ to win him over.⁵ Though a reference to this experience is included in

¹ST, Vol. 20, No. 7, December 18, 1893.

²ST, Vol. 20, No. 59, December 24, 1894.

³This point is discussed under redaction analysis.

⁴RH, Vol. 74, No. 40 (October 5, 1897) and No. 41 (October 12, 1897).

Judas

the chapter under review, we found no evidence that Manuscript 64, 1897, was used here.

The same may be said for Manuscript 100, 1897. This four-page document, dated September 15, 1897, is entitled "The Arrest of Christ." This text commenting on the life of Judas discusses the role of Judas in the garden arrest but does not appear to have been used for the brief reference to this incident in chapter 76.

The fourth and final 1897 manuscript, entitled "Judas," is Manuscript 120, dated October 27, 1897. This document combines the older SP material and the ST articles of 1893 and 1894 with some new commentary to form the major structural component for chapter 76.

The literary parallels for chapter 76 of the DA text and the earlier writings used in the composition of this commentary on the life of Judas were taken from the following sources: Alfred Edersheim, The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah, Vol. 2 [LTJM];¹ Marcus Dods, The Gospel of John, Vol. 2 [GJ];² Frederic Farrar, The Life of Christ [LC];³ William Hanna, The Life of Christ [LC];⁴ J. H. Ingraham, The Prince of the House of David [PHD];⁵ Frederick Wilhelm Krummacher, The Suffering Saviour [SS];⁶ William Smith, editor, A Dictionary of the Bible [DB];⁷ and E. W. Thayer, Sketches from the Life of Jesus [SLJ].⁸

⁵MS 64, "The Compassion of Christ," five pages, dated June 6, 1897.

¹Edersheim, op. cit. The initials of the book title

Judas

Most if not all of these works have been introduced earlier in this study but some have not appeared very often as possible sources. The following two sources fall into this latter category. Marcus Dods' commentary on John went through several editions as did Smith's Bible dictionary. At the time of her death Ellen White's office library carried a copy of Dods' work on John dated in 1894. Her private library held an 1873 copy of Smith's Bible dictionary.

The identification and evaluation of source parallels have not been weighted to indicate the degree of confidence we have in the accuracy of our judgment. When the parallel shows a higher degree of dependency and is one of a number of parallels from the same source we can be quite certain our evaluations are fair. If the source furnished few if any parallels and the verbal similarities are also minimal, we offer the parallel with little conviction.

There are several occasions when we listed a possible parallel without an evaluation. In such instances we felt the similarities merited notice even if we could not be

are used as an abbreviated designation of the specific book being quoted. This system of identification is used throughout the report for all source references.

²Marcus Dods, The Gospel of John, 2 volumes (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1894).

³Farrar, op. cit.

⁴Hanna, op. cit.

⁵Ingraham, op. cit.

⁶Krummacher, op. cit.

⁷Smith, op. cit.

⁸Thayer, op. cit.

Judas

certain of dependence. We urge the reader to consider the text, context, and thought development of both the source text and the Ellen White document when judging the fairness of our evaluations.

DA1/716 THE history of Judas presents the sad ending of a life that might have been honored of God. (11)

DA2/716 Had Judas died before his last journey to Jerusalem he would have been regarded as a man worthy of a place among the twelve, and one who would be greatly missed. (11)

DA3/716 The abhorrence which has followed him through the centuries would not have existed but for the attributes revealed at the close of his history. (11)

DA4/716 But it was for a purpose that his character was laid open to the world. (11)

DA5/716 It was to be a warning to all who, like him, should betray sacred trusts. (11)

DA6/716 A little before the Passover, Judas had renewed his contract with the priests to deliver Jesus into their hands. (11)

DA7/716 Then it was arranged that the Saviour should be taken at one of His resorts for meditation and prayer. (11)

3SP3/81 Judas, one of the twelve, proposed secretly to betray Jesus into their hands, by leading them to one of the Saviour's resorts for prayer and retirement. (11)

3SP4/81+ In this quiet place they could make sure of their prey, for there would be no multitude to oppose them. [H/15/644] (P2)

DA8/716 Since the feast at the house of Simon, Judas had had opportunity to reflect upon the deed which he had covenanted to perform, but his purpose was unchanged. (11)

DA9/716 For thirty pieces of silver--the price of a slave--he sold the Lord of glory to ignominy and death. [H/110/649] (P2)

3SP5/82 Judas, ever greedy for gain, made a contract with the priests and rulers to betray his Master into their hands for thirty pieces of silver. [H/110/649] (P1)

3SP6/82 The Lord of life and glory was sold to ignominy and death by one of his disciples for a paltry sum of money. [H/110/649] (P2)

15/64 He had seen and known, as though he had been present, the immediate resort of Judas to those with whom he had so recently made his unhallowed bargain, telling them that the hour had come for carrying the projected arrangement into execution, and that he was quite sure that Jesus, as his custom all that week had been, would go out to Gethsemane so soon as the meeting in the upper chamber had broken up, and that there they could easily and surely, without any fear of popular disturbance, lay hold of him. [Hanna, LC]

110/649 They offered him thirty pieces of silver, a very paltry bribe--the price in the old Hebrew code of a slave that was gored by an ox--less than \$5 of our money; a bribe insufficient of itself to have tempted even a grossly avaricious man, in the position in which Judas was, to betray his Master, knowing or believing that it was unto death. [Hanna, LC]

477.4 And yet it was surely as much in contempt of the seller as of Him Whom he sold, that they paid the legal price of a slave. [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA10/716 Judas had naturally a strong love for money; but he had not always been corrupt enough to do such a deed as this. [H/84/648] (P3)

3SP7/82 The heart of Judas had not suddenly grown thus base and corrupt. [H/84/648] (P3)

DA11/716 He had fostered the evil spirit of avarice until it had become the ruling motive of his life. [H/83/648] (P2)

3SP15/82 Judas was naturally avaricious, and he had fostered this evil propensity until it had become the ruling motive of his life. [H/83/648] (P2)

3SP16/82 We look with horror upon the treachery of Judas; but his case represents a large class who file in under the banner of Christ, yet are really his worst enemies. [H/129/650] (P3)

3SP17/82+ They worship only self and money, and use the name of Christian as a cloak to hide their evil deeds. [H/130/650] (P3)

3SP18/83 They seal their integrity for money, and their Saviour for a little worldly advantage. [H/130/650] (P3)

DA12/716 The love of mammon overbalanced his love for Christ. (11)

DA13/716 Through becoming the slave of one vice he gave himself to Satan, to be driven to any lengths in sin. (11)

3SP8/82 His love of mammon, like any vice which is left unchecked, had daily grown stronger, until it overbalanced his love for the Saviour, and he had become an idolater. [H/83/648] (12)

3SP9/82 His mind had become debased by covetousness; and a man who is enslaved by avarice is in danger of going to any lengths in crime. [H/83/648] (P3)

84/648 For we have no reason to believe of Judas, that from the first he was an utter reprobate. [Hanna, LC]

83/648 We should be nearer the truth, I suspect, if we took him as an average specimen of what the passion of avarice, or any like passion, when once it has got the mastery, may lead any man to be and do. [Hanna, LC]

555.3 With the gloating eyes of that avarice which was his besetting sin, he might gaze on the silver coins. . . [Farrar, LC]

129/650 For if we are right in the idea we have formed of the character and conduct of Judas, there have been many since his time, there may be many still, in the same way, and from the operation of the same motives, betrayers of Christ.

130/650 For everywhere he is a Judas, with whom worldly interest, his worldly ambition, prevail over his attachment to Christ and to Christ's cause; who joins the Christian society, it may be, not to make gain thereby--but who, when the occasion presents itself, scruples not to make what gain he can of that connection; who, beneath the garb of the Christian calling, pursues a dishonest traffic; who, when the gain and the godliness come into collision, sacrifices the godliness for the gain. [Hanna, LC]

DA14/716 Judas had joined the disciples when multitudes were following Christ. [E/68,69/473] (P1)

DA15/716 The Saviour's teaching moved their hearts as they hung entranced upon His words, spoken in the synagogue, by the seaside, upon the mount. [E/69/473] (P2)

DA16/717 Judas saw the sick, the lame, the blind, flock to Jesus from the towns and cities. [E/69/473] (P2)

DA17/717 He saw the dying laid at His feet. [E/69/473] (P2)

DA18/717 He witnessed the Saviour's mighty works in healing the sick, casting out devils, and raising the dead. [E/69/473] (P2)

DA19/717 He felt in his own person the evidence of Christ's power. [E/73,74/473] (P2)

DA20/717 He recognized the teaching of Christ as superior to all that he had ever heard. (I1)

DA21/717 He loved the Great Teacher, and desired to be with Him. (I1)

DA22/717 He felt a desire to be changed in character and life, and he hoped to experience this through connecting himself with Jesus. [D/55/96] (P2)

MS(28)30 There came to him a desire to be changed in spirit and inclination, and he hoped to experience this by connecting himself with Jesus Christ. [D/55/96] (P2)

MS(28)31 Yes, in the companionship of Jesus, Judas would have found continual strength and aid; he might have co-operated with Christ in overcoming temptation rather than yielding to the suggestions of Satan. [D/55/96] (I2)

DA23/717 The Saviour did not repulse Judas. (I1)

68/473 He had, from such conviction as we have described, joined the movement at its very commencement.
[Edersheim, LTJM]

69/473 Then, multitudes in Galilee followed His Footsteps, and watched for His every appearance; they hung entranced on His lips in the Synagogue or on 'the Mount'; they flocked to Him from every town, village, and hamlet; they bore the sick and dying to His Feet, and witnessed, awestruck, how conquered devils gave their testimony to His Divine Power.
[Edersheim, LTJM]

73/473 And, oh! what power was there in His Face and Word, in His look and deed. [Edersheim, LTJM]

74/473 And Judas, also had been one of them who, on their early Mission, had temporarily had power given him, so that the very devils had been subject to them. [Edersheim, LTJM]

55/96 With this motive, therefore, there probably mingled in the mind of Judas a desire to be with One who could shield him from evil influences; he judged that with Jesus he would find continual aid against his weaker nature.
[Dods, GJ]

DA24/717 He gave him a place among the twelve. (11)

DA25/717 He trusted him to do the work of an evangelist. (11)

DA26/717 He endowed him with power to heal the sick and to cast out devils. [E/74/473] (P1)

DA27/717 But Judas did not come to the point of surrendering himself fully to Christ. (11)

DA28/717 He did not give up his worldly ambition or his love of money. (11)

DA29/717 While he accepted the position of a minister of Christ, he did not bring himself under the divine molding. (11)

DA30/717 He felt that he could retain his own judgment and opinions, and he cultivated a disposition to criticize and accuse. (11)

DA31/717 Judas was highly regarded by the disciples, and had great influence over them. [E/50/472] (P3)

MS(28)3 He was trusted by his fellow-disciples, and by his Master he was entrusted with a special work for the church. [D/57/96] (P2)

MS(28)27 Even to the end of his companionship with the disciples Judas was not suspected by them of the evil purpose in his heart. [D/60/97] (P1)

DA32/717 He himself had a high opinion of his own qualifications, and looked upon his brethren as greatly inferior to him in judgment and ability. (11)

MS(28)34 Judas looked upon several of the disciples as very deficient. (11)

DA33/717 They did not see their opportunities, he thought, and take advantage of circumstances. (11)

MS(28)35 They would not see their opportunities, and take advantage of circumstances. (11)

74/473 And Judas, also, had been one of them who, on their early Mission, had temporarily had power given him, so that the very devils had been subject to them. [Edersheim, LTJM]

50/472 From the circumstance that he was appointed to such office of trust in the Apostolic community, we infer that he must have been looked up to by the others as an able and prudent man, a good administrator. [Edersheim, LTJM]

57/96 That Judas was trusted by the other Apostles is manifest from the fact that to him they committed their common fund,-- [Dods, GJ]

60/97 Even to the end he was unsuspected by his fellow-Apostles; and to the end he had an active conscience. [Dods, GJ]

64.2 He soon showed himself possessed of superior abilities, acute understanding, strong excitability, and energetic will, and therefore seemed, as he was probably soon conscious of himself, to be capable of deeds of a superior kind than the limited current of quiet, civil life, affords opportunity for performing. [Krummacher, SS]

DA34/717 The church would never prosper with such shortsighted men as leaders. (I1)

MS(28)36 The church would never prosper with such short sighted men. (I1)

DA35/717 Peter was impetuous; he would move without consideration. [D/57b/96] (I2)

MS(28)37 Peter was so impetuous; he would move without consideration. [D57b/96] (I2)

DA36/717 John, who was treasuring up the truths that fell from Christ's lips, was looked upon by Judas as a poor financier. [D/57a/96] (I2)

MS(28)18 John, who was gathering the power of the truths that fell from the lips of Christ, and bringing them into the sanctuary of the soul, was looked upon by Judas as a poor financier, one who could not keep the church free from financial embarrassment. [D/57a/96] (I2)

DA37/717 Matthew, whose training had taught him accuracy in all things, was very particular in regard to honesty, and he was ever contemplating the words of Christ, and became so absorbed in them that, as Judas thought, he could not be trusted to do sharp, far-seeing business. [D/57c/96] (I2)

MS(28)39 Matthew, who had had an education which qualified him for accuracy in all his undertakings, was very definite and particular in regard to honesty. [D/57c/96] (I2)

DA38/717 Thus Judas summed up all the disciples, and flattered himself that the church would often be brought into perplexity and embarrassment if it were not for his ability as a manager. [D/57d/96] (I2)

MS(28)44 His practical financiering ability if exercised and enlightened and moulded by the Holy Spirit, would have been of great service to the little church, and by the sanctification of his spirit he would have had a clear insight, a correct discernment to appreciate heavenly things. [D/58/96] (P2)

DA39/717 Judas regarded himself as the capable one, who could not be overreached. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 76 - SOURCES

57a/96 That Judas was trusted by the other Apostles is manifest from the fact that to him they committed their common fund,--not to John, whose dreamy and abstracted nature ill fitted him for minute practical affairs; [Dods, GJ]

57b/96 not to Peter, whose impulsive nature might often have landed the little company in difficulties; [Dods, GJ]

57c/96 not even to Matthew, accustomed as he was to accounts; [Dods, GJ]

57d/96 but to Judas, who had the economical habits, the aptitude for finance, the love of bargaining, which regularly go hand in hand with the love of money. [Dods, EB]

58/96 This practical faculty for finance and for affairs generally might, if rightly guided, have become a most serviceable element in the Apostolate, and might have enabled Judas more successfully than any other of the Apostles to mediate between Church and the world. Dods, GJ]

DA40/717 In his own estimation he was an honor to the cause, and as such he always represented himself. (11)

DA41/717 Judas was blinded to his own weakness of character, and Christ placed him where he would have an opportunity to see and correct this. (11)

DA42/717 As treasurer for the disciples, he was called upon to provide for the needs of the little company, and to relieve the necessities of the poor. [H/93/648] (P2)

DA43/717+ When in the Passover chamber Jesus said to him, "That thou doest, do quickly" (John 13:27), the disciples thought He had bidden him buy what was needed for the feast, or give something to the poor. (11)

DA44/718 In ministering to others, Judas might have developed an unselfish spirit. (11)

DA45/718 But while listening daily to the lessons of Christ and witnessing His unselfish life, Judas indulged his covetous disposition. [D/93,94/101] (I2)

DA46/718 The small sums that came into his hands were a continual temptation. (11)

DA47/718 Often when he did a little service for Christ, or devoted time to religious purposes, he paid himself out of this meager fund. (11)

DA48/718 In his own eyes these pretexts served to excuse his action; but in God's sight he was a thief. (11)

DA49/718 Christ's oft-repeated statement that His kingdom was not of this world offended Judas. [E/92,93/77] (P2)

DA50/718 He had marked out a line upon which he expected Christ to work. (11)

93/648 The little company that he had joined had chosen him to be their treasurer, to hold and dispense the slender funds which they possessed. [Hanna, LC]

93/101 Naturally covetous, he fed his evil disposition during those years he carried the bag for the disciples; . . . [Dods, GJ]

94/101 This he does, regardless of the frequent admonitions he hears from the Lord addressed to others; and as he finds excuses for his own avarice in the face of these admonitions, and hardens himself against the better impulses that are stirred within him by the words and presence of Christ, his covetousness roots itself deeper and deeper in his soul. [Dods, GJ]

96, 97/649 The temptation was greater than he could resist. He became a pilferer from that small bag. [Hanna, LC]

92, 93/77 Gradually, increasingly, came the disenchantment. It was quite another Kingdom, that of Christ; quite another Kingship than what had set Judas aglow. [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA51/718 He had planned that John the Baptist should be delivered from prison. [E/95/77] (P3)

MS(120)27 He had planned that John the Baptist should be delivered from prison. [E/95/77] (P3)

DA52/718 But lo, John was left to be beheaded. [E/75,76/473] (P1)

DA53/718 And Jesus, instead of asserting His royal right and avenging the death of John, retired with His disciples into a country place. [E/76,77a/473] (P1)

MS(120)28 But lo, John was left to be beheaded, and Jesus withdrew himself and his disciples into a country place, instead of avenging the death of John. [E/76,77a/473] (P1)

DA54/718 Judas wanted more aggressive warfare. (11)

MS(120)29 Judas wanted more aggressive warfare. (11)

DA55/718 He thought that if Jesus would not prevent the disciples from carrying out their schemes, the work would be more successful. [E/77a/473] (P3)

MS(120)30 He thought that if Jesus would not prevent the disciples from carrying out their schemes, the work would be more successful. [E/77a/473] (P3)

DA56/718 He marked the increasing enmity of the Jewish leaders, and saw their challenge unheeded when they demanded from Christ a sign from heaven. [E/77b/473] (P1)

MS(120)31 He marked the increasing enmity of the Jewish leaders, and saw their challenge unheeded when they demanded from Christ a sign from heaven. [E/77b/473] (P1)

DA57/718 His heart was open to unbelief, and the enemy supplied thoughts of questioning and rebellion. (11)

95/77 His confidence must have been terribly shaken when the Baptist was beheaded. [Edersheim, LTJM]

75/473 But, step by step, had come the disappointment. [Edersheim, LTJM]

76/473 John was beheaded, and not avenged; on the contrary, Jesus withdrew Himself. [Edersheim, LTJM]

77a/473 This constant withdrawing, whether from enemies or from success--almost amounting to flight--even when they would have made Him a King; [Edersheim, LTJM]

77b/473 this gathering enmity of Israel's leaders, and His marked avoidance of, or, as some might have put it, His failure in taking up the repeated public challenge of the Pharisees to show a sign from heaven; [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA58/718 Why did Jesus dwell so much upon that which was discouraging? [E/77c/473] (I2)

MS(120)33 Why did Christ dwell so much upon that which was discouraging? [E/77c/473] (I2)

DA59/718 Why did He predict trial and persecution for Himself and for His disciples? [E/77c/473] (P3)

MS(120)34 Why did he portray his own trials and persecutions, and point to the trial and persecution of his disciples? [E/77c/473] (P3)

DA60/718 The prospect of having a high place in the new kingdom had led Judas to espouse the cause of Christ. [E/77c/473] (P2)

MS(120)35 The prospect of having a high place in the new kingdom had led Judas to espouse the cause of Christ. [E/77c/473] (P2)

DA61/718 Were his hopes to be disappointed? [E/77c/473] (P1)

MS(120)36 Were his hopes to be disappointed? [E/77c/473] (P1)

DA62/718 Judas had not decided that Jesus was not the Son of God; but he was questioning, and seeking to find some explanation of His mighty works. (I1)

DA63/718 Notwithstanding the Saviour's own teaching, Judas was continually advancing the idea that Christ would reign as king in Jerusalem. (I1)

DA64/718 At the feeding of the five thousand he tried to bring this about. (I1)

DA65/718 On this occasion Judas assisted in distributing the food to the hungry multitude. (I1)

DA66/718 He had an opportunity to see the benefit which it was in his power to impart to others. (I1)

DA67/718 He felt the satisfaction that always comes in service to God. (I1)

DA68/718 He helped to bring the sick and suffering from among the multitude to Christ. (I1)

DA69/718 He saw what relief, what joy and gladness, come to human hearts through the healing power of the Restorer. (I1)

77c/473+ . . .last, and chief of all, this constant and growing reference to shame, disaster, and death--what did it all mean, if not disappointment of all those hopes and expectations which had made Judas at the first a disciple of Jesus? [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA70/718 He might have comprehended the methods of Christ.
(I1)

DA71/718 But he was blinded by his own selfish desires.
(I1)

DA72/718 Judas was first to take advantage of the enthusiasm excited by the miracle of the loaves. (I1)

DA73/718+ It was he who set on foot the project to take Christ by force and make Him king. (I1)

DA74/719 His hopes were high. (I1)

DA75/719 His disappointment was bitter. [E/77c/473+] (P2)

DA76/719 Christ's discourse in the synagogue concerning the bread of life was the turning point in the history of Judas.
[E/82/474] (P2)

MS(120)38 Christ's discourse in the synagogue concerning the bread of life was the turning point in the history of Judas. [E/82/474] (P2)

DA77/719 He heard the words, "Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of man, and drink His blood, ye have no life in you." John 6:53. [E/82/474] (B1)

DA78/719 He saw that Christ was offering spiritual rather than worldly good. [E/91/475] (I2)

MS(120)40 He saw that Christ was offering spiritual rather than worldly good. [E/91/475] (I2)

MS(120)42 At this time he made shipwreck of faith.
[E/85/474] (I2)

MS(120)44 His jealousy was aroused when he was not included with the three disciples chosen to witness the transfiguration of Christ upon the mount.
[E/87/474] (I2)

DA79/719 He regarded himself as farsighted, and thought he could see that Jesus would have no honor, and that He could bestow no high position upon His followers. (I1)

DA80/719 He determined not to unite himself so closely to Christ but that he could draw away. (I1)

DA81/719 He would watch. (I1)

293.1 There were those present on this occasion, who were taking the gauge of Jesus as "the leader and commander of the people," and estimating his worth as a captain. Judas was evidently among the foremost in proposing and carrying out the exaltation of his Master; and the loudest in objecting to being sent away to the other side. [Thayer, SLJ]

[See Edersheim, LTJM, 77c/473, above]

82/474 As if we were pressed to name a definite moment when the process of disintegration, at least sensibly, began, we would point to that Sabbath-morning at Capernaum, when Christ had preached about His Flesh as the Food of the World, and so many of His adherents ceased to follow after Him; [Edersheim, LTJM]

293.8 This refusal of the crown was the pivotal point, on which turned the rejection of the Nazarene by the Jewish nation. [Thayer, SLJ]

293.4 The vi. ch. of John, which is a specimen of his teaching for a time, was inexpressibly offensive to them, and led to loud murmurs, Judas being the chief complainant. [Thayer, SLJ]

91/475 When the Messianic faith of Judas gave place to utter disappointment, the moral and spiritual character of Christ's Teaching would affect him, not sympathetically but antipathetically. [Edersheim, LTJM]

85/474 But this moral element was the very cliff on which Judas made shipwreck. [Edersheim, LTJM]

87/474 We see disappointment in his face when not climbing the Mount of Transfiguration and disappointment in the failure to heal the lunatick child. [Edersheim, LTJM]

87/77 We shall, perhaps, best understand it when following the progress of this trial in him who, at last, made shipwreck of his faith: Judas Iscariot. [Edersheim, LTJM]

557.9 All we know is that henceforth he was ever anxiously, eagerly, suspiciously upon the watch. [Farrar, LC]

DA82/719 And he did watch. (I1)

DA83/719 From that time he expressed doubts that confused the disciples. (I1)

DA84/719 He introduced controversies and misleading sentiments, repeating the arguments urged by the scribes and Pharisees against the claims of Christ. (I1)

DA85/719 All the little and large troubles and crosses, the difficulties and the apparent hindrances to the advancement of the gospel, Judas interpreted as evidences against its truthfulness. (I1)

DA86/719 He would introduce texts of Scripture that had no connection with the truths Christ was presenting. (I1)

DA87/719 These texts, separated from their connection, perplexed the disciples, and increased the discouragement that was constantly pressing upon them. (I1)

DA88/719 Yet all this was done by Judas in such a way as to make it appear that he was conscientious. (I1)

DA89/719 And while the disciples were searching for evidence to confirm the words of the Great Teacher, Judas would lead them almost imperceptibly on another track. (I1)

DA90/719 Thus in a very religious, and apparently wise, way he was presenting matters in a different light from that in which Jesus had given them, and attaching to His words a meaning that He had not conveyed. (I1)

DA91/719 His suggestions were constantly exciting an ambitious desire for temporal preferment, and thus turning the disciples from the important things they should have considered. (I1)

DA92/719 The dissension as to which of them should be greatest was generally excited by Judas. [E/88/474] (P2)

MS(120)45 When the disciples disputed by the way as to who should be greatest, his voice was often heard. [E/88/474] (P1)

97.1 That Judas in all other respects conducted himself circumspectly is proved by the fact that, though other Apostles incurred the displeasure of Christ and were rebuked by Him, Judas committed no glaring fault till this last week. Even to the end he was unsuspected by his fellow-Apostles; [Dods, EB]

88/474 In the disputes by the way, in the quarrels who was greatest among them, in all the pettiness of misunderstandings and realistic folly of their questions or answers, we seem to hear the echo of his voice, to see the result of his influence, the leaven of his presence. [Edersheim, LTJM]

DA93/719 When Jesus presented to the rich young ruler the condition of discipleship, Judas was displeased. (11)

DA94/719 He thought that a mistake had been made. (11)

DA95/719 If such men as this ruler could be connected with the believers, they would help sustain Christ's cause. (11)

DA96/719 If Judas were only received as a counselor, he thought, he could suggest many plans for the advantage of the little church. (11)

DA97/719 His principles and methods would differ somewhat from Christ's, but in these things he thought himself wiser than Christ. (11)

DA98/720 In all that Christ said to His disciples, there was something with which, in heart, Judas disagreed. (11)

DA99/720 Under his influence the leaven of disaffection was fast doing its work. [E/88/474] (P2)

MS(120)47 Under his influence the leaven of this disaffection was fast developing. [E/88/474] (P2)

DA100/720 The disciples did not see the real agency in all this; but Jesus saw that Satan was communicating his attributes to Judas, and thus opening up a channel through which to influence the other disciples. (11)

DA101/720 This, a year before the betrayal, Christ declared. (11)

DA102/720 "Have not I chosen you twelve," He said, "and one of you is a devil?" John 6:70. (11)

DA103/720 Yet Judas made no open opposition, nor seemed to question the Saviour's lessons. (11)

DA104/720 He made no outward murmur until the time of the feast in Simon's house. (11)

295.3 No interview, that our Lord had while on earth, had a greater influence upon the sentiments and conduct of his disciples, than his conversation with the rich young ruler. . . . We can imagine that no one felt the disappointment more keenly than he, whose lips were hermetically sealed against remonstrance. [Thayer, SLJ]

[see E/88/474 above]

DA105/720 When Mary anointed the Saviour's feet, Judas manifested his covetous disposition. [E/89/474] (P2)

MS(120)50 When Mary anointed the Saviour's feet with the precious ointment, Judas manifested his covetous disposition. [E/89/474] (P2)

DA106/720 At the reproof from Jesus his very spirit seemed turned to gall. [H/103/649] (P3)

DA107/720 Wounded pride and desire for revenge broke down the barriers, and the greed so long indulged held him in control. (11)

DA108/720 This will be the experience of everyone who persists in tampering with sin. (11)

DA109/720 The elements of depravity that are not resisted and overcome respond to Satan's temptation, and the soul is led captive at his will. (11)

DA110/720 But Judas was not yet wholly hardened. (11)

DA111/720 Even after he had twice pledged himself to betray the Saviour, there was opportunity for repentance. (11)

DA112/720 At the Passover supper Jesus proved His divinity by revealing the traitor's purpose. (11)

DA113/720 He tenderly included Judas in the ministry to the disciples. (11)

DA114/720 But the last appeal of love was unheeded. (11)

DA115/720 Then the case of Judas was decided, and the feet that Jesus had washed went forth to the betrayer's work. (11)

89/474 And in it all we mark the downward hastening of his course, even to the moment when, in contrast to the deep love of a Mary, he first stands before us unmasked, as heartless, hypocritical, full of hatred--disappointed ambition having broken down into selfishness, and selfishness slid into covetousness, even to the crime of stealing that which was destined for the poor. [Edersheim, LTJM]

102/649 At the supper in Bethany, it vexed him to see that box of ointment of spikenard, which might have been sold for three hundred pence, wasted on what seemed to him an idle piece of premature and romantic homage. [Hanna, LC]

103/649 It vexed him still more to hear his Master rebuke the irritation he had displayed, . . . [Hanna, LC]

299.3 It was done out of revenge for the great disappointment of his life, and the terrible rebukes which were as a sword in his bones. [Thayer, SLJ]

69.7 That moment, the evil will of Judas overcame the last and most powerful attraction of mercy, and the sin against the Holy Ghost was perpetrated. [Krummacher, SS]

DA116/720 Judas reasoned that if Jesus was to be crucified, the event must come to pass. [E/99/475] (P3)

DA117/720 His own act in betraying the Saviour would not change the result. [F/556.6] (P3)

DA118/720 If Jesus was not to die, it would only force him to deliver Himself. [F/556.6] (P3)

MS(120)64 If Jesus was not to die, it would only force him to deliver himself from his enemies. [F/556.6] (P3)

MS(28)48 So he was willing to put the matter to the test, and bring the crisis. [D/81/100] (P2)

DA119/720 At all events, Judas would gain something by his treachery. [E/100/475] (P3)

DA120/720 He counted that he had made a sharp bargain in betraying his Lord. (11)

DA121/720 Judas did not, however, believe that Christ would permit Himself to be arrested. (11)

DA122/720 In betraying Him, it was his purpose to teach Him a lesson. (11)

DA123/720 He intended to play a part that would make the Saviour careful thenceforth to treat him with due respect. (11)

DA124/720 But Judas knew not that he was giving Christ up to death. (11)

DA125/720 How often, as the Saviour taught in parables, the scribes and Pharisees had been carried away with His striking illustrations! (11)

DA126/720 How often they had pronounced judgment against themselves! (11)

99/475 Christ would be crucified; this was quite certain.
[Edersheim, LTJM]

556.6 Doubtless other motives mingled with, strengthened--perhaps to the self-deceiving mind and blinded soul substituted themselves for--the predominant one. "Will not this measure," he may have thought, "force Him to declare His Messianic kingdom? At the worst, can He not easily save Himself by miracle? If not, has He not told us repeatedly that He will die; and if so, why may I not reap a little advantage from that which is in any case inevitable?
[Farrar, LC]

81/100 Judas was weary of this inactivity: might he not himself bring matters to a crisis by giving Jesus into the hands of His enemies, and thus forcing Him to reveal His real power and assert by miracle His kingship? [Dods, GJ]

100/475 In the general cataclysm let Judas have at least something. [Edersheim, LTJM]

392.8 And since Jesus had made up his mind to perish, and was certain to do so if He persisted in his present views, why might not he make some gain of the business? [Kitto, DBI]

DA127/720+ Often when the truth was brought home to their hearts, they had been filled with rage, and had taken up stones to cast at Him; but again and again He had made his escape. (11)

DA128/721 Since He had escaped so many snares, thought Judas, He certainly would not now allow Himself to be taken. [D/99.7] (P3)

DA129/721 Judas decided to put the matter to the test. [H/112/649] (P2)

DA130/721 If Jesus really was the Messiah, the people, for whom He had done so much, would rally about Him, and would proclaim Him king. (11)

MS(28)49 If he really were the Son of God, the Messiah, the people for whom he had done so much in relieving them from the oppressive power of Satan, would rally and come to his assistance. (11)

DA131/721 This would forever settle many minds that were now in uncertainty. (11)

DA132/721 Judas would have the credit of having placed the king on David's throne. [S/320a.8] (P3)

MS(28)50 Then he, Judas, would have the credit of having caused him to be crowned king on David's throne. (11)

DA133/721 And this act would secure to him the first position, next to Christ, in the new kingdom. [S/320a.8] (P3)

DA134/721 The false disciple acted his part in betraying Jesus. (11)

99.7 It has been supposed that when he delivered up his Master into the hands of the chief priests he expected that our Lord would save Himself by a miracle. [Dods, GJ]

112/649 But this scheme of his would bring his Master to the test. [Hanna, LC]

320a.8 Not the love of money, nor revenge, nor fear, nor disappointment, but policy, a subtle plan to force on the hour of the triumph of the Messianic kingdom, the belief that for this service he would receive as high a place as Peter, or James, or John: this it was that made him the traitor. [Smith, DB]

DA135/721 In the garden, when he said to the leaders of the mob, "Whomsoever I shall kiss, that same is He: hold Him fast" (Matt. 26:48), he fully believed that Christ would escape out of their hands. [H/42,43/645] (P2)

DA136/721 Then if they should blame him, he could say, Did I not tell you to hold Him fast? (11)

DA137/721 Judas beheld the captors of Christ, acting upon his words, bind Him firmly. (11)

DA138/721 In amazement he saw that the Saviour suffered Himself to be led away. [H/122/650] (P2)

DA139/721 Anxiously he followed Him from the garden to the trial before the Jewish rulers. (11)

DA140/721 At every movement he looked for Him to surprise His enemies, by appearing before them as the Son of God, and setting at nought all their plots and power. (11)

DA141/721 But as hour after hour went by, and Jesus submitted to all the abuse heaped upon Him, a terrible fear came to the traitor that he had sold his Master to His death. [H/124/650] (P3)

3SP27/125 But when he saw him meekly submitting to their abuse, suffering himself to be tried and condemned to death, his heart smote him, and he realized the full extent of his own crime--he had sold his divine Master to shame and death. [H/124/650] (P3)

DA142/721 As the trial drew to a close, Judas could endure the torture of his guilty conscience no longer. (11)

DA143/721 Suddenly a hoarse voice rang through the hall, sending a thrill of terror to all hearts: He is innocent; spare Him, O Caiaphas! (11)

DA144/721 The tall form of Judas was now seen pressing through the startled throng. (11)

42,43/ 645 Judas knew how in such a manner he had previously escaped. He must have had a strong impression that it would not be so easy thing to accomplish the arrest, when he told the men, "Whomsoever I shall kiss, that same is he; take him, and hold him fast." Take him; and hold him! it will only be if he please to be taken and to be held that they will have any power to do it. [Hanna, LC]

122/650 If not, then how are we to explain his surprise when he saw his Master, though still possessing all his wonderful power, as he showed by the healing of the servant's ear, allow himself to be bound and led away like a felon? [Hanna, LC]

124/650 Then it was, when all turned out so differently from what he had anticipated, that the idea of his having been the instrument of his Master's death entered like iron into the soul of Judas. [Hanna, LC]

DA145/721 His face was pale and haggard, and great drops of sweat stood on his forehead. (I1)

DA146/721+ Rushing to the throne of judgment, he threw down before the high priest the pieces of silver that had been the price of his Lord's betrayal. (B2)

3SP33/126 Afterward the money which Judas had cast down before the priest was used for the purchase of a public burial ground. (B2)

DA147/722 Eagerly grasping the robe of Caiaphas, he implored him to release Jesus, declaring that He had done nothing worthy of death. (I1)

DA148/722 Caiaphas angrily shook him off, but was confused, and knew not what to say. (I1)

DA149/722 The perfidy of the priests was revealed. (I1)

DA150/722 It was evident that they had bribed the disciple to betray his Master. (I1)

DA151/722 "I have sinned," again cried Judas, "in that I have betrayed the innocent blood." (B2)

DA152/722 But the high priest, regaining his self-possession, answered with scorn, "What is that to us? see thou to that." Matt. 27:4. (B2)

DA153/722 The priests had been willing to make Judas their tool; but they despised his baseness. (I1)

DA154/722 When he turned to them with confession, they spurned him. (I1)

DA155/722 Judas now cast himself at the feet of Jesus, acknowledging Him to be the Son of God, and entreating Him to deliver Himself. (I1)

DA156/722 The Saviour did not reproach His betrayer. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 76 - SOURCES

DA157/722 He knew that Judas did not repent; his confession was forced from his guilty soul by an awful sense of condemnation and a looking for of judgment, but he felt no deep, heartbreaking grief that he had betrayed the spotless Son of God, and denied the Holy One of Israel. (11)

3SP16/124 He knew that he was suffering the bitterest remorse for his crime. (11)

3SP28/125 He remembered how kind and considerate Jesus had ever been to him, and his heart filled with remorse and anguish. (11)

DA158/722 Yet Jesus spoke no word of condemnation. (11)

DA159/722 He looked pityingly upon Judas, and said, For this hour came I into the world. (11)

DA160/722 A murmur of surprise ran through the assembly. (11)

DA161/722 With amazement they beheld the forbearance of Christ toward His betrayer. (11)

DA162/722 Again there swept over them the conviction that this Man was more than mortal. (11)

DA163/722 But if He was the Son of God, they questioned, why did He not free Himself from His bonds and triumph over his accusers? (11)

DA164/722 Judas saw that his entreaties were in vain, and he rushed from the hall exclaiming, It is too late! (11)

DA165/722 It is too late! (11)

DA166/722 He felt that he could not live to see Jesus crucified, and in despair went out and hanged himself.
[H/125/650] (P1)

3SP32/126 He felt unable to live to see Jesus crucified, and, in an agony of remorse, went out and hanged himself. [H/125/650] (P2)

337.1 The deepest remorse now seized upon the wretched Judas, and his soul was agitated by the horrors of despair. [Fleetwood, LC]

337.3 The innocence and benevolence of his Master, the many favors he himself had received from him, and the kind offices he had done for the sons and daughters of affliction, crowded at once into his mind and rendered his torments intolerable. Racked with these agonizing passions, and unable to support the misery, he threw down the wages of his iniquity in the temple, and confessing at the same time his own sin and the innocence of his Master, went away in despair, and hanged himself. [Fleetwood, LC]

125/650 Then it was, that, overwhelmed with nameless, countless disappointments, vexations, self-reproaches, his very living to see his Master die became intolerable to him, and in his despair he flung his ill-used life away. [Hanna, LC]

DA167/722 Later that same day, on the road from Pilate's hall to Calvary, there came an interruption to the shouts and jeers of the wicked throng who were leading Jesus to the place of crucifixion. [I/1/402] (P2)

MS(120)101 Later that same day, on the road from Pilate's judgment hall to Calvary, there came an interruption to the shouts and jeers of the wicked throng who were leading Jesus to the place of crucifixion. [I/1/402] (P2)

DA168/722 As they passed a retired spot, they saw at the foot of a lifeless tree, the body of Judas. [I/1/402] (P2)

DA169/722 It was a most revolting sight. [I/1/403] (P1)

DA170/722 His weight had broken the cord by which he had hanged himself to the tree. [I/2,3/403] (P1)

DA171/722 In falling, his body had been horribly mangled, and dogs were now devouring it. [I/2,3/403] (P1)

DA172/722 His remains were immediately buried out of sight; but there was less mockery among the throng, and many a pale face revealed the thoughts within. [I/4/403] (I2)

DA173/722 Retribution seemed already visiting those who were guilty of the blood of Jesus. [I/7/403] (P2)

3SP37/126 If any testimony had been needed to prove the innocence of Jesus, it was given in the confession of Judas. [K/209.8] (P2)

1/402 Here Rabbi Amos could speak no more to Him, for the crowd dragged Him off out of the court of Gabbatha, and so down the steep street, in the direction of the gate of the kings, that leads out to Calvary, the public place of execution . . . [Ingraham, PHD]

12,13/402+ On the way, as they crossed the open space where once stood the palace and the statue of Antiochus Seleucus, the eyes of the Rabbi were attracted by the cries and pointed fingers of many of the people, to the body of a man lying dead at the foot of a withered fig-tree. Upon drawing nearer, he recognized the features of the man Judas, who had so basely betrayed his Master! [Ingraham, PHD]

1/403 The spectacle which he exhibited was revolting, and horrid to look upon! [Ingraham, PHD]

2,3/402 About his neck was wound a fragment of his girdle, the other half being still secured to a limb of the tree, showing how he had met his fate. The cord had broken by his weight, and being a fleshy man, he had, most dreadful to relate, in the fall burst asunder, and the hungry dogs that infest the suburbs, were feeding upon his bowels. [Ingraham, PHD]

4/403 With cries of horror, several of the mob drove them away; but the Roman Centurion, whom Pilate had ordered to crucify Jesus for the Jews, directed four of his soldiers to convey the hideous corpse from sight, and see that it was either burned or buried. . . [Ingraham, PHD]

7/403 This looks like Divine retribution, and, as if Jesus were, in truth, the favored Prophet of the Highest. [Ingraham, PHD]

209.8 How strongly and triumphantly, therefore, must the heavenly radiance of Jesus' innocence have been reflected even by the darkened mirror of his treacherous soul, that, in spite of the injury just mentioned which he thereby occasioned himself, he could not refrain from honouring Jesus by such a confession! Truly, scarcely ever has a more powerful hymn of praise to the holiness of the Lamb of God been heard, than sounds in our ears in the despairing outcry of his betrayer; and where has the innocence of Jesus been more powerfully attested, than by the testimony which the unhappy murderer is compelled by conscience to give against himself? [Krummacher, SS]

Analysis

Chapter 76 presents some unusual problems for source and redaction analyses. Evidently Marian Davis also recognized the special nature of Ellen White's comments on Judas. She did not list any references to Scripture on the title page of this chapter.¹ There are other chapters which do not carry footnotes referring the reader to the corresponding scriptural passages.² No other chapter, however, treating a specific personality, is presented apart from a scriptural context.³ The chapter on Judas is clearly a composite construction, a mosaic in which the various experiences of Judas throughout his discipleship with Jesus are allowed to reveal the colorful character of one who was not destined to be a traitor. The commentary recounts the early discipleship of Judas, the interaction of Judas with the other disciples, his reaction to the preaching of Jesus, his influence on the other disciples, his personal interest in the Messianic claims of Jesus, and the efforts of Jesus to woo and win the heart of Judas.

¹The working-manuscript copy of the earlier chapters of the DA text carry text references at the bottom of the title page for most chapters. The first published edition also carries the same basic references with the explanatory phrase added, "This chapter is based on . . ." This evidence leads us to assume that Marian Davis supplied the scriptural references.

²Chapter 3 on "The Fullness of Time" is the only other chapter from the 15 covered in this report which does not give the texts on which the chapter is built.

³Cf. "Nicodemus," chapter 17; "Levi-Matthew," chapter 28; "The Centurion," chapter 32; "The Good Samaritan," chapter 54; and "Zacchaeus," chapter 61.

Judas

Many of the comments of Ellen White involve insights into the attitudes, motives, and aspirations of Judas which are far from explicit presentation in Scripture. The extrabiblical aspects of chapter 76 may in part explain why no Bible references are listed in support of the commentary.

The broad scope of this chapter's content made it difficult to locate possible source parallels. The various episodes in the life of Judas do not occupy independent chapters of the DA text. If commented upon at all, they are treated in connection with other themes. Where the content does not correspond to the main topic of the chapters selected for this study, we would not have included the subject content in our search for literary parallels.¹

The synthesis of the Judas story in chapter 76 also introduces problems of omission and duplication. For example, the betrayal is only briefly mentioned in chapter 76 since it is covered in the chapter on Gethsemane.² The appearance of Judas before Caiaphas, however, is given extensive coverage in chapter 76 but not mentioned in chapter 75, which treats the appearance of Jesus "Before Annas and the Court of Caiaphas."

We shall have more to say about the composition of this chapter under "Redaction Analysis" below. Let us first identify the sources utilized by Ellen White.

¹For example the early discipleship of Judas, and Jesus' treatment of Judas, are part of chapter 30 of the DA text, "He Ordained Twelve," pages 293-295.

²DA, chapter 74, pages 694-696.

Source Analysis - The Desire of Ages

According to our analysis, chapter 76 yields 55 sentences which show some dependency upon a literary source. In Table 1, page 697, we list on line 01 the various types of parallels found. Out of the 55, there were 11 sentences evaluated as Strict Paraphrase, 21 as Simple Paraphrase, 14 as Loose Paraphrase, and one sentence exhibiting dependency in the use of a Bible reference. A Partial Independence rating was given to 8 sentences, and 115 sentences were attributed solely to Ellen White. There were three quotations from the Bible which were not counted in the dependency evaluation. Once again no examples of Verbatim were found in the DA text. In Appendix A the full listing of the 173 sentences of chapter 76 is given with the individual sentence evaluations and sources where parallels have been found.

When we apply the scale of dependency values to the parallels, the following averages result. Excluding the Bible quotations, the average literary dependency for the 170 sentences is 1.12. If we also exclude the categories of independence, and limit the evaluation to the categories of dependency, as registered by the 55 sentences, the average dependency for the chapter is 3.47.

Table 1 also includes the data on our analysis of the pre-DA Ellen White writings on Judas. These figures will be discussed under the next section.

Table 2 presented on page 698 shows the distribution of

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 76

Ellen White Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
V1 Strict Verbatim	00	00	11	21	14	01	08	115	03	173
V2 Verbatim	00	00								
P1 Strict Paraphrase	00	00	01	05	06	00	01	03	01	17
P2 Simple Paraphrase	00	00	01	04	00	00	04	05	00	14
P3 Loose Paraphrase	00	00	04	05	04	00	04	01	00	18
B1 Source Bible	00	00	06	14	10	00	09	(09)	(01)	49
I2 Partial Independence										
I1 Strict Independence										
B2 Bible										
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	00	06	14	10	00	09	(09)	(01)	49

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 76

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	COUNT								
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
	V1	V2	P1	P2	P3	B1	I2	I1	B2
	Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	03
02. Hanna IC	00	00	01	06	03	00	00	00	00
03. Smith BD	00	00	00	00	02	00	00	00	00
04. Farrar IC	00	00	00	00	02	00	00	00	00
05. Edersum LHM	00	00	06	11	06	01	02	00	00
06. Ingraham PHD	00	00	04	02	00	00	01	00	00
07. Thayer SLJ	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00
08. Dods EB	00	00	00	01	01	00	05	00	00
TOTALS DA Text	00	00	11	21	14	01	08	00	(03)

Judas

sources used in chapter 76. One can also note the type of parallels provided by the different sources. The sources have been listed according to their dates of publication. Of the sources named in Table 2, Hanna's Life of Christ is the earliest, and Dods' commentary on John from The Expositor's Bible is the latest.

Edersheim furnished 26 parallels, or nearly half of those found in the entire chapter. Hanna provided 10, and Ingraham and Dods were each used 7 times. Three other writers, Smith, Farrar and Thayer, furnished together five parallels.

The majority of the parallels found in the DA text are due to the influence of Ellen White's earlier writings on the composition of this chapter. Table A, pages 700-703, lists seven published texts and/or unpublished manuscripts which have been utilized directly or indirectly to some extent in the composition of this chapter on Judas. Of the 55 sentences containing source parallels in the DA text, only four appear to have been added beyond the contribution of the earlier writings.¹

The parentheses and brackets indicate where duplicate use of a sentence has resulted in some modification to the sentence form. Parentheses indicate a change from the earliest form of the sentence. Brackets are used when

¹DA26 is similar to a statement appearing in ST(94) but it is reflecting the influence of Edersheim. The remaining three, DA31, 75, and 135, have not been found in the previous writings, and contain parallels from Edersheim (DA31, 75) and Hanna (DA135).

TABLE A

SENTENCE PARALLELS IN ELLEN G. WHITE WRITINGS FOR CHAPTER 76

<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(93)</u>	<u>ST(94)</u>	<u>MS 28</u> 1897	<u>RH(97)</u> Oct. 5	<u>RH(97)</u> Oct.12	<u>MS 120</u> 1897	<u>DA</u>
			1	1			1
							2
							3
							4
							5
3a/81						(1) ¹	6
3b/81						(2)	7
						3	8
6/82						(4)	9
						5	10
15/82	(19)					[6]	11
8a, d/82						7	12
9/82						(8)	13
10a/82						(9)	14
10b/82						(10)	15
12/82						(11,12)	16
12/82						(13)	17
10c, 11/82						(14)	18
13/82						15	19
			29a	27a			
			29b	29b			(20) 21b
			58	28			21a
			30	30			(22)
							23
		3					(24)
							25
		6					(26)
	15					16	27
	14					(17)	28
	17					18	29
	16					(19)	30
							31
			34	37			(32)
			35	38			33
			36	39			34
			37	40			35
			38	41			(36)
			39, 40	42, 43			37
			41	44			38
			42	45			(39)
			4	(46)			[40]
						20b, c	(41)
						20a, 22b	42
							43

¹Parentheses/brackets indicate modification of earlier text form.

TABLE A - CHAPTER 76
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(93)</u>	<u>ST(94)</u>	<u>MS 28</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct. 5</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct.12</u>	<u>MS 120</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>DA</u>
							44
	20a					(21)	[45]
						22a,c	46
						23	47
						24	48
		7				25	(49)
		8				26	50
		9a				27	51
		9b				28a	52
		9c				28b	(53)
		10a				29	54
		10b				30	55
		11				(31)	56
		12				(32)	57
		13a				33	58
		13b				34	(59)
		16				(35)	60
		15				(36)	61
		17				37	(62)
							63
							64
							65
							66
							67
							68
							69
							70
							71
							72
			54	59			73
							74
							75
		40				(38)	76
						39	77
						40	78
							79
							80
							81
							82
							83
			73	63			(84)
			79	65			85
			80	66			(86)
			81	67			(87)
			83	69			88
			84	70			89
			87	71			90

TABLE A - CHAPTER 76
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(93)</u>	<u>ST(94)</u>	<u>MS 28</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct. 5</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct.12</u>	<u>MS 120</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>DA</u>
						45	(92)
							93
							94
							95
							96
							97
		44a				(46)	98
		44b				(47)	99
			85,86		72		100
							101
							102
	20b					(48)	[103]
	21					49	104
222/125	27,28	(45-6a)				50	105
		45b				(51)	106
	29,31					(52)	[107]
						53	108
	30					(54)	109
						55	110
						56	111
						57	112
						58	113
						59	114
		55				(60,61a)	115
		57a				(62)	116
						63	117
		57b				(64)	[118]
		58a				(65)	119
		58b				66	120
			18			(67)	121
							122
							123
							124
			19		6		(125)
			20		7		(126)
158/105			(21)		8		[127abc]
			22		9		(127d)
			25		11ab		(128)
			26		12		
			48		11c		(129)
			49		13		(130)
			51		15		131
			50		14		132
			52		16		133
							134
							135
							136

TABLE A - CHAPTER 76
(Continued)

<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(93)</u>	<u>ST(94)</u>	<u>MS 28</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct. 5</u>	<u>RH(97)</u> <u>Oct.12</u>	<u>MS 120</u> <u>1897</u>	<u>DA</u>
157-9/106						(69)	[138]
						70	(139)
226/125						71	(140)
227/125						72, 73	(141)
						76	142
204-5/123						77	(143)
207/124						78	144
208/124						79	145
209/124						80	146
210/124						81	(147)
211/124						82	148
212/124						83	149
213/124						84	(150)
		62c				85	(151)
215/124		63				86	152
		68				(87, 89)	153
		68				(90)	(154)
217/124						91	(155)
218/124						92	(156)
219/124						93	(157)
							158
220/124						94	(159)
221/125						95a	160
221/125						95b	(161)
222/125						96	162
223/125						97	163
233/126						98, 99a	164
234/126						99b	165
235/126						100	(166)
						101	167
						102	168
						103	169
						104	170
						105	171
						106	172
						107	173
240/126						(108)	
241/126						(109)	
242/126						110	
243/126						111	
244/126						112	
245/126						113	
246/126						114	

further modification has taken place. When neither brackets nor parentheses are used the form agrees with the latest of the earlier constructions.

The independent material of the DA text which has not been taken over from the previously written texts has, for the most part, to do with episodes in the experience of Judas discussed in earlier chapters of the DA text. Sentences 63-75 refer to the attitude of Judas at the occasion of feeding the 5,000. In chapter 39, however, no mention is made of Judas' part in the efforts of the crowd to make Jesus king.¹ In fact, this part of the narrative is described in chapter 40, "A Night on the Lake," and yet Judas is not mentioned.

Sentences 93-97 speak of the reaction of Judas to Jesus' interview with the rich young ruler.² These comments are not reflected in the earlier writings of Ellen White on Judas, nor is Judas' reaction mentioned in the DA chapter on Jesus and the wealthy, young Jewish leader. Another short section not apparently covered in the earlier materials, DA sentences 134-137, has to do with Judas' betrayal of Christ in the garden. These comments do not appear in her chapter on Gethsemane where she discusses this episode.³

¹See pages 364-371, "Give Ye Them to Eat."

²See chapter 57, pages 518-523, "One Thing Thou Lackest."

³Cf. chapter 74, especially pages 694-696.

Source Analysis - Pre-Desire of Ages

Three documents from the pen of Ellen White evidently furnished the major sources for Marian Davis' construction of chapter 76. These documents are listed in Table 1 as Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, Manuscript 28, 1897, and Manuscript 120, also dated in 1897. Apart from the Spirit of Prophecy text, which exists in book form only, we have secretarial copies of the two manuscripts. No handwritten copies have been located. As indicated above, both manuscripts were written in 1897, and both carry the title, "Judas."¹ Neither manuscript carries the signature of Ellen White and Manuscript 120 also lacks the signature of the copyist, and date of the copying. Manuscript 28 is identified as copied by M. V. H. on April 22, 1897.²

Most of the material which we have in chapter 76 may be traced to these two manuscripts, whether source parallels or independent Ellen White commentary. We have attempted to show this dependency of the DA text on Ellen White's earlier writings through the comparisons found in Table A above. Of the 173 sentences of chapter 76, 107 are to be found in identical or similar form in Manuscript 120. The text tradition, however, extends further back in history than this manuscript from 1897. Table A shows that many

¹See pages 672, 673.

²This information is merely descriptive. Many of Ellen White's writings did not carry her signature, especially in the typical typewritten form. Some copies were stamped with a formal script signature. The initials M. V. H. stand for Minnie Hawkins.

Judas

sentences found in Manuscript 120 had appeared in printed form earlier in Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, and in two articles from the Signs of the Times.¹

Evidently Marian Davis, or Ellen White, worked from MS 120 in arranging chapter 76. Except for a few sentences,² the parallels from these earlier texts are to be found in MS 120 and in like sequence as they appear in the same MS.³

The typed form of MS 120 carries the date of October 27, 1897, in handscript. This date is just over six months after the copyist date of April 22, 1897, for MS 28. Yet MS 120 makes no obvious use of the earlier writing on Judas. This is not to say that the author of MS 120 was writing without the knowledge of the earlier text. It is hard to account for the lack of overlap between two manuscripts on the same topic by the same writer apart from the explanation that the writer is consciously adding to the first document, knowing that a third writing would pull the two individual accounts into a complete and coherent whole. More will be said on this point under redaction analysis below.

Some 30 DA sentences may be attributed to the influence of MS 28, which we have already in part described.⁴ When the parallel sentences as listed in Table A are compared, it is obvious, however, that in putting together the DA text,

¹ST, December 18, 1893, and December 24, 1894.
²Cf. ST(94)3 and DA(24); and ST(94)6 and DA(26) in Table A.

³See, for example, ST(93)15, 14, 17, 16, MS(120)16-19, and DA27-30, as listed in Table A.

⁴These DA sentences are 20-22, 32-40, 73, 84-90, 100, and 125-133.

the published form of MS 28 was used.

The sentences first appearing in MS 28, and finally included in chapter 76, were first published in article form.¹ The DA sequence of the sentences follows the order as printed in the Review and Herald, rather than the order as originally composed in MS 28.² It should be noted, nevertheless, that while sentence order has been changed, the text of MS 28 has remained basically the same.

The sources behind the literary parallels are listed in Table 3, page 708. Though some variation is to be found, the same sources behind the DA text are shown to have been used in the development of the pre-DA text.³ This is to be expected when our comparison table (Table A) showed such a marked similarity between the DA text and various earlier writings.

In view of the duplication of the Ellen White material, the differences in the number of parallels demand some explanation. How is it that we show more parallels from Edersheim in the DA text, over twice as many, than listed for the pre-DA text? Does the DA text add parallels from Edersheim not appearing in the earlier writings of Ellen White? The same question could be asked of the Ingraham parallels. And how is it that we have more parallels from

¹RH, October 5 and 12, 1897. See Appendix D for the full text of these articles.

²Cf. sentences 29a, 29b, 58, 30, and 4 of MS 28, with DA sentences 20-22 and 40, and with sentences 27a, 29b, 28, 30, and 46 of RH, Oct. 5, as listed in Table A.

³See Table 2, page 698.

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 76

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
01. Krummacker SS	VI Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	01
02. Hanna LC	00	00	01	05	06	00	01	00	00	13
03. Farfar LC	00	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	01
04. Ederholm LHM	00	00	04	03	03	00	04	00	00	14
05. Ingraham PHD	00	00	00	01	00	00	00	00	00	01
06. Dods EB	00	00	01	04	00	00	04	00	00	09
TOTALS Pre-DA	00	00	06	14	10	00	09	00	(00)	39

Dods and Hanna among the earlier texts than in the DA text which lists more parallels, 55 over against 39?

The answer to these questions are to be found in noticing Ellen White's characteristic pattern of using the sources and our format of text presentation.

Ellen White tended to concentrate on one or two sources in the composition of a manuscript. We have no manuscripts for the SP text, but of the 46 entries we show for the pre-DA text (Table 1), 13 of the 17 parallels listed for 3SP are attributable to Hanna.¹ Marcus Dods was used in developing Manuscript 28 and Edersheim played a dominant role in the composition of Manuscript 120. If this use of sources in the earlier texts is not evident in the DA text, we listed the earlier parallels. If, however, these earlier sentences containing the source parallels are taken over by the DA text, space considerations demanded that we not duplicate the previous writings.

There were, nevertheless, certain times when we did duplicate the pre-DA text. We added the earlier reading if it showed literary dependency and the DA text did not, if the pre-DA text showed greater dependency, or if we needed to indicate the relationship between the DA text and earlier materials, or to establish parallel contexts.

Take, for example, the Edersheim and Ingraham parallels for this chapter. Edersheim was heavily used in writing

¹Of the remaining four, 3 are listed as Bible quotes and 1 is credited to Kitto. See Appendix C for the full list of sources for the pre-DA text.

Manuscript 120. In sentences, DA14-19, we show Edersheim as the literary source for modifying the 3SP text. Since these sentences from MS 120 were taken over verbatim in the DA text, we do not include the text from the manuscript.¹ Therefore our figures list more use of Edersheim in the DA text than in the earlier MS 120 when actually the DA text was duplicating the earlier text.

A similar case can be made for Ingraham. Sentences 167-173 of DA show dependency upon Ingraham. We listed one sentence from Manuscript 120 which is virtually repeated verbatim in DA167. Having established the connection of the DA text with MS 120, we continue to show the literary dependency between the DA text and Ingraham. We do not repeat the sentences from MS 120 which first used Ingraham. We do include the relevant portions from these earlier materials in Appendix D so that the reader may review the comparative analysis as indicated in Table A with the complete textual evidence.

In view of Ellen White's methods of using sources, and our limited presentation of the text, we suggest that comparisons be limited to the DA text, or to individual sentences between the DA text and earlier Ellen White writings. This caution is especially important for the analysis of chapter 76, which is so dependent on earlier writings.

¹Cf. Table A for the textual tradition behind the DA sentences.

The evaluation of the dependent sentences listed for this chapter underscores the necessity for great care in making comparisons. When we average the dependency ratings for the 39 sentence evaluations listed in Table 3, the dependency rating for the pre-DA text is 3.2.¹ This is a lower dependency rating than for the DA text, which registered 3.47.

Typically, the earlier writings have been showing greater literary dependency than the DA. How shall we interpret our findings? Can we say chapter 76 is the exception that breaks the rule? We think not. The dependency rating has been skewed by reason of the omission of so many parallels which were duplicated in the DA. Virtually, the same sources used in the earlier writings are reflected in the DA text. Sentences 26, 31, 75, and 136 are the exceptions, not being found in the pre-DA materials.

These four sentences, standing alone in the DA, together average 4.0 in dependency. But Table 4 on page 712 lists 6 instances where evaluations differ between the earlier text and DA. In 5 out of the 6, the dependency is greater in the earlier text. The 6 sentences average 2.83 for the DA, and 3.83 for the previous writings. Once again we find the literary dependency is greater for the earlier writings than for the DA text. The use of sources is also

¹We do not evaluate the entire text tradition, because we do not list independent sentences for these earlier writings unless they are associated with dependency sentences.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 76

Same Sentence - Similar Words

No. -	<u>DA Text</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA Txt</u>	<u>Eval</u>
01. -	<u>DA9/716</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>3SP5/82</u>	<u>P1</u>
02. -	<u>DA13/716</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>3SP8/82</u>	<u>I2</u>
03. -	<u>DA31/717</u>	<u>P3</u>	<u>MS(28)3</u>	<u>P2</u>
04. -	<u>DA38/717</u>	<u>I2</u>	<u>MS(28)44</u>	<u>P2</u>
05. -	<u>DA92/719</u>	<u>P2</u>	<u>MS(120)45</u>	<u>P1</u>
06. -	<u>DA166/722</u>	<u>P1</u>	<u>3SP32/126</u>	<u>P2</u>

evident in the arrangement of the smaller literary units of the chapter, as we shall now review.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

We have already remarked on the special character of chapter 76. It does not follow the biblical narrative, yet it is not extrabiblical such as chapter 3 on "The Fullness of the Time." Here we have a number of vignettes linked together like beads on a string. The pictures are biblical but the story line is not. How do we account for this arrangement? Who put this chapter together in this fashion?

We have noted in connection with the redaction analysis of previous chapters that Ellen White often followed the thematic arrangement of a given writer when writing on a specific topic. The chapters themselves, however, as larger literary compositions, combined several smaller literary units to form the structure of the chapter. Who did this work of arrangement? Did Marian Davis edit the earlier articles and writings of Ellen White into a general pattern of separate chapters and then suggest to Ellen White which aspects of the story, as we know it from Scripture, needed further comment? Or did Marian Davis collect the earlier writings on a given topic, hand the "scrapbook" or "scrapbook section" to Ellen White for the creation of the chapter's theme and arrangement?

We may never know the answer to these intriguing literary questions, because the working manuscripts for the

Judas

chapters no longer exist. It is just possible, however, that chapter 76 will shed some light on this problem.

Apart from 44 sentences,¹ the entire chapter may be found in two manuscripts written in 1897, one year before the DA was published. These 44 sentences are scattered throughout the chapter, the longest subunit being 70 sentences relating to the feeding of the five thousand, sentences 63-72 on page 718 of DA. Of the 44 sentences not attributable to the two 1897 manuscripts, 40 have been evaluated as Ellen White's independent work. The remaining 4 contain 3 parallels from Edersheim and one from Hanna.² It is the remaining 129,³ however, which are of special interest for the issue of redaction.

Chapter 76 is the only chapter thus far studied for which we have so much material in manuscript form. Approximately 75% of this chapter, entitled "Judas," can be directly attributed to two Ellen White manuscripts produced in 1897 and given the title of "Judas." Even the arrangement of the chapter must be attributed to these two documents, Manuscripts 28 and 120.

According to the DA column of Table A, sentence 1 of chapter 76 was taken from MS 28. Sentences 2-5 are

¹These sentences are 2-5, 23-26, 31, 43, 44, 63-72, 74, 75, 79-83, 91, 93-97, 101, 102, 122-124, 134-137, and 158.

²Sentences 26, 31, and 75 show the influence of Edersheim, and Hanna is reflected in the composition of sentence 135. This analysis can be checked by comparing Table A and Appendix A.

³It is actually 130 remaining sentences, since 21 and 127 are listed as two sentences in Table A.

independent compositions of Ellen White enlarging on sentence 1. The next 14 sentences come from MS 120. Apart from a few independent sentences scattered here and there throughout the chapter, the text of chapter 76 moves back and forth between these two manuscripts. We should also note that the material from MS 28 was not directly taken over into the DA text. A careful scrutiny of the sentence sequence of MS 28 and that of the two Review and Herald articles developed from MS 28,¹ will show that the sentence sequence of the DA text follows the order of the RH article rather than the original manuscript order.

We have pointed out in the introduction to this study how Ellen White depended upon her literary assistants to edit and rearrange her manuscripts for publication purposes. We know this was done in the preparation of articles for the various journals of the church. It is very likely that Marian Davis constructed chapter 76 out of the October 5 and 12, 1897, articles and Manuscript 120 of the same year. Ellen White probably took this composition and added comments and transitional material, and in so doing added 44 sentences to the text.

We must, of course, bear in mind that the basic integration of the various facets of the life and work of Judas had already been done by Ellen White in her

¹Compare the MS 28 and the RH(97) Oct. 5 columns of Table A with the DA column of the same table, especially for DA sentences 20-22 and 32-40. See also DA sentences 125-133 and the parallel sentences from MS 28 and RH(97) Oct. 12.

construction of the two manuscripts on Judas. In so doing she had set the format for chapter 76. It is also in these two manuscripts that we see the sources being utilized. To understand more clearly the role of Ellen White and that of the sources in the arrangement of chapter 76, let us take a careful look at the thematic development and interdependency of these two earlier documents.

Redaction Analysis - Pre-DA Text

Manuscript 28 contains 257 sentences, in 18 pages of text, out of which about 30 enter chapter 76 via the two RH articles which appear as two consecutive but independent articles on "Judas." The text weaves together various strands of material on the life of Judas. Portions of this manuscript were rearranged and combined with other writings of Ellen White to form the RH articles used in chapter 76. Since our study is primarily concerned with the content of chapter 76, we have made no effort to compare the full text of MS 28 with the full text of the two RH articles which were developed from (at least parts of) MS 28.

The structure of MS 28 is not clearly set forth, and thematic units do not always submit to easy identification. In general Ellen White first speaks of the possibility for another kind of destiny for Judas. She goes on to mention the last trip to Jerusalem, the garden betrayal, the early history of the discipleship of Judas, his view of the other disciples as compared to himself, his covetous spirit, his

Judas

desire to make Christ king of the Jews, his lack of a teachable attitude and inner experience, and his negative influence on the other disciples. Portions from these 87 sentences are found in the DA text.

The next 24 sentences present the burden Jesus carried in his efforts to help humanity reflect the image of God. With sentence 113 Ellen White begins comment on Judas' reaction to the anointing of the feet of Jesus in Bethany. This incident in Judas' life is only lightly treated in chapter 76, but is given in-depth coverage in chapter 62 of DA.¹ A comparative study of MS 28 with chapter 62 reveals that at least 15 sentences of the DA text were dependent upon MS 28.² Appendix D contains the full text of MS 28, as well as the corresponding sentences for DA, chapter 62.

This experience with the open rebuke by Jesus functions as a pivotal point in the life of Judas. From this feast he goes to the Jewish rulers to offer his services as a betrayer. In chapter 76 Ellen White gives one paragraph to this important encounter of Judas with Jesus.

The composite nature of MS 28 appears to have been influenced at least in part by Marcus Dods' commentary on the Gospel of John. Our source analysis indicates he

¹Cf. sentences 41-165, pages 558-566, of the DA text on "The Feast at Simon's House."

²Compare MS 28, sentence 146, with DA58-61a/560, and sentences 206-233 of MS 28 with DA144a-156/565. In view of our lack of information on when chapter 62 of the DA was composed, we must leave open the possibility that MS 28 here was dependent upon the earlier composition of chapter 62 of DA.

furnished 9 parallels for MS 28. In his chapter on Judas he makes it a special concern to treat the character of Judas and how it was that a disciple whom Jesus called could betray such an One as Christ. There is more similarity between MS 28 and the Dods material than is apparent in the source analysis. We include a few pages from Dods in Appendix D in order that the more subtle relationship between MS 28 and this commentary may be studied further. The reader will also note what Ellen White does not take from the work of Dods.

The second manuscript composed by Ellen White on the life of Judas, MS 120, while a shorter document overall, contributed more to the development of chapter 76 than did MS 28. Out of 114 sentences from this 7-page manuscript, only 15 do not appear in our chapter.¹ With one exception the DA text follows the same sentence sequence as does MS 120.² Of the nearly 100 sentences, or 57% of the text of chapter 76 furnished by MS 120, 37 may be attributed to the influence of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, and 38 to two articles appearing in The Signs of the Times.³

The comments on the life of Judas in 3SP follow the sequence of events as presented in Scripture. MS 120

¹The 15 sentences are 41-44, 68, 74, 75, 88, and 108-114.

²Cf. DA, sentence 42.

³Table A shows 173 sentences in the DA text, but when compared to earlier texts the number is slightly larger, due to the multiple listing of several sentences. Cf. DA21 and 127.

Judas

borrowed from two segments of the Judas tradition, presented in 3SP. Ellen White rearranges her earlier remarks on "The Passover Supper" in the first section she takes from 3SP.¹ Her subject concerns how one so blessed by the presence of Jesus could stoop to betrayal. The second unit taken from 3SP by MS 120 has to do with the end result of the betrayal for Judas. Here she leans on her commentary treating the experience of Judas in the judgment hall of Caiaphas and his subsequent suicide. Her closing remarks over the fulfillment of Zechariah's prophecy are included in MS 120 but not taken over by DA.²

These two selections from the SP material frame her comment as presented in MS 120. In between these opening and closing portions of MS 120, Ellen White introduced some of her independent commentary and some selected elements from the two articles appearing in The Signs of the Times.³ These two articles present character studies on Judas, but judging from the limited and selective use made of the content, it does not appear that they furnished the pattern for arranging the components of MS 120.

Our analysis seems to indicate two major controls were operating in the construction of MS 120. In the first place the absence of any duplication with MS 28 strongly suggests

¹Cf. DA6-19 with sentences 3-15 on pages 81 and 82 of 3SP. See Table A for specific notation.

²Cf. DA140-166 with sentences 204-235 on pages 123-126 of 3SP.

³ST, Dec. 18, 1893, "The Character to Be Tested," and Dec. 24, 1894, "A Lesson from the Experience of Judas."

Judas

that in writing MS 120, Ellen White was consciously expanding on the material of MS 28, either by adding new commentary or taking over portions of her earlier writings.¹ Secondly, Ellen White was following some leads furnished by Edersheim's life of Christ which she used in producing MS 120. She generally follows the sequence of Edersheim where the parallels are plain to see.²

Edersheim covers the life of Judas in two separate sections of his account. Ellen White evidently drew from both. In Book III, chapter 37, a "psychological development" is presented.³ Here we read of the "one terrible master-passion" of Judas, his "covetousness."⁴ This deeper motivation fired his interest in the political future of Israel, particular with Jesus as the Messiah. But in this respect Judas was to experience continual disappointment. Jesus allowed John the Baptist to be beheaded, would not permit the people to make Him king, and would not stand up against the opposition of the Pharisees.⁵

In Book V, chapter VIII, Edersheim approaches the story of Judas through a "brief study of his character and history."⁶ This second account traces the path Judas took from his appointment as treasurer of the apostolic band,

¹We are assuming that Ellen White produced MS 120 even though no signature appears on the typed copy.

²Appendix C lists the sentences from MS 120 and those from Edersheim.

³Edersheim, The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah, Book III, pp. 77-78.

⁴Op. cit., p. 77 (sentence 90).

⁵Op. cit., pp. 77, 78 (sentences 92-101).

⁶Op. cit., pp. 472ff.

Judas

and his early impression of the ministry of Jesus, through the disappointment over the death of John the Baptist, to the "definite moment when the process of disintegration . . . began. . . ."¹ That point was the Sabbath sermon by Jesus in Capernaum in which He presented Himself as the Bread of the world. The road is all downward from there, even to his being openly rebuked by Jesus when Judas objected to Mary's gift of the anointing.

William Hanna also interrupts his commentary on the betrayal of Jesus to treat the story of "the betrayer." In seeking to explain how it was that a disciple of the loving Lord could stoop to such a despicable deed, Hanna first talks about the power of a "dominant passion."² In this context he also comments on Judas' attempt to release Jesus, or at least absolve his own guilt by returning the money. Hanna's account then briefly surveys Judas' life from the beginning of his discipleship, his role as treasurer for the little company, his reaction to Mary's gift of ointment, his general concern over Christ's reluctance "to exercise His kingly power," and his decision to turn Jesus over to the rulers. The character study on Judas continues with a few comments on Judas' great disappointment over Jesus' acceptance of the judgment of the Jewish rulers, and the intolerable despair which followed. Hanna returns to his narrative on the arrest of Jesus after reminding his readers

¹Op. cit., p. 474.

²This section begins at line 79 of Hanna's section of "The Betrayal and the Betrayer," pp. 643ff.

Judas

of the process by which Jesus is still being betrayed by those who today exhibit the character traits of Judas.

We are not certain as to the degree to which Hanna's life of Christ influenced the general composite pattern of chapter 76 or its order of development. We do know Ellen White often consulted Hanna's work, and this chapter 76 contains several parallels not directly related to The Spirit of Prophecy text where Hanna was definitely used.¹

It seems reasonable to conclude that while the character study approach on Judas had already been used in the ST articles of 1893 and 1894, the development of a whole chapter on the history of Judas appears to have been strongly influenced by the works of Dods, Edersheim, and possibly Hanna. Once the two manuscripts of 1897 had put together the major elements of the narrative, it only remained for Marian Davis to integrate them into one continuous story. Probably Ellen White took over the compilation in this larger form, and added her independent comment to complete the character analysis and draw the spiritual lessons for the benefit of the intended readers.

There are definite similarities between the DA text and the commentaries of Dods, Edersheim, and Hanna. The character study on Judas falls in the middle of her narrative on the arrest and trial of Jesus. As do Hanna and Edersheim, she remarks on the tragedy of this life of Judas, and after speaking of the betrayal, points to the chief

¹Cf. DA42, 103, 129 and 135.

Judas

weakness of Judas' character, his "evil spirit of avarice."¹ After identifying his basic flaw, she follows Judas from his early discipleship to his death. She mentions his reaction to the ministry of Jesus, the relationship Judas had with the other disciples, his disappointment over the death of John the Baptist, and the spiritual nature of the kingdom Jesus proclaimed. She goes beyond the sources in naming Judas as one of the prime movers in the attempt of the people to make Jesus king.² She agrees with Edersheim, however, in seeing the sermon at Capernaum on the bread of life, as being the "turning point" in the experience of Judas.³

Ellen White is alone in her detailing the way in which Judas influenced the other disciples in interpreting Scripture and the teachings of Jesus. But the basic negative impact of Judas on the disciples, his intention to force Christ to exert His Messianic power and calling through the betrayal, and his belated attempt to set things right and release Jesus, which Ellen White enlarges upon, are all mentioned, if only briefly, by Hanna and/or Edersheim.

Redaction analysis involves the study of content, but not as a primary consideration. Readers interested in content analysis and further study on the possibility of a more subtle influence of the sources on the content and

¹DA11/716

²DA72,73/718

³DA76/719

Judas

arrangement of chapter 76, should consult Appendix D. There we have included the relevant portions from Dods, Edersheim, and Hanna, as well as the Ellen White materials referred to in this analysis. The Ellen White texts will also show the nature and scope of the changes in her literary expressions and content which take place as she adapts previous writings to meet new situations and her various publishing commitments.

This analysis has been long and fairly involved. Chapter 76 makes a departure from what we have noted from the previous chapters of the DA text. In this chapter the life of Christ narrative, composed from bringing the four Gospel stories into one narrative story line, has been broken. Instead of the life of Christ, we have the life of Judas constructed from various references found in the Gospels.

There is, of course, much that has been left to other chapters of the DA text to cover, such as the special circumstances of Judas' call to become a disciple, and the full account of Judas' reaction to Mary's anointing of Jesus at Bethany.¹ Ellen White was concerned to bring together those experiences in his life which illuminated the fundamental nature of Judas' character, and how he was able to betray his Master.

Since the biblical narrative does not attempt to treat the life of Judas, and neither did Ellen White in The Spirit

¹See DA, chapters 30 and 62.

of Prophecy, chapter 76 does represent an expansion of Ellen White's commentary. It is also true that she was dependent upon literary sources for the development of Manuscripts 28 and 120 which, if our analysis is correct, were specifically written for the DA life of Christ project. These manuscripts should be understood as first draft efforts for the composition of chapter 76, rather than as pre-DA texts, as we have listed them for our analysis. Their title, nature, scope, and apparent relationship suggest that in these two documents we have the Ellen White working manuscript for chapter 76, which Marian Davis evidently edited. Once edited, Ellen White reworked the integrated document, which we no longer have, adding some independent commentary to complete the composite study. If this reconstruction is correct, and if chapter 76 is no exception to her general practice, we have in these two manuscripts evidence that Ellen White was active, not only in producing the separate articles forming the collection used by Marian Davis, but also as a major participant in arranging the content of the chapters themselves.

Of course we have noted that her compositional activities involve the use of sources for both verbal expression and order of arrangement. Nevertheless, granting the expansion and the use of sources, the result is still mostly the work of Ellen White. Her independent comments total more than double the number of sentences exhibiting literary parallels. Our figures do not include the two

Signs of the Times articles published in 1893 and 1894.¹

Summary

1. No handwritten manuscripts of chapter 76 are in existence today, We do have typewritten corrected copies of two manuscripts which form the bulk of this treatise on the life of Judas. Manuscripts 28 and 120, both dated in 1897 and both entitled "Judas," contain about 80% of the DA text. MS 28 is signed by Minnie Hawkins and apparently was a new composition by Ellen White. MS 120 carries no identification marks of Ellen White or a copyist, and is largely a compilation of earlier writings. If we assume Ellen White composed MS 120, we have in this manuscript the best evidence that Ellen White was involved with the arrangement of at least one chapter of the DA text. The manuscript was clearly written to dovetail with MS 28, and also involved the selection and adaptation of several earlier writings, as well as the addition of some independent material. There is no difference in the nature of construction required for MS 120 from that demanded by the chapter as a whole.

2. If Manuscripts 28 and 120 are understood to be rough drafts for chapter 76, our investigation located three

¹These articles were not evaluated as previous writings in analyzing the content because Ellen White was in Australia working on the life of Christ project when they were published. She could have written them as part of her work on what later came to be called The Desire of Ages. Only 44 sentences from these two articles found their way into the DA text.

earlier writings, which furnished matter for this chapter.¹ These three earlier Ellen White texts were utilized in the production of MS 120. Two portions of The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, were taken over for the opening and closing sections of the manuscript. The first section has to do with Judas' agreement with the chief priests to betray Christ, and the last treats the response of those same religious rulers to Judas' confession of regret, and his death. Apart from a few independent sentences to open chapter 76, and a few parallels from Ingraham at the close, the DA text follows this same arrangement for its opening and closing elements.

The other earlier Ellen White comments were taken from two articles appearing in The Signs of the Times. According to our evaluation, 11 sentences were taken from her remarks on "The Character to Be Tested," and 21 came from "A Lesson from the Experience of Judas."²

Ellen White wrote much more than these two articles and two manuscripts on Judas. The "scrapbook" of Marian Davis no doubt included the pages from Spiritual Gifts;³ selections from the Testimonies;⁴ Letters 63, 1893, and 51a, 1895; as well as, MS 2, 1883, and MS 100, 1897.

¹Manuscript 28, 1897, was in the main published as two RH articles later the same year.

²ST, Dec. 18, 1893, and Dec. 24, 1894, respectively.

³Cf. pp. 52, 53.

⁴Cf. 1T 192, 4T 41-42, 5T 557. We have listed only some of the places Ellen White comments on the life of Judas. Only those materials which went into the composition of chapter 76 and/or were found to contain clear source parallels, were introduced into our text presentation.

Judas

We have considered the chapter on the life of Judas an expansion of Ellen White's earlier writings, which are usually brief and not so broad in their coverage. This increased coverage, however, does not represent a greater dependency upon the sources. The different format allowed Ellen White to introduce more of her personal comment. She is able to draw the moral lessons and make the spiritual appeal by contrasting the selfishness of Judas with the selflessness of Jesus.

3. Ordinarily our comparisons of content between the DA text and earlier Ellen White writings have placed all the pre-DA materials (apart from the working DA typescript) in a category by themselves, in contrast to the DA text. We have not followed this procedure or method of classification for this chapter. In our estimation, MSS 28 and 120 were specifically written to form chapter 76. They both have a composite nature, neither one duplicates the other, though they both have the same title, and both, though in slightly different ways, follow the same pattern as found in the final DA text. If we grant that MSS 28 and 120 are first drafts of chapter 76, then our comparison of content between the DA text and earlier texts must be limited to 3SP and the two ST articles to be discussed next.

4. We did not notice any striking differences in the content of the earlier writings and that of the DA text insofar as their content dealt with the same subject matter. It is the similarities which stand out.

The two ST articles are similar in their focus on the character of Judas, and in their treatment of several experiences in the life of Judas.¹ The essays differ from the DA text in that they make no attempt to explain the motivation for the betrayal, and cover only a few incidents from the life of Judas. Then earlier writings use the life of Judas to illustrate negatively some moral and spiritual lessons for Christian readers to consider.

5. Chapter 76 contains 55 sentences exhibiting some degree of literary dependency. On the basis of 173 sentences in the chapter, the percentage of dependency for the full chapter is about 32. This figure includes 8 sentences of Partial Independence, or which could also be viewed as Partial Dependence.

6. Excluding three sentences consisting of Bible quotations, we found 115 sentences, or 67 percent of the chapter, to show literary independence.

7. The average degree of dependency according to our rating scale was 3.47 for those sentences involving the use of sources. If we average the dependency in terms of the entire 173 sentences, we get the figure of 1.12.

8. Our analysis yielded two major literary sources for this chapter. Alfred Edersheim's Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah furnished 26 parallels, and Hanna's Life of Christ supplied 10.

9. Some use was made of five other sources, if our

¹ST, Dec. 18, 1893, and Dec. 24, 1894.

evaluations are correct. Joseph Ingraham's work, The Prince of the House of David, and Marcus Dods' commentary on John's Gospel, account for 7 parallels each. We are not very confident that Ellen White used three other writers, but we have nevertheless listed them as sources. These are: William Smith's Bible Dictionary which went through many editions and was found in Ellen White's personal library at the time of her death; Frederic Farrar's Life of Christ, a copy of which Ellen White also had in her personal study; and E. W. Thayer's Sketches from the Life of Jesus.

10. The source parallels located in the earlier writings are virtually the same as found for the DA text. This duplication in the use of sources is the natural result of the duplication of text between the earlier and later writings. We do credit one author, not listed with the sources for the DA text, with providing one parallel for the earlier material. We refer here to Friedrich Krummacher and his reflections on The Suffering Saviour.

11. In a few instances we found the earlier materials to exhibit greater dependency than the DA text, and one DA sentence rated a greater degree of dependency than in the earlier text.¹ The continuation of basically the same literary tradition between the various texts, however, produced such similarity between the readings that no major differences in dependency resulted.

12. Most of Ellen White's independent comment has to

¹Cf. DA166/722 and 3SP32/126.

do with her extending her remarks beyond the points mentioned by the source, or expressing the same ideas found in the source in her own independent manner. One example of this freedom is found in her comments on Judas' reaction to an attempt by the people to make Christ king.¹ We found no difference in the type of comment found in dependent and independent sentences. Perhaps Ellen White included more content having to do with Jesus' attitude toward Judas than did the sources. The one area of content not found in the sources had to do with Judas' efforts to mislead his fellow disciples in the interpretation of Scripture and the teachings of Jesus.²

13. The arrangement of chapter 76 appears to have been largely taken over from two or three sources, both of which follow basically the same pattern of development.³ These literary sources were used in the composition of two manuscripts which together form nearly the whole of this chapter.⁴ The unique contribution of Ellen White, except for possibly one segment on Judas and the rich young ruler, is to be found in the subunits of chapter 76.

Ellen White exhibits her own creative hand in the

¹Cf. DA62-74/718 and Edersheim's comment, "Then came the next disappointment, when Jesus would not be made King. Why not--if He were King?" (LTJM, pp. 77, 78)

²DA83-91/719.

³We refer here to the works of Dods, Edersheim, and Hanna on the life of Christ.

⁴These manuscripts are dated so close to the time of publication, and are so similar to the DA text that we are classifying them as rough drafts of chapter 76 and not pre-DA texts.

Judas

extent and direction the individual units are developed. What may be only alluded to by the source becomes in her hands a large window through which the character of Judas becomes transparent.

14. The earlier writings of Ellen White on the life of Judas do not present an integrated account of his attitudes and experiences. Insofar as one of the episodes in the life of Judas is treated in an earlier account and also included in the connected story of Judas as covered in chapter 76, we may find some correlation between the earlier writings and the DA text.

The Spirit of Prophecy text provided two such episodes,¹ and The Signs of the Times furnished another. Our study suggests, however, that chapter 76 was basically a new composition and not a revision or compilation of earlier writings.

¹Manuscript 120 borrowed a third segment from 3SP, 240-246/126, but this portion of the manuscript was not utilized in chapter 76.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 76

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/95/77</u>	P3
002. -		I1	052. -	<u>Eder LTJM/75,76/473</u>	P1
003. -		I1	053. -	<u>Eder LTJM/76,77/473</u>	P1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -		I1	055. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77a/473</u>	P3
006. -		I1	056. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77b/473</u>	P1
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -		I1	058. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	I2
009. -	<u>Hanna LC/110/649</u>	P2	059. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P3
010. -	<u>Hanna LC/84/648</u>	P3	060. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P2
011. -	<u>Hanna LC/83/648</u>	P2	061. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -		I1
014. -	<u>Eder LTJM/68,69/473</u>	P1	064. -		I1
015. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	065. -		I1
016. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	066. -		I1
017. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	067. -		I1
018. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	068. -		I1
019. -	<u>Eder LTJM/73,74/473</u>	P2	069. -		I1
020. -		I1	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -	<u>Dods EB/55/96</u>	P2	072. -		I1
023. -		I1	073. -		I1
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P2
026. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/74/473</u>	P1	076. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/82/474</u>	P2
027. -		I1	077. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/82/474</u>	B1
028. -		I1	078. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/91/475</u>	I2
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/50/472</u>	P3	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	085. -		I1
036. -	<u>Dods EB/57a/96</u>	I2	086. -		I1
037. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	087. -		I1
038. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -		I1
041. -		I1	091. -		I1
042. -	<u>Hanna LC/93/648</u>	P2	092. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/88/474</u>	P2
043. -		I1	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -		I1
045. -	<u>Dods EB/93,94/101</u>	I2	095. -		I1
046. -		I1	096. -		I1
047. -		I1	097. -		I1
048. -		I1	098. -		I1
049. -	<u>Eder LTJM/92,93/77</u>	P2	099. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/88/474</u>	P2
050. -		I1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 76

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Bible	B2
102. -		I1	152. -	Bible	B2
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -	Edersh LTJM/89/474	P2	155. -		I1
106. -	Hanna LC/103/649	P3	156. -		I1
107. -		I1	157. -		I1
108. -		I1	158. -		I1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -		I1	162. -		I1
113. -		I1	163. -		I1
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -	Edersh LTJM/52/475	P3	166. -	Hanna LC/125/650	P1
117. -	Farrar LC/556.6	P3	167. -	Ingraham PHD/1/402	P2
118. -	Farrar LC/556.6	P3	168. -	Ing PHD/12,13/402+	P1
119. -	Edersh LTJM/53/475	P3	169. -	Ingraham PHD/1/403	P1
120. -		I1	170. -	Ingrah PHD/2,3/403	P1
121. -		I1	171. -	Ingrah PHD/2,3/403	P1
122. -		I1	172. -	Ingraham PHD/4/403	I2
123. -		I1	173. -	Ingraham PHD/7/403	P2
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -	Dods EB/99.7	P3	178. -		
129. -	Hanna LC/112/649	P2	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -		I1	181. -		
132. -	Smith BD/320a.8	P3	182. -		
133. -	Smith BD/320a.8	P3	183. -		
134. -		I1	184. -		
135. -	Hanna LC/42,43/645	P2	185. -		
136. -		I1	186. -		
137. -		I1	187. -		
138. -	Hanna LC/122/650	P2	188. -		
139. -		I1	189. -		
140. -		I1	190. -		
141. -	Hanna LC/124/650	P3	191. -		
142. -		I1	192. -		
143. -		I1	193. -		
144. -		I1	194. -		
145. -		I1	195. -		
146. -	Bible	B2	196. -		
147. -		I1	197. -		
148. -		I1	198. -		
149. -		I1	199. -		
150. -		I1	200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 76

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	3SP3/81	I1	7	051.	-			
002.	-	3SP4/81+	P2	7	052.	-			
003.	-	3SP5/82	P1	9	053.	-			
004.	-	3SP6/82	P2	9	054.	-			
005.	-	3SP7/82	P3	10	055.	-			
006.	-	3SP15/82	P2	11	056.	-			
007.	-	3SP16/82	P3	11	057.	-			
008.	-	3SP17/82+	P3	11	058.	-			
009.	-	3SP18/83	P3	11	059.	-			
010.	-	3SP8/82	I2	13	060.	-			
011.	-	3SP9/82	P3	13	061.	-			
012.	-	MS(28)30	P2	22	062.	-			
013.	-	MS(28)31	I2	22	063.	-			
014.	-	MS(28)3	P2	31	064.	-			
015.	-	MS(28)27	P1	31	065.	-			
016.	-	MS(28)34	I1	32	066.	-			
017.	-	MS(28)35	I1	33	067.	-			
128.	-	MS(28)36	I1	34	068.	-			
019.	-	MS(28)37	I2	35	069.	-			
020.	-	MS(28)38	I2	36	070.	-			
021.	-	MS(28)39	I2	37	071.	-			
022.	-	MS(28)44	P2	38	072.	-			
023.	-	MS(120)27	P3	51	073.	-			
024.	-	MS(120)28	P1	53	074.	-			
025.	-	MS(120)29	I1	54	075.	-			
026.	-	MS(120)30	P3	55	076.	-			
027.	-	MS(120)31	P1	56	077.	-			
028.	-	MS(120)33	I2	58	078.	-			
029.	-	MS(120)34	P3	59	079.	-			
030.	-	MS(120)35	P2	60	080.	-			
031.	-	MS(120)36	P1	61	081.	-			
032.	-	MS(120)38	P2	76	082.	-			
033.	-	MS(120)40	I2	78	083.	-			
034.	-	MS(120)42	I2	78	084.	-			
035.	-	MS(120)44	I2	78	085.	-			
036.	-	MS(120)45	P1	92	086.	-			
037.	-	MS(120)47	P2	99	087.	-			
038.	-	MS(120)50	P2	105	088.	-			
039.	-	MS(120)64	P3	118	089.	-			
040.	-	MS(28)48	P2	118	090.	-			
041.	-	MS(28)49	I1	130	091.	-			
042.	-	MS(28)50	I1	132	092.	-			
043.	-	3SP27/125	P3	141	093.	-			
044.	-	3SP33/126	B2	146	094.	-			
045.	-	3SP16/124	I1	157	095.	-			
046.	-	3SP28/125	I1	157	096.	-			
047.	-	3SP32/126	P2	166	097.	-			
048.	-	MS(120)101	P2	167	098.	-			
049.	-	3SP37/126	P2	173	099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 76

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	3SP3/81		051.	-		
002.	-	3SP4/81+	H/15/644	052.	-		
003.	-	3SP5/82	H/110/649	053.	-		
004.	-	3SP6/82	H/110/649	054.	-		
005.	-	3SP7/82	H/84/648	055.	-		
006.	-	3SP15/82	H/83/648	056.	-		
007.	-	3SP16/82	H/129/650	057.	-		
008.	-	3SP17/82+	H/130/650	058.	-		
009.	-	3SP18/83	H/130/650	059.	-		
010.	-	3SP8/82	H/83/648	060.	-		
011.	-	3SP9/82	H/83/648	061.	-		
012.	-	MS(28)30	D/55/96	062.	-		
013.	-	MS(28)31	D/55/96	063.	-		
014.	-	MS(28)3	D/57/96	064.	-		
015.	-	MS(28)27	D/60/97	065.	-		
016.	-	MS(28)34		066.	-		
017.	-	MS(28)35		067.	-		
018.	-	MS(28)36		068.	-		
019.	-	MS(28)37	D/57b/96	069.	-		
020.	-	MS(28)38	D/57a/96	070.	-		
021.	-	MS(28)39	D/57c/96	071.	-		
022.	-	MS(28)44	D/58/96	072.	-		
023.	-	MS(120)27	E/95/77	073.	-		
024.	-	MS(120)28	E/76,77a/473	074.	-		
025.	-	MS(120)29		075.	-		
026.	-	MS(120)30	E/77a/473	076.	-		
027.	-	MS(120)31	E/77b/473	077.	-		
028.	-	MS(120)33	E/77c/473	078.	-		
029.	-	MS(120)34	E/77c/473	079.	-		
030.	-	MS(120)35	E/77c/473	080.	-		
031.	-	MS(120)36	E/77c/473	081.	-		
032.	-	MS(120)38	E/82/474	082.	-		
033.	-	MS(120)40	E/91/475	083.	-		
034.	-	MS(120)42	E/85/474	084.	-		
035.	-	MS(120)44	E/87/474	085.	-		
036.	-	MS(120)45	E/88/474	086.	-		
037.	-	MS(120)47	E/88/474	087.	-		
038.	-	MS(120)50	E/89/474	088.	-		
039.	-	MS(120)64	F/556.6	089.	-		
040.	-	MS(28)48	D/81/100	090.	-		
041.	-	MS(28)49		091.	-		
042.	-	MS(28)50		092.	-		
043.	-	3SP27/125	H/124/650	093.	-		
044.	-	3SP33/126	Bible	094.	-		
045.	-	3SP16/124		095.	-		
046.	-	3SP28/125		096.	-		
047.	-	3SP32/126	H/125/650	097.	-		
048.	-	MS(120)101	I/1/402	098.	-		
049.	-	3SP37/126	K/209.8	099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Ellen White's comments on "The Walk to Emmaus" follow the Scripture account as given in Luke 24:13-33. None of the other gospels relate this episode in the life of Christ though Mark 16:12 probably has this event in mind.

The story of Jesus accompanying the two disciples to Emmaus does not appear in Spiritual Gifts, Volume II. An allusion to the Emmaus experience is to be found in Spiritual Gifts, Volume 4, 1864, but the point of the brief comment is to discuss the physical size and form of the post-resurrection Jesus.¹

Though she preached on the topic on at least one earlier occasion,² Ellen White's first extended treatment of the topic is found in The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, chapter XV, "Jesus at Emmaus."³

This narrative of 108 sentences is only one sentence shorter than the DA account written 20 years later. We have included more than 50 quotes from the SP text in our text presentation. These sentences are indented and labeled 3SP. The next number indicates the sentence when counting from the beginning of the chapter. Following the slash we give the page in 3SP on which the sentence may be found. When only a portion of the SP sentence is quoted we list the

¹Spiritual gifts, Vol. IV, p. 119.

²According to Letter 11, 1875, she preached a sermon on the topic in Oakland, California, on March 26, 1875.

³This same material was reprinted in the Signs of September 19, 1878.

The Walk to Emmaus

clause as (a), (b), or (c), depending on whether the sentence portion may be found at the beginning of the sentence, in the middle, or at the end.

In the years following the publication of the Spirit of Prophecy account Ellen White often referred to the experience of the two disciples from Emmaus. She found the example of Christ's using Scripture to be very appropriate for the church of her time. In the Review and Herald of November 28, 1878, she had an article on "Search the Scriptures" in which she notes how the disciples failed to recognize Jesus because they lacked a thorough knowledge of the Scriptures.¹ The Emmaus story appears to be used in another piece to emphasize how the word of God foretold the coming of the Messiah.²

Space does not permit us to list all of the places in her writings where Ellen White made reference to this experience in the life of Jesus.³ Two further references, however, deserve special mention.

In Signs, January 20, 1888, Ellen White published an

¹RH, Vol. 52, No. 22. Reprinted in Signs, Vol. 7, No. 6, (February 10, 1881). References to this article in the text presentation will carry the identification RH(78) followed by the sentence number.

²Mrs. E. G. White, "The Law Immutable," RH, Vol. 63, No. 37 (September 14, 1886). Reprinted in Signs, Vol. 12, No. 46 (October 21, 1886).

³For example in "Christ the True Vine," Signs, Vol. 13, No. 10 (March 10, 1887); "Light Through Darkness," Great Controversy, 1888 edition, chapter XIX; "The Work of God's People," Signs, Vol. 15, No. 39 (October 14, 1889) and "Value of Bible Study," Signs, Vol. 12, No. 22 (June 10, 1896).

The Walk to Emmaus

article entitled, "Know the Reason of Your Hope." Our study shows that this piece furnished some material for both chapters 83 and 84 of the DA text.¹ The basic text behind DA chapter 83 appears to have been Manuscript 113, 1897. According to the notation at the bottom of page 9, the manuscript was copied by Margaret (Maggie) Hare on October 14, 1897. This manuscript, titled "The Walk to Emmaus," will be identified by the sign, MS(113), followed by the number of the sentence when counting from the beginning of the manuscript. The full text of the manuscript is included in Appendix D.

According to our research only two sources were used in composing the text of this chapter and the earlier writings which feed into it. Once again we find Ellen White leaning upon William Hanna's Life of Christ (1863) and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March (1868). The former source may be identified by the writer's name (Hanna), followed by the initials of the book (LC). March's material will be tagged with his name (March) and the initials (NS).

Neither the earlier Ellen White texts of 3SP and MS 13 nor the writings of Hanna and March divide the content as does the DA text. What Ellen White leaves to the closing paragraphs of chapter 82, "Why Weepest Thou?," or to the opening remarks of chapter 84, "Peace Be Unto You," in the

¹Signs, Vol. 14, No. 3. These sentences will be indicated by ST(88) followed by the appropriate sentence number.

The Walk to Emmaus

DA text, may be found in the sources or in her earlier commentary to be included in the narrative on the Emmaus experience. In order to present the full text of 3SP as well as MS 113 we have included the references to the earlier events of resurrection day as part of the text presentation for this chapter.¹ To do this we begin the text quotations with those relevant passages from MS 113, 1897, and 3SP.

Since DA, chapter 84, is included in the 15 chapters under review, we need not bring those sentences relating to the events following the Emmaus journey into this chapter. They will be included in the text presentation for chapter 84 of the DA text.

A second and final series of sentences from earlier materials not directly related to the DA text follows DA sentence 15b. The 7 sentences from 3SP follow the context of the earlier 3SP sentences which are reflected in the DA text, and further demonstrate Ellen White's use of sources. Several isolated sentences from the 3SP account will be found in various places in our text presentation where they appear best to fit the context. In each instance we have indicated the independence from the DA text by a short broken line in the left margin at the beginning and ending of the quotation.

¹These sentences, largely taken from MS 113, 1897, relate to the latter half of DA chapter 82, "Why Weepest Thou?"

MS(113)1 On the first day of the week after Christ's crucifixion, the disciples had everything to fill their hearts with rejoicing. [M/8,11a/414] (P3)

MS(113)2 But this day wasn't to all a day of joy.
(I2)

MS(113)3 To some it was a day of uncertainty, confusion, and perplexity. [M/11a/414] (P1)

3SP1/206 On this same day Jesus met several of his disciples, and greeted them with "All hail," upon which they approached him and held him by the feet and worshipped him. [Matt. 28:9] (B2)

3SP2/206 He permitted this homage, for he had then ascended to his Father, and had received his approval, and the worship of the holy angels. (I1)

MS(113)4 The apparent unbelief of the disciples in the testimony of the women gives evidence of how low their faith had sunk. [M/9/414] (I2)

MS(113)5 The women brought tidings that a vision of angels had appeared to them, and had positively affirmed that Christ had risen from the dead, and that they themselves had seen Jesus alive in the garden. [M/10/414] (V2)

MS(113)6 But still the disciples seemed unbelieving. [M/10/414] (P1)

MS(113)7 Their hopes had died with Christ. (I1)

MS(113)8 And when the news of his resurrection was brought to them, it was so different from what they had anticipated, that they could not believe it.
[M/11b/414] (P3)

8/414 The brightest morning that ever rose upon a darkened and death-stricken world was the morning when the two Marys ran with wonder and joy from the garden of Joseph to the gate of Jerusalem, to tell the disciples that the tomb was empty and the Lord was risen. [March, NS]

11a/414 The day which might most fitly have been spent in rejoicing was one of confusion and perplexity of mind to them, [March, NS]

12/414 Friday had taken from them their living Master, and now it seemed that Sunday would deprive them of the last sad privilege of embalming his dead body in the tomb. [March, NS]

9/414 The disappointed and disheartened disciples refused to believe the words of the trembling and excited women. [March, NS]

10/414 And when the tidings came again that Mary Magdalene had seen Jesus himself alive in the garden, and that a vision of angels had appeared to others and had positively affirmed the fact of the resurrection, still they believed it not. [March, NS]

11b/414 because the awful and glorious event of the resurrection surpassed the utmost reach of their faith. [March, NS]

DA1/795 Late in the afternoon of the day of the resurrection, two of the disciples were on their way to Emmaus, a little town eight miles from Jerusalem. [M/17/415] (P1)

MS(113)15 In the afternoon of the first day of the week, two of the disciples, restless and unhappy, decided to return to their home in Emmaus, a village about eight miles from Jerusalem. [M/17/415] (P2)

RH(78)1 After the resurrection, two disciples traveling to Emmaus were talking over the disappointed hopes occasioned by the death of the beloved Master. [M/7,9,17/413,414] (P2)

DA2a/795 These disciples had had no prominent place in Christ's work, [H/10/795] (P1)

3SP7a/207 These two disciples had not held a prominent position beside Jesus in his ministry, [H/10/795] (V2)

DA2b/795 but they were earnest believers in Him. [H/11/795] (I2)

3SP7b/208 but they were earnest believers in him. [H/11/795] (I2)

DA3/795 They had come to the city to keep the Passover, and were greatly perplexed by the events that had recently taken place. (I1)

3SP4/206 They had come to the city to keep the passover, and the news of the morning in regard to the removal of the body of Jesus from the sepulcher had greatly perplexed them. [H/32,33/796] (I2)

DA4/795 They had heard the news of the morning in regard to the removal of Christ's body from the tomb, and also the report of the women who had seen the angels and had met Jesus. [H/33/796] (P2)

3SP5/206 This perplexity had been increased by the reports of the women concerning the heavenly messengers, and the appearance of Jesus himself. [H/32,33/796] (P2)

17/415 Late in the afternoon two of the number resolved to give up all further inquiry and suspense, and go home to quiet their excited and weary minds in a little village.
[March, NS]

7/413+ But to human judgment the most dismal night that ever cast its shadows upon the hearts and hopes of men was the last night that the body of Jesus rested in the grave.
[March. NS]

10/795 They had occupied no prominent place beside the Saviour in the course of his ministry. [Hanna, LC]

11/795 They had exhibited no peculiar strength of attachment to him, or to his cause. [Hanna, LC]

32/796 What a confused heap of difficulties must have risen up before these two men's eyes as they reasoned by the way!
[Hanna, LC]

33/796 And then besides, there was what they had heard just before they left the city--the report of some women that they had gone out, and found the sepulchre empty, and had seen angels, who had told them that he was alive. [Hanna, LC]

3SP15/207 And the strange reports of the women threw them into still greater uncertainty. [H/32,33/796] (P3)

DA5/795 They were now returning to their homes to meditate and pray. [M/17/415] (I2)

3SP6/206+ They were now returning to their home to meditate and pray, in hope of gaining some light in reference to these matters which so confused their understanding. [M/17/415] (I2)

DA6/795 Sadly they pursued their evening walk, talking over the scenes of the trial and the crucifixion. [M/18/415] (I2)

MS(113)16 Sad, discouraged, and hopeless, they pursued their evening walk, talking over the scenes of the trial and the crucifixion. [M/18/415] (I1)

DA7/795 Never before had they been so utterly disheartened. [M/7,9/413,414] (P2)

DA8/795 Hopeless and faithless, they were walking in the shadow of the cross. (I1)

ST(88)3 Their way lay over a bleak, barren plain, broken by rugged ridges and dangerous steeps. [M/20/415] (P1)

ST(88)4 The ground was cracked and parched, and loose stones strewed the path. [M/19,20/415] (P1)

DA9a/795 They had not advanced far on their journey when they were joined by a stranger, [M/21/415] (P1)

3SP8a/207 Soon after they began their journey, they observed a stranger coming up behind them, who presently joined their company; [M/21/415] (P1)

ST(88)5a As they ascended the ridge a stranger joined them; [M/21/415] (P1)

17/415 Late in the afternoon two of the number resolved to give up all further inquiry and suspense, and go home to quiet their excited and weary minds in a little village. [March, NS]

18/415 As nearly as can be ascertained they went out of the city at its western gate, and pursued their evening walk with sad looks and heavy hearts. [March, NS]

[See above.]

13/414 Alas! how often do the sad thoughts of the afflicted linger about the grave and cling to the perishable form of the beloved who sleep in Jesus, forgetful of the angel-voice which speaks from the tomb, "He is not here, he is risen!" [March, NS]

19/415 The path which they were to follow was one of the most dreary and desolate in all Palestine. [March, NS]

20/415 First, they had to pass two miles over a bleak and barren level of loose stones and sun-dried earth and naked slabs of rock. [March, NS]

21/415 I think it must have been somewhere on this cheerless mountain ridge, at the beginning of their walk, that they saw a stranger coming up from behind with a quicker step and silently joining their company. [March, NS]

MS(113)21 They had not advanced far on their journey when they were joined by a stranger. [M/21/415]
(P1)

DA9b/795 but they were so absorbed in their gloom and disappointment that they did not observe him closely.
[H/17/795] (P2)

3SP8b/207 but they were so busy with perplexing thoughts, which they were communicating to each other, that they scarcely noticed they were not alone. [M/22/415] (P1)

ST(88)5b but they were so engrossed in reviewing the mournful events of the passover week that they did not notice his presence.
[H/17/795] (P1)

DA10/795 They continued their conversation, expressing the thoughts of their hearts. [M/22/415] (P2)

Dalla/795 They were reasoning in regard to the lessons that Christ had given, [H/24/795] (B1)

DA11b/795 which they seemed unable to comprehend.
[H/32/796] (P2)

3SP11a/207 The disciples were reasoning with each other concerning the events of the past few days,
[H/24/795] (P1)

DA12/795 As they talked of the events that had taken place, Jesus longed to comfort them. [H/21/795] (I2)

DA13/795+ He had seen their grief; He understood the conflicting, perplexing ideas that brought to their minds the thought, Can this Man, who suffered Himself to be so humiliated, be the Christ? [H/23-26/795] (I2)

3SP11b/207 and marveling how the fact of Jesus yielding himself up to a shameful death could be reconciled with his claims as the Son of God.
[H/26/785] (I2)

17/795 But they are so intent upon the topic which engrosses them, that they notice not a stranger has overtaken them, and been in part a listener to their discourse. [Hanna, LC]

22/415 They were so busy with their sad thoughts, and he was so gentle and courteous in his approach, that they kept on in their conversation as if they were still alone. [March, NS]

24/795 It is especially noticed that it was while they communed together, and reasoned with one another, that Jesus himself drew near to them. [Hanna, LC]

32/796 What a confused heap of difficulties must have risen up before these two men's eyes as they reasoned by the way! [Hanna, LC]

21/795 And now it is to these two disciples in their sorrow that he joins himself: so early did the risen Saviour assume the gracious office of comforting those who mourn, of binding up the broken heart. [Hanna, LC]

23/795 Mary's was the grief of a grateful and affectionate heart, mourning the loss of one beloved; Peter's was the grief of a spirit smitten with the sense of a great offence committed; the grief of the two disciples was that of men disappointed, perplexed, thrown into despondency and unbelief. [Hanna, LC]

24/795 It is especially noticed that it was while they communed together, and reasoned with one another, that Jesus himself drew near to them. [Hanna, LC]

25/795 There was much about which they well might differ and dispute. [Hanna, LC]

26/795 The yielding of their Master to the power of his enemies, and his shameful crucifixion two days before, how could they reconcile with his undoubted pretensions and power, as a prophet so mighty in words and deeds? [Hanna, LC]

MS(113)26 He had seen their grief, and understood the conflicting, perplexing ideas that brought to their minds the thought, Can this man, who suffered himself to be so humiliated and so cruelly treated be the Christ? [H/23-26/795] (I2)

MS(113)20 They were filled with gloomy forebodings for the future. [H/27/795] (P2)

3SP12/207 One maintained that he could be no pretender, but had been himself deceived in regard to his mission and his future glory. [H/27,28/795+] (P2)

3SP13/207 They both feared that what his enemies had flung in his teeth was too true--"He saved others; himself he cannot save". [H/31/796] (P1)

3SP14/207 Yet they wondered how he could be so mistaken in himself, when he had given them such repeated evidence that he could read the hearts of others. [H/29/796] (P2)

3SP16a/207 Long might these disciples have perplexed themselves over the mysteries of the past few days, [H/42/796] (P1)

3SP16b/207 if they had not received enlightenment from Jesus. [H/43/796] (P2)

3SP17a/207 He, disguised as a stranger, entered into conversation with them. [H/43,44/796] (P1)

DA14/796 Their grief could not be restrained, and they wept. (I1)

DA15a/796 Jesus knew that their hearts were bound up with Him in love, (I1)

DA15b/796 and He longed to wipe away their tears, and fill them with joy and gladness. [H/19-21/795] (P2)

[See above.]

27/795+ This one, that other saying of his pointing to a future, never now, as they fancied, to be realized, what could they make of them? [Hanna, LC]

28/796 Had Jesus himself been disappointed, deceived; had he imagined that the people would rise on his behalf, and prevent his crucifixion? [Hanna, LC]

31/796 There was truth, too, in what so many of them had flung reproachfully in his teeth, as he hung upon the cross: He had saved others, why did he not save himself? [Hanna, LC]

29/796 That might have been, had he not so often shown that he knew all that was passing in men's hearts. [Hanna, LC]

42/796 For hours and hours, for days and days, they might have remained together without clearing up the difficulties that beset them. [Hanna, LC]

43/796 But now, in pity and in love, the great Enlightener himself appears--appears in the garb of a stranger who joins them by the way. [Hanna, LC]

44/796 They do not at first, they do not at all through the earnest conversation which follows, recognize him. [Hanna, LC]

19/795 That sadness, who can tell what power it had in drawing the Man of sorrows to their side? [Hanna, LC]

20/795 It was to Mary, weeping in her lonely grief; to Peter, drowned in tears of penitence, that he had already appeared. [Hanna, LC]

21/795 And now it is to these two disciples in their sorrow that he joins himself; so early did the risen Saviour assume the gracious office of comforting those who mourn, of binding up the broken heart. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(113)28b and he longed to take them in his arms and wipe away their tears, and put joy and gladness in their hearts. [H/19-21/795] (P2)

DA16/796 But He must first give them lessons they would never forget. [H/66/798] (I2)

DA17/796 "He said unto them, What manner of communications are these that ye have one to another, as ye walk, and are sad?" (B2)

DA18/796 "And the one of them, whose name was Cleopas, answering said unto Him, Art Thou only a stranger in Jerusalem, and hast not known the things which are come to pass there in these days?" (B2)

RH(78)5a They were astonished at the question, [H/69/798] (I2)

DA19a/796 They told Him of their disappointment in regard to their Master, [H/73/799] (P1)

DA19b/796 "which was a prophet mighty in deed and word before God and all the people;" (B2)

DA19c/796 but "the chief priests and our rulers," they said, "delivered Him to be condemned to death, and have crucified Him." (B2)

RH(78)5b,c and asked if he were indeed a stranger in Jerusalem and had not heard that a prophet mighty in word and in deed had been taken by wicked hands and crucified. [H/70/798] (I2)

DA20/796 With hearts sore with disappointment, and with quivering lips, they added, "We trusted that it had been He which should have redeemed Israel: and beside all this, today is the third day since these things were done." (B2)

DA21/796 Strange that the disciples did not remember Christ's words, and realize that He had foretold the events which had come to pass! [H/80a/799] (I2)

[See above.]

66/798 For a reason however, hereafter to be alluded to, our Lord purposely concealed himself till his work of instruction was completed, and drew a veil of some kind over their eyes, which hindered their discovery of him by the way. [Hanna, LC]

69/798 Little need, thought one of them (his own deep interest in them leading him, perhaps, to exaggerate that felt by the general community)--little need of asking such a question. [Hanna, LC]

73/799 Thus it is, by questions needless for him on his own account to put, but very useful to them to answer, that Jesus draws out from them that statement, which at once reveals the extent of their ignorance and incredulity, but at the same time, the amount of their belief, the strength of their attachment to Christ, and the bitterness of that grief which the disappointment of their expectations regarding him had created. [Hanna, LC]

70/798 Of what could any two men leaving Jerusalem, only two days after that crucifixion had occurred--of what else than of it, and him the Crucified, could they be talking? [Hanna, LC]

80a/799 Slow of heart indeed, and difficult to convince had they been, who, after such explicit declaration of his own beforehand, [Hanna, LC]

DA22/796 They did not realize that the last part of His disclosure would be just as verily fulfilled as the first part, that the third day He would rise again. [H/80b/799] (I2)

DA23/796 This was the part they should have remembered. (I1)

DA24/796 The priests and rulers did not forget this. (I1)

DA25/796 On the day "that followed the day of the preparation, the chief priests and Pharisees came together unto Pilate, saying, Sir, we remember that that deceiver said, while He was yet alive, After three days I will rise again." Matt. 27:62, 63. (B2)

DA26/796 But the disciples did not remember these words. (I1)

DA27/796 "Then He said unto them, O fools, and slow of heart to believe all that the prophets have spoken: ought not Christ to have suffered these things, and to enter into His glory?" (B2)

DA28/796 The disciples wondered who this stranger could be, that He should penetrate to their very souls, and speak with such earnestness, tenderness, and sympathy, and with such hopefulness. [M/25a,24/416] (P1)

DA29/796 For the first time since Christ's betrayal, they began to feel hopeful. (I1)

DA30/796 Often they looked earnestly at their companion, and thought that His words were just the words that Christ would have spoken. (I1)

DA31/796 They were filled with amazement, and their hearts began to throb with joyful expectation. [M/25b/416] (I2)

3SP26/208 The disciples were silent from amazement and delight. [M/25b/416] (P2)

80b/799 that he should be delivered up to the rulers, and suffer many things at their hands, and be crucified, and rise again the third day, had nevertheless remained so obstinate in their incredulity. [Hanna, LC]

24/415+ He gently drew from them the cause of their grief, and in a few moments he entered into their feelings with so much earnestness, tenderness and sympathy that their hearts burned within them while he spoke. [March, NS]

25a/416 They wondered who he could be, [March, NS]

25b/416 and they expressed their wonder by silent glances at each other, while he went on with them and talked all the way. [March, NS]

3SP27/208 They did not venture to ask the stranger who he was. [M/26/416] (P1)

3SP28a/208 They listened to him intently, charmed by his intelligence, and drawn toward him by his gracious words and manner, [M/26/416] (I2)

3SP62a/212g As the disciples walked on with Jesus, listening intently to his gracious words, [M/26,27/416] (I2)

3SP28b/208 as he opened the Scriptures to their understanding, showing them from prophecy how Christ must suffer, and after suffering enter into his glory. [M/26b/416] [Cf. H/84/799] (V2)

DA32/796 Beginning at Moses, the very Alpha of Bible history, Christ expounded in all the Scriptures the things concerning Himself. [H/86/799] (B1)

DA33/796+ Had He first made Himself known to them, their hearts would have been satisfied. (I1)

DA34/799 In the fullness of their joy they would have hungered for nothing more. (I1)

3SP89/214 Jesus did not first reveal himself in his true character to them, and then open the Scriptures to their minds; for he knew that they would be so overjoyed to see him again, risen from the dead, that their souls would be satisfied. [H/104/801] (I2)

DA35/799 But it was necessary for them to understand the witness borne to Him by the types and prophecies of the Old Testament. (I1)

DA36/799 Upon these their faith must be established. (I1)

DA37/799 Christ performed no miracle to convince them, but it was His first work to explain the Scriptures. (I1)

26/416 But they did not dare to ask him, or in any way to interrupt the flow of his gracious words, while he opened to them the Scriptures, and showed them how Christ must needs suffer and by suffering enter into his glory. [March, NS]

27/416 And so the three walked on together, the delighted and wondering disciples not knowing that they were listening to their lamented and risen Lord. [March, NS]

18/795 At last, in manner the easiest and most natural, least calculated to give offence, expressive at once of interest and sympathy, Jesus breaks in upon their discourse with the inquiry, "What manner of communications are these that ye have to one another, as ye walk and are sad?" [Hanna, LC]

84/799 To rectify that error, it was only required that they should be made to see that the predicted triumph and glory were alone to be reached through the dark avenues of suffering and of death. [Hanna, LC]

86/799 "And beginning at Moses and all the prophets, he expounded to them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself." [Hanna, LC]

104/801 Why, instead of doing as he did with the eleven, first manifesting himself, and then opening their understanding to understand the Scriptures, did he keep himself unknown all the time that the work of exposition was going on? [Hanna, LC]

DA38/799 They had looked upon His death as the destruction of all their hopes. (11)

3SP46/210 Their preconceived views led them to look upon his crucifixion as the final destruction of all their hopes. [H/83/799] (P3)

DA39/799 Now He showed them from the prophets that this was the very strongest evidence for their faith. (11)

DA40/799 In teaching these disciples, Jesus showed the importance of the Old Testament as a witness to His mission. [H/87/799+] (P2)

3SP30b/208+ but he went back to the prophecies, and gave a full and clear explanation of them to settle the question of his identity, and the fact that all which had occurred to him was foretold by the inspired writers. [H/87/799+] (P2)

DA41/799 Many professed Christians now discard the Old Testament, claiming that it is no longer of any use. [H/88/800] (12)

DA42/799 But such is not Christ's teaching. [H/88/800] (P3)

DA43/799 So highly did He value it that at one time He said, "If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded, though one rose from the dead." Luke 16:31. [H/95b/800] (B1)

DA44/799 It is the voice of Christ that speaks through patriarchs and prophets, from the days of Adam even to the closing scenes of time. (11)

DA45/799 The Saviour is revealed in the Old Testament as clearly as in the New. (11)

DA46/799 It is the light from the prophetic past that brings out the life of Christ and the teachings of the New Testament with clearness and beauty. (11)

[See above.]

83/799 The one great, misleading prejudice of the disciples had been their belief that the path of the promised Messiah was only to be one of triumph and of glory. [Hanna, LC]

87/799+ Either Christ, then, is not himself to be believed--in which case it were useless to hear and read anything about him--or in those Old Testament Scriptures there are to be seen everywhere prophetic fingers pointing forward to Him. [Hanna, LC]

88/800 To search those Scriptures, and to find little or nothing there of Christ, little or nothing to show how it behooved him to suffer, and then to enter into his glory, is to handle them after a very different fashion from that in which they were handled by our Lord himself. [Hanna, LC]

95b and may we not be sure that if we believe not them, neither would we be persuaded though one rose from the dead, as Jesus that morning had done, and should teach us even as he taught those two disciples? [Hanna, LC]

DA47/799 The miracles of Christ are a proof of His divinity; but a stronger proof that He is the world's Redeemer is found in comparing the prophecies of the Old Testament with the history of the New. (I1)

DA48/799 Reasoning from prophecy, Christ gave His disciples a correct idea of what He was to be in humanity. (I1)

DA49/799 Their expectation of a Messiah who was to take His throne and kingly power in accordance with the desires of men had been misleading. (I1)

DA50/799 It would interfere with a correct apprehension of His descent from the highest to the lowest position that could be occupied. (I1)

3SP39/210 A careful search of the prophecies would have so enlightened the understanding of the Jews that they would have recognized Jesus as the predicted Messiah. [H/92/800] (I2)

DA51/799 Christ desired that the ideas of His disciples might be pure and true in every specification. (I1)

DA52/799 They must understand as far as possible in regard to the cup of suffering that had been apportioned to Him. (I1)

3SP42/210 These misinterpreted prophecies were now made plain to the understanding of the two disciples, by Him who, through his Holy Spirit, inspired man to write them. [H/94/800] (I2)

DA53/799 He showed them that the awful conflict which they could not yet comprehend was the fulfillment of the covenant made before the foundation of the world was laid. (I1)

DA54/799 Christ must die, as every transgressor of the law must die if he continues in sin. (I1)

DA55/799 All this was to be, but it was not to end in defeat, but in glorious, eternal victory. (I1)

92/800 One or two of the leading prophecies about the Messiah, such as that first one of God himself in paradise, as to the seed of the woman and the serpent; such as that of Moses as to the raising up of a prophet like unto himself; such as that of Isaiah, when he saw his glory, and testified beforehand of the sufferings by which that glory should be preceded and entered; such as that of Daniel about the Messiah being cut off, but not for himself--Jesus may have quoted. [Hanna, LC]

94/800 As we think who the expounder in that instance was, and what the materials of his exposition, how natural the expression, Would that I had heard all these things concerning Christ illustrated by Christ himself! [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA56/799 Jesus told them that every effort must be made to save the world from sin. (I1)

DA57/799 His followers must live as He lived, and work as He worked, with intense, persevering effort. (I1)

DA58/800 Thus Christ discoursed to His disciples, opening their minds that they might understand the Scriptures. (I1)

DA59/800 The disciples were weary, but the conversation did not flag. (I1)

DA60/800 Words of life and assurance fell from the Saviour's lips. (I1)

DA61/800 But still their eyes were holden. (B2)

3SP18/207 "But their eyes were holden that they should not know him." (B2)

DA62/800 As He told them of the overthrow of Jerusalem, they looked upon the doomed city with weeping. [M/31/416] (I2)

ST(88)25 They are surprised to find their burdened hearts becoming light; and as they think of Jesus, of all he was to them, of all he suffered, their tears flow freely.
[M/31/416] (I2)

DA63/800 But little did they yet suspect who their traveling companion was. [M/27,30/416] (P2)

DA64/800 They did not think that the subject of their conversation was walking by their side; for Christ referred to Himself as though He were another person. [H/98/800] (I2)

DA65/800 They thought that He was one of those who had been in attendance at the great feast, and who was now returning to his home. [M/30/416] (P1)

31/416 Having passed over the rocky platform immediately west of Jerusalem, on what is now the Ramleh road, they turn to take their last look of the city and (brush away a silent tear at the fresh remembrance of all they had seen and suffered there within the last few days). [March, NS]

30/416 Nothing in his dress or manner or person leads them to suspect that he can be anything else than one of the pilgrims returning from the great feast to some distant home. [March, NS]

98/800+ Two of them are men in humble attire, travelling in the humblest fashion, returning to one of the humblest village-homes; and the third, there is nothing about him different in appearance from the other two; nothing to keep them from conversing with him as an equal, one with whom the most unrestrained familiarity might be used. [Hanna, LC]

3SP62b/212 nothing in his bearing suggested to them that they were listening to other than a casual pilgrim, returning from the feast, but one who thoroughly understood the prophecies. [M/26,30/416] (P2)

ST(88)49b and there was nothing in his dress or his manner to lead the disciples to suspect that he was any other than one of the many pilgrims returning from the great feast. [M/26,27,30/416] (V2)

DA66/800 He walked as carefully as they over the rough stones, now and then halting with them for a little rest. [M/29/416] (P2)

3SP63/212 He walked as carefully as they over the rough stones, halting with them for a little rest after climbing some unusually steep place. [M/28,29/416] (P2)

ST(88)49a He had labored up the toilsome steeps; he had moved with equal caution down the precipitous path, [M/29/416] (V2)

DA67/800 Thus they proceeded along the mountainous road, while the One who was soon to take His position at God's right hand, and who could say, "All power is given Me in heaven and in earth," walked beside them. [M/32-35/416,17] (P1)

ST(88)39 The divine Son of God, the resurrected Saviour, who walked with the sorrowing disciples up and down the steeps that intercepted the journey to Emmaus, is our compassionate Saviour. [M/35/417] (P1)

ST(88)47 The three weary travelers had walked together. [M/27,50/417,18] (P1)

ST(88)48 The Son of God was one with them. [M/35/417] (P1)

[See above]

28/416 They hear his step upon the stony road just like their own. [March, NS]

29/416 He labors with panting breath in climbing the steep place, and he moves with cautious tread in descending the slippery path, just as they do. [March, NS]

32/416 Then they plunge down into a narrow glen and make their way cautiously over a dreary waste of bare ledges and confused drifts of gravel and rubble stone. [March, NS]

33/416+ They cross the dry bed of a torrent, and then climb slowly up a winding and zig-zig path cut in the limestone rock to the crest of another ridge. [March, NS]

34/417 This height is no sooner gained than they begin another descent, again to climb a long, steep and winding track over loose stones and ledges that have been worn smooth by winter rains and spring torrents and the feet of travelers for centuries. [March, NS]

35/417 And all the way the Divine Saviour, the Son of God who could say, "All power is given unto me in heaven and in earth," walks with these two men, taking as many steps as they, and talking all the while as they go up and down the steep places together. [March, NS]

3SP88/214 He who had endured the conflict of the garden, the shame of the cross, and who had gained the victory over death and the tomb--He, before whom angels had fallen prostrate, worshiping with thanksgiving and praise, had sought the two lonely and desponding disciples, and been in their presence for hours, teaching and comforting them, yet they had not known him. [H/100,101/801] [Cf. M/36,37/417] (I2)

3SP65/212 This mighty conqueror of death, who had reached to the very depths of human misery to rescue a lost world, assumed the humble task of walking with the two disciples to Emmaus, to teach and comfort them. [M/37/417] (I2)

3SP66/212 Thus he ever identifies himself with his suffering and perplexed people. [M/37/417] (P2)

3SP67/212 In our hardest and most trying paths, lo, Jesus is with us to smoothe the way. [M/37/417] (P2)

3SP68/212 He is the same Son of Man, with the same sympathies and love which he had before he passed through the tomb and ascended to his Father. [M/38,39/417] (P1)

DA68/800 During the journey the sun had gone down, and before the travelers reached their place of rest, the laborers in the fields had left their work. [M/40/417] (V2)

3SP69/212 At length, as the sun was going down, the disciples with their companion arrived at their home. [M/40/417] (P1)

ST(88)44 The sun sinks behind the hills and they near their destination. [M/40/417] (P1)

3SP70a/212 The way had never before seemed so short to them, [H/110/801] (P1)

3SP70b/212 nor had time ever passed so quickly. [H/111/801] (P2)

99/801 Yet who is he? [Hanna, LC]

100/801 He who that very morning had burst the barriers of the grave; he in honor of whose exit from the tomb angels from heaven had been despatched to watch at the foot and at the head of the sacred spot, where in death his body had for a time reposed; he who was now upon his way to enter into that glory which he had with the Father before the world was--incarnate Deity fresh from the conflicts and the victories of the garden, the cross, the sepulchre. [Hanna, LC]

101/801 It is literally God walking with men, men walking, though they knew it not, with God. [Hanna, LC]

36/417 He spends more time in this long and laborious conversation with these two sad and despondent men than with all others on the first day of his resurrection life. [March, NS]

37/417 This mighty Conqueror of death, who had unbarred the gates of the tomb for a lost world, would thus teach us his readiness to be with us and comfort our hearts in the hardest paths we have to tread. [March, NS]

38/417 In his risen and glorified state he is still the Son of Man, having all the sympathies and affections of the human heart. [March, NS]

39/417 He is still as near to those who desire his company as he was before he passed through the awful transformation of the cross and the tomb. [March, NS]

40/417+ The sun has gone down behind the gray hill-tops, and the shadows of evening have begun to deepen in the narrow valleys, and the laborers have left the terraced orchards and vineyards on the hill-sides before the two travelers reach their home. [March NS]

110/801 But they are at the village now, and the road had never appeared so short. [Hanna, LC]

111/801+ Had they imagined they could be there so soon, they would have lingered on the road. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA69/800 As the disciples were about to enter their home, the stranger appeared as though He would continue His journey. [H/112/802] (B1)

DA70/800 But the disciples felt drawn to Him. [H/114/802] (P2)

ST(88)45 They cannot endure the thought of separation. [H/114/802] (P2)

DA71/800 Their souls hungered to hear more from Him. [H/115/802] (P2)

3SP71/212 The stranger made no sign of halting; but the disciples could not endure the thought of parting so soon from one who had inspired their hearts with new hope and joy, and they urged him to remain with them over night. [H/112-116/802] (P2)

DA72/800 "Abide with us," they said. (B2)

DA73/800 He did not seem to accept the invitation, but they pressed it upon Him, urging, "It is toward evening, and the day is far spent." [H/116/802] (B1)

DA74/800 Christ yielded to this entreaty and "went in to tarry with them." [Luke 24:29c] [H/120/802] (B1)

3SP74/213 Jesus yielded to their entreaties and entered their humble abode. [M/49,50a/418] [Cf. H/120,122/802] (P2)

ST(88)50 He enters the lowly home, and is seated before the humble board. [M/49,50/418] [Cf. H/122/802] (P1)

DA75/800 Had the disciples failed to press their invitation, they would not have known that their traveling companion was the risen Lord. [M/41/418] (P1)

RH(78)12 Had the disciples been indifferent in regard to their fellow-traveler, they would have lost the precious opportunity of recognizing their companion who had reasoned so ably from the Scriptures regarding his life, his suffering, and his death and resurrection. [M/41/418] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - SOURCES

112/802 And now this stranger, whose discourse had so beguiled the way, and made their hearts so burn within them, makes as if he would go farther. [Hanna, LC]

113/801 Emmaus, it would seem, is not his resting place. [Hanna, LC]

114/802 But how can they part from him? [Hanna, LC]

115/802 How may that conversation, which has shed such fresh light into their understandings, such a new hope into their hearts, be prolonged? [Hanna, LC]

116/802 They invite, they urge him to remain. [Hanna, LC]

120/802 The two disciples constrain him, and he goes in apparently to abide with them. [Hanna, LC]

49/418 When asked he entered without delay. [March, NS]

50/418 The three weary traveler sat down together in that lowly cottage home, and the mysterious stranger continued to speak his heart-burning words while waiting for the evening meal. [March, NS]

122/802 The humble table is quickly spread. [Hanna, LC]

41/481 He would have gone farther, and they would not have recognized their Lord had they not yielded to the impulse which his words had kindled in their hearts and urged him to stay. [March, NS]

DA76/800 Christ never forces His company upon anyone.
[M/42/418] (V2)

ST(88)42b but he never forces his company upon any. [M/42/418] (V2)

DA77/800 He interests Himself in those who need Him. [M/43b/418] (P1)

ST(88)40 He knows whose hearts are burdened with sorrows and disappointed hopes.
[M/43b/417] (P2)

ST(88)42a He presses close to the believing mourner who yearns for his presence;
[M/43a/418] (P3)

DA78/800 Gladly will He enter the humblest home, and cheer the lowliest heart. [M/45/418] (P1)

3SP77/213 If they, with longing desire, entreat him to abide with them he will enter the humblest homes, and brighten the lowliest hearts. [M/44,45,43b/418] (P1)

DA79/800 But if men are too indifferent to think of the heavenly Guest, or ask Him to abide with them, He passes on.
[M/43c/418] (P1)

DA80/800 Thus many meet with great loss. (I1)

DA81/800 They do not know Christ any more than did the disciples as He walked with them by the way. [M/44,47/418] (I2)

3SP78/213 While waiting for the evening meal, Jesus continued to open the Scriptures to his hosts, bringing forward the evidence of his divinity, and unfolding to them the plan of salvation. [M/50b/418] (I2)

ST(88)51 While the meal is preparing, words that stir and warm the heart flow from his lips. [M/50b/418] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - SOURCES

42/418 He never forces himself upon any. [March, NS]

43a/418 He joins the company of many who are toiling along the hard journey of life, [March, NS]

43b/418 he interests himself in the sorrows that press them down, he warms their hearts with his words of love, [March, NS]

43c/481 but if they fail to ask him to abide with them, he passes on and they know him not. [March, NS]

44/418 It is toward evening, and the day of life is far spent with some to whom Jesus has often drawn near in the way; the shadows of evening are gathering thick around them, and yet they have never said to him with earnest and longing desire, "Abide with us." [March, NS]

45/481 The humblest home becomes a palace fit for a king when Jesus enters in to tarry there. [March, NS]

47/418 Blessed is the home and sweet is the rest of those who let no evening pass without offering the prayer to him who walked from Jerusalem to Emmaus with the two disciples: "Abide with us." [March, NS]

50/418 The three weary travelers sat down together in that lowly cottage home, and the mysterious stranger continued to speak his heart-burning words while waiting for the evening meal. [March, NS]

DA82/800 The simple evening meal of bread is soon prepared.
[M/50,51/418] (P1)

3SP79a/213 The simple fare was soon ready,
[M/51/418] [H/122/802] (P1)

RH(78)10a The evening meal was quickly prepared, [H/122/802] [M/50/418] (P1)

DA83/800 It is placed before the guest, who has taken His seat at the head of the table. [H/123,124/802] (P2)

3SP79b/213 and the three took their position at the table, Jesus taking his place at the head as was his custom. [H/123,124/802] (I2)

3SP80a/213 The duty of asking a blessing upon the food usually devolved upon the head of the family;
[H/123/802] (P2)

DA84/800 Now He puts forth His hands to bless the food.
[M/51b/418] (V2)

DA85/800 The disciples start back in astonishment.
[M/52/419] (P1)

MS(113)85 Why do the disciples start back in astonishment? [M/52/419] (V2)

DA86/800 Their companion spreads forth His hands in exactly the same way as their Master used to do. [H/126/802] (P2)

3SP82/213 Surely none other than their Lord had ever done in this manner. [H/126/802] (P2)

DA87/800 They look again, and lo, they see in His hands the print of nails. [M/53/419] (P1)

ST(88)55 They recognize his voice.
[M/54/419] (P1)

ST(88)56 The words, the tone, the manner, are all familiar. [M/54/419] (P1)

51a/418+ When bread, the simple fare of the poor, was set before them, [March, NS]

122/802 The humble table is quickly spread. [Hanna, LC]

123/802 This is the home, it has been thought, of one of the two disciples, and he whose home it is prepares to do the duty of the host. [Hanna, LC]

124/802 That duty is taken out of his hands. [Hanna, LC]

51b/418+ he put forth his hands to bless it. [March, NS]

125/802 The mysterious stranger takes the bread; he blesses, he breaks, he gives. [Hanna, LC]

52/419 But what now so suddenly startles the wondering disciples? [March, NS]

126/802 Who but One could bless and break and give in such a way as this? [Hanna, LC]

53/419 They see the print of the nails in the open palms, the sign and scar of the cross. [March, NS]

54/419 And now that he breathes forth the blessing they recognize the tone, the manner, the look. [March, NS]

55/419 It is he who hung upon the cross! [March, NS]

DA88/800 Both exclaim at once, It is the Lord Jesus! (I1)

ST(88)57 It is the Master himself.
[H/128/802] (P1)

DA89/800 He has risen from the dead! [M/56,57/419] (P1)

ST(88)58 He whom they had placed in Joseph's new tomb lives before them. [M/56,57/419]
(P1)

3SP86/213 Now they know that they have been walking and talking with the risen Redeemer. [M/57/419]
(P2)

ST(88)59 They had walked with their risen Saviour from Jerusalem to Emmaus. [M/57/419]
(P1)

DA90a/801 They rise to cast themselves at His feet and worship Him, [M/58/419] (P1)

3SP85a/213 For a moment they are spell-bound; then they arise to fall at his feet and worship him;
[H/129/802] (P1)

DA90b/801 but He has vanished out of their sight.
[M/59/419] [H/132/802] (B1)

3SP85b/213 but he suddenly disappears from their midst. [H/131/802] (P2)

3SP91/214 He maintained his disguise till he had interpreted the Scriptures, and had led them to an intelligent faith in his life, his character, his mission to earth, and his death and resurrection. [H/103/801] (I2)

3SP92a/214 He wished the truth to take firm root in their minds, not because it was supported by his personal testimony, [H/105/801] (P1)

128/802 'Tis he, their own lost but now recovered Lord and Master. [Hanna, LC]

56/419 It is he whose body was laid in the tomb! [March, NS]

57/419 He lives, and they have been walking with him all the way! [March, NS]

58/419 Now they are ready to cast themselves in wonder and in worship at his feet. [March, NS]

129/802 Let him wait but a moment or two, they shall be clasping him, as Mary would fain have done, to their hearts, or, falling down, as the women did, and worshipping at his feet. [Hanna, LC]

131/802 He reveals himself, and disappears. [Hanna, LC]

132/802 This moment known by them, the next vanishing from their sight. [Hanna, LC]

103/801 But why was that disguise adopted, and, in this instance, so long preserved? [Hanna, LC]

105/801 May it not have been to obtain such a simple, natural, easy access for the truth into these two men's minds and hearts, as to give it, even when unsupported by the weight of his own personal authority, a firmer and securer hold? [Hanna, LC]

3SP93/214 When the object of his labors with the two disciples was gained, he revealed himself to them that their joy might be full, and then vanished from their sight. [M/59/419] (P2)

3SP94/215 When these disciples left Jerusalem, to return to their homes, they intended to take up their old employment again, and conceal their blighted hopes as best they could. [H/1/802] (P2)

DA91/801 They look at the place which had been occupied by One whose body had lately lain in the grave, and say to each other, "Did not our heart burn within us, while He talked with us by the way, and while He opened to us the Scriptures?" (I1)

DA92/881 But with this great news to communicate they cannot sit and talk. [H/4/803] (I2)

3SP97b/215 for they could not tarry in their homes and hold their newly found knowledge from the other disciples. [H/4/803] [M/62/419] (P2)

DA93/801 Their weariness and hunger are gone. [M/60,61/419] (P1)

3SP97a/215 They forgot their hunger and fatigue, and left the prepared repast, [M/60,61/419] (P2)

ST(88)64 Discouragement is gone. [M/60/419] (P2)

DA94/801 They leave their meal untasted, and full of joy immediately set out again on the same path by which they came, hurrying to tell the tidings to the disciples in the city. [M/60-63/419] (P1)

3SP99a/215 Late as it was, they set about retracing their way to Jerusalem; [H/5,6/803] (P1)

ST(88)65 They stop not for food, nor feel they the need of it, but hasten to retrace their steps over the rough path so lately trodden with Jesus. [H/6/803] [M/63/419] (P2)

59/419 But the object of his appearance and his long reasoning with them by the way is gained, and he vanishes out of their sight. [March, NS]

1/802 When they left Jerusalem on the afternoon of the first day of the week, the two disciples had intended to remain that night, perhaps permanently, at Emmaus. [Hanna, LC]

4/803 They could not stay at Emmaus. [Hanna, LC]

60/419 And now, that this great joy has filled their hearts, their weariness and their discouragement are all gone. [March, NS]

61/419 They have no thought of hunger or of rest. [March, NS]

62/419 They must hurry back to tell the tidings to their brethren in the city. [March, NS]

63/419 In a moment they are out again upon the stony path with their faces toward Jerusalem. [March, NS]

5/803 Late as it was, they instantly arose and returned to Jerusalem. [Hanna, LC]

6/803 How quickly, how eagerly would they retrace their steps! [Hanna, LC]

DA95/801 In some parts the road is not safe, but they climb over the steep places, slipping on the smooth rocks.
[M/69/420] (P1)

DA96/801 They do not see, they do not know, that they have the protection of Him who has traveled the road with them.
[H/8,9/803] (I2)

3SP100/215 Jesus was by their side, but they knew it not. [H/8,9/803] (P2)

3SP101/215 He heard with gladness their expressions of joy and gratitude as they talked with each other by the way. [H/9/803] (P2)

3SP104/215 They picked their way over the rough stones, and the dangerous ledges, sometimes stumbling and falling in their haste. [M/69/420] (P2)

DA97/801 With their pilgrim staff in hand, they press on, desiring to go faster than they dare. [M/69/420] (P2)

DA98/801 They lose their track, but find it again.
[M/69/420] (I2)

DA99/801 Sometimes running, sometimes stumbling, they press forward, their unseen Companion close beside them all the way. [M/69,72/420] [H/8,9/803] (P2)

3SP99b/215 but how different were their feelings now from those which depressed them when they set out upon their way to Emmaus. [H/7/803] (P2)

DA100/801 The night is dark, but the Sun of Righteousness is shining upon them. [M/64-66/419] (I2)

MS(113)95 The moon has set, but the Sun of Righteousness has shone upon them. [M/64,65/419]
(I2)

3SP103/215 There was no moon to light them, but their hearts were light with the joy of a new revelation. [M/64-66/419] (P1)

69/420 They hurry along the wild mountain road, plunging into dark glens, climbing over steep ridges, bending around shadowy hills, sometimes stepping from stone to stone, feeling the way in the dark with the pilgrim's staff, and sometimes slipping upon the smooth face of the steep ledges, and then losing the track in crossing the dry bed of a torrent. [March, NS]

8/803 The stranger who had made their hearts burn within them, on their way out to the village, he too was traversing at the same time the road they took on their way back to Jerusalem. [Hanna, LC]

9/803 But he did not join them now; he left them to muse in silence on all they had seen and heard, or to add to each other's wonder, gratitude, and gladness, by talking to one another by the way. [Hanna, LC]

72/420 And well they might go, running when they could, climbing and descending with cautious step when they must, but rejoicing all the way. [March, NS]

7/803 What manner of communications would those be that they would now have with one another; how different from those which Jesus had interrupted; the incredulity turned now into faith, the sadness into joy. [Hanna, LC]

64/419 It is now night, and the moon which was full four days ago, has not yet risen. [March, NS].

65/419 But it is all light in the glad hearts of the disciples who have seen their risen Lord. March, NS]

66/419 The sad looks and sorrowful words with which they went out in the bright afternoon are all exchanged for exultations of joy, now that they are coming back in the dark night. [March, NS]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 83 - ELLEN G. WHITE

ST(88)69 Their hearts are all light, and joy, and peace. [M/65/419] (P2)

DA101/801 Their hearts leap for joy. [M/65,66/419] (P1)

DA102/801 They seem to be in a new world. [M/67/419] (P1)

DA103/801 Christ is a living Saviour. [M/67/419] (P2)

ST(88)68 He has risen from the dead. [M/67/419] (P1)

DA104/801 They no longer mourn over Him as dead. (I1)

DA105/801 Christ is risen--over and over again they repeat it. (I1)

DA106/801 This is the message they are carrying to the sorrowing ones. [M/68/419] (P2)

ST(88)66 They have a message of joy to carry to their mourning brethren. [M/68/419] (P1)

DA107/801 They must tell them the wonderful story of the walk to Emmaus. [H/10/803] (P2)

3SP107/215 They longed to deliver their precious message to their friends. [H/10/803] [M/68/419] (P2)

DA108/801 They must tell who joined them by the way. (I1)

DA109/801 They carry the greatest message ever given to the world, a message of glad tidings upon which the hopes of the human family for time and for eternity depend. [M/71-74/420] (P2)

3SP108/215+ Never before had human lips such tidings to proclaim; for the fact of Christ's resurrection was to be the great truth around which all the faith and hope of the church would center. [M/71-74/420] (P1)

[See above.]

67/419 The world is all new to them, and the one dread horror of death is all gone, if Christ be risen from the dead. [March, NS]

68/419 They cannot wait for the morning to carry such joyful tidings to the sorrowing band of their brethren. [March, NS]

10/803 Their hearts were now full of the desire to tell to the brethren they had left behind in the city all that had happened. [Hanna, LC]

71/420 But they carried in their hearts tidings of the greatest victory ever gained in this world--the victory over death, the unbarring of the gates of the grave for the whole human race. [March, NS]

73/420 For they were the bearers of the best tidings that human lips ever told. [March, NS]

74/420 They could testify to a fact upon which all the hopes of man for eternity must depend. [March, NS]

Analysis

Ellen White's comments on the interview of Jesus and the two disciples on the road to Emmaus follow the general order of events as given in Luke's gospel. She covers the story from the departure from Jerusalem to their return to the city the same night, in 109 sentences in the DA text. We divided five of the 109 sentences into 2 independent clauses and one sentence into 3 parts, making a total of 116 sentences for evaluation purposes.¹ The analysis also includes 113 sentence units from Ellen White's earlier writings. A number of these evaluation units or independent clauses represent parts of sentences. These were indicated by (a), (b) or (c). We did not always present the entire sentence of the earlier text since our study is primarily concerned with those texts which relate to the later DA text or which reveal the use of sources in the commentary on the life of Christ.

This analysis will follow the usual outline. We first treat the sources used in writing the DA text, then the sources reflected in the earlier texts, and finally we discuss the compositional arrangement of the DA text and the previous writings.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Our review of possible sources behind Ellen White's

¹The five sentences are Nos. 2, 9, 11, 15, and 90, each of which have an (a) and a (b) part. Sentence 19 is divided

The Walk to Emmaus

remarks on the Emmaus experience indicates that she used at least two writers in a major way. At what point in the writing process these sources came into play is rather difficult to determine. We have no manuscript for the DA text as it now reads. Our study seems to indicate that the entire chapter is dependent on earlier materials, even the independent sentences. We have made a comparative listing of sentence parallels between the major Ellen White writings on this post-resurrection appearance of Jesus. Table A on pages 759-763 lists only one sentence, DA36, which does not show an earlier parallel.¹ The thought presented in this independent sentence is, however, intimated in a number of 3SP sentences.²

Manuscript 113, 1897, comes the closest to being the original manuscript behind chapter 83. It contains parallels to 100 DA sentences and sentence units. Another 17 units of the DA text relate either to 3SP or to a Signs article from 1878.³

into 19a, 19b, and 19c.

¹The list of parallels is given in 4 columns, with the earliest dated text on the left and the latest text, the DA, on the right. If in our judgment a particular sentence from an earlier document appears in a later text, the corresponding sentence number of the text is given on a parallel line. Some sentences appear in all four documents. The first time a change in the sentence occurs the sentence number is placed in parentheses. A second change is indicated by brackets and a third change is shown by returning to the parentheses sign. When the new usage duplicates an earlier sentence structure the corresponding sentence number appears without either parentheses or brackets.

²Cf. 3SP47/210 and 53/211.

³The comparison of content between the Ellen White materials does not necessarily represent the division of

TABLE A
LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 83
(EXCLUDES ISOLATED SENTENCES)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>DA 82</u>
001. -			1	(119)
002. -			2	
003. -			3	(75)
004. -	1			(99,100)
005. -	2			(69)
006. -			4	(76)
007. -			5	(109)
008. -			6	(110)
009. -			7	
010. -			8	(77)
011. -			9	78
012. -			10	79
013. -			11	80
014. -			12	81
015. -			13	
016. -			14	
				<u>DA 83</u>
017. -	3	(1)	[15]	(1)
018. -	7			(2)
019. -	4			(3)
020. -	5			(4)
021. -	6			(5)
022. -			16	(6)
023. -			18	(7)
024. -			19	8
025. -			20	
026. -		3		
027. -		4		
028. -	8a	(5a)	[21]	9a
029. -	8b	(5b)	[22]	9b
030. -			23	10
031. -	11a		(24a)	11a
032. -			24b	11b
033. -			25	12
034. -	11b		(26)	13
035. -	9		(27)	14
036. -	10		28a	15a
037. -			28b	(15b)
038. -	12			
039. -	13			
040. -	14			
041. -	15			
042. -	16a			
043. -	16b			
044. -	17			

TABLE A - CHAPTER 83

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>DA 83</u>
045. -		.	29	16
046. -		6		
047. -	19	(7)	[30]	17
048. -	20	8	31	18
049. -	21	9		
050. -			32a	19a
051. -	22	10a		(19b)
052. -	23a	(10b)	[32b]	19c
053. -	23b			
054. -		11,12	(33)	20
055. -		13		
056. -			34	(21)
057. -			35	22
058. -			36	23
059. -			37	24
060. -			38	25
061. -			39	(26)
062. -	24	14,15	40,41	27
063. -			42	(28)
064. -			43	(29)
065. -		17	(44)	30
066. -		18		
067. -		19		
068. -		20		
069. -		21		
070. -		22		
071. -		23		
072. -		24		
073. -		25		
074. -		26		
075. -		27		
076. -		28		
077. -		29		
078. -		30		
079. -		31		
080. -		32		
081. -		33		
082. -		34		
083. -		35		
084. -		36		
085. -		37		
086. -		38		
087. -	26		(45)	[31]
088. -	27			

TABLE A - CHAPTER 83

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>DA 83</u>
089. -	28a			
090. -	62a			
091. -	28b			
092. -	29			
093. -	25	16	(46)	[32]
094. -	89			33
095. -	89			34
096. -	31, 57			(35)
097. -				36
098. -	30a		(49)	[37]
099. -	46			(38)
100. -	47		(50)	[39]
101. -	30b, 54			(40)
102. -	51, 52		(47, 48)	[41]
103. -	53			(42)
104. -	32b			43
105. -	33			
106. -	34			
107. -	35			
108. -	36			(44)
109. -	37			
110. -	39			
111. -	40			
112. -	41			
113. -	42			
114. -	43			
115. -	44			
116. -	55			45
117. -	56			
118. -	58			46
119. -	59			47
120. -			51	(48)
121. -	45		(52a)	[49]
122. -			52b	50
123. -			53	51
124. -			54	52
125. -			55	(53)
126. -			56	54
127. -			57	55
128. -			58	56
129. -			59	57
130. -			60	58
131. -			61	59
132. -			62	60

TABLE A - CHAPTER 83

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>DA 83</u>
133. -	48			
134. -	49			
135. -	50			
136. -	60			
137. -	61			
138. -	18		63	61
139. -			64	62
140. -			65, 66	(63)
141. -			67	64
142. -	62b	49b	68	65
143. -	63	49a		(66)
144. -	64	(39)	[69]	(67)
145. -	65			
146. -	66	(41)		
147. -	67			
148. -	68a			
149. -	68b			
150. -	69	(44)	[70]	68
151. -	70			
152. -	71		(71)	69
153. -	71	45	(72)	70
154. -	71		(73)	71
155. -			74a	72
156. -	72, 73	(46)	[74b]	(73)
157. -	74	(50)	[75, 76]	(74)
158. -			77	75
159. -	75	(42b)	78	76
160. -	76	(40, 42a)	[79]	(77)
161. -	77			[78]
162. -			(80)	79
163. -			81	80
164. -			82	(81)
165. -	78	(51)		
166. -	79a		(83)	82
167. -	79b		84a	83
168. -	80	52	(84b)	84
169. -	81	(53)	[85]	85
170. -	82		(86)	86
171. -	83	(54-56)	[87]	87
172. -	84	(57)	[88]	88
173. -		58	(89)	89
174. -	86	(59)		
175. -	85a	(62a)	[90]	90a
176. -	85b	(62b)	[91]	90b

TABLE A - CHAPTER 83

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>DA 83</u>
177. -	91			
178. -	92a			
179. -	93			
180. -	94			
181. -	95			
182. -	96		(92)	91
183. -	97b		(93)	92
184. -	97a	(63)	[94a]	93
185. -		64		
186. -	98			
187. -	99a	(65)	[94b]	(94)
188. -	99b			
189. -			107	95
190. -	100		(108)	96
191. -	101			
192. -	102			
193. -			109	97
194. -	106		(110)	98
195. -	104		(111)	[99]
196. -	105			
197. -	103a		95a	100a
198. -	103b		95b	100b
199. -	103b	(69)	[96]	101
200. -			97	102
201. -			(98)	103
202. -		67		
203. -			99	(104)
204. -		68	(100)	105
205. -		66	(101)	106
206. -	107		(102)	107
207. -			103	108
208. -	108		(104)	109

The Walk to Emmaus

Even though there may not be any direct dependency on a literary source in the actual composition of the DA text as it stands today for chapter 83, the literary dependency is still to be recognized. The comparison of the DA text with earlier Ellen White writings where sources obviously were used, and the admitted fact that the DA text was largely developed from the editing of these previous materials, clearly ties the DA text to the literary sources.

Line 1 of Table 1, page 765, shows that 3 of the 116 sentence units registered as Verbatim, 21 as Strict Paraphrase, 18 as Simple Paraphrase, and 2 as Loose Paraphrase. Seven of the Bible references showed some influence of a source whether in their location in the narrative, in the associated commentary, or in the format of their presentation. Partial Independence, or Partial Dependence, was registered against 17 sentences, and 39 sentences were evaluated as indicating Strict Independence. There were also 9 independent selections from Scripture. According to our rating scale which gives a value of 7 points to Strict Verbatim sentences, 6 to Simple Verbatim, etc.,¹ the 107 sentence units, including the 39 independent sentences, average 2.17 for dependency.² Taking only the 68 sentences showing some dependency, the average dependency is 3.41. The complete list of the DA sentences and their

units used in comparing the DA text with the literary sources.

¹This scale has been fully explained in the Introduction, Part A, pages 61-63, of this report.

²We do not include independent Bible quotations in our evaluations.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 83

Ellen White Text

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
TEXT	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	TOTAL
01. DA	00	03	21	18	02	07	17	39	09	116
02. 3SP(78)	00	02	17	26	02	00	14	01	02	64
03. RH(78)	00	00	01	01	00	00	03	00	00	05
04. ST(88)	00	04	17	05	01	00	01	00	00	28
05. MS113(97)	00	02	03	03	02	00	04	02	00	16
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	08	38	35	05	00	22	(03)	(02)	113

evaluations may be found in Appendix A.

From the point of view of percentages, approximately 7.8% of the chapter involved independent use of Scripture, 33.6% of the text represents Ellen White's independent work, and 58.6% of the composition of the DA text reflects the literary influence of sources.

The literary parallels in chapter 83 came from William Hanna's Life of Christ and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. According to Table 2, page 767, Hanna furnished 30 parallels and March contributed 38.

Chapter 83 provided the same kind of difficulties as noted in the analyses of the previous chapters we have reviewed. There are the sentences which appear to be built on a Bible verse yet also contain elements from a source. How do you decide where to credit the influence? In DA1, for example, we gave the credit to March, in DA1a we labeled it as Bible through source influence and split off DA1b to indicate the additional contribution of the source.

Another difficulty we encountered had to do with the occasional similarity between the accounts of March and Hanna. In these cases we listed both sources but evaluated and credited the parallel according to the source listed first. The question of dependency between the sources is beyond the scope of this study, but it is nevertheless a matter of great interest. We cannot in all fairness decide the issue of plagiarism with respect to Ellen White until we have considered how other writers used their sources and

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 83

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT										TOTAL
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
01. Bible	V1 Strict Verbatim	V2 Verbatim	P1 Strict Paraphrase	P2 Simple Paraphrase	P3 Loose Paraphrase	B1 Source Bible	I2 Partial Independence	I1 Strict Independence	B2 Bible	09
02. Hanna IC	00	00	02	10	01	07	10	00	00	30
03. March IC	00	03	19	08	01	00	07	00	00	38
TOTALS DA Text	00	03	21	18	02	07	17	00	(09)	77

The Walk to Emmaus

what they did in terms of documenting this use.¹

The evaluation of Ellen White's contribution in a given instance is often made difficult because of the subtle, and at times not so subtle, shift in the thoughts being presented. Particularly is this so when the change is not unique to Ellen White but at this particular location is not found in the source material. A case in point is her reference to Christ as "the Son of God" or "the Christ" in DA13/795 when the source claims the question in the minds of the disciples was over Jesus' "pretensions and power, as a prophet so mighty in words and deeds."² Ellen White obviously knew of the scriptural basis for the words of Hanna, and actually refers to them in DA19. Hanna also relates the problem of unbelief to the false expectations of "the Christ" or the Messiah as does Scripture.³ In these circumstances, even though the general progression of thought follows that of the literary source, we felt the interpretation of Ellen White, on whatever grounds, should be recognized as being different from that of Hanna. To register this difference we evaluated her sentence as Partial Independence rather than Simple Paraphrase.

Another example of this type of difficulty may be found in DA2a and 22/796 when compared with Hanna's remarks in 80a and 89b/799. Ellen White explains the sadness of the

¹Cf. DA99/801. Other examples are listed under our analysis of the pre-DA text below.

²Hanna, LC, sentences 23-26.

³Hanna, LC, sentences 83 and 92, pages 799 and 800, for example. Cf. Luke 24:19-21.

The Walk to Emmaus

disciples as stemming from their lack of memory, whereas Hanna speaks of their lack of faith because they were "slow of heart" and "difficult to convince."¹

The reader should also note that we gave certain sentence units a P1 rating when it would appear that the sentence is actually a verbatim quote.² In these sentences the verbatim expression has been developed from a selection of words appearing in more than one sentence in the source. Then the verbatim expression is the result of a paraphrase by the writer of the DA text.

There are other sentences where the dependency is clear and even fairly strong but the hand of Ellen White is also obvious in the added comment or re-arrangement. In such cases we register Partial Independence rather than a form of paraphrase. Sometimes Ellen White omits a thought found in the source. It is difficult to show this aspect in the evaluation when the text of the DA does not indicate the omission.³ In fact, the only way to register such non-selected material would be to include the entire source context. The more accurate literary analysis would demand a study of the complete Ellen White context and usage as compared with the full text of the source. Such a study is

¹See also DA2b and Hanna 11/795.

²Cf. DA93/801.

³Compare DA102/801 with M/67/419, and DA109 and 3SP108 with M/71-74/420. In the first example Ellen White does not mention March's reference to the "dread horror of death," and in the second case she does not mention the resurrection truth as the "greatest message" as does March, even though in her 3SP parallel account she clearly stressed the resurrection as the "great truth."

beyond the scope of this investigation. We have, however, included the full text of Hanna and March as well as the earlier writings of Ellen White for this chapter in Appendix D.

Apart from the process of selectivity which operates throughout the entire chapter, and Ellen White's paraphrasing and isolated changes in the thoughts being expressed, the major impact of her originality of expression is to be found in her comments on Jesus' use of Scripture. In sentences 33-39 and 44-60 she speaks of why and how Jesus appealed to Scripture to explain the meaning of His death and resurrection, including the relationship of the Old and New Testaments. Her comments are more extended than those of her sources even though many of the points she makes are also addressed by Hanna and March.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

We have already noted that the DA text apparently was constructed largely from three previous writings of Ellen White.¹ According to our analysis 72 sentences, or segments of sentences from The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, contributed directly or indirectly to the composition of the DA text. These sentence units have been listed in Table A

¹Table 1 shows 4 as does the text presentation. The Review and Herald of 1878 is quoted 5 times out of 16 sentences on the topic of our chapter. The text is interesting for its contribution to the general textual tradition behind chapter 83 but does not add much to our study of the DA text and the use of sources. It is largely a paraphrase of the biblical account.

The Walk to Emmaus

above and are numbered as they occur in 3SP, chapter XV, "Jesus at Emmaus." Portions of the chapter were not used for the DA text. Sentences 12-17 have to do with content that is found in chapter 82 of the DA text. Most of the other 3SP material not found in chapter 83 of the DA has to do with Ellen White's independent comments on the reason and nature of Jesus' incognito interview with the two disciples. Her comments on these matters are condensed in the DA text when compared with 3SP.¹ Another block of material on the same topic and also omitted from DA is found in 3SP, sentences 91-95. This second block was included in our text presentation because of the source parallels involved.

The two separated sections of 3SP text on the same subject matter illustrates one common problem with the SP text, and one reason why Ellen White and others saw the need for a new work on the life of Christ. The repetition is to be noted elsewhere in this chapter.

The sentences 3SP6/206 and 3SP94/215 both speak of the disciples leaving Jerusalem, but give two different purposes for the journey. The difference in Ellen White's treatment may be explained on the basis of her sources. In sentence 6 she appears to have been using March, while in sentence 94 we have Hanna's comments reflected.² The DA text, sentence 5, is closer to March's point of view than Hanna's. At any rate we did not find the purpose for the trip to Emmaus as spelled out in 3SP continued in the DA text. As a result,

¹The 3SP sentences are 33-44, 48-50, and 60-61.

²Cf. March 17/415 and Hanna 1/802.

the possible conflict in the 3SP text is resolved in the DA text.¹

This apparent duplication in the SP account made our location of the earlier text somewhat problematic. We could not always be sure which sentence influenced the later texts, including the final DA text. For example, 3SP5a/206 is repeated in 3SP15/207. In both 3SP28/208 and 3SP62/212 Ellen White used the expressions, "listen intently" to "his gracious words."²

There is, of course, a duplication problem with the sources, especially when using more than one source as is the case with chapter 83. We often found it difficult to identify the source for a given parallel. It is very possible that credit should be given to both sources, but our system of evaluation did not permit such "fine tuning." We therefore attempted to identify the predominant source and list that source first, allowing its dependency rating to apply to the entire sentence even though we listed the second source as well. Here again the reader is free to modify our evaluation as he/she sees fit.³ We are reminded once again, however, of the dependency which seems to exist between various writings on the life of Christ. Perhaps Ellen White's literary dependency is not unusual for

¹It may be argued that the two purposes are not in conflict. The disciples were returning for both reasons.

²Compare also 3SP65/212 with 3SP88/214, neither of which is used for the DA text.

³We have in mind here such sentences as: 3SP28b/208, 3SP88/214, 3SP74/213, ST(88)50, 3SP79a/213, 3SP85a/213, and 3SP97b/215.

The Walk to Emmaus

nineteenth century writers.

There is also the distinct possibility that what may appear to be a duplicate reference is really only a second occurrence of a similar event. Take for example the weeping of the two disciples, something not mentioned in Luke 24 where the Emmaus journey is recorded.

In 3SP9/207 we read of the disciples weeping as they walked. The context suggests it was due to their grief over the death of Jesus. This sentence seems to match the DA text, sentence 14, and refers to their sadness before Jesus talked with them. Once Jesus explains the true nature of the cross experience, according to ST(88)25, the tears once again "flow freely" as they reflect on the sufferings of Jesus. At about this same time in the dialogue with Jesus, the disciples are told about the destruction to be visited upon the city of Jerusalem. In this connection DA62/800 informs us the disciples "looked upon the doomed city with weeping." About this time in the walk March also has the disciples weeping but for reasons different from that given in ST(88)25 and in 3SP9/207. The question may be only academic, but in establishing dependency between various texts, correspondence or non-correspondence is determined by such issues. How many weeping experiences are being described, when does the weeping take place, and for what reasons? We solved the problem by giving Ellen White independent credit for the early weeping as reworded in 3SP9/207 (not quoted) and DA14/796. We placed ST(88)25

The Walk to Emmaus

after DA62/800 to show a parallel weeping experience after the conversation had gone on for some time between Jesus and the disciples. We also show some dependency upon March who likewise records a weeping scene at this time which is connected to "a look" at the city of Jerusalem.¹ Because the reasons are different in the three accounts and the Signs comment does not mention a looking at Jerusalem but rather a thinking of Jesus, we break the context between the DA text and the ST(88) text with broken lines and register both sentences of Ellen White in the category of Partial Independence.

We cannot go into the reasoning behind every evaluation. We only hope to illustrate the complicated nature of the task and to urge the readers to enter into the same task as they study the evaluations of this report. We have no doubt overlooked some elements in some of our evaluations, and have possibly made some errors in our efforts to show the interdependence of Ellen White's writings. The textual evidence provided by these earlier writings may be found in Appendix D, and the lists of our evaluations and the source references are given in Appendices B and C for those interested in further analysis.

The Spirit of Prophecy account served as the starting point for chapter 83 of the DA as well as for a number of other compositions of Ellen White on the Emmaus journey. If

¹March's commentary has the disciples weeping because of what "they had seen and suffered" in Jerusalem (NS31/416).

The Walk to Emmaus

our comparisons are correct the SP text contributed 31 sentences to the 1888 Signs article on "Know the Reasons of Your Hope," part of which covered the Emmaus story. Six sentences not found in the SP narrative appear to have influenced the DA text, all of which were also used in the writing of Manuscript 113, 1897, which is discussed below.¹ Two of the sentences are Bible quotations, one is an independent comment, and three appear to reflect the influence of March. In addition to these sentences, the Signs article contains source parallels not found in chapter 83. Several of these are in the Verbatim or Strict Paraphrase categories.² Even though Ellen White had used Hanna and March in the writing of 3SP, she must have returned to March's work and taken new material for this Signs article.

We have classified Manuscript 113, 1897, as one of the "Pre-DA Texts" for this chapter. This designation is probably a misnomer. Both its date and content strongly suggest it was written as a working draft for the DA text.

The copy date is given as October 14, 1897, barely a year before the DA was published. The title of the manuscript bears the same title as does the finished text of chapter 83. A number of manuscripts dated from 1897 carry the titles of chapters from the DA.³ Evidently in 1897

¹These sentences, numbered from that section of the article describing the journey of the two disciples to Emmaus, are 11, 12, 17, 58, 68, and 66. Table A gives the full comparison between ST(88) and the other texts.

²Cf. ST(88)49a and 49b, ST(88)47, and ST(88)39.

³See comment under chapter 76 above.

The Walk to Emmaus

Ellen White was busy completing the chapter for the DA. The content of MS 113 covers chapters 82-84 of DA. Of the first 14 sentences of MS 113, eleven treat the subject covered in DA, chapter 82, "Why Weepest Thou?"¹ Sentences 15-111 have to do with chapter 83 and the final 37 concern the subject matter of chapter 84, "Peace Be Unto You."

Out of the 96 sentences devoted to the walk to Emmaus, 3 were not found in the DA text.² The remaining 93 sentences contributed 101 sentence units for 97 DA sentence units.³ The more striking comparison, however, has to do with the text itself. We counted 77 entries under column 4 of Table A which were not enclosed with brackets or parentheses. This means that according to our survey 77 sentence units of the DA text have been taken over verbatim from MS 113, 1897. Most of these 77 entries were in parallel with sentences from MS 113, which had been modified from the earlier SP and/or Signs text(s), or which had no earlier history. Except for DA sentences 95-99, the arrangement of chapter 83 also follows the compositional order of MS 113. The correspondence between chapter 83 and MS 113 is also to be noted in respect to the earlier SP

¹See comment under chapter 76 above.

²Sentences 7, 13, and 14 were not utilized in chapter 82.

³Eight sentences of MS 113, 1897, furnished two comparative units. These were sentences 24, 28, 32, 52, 74, 84, 94, and 95. A few sentences were combined for the DA text (40 and 41, 47 and 48, 65 and 66, 75 and 76) and several DA sentences were broken into multiple sentence units (9, 11, 15, 19, 90, and 100). Table A, beginning on page 759, gives the full list of comparisons.

The Walk to Emmaus

text. Where MS 113 omits or uses material from 3SP the DA text generally follows suit. This evidence leads us to conclude that MS 113 was produced specifically as copy for the DA text. It combined elements from 3SP and the Signs articles as well as adding a few new comments. The new sentences largely consist of two blocks of material, sentences 34-39, and 52b-62. The first group of sentences has to do with the disciples' forgetting the words of Jesus in respect to his resurrection. The second set speaks of Christ's instruction to the disciples on the meaning of His death.

It is therefore very likely that in MS 113 we have Ellen White putting together the chapter for the DA text. Very little was added or omitted from this manuscript in forming the finished chapter. Chapter 83 added, with some modifications, thirteen sentences from the SP text,¹ and changed the sentence arrangement of five sentences from the manuscript. This could have been the work of Marian Davis as she edited MS 113 to form the finished version of chapter 83.

We do not mean to suggest that MS 113 did not introduce any new material from the sources. At least three sentences in the DA text which owe their origin to MS 113 are not to be found in 3SP or the Signs article. These sentences, DA77, 79, and 97, reflect the use of March. There are also indications that March was used in the reworking of the 3SP

¹These were sentences 4-7, 36, 46, 53-55, 58, 59, 63, and 89.

text for MS 113, 1897.¹

The sources behind MS 113 are Hanna and March. This is to be expected since MS 113 is largely a compilation and revision of earlier writings using the same two sources. Since we do not make it a practice to repeat the quotation of earlier material unless the earlier text sheds more light on Ellen White's use of sources, most of the sentences from MS 113 do not appear in our text presentation. The full text of the manuscript where it treats the content of chapter 83 may, however, be found in Appendix D. Table 1 shows that our list of sentences from MS 113 contains 2 Verbatim sentences, 3 Strict Paraphrase, 3 Simple Paraphrase, and 2 Loose Paraphrase. We also registered four Partial Independence sentences and two Strict Independence sentence units.

Ordinarily we do not list sentences and their evaluations from writings which do not concern the particular chapter content selected for this study. We have departed from a strict compliance with that policy for several of the opening sentences of MS 113 because, while these sentences may be found in chapter 82, the content may also be found in chapter 83. The opening paragraphs of chapter 83 speak of the perplexity of the disciples over the reports of the resurrection which also is discussed in connection with Jesus' appearance to Mary and to the women in chapter 82. In our view this repetition of content

¹Cf. DA68/800 with 3SP69/212 and ST(88)44.

justifies the inclusion of these few sentences from chapter 82.

Our study of the sources behind the pre-DA text indicates that 108 sentences are to some degree dependent upon Hanna's Life of Christ and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. We evaluated 8 sentences as Verbatim, 38 as Strict Paraphrase, and 35 as Simple Paraphrase. There were 5 sentences given the rating of Loose Paraphrase and 22 were labeled as Partial Independence. Table 3 on page 780 also lists how these parallels are divided between March and Hanna. The average dependency of the pre-DA material is 3.84 when only dependent sentences are included in the analysis. Since we do not fully evaluate these early writings we have no information on the number of sentences containing Bible quotations or Ellen White's independent comments.

The pattern is not as consistent as we have found in some chapters, but generally the earlier text shows greater dependency than the later. Exceptions to this general rule are evidently due to the influence of MS 113, 1897. This manuscript was a first draft of the DA text for chapter 83. This means that the sentences are often shorter than ones in the earlier texts, especially 3SP, as is usually the case for the DA text. Shorter sentences allow greater precision in evaluation. Usually they reflect either the source or Ellen White's independent expression. The dependency elements can be separated from the independent comment of

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 83

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

		TEXT							
01. Hanna IC	00	V1	Strict Verbatim	1					
	07	V2	Verbatim	2					
	27	P1	Strict Paraphrase	3					
	14	P2	Simple Paraphrase	4					
	03	P3	Loose Paraphrase	5					
	00	B1	Source Bible	6					
	10	I2	Partial Independence	7					
	00	I1	Strict Independence	8					
	00	B2	Bible	9					
TOTALS Pre-DA	61	TOTAL							
02. March NS	00	01							
	11								
	21								
	02								
	00								
	12								
	00								
	(00)								
TOTALS Pre-DA	108								

The Walk to Emmaus

earlier more involved sentence constructions. In addition, the author of MS 113 added comment based upon another look at the sources. These two factors could account for several sentences of the DA text, i.e., the text of MS 113 showing greater dependency than the earlier texts. In Table 4, page 782, we have listed several references from corresponding sentences in the various Ellen White texts. Most of these show the same or greater dependency for the earlier form of the sentence. But notice also numbers 6 and 9 of the top list and item 5 of the lower list where this not the case.

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

According to our examination the chapter divides easily into seven sections. We have included an outline of our redaction analysis in Appendix D. Our presentation compares the arrangement of Scripture with that of Hanna, March, and Ellen White.

The first part of the chapter treats the doubt and perplexity of the disciples, particularly those who depart for Emmaus and home.¹ The Bible narrative begins the same way except for the subject matter of the conversation between the two disciples. The DA text follows the lead of Hanna in this section but includes elements from March.²

¹DA, sentences 1-9; 3SP, 1-7, beginning of p. 206; Hanna, LC, 1-15, pp. 794ff; and March, NS, sentences 1-18, pp. 413ff.

²Our text shows more quotes from March than Hanna, but the theme development is more like Hanna's narrative. Appendix D contains the full text of both the March and Hanna commentaries on the Emmaus journey.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 83

Same Sentence - Similar Words

<u>No.</u>	<u>- DA Text</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA Txt</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA</u>	<u>Eval</u>
01.	- DA1/795	P1	MS(113)15	P2	RH(78)1	P2
02.	- DA2a/795	P1	3SP7a/207	V2		
03.	- DA9a/795	P1	3SP8a/207	P1	ST(88)5a	P1
04.	- DA9b/795	P2	3SP8b/207	P1	ST(88)5b	P1
05.	- DA38/799	P3	3SP46/210	P3		
06.	- DA68/800	V2	3SP69/212	P1	ST(88)44	P1
07.	- DA74/800	B1	3SP74/213	P2	ST(88)50	P1
08.	-		3SP86/213	P2	ST(88)59	P1
09.	- DA93/801	P1	3SP97a/215	P2	ST(88)64	V2
10.	- DA106/801	P2	ST(88)66	P1		

Same Thought - Modified Construction

01.	- DA31/796	I2	3SP26/208	P2		
02.	- DA40/799	P2	3SP30b/208	P2		
03.	- DA64/800	I2	ST(88)49bc	V2		
04.	- DA66/800	P2	3SP63/212	P2	ST(88)49a	V2
05.	- DA75/800	P1	RH(78)12	I2		
06.	- DA78/800	P3	3SP77/213	P2		
07.	- DA109/801	P2	3SP108/215	P1		

The Walk to Emmaus

Ellen White's comments are about half as long as the apparent source, but she had covered part of the story in chapter 82.

The second division would appear to cover the meeting of Jesus and the two disciples and how He joins their walk. Once again the general content follows the pattern of Scripture and the order of presentation found in Hanna and March. Hanna's comments are, however, much longer, and he includes a long section on the post-resurrection appearances which Ellen White omits. This subject matter is also not found here in March's account.

The general order of all accounts parallel each other in section III of 3SP, where we discover Jesus questioning the disciples. The only special feature here is Ellen White's extra comments on the forgetfulness of the disciples, a point we did not find stressed in the sources. We also found a unique feature in Ellen White's comments on the next part which has to do with Jesus teaching the two disciples. March omits this subject matter but Ellen White extends her commentary far beyond the remarks of Hanna. In both the earlier SP account and in the DA text Ellen White stresses the value of the Old Testament for understanding the New Testament and its message of salvation. Here, of course, Ellen White is moving beyond the biblical text and comment as well.

Ellen White returns to the narrative structure of Hanna and March in section V (of 3SP), "Jesus Walks and Eats with

The Walk to Emmaus

the Two Disciples." She does, however, make several changes. The matter of Jesus' disguise is moved to section VI in the 3SP record, and omitted in the DA text. She also moves the comment on Jesus' concern to meet with Christians today down in the DA text. This latter change was probably done to avoid the apparent repetition in the March account and in the earlier 3SP narrative. We also note that the point about Jesus' continuing the conversation while the meal is being prepared, a point found in the 3SP story as well, is not included in the DA text.

The final two divisions, particularly the last one, follow the commentary of the two sources quite closely. In short, apart from one major departure over the content of Jesus' instruction and use of the Old Testament to show the disciples why they should be encouraged rather than perplexed, why they should rejoice in their faith rather than despair in their doubt, the DA text follows the compositional order of the sources, particularly the commentary of Hanna.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Our study of chapter 83 has led us at this point to list only one earlier document as providing major influence on the DA text. The material found in 3SP was largely utilized by both the Signs article of 1888 and Manuscript 113, 1897. In addition, MS 113 was more likely an earlier draft of chapter 83 than an independent earlier composition.

The Walk to Emmaus

The question then of the compositional arrangement of pre-DA texts is limited to the 3SP account which has already been mentioned above, under our study of the redaction of chapter 83. We need only to summarize our findings here. It would appear to us that the literary structure of the 3SP commentary is closer to the general arrangement of Hanna than to March and closer to both sources than is the DA text.¹ The one place where Ellen White's independent contribution is very obvious has to do with her comments about Jesus' teachings on the Old Testament prophecies, a point we have already emphasized above.

Summary

The source analysis of chapter 83 has been rather a straightforward matter of investigation. Ellen White's comments on the experience of the two disciples meeting Jesus while on their journey to Emmaus are numerous, but her treatment of the episode as a whole was rather limited. She found the part about Jesus' use of the Scriptures, particularly the Old Testament prophecies for explaining the significance of His life, death, and message, very useful. She was fond of using the example of Jesus to urge Christians to study the Scriptures.

The extended commentary on the topic of the entire story, however, is found in only a few places. The entire

¹This similarity of arrangement between Hanna and 3SP may be easily noted by comparing the appropriate columns of the redaction outline of chapter 83 under Appendix D.

The Walk to Emmaus

story is presented in Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, chapter XV, "Jesus at Emmaus;" in a Signs article from 1888 on "Know the Reason of Your Hope;"¹ in Manuscript 113, 1897, entitled, "The Walk to Emmaus;" and finally in chapter 83 of The Desire of Ages. Our study of these materials has brought us to these conclusions.

1. There are no primary sources for the DA text or for the earlier texts used to develop chapter 83. We do have the secretary's copy of one manuscript that contains most of the chapter in its final text form.

2. The DA text is a slightly shorter version of the walk to Emmaus than is to be found in the 3SP text. The DA sentences are shorter and while some new material has been added, more has been omitted. The DA chapter is considerably shorter than the total of all Ellen White had previously written on the topic because there is so much duplication in the material, and the DA commentary does not involve the use of additional sources.

3. We found no major difference in the content of the pre-DA writings and the DA text apart from the abbreviated treatment of some features in the DA material.

4. The one major element to be noted was the extended discussion of Jesus' use of Scripture to explain His life, death, and mission. This aspect of the Lukan account was heavily emphasized in both the 3SP commentary as well as in Manuscript 113, 1897, and the DA text. We found no

¹Signs, Vol. 14, No. 3, January 20, 1888.

The Walk to Emmaus

significant differences between the DA coverage of the journey to Emmaus and Ellen White's earlier comments. There were some subtle shifts of focus and interest, which may be noticed when comparing the repetition of content between documents as well as within the same chapter or manuscript. Perhaps a careful scrutiny of Ellen White's thoughts as they are repeated through the literary tradition of her writings would prove useful in developing a proper method of interpreting her writings.

5. The 116 comparative units resulting from the evaluation of the 109 sentences of chapter 83 contained 68 dependent sentences or clauses. These dependent literary units, including 3 Verbatim, represent almost 59 percent (58.6%) of the total text of the chapter.

6. When we discount the 9 Bible quotations which any commentator would have taken from Luke's gospel, Ellen White may be credited with 39 independent sentences or about 34 percent (33.6%) of the chapter.

7. If we average the various types of dependent sentences from Partial Independence to Verbatim, the degree of dependency for the 68 sentences is 3.41. The degree of dependency for the entire chapter when all 116 sentences are included is 2.17.

8. The two main sources used in the composition of chapter 83 were William Hanna's life of Christ and Daniel March's Night Scenes in the Bible. The former supplied 30 parallels and the latter 38. Both of these sources,

The Walk to Emmaus

particularly Hanna, have been noted earlier in this study as having been drawn upon by Ellen White. The White Estate holds a copy of Hanna's work with Ellen White's handwritten signature. Several books by March, including Night Scenes in the Bible, were found in Ellen White's office library after her death.¹

We should note in connection with our references to these two sources that their influence on the DA text comes from their use in the production of the earlier writings. We would also suggest that further study be given to the correspondence between the sources. There were times when we were not sure which source was used in composing the DA text.

9. There are no minor sources for this chapter.

10. The earlier texts used the same two sources as listed for the DA text under (8) above. There is so much duplication between the earlier writings and the DA material that we found it difficult to draw an accurate distinction between the comparative uses of the two sources. When the DA text was identical with an earlier form of the same sentence we did not always include it.

Our impression is, however, that Hanna's work was the dominant source for 3SP and March provided the greater influence for the Signs article and the later Manuscript

¹Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier, and Ron Graybill, A Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries, White Estate, Second Revised Edition, 1983, pp. 23, 32, and 33.

The Walk to Emmaus

113. According to the references found in Appendix C where we list all the sentences quoted from earlier compositions, Hanna supplied 32 parallels for the 3SP narrative and March provided 21. The Signs article had 22 sentences from March with only 3 from Hanna. Of 16 sentences quoted from Manuscript 113, 11 came from March and 3 from Hanna. Before we could fully depend upon these figures as indicating the source dependency, an evaluation of all the sentences of the three documents would have to be undertaken.

11. We found no basic difference between the use of sources represented in the DA text and that found in the earlier material. This similarity of source dependency was the inevitable result of the DA text being composed from the previous writings. Apart from the more abbreviated commentary and shorter sentences of Manuscript 113 and the DA text we found no significant difference in content between the DA text and the pre-DA writings.

12. The major difference between the dependent and independent material had to do with the extended comment of Ellen White over Christ's use of the Old Testament in leading the two disciples back to faith in Him and His work for the salvation of mankind. The basic point is found in Hanna's commentary but not to the extent of Ellen White's treatment. One special point to be noted is Ellen White's comment on the general discounting of the Old Testament by Christians of her time. In general it may be said that Ellen White's independent comment repeats in her own words

The Walk to Emmaus

the basic point found in the source or enlarges upon a thought only briefly presented in the source.

13. The compositional arrangement of chapter 83 follows the basic structural outline of the biblical account. The same may be said for the two sources she used, expressly Hanna. Only Luke records the Emmaus incident and there is no particular problem in following his story line. Insofar as adding descriptive background material and developing certain aspects of the story beyond the limits of Scripture is concerned, Ellen White heavily depends upon the patterns established in her earlier writings. The influence of sources in the matter of the structure of chapter 83 was mediated through the literary dependency of her early writings.

14. Any major difference in the literary sequence of her commentary from that found in Scripture appears to have originated through her use of Hanna's Life of Christ in composing the chapter on Emmaus in 3SP. She parts company with Hanna, though, when he turns to discuss the nature of the post-resurrection appearances of Jesus. She also shows her independence from Hanna when she elaborates in depth over the reasons why Jesus used Scripture to restore the faith of the two disciples, and how He used the Old Testament in so doing. Once this pattern was established in 3SP it reappears in her later comments and in the DA text.

This chapter reinforces our interest in several aspects of Ellen White's writing methods. Is her use of literary

The Walk to Emmaus

sources substantially different from the way her sources used the works of others? To what degree does the similarity of source materials indicate literary dependency among her contemporaries? Secondly, is there any clear evidence that Ellen White wrote the manuscripts of 1896 and 1897 which so closely parallel the DA text? Are these reconstructions of her earlier works her efforts or those of her literary assistants? Thirdly, what can we learn from a closer look at the content of Ellen White's material, particularly those comments which are repeated within and/or between her writings? Is it best to make them harmonize, to allow those saying different things to stand for different points of view, or to evaluate the differing ideas as peripheral issues which only serve as window dressing for the main feature being presented? Finally, how does the content of Ellen White's writings differ from that of her sources? Is there an essential difference or is it mainly one of emphasis? Where do the similarities and/or differences appear, in biblical or extra-biblical materials?

It would seem that chapter 83, one of the shorter chapters of our study, has added a major voice to the choir of 15 chapters. It has confirmed a number of our previous findings as well as supported several of our previous questions. One cannot help but wonder what each of the chapters not covered in this investigation would tell us if we took the time and trouble to let them speak.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 83

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001.	- March NS/17/415	P1	045.	-	I1
02a.	- Hanna LC/10/795	P1	046.	-	I1
02b.	- Hanna LC/11/795	I2	047.	-	I1
003.	-	I1	048.	-	I1
004.	- Hanna LC/33/796	P2	049.	-	I1
005.	- March NS/17/415	I2	050.	-	I1
006.	- March NS/18/415	I2	051.	-	I1
007.	- March NS/7,9/413-4	P2	052.	-	I1
008.	-	I1	053.	-	I1
09a.	- March NS/21/415	P1	054.	-	I1
09b.	- Hanna LC/17/795	P2	055.	-	I1
010.	- March NS/22/415	P2	056.	-	I1
11a.	- Hanna LC/24/795	B1	057.	-	I1
11b.	- Hanna LC/32/796	P2	058.	-	I1
012.	- Hanna LC/21/795	I2	059.	-	I1
013.	- Hanna LC/23-26/795	I2	060.	-	I1
014.	-	I1	061.	- Bible	B2
15a.	-	I1	062.	- March NS/31/416	I2
15b.	- Hanna LC/19-21/795	P2	063.	- March NS/27,30/416	P3
016.	- Hanna LC/66/798	I2	064.	- Hanna LC/98/800	I2
017.	- Bible	B2	065.	- March NS/30/416	P1
018.	- Bible	B2	066.	- March NS/29/416	P2
19a.	- Hanna LC/73/799	P1	067.	- March NS/32-35/416-7	P1
19b.	- Bible	B2	068.	- March NS/40/417	V2
19c.	- Bible	B2	069.	- Hanna LC/112/802	B1
020.	- Bible	B2	070.	- Hanna LC/114/802	P2
021.	- Hanna LC/80a/799	I2	071.	- Hanna LC/115/802	P2
022.	- Hanna LC/80b/799	I2	072.	- Bible	B2
023.	-	I1	073.	- Hanna LC/116/802	B1
024.	-	I1	074.	- Hanna LC/120/802	B1
025.	- Bible	B2	075.	- March NS/41/418	P1
026.	-	I1	076.	- March NS/42/418	V2
027.	- Bible	B2	077.	- March NS/43b/418	P1
028.	- March NS/25a, 24/416	P1	078.	- March NS/45, 43b/418	P1
029.	-	I1	079.	- March NS/43c/418	P1
030.	-	I1	080.	-	I1
031.	- March NS/25b/416	I2	081.	- March NS/44, 47/418	I2
032.	- Hanna LC/86/799	B1	082.	- March NS/50, 51/418	P1
033.	-	I1	083.	- Hann LC/123, 124/802	P2
034.	-	I1	084.	- March NS/51/418	V2
035.	-	I1	085.	- March NS/52/419	P1
036.	-	I1	086.	- Hanna LC/126/802	P2
037.	-	I1	087.	- March NS/53/419	P1
038.	-	I1	088.	-	I1
039.	-	I1	089.	- March NS/56, 57/419	P1
040.	- Hanna LC/87/799	P2	90a.	- March NS/58/419	P1
041.	- Hanna LC/88/800	I2	90b.	- Hanna LC/132/802	B1
042.	- Hanna LC/88/800	P3	091.	-	I1
043.	- Hanna LC/95b/800	B1	092.	- Hanna LC/4/803	I2
044.	-	I1	093.	- March NS/60, 61/419	P1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 83

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
094. -	March NS/60-63/419	P1	151. -		
095. -	March NS/69/420	P1	152. -		
096. -	Hanna LC/8/803	I2	153. -		
097. -	March NS/69/420	P2	154. -		
098. -	March NS/69/420	I2	155. -		
099. -	March NS/69,72/420	P2	156. -		
100. -	March NS/64-66/419	I2	157. -		
101. -	March NS/65,66/419	P1	158. -		
102. -	March NS/67/419	P1	159. -		
103. -	March NS/67/419	P2	160. -		
104. -		I1	161. -		
105. -		I1	162. -		
106. -	March NS/68/419	P2	163. -		
107. -	Hanna LC/10/803	P2	164. -		
108. -		I1	165. -		
109. -	March NS/71-74/420	P2	166. -		
117. -			167. -		
118. -			168. -		
119. -			169. -		
120. -			170. -		
121. -			171. -		
122. -			172. -		
123. -			173. -		
124. -			174. -		
125. -			175. -		
126. -			176. -		
127. -			177. -		
128. -			178. -		
129. -			179. -		
130. -			180. -		
131. -			181. -		
132. -			182. -		
133. -			183. -		
134. -			184. -		
135. -			185. -		
136. -			186. -		
137. -			187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	MS(113)1	P3	---	051.	-	ST(88)25	I2	62
002.	-	MS(113)2	I1	---	052.	-	3SP62b/212	P2	65
003.	-	MS(113)3	P1	---	053.	-	ST(88)49b	V2	65
004.	-	3SP1/206	B2	---	054.	-	3SP63/212	P2	66
005.	-	3SP2/206	I1	---	055.	-	ST(88)49a	V2	66
006.	-	MS(113)4	I2	---	056.	-	ST(88)39	P1	67
007.	-	MS(113)5	V2	---	057.	-	ST(88)47	P1	67
008.	-	MS(113)6	P1	---	058.	-	ST(88)48	P1	67
009.	-	MS(113)7	I1	---	059.	-	3SP88/214	I2	67
010.	-	MS(113)8	P3	---	060.	-	3SP65/212	I2	67
011.	-	MS(113)15	P2	1	061.	-	3SP66/212	P2	67
012.	-	RH(78)1	P2	1	062.	-	3SP67/212	P1	67
013.	-	3SP7a/207	V2	2a	063.	-	3SP68/212	P1	67
014.	-	3SP7b/208	I2	2b	064.	-	3SP68b/212	P1	67
015.	-	3SP4/206	I2	3	065.	-	3SP69/212	P1	68
016.	-	3SP5/206	P2	4	066.	-	ST(88)44	P1	68
017.	-	3SP15/207	P3	4	067.	-	3SP70a/212	P1	68
018.	-	3SP6/206	I2	5	068.	-	3SP70b/212	P2	68
019.	-	MS(113)16	I2	6	069.	-	ST(88)45	P2	70
020.	-	ST(88)3	P1	8	070.	-	3SP71/212	P2	71
021.	-	ST(88)4	P1	8	071.	-	3SP74/213	P2	74
022.	-	3SP8a/207	P1	9a	072.	-	ST(88)50	P1	74
023.	-	ST(88)5a	P1	9a	073.	-	RH(78)12	I2	75
024.	-	MS(113)21	P1	9a	074.	-	ST(88)42b	V2	76
025.	-	3SP8b/207	P1	9b	075.	-	ST(88)40	P2	77
026.	-	ST(88)5b	P1	9b	076.	-	ST(88)42a	P3	77
027.	-	3SP11a/207	P1	11a	077.	-	3SP77/213	P2	77
028.	-	3SP11b/207	I2	13	078.	-	3SP78/213	I2	81
029.	-	MS(113)26	I2	13	079.	-	ST(88)51	P1	81
030.	-	MS(113)20	P2	13	080.	-	3SP79a/213	P1	82
031.	-	3SP12/207	P2	13	081.	-	RH(78)10a	P1	82
032.	-	3SP13/207	P1	13	082.	-	3SP79b/213	I2	83
033.	-	3SP14/207	P2	13	083.	-	3SP80a/213	P2	83
034.	-	3SP16a/207	P1	13	084.	-	MS(113)85	V2	85
035.	-	3SP16b/2007	P2	13	085.	-	3SP82/213	P2	86
036.	-	3SP17/207	P1	13	086.	-	ST(88)55	P1	87
037.	-	MS(113)28b	P2	15b	087.	-	ST(88)56	P1	87
038.	-	RH(78)5a	I2	18	088.	-	ST(88)57	P1	88
039.	-	RH(78)5b,c	I2	19c	089.	-	ST(88)58	P1	89
040.	-	3SP26/208	P2	31	090.	-	3SP86/213	P2	89
041.	-	3SP27/208	P1	31	091.	-	ST(88)59	P1	89
042.	-	3SP28a/208	I2	31	092.	-	3SP85a/213	P1	90a
043.	-	3SP62a/212	I2	31	093.	-	3SP85b/213	P2	90b
044.	-	3SP28b/208	V2	31	094.	-	3SP91/214	I2	90b
045.	-	3SP89/214	I2	34	095.	-	3SP92a/214	P2	90b
046.	-	3SP46/210	P3	38	096.	-	3SP93/214	P2	90b
047.	-	3SP30b/208	P2	40	097.	-	3SP94/215	P2	90b
048.	-	3SP39/210	I2	50	098.	-	3SP97b/215	P2	92
049.	-	3SP42/210	I2	52	099.	-	3SP97a/215	P2	93
050.	-	3SP18/207	B2	61	100.	-	ST(88)64	V2	93

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
101.	-	3SP99a/215	P1	94	151.	-			
102.	-	ST(88)65	P2	94	152.	-			
103.	-	3SP100/215	P2	96	153.	-			
104.	-	3SP101/215	P2	96	154.	-			
105.	-	3SP104/215	P2	96	155.	-			
106.	-	3SP99c/215	P2	99	156.	-			
107.	-	MS(113)95	I2	100	157.	-			
108.	-	3SP103/215	P1	100	158.	-			
109.	-	ST(88)69	P2	100	159.	-			
110.	-	ST(88)68	P1	103	160.	-			
111.	-	ST(88)66	P1	106	161.	-			
112.	-	3SP107/215	P2	107	162.	-			
113.	-	3SP108/215	P1	109	163.	-			
114.	-				164.	-			
115.	-				165.	-			
116.	-				166.	-			
117.	-				167.	-			
118.	-				168.	-			
119.	-				169.	-			
120.	-				170.	-			
121.	-				171.	-			
122.	-				172.	-			
123.	-				173.	-			
124.	-				174.	-			
125.	-				175.	-			
126.	-				176.	-			
127.	-				177.	-			
128.	-				178.	-			
129.	-				179.	-			
130.	-				180.	-			
131.	-				181.	-			
132.	-				182.	-			
133.	-				183.	-			
134.	-				184.	-			
135.	-				185.	-			
136.	-				186.	-			
137.	-				187.	-			
138.	-				188.	-			
139.	-				189.	-			
140.	-				190.	-			
141.	-				191.	-			
142.	-				192.	-			
143.	-				193.	-			
144.	-				194.	-			
145.	-				195.	-			
146.	-				196.	-			
147.	-				197.	-			
148.	-				198.	-			
149.	-				199.	-			
150.	-				2:0.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	MS(113)1	M/8,11a/414	051.	-	ST(88)25	March31/416
002.	-	MS(113)2		052.	-	3SP62b/212	M/26,30/416
003.	-	MS(113)3	M/11a/414	053.	-	ST(88)49b	March30/416
004.	-	3SP1/206	Bible	054.	-	3SP63/212	M/28,29/416
005.	-	3SP2/206		055.	-	ST(88)49a	March29/416
006.	-	MS(113)4	March 9/414	056.	-	ST(88)39	March35/417
007.	-	MS(113)5	March10/414	057.	-	ST(88)47	March27/416
008.	-	MS(113)6	March10/414	058.	-	ST(88)48	March35/417
009.	-	MS(113)7		059.	-	3SP88/214	H/100f/801
010.	-	MS(113)8	M/11b/414	060.	-	3SP65/212	March37/417
011.	-	MS(113)15	March17/414	061.	-	3SP66/212	March37/417
012.	-	RH(78)1	M/7,9,17/414f	062.	-	3SP67/212	March37/417
013.	-	3SP7a/207	Hanna10/795	063.	-	3SP68/212	March38/417
014.	-	3SP7b/208	Hanna11/795	064.	-	3SP68b/212	March38/417
015.	-	3SP4/206	H/32,33/796	065.	-	3SP69/212	March40/417
016.	-	3SP5/206	H/32,33/796	066.	-	ST(88)44	March40/417
017.	-	3SP15/207	H/32,33/796	067.	-	3SP70a/212	Hanna110/801
018.	-	3SP6/206	March17/415	068.	-	3SP70b/212	Hanna111/801
019.	-	MS(113)16	March18/415	069.	-	ST(88)45	Hanna114/802
020.	-	ST(88)3	March20/415	070.	-	3SP71/212	H/112-116/802
021.	-	ST(88)4	M/19,20/415	071.	-	3SP74/213	M/49,50a/418
022.	-	3SP8a/207	March21/415	072.	-	ST(88)50	M/49,50a/418
023.	-	ST(88)5a	March21/415	073.	-	RH(78)12	March41/418
024.	-	MS(113)21	March21/415	074.	-	ST(88)42b	March42/418
025.	-	3SP8b/207	March22/415	075.	-	ST(88)40	M/43b/418
026.	-	ST(88)5b	Hanna17/795	076.	-	ST(88)42a	M/43a/418
027.	-	3SP11a/207	Hanna26/795	077.	-	3SP77/213	M/44,45/418
028.	-	3SP11b/207	Hanna26/795	078.	-	3SP78/213	March50/418
029.	-	MS(113)26	H/23-26/795	079.	-	ST(88)51	March50/418
030.	-	MS(113)20	Hanna27/795	080.	-	3SP79a/213	March51/418
031.	-	3SP12/207	H/27,28/795f	081.	-	RH(78)10a	Hanna122/802
032.	-	3SP13/207	Hanna31/796	082.	-	3SP79b/213	H/123f/802
033.	-	3SP14/207	Hanna29/796	083.	-	3SP80a/213	Hanna123/802
034.	-	3SP16a/207	Hanna42/796	084.	-	MS(113)85	March52/419
035.	-	3SP16b/2007	Hanna43/796	085.	-	3SP82/213	Hanna126/802
036.	-	3SP17/207	H/43,44/796	086.	-	ST(88)55	March54/419
037.	-	MS(113)28b	H/19-21/795	087.	-	ST(88)56	March54/419
038.	-	RH(78)5a	Hanna69/798	088.	-	ST(88)57	Hanna128/802
039.	-	RH(78)5b,c	Hanna70/798	089.	-	ST(88)58	M/56,57/419
040.	-	3SP26/208	M/25b/416	090.	-	3SP86/213	March57/419
041.	-	3SP27/208	March26/416	091.	-	ST(88)59	March57/419
042.	-	3SP28a/208	March26/416	092.	-	3SP85a/213	Hanna129/802
043.	-	3SP62a/212	M/26,27/416	093.	-	3SP85b/213	Hanna131/802
044.	-	3SP28b/208	M/26b/416	094.	-	3SP91/214	Hanna103/801
045.	-	3SP89/214	H/104/801	095.	-	3SP92a/214	Hanna105/801
046.	-	3SP46/210	Hanna83/799	096.	-	3SP93/214	March59/419
047.	-	3SP30b/208	Hanna87/799	097.	-	3SP94/215	Hanna 1/802
048.	-	3SP39/210	Hanna92/800	098.	-	3SP97b/215	Hanna 4/803
049.	-	3SP42/210	Hanna94/800	099.	-	3SP97a/215	M/60,61/419
050.	-	3SP18/207	Bible	100.	-	ST(88)64	March60/419

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
101.	-	3SP99a/215	H/5,6/803	151.	-		
102.	-	ST(88)65	Hanna6/803	152.	-		
103.	-	3SP100/215	H/8,9/803	153.	-		
104.	-	3SP101/215	Hanna9/803	154.	-		
105.	-	3SP104/215	March69/420	155.	-		
106.	-	3SP99c/215	Hanna7/803	156.	-		
107.	-	MS(113)95	M/64,65/419	157.	-		
108.	-	3SP103/215	M/64-66/419	158.	-		
109.	-	ST(88)69	M/65-66/419	159.	-		
110.	-	ST(88)68	March67/419	160.	-		
111.	-	ST(88)66	March68/419	161.	-		
112.	-	3SP107/215	Hanna10/803	162.	-		
113.	-	3SP108/215	M/71-74/420	163.	-		
114.	-			164.	-		
115.	-			165.	-		
116.	-			166.	-		
117.	-			167.	-		
118.	-			168.	-		
119.	-			169.	-		
120.	-			170.	-		
121.	-			171.	-		
122.	-			172.	-		
123.	-			173.	-		
124.	-			174.	-		
125.	-			175.	-		
126.	-			176.	-		
127.	-			177.	-		
128.	-			178.	-		
129.	-			179.	-		
130.	-			180.	-		
131.	-			181.	-		
132.	-			182.	-		
133.	-			183.	-		
134.	-			184.	-		
135.	-			185.	-		
136.	-			186.	-		
137.	-			187.	-		
138.	-			188.	-		
139.	-			189.	-		
140.	-			190.	-		
141.	-			191.	-		
142.	-			192.	-		
143.	-			193.	-		
144.	-			194.	-		
145.	-			195.	-		
146.	-			196.	-		
147.	-			197.	-		
148.	-			198.	-		
149.	-			199.	-		
150.	-			2:0.	-		

XVII CHAPTER 84 - "Peace Be Unto You"

Chapter 84 is the final chapter of The Desire of Ages to be included in this source study. It is also the third chapter of the 15 which followed in consecutive sequence a DA chapter also surveyed in this investigation.¹ The topic of chapter 84, "Peace Be Unto You," continues the narrative of chapter 83 on "The Walk to Emmaus." The previous chapter covered Luke 24:13-33. This chapter treats Luke 24:33-48 and John 20:19-29. The story line opens with the two disciples returning to Jerusalem from Emmaus and focuses the reader's attention on the two appearances of Jesus before the disciples in the upper room in Jerusalem.

Our review of Ellen White's writings on the general content of this chapter turned up over 50 references in more than 25 books and articles. Many of these are limited to one aspect of the account, such as the warning and rebuke of Jesus to Thomas for his lack of faith. Following the 15 sentences dedicated to this episode in Spiritual Gifts, 1858, Ellen White draws a parallel between Thomas' failure to accept the message of Jesus' resurrection from the testimony of the other disciples to the rejection of the first and second angels' messages by those who had not gone through the earlier experiences.²

¹The three randomly selected consecutive chapter-sets we have reference to here are 13 and 14, 75 and 76, and 83 and 84.

²SG, I, chapter X, page 75.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The earliest record we have of Ellen White's writing a comprehensive commentary on the two upper-room experiences is found in The Spirit of Prophecy, III, chapter XVI, "In the Upper Chamber."¹ We shall have occasion to refer often to this early commentary of Ellen White on the life of Christ. Our references will be indicated by the symbol 3SP, followed by the sentence number and page of the text where the particular sentence appears.

In the previous chapter we included a large portion of an 1888 article from The Signs of the Times, "Know the Reason of Your Hope."² The last section of that composition, beginning with sentence 70, deals with the content of the chapter under discussion here. After 17 sentences, Ellen White turns from the Lukan account to draw some practical lessons for Christians facing trials and conflicts. Within the few sentences devoted to the experience of the disciples are to be found some interesting source parallels. These sentences are indicated by the sign ST(88) followed by the number of the sentence being quoted. The sentence numbers begin with the opening paragraph of the article.

In 1897 Ellen White prepared two manuscripts relating to the subject matter of chapter 84. Manuscript 113, discussed in the previous chapter, goes beyond the Emmaus experience. Sentences 112 to 148 have to do with the upper-

¹This material was also published in Signs, September 26, 1878, and as Redemption Leaflet No. 6, pp. 34-40, 1877.

²Signs, Vol. 14, No. 30 (January 20, 1888).

"Peace Be Unto You"

room appearance of Jesus which took place on the day of His resurrection. In the text presentation to follow we have marked these sentences as MS(113). Following this sign of identification we list the sentence number.

The second manuscript from 1897 used in the preparation of the DA text for chapter 84 carries the White Estate listing of Manuscript 149, 1897. This composition is entitled "The Remission of Sins" and was used in Ellen White's commentary on John 20:19-29. Sentences from this manuscript will carry the designation MS(149) before the sentence number. Manuscripts 113 and 149 carry the initials "M. H.," which stand for Margaret (Maggie) Hare. October 14 is the date given MS 113, and MS 149 is dated December 1. Neither typescript is signed or stamped with Ellen White's signature. No handwritten text was found for these two documents.

The only sources quoted in the text presentation are Hanna's Life of Christ and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. These are the same two works Ellen White used for chapter 83.

There are several sentences from these earlier writings which reflect the use of literary sources and treat content not found in the DA text. We have included these where they appear to fit the context of either the source or the other sentences taken from the same earlier text. These sentences which interrupt the context of the DA text will be marked

"Peace Be Unto You"

off by a short broken line in the left margin.

Most of the sentences from the earlier writings which duplicate the DA text or which do not differ in their degree of literary dependency have not been included in the text presentation. These sentences will be discussed further under the analysis below.

DA1/802 On reaching Jerusalem the two disciples enter at the eastern gate, which is open at night on festal occasions. [M/75/420] (P1)

3SP1/216 When the disciples arrived at Jerusalem they entered the eastern gate, which was open on festal occasions. [M/75/420] (P1)

DA2/802 The houses are dark and silent, but the travelers make their way through the narrow streets by the light of the rising moon. [M/76-78/420,421] (P1)

3SP2/216 The houses were dark and silent, but they made their way through the narrow streets by the light of the rising moon. [M/76-78/420,421] (P1)

DA3/802 They go to the upper chamber where Jesus spent the hours of the last evening before His death. [M/78/421] (P1)

DA4/802 Here they know that their brethren are to be found. [M/79/421] (P1)

3SP3/216 They knew that they would find their brethren in the memorable upper chamber where Jesus had spent the last night before his death. [M/78,79/421] (P1)

MS(113)112 Entering Jerusalem, they go to the upper chamber, where Christ spent the hours of the last evening before his death instructing his disciples. [M/75-78/421] (P1)

DA5/802 Late as it is, they know that the disciples will not sleep till they learn for a certainty what has become of the body of their Lord. [M/79,80/421] (P1)

MS(113)113 It is late, but they know that the disciples will not sleep till they know for a certainty what has become of the body of their Lord. [M/79,80/421] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

75/420 Reaching the walls of the city at a late hour, they probably passed around to one of the eastern gates, which was kept open all night during the great festivities of the Jewish people. [March, NS]

76/420 Having gained admission, they hurry along the narrow streets, guided now by the light of the risen moon. [March, NS]

77/420+ The doors are shut and the blank walls of the stone houses give no sign of life within. [March, NS]

78/421 They make their way first of all, we may suppose, to that one memorable house with the upper chamber where Jesus spent the last evening with his disciples before he suffered. [March, NS]

13/803 And where but in that same chamber can we imagine that their Sunday evening assembly gathered? [Hanna, LC]

79/421 Late as is the hour, they feel confident that the band will still be together. [March, NS]

80/421 The excitement of the day has been too great to let them think of sleep. [March, NS]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

3SP5/216 And now they had no disposition to sleep, for exciting events were being related among them.
[M/80/421] (P1)

DA6/802 They find the door of the chamber securely barred.
[M/81/421] (P1)

MS(113)114 They find the door of the chamber securely barred. [M/81/421] (P1)

DA7/802 They knock for admission, but no answer comes.
[M/82/421] (P1)

MS(113)115 They knock for admission, but no answer comes. [M/82/421] (P1)

DA8/802 All is still. [M/82/421] (P2)

MS(113)116 All is still. [M/82/421] (P2)

DA9/801 Then they give their names. [M/83a/421] (P1)

MS(113)117 Then they give their names. [M/83a/421] (P1)

DA10a/802 The door is carefully unbarred, they enter,
[M/83b/421] (P1)

3SP6a/216 Cautious hands unbarred the door to the repeated demand of the two travelers; they entered,
[M/83ab/421] (P1)

ST(88)71 All is silent within; but finally, to their continued knocking, they hear the slipping of the bolts. [M/82,83b/421] (P2)

DA10b/802 and Another, unseen, enters with them. (I1)

3SP6b/216 and with them also entered Jesus, who had been their unseen companion all the way. (I1)

81/421 When they reach the door, they find it barred from within and they cannot enter. [March, NS]

82/421 They knock, but none reply. [March, NS]

83a/421 They call aloud and announce their names, [March, NS]

83b and then they hear steps and voices within, and the swift and cautious hands of their brethren unbolting the door. [March, NS]

DA11/802 Then the door is again fastened, to keep out spies. [M/85a/421] [H/14a/803] (P2)

ST(88)72 The door is cautiously opened and carefully barred after them. [M/83,85a/421] (P1)

DA12/802 The travelers find all in surprised excitement. [H/15/803] [M/85a,80/421] (P1)

3SP/216 They found the disciples assembled, and in a state of excitement. [H/15/803] (P2)

3SP9a/216 The report of Mary Magdalene, and that of the other women, had been heard by all; [H/16a/803] (V2)

3SP9b/216 but some were too hopeless to believe their testimony. [H/16b/803] (I2)

3SP10/216+ The evidence of Peter concerning his interview with the risen Lord, was borne with great ardor and assurance, and had more weight with the brethren, and their faith began to revive. [H/17a/803] (P2)

DA13/802 The voices of those in the room break out into thanksgiving and praise, saying. "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [M/84b/421] (B1)

3SP11/217 When the disciples from Emmaus entered with their joyful tidings, they were met by the exclamation from many voices: "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [H/17b/803] [Cf. M/84b/421] (P2)

DA14/802 Then the two travelers, panting with the haste with which they have made their journey, tell the wondrous story of how Jesus had appeared to them. [M/85a,b/421] (P1)

MS(113)121 Then the travelers, panting with the haste with which they have made their journey, tell the wondrous story of how as they were journeying along full of discouragement and hopelessness, they were joined by a stranger. [M/85a,b/421] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

14a/803 The doors were closed against intruders, . . .
[Hanna, LC]

85a/421 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus,
[March, NS]

15/803 In what an agitated, conflicting state of thought and feeling do they find those assembled there! [Hanna, LC]

16a/803 They had all heard the reports of the women and of Mary Magdalene; [Hanna, LC]

16b/803 but they say little or nothing about them; perhaps give them little credit. [Hanna, LC]

17a/803 But there is Peter, whom no one can well distrust, telling all the particulars of his interview, and carrying the conviction of so many, [Hanna, LC]

84b/421 before the voices of all within break out in the exclamation, "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [March, NS]

17b/803 that they are joyfully exclaiming; "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." [Hanna, LC]

85ab/421 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus, the strange companion that joined them in the way,
[March, NS]

MS(113)122 With wonder and hope, they relate how he opened the Scriptures to them, and how they invited him to abide with them. [M/85a/421] (P3)

MS(113)123 They tell how, they prepared the evening meal, and when as their guest had extended his hands to bless the food, they recognized him. [M/85d,f/421] (P3)

MS(113)124 Their eyes were indeed opened. [M/85f/421] (P3)

MS(113)125 They saw the marks of the nails, and rose up to worship him, but he vanished out of their sight. [M/85e,g/421] (P2)

DA15/802 They have just ended, and some are saying that they cannot believe it, for it is too good to be true, when behold, another Person stands before them. [M/86/421] (P2)

MS(113)126 They have just finished their story and some are saying that they could not believe it for it is too good to be true, when behold, another person stands before them. [M/86/421] (P1)

3SP14/217 Some were inspired with new faith; others were incredulous. [H/17-19/803] (P2)

3SP15/217 Suddenly Jesus himself was in their midst. [H/21/803] (V2)

ST(88)73 Scarcely had they finished relating the marvelous story of the walk to Emmaus to the incredulous disciples, when they behold with amazement another in their midst. [M/86/421] (P1)

DA16/802 Every eye is fastened upon the Stranger. [M/88/422] (V2)

DA17/802 No one has knocked for entrance. [M/89/422] (P1)

ST(88)75 The bars and bolts have not been withdrawn. [M/90/422] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

85c/421 the burning words that he spoke as he climbed the hills and toiled along the steep stony path in their company, [March, NS]

85d/421 the blessing that he pronounced at the evening meal, [March, NS]

85e/421 the print of the nails that they plainly saw in his extended hands, [March, NS]

85f/421 the familiar looks of their beloved Lord shining out upon his face, [March, NS]

85g/421 and then his vanishing out of their sight. [March, NS]

86/421+ They have scarcely finished their story, amid the wonder and joy of the listening throng, when, behold! another stands in the midst of the room. [March, NS]

19/803 The two disciples tell their tale, but it falls on many an incredulous ear. [Hanna, LC]

21/803 They are trying all they can by a minute recital of how Jesus had been known of them, to remove the incredulity, when suddenly, coming as a spirit cometh, casting no shadow before him, the doors not being open to let him in, no sight nor sound giving token of his approach, Jesus himself is in the midst of them, and his "Peace be unto you" stills at once the conflicting conversation that had been going on. [Hanna, LC]

88/422 Every eye is fixed upon the stranger. [March, NS]

89/422 There has been no knocking without. [March, NS]

90/422 The door has not been unbarred. [March, NS]

DA18/802+ No footstep has been heard. [M/91/422] (V2)

DA19/802 The disciples are startled, and wonder what it means. [M/87,93/422] (P1)

ST(88)76 They have heard no footstep, and they are terrified. [M/87,91/422] (V2)

DA20/803 Then they hear a voice which is no other than the voice of their Master. [M/94/422] (P2)

DA21/803 Clear and distinct the words fall from His lips, "Peace be unto you." (I1)

DA22/803 "But they were terrified and affrighted, and supposed that they had seen a spirit." (B2)

DA23/803 "And He said unto them, Why are ye troubled? and why do thoughts arise in your hearts?" (B2)

DA24/803 "Behold My hands and My feet, that it is I Myself: handle Me, and see; for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see Me have." (B2)

DA25/803 "And when He had thus spoken, He showed them His hands and His feet." (B2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

91/422 No sound of entering footsteps has been heard.
[March, NS]

87/422 They are startled and terrified at the sudden apparition, even as they were when they saw the bright form walking upon the Sea of Galilee. [March, NS]

93/422 What can it be? [March, NS]

94/422 In the hush of silence which pervades the breathless group they hear a voice speaking as only their Lord could speak, and saying "Peace be unto you." [March, NS]

DA26/803 They beheld the hands and feet marred by the cruel nails. [M/95/422] (P1)

DA27/803 They recognized His voice, like no other they had ever heard. [Cf. DA20 above.] [M/94/422] (P2)

DA28/803 "And while they yet believed not for joy, and wondered, He said unto them, Have ye here any meat?" (B2)

DA29/803 "And they gave Him a piece of a broiled fish, and of an honeycomb." (B2)

DA30/803 "And He took it, and did eat before them." (B2)

DA31/803 "Then were the disciples glad, when they saw the Lord." [M/99/422] (B1)

DA32/803 Faith and joy took the place of unbelief, and with feelings which no words could express they acknowledged their risen Saviour. [H/30/804] (I2)

DA33/803 At the birth of Jesus the angel announced, Peace on earth, and good will to men. [M/105/423] (I2)

3SP35/218 At the first advent of Jesus to the world, the angel announced: Peace on earth, and good will to men. [M/105/423] (I2)

DA34/803+ And now at His first appearance to the disciples after His resurrection, the Saviour addressed them with the blessed words, "Peace be unto you." [M/102,105/422,423] (P1)

3SP36/218 After his earthly life was completed, he came forth from the dead, and, appearing for the first time to his assembled disciples, addressed them with the blessed words, "Peace be unto you." [M/102,105,106/422,423] (V2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

95/422 Then he shows them his hands and his feet, and they lean forward with fear and wonder to look upon the print of the nails, the signs of sacrificial suffering which he wears even now upon the throne of heaven. [March, NS]

[See M/94/422 above.]

99/422 And now at last are they glad and satisfied that they see their Lord. [March, NS]

30/804 Doubt now gives place to conviction, fear to believing joy; a joy so fresh, so full, that it in turn begins to shake the new-born faith. [Hanna, LC]

105/423 His first appearance on earth was announced by angel voices with the same blessed word--peace. [March, NS]

102/422 And the first word which the risen Lord brings to the assembly of his disciples on this first night after his resurrection is "Peace." [March, NS]

106/423 And after he has completed his work and passed away from the world, he comes back from the grasp of death and the grave to bring the weary and the sorrowing the blessing of peace. [March, NS]

DA35/804 Jesus is ever ready to speak peace to souls that are burdened with doubts and fears. [M/110/423] (P2)

3SP37/219 Jesus is ever ready to speak peace to souls that are troubled with doubts and fears.
[M/110/423] (P2)

DA36/804 He waits for us to open the door of the heart to Him, and say, Abide with us. [M/113/423] (P2)

DA37/804 He says, "Behold, I stand at the door, and knock: if any man hear My voice, and open the door, I will come in to him, and will sup with him, and he with Me." Rev. 3:20. [M/114/423] (B1)

3SP40a/219 Our life is a continual strife;
[M/118/424] (V2)

3SP40b/219 we must war against principalities and powers, against spiritual wickedness, and foes that never sleep; [M/119/424] (P1)

3SP40c/219 we must resist temptations, and overcome as Christ overcame. [M/120/424] (I2)

3SP41/219 When the peace of Jesus enters our heart we are calm and patient under the severest trials.
[M/135/425] (P2)

DA38/804 The resurrection of Jesus was a type of the final resurrection of all who sleep in Him. [M/147/426] (P2)

DA39/804 The countenance of the risen Saviour, His manner, His speech, were all familiar to His disciples. [M/148/426] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

110/423 Peace to all troubled and restless and doubting and dissatisfied souls, for Jesus came to seek and to save the lost. [March, NS]

113/423 But he stands at the door of the heart and knocks and waits to be invited in. [March, NS]

114/423 He knocks and knocks again. [March, NS]

115/423 He waits and waits long. [March, NS]

116/423 And many never invite him in. [March, NS]

118/424 Our life on earth is a continual conflict. [March, NS]

119/424 We must fight against forces that never tire, and keep ourselves upon the watch against foes that never sleep. [March, NS]

120/424 We are beset by countless temptations, and we must resist and put them down, or be overcome and destroyed ourselves. [March, NS]

135/425 When the peace of Christ comes into the soul, it brings the calmness and serenity of heaven. [March, NS]

147/426 His resurrection is the pattern of our own. [March, NS]

149/426 His voice and look and manner of speech were all such as his friends and followers had known them to be in his former life. [March, NS]

DA40/804 As Jesus arose from the dead, so those who sleep in Him are to rise again. [M/152/426] (P1)

3SP44/219 In like manner will those who sleep in Jesus rise again. [M/152/426] (V2)

DA41/804 We shall know our friends, even as the disciples knew Jesus. [M/154/426] (P2)

DA42/804 They may have been deformed, diseased, or disfigured, in this mortal life, and they rise in perfect health and symmetry; yet in the glorified body their identity will be perfectly preserved. [M/158/427] (P2)

DA43/804 Then shall we know even as also we are known. 1 Cor. 13:12. [M/157/427] (P2)

DA44/804 In the face radiant with the light shining from the face of Jesus, we shall recognize the lineaments of those we love. [M/156/427] (I2)

DA45/804 When Jesus met with His disciples, He reminded them of the words He had spoken to them before His death, that all things must be fulfilled which were written in the law of Moses, and in the prophets, and in the Psalms concerning Him. (B2)

DA46/804+ "Then opened He their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures, and said unto them, Thus it is written, and thus it behooved Christ to suffer, and to rise from the dead the third day: and that repentance and remission of sins should be preached in His name among all nations, beginning at Jerusalem." (B2)

152/426 And in like manner shall our beloved who sleep in Jesus rise again. [March, NS]

154/426 They shall speak so that when we meet them and they call our names, as Jesus called the name of Mary in the garden of the sepulchre, it shall be all we need to know them. [March, NS]

158/427 And so the faces that we last saw on earth wrinkled with age or wasted in suffering, and void of all grace and comeliness, shall be the same when seen in the light of heaven, yet clothed with immortal beauty and fit for the companionship of angels. [March, NS]

157/427 The great artist has the skill to make a homely face beautiful in a picture, and yet everybody who knows the original will say it is a perfect likeness. [March, NS]

156/427 However plain they looked in this earthly life, they shall still be themselves and yet their faces shall be radiant with the soul's immortal beauty in the resurrection. [March, NS]

[March (NS) continues the resurrection theme for thirty-two additional sentences, 159-190.]

[Hanna (LC) uses three sentences in a paraphrase of the texts referred to here by EGW, 32-35/804.]

DA47/805 "And ye are witnesses of these things." (B2)

DA48/805 The disciples now began to realize the nature and extent of their commission. [H/36/804] (P1)

3SP31/218 The disciples now began to realize the nature and extent of their commission. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA49/805 They were to proclaim to the world the wonderful truths which Christ had entrusted to them. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA50/805 The events of His life, His death and resurrection, the prophecies that pointed to these events, the sacredness of the law of God, the mysteries of the plan of salvation, the power of Jesus for the remission of sins,--to all these things they were witnesses, and they were to make them known to the world. [H/36/804] (P1)

DA51/805 They were to proclaim the gospel of peace and salvation through repentance and the power of the Saviour. [H/36,46c/804,806] (P1)

MS(149)28 They were to preach and teach the gospel in Christ's name. [H/47/806] (P2)

DA52/805 "And when He had said this, He breathed on them, and saith unto them, Receive ye the Holy Ghost: Whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted unto them; and whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained." [H/48/806] (B1)

MS(149)29 The instruction given them had the vital, spiritual breath that is in Jesus. [H/49/806] (I2)

36/804+ Now that the needful work of suffering and death were over; now that the wonderful exhibition at once of the sacredness of the Divine law, the holiness of the Divine character, the deep unutterable love of God, had been given; now, wide over all the world, were repentance and remission of sin to be proclaimed in his name; and they, the men to whom Jesus was then speaking, were to be the witnesses, the heralds, the preachers of this large and all-embracing gospel of peace on earth, and good-will on God's part towards all the children of men: the first and earliest hint this of the nature and the extent of their great commission; a hint which they did not then understand, which they did not understand even under the enlightening and quickening influence of the day of Pentecost. [Hanna, LC]

46c/806 that of publishing everywhere the gospel of this peace; preaching peace by me to them that are afar off, and to them that are nigh; "For as my Father sent me, even so now send I you." [Hanna, LC]

47/806 I send you forth in my name, and I will qualify you by my Spirit. [Hanna, LC]

48/806 And having said so, he breathed on them, and said, "Receive ye the Holy Ghost"--an outward and expressive symbol; of the twofold truth, that dead, motionless, useless for all the common work of this earthly existence, as lay that dust which the hand of the Creator moulded into human form till he breathed into it the breath of his natural life, so dead, motionless, useless for the work of our Christian calling do we all lie, till the breath of true spiritual life be breathed into us by the Holy Ghost. [Hanna, LC]

49/806 And as it was from the lips of the risen Saviour that the breath proceeded, which spread out upon the little company at Jerusalem, so is it from the risen, exalted Saviour that the Spirit comes, whose life-giving influences spread over the whole church of the first-born. [Hanna, LC]

DA53/805 The Holy Spirit was not yet fully manifested; for Christ had not yet been glorified. [H/53/806] (V2)

MS(149)36 But the Holy Spirit was not yet fully manifested, because Christ had not yet been glorified. [H/53/806] (V2)

DA54/805 The more abundant impartation of the Spirit did not take place till after Christ's ascension. [H/54/806] (P1)

DA55/805 Not until this was received could the disciples fulfill the commission to preach the gospel to the world. [H/50/806] (P2)

DA56/805 But the Spirit was now given for a special purpose. [H/50/806] (P2)

DA57/805 Before the disciples could fulfill their official duties in connection with the church, Christ breathed His Spirit upon them. [H/50/806] (I2)

MS(149)35 Thus they were to fulfil the official duties connected with the church. [H/50/806] (I2)

DA58/805 He was committing to them a most sacred trust, and He desired to impress them with the fact that without the Holy Spirit this work could not be accomplished. [H/51/806] (I2)

MS(149)34 Without this qualification, their work could not be accomplished. [H/51/806] (P1)

DA59/805 The Holy Spirit is the breath of spiritual life in the soul. [H/48,56/806] (P2)

MS(149)38 The Holy Spirit is the breath of life in the soul. [H/56/806] (P2)

MS(149)39 The breathing of Christ upon his disciples was the breath of true spiritual life. [H/48,50/806] (P1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

53/806 The Holy Ghost was not yet in his fulness given, because that Jesus was not yet glorified. [Hanna, LC]

54/806 The more plentiful effusion of this gift was reserved for the day of Pentecost. [Hanna, LC]

50/806 But specially upon this occasion was the breathing of Jesus upon the disciples, and the gift which accompanied that breathing, meant to indicate that the mission on which Jesus was sending these disciples out--that of being witnesses for him--was one that could alone be discharged by those who, through him, had received more or less of that heavenly gift. [Hanna, LC]

51/806 It was this impartation of the Spirit, which was to form the one, indispensable qualification for the work; without which it could not be done. [Hanna, LC]

56/806+ This was but an earnest of better things to come--a few sprinkled drops of that fuller baptism wherewith they were afterwards to be baptized; but yet enough to teach that it was by Spirit-taught, Spirit-moved men--by men in whose breasts the heaven-kindled fire of the true spiritual life had begun to burn--that the commission Jesus had been giving could alone be executed. [Hanna, LC]

DA60/805 The impartation of the Spirit is the impartation of the life of Christ. [H/51/806] (I2)

MS(149)33 The impartation of the Spirit was the impartation of the very life of Christ, which was to qualify the disciples for their mission. [H/50,51/806] (I2)

DA61/805 It imbues the receiver with the attributes of Christ. (I1)

MS(149)40 The disciples were to interpret this as imbuing them with the attributes of Christ, that in purity, faith, and obedience, they might exalt the law and make it honorable. (I1)

MS(149)47 The Holy Spirit will convince of sin, righteousness, and of judgment. [H/55/806] (B1)

DA62/805 Only those who are thus taught of God, those who possess the inward working of the Spirit, and in whose life the Christ-life is manifested, are to stand as representative men, to minister in behalf of the church. [H/57/807] (I2)

MS(149)48 The lesson given to the disciples means that wise men, truly taught of God, possessing the inward working of the Holy Spirit, are to be representative men, samples of the whole body of believers. [H/57/807] (I2)

DA63/805 "Whosoever sins ye remit," said Christ, "they are remitted; . . . and whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained." [Jn. 20:23] [H/58/807] (B1)

DA64/805 Christ here gives no liberty for any man to pass judgment upon others. [H/60/807] (P3)

[See above Hanna 50, 51/806]

[Hanna emphasizes the work of the Holy Spirit to convince mankind of sin and opening their minds to understand the Scriptures.]

55/806 That Spirit, who was to convince of sin, and to lead into all truth, began even then, indeed, his gracious work in the minds and hearts of these disciples, by convincing them of their unbelief and hardness of heart, and by opening their minds to understand the Scriptures. [Hanna, LC]

57/807 And let not those to whom Jesus is now speaking, speaking as the heads and representatives of the whole body of his true followers upon earth; let them not think, weak as they are, powerless as they appear, that, in going forth to proclaim in his name, to every penitent transgressor, the free, full, instant, gracious pardon of all his sins, they are embarking in an ideal, unreal work--a work of which they shall never know whether they are succeeding in it or not. [Hanna, LC]

58/807 'No,' says the Saviour; 'Partake of the peace I now impart, accept the commission I now bestow; go forth in my name; receive ye the Holy Ghost to guide you; announce the news of God to sinners; proclaim the remission of sins, and, verily I say, whosoever sins ye thus remit, they are remitted; whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained.' [Hanna, LC]

60/807 It were to misinterpret the incidents of that evening meeting, it were to mistake the simple, immediate, and precise object which, in using them, our Lord had in view, to explain these words, as if they were intended to clothe the eleven apostles, and after them, their successors, or representatives--to clothe any class of officials in the church, exclusively, with a power of remitting and retaining sins. [Hanna, LC]

DA65/804 In the Sermon on the Mount He forbade this.
[H/69a/808] (I2)

MS(149)45 The warnings in the seventh chapter of Matthew forbid men from pronouncing judgment on their fellow-men. [H/69a/808] (I2)

DA66/805 It is the prerogative of God. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)46 The remission of sins is to be understood as the prerogative of God alone. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)51 Moreover if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone; if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother. [H/69b/808] (B1)

MS(149)52 But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee one or two more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every word may be established.
[H/70/808] (B1)

MS(149)53 And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church: but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as an heathen man and a publican. [H/71/808] (B1)

MS(149)54 Verily I say unto you, Whatsoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven, and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven." [H/72/808] (B1)

DA67/805 But on the church in its organized capacity He places a responsibility for the individual members.
[H/76/808] (P2)

MS(149)59 Remitting sins or restraining¹ sins applied to the church in her organized capacity.
[H/76/808] (P1)

¹RH June 13, 1899, reprinted MS 149, 1897, and sentence 59 appears with "retaining" in place of "restraining." With only the typewritten secretarial copy of the manuscript we have no way of checking for copy error. We have evaluated the sentence according to the published text.

69a/808 Jesus had once before used words of nearly the same import with those that are now before us, and he had addressed them to the disciples at large: [Hanna, LC]

88/809 And if, in executing that simple but most honorable office of proclaiming unto all men that there is remission of sins through the name of Jesus, she teaches that it is alone through her channels--through channels that priestly or ordained and consecrated hands can alone open--the pardon cometh, she trenches upon the rights and prerogatives of Him whom she represents, and turns that eye upon herself that should be turned alone on him. [Hanna, LC]

69b/808 "Moreover, if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone; if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother. [Hanna, LC]

70/808 "But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee one or two more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every work may be established. [Hanna, LC]

71/808 "And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church: but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as a heathen man and a publican. [Hanna, LC]

72/808 "Verily I say unto you, Whatsoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven; and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven." [Hanna, LC]

76/808 We are not in the least disposed to doubt, that while Christ speaks of the remitting and the retaining of sins as pertaining to the church at large, his words cover the acts of the church in her organized capacity, the inflicting and removing of ecclesiastical censures through her office-bearers in the exercise of discipline. [Hanna, LC]

MS(149)61 Censure is to be given. [H/76/808] (P1)

MS(149)62 This censure is to be removed when the one
in error confesses and repents of his sin.
[H/76/808] (I2)

DA68/805 Toward those who fall into sin, the church has a duty, to warn, to instruct, and if possible to restore. (I1)

DA69/805 "Reprove, rebuke, exhort," the Lord says, "with all long-suffering and doctrine." 2 Tim. 4:2. (B2)

DA70/805+ Deal faithfully with wrongdoing. (I1)

DA71/806 Warn every soul that is in danger. (I1)

DA72/806 Leave none to deceive themselves. (I1)

DA73/806 Call sin by its right name. (I1)

DA74/806 Declare what God has said in regard to lying, Sabbathbreaking, stealing, idolatry, and every other evil. (I1)

DA75/806 "They which do such things shall not inherit the kingdom of God." Gal. 5:21. (B2)

DA76/806 If they persist in sin, the judgment you have declared from God's word is pronounced upon them in heaven. (I1)

DA77/806 In choosing to sin, they disown Christ; the church must show that she does not sanction their deeds, or she herself dishonors her Lord. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

DA78/806 She must say about sin what God says about it.
[H/77/808] (P2)

DA79/806 She must deal with it as God directs, and her action is ratified in heaven. [H/59/807] (P2)

DA80/806 He who despises the authority of the church despises the authority of Christ Himself. [H/77/808] (I2)

DA81/806 But there is a brighter side to the picture. (I1)

DA82/806 "Whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted."
[John 20:23a] (B2)

DA83/806 Let this thought be kept uppermost. (I1)

DA84/806 In labor for the erring, let every eye be directed to Christ. [H/88/809] (I2)

DA85/806 Let the shepherds have a tender care for the flock of the Lord's pasture. [H/93/810] (P2)

DA86/806 Let them speak to the erring of the forgiving mercy of the Saviour. [H/90/810] (P2)

DA87/806 Let them encourage the sinner to repent, and believe in Him who can pardon. [H/89,90/809] (P2)

DA88/806 Let them declare, on the authority of God's word, "If we confess our sins, He is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness." 1 John 1:9. (B2)

DA89/806 All who repent have the assurance, "He will have compassion upon us; He will subdue our iniquities; and Thou wilt cast all their sins into the depths of the sea." Micah 7:19. [H/89/809] (B1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

59/807 Such I take to be the real spirit and objects of these last words of Jesus, as spoken by him to his disciples at this time; words spoken to animate them in their after work by the assurance that they should not labor in vain; that what they should do on earth should be owned and ratified in heaven. [Hanna, LC]

77/808 Here, however, we have two remarks to make: First, that it is only so far as these acts are done by spiritual men, seeking and following the guidance of the Spirit, only so far as they are in accordance with Christ's own expressed will, that they are of any avail, or can plead any heavenly ratification; and, secondly, that all the force they carry is nothing more or less than an authoritative and official declaration of what that will of the Lord is. [Hanna, LC]

[See H/88/809 below]

93/810 Assuming that it lay with the church to extend her forgiveness to that offender, desiring to do nothing upon his own individual authority, claiming no exclusive power of priestly absolution, Paul invites the Corinthian believers to deal tenderly, forgivingly with that man, and to receive him back into their communion, telling them that he was quite prepared to go along with them in such treatment of the penitent. [Hanna, LC]

90/809 Wherever the gospel of the grace of God is preached, not generally, but pointedly, to an individual man, and he is entreated and encouraged to take hold of peace, to accept of pardon, to trust in the mercy of Jesus, to believe in the forgiving love of God--then is that office of remitting sins in the name of Jesus undertaken and discharged. [Hanna, LC]

89/809 But it is the gracious office of the church, of every individual member thereof, of every distinct community thereof, in the sense here indicated, to absolve the sinner, to assure him of the divine forgiveness, to help him to believe in that forgiveness. [Hanna, CC]

DA90/806 Let the repentance of the sinner be accepted by the church with grateful hearts. (I1)

DA91/806 Let the repenting one be led out from the darkness of unbelief into the light of faith and righteousness. (I1)

DA92/806 Let his trembling hand be placed in the loving hand of Jesus. (I1)

DA93/806 Such a remission is ratified in heaven.
[H/59,77/807,808] (P2) [See DA79/806 above.]

DA94/806 Only in this sense has the church power to absolve the sinner. [H/87,78/809,808] (P2)

DA95/806 Remission of sins can be obtained only through the merits of Christ. [H/88/809] (P2)

MS(149)55 There is no power given to any of God's delegated servants to cast down or destroy.
[H/83/809] (I2)

DA96/806 To no man, to no body of men, is given power to free the soul from guilt. [H/78/808] (P2)

MS(149)86 On no man, priest, or pope, but on God alone rests the forgiveness of sins. [H/78-80/808]
(P2)

DA97/806 Christ charged his disciples to preach the remission of sins in His name among all nations; but they themselves were not empowered to remove one stain of sin.
[H/83,85/809] (P2)

[See above.]

87/809 The church's function is as strictly limited to the announcing of a pardon which it is for the grace of the heavenly Forgiver alone to bestow. [Hanna, LC]

88/809 And if, in executing that simple but most honorable office of proclaiming unto all men that there is remission of sins through the name of Jesus, she teaches that it is alone through her channels--through channels that priestly or ordained and consecrated hands can alone open--the pardon cometh, she trenches upon the rights and prerogatives of Him whom she represents, and turns that eye upon herself that should be turned alone on him. [Hanna, LC]

83/809 Here, in terms not less distinct than those in which Christ gives his disciples power over the sins of men, to remit or to retain, God gives to the two prophets power over the nations to cast down and to destroy. [Hanna, LC]

78/808 Neither in any man, in any pope or any priest, in any community, or in any ecclesiastical court, lies the absolute, the independent, the arbitrary power to absolve the sinner from his sins. [Hanna, LC]

79/808 But did not he, we are asked, with whom alone it is acknowledged that that power rests, appoint the eleven as his earthly delegates, and in the commission here given them, convey into their hands as such, that power? [Hanna, LC]

80/808 Just as little as in two other commissions given to two of the old prophets, he handed over to them that power over the kingdoms and nations of the earth which we rightly believe and affirm resides alone in the hands of the Almighty. [Hanna, LC]

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - ELLEN G. WHITE

MS(149)56 The apostles were unable to remove the guilt from any soul. [H/85/809] (V2)

DA98/806 The name of Jesus is the only "name under heaven given among men, whereby we must be saved." Acts 4:12. (I1)

DA99/806 When Jesus first met the disciples in the upper chamber, Thomas was not with them. [H/1/811] (P1)

3SP49/219 He was not present in the upper chamber when Jesus appeared to his disciples. [H/1/811] (P1)

3SP47/219 The death of Jesus had left Thomas in blank despair. [H/6/811] (P1)

DA100/806 He heard the reports of others, and received abundant proof that Jesus had risen; but gloom and unbelief filled his heart. [H/7/811] (P2)

DA101/806 As he heard the disciples tell of the wonderful manifestations of the risen Saviour, it only plunged him in deeper despair. [H/7,8/811,812] (P3)

85/809 In the exercise of any power, inherent or delegated, natural or acquired, Jeremiah and Ezekiel were altogether impotent of themselves to overturn a nation; in the exercise of any power, original or conferred, personal or official, the apostles were just as impotent to remove any sinner's guilt. [Hanna, LC]

1/811 Was it his fault, or his misfortune simply, that Thomas was not present at that first meeting on the evening of the day of the resurrection? [Hanna, LC]

6/811 It may, therefore, have been Thomas' extreme incredulity as to the fact of the resurrection, the utter and blank despair into which the death of his Master had cast him, which indisposed him to join the rest. [Hanna, LC]

7/811+ If it were so; if he kept aloof from his brethren as believing that no good could come from their assembling; that it was all over with the hopes as to their Master which they had been cherishing; that they were mere idle tales which had been circulating about his having risen from the dead; then for his neglect of all that Jesus had predicted about his death and resurrection, and for his treatment of the testimony of Peter and the other early visitors of the sepulchre, he was amply punished, in losing that sight of the risen Jesus given to the others, and in his being left, for the seven days that followed, to the wretchedness of uncertainty and doubt--an uncertainty and doubt which would be all the bitterer, as contrasted with the unclouded convictions and new-born joy of his brother disciples. [Hanna, LC]

8/812 While they, lifted from the depths of their despair, were congratulating one another on the great triumph over death and the grave which their Master had achieved, were strengthening each other's faith, and heightening each other's joy, he, alone and disconsolate, was scraping together the scanty food on which his incredulity might nourish itself. [Hanna, LC]

DA102/806+ If Jesus had really risen from the dead there could be no further hope of a literal earthly kingdom.
[H/7,22/811,812] (P2)

DA103/807 And it wounded his vanity to think that his Master should reveal Himself to all the disciples except him. [H/71/816] (P2)

DA104/807 He was determined not to believe, and for a whole week he brooded over his wretchedness, which seemed all the darker in contrast with the hope and faith of his brethren. [H/7/811] (P1)

DA105/807 During this time he repeatedly declared, "Except I shall see in His hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into His side, I will not believe." [H/13/812] (B1)

DA106/807 He would not see through the eyes of his brethren, or exercise faith which was dependent upon their testimony. [H/56/815] (P2)

DA107/807 He ardently loved his Lord, but he had allowed jealousy and unbelief to take possession of his mind and heart. (I1)

DA108/807 A number of the disciples now made the familiar upper chamber their temporary home, and at evening all except Thomas gathered here. (I1)

DA109/807 One evening Thomas determined to meet with the others. (I1)

DA110/807 Notwithstanding his unbelief, he had a faint hope that the good news was true. [H/81,87/816] (P2)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

22/813 It was not the character of the event, it was the nature of their precedent faith in, and their precedent expectations about, their Master and his kingdom, which generated the difficulty which was felt by them as to believing in the resurrection. [Hanna, LC]

71/816 'And is it even thus,' we feel disposed to make answer, 'that thy hurt vanity hopes to redeem itself from the fancied oversight; is it thus that placed, as thou thinkest, below thy brethren, by not having got the same proof given them, thou thinkest to set thyself right by putting thyself above them, and declaring that that proof may have been enough for them, but is not enough for thee?' [Hanna, LC]

[See Hanna, LC 7/811 above.]

13/812 All that is told is, that he took and kept resolutely to that position behind which he had entrenched himself, as he said, "Except I shall see in his hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into his side, I will not believe." Jn. 20:25 [Hanna, LC]

56/815 He did not like, he did not choose to be indebted to others for the grounds of his believing. [Hanna, LC]

81/816 He had taken up a position which it behooved him to defend; but I am much mistaken, if a strong desire, an expectation, nay, something of a faith, that it was even as his brethren had told him, was not working latently, yet strongly in his breast. [Hanna, LC]

DA111/807 While the disciples were taking their evening meal, they talked of the evidences which Christ had given them in the prophecies. (I1)

DA112/807 "Then came Jesus, the doors being shut, and stood in the midst, and said, Peace be unto you." (B2)

DA113/807 Turning to Thomas He said, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold My hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into My side: and be not faithless, but believing." [H/89/817] (B1)

DA114/807 These words showed that He was acquainted with the thoughts and words of Thomas. [H/91,93/817] (I2)

DA115/807 The doubting disciple knew that none of his companions had seen Jesus for a week. [H/91a/817] (V2)

DA116/807 They could not have told the Master of his unbelief. [H/91b/817] (P1)

DA117/807 He recognized the One before him as his Lord. [H/93/817] (P2)

DA118/807 He had no desire for further proof. [H/98/817] (P2)

DA119/807 His heart leaped for joy, and he cast himself at the feet of Jesus crying, "My Lord and my God." [H/100/817] (P2)

3SP63/221 He cast himself at the feet of his Master in deep affection and devotion, crying, "My Lord and my God." [Jn. 20:28] [H/100/817] (P1)

DA120/807 Jesus accepted his acknowledgment, but gently reproved his unbelief; "Thomas, because thou hast seen Me, thou hast believed: blessed are they that have not seen, and yet have believed." [H/110-112/818] (P2)

3SP64/221 Jesus accepted his acknowledgment, but mildly rebuked him for his unbelief: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed; [H/110-112/818] (P1)

89/817 The general salutation over, and before another word was spoken, he turns to Thomas and says, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold my hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into my side: and be not faithless, but believing." Jn. 20:17 [Hanna, LC]

91a/87 Thomas knew that for seven days none of the disciples had seen the Lord; [Hanna, LC]

91b/817 none of them could have reported to Him the words that he used. [Hanna, LC]

93/817 It is the omniscient Jesus; it is his own well-beloved Master who stands before him! [Hanna, LC]

98/817 That sight, those words of Jesus, are sufficient to rebuke and to remove his unbelief. [Hanna, LC]

100/817 Adoring, believing, loving, the fervent, affectionate Thomas casts himself at his Master's feet, exclaiming, "My Lord and my God!" [Hanna, LC]

110a/818 But though he refuses not the tendered homage, he passes no such approving judgment on him who presents it, [Hanna, LC]

111/818 Instead of this, Christ administers now a mild but effective rebuke: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed. Jn. 20:29 [Hanna, LC]

DA121/807 The faith of Thomas would have been more pleasing to Christ if he had been willing to believe upon the testimony of his brethren. [H/115/818] (I2)

3SP65/221 Jesus here showed Thomas that his faith would have been more acceptable to him if he had believed the evidence of his brethren, and had not refused to believe until he had seen Jesus with his own eyes. [H/115/818] (I2)

DA122/807 Should the world now follow the example of Thomas, no one would believe unto salvation; for all who receive Christ must do so through the testimony of others. [H/117/818] (I1)

DA123/807 Many who are given to doubt excuse themselves by saying that if they had the evidence which Thomas had from his companions, they would believe. [H/118/818] (P2)

DA124/807+ They do not realize that they have not only that evidence, but much more. [H/119/818] (I2)

DA125/808 Many who, like Thomas, wait for all cause of doubt to be removed, will never realize their desire. (I1)

DA126/808 They gradually become confirmed in unbelief. (I1)

DA127/808 Those who educate themselves to look on the dark side, and murmur and complain, know not what they do. (I1)

DA128/808 They are sowing seeds of doubt, and they will have a harvest of doubt to reap. (I1)

DA129/808 At a time when faith and confidence are most essential, many will thus find themselves powerless to hope and believe. (I1)

The Desire of Ages - Chapter 84 - SOURCES

112/818 "Blessed are they who have not seen, and yet have believed." Jn. 20:29 [Hanna, LC]

115/818 It was, in fact, as addressed to Thomas, a distinct enough yet delicate intimation that his faith had been all the more acceptable to his Master if it had not been delayed so long. [Hanna, LC]

117/818 The spirit of Thomas still lives among us. [Hanna, LC]

118/818 Have we not often detected ourselves, thinking at least, if not saying, that, had we lived in the days of Jesus Christ, had we seen what those disciples saw, we would not have doubted as they did; that, give us but the evidence that they had, and our doubts would disappear? [Hanna, LC]

119/818 We practise thus a strange deception upon ourselves. [Hanna, LC]

DA130/808 In his treatment of Thomas, Jesus gave a lesson for His followers. [H/132/819] (P2)

DA131/808 His example shows how we should treat those whose faith is weak, and who make their doubts prominent. [H/132/819] (I2)

3SP72/222 Jesus in his treatment of Thomas gave his followers a lesson regarding the manner in which they should treat those who have doubts upon religious truth, and who make those doubts prominent. [H/132/819] (I2)

DA132/808 Jesus did not overwhelm Thomas with Reproach, nor did He enter into controversy with him. [H/133,136/819] (P2)

DA133/808 He revealed Himself to the doubting one. [H/137/819] (P1)

3SP73/222 He did not overwhelm Thomas with words of reproach, nor did he enter into a controversy with him; but, with marked condescension and tenderness, he revealed himself unto the doubting one. [H/133,136,137/819] (P1)

DA134/808 Thomas had been most unreasonable in dictating the conditions of his faith, but Jesus, by His generous love and consideration, broke down all the barriers. [H/135,137/819] (P1)

3SP74/222 Thomas had taken a most unreasonable position, in dictating the only conditions of his faith; but Jesus, by his generous love and consideration, broke down all the barriers he had raised. [H/135,137/819] (P1)

DA135/808 Unbelief is seldom overcome by controversy. (I1)

DA136/808 It is rather put upon self-defense, and finds new support and excuse. (I1)

DA137/808 But let Jesus, in His love and mercy, be revealed as the crucified Saviour, and from many once unwilling lips will be heard the acknowledgment of Thomas, "My Lord and my God." [H/138/819] (I2)

132/819 Second; Let us take this instance of our Lord's treatment of Thomas, as a guide and example to us how to treat those who have doubts and difficulties about the great facts and truths of religion. [Hanna, LC]

133/819 There was surely a singular toleration, a singular tenderness, a singular condescension in the manner of the Saviour's conduct here towards the doubting, unbelieving apostle. [Hanna, LC]

136/819 What abundant materials for controversy, for condemnation did his case supply! [Hanna, LC]

135/819 It was not only an unreasonable, it was a proud, a presumptuous position he took up, in dictating the conditions upon which alone he would believe. [Hanna, LC]

137/819 Yet not by these does Jesus work upon him, but by love--by simply showing himself, by stooping even to comply with the conditions so unreasonably and presumptuously prescribed. [Hanna, LC]

138/819 And if, in kindred cases--when the spirit of religious incredulity is busy in any human breast, doing there its unhappy work in blasting the inward peace--waiving all controversy we could but present the Saviour as he is, and get the eye to rest upon him, and the heart to take in a right impression of the depth and the tenderness and the condescension of his love, might not many a vexed spirit be led to throw itself down before such a Saviour, saying "Lord I believe; help thou mine unbelief". [Hanna, LC]

Analysis

It should be very clear by now that much of Ellen White's commentary extends beyond what may be found in Scripture. She not only treats matters not covered in Scripture but also enlarges on topics only briefly alluded to in the Bible. At times her remarks are her own and at other times she uses material taken from other writers. Since this study is not primarily concerned with content analysis we have not made a serious attempt to compare her themes with those of Scripture or her sources.¹

We have, however, looked at the arrangement of the content for possible source dependency. In order to make this type of comparison it is necessary to note the order of the biblical narrative which is common to both Ellen White and her sources.

In chapter 84 there are some interesting differences between Ellen White's comments and the Scripture narrative which go beyond the general thematic structure. In the interest of placing the biblical material as background to the entire analysis we will first review the story line of Scripture and then move to the specific treatment of source and redactional dependency for both the DA and pre-DA texts.

The footnote at the bottom of the title page to chapter 84 of the DA text indicates that Ellen White's comments

¹For example we did not mention in the previous chapter how much of her discussion of resurrection day, the Emmaus journey, the meal, or the return trip to Jerusalem was extrabiblical as well as original and/or source dependent.

"Peace Be Unto You"

were "based on Luke 24:33-48; John 20:19-29."¹ Luke records that the two disciples return to Jerusalem and meet with the eleven and others with them at some undisclosed location. The eleven testify that Jesus was alive and had been seen by Simon. The report makes brief reference to "what things were done in the way" and that they recognized Jesus in the breaking of the bread. Suddenly Jesus appears before them and they are afraid. Jesus calms them and invites them to look at the wounds of His hands and feet. To clinch the question of His reality, He asks for food and eats before them. He then appeals to Scripture and shows them how His sufferings, death, and resurrection fulfilled the prophecies found in the Old Testament. Luke then changes the words of "Jesus" to third person and presents Jesus as talking about the preaching of "Christ" to all nations, offering repentance and remission of sins "in His name." They as witnesses were to wait in Jerusalem until they were "endued with power" before beginning their work.²

This single meeting as detailed by Luke is not mentioned in Matthew who mentions only the one appearance of Jesus to the women leaving the tomb and Jesus' later meeting with the disciples in Galilee.³ Mark's gospel speaks of the

¹DA, page 802. The earlier DA working manuscript shows that these Bible references were given for each chapter by either Ellen White or Marian Davis. We are assuming this plan was followed for the entire text. These same entries appear in the first edition of DA.

²The quotations and paraphrase are taken from the King James Version.

³Matthew 28:8-17.

"Peace Be Unto You"

encounter of Jesus and Mary, the appearance "in another form" to the two who "went into the country," and of one appearance before the "eleven as they sat at meat . . ."¹

A careful comparison of these synoptic gospels reveals several differences. Matthew says nothing of the Jerusalem meeting and actually has Jesus telling the women to instruct the disciples that He will see them in Galilee (28:10). Mark and Luke refer to a mealtime appearance of Jesus with the eleven where, according to Mark, Jesus "upbraided them" (16:14) for their lack of faith. It is possible to view Jesus' remarks and arguments of His physical reality as "upbraiding." (Luke 24:38-43). There also may be some question over the time of this mealtime appearance. Luke clearly places this interview with Jesus on resurrection day. Mark uses the adverb "afterward" or "later," which could refer to some days later. But in view of his use of the expression "appeared first" (v. 14), it would seem that Mark is still referring to the events of resurrection day. He does not otherwise refer to Jesus' activities such as the Galilee visit mentioned by Matthew, and in this respect also his account matches Luke's record which leads the reader to conclude that Jesus ascends to heaven on resurrection day.²

¹Mark 16:9-16. Since the Markan account is not a major element in our chapter we will not discuss the question over the authenticity of these verses. See SDA BC V, pp. 658-659.

²Luke also places the ascension in Bethany, whereas Matthew points to a mountain in Galilee but does not specifically describe the ascension. Cf. Luke 24:50, 51 and Matthew 28:16-20.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Where Luke and Mark basically agree on the one appearance of Jesus before the eleven, and that on the day of resurrection, Matthew records no such encounter and John has two. John's gospel also reports that Thomas was absent from the first gathering on the evening of the resurrection day, making it possible for only ten of the disciples to have witnessed this first appearance of Jesus.¹ Against Luke's report of Jesus' telling the disciples to remain in Jerusalem until they be given the power to witness, John speaks of giving them the Holy Spirit on the first occasion. John also describes the second appearance of Jesus before the disciples and Thomas' doubts as well as his confession of faith. John tells us nothing of the Emmaus experience and has no ascension of Jesus. His final chapter does include some comment on the Galilee appearances of Jesus as mentioned by Matthew.

In uniting the accounts of Luke and John as does Ellen White in chapter 84 we would anticipate three main points of interest for the chapter. These would be the first appearance of Jesus before His disciples, the giving of the Holy Spirit to all the remaining disciples but Thomas, and the second appearance before the disciples when doubting Thomas becomes a believer again.

We now turn to our analysis of Ellen White's writings on these topics. With this background on the agreements and disagreements of Scripture we will be in a better position

¹John 20:19-31.

to evaluate her reconstruction of the story and her commentary on these two encounters of Jesus with His disciples.

Source Analysis - The DA Text

Chapter 84 contains 137 sentences or 138 evaluation units.¹ As Table 1, page 821 indicates, 5 of the sentences were evaluated as Verbatim, 25 as Strict Paraphrase, 39 as Simple Paraphrase, and 2 as Loose Paraphrase. Ellen White's independent commentary took 28 sentences, 17 showed Partial Independence, and 7 reflected some dependency in the use of quotations from the Bible. We counted 15 independent Bible quotations.

Most of the literary parallels came from Hanna's Life of Christ as Table 2 on page 822 shows. Hanna influenced 61 sentences and 34 parallels came from Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. If we count the sentences of Partial Dependence on the side of dependence, we have 95 of the 138 sentence units, or 69 percent of the chapter, indicating some dependence. Ellen White's independent commentary of 28 sentences accounts for 20 percent of the chapter. The 15 Bible quotations take up 11 percent of the chapter's comments.

According to our evaluation scale the 123 sentences, or 89% of the text of commentary, measures a dependency rate of 2.83 or nearly that of Loose Paraphrase on the average. If

¹DA10 is divided into 10a and 10b.

TABLE 1

EVALUATIONS OF LITERARY PARALLELS FOR CHAPTER 84

Ellen White Text

TEXT										TOTAL
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	
V1 Strict Verbatim										
V2 Verbatim										
P1 Strict Paraphrase										
P2 Simple Paraphrase										
P3 Loose Paraphrase										
B1 Source Bible										
I2 Partial Independence										
I1 Strict Independence										
B2 Bible										
01. DA	00	05	25	39	02	07	17	28	15	138
02. 3SP(78)	00	05	13	06	00	00	05	01	00	30
03. ST(88)	00	01	03	01	00	00	00	00	00	05
04. MS113(97)	00	01	05	03	03	00	00	00	00	12
05. MS149(97)	00	02	05	03	00	05	07	01	00	23
TOTALS PRE-DA	00	09	26	13	03	05	12	(02)	(00)	70

TABLE 2

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 84

Desire of Ages Text

TEXT		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	TOTAL
		Strict Verbatim	Verbatim	Strict Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Loose Paraphrase	Source Bible	Partial Independence	Strict Independence	Bible	
01. Bible	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	00	(15)	15
02. Hanna LC	00	02	10	27	02	05	15	00	00	00	61
03. March NS	00	03	15	12	00	02	02	00	00	00	34
TOTALS DA Text	00	05	25	39	02	07	17	00	(15)	110	

"Peace Be Unto You"

we omit the independent sentences as well as the Bible quotations, the 95 dependent sentences average 3.66, about midpoint between Loose and Simple Paraphrase. A complete list of the DA sentences, their literary source parallels, and evaluations may be found in Appendix A.

In our efforts to discover how much of chapter 84 was written independently of the earlier writings we compared the sentences of the DA text with the sentences of the earlier texts. This comparative study is found in Table A, beginning on page 825. Only those sentences listed in column 5 to the extreme right and having no corresponding parallel with an earlier text can be taken as possibly original with the DA text.¹ Only DA sentences 43, 56, 68, 70, 72, 73, 75-81, 83, 90-94, 127, 128, and 129 have no previous text parallel. Of these 22 sentences 14 are Ellen White's independent comment, 6 relate to Hanna's life of Christ, 1 from March, and 1 from the Bible.

We do not mean to suggest that these 22 sentences, or approximately 16% of the chapter, represent new content.² While some of the material is new because of Ellen White's

¹It is possible we have missed some of Ellen White's earlier remarks on these topics. We have largely confined our review to the larger narrative commentary of Ellen White. We have not checked with the E. G. White indices to see if devotional or doctrinal texts previously written included such remarks.

²The sentences listed in column 5 do not exactly match the evaluation units of our study. In order to show the corresponding sentence content between sentences which have been rewritten and rearranged we have had to designate the sections of some sentences by a letter of the alphabet. We list 141 sentence units in column 5 but our text presentation lists 138.

"Peace Be Unto You"

enlargement of her independent material or her return to the sources for additional parallels,¹ these sentences also include thoughts found earlier in her comments but presented in the DA text in such a form as to be literarily independent from the previously written texts. Our major purpose in bringing up this comparative study is to emphasize the 84% of the chapter which is dependent on earlier compositions. The high percentage of dependency on the earlier materials provides clear evidence that the DA text is a composite work.

Another approach in support of the same claim is to note how many sentences under the DA column, or fifth column counting from the left, are not presented in parentheses or brackets. When the earliest form of the text, the 3SP form, is to a major degree changed in a later text or manuscript the change is indicated by parentheses. If a second change occurs the sentence is bracketed. If a third change takes place we return to the parenthesis sign. If no parentheses or brackets appear the sentence is actually or virtually identical to an earlier form of the same sentence. Out of the 141 sentences or sentence units given in column 5 of Table A, 92 indicate no change. If we subtract the 22 sentences which are new for the DA text we are left with 70

¹We shall have more to say about Ellen White's return to the sources under the analysis of the pre-DA text below. Even though 7 of the 22 new sentences reflect parallels from Hanna and March not previously quoted in the earlier writings there is also evidence in support of this claim to be found in studying the modifications made to the earlier texts.

TABLE A
LISTING OF PARALLEL SENTENCES FOR CHAPTER 84

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
001. -	1				(1)
002. -	2	(70a)			2
003. -	3b	(70b)	[112]		(3)
004. -	3a				(4)
005. -	4				
006. -	5		(113)		5
007. -			114		6
008. -	6a		(115)		7
009. -			116		8
010. -			117		9
011. -	6a	(71)	[118a]		10a
012. -	6b				(10b)
013. -		72	(118b)		11
014. -	7		(119)		12
015. -	8				
016. -	9				
017. -	10				
018. -	11		(120)		13
019. -			121		(14)
020. -	12		122-125		
021. -	13				
022. -				21a	
023. -	14	(73a)	[126a]		15a
024. -	15	(73b)	[126b]		15b
025. -		74	(127)		16
026. -			128		17
027. -		75			
028. -		76a	129		18
029. -		76b	130		19
030. -			131		20
031. -	16	(77a)	[132]	21b	21
032. -	17				22
033. -			140	(23)	
034. -	18	77b			23
035. -	19	78	141		24
036. -	20		142	22	25
037. -	21a				26
038. -	21b				27
039. -	22	79	143		28
040. -	23	80	144		29
041. -	24	81	145		30
042. -			133	24	31
043. -	25				32
044. -	35				(33)

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
045. -	36				(34)
046. -	37				35
047. -	38				36
048. -	39				37
049. -	40a				
050. -	40b				
051. -	40c				
052. -	41				
053. -	42				38
054. -	43				(39)
055. -	44				(40)
056. -	45				41
057. -	46a				(42)
058. -					43
059. -	46b				44
060. -	26				(45a)
061. -	27		146		(45b)
062. -	28, 29		147		46
063. -	30		148		47
064. -	31			(27)	[48]
065. -	32				49
066. -	33				(50)
067. -	34	(86)		[28]	51
068. -			134	25	
069. -			135, 136	26	52
070. -				29	
071. -				30	
072. -				31	
073. -				32	
074. -			131	36	53
075. -				37	54
076. -			137	(63a)	[55]
077. -					56
078. -			138	(35, 67)	[57]
079. -			139	(33b, 34)	[58]
080. -				38, 39	(59)
081. -				33a	(60)
082. -				40a, 66b	61
083. -				40b	
084. -				47	
085. -				41	
086. -				42	
087. -				43	
088. -				66a, 63b, 48	(62)
089. -				64	
090. -				65	

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
091. -				68	
092. -				44	(63)
093. -				45b	(64)
094. -				45a	(65)
095. -				46	(66)
096. -				49	
097. -				50	
098. -				51	
099. -				52	
100. -				53	
101. -				54	
102. -				(59)	67
103. -				61	
104. -				62	
105. -					68
106. -				60	(69)
107. -					70
108. -				84	71
109. -					72
110. -					73
111. -				58	(74)
112. -					75
113. -					76
114. -					77
115. -					78
116. -					79
117. -					80
118. -					81
119. -				78	(82)
120. -					83
121. -				71	(84)
122. -				72a, 75	(85)
123. -				72b	(86)
124. -				73	
125. -				74	(87)
126. -				69, 96	(88)
127. -				70	
128. -				76	
129. -				77	
130. -				78	(89)
131. -				79	
132. -				80	
133. -				81	
134. -				82	
135. -				83	
136. -					90

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MSL13/97</u>	<u>MSL49/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
137. -					91
138. -					92
139. -					93
140. -					94
141. -				85	95
142. -				55	
143. -				86	(96)
144. -				56	(97)
145. -				57	
146. -					98
147. -				87	
148. -				88	
149. -				89	
150. -				90	
151. -				91	
152. -				92	
153. -				93	
154. -				94	
155. -				95	
156. -				96	
157. -				97	
158. -				98	
159. -	49				(99)
160. -	47				
161. -	48				
162. -	50				(100)
163. -	51a				101
164. -	51b				102
165. -	52a				103
166. -	52b				104
167. -	53				(105)
168. -	54				166
169. -	55				107
170. -	56				(108)
171. -	57a				(109)
172. -	57b				(110)
173. -	58a				111
174. -	58b				112
175. -	59				(113)
176. -	60				114
177. -	61a				115
178. -	61b				116
179. -	62a				117
180. -	62b				118
181. -	62c				119a
182. -	63				119b

TABLE A - CHAPTER 84

(Continued)

	<u>3SP</u>	<u>ST(88)</u>	<u>MS113/97</u>	<u>MS149/97</u>	<u>DA</u>
183. -	64				120
184. -	65				(121)
185. -	66				122
186. -	67				(123)
187. -	68				(124)
188. -	69a				125
189. -	69b				(126)
190. -					127
191. -					128
192. -	69c				
193. -	70				
194. -	71				
195. -					129
196. -	72a				130
197. -	72b				(131)
198. -	73a				132
199. -	73b				(133)
200. -	74				134
201. -	75a				(135)
202. -	75b				136
203. -	76				137

"Peace Be Unto You"

sentence units which are virtually if not entirely identical each to an earlier sentence. This means that over one-half of the DA text represents a verbatim duplication of previously written sentences. Under our examination of these earlier written documents we shall on occasion speak of the degree to which each of the four texts contributed to the DA text.

Chapter 84 presents some of the same problems we have met in our study of the other chapters in relating the DA text to the sources. There is the question of which source is being used. In several instances we list two sources but in Appendix A we give the first source mentioned after the DA sentence. The evaluation also represents the dependency applied to the sentence when compared to the first source given.¹ Another question involves the evaluation. Often there is a great degree of dependency in a sentence that also has much of Ellen White's independent comment. We have only one category for partial independency though the sentences vary in degree of independence or dependence. Such evaluations are only approximate.

We also face a complicated issue in the matter of repetition or duplication of expressions and thoughts. This occurs not only in Ellen White's text but in the sources as well. How is one to be sure as to which sentences are in parallel?² We have usually depended upon verbal

¹See DA11,12/802. Of course we must also consider the possibility that the DA text is combining two similar source sentences.

²Cf. DA59,60/805; DA79/806, and DA93/806. See below

"Peace Be Unto You"

similarities of special constructions and parallel contextual thematic development as clues to establishing dependency.

Ellen White's independent comments were of several kinds in chapter 84. We found no large blocks of original material but in several sections she stressed a special point of view. In sentences 68-77 she emphasized the church's responsibility in the matter of "retaining" sins. She evidently interpreted this phrase to mean giving censure and clear warning in instances of wrong doing. Two shorter independent sections, sentences 107-112 and 125-129, treated the problem of Thomas' doubting spirit and the dangers in store for Christians who follow the example of Thomas.

In several sentences Ellen White took a different tact than did her literary source. On one occasion where the sources presented a problematic situation Ellen White took a decided position.¹ When March takes over 30 sentences to elaborate on the resurrection of the saints, which Jesus illuminates through His resurrection, Ellen White covers the topic in only four. Hanna only reminds us that he had said all he had to say in the previous chapter when he discussed

under the analysis of the pre-DA text for additional illustrations of this problem.

¹In the absence of any clear evidence from Scripture March suggests that "we may suppose" the meeting place of the disciples was the same "upper room" where Jesus spent Thursday evening with the disciples before His death (M/78/421). Ellen White has no such hesitancy (DA3/802). Hanna puts the issue in the form of a rhetorical question, "Where but in that same chamber can we imagine that this Sunday evening assembly gathered?" (H/13/803)

"Peace Be Unto You"

the form of Jesus' post-resurrection "body." He prefers to leave it as a "mystery" (p. 804). When Hanna interprets the giving of the Spirit to the disciples as providing them with the power to convince mankind of sin, Ellen White stresses the power of the Spirit to impart the "life of Christ," including the attributes of His character.¹

These examples of Ellen White's independence from her literary sources and other instances of lesser significance in terms of content clearly indicate that Ellen White is in control of her material. She appears to have been as free to accommodate the writings of others to her purposes as she is to use them on their own merits.

We have already argued that chapter 84 is heavily dependent on previous writings. It may even be argued that Manuscripts 113 and 149 of 1897 were specifically written DA texts and should be so analyzed here. In view of the fact that these manuscripts also undergo revision and change comparable to earlier manuscripts and even the SP text, we have chosen to consider all manuscripts of these types as pre-DA texts. Were we to locate a DA chapter in manuscript form such a text would be treated as DA text. In harmony with our pattern of analysis we now turn to the pre-DA materials. Unavoidably we shall have more to say about the DA text in our comparative study of these earlier writings.

¹Compare DA60,61/805 with Hanna LC55-80/806-807.

Source Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

Before publishing the DA text Ellen White had covered the Jerusalem appearances of Jesus before the eleven disciples in four separately written documents. We shall review each of them separately before drawing general conclusions on the four as a group.

Chapter XVI of The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III, devotes 76 sentences to discuss the meeting of the two Emmaus disciples and the other disciples in the upper room, the appearances of Jesus in their midst, the teachings of Jesus to the disciples, what this fellowship with Jesus and His resurrection may mean to Christian believers today, the absence of Thomas, how Jesus restores the faith of Thomas in a second meeting a week later, and lessons to be learned from the experience of Jesus and Thomas. Only 12 of the 76 sentences treating the appearances of Jesus "in the upper chamber" are not found in the DA text. Of the 64 reflected in the DA about 17 come by way of MS 113 to be discussed below and some via the Signs article of 1888. According to our analysis 43 sentences came to the DA text directly and about half of these without any major modification of the text.¹

¹The 43 sentences have the net effect of furnishing 54 DA sentences. Several of the longer SP sentences were edited to form shorter DA sentences. For example, the 3SP sentences 21, 51, 52, 57, 58, 61, 62, 69, 72, 73, and 75, a total of 11 sentences, appear in the DA text as 22 sentences. Occasionally the editing does have the opposite effect. The 3SP sentences 28 and 29 are combined into one DA sentence, DA46.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The extent of duplication between the SP text and our chapter in the DA made it impractical to present both texts and list the evaluation for both texts. We included only enough sentences from 3SP to illustrate this dependency of the DA text on 3SP and to indicate where the source dependency is the greatest if some difference in the use of the source was readily apparent. The full evaluation of the source dependency of these earlier writings is beyond the scope of the study. In some of the earlier chapters of the study when there was less duplication between the DA text and the previously written materials the evaluation of the earlier texts provided a stronger comparative model. That is no longer the case as Table A clearly shows.

Ellen White used Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March and William Hanna's Life of Christ when composing the 3SP text. These are the only two sources used in any of the early texts according to our study. Since we did not make a thorough study of the SP text we have nothing to report on the content of the dependent material when compared with Ellen White's independent comment in this chapter. The general comparison of the content of 3SP with the DA text will be presented under the redaction analysis below.

In sentences 70-86 of the Signs article of 1888¹ Ellen White presents a brief overview of the upper room appearance of Jesus on the day of His resurrection. She builds upon the text of 3SP but also adds some material from March²

¹Signs, January 20, 1888.

²ST(88)72, 74, 76.

which is not found in 3SP. The DA text reflects most of this March material through the influence of Manuscript 113, 1897, to which we now turn.¹

Manuscript 113, 1897, was introduced in our study of chapter 83. This document, entitled "The Walk to Emmaus," carries Ellen White's comments on the experience of the two disciples on the road to Emmaus, their return to Jerusalem, and encounter with Jesus in the upper room where the other disciples were gathered as well. The 37 sentences of the manuscript on the topic of chapter 84, from sentence 112 to the close at sentence 148, is obviously dependent on 3SP and the Signs article. If our analysis as indicated in Table A is correct, MS 113 supplied 14 complete sentences for the DA text in addition to influencing the construction of 3 sentences, and passing on the verbal form of 8 others.² Insofar as Manuscript 113 treats the content of chapter 84 it is the major influence behind the construction of the DA text. Rather than an earlier writing, MS 113 should be considered as the rough draft for the first major segment of the DA chapter. Judging from Appendix C which lists the sources reflected in the sentences presented from MS 113, March's Night Scenes is the dominant literary influence

¹ST(88)75 apparently was not picked up by MS 113 and is also not in the DA text. It would appear that no further reference was made to the Signs article after MS 113 was composed.

²DA sentences 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, 20, 25, and 31 are identical (or almost so) to their corresponding sentences in MS 113; DA3, 10, and 14 while undergoing modifications show the influence of MS 113; DA18, 19, 24, 28, 29, 30, 46, and 47, are in the latter class.

behind its composition.

Evidently Ellen White returned to March's volume when working on Manuscript 113. She repeats material from the Emmaus journey as does March.¹ There are also DA sentences from MS 113 which reflect March but are not found in the earlier writings.²

A second 1897 manuscript with the title of "The Remission of Sins," was also copied by Margaret (Maggie) Hare. Manuscript 149 carries the date of December 1, 1897. Like MS 113 there is no handwritten text of the manuscript and the typed copy does not contain either the handwritten or stamped signature of Ellen G. White. William Hanna's Life of Christ is definitely the major influence behind the text of MS 149 as a review of Appendix C would clearly reveal.

Ellen White may have produced MS 149 at the behest of Marian Davis. In MS 113 Ellen White quotes John 20:20b-23 where the Gospel recounts the giving of the Holy Spirit to the disciples and the authority to "remit" and "retain" sins.³ These few verses are John's contribution to the record of what took place at that first evening meeting of Jesus and the disciples. In view of a second account of the giving of the Holy Spirit in Acts and the theological difficulties raised by these verses in respect to the

¹Note the paraphrase of March, NS85c-g/421 in MS(113)122-125 located in the text presentation following DA14/802.

²Cf. DA17/802 and MS(113)128.

³See MS(113)133-136.

"Peace Be Unto You"

ecclesiastical authority of religious leaders, these verses are not to be lightly passed over. They are not included in the commentary of 3SP and in MS 113 receive only a brief remark by Ellen White.¹ Marian Davis may have noticed this rather slight treatment and suggested that further comment might be helpful.

Robert W. Olson in his pamphlet, "How the Desire of Ages Was Written," summarizes part of Marain Davis' role as follows:

In organizing the material into chapters, Marian noted areas on which she had nothing from Ellen White's pen. Apparently the two women had such a close working relationship that Marian felt free to make suggestions to Mrs. White as to what she thought might be lacking from the book.²

It is also very possible that in reviewing the text of 3SP it was noticed that the second appearance in the upper room involved John's Gospel since he is the only one to report it. He alone of the four gospel writers mentions the two appearances a week apart, Thomas' absence from the first occasion, and the giving of the Holy Spirit. It would be difficult to introduce John's record of the second appearance and not his description of the first appearance and the Holy Spirit experience.

At any rate MS 149 contains 98 sentences, the first 20 of which set the stage by comparing the teachings of Jesus

¹See MS(113)137-139.

²Cited from "An Introductory Statement to the Document, 'Exhibits Relating to the Writing of The Desire of Ages,'" compiled by Ron Graybill and Robert W. Olson, Ellen G. White Estate, Washington, D. C., May 23, 1979, page 3.

"Peace Be Unto You"

with the misleading influences of religious teachers of the day. Sentence 21 picks up the story as Jesus meets the disciples in the upper room on the day of His resurrection. The remaining sentences of MS 149 have to do with the breathing of the Holy Spirit upon the disciples and the accompanying charges of Jesus. While the 78 sentences could not be taken over into the composition of chapter 84, 21 complete sentences¹ and parts of several others were.

We should not overlook a more subtle kind of dependency between these earlier Ellen White texts and the DA text. We identify parallels largely according to verbal similarities. In Table A we show that sentence 55 of MS 149 was not used in the DA text. We also indicate that MS(149)86 was used in the construction of DA96. Perhaps we should have also listed MS(149)55 as contributing to DA96.

Regardless of the degree to which MS 149, 1897, has influenced chapter 84, it does seem reasonable to conclude that MS 149 played a major role in providing many sentences for this chapter. We shall have more to say under redaction below as to the contribution of this document.

The complete text of 3SP, chapter XVI, the Signs article of January 29, 1888, Manuscript 113, 1897, and Manuscript 149, 1897, are included in Appendix D. Sentence numbers have been added to aid the reader in checking the analysis and the comparative listing given in Table A above. We suggest that these texts be given careful scrutiny,

¹MS(149) 36, 37, 38, 39, 44, 45, 46, 56, 59, 60, 84, 58, 66, 78, 71, 72, 74, 78, 85, 86, 96.

"Peace Be Unto You"

particularly in areas where the content is so similar we may not have listed the best sentence parallels. Sentences 30, 33, and 34 of MS 149, for example, are making the same basic point.

The evaluation of each sentence presented from these earlier texts may be found in Appendix B. Our findings for MS 149 show that Hanna's Life of Christ was the dominant source behind Ellen White's comments on the giving of the Holy Spirit and the associated statements of Christ relative to the authority of the apostles.

The four documents providing the major portion of chapter 84 have not been fully evaluated for reasons given above. We selected 68 sentences for their value in showing source dependency of the Ellen White text. At times this literary dependency was apparent in the earlier text and not in the DA text. In other cases the dependency was clearer, or to a greater degree, in one of these supporting texts than in the DA text. These 68 sentences include 38 parallels from Hanna's Life of Christ and 30 from Night Scenes in the Bible by March. We show in Table 3, page 840, that these two sources provided in these 68 sentences 9 Verbatim sentences, 26 Strict Paraphrase, 13 Simple Paraphrase, 3 Loose Paraphrase, and 5 instances where the Bible has been quoted through the influence of a source. We credited Ellen White with 12 sentences of Partial Independence. In addition to the 68 sentences showing literary dependency we listed in Appendices B and C two

TABLE 3

DISTRIBUTION OF SOURCES FOR CHAPTER 84

Pre-Desire of Ages Text

TEXT									
01. Hanna IC	00	V1	Strict Verbatim	1					
	04	V2	Verbatim	2					
	12	P1	Strict Paraphrase	3					
	07	P2	Simple Paraphrase	4					
	00	P3	Loose Paraphrase	5					
	05	B1	Source Bible	6					
	10	I2	Partial Independence	7					
	00	I1	Strict Independence	8					
	00	B2	Bible	9					
	38	TOTAL							
02. March NS	00								
	05								
	14								
	06								
	03								
	00								
	12								
TOTALS Pre-DA	00								
	09								
	26								
	13								
	03								
	05								
	00								
	00								
	00								
	00								
	68								

additional sentences where Ellen White's remarks are independent.

These 70 sentences when evaluated according to the dependency scale show an average dependency of 3.81. The 68 dependent sentences measure out at 3.93 or close to Simple Paraphrase.

This list of source parallels from the earlier documents is far from complete due to the amount of overlap with the DA text which we did not want to repeat. The pattern of source usage nevertheless holds true when comparing the sentence dependency of the early texts against the later DA text. Granting that exceptions occur, generally the dependency of the earlier material is of a higher degree than is found in the DA text. Table 4, page 842, offers a comparison of the evaluations of 13 DA sentences, one of which shows a higher degree of dependency for the DA text.¹

Redaction Analysis - The DA Text

The compositional structure of chapter 84 consists of six thematic sections, three of major length and three smaller units. The chapter opens with 34 sentences detailing the return of the two disciples to the upper room in Jerusalem and the appearance of Jesus. The next 10 sentences relate to lessons to be learned from the visit of Jesus to His disciples. Seven sentences are then devoted

¹See line 3 of Table 4.

TABLE 4

Desire of Ages and Pre-DA Text Evaluations Compared

Chapter 84

Same Sentence - Similar Words

<u>No.</u>	<u>- DA Text</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA Txt</u>	<u>Eval</u>	<u>Pre-DA</u>	<u>Eval</u>
01.	- DA10a/802	P1	3SP6a/216	P1	ST(88)71	P2
02.	- DA11/802	P2	ST(88)72	P1		
03.	- DA12/802	P1	3SP7/216	P2		
04.	- DA15/802	P2	MS(113)126	P1	ST(88)73	P1
05.	- DA34/803+	P1	3SP36/218	V2		
06.	- DA40/804	P1	3SP44/219	V2		
07.	- DA59/805	P2	MS(149)39	P1		
08.	- DA66/805	P2	MS(149)46	P1		
09.	- DA67/805	P2	MS(149)59	P1		
10.	- DA97/806	P2	MS(149)56	V2		
11.	- DA99/806	P1	3SP49/219	P1		
12.	- DA119/807	P2	3SP63/221	P1		
13.	- DA120/807	P2	3SP64/221	P1		

"Peace Be Unto You"

to a commentary on what it meant for the disciples to be witnesses (Luke 24:48). Without a transitional sentence or paragraph Ellen White moves directly into the largest segment of the chapter. The following 47 sentences discuss the significance of the receiving of the Holy Spirit in terms of power and authority for the disciples and the church. A fifth section of 22 sentences treats the experience of doubting Thomas and the second upper room appearance of Jesus. The chapter closes with 17 sentences dedicated to pointing out the lessons to be learned from the way Thomas related to the resurrection and the method of Jesus in dealing with the doubts of Thomas.

With the exception of the second division the order of thematic development for chapter 84 follows the sequence of Hanna's account. The section on lessons to be learned from the post-resurrection appearance of Jesus appears to have been influenced by March's description of "The First Night After the Resurrection."¹ We should also note that Hanna's arrangement follows that of Scripture. We have already mentioned at the opening of this analysis that if one harmonizes the accounts of Mark, Luke, and John, the only gospels to record an appearance of Jesus at such a gathering of the disciples, three points of interest would emerge. There would have to be two appearances of Jesus before His disciples, the first without Thomas despite the fact that the Scriptures speak of "the eleven" and the second with

¹Night Scenes in the Bible, chapter XX, especially pages 422-427.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Thomas present. The third element would be the receiving of the Holy Spirit by those present at the first appearance. Were it not for the other details of correspondence between Hanna's commentary and Ellen White's we could be satisfied to argue that both are working mainly from Scripture.

Hanna's influence in the literary structure appears to have reached the DA text via MS 149 which will be discussed in more detail below. It also appears limited to the addition of certain segments involving narrative and admonition. It does not account for the specific order of sentences within the divisions of content nor for the Ellen White independent content scattered throughout the chapter. For example Hanna's commentary does not explain why the DA text departs from the sentence sequence of 3SP and MS 113 after 3SP25. Neither does Hanna's work explain why the DA text has in many places departed from the sentence sequence of MS 149 even when no other manuscript provides the material being presented.¹

We must, therefore, recognize not only a dependency factor for the structure of chapter 84 but also a degree of originality. Perhaps the picture will come into better focus once we have looked at the literary outlines of the earlier texts.

¹See Table A, pp. 825-829, for a comparative listing of parallel and non-parallel sentences.

Redaction Analysis - The Pre-DA Text

The text of 3SP, chapter XVI, has two major parts. Lines 1-26 cover the first appearance of Jesus and lines 47-76, the second occasion when Jesus suddenly stands in their midst. The first section leans on March and Hanna for both extrabiblical details and on March alone for the lessons to be drawn. The source used behind the narrative on Jesus and Thomas and the teaching from this experience was Hanna. Apart from the added sections of exhortation the basic structure follows the Scripture outline. Though a few sentences do not appear in the DA text, especially some Bible quotations, the fundamental structure and text reappear in the DA text.

The only change in the structure of the text of 3SP when taken over into the DA text is the repositioning of sentences 26-34. These sentences on the witness of the apostles came before the lessons to be drawn from the first appearance of Jesus in the 3SP text. Apparently when the DA text added the section on the Holy Spirit it was felt that the discussion on witnessing should come after the practical exhortation. In this arrangement the unit on witnesses would lead more naturally into the part on the Holy Spirit, the Power needed for witnessing.

The Signs article covers the only Lukan account of the first appearance of Jesus in Jerusalem. In the 26 sentences dedicated to this encounter, eight sentences are taken up with Lukan quotations. Apart from the description of how

"Peace Be Unto You"

the two disciples come to meet the other disciples in the upper room the article does not contribute to the DA text. Even these sentences reach the text of chapter 84 indirectly through their influence on MS 113.

Manuscript 113, 1897, makes its greatest impact on the structure of chapter 84 in its introduction of John's reference to the reception of the Holy Spirit and the authority to deal with sins. While the 3SP commentary included John's record on the second appearance of Jesus and the interview with Thomas, no mention was made of the bestowal of the Holy Spirit on the disciples. Ellen White's comments on this aspect of the upper room experience are too brief to permit us to argue convincingly that Hanna's work has led her to introduce this feature of the story. Up to this place in her text she follows March's development of the story, the basic outline of which matches the Lukan account.

It is only to be expected that MS 113 would have little impact on the content arrangement of chapter 84. The major thrust of the document concerns the Emmaus road episode, the topic of chapter 83. We do find some influence of MS 113 in such matters as the editing of the text of 3SP and the Signs article.¹ Many of its sentences were taken over into the DA text as we have noted above.

¹The DA text follows MS 113 in omitting sentences 8-10/216 of the text of 3SP and the combining of 3SP14,15/217. The DA text also, however, departs from the structure of MS 113 in omitting MS(113)122-125 and changing the location of MS(113)134-139.

"Peace Be Unto You"

The final text to be considered for its influence on the structure of chapter 84 presents a complicated problem for analysis. There is no doubt that MS 149, 1897, had a direct bearing on the structure of chapter 84. It is only this text that contains the major commentary of Ellen White on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit and the authority of the church over sin as reflected in the DA text. Our source analysis clearly shows the dependency of the DA text on MS 149 and the dependency of MS 149 on Hanna's Life of Christ. Our comparative listing of the sentences of MS 149 and DA, as given in Table A,¹ indicates that the general order of thematic presentation in the section treating the Holy Spirit and authority over sin in chapter 84 parallels that of MS 149. Our study also reveals that MS 149 follows the general arrangement of Hanna's account.²

There are, however, many isolated exceptions. Ellen White at times breaks the sequential order of Hanna's sentences in writing the text of MS 149. The DA text also often departs from the sentence arrangement of MS 149. In addition, the DA text omits sections of MS 149³ and introduces small blocks of new material.⁴ Some of the additional comment involves Ellen White's independent work and other sentences show that the source is being consulted

¹See pp. 825ff above.

²See Appendix C and note the order of Hanna's sentences reflected in MS 149 and its sentence sequence.

³Cf. MS 149 sentences 29-32, 41-43, 64-68, 49-54, 79-83, and 87-98 for example.

⁴Cf. DA sentences 75-81 and 90-95.

once again.¹

The influence of MS 149 is also mitigated by a subtle editing process that is only apparent when each sentence is carefully compared. This type of literary analysis takes us beyond the scope of this investigation. We only make a brief comment here to point out the complicated nature of comparative literary analysis.

At times the restructuring of sentences may be only a stylistic consideration, such as the splitting of MS(149)72 into two separate sentences DA85,86/806. At other times such editing allows for a change of emphasis. MS(149)40a appears as DA61/805. The remainder of MS(149)40 as well as 41-43 are omitted from the DA text. The sentences omitted stress the obedience to God's law and the exaltation of God's law as the purpose of the bestowal of the Holy Spirit. The significance of the gift of the Holy Spirit is not the same as Hanna interprets this event but Ellen White's modification does bring her interpretation closer to Hanna's when the entire context is taken into consideration. The "attributes" of Christ are left undefined and could be taken as including the merciful and forgiving spirit as well as the warnings against doing evil. As such these characteristics would fit very well with Hanna's view that the power of the Spirit enables the ministry of the

¹The sentences under the previous two footnotes may be checked against Table A on pp. 825ff and with the complete text in Appendix D. Sentences under the previous footnote may also be studied in connection with Appendix A to note their dependency evaluations.

"Peace Be Unto You"

disciples to have an effect in the lives of those who hear the "witnesses."

MS 149, 1897, obviously had a major influence on the redaction of chapter 84 insofar as the section on the Holy Spirit is concerned. But having said this, we must also insist that just as the DA text exhibits an independence in its combination of materials from 3SP, MS 113, and MS 149, so does it exercise a strong measure of independence in the way it chooses to utilize the text of MS 149. As has been so typical of this entire study, we must admit to Ellen White's independent contributions as well as to her dependency on sources. This mixed approach to the conclusion involves not only her use of sources in the literary development of individual sentences but also in the structure of the chapter where such sentences find their order of presentation.

In conclusion, a few words about the content of chapter 84 may be of interest to the reader, particularly in respect to the Scriptures and the sources used.

The DA text combines the records of Luke and John but adds descriptive, theological, and devotional comment which, while found in the two sources, is not contained in Scripture. In sentences 28 to 31 of the DA text Ellen White moves from the quoting of Luke to taking a verse from John without any indication that she has done so. After some comment based upon the record of John she returns to Luke's record without the slightest hint apart from the use of

quotation marks.¹ In a few sentences she returns to quote John again with no indication she is combining Scripture accounts. Hanna also constructed a similar harmony of the gospel stories.

There is no attempt in either Ellen White's comments or those of March and Hanna to explain the conflicts between the four gospels as briefly introduced at the opening of this analysis. The DA text makes no apparent difference in the authenticity of the background descriptions as compared to the Scriptural material or theological comment. All remarks are presented as factual and/or true.

Finally, chapter 84 does not contain a lengthy block of independent Ellen White comment. There is one section of ten short sentences credited to Ellen White or the Bible.² These have to do with the church's duty to warn sinners of judgment to come upon all who continue to do evil. In subsequent comment she adds seven sentences on how to restore and encourage the repentant sinners. In view of the fact that the same general content of Ellen White's independent remarks may be found in the sources and in other sentences where the influence of the source is obvious, we are not able to establish a unique emphasis for Ellen White in chapter 84.

We did find one interesting extrabiblical piece of factual data not mentioned in the sources. In DA10b/802

¹Cf. DA46,47/804,805.

²DA68-77/805,806.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Ellen White explains how Jesus entered the upper chamber. He enters unseen with the two disciples returning from Emmaus.¹

Summary

The summary of chapter 84 brings to a close the survey of 15 chapters randomly selected from The Desire of Ages. Once again we pose 14 questions to be answered from the foregoing analysis.² The answers garnered from the summaries of the 15 chapters will form the basis for the conclusion of the study.

1. We found no handwritten manuscripts for the DA text or the earlier writings on the topic of chapter 84. Two manuscripts dating from 1897 do exist in corrected-copy typewritten form. Each bears the initials "M. H.," which stand for Margaret (Maggie) Hare, one of Ellen White's literary assistants. In neither case do we find either the handwritten or stamped signature of Ellen White.

2. We located four texts on the topic of chapter 84 written prior to the publication of DA. Chapter XVI of Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, treated the two appearances of Jesus in the upper room in Jerusalem. The 76 sentences of this published work did not include the bestowal of the Holy Spirit which received major coverage in the DA text.

¹The same point is made with other words in 3SP6b/216.
²These questions are formally stated in the Introduction, II. We do not repeat the questions for each summary. The answers, however, are stated so that the question may be inferred from the answer.

"Peace Be Unto You"

Another 27 sentences on the first encounter appear in a January 20, 1888, Signs article. The last 10 sentences of this text are really directed away from the content of chapter 84. Though we found many references to the experience of Thomas and warnings against nurturing doubts, as did this unbelieving disciple, Ellen White did not develop a narrative commentary on these post-resurrection appearances of Jesus in any other article, at least as far as we were able to discover.

The two manuscripts written on the topics of chapter 84 in 1897 appear to have been specifically written for the DA life of Christ project. Manuscript 113 obviously is revising the text of 3SP as the DA text was intended to accomplish. The title of the manuscript is identical to the caption for chapter 84 of DA. The latter part of the manuscript follows the Emmaus experience with some comment on Christ's appearance in the upper room to which the disciples from Emmaus return. This chapter on the two appearances of Jesus before the other disciples opens with sentences taken from this same section of MS 113.

The second manuscript from 1897, MS 149, appears to have been specifically written to provide commentary on several verses in John's gospel not covered in the earlier writings. Its extensive coverage on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit makes a major addition to the 76 sentences in 3SP on the two occasions when Jesus showed Himself to the disciples in the upper room.

"Peace Be Unto You"

We therefore conclude that the published DA text, even though only 137 sentences in length, offers a considerable expansion over Ellen White's earlier writings. The expansion is even greater if we count the sentences of the two manuscripts which, though written as DA text, in our judgment, were omitted from the final published edition.

3. If we grant the assumption that it is more accurate to view Manuscripts 113 and 149 of 1897 as early forms of the DA text, then we have the same general content between the DA texts and the early texts of 3SP and the Signs article. Both the early and later writings are treating two upper room visits of Jesus as presented in the gospels of Luke and John. Both the DA text and the pre-DA writings mention lessons to be drawn from these two experiences.

4. While the accounts of the DA text and 3SP are strikingly similar, there is one significant difference. The DA text, largely through the expansion provided by MS 149, has a major section on the Holy Spirit and the authority of the church to "retain" or "remit" sins. This material from John's gospel is not even mentioned in 3SP, chapter XVI, even though the encounter of Jesus and Thomas, also from the same context of John, is given full treatment by Ellen White.

5. Chapter 84 is composed of 137 sentences or 138 evaluation units. Of these, 95, or 69 percent of the chapter, registered as dependent.

6. We found 28 sentences, or 20 percent, of Ellen

"Peace Be Unto You"

White's text to be fully independent in respect to this literary form. The 15 Bible quotations taken from the gospel accounts were not credited to either the sources or to Ellen White.

7. According to the dependency rating scale, the average degree of dependency for the entire chapter apart from the gospel quotations, i.e., 123 out of the 138 sentence units, comes to 2.83. If we rate only the 95 dependent sentences, the average dependency is 3.66, or about midway between Loose and Simple Paraphrase.

8. The two main sources for chapter 84 were The Life of Christ by William Hanna and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. The former was used in the construction of 61 sentences and the latter influenced 34.

9. No other writers were found to have contributed to the literary form of chapter 84.

10. Strictly speaking we should limit the earlier writings to The Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, and to the Signs article of 1888. Manuscripts 113 and 149 were apparently written specifically for the DA text. Nevertheless, according to our method of analysis all such earlier texts are figured as pre-DA materials and rated as a group. These four earlier accounts also show dependency on the same two literary sources. The 68 dependent sentences duplicate much of the DA text. When rated in their own classification as pre-DA text the average dependency rate comes to 3.93.

"Peace Be Unto You"

11. We found no special characteristics which would justify distinguishing between the earlier and later use of the sources. The editing process involved more than one stage of revision. The 3SP text was in places modified in the production of MS 113, 1897. It was further revised in the formation of chapter 84. The final text appears to have condensed the earlier accounts of the two encounters in the upper room in Jerusalem. Ellen White did return to Hanna's commentary to add her remarks on the coming of the Holy Spirit and the charge of Jesus regarding authority over sin. This material as found in MS 149, 1897, became part of chapter 84.

Since Ellen White had alluded to the incident of the Holy Spirit in MS 113, 1897, had used the same sources for both the earlier writings and the DA text, and evidently wrote MS 149 more as a rough draft for a section of the DA text than as an independent pre-DA text, we have not viewed her comments on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit as constituting a different use of the sources.

12. There is no substantive difference between the dependent and independent comments of Ellen White in chapter 84. Both types of material include descriptive, theological, and spiritual remarks. Ellen White exhibits her independence in the areas of her emphasis and in her selective use of the two sources. She is also positive when her sources are "supposing" or "imagining." In one place she explains that Jesus enters the room in some unseen

"Peace Be Unto You"

fashion at the time the two disciples from Emmaus enter. This point is not made by her sources and is not carried over to explain how Jesus enters for his second appearance.

13. The large redactional units of the DA text follow the same order as given in the narrative as told by Luke and John. The three smaller sections dealing with the lessons to be learned from these three main episodes discussed in chapter 84 were arranged through the influence of her literary sources. March supplies the first segment and lessons, Hanna the last two sections and their lessons.

14. The major earlier writing, chapter 15 of 3SP, follows the compositional arrangement of March for the first appearance and Hanna for the second appearance a week later. The only other truly pre-DA text is the Signs article which largely follows the story line of 3SP. The two manuscripts, MS 113 and MS 149, are taken to be first drafts of the DA text. They do not overlap in their main segments, the first appearance and the giving of the Holy Spirit. Neither one of these manuscripts includes the second appearance. For comment on the encounter with Thomas, Ellen White returns to 3SP and to the text of Hanna.

Chapter 84 has proven to be one of the more "dependent" chapters of the 15 DA chapters. Its widespread use of March and Hanna poses a question for further study. Apart from literary style, how does the content of Ellen White's commentary differ from that of March or Hanna? Is it that very combination that is her unique contribution? What is

"Peace Be Unto You"

the difference in the content between chapter 84 of DA and the parallel chapters in March's or Hanna's work? Were her remarks on the role of the Holy Spirit's imparting the attributes of Jesus a basic difference from Hanna or only one of emphasis?

We might also find it of interest to compare the early writings or even the manuscript texts on the topic with the published text of DA chapter 84. Why does she omit in the DA text the references to the righteousness of the law that appeared in her earlier draft on the work of the Holy Spirit?

These questions over matters of content have been raised before in this study. They, along with the other issues raised or reinforced by our investigation will, hopefully, lead others to further analyze the writings of Ellen White.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	March NS/75/420	P1	051.	H LC/36, 46c/804, 806	P1
002.	March NS/76-78/420+	P1	052.	Hanna LC/48/806	B1
003.	March NS/78/421	P1	053.	Hanna LC/53/806	V2
004.	March NS/79/421	P1	054.	Hanna LC/54/806	P1
005.	March NS/79, 80/421	P2	055.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
006.	March NS/81/421	P1	056.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
007.	March NS/82/421	P1	057.	Hanna LC/50/806	I2
008.	March NS/82/421	P2	058.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
009.	March NS/83a/421	P1	059.	Hanna LC/48, 56/806	P2
10a.	March NS/83b/421	P1	060.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
10b.		I1	061.		I1
011.	March NS/85a/421	P2	062.	Hanna LC/57/807	I2
012.	Hanna LC/15/803	P1	063.	Hanna LC/58/807	B1
013.	March NS/84b/421	B1	064.	Hanna LC/60/807	P3
014.	March NS/85ab/421	P1	065.	Hanna LC/69a/808	I2
015.	March NS/86/421	P2	066.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
016.	March NS/88/422	V2	067.	Hanna LC/76/808	P2
017.	March NS/89/422	P1	068.		I1
018.	March NS/91/422	V2	069.	Bible	B2
019.	March NS/87, 93/422	P1	070.		I1
020.	March NS/94/422	P2	071.		I1
021.		I1	072.		I1
022.	Bible	B2	073.		I1
023.	Bible	B2	074.		I1
024.	Bible	B2	075.	Bible	B2
025.	Bible	B2	076.		I1
026.	March NS/95/422	P1	077.		I1
027.	March NS/94/422	P2	078.	Hanna LC/77/808	P2
028.	Bible	B2	079.	Hanna LC/59/807	P2
029.	Bible	B2	080.	Hanna LC/77/808	I2
030.	Bible	B2	081.		I1
031.	March NS/99/422	B1	082.	Bible	B2
032.	Hanna LC/30/804	I2	083.		I1
033.	March NS/105/423	I2	084.	Hanna LC/88/809	I2
034.	Mar NS/102, 105/422+	P1	085.	Hanna LC/93/810	P2
035.	March NS/110/423	P2	086.	Hanna LC/90/810	P2
036.	March NS/113/423	P2	087.	Hanna LC/89, 90/809	P2
037.	March NS/114/423	B1	088.	Bible	B2
038.	March NS/147/426	P2	089.	Hanna LC/89/809	B1
039.	March NS/148/426	P1	090.		I1
040.	March NS/152/426	P1	091.		I1
041.	March NS/154/426	P2	092.		I1
042.	March NS/158/427	P2	093.	Hanna LC/59, 77/807+	P2
043.	March NS/157/427	P2	094.	Han LC/87, 78/809, 08	P2
044.	March NS/156/427	I2	095.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
045.	Bible	B2	096.	Hanna LC/78/808	P2
046.	Bible	B2	097.	Hanna LC/83, 85/809	P2
047.	Bible	B2	098.		I1
048.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	099.	Hanna LC/1/811	P1
049.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	100.	Hanna LC/7/811	P2
050.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1			

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	Hanna LC/7,8/811-12	P3	151. -		
102. -	Han LC/7,22/811,812	P2	152. -		
103. -	Hanna LC/71/816	P2	153. -		
104. -	Hanna LC/7/811	P1	154. -		
105. -	Hanna LC/13/812	B1	155. -		
106. -	Hanna LC/56/815	P2	156. -		
107. -		I1	157. -		
108. -		I1	158. -		
109. -		I1	159. -		
110. -	Hanna LC/81,87/816	P2	160. -		
111. -		I1	161. -		
112. -	Bible	B2	162. -		
113. -	Hanna LC/89/817	B1	163. -		
114. -	Hanna LC/91,93/817	I2	164. -		
115. -	Hanna LC/91a/817	V2	165. -		
116. -	Hanna LC/91b/817	P1	166. -		
117. -	Hanna LC/93/817	P2	167. -		
118. -	Hanna LC/98/817	P2	168. -		
119. -	Hanna LC/100/817	P2	169. -		
120. -	Hanna LC/110-12/818	P2	170. -		
121. -	Hanna LC/115/818	I2	171. -		
122. -	Hanna LC/117/818	I2	172. -		
123. -	Hanna LC/118/818	P2	173. -		
124. -	Hanna LC/119/818	I2	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -	Hanna LC/132/819	P2	180. -		
131. -	Hanna LC/132/819	I2	181. -		
132. -	Han LC/133,136/819	P2	182. -		
133. -	Hanna LC/137/819	P1	183. -		
134. -	Han LC/135,137/819	P1	184. -		
135. -		I1	185. -		
136. -		I1	186. -		
137. -	Hanna LC/138/819	I2	187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 84

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	3SP1/216	P1	1	051.	-	MS(149)45	I2	65
002.	-	3SP2/216	P1	2	052.	-	MS(149)46	P1	66
003.	-	3SP3/216	P1	4	053.	-	MS(149)51	B1	66
004.	-	MS(113)112	P1	4	054.	-	MS(149)52	B1	66
005.	-	MS(113)113	P2	5	055.	-	MS(149)53	B1	66
006.	-	3SP5/216	P1	5	056.	-	MS(149)54	B1	66
007.	-	MS(113)114	P1	6	057.	-	MS(149)59	P1	67
008.	-	MS(113)115	P1	7	058.	-	MS(149)61	P1	67
009.	-	MS(113)116	P2	8	059.	-	MS(149)62	I2	67
010.	-	MS(113)117	P1	9	060.	-	MS(149)55	I2	95
011.	-	3SP6a/216	P1	10a	061.	-	MS(149)86	P2	96
012.	-	ST(88)71	P2	10a	062.	-	MS(149)56	V2	97
013.	-	3SP6b/216	I1	10b	063.	-	3SP49/219	P1	99
014.	-	ST(88)72	P1	11	064.	-	3SP47/219	P1	99
015.	-	3SP7/216	P2	12	065.	-	3SP63/221	P1	119
016.	-	3SP9a/216	V2	12	066.	-	3SP64/221	P1	120
017.	-	3SP9b/216	I2	12	067.	-	3SP65/221	I2	121
018.	-	3SP10/216+	P2	12	068.	-	3SP72/222	I2	131
019.	-	3SP11/217	P2	13	069.	-	3SP73/222	P1	133
020.	-	MS(113)121	P1	14	070.	-	3SP74/222	P1	134
021.	-	MS(113)122	P3	14	071.	-			
022.	-	MS(113)123	P3	14	072.	-			
023.	-	MS(113)124	P3	14	073.	-			
024.	-	MS(113)125	P2	14	074.	-			
025.	-	MS(113)126	V2	15	075.	-			
026.	-	3SP14/217	P2	15	076.	-			
027.	-	3SP15/217	V2	15	077.	-			
028.	-	ST(88)73	P1	15	078.	-			
029.	-	ST(88)75	P1	17	079.	-			
030.	-	ST(88)76	V2	19	080.	-			
031.	-	3SP35/218	I2	33	081.	-			
032.	-	3SP36/218	V2	34	092.	-			
033.	-	3SP37/219	P2	35	083.	-			
034.	-	3SP40a/219	V2	37	084.	-			
035.	-	3SP40b/219	P1	37	085.	-			
036.	-	3SP40c/219	I2	37	086.	-			
037.	-	3SP41/219	P2	37	087.	-			
038.	-	3SP44/219	V2	40	088.	-			
039.	-	3SP31/218	P1	48	089.	-			
040.	-	MS(149)28	P2	51	090.	-			
041.	-	MS(149)29	I2	52	091.	-			
042.	-	MS(149)36	V2	53	092.	-			
043.	-	MS(149)35	I2	57	093.	-			
044.	-	MS(149)34	P1	58	094.	-			
045.	-	MS(149)38	P2	59	095.	-			
046.	-	MS(149)39	P1	59	096.	-			
047.	-	MS(149)33	I2	60	097.	-			
048.	-	MS(149)40	I1	61	098.	-			
049.	-	MS(149)47	B1	61	099.	-			
050.	-	MS(149)48	I2	62	100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 84

No.	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	3SP1/216	M/75/420		051.	MS(149)45	H/69a/808	
002.	3SP2/216	M/76-78/420		052.	MS(149)46	H/88/809	
003.	3SP3/216	M/78, 79/421		053.	MS(149)51	H/69b/808	
004.	MS(113)112	M/75-78/420f		054.	MS(149)52	H/70/808	
005.	MS(113)113	M/79, 80/421		055.	MS(149)53	H/71/808	
006.	3SP5/216	M/80/421		056.	MS(149)54	H/72/808	
007.	MS(113)114	M/81/421		057.	MS(149)59	H/76/808	
008.	MS(113)115	M/82/421		058.	MS(149)61	H/76/808	
009.	MS(113)116	M/82/421		059.	MS(149)62	H/76/808	
010.	MS(113)117	M/83a/421		060.	MS(149)55	H/83/808	
011.	3SP6a/216	M/83ab/421		061.	MS(149)86	H/78-80/808	
012.	ST(88)71	M/82, 83b/421		062.	MS(149)56	H/85/809	
013.	3SP6b/216			063.	3SP49/219	H/1/811	
014.	ST(88)72	M/83, 85a/421		064.	3SP47/219	H/6/811	
015.	3SP7/216	H/15/803		065.	3SP63/221	H/100/817	
016.	3SP9a/216	H/16a/803		066.	3SP64/221	H/110-112/818	
017.	3SP9b/216	H/16b/803		067.	3SP65/221	H/115/818	
018.	3SP10/216+	H/17a/803		068.	3SP72/222	H/132/819	
019.	3SP11/217	H/17b/803		069.	3SP73/222	H/133, 136+/819	
020.	MS(113)121	M/85ab/421		070.	3SP74/222	H/135, 137/819	
021.	MS(113)122	M/85c/421		071.			
022.	MS(113)123	M/85d, f/421		072.			
023.	MS(113)124	M/85f/421		073.			
024.	MS(113)125	M/85e, g/421		074.			
025.	MS(113)126	M/86/421		075.			
026.	3SP14/217	H/17-19/803		076.			
027.	3SP15/217	H/21/803		077.			
028.	ST(88)73	M/86/421		078.			
029.	ST(88)75	M/90/422		079.			
030.	ST(88)76	M/87, 91/422		080.			
031.	3SP35/218	M/105/423		081.			
032.	3SP36/218	M/102, 105+/423		092.			
033.	3SP37/219	M/110/423		083.			
034.	3SP40a/219	M/118/424		084.			
035.	3SP40b/219	M/119/424		085.			
036.	3SP40c/219	M/120/424		086.			
037.	3SP41/219	M/135/425		087.			
038.	3SP44/219	M/152/426		088.			
039.	3SP31/218	H/36/804		089.			
040.	MS(149)28	H/47/806		090.			
041.	MS(149)29	H/49/806		091.			
042.	MS(149)36	H/53/806		092.			
043.	MS(149)35	H/50/806		093.			
044.	MS(149)34	H/51/806		094.			
045.	MS(149)38	H/56/806		095.			
046.	MS(149)39	H/48, 50/806		096.			
047.	MS(149)33	H/50, 51/806		097.			
048.	MS(149)40			098.			
049.	MS(149)47	H/55/806		099.			
050.	MS(149)48	H/57/807		100.			

XVIII SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The investigation of Ellen White's use of literary sources in writing The Desire of Ages has proven to be a long and involved study. As it is we have reviewed only 15 of the 87 chapters or about 17 percent of the full text. Our coverage, however, has been thorough and the text of the chapters analyzed represents a random sample. On these grounds, assuming our summary and conclusions represent the findings faithfully, our generalizations about the work as a whole should be quite valid.

This final chapter of the research report will consist of two major divisions, as the title suggests. Each section will be presented as an independent unit though obviously they will be related. In the summary we will attempt to pull together the separate summaries of the 15 chapters into a general summary statement. The same 14 questions treated in each of the 15 chapter summaries will provide the format for this final summary. The second part of the chapter will utilize the information provided by the summary to answer the general questions to which this investigation has pointed from the beginning. The primary concern of this research has been to discover the nature and extent of Ellen White's use of sources and secretaries in her writing on the life of Christ, particularly in the writing of The Desire of Ages.

The project advisors have warned me that many will not read the full text of this report, particularly the research

Summary and Conclusions

data and the analyses. Many, I am told, will not take the time to read the introduction to the research. Those who do look at the report, apart from those whose questions and interest led the church to sponsor the research project, will no doubt be satisfied to look at the summary and conclusions. If these expectations are realistic for a study of this nature, length, and complexity, then we should present a rather complete statement even if in so doing we must repeat some matters treated in the introduction. This I have attempted to do, including only as much material from the introduction as seems necessary for clarification purposes. During the years I have been conducting this study I have met many who have questioned the wisdom of undertaking such a project. Some were not sure the research was necessary. Usually these knew little about its nature and objectives. Others felt that a study of sources was inappropriate for inspired writings. I would surely hope that all who read the conclusions will be clear on the questions to which the conclusions speak. No study attempts to answer all issues; no one should expect this research to answer his/her questions. The best one may expect is that such an investigation address its own questions honestly and fairly. We sincerely invite the reader to evaluate our conclusions on these terms. But before summarizing the results of the research and stating our conclusions, let us first explain how the basic research questions were generated.

Summary and Conclusions

The special nature of Ellen White's writing methods and the particular purpose for writing The Desire of Ages made it necessary to raise questions about earlier writings and the use of literary assistants.

The Desire of Ages was originally planned as a revision of Ellen White's earlier comments on the life of Christ as found in The Spirit of Prophecy, Volumes II and III. The new work of the life of Christ was also to include the numerous writings on the life and ministry of Jesus which Ellen White had written for the various church journals. Ellen White's literary assistants were instructed to collect these earlier writings into an orderly compilation to which she would also be adding further commentary as needed to round out certain episodes in the life of Christ, or to add remarks on the teachings and events of Christ's life not included in the earlier accounts.¹

The revisions and editing of earlier writings, the work of compiling these existing texts into an integrated new commentary on the life of Christ, and the development of new materials on the various episodes in the life and ministry of Jesus raise special questions about the work of these literary helpers, the role of Ellen White in the production of the DA text, and the use of literary sources.

Since the DA text includes both new materials and edited commentary from various older writings, our source

¹See Introduction Part B for full details on how The Desire of Ages was written.

Summary and Conclusions

study had to be extended to these earlier diary entries, manuscripts, and journal articles. Obviously source parallels (parallels in sources) should be drawn from the writer's own work, hopefully from the writer's own handwritten text, if evaluations of an author's literary dependency are to be measured.

We did not make a thorough study of the full content of these earlier writings, but we did include in our analysis those materials written on the same topics as the DA chapters researched, even if in later editing the commentaries were not included in the finished DA text. We were seeking Ellen White's firsthand use of sources, not always observable in a later edited version.

Of course the fact that Marian Davis and others were very much involved in the production of the DA text raised the questions relative to the influence of these literary assistants on the text. Was there any evidence that they did the copying? To what extent did their editorial activities modify the writings of Ellen White? Additional questions were raised by the study of the text itself. Did the text agree with Scripture? Is Ellen White consistent in her commentary through the years, or does she change either position or emphasis as she continues to treat a given topic through the years? These and other matters entered the discussion as the textual evidence changed from chapter to chapter.

The 15 randomly selected chapters from The Desire of

Summary and Conclusions

Ages vary in length, literary dependency, and use of earlier Ellen White writings. When literary criticism is extended over so wide an area and such varied extent of text the reviewer is often pulled in different directions at different stages of the analysis and by different characteristics of the text. The final analysis may be unduly influenced by such special features and to this degree distorted. A few distinctive features may have the effect of coloring one's view of the entire work. On the other hand in an attempt to avoid any such misrepresentation of the whole, one is tempted to overlook the more special elements of certain chapters and look for a common denominator shared by all the chapters. The effort to harmonize and smooth out the work so as to create a defensible generalization representative of the whole often washes out these atypical features. The net effect of such criticism is to create a unity or even a uniformity that exists only in the mind of the reviewer, surely not in the text.

To avoid either of these pitfalls we decided to develop questions to ask of each chapter, regardless of length and content. There was no time to research all 15 chapters, note their general character, then generate the most appropriate questions, given the content of the 15 selected chapters. Once the text evidence was presented, both that of Ellen White and that of her sources, we undertook a careful analysis of our findings. In so doing we kept the

Summary and Conclusions

14 basic questions in mind, questions that would form the structure of the summary of each chapter. At the same time, however, rather than taking a rigid approach to the 14 guiding questions addressed to each chapter, we allowed the study to follow the course as determined by the particular character of the textual evidence. If problems or questions emerged for which we had no answers and/or which would lead us beyond the limited scope of this research project, we allowed these questions to be raised and we noted the problem for future researchers to solve.

Generally speaking, we are quite pleased with the 14 questions. The fact that not all 14 applied equally well to all 15 chapters forced us to open the analysis to other issues. By not coercing the text to fit one particular mold, we were made aware of the special features of certain chapters. The special content of certain chapters raises, for example, the question of Ellen White's use of the text of Scripture. At the end of each chapter summary of 14 questions we allowed room for presentation of special features or problems raised by the chapter. These items are not compiled in the summary for they differ from chapter to chapter. These questions which remain for future study will be held over for the second section of this chapter and introduced where they relate to the general concluding statements.

Another advantage of developing the 14 questions prior to the analysis of the 15 chapters lay in the resulting

Summary and Conclusions

objectivity of the questions. We developed the questions from our desire for answers and not on the basis of the chapter's content. We did not limit questions to areas known to be common to the chapters under review. Whatever commonality of answers exists, it exists not by reason of the question but by reason of the content itself.

GENERAL SUMMARY

Each of the 14 questions is presented in full before the summary statement is given for the evidence of all 15 chapters for that particular question. The summary statement is based upon the answers given under that question number for all 15 chapters. Since it is rather cumbersome for the reader to check the answer for each question through the entire research report, we have attempted to pull together in one chart the answers to each question provided by each chapter. On the following six pages we list each of the 14 questions and the answer we found in each of the 15 chapters. Two pages are given to the 14 questions as answered by 5 chapters. Obviously we have had to abbreviate our answers to accommodate the limited space. As the answers to each question are compiled and summarized in our comments below, the reader is invited to consult the chart for evidence and for locating the specific chapters where further evidence may be found on a given question or special feature of the text.

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS

Summary Questions	Chapter 3	Chapter 10	Chapter 13	Chapter 14	Chapter 24
1A. HW or CC <u>DA</u> Texts? ¹	Neither	Neither	Neither	Handwritten	Handwritten
1B. Pre- <u>DA</u> HW or CC Txts	Both	Both	Both	Both	Copy Text
2. Is <u>DA</u> Txt Expansion or Reduction?	Reduction	Neither	Inconclusive	Expansion	Expansion
3. How does <u>DA</u> Content Compare with Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Same	Same	Same	Same	Same
4. How is <u>DA</u> Different from Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt?	Theme greatly enlarged	Christian aim not Adventist	Omits John's desert visit	John appears as new disciple	Did Jesus ask to read Bible?
5A. Dependent Sentences <u>DA</u>	59 of 130	35 of 231	8 of 127	100 of 250	32 of 153
5B. % of Chapt. Dependence	45%	15%	6%	40%	21%
6A. Independent <u>DA</u> Sent.	67 of 130	166 of 231	110 of 127	132 of 250	112 of 153
6B. % Chapt. Independence	52%	72%	87%	53%	73%
7A. Ave. Rate of Dependence for Dependent Sent.	2.3 for 59 S	2.89 for 35 S	2.1 for 8 S	3.12 for 100 S	2.8 for 32 S
7B. Ave. Rate of Dependence for all non-Bible Sent.	1.08 for 126 S	.50 for 201 S	.14 for 118 S	1.34 for 232 S	.63 for 144 S
8. Major <u>DA</u> Sources	Harris 44 S	None	None	Hanna 49 S Jones 44 S	Hanna 13 S March 15 S

1. The following abbreviations are used in this chart: HW = handwritten text(s); CC = corrected copy or copied text(s); DA = The Desire of Ages text; Txt = text(s); % = percent; Ave. = average; and S or Sent. = sentence(s).

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS - Page 2

Summary Questions	Chapter 3	Chapter 10	Chapter 13	Chapter 14	Chapter 24
9. Minor <u>DA</u> Sources	Kennedy 5 S Thayer 6 S Harris-Thayer-Kennedy in combination 4S	Fleetwood 10 S Geikie 9 S Hanna 8 S Jones 5 S Kitto 2 S Combination 1S	Hanna 8 S	Farrar 2 S Fleetwood 1 S Ingraham 2 S Melvill 2 S	March 4 S
10. Pre- <u>DA</u> Sources	Harris 100 S	Fleetwood 17 S Geikie 23 S Hanna 21 S Jones 3 S	Fleetwood 6S Hanna 28 S Harris 30 S Melvill 21 S Winslow 53 S	Jones 1 S Melvill 68 S	Hanna 9 S March 3 S March 37 S ¹
11. Is <u>DA</u> Text More or less Dependent than Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Less	Less	No basis for comparison	Some Less	Some Less
12. How does <u>DA</u> Dependent Content Compare with Independent Content?	Same	Same	No basis for comparison	Same	Same
13A. Is <u>DA</u> Chapt. Thematic Structure Dependent on Literary Sources?	No	No	No	No	Yes
13B. Are <u>DA</u> Chapt. Sub-units Structurally Dependent?	Yes	No	No	Possibly, See Pre- <u>DA</u> text	Partly
14. Are Pre- <u>DA</u> txts dependent in structure?	Yes where content is same	Yes in 3SP	Yes in some subsections	Yes in sub-units	Partly

1. March authored two books of a similar nature. The 3 sentences were from his <u>Days of the Son of Man</u> and the 37 sentences were parallels from his <u>Walks and Homes of Jesus</u> .					

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS - Page 3

867

Summary Questions	Chapter 37	Chapter 39	Chapter 46	Chapter 53	Chapter 56
1A. HW or CC <u>DA</u> Texts? ¹	Neither	Neither	Neither	Neither	Neither
1B. Pre- <u>DA</u> HW or CC Txts	Neither	Neither	Neither	Neither	Neither
2. Is <u>DA</u> Txt Expansion or Reduction?	Expansion	Reduction	Neither	Expansion	Inconclusive
3. How does <u>DA</u> Content Compare with Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Different	Same	Different	Different	Different
4. How is <u>DA</u> Different from Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt?	Follows Mt.10 not general	Harmonizing of Gospels	Only Trans-figuration	Larger scope of Jesus' activity	Bible comment not homelife
5A. Dependent Sentences <u>DA</u>	59 of 217	39 of 158	38 of 89	26 of 193	1 of 97
5B. % of Chapt. Dependence	27%	25%	43%	13%	1%
6A. Independent <u>DA</u> Sent. ¹	146 of 217	107 of 158	48 of 89	142 of 193	96 of 97
6B. % Chapt. Independence ¹	67%	68%	54%	74%	99%
7A. Ave. Rate of Dependence for Dependent Sent.	3.2 for 59 S	3.4 for 39 S	3.7 for 38 S	3.31 for 26 S	1.0 for 1 S
7B. Ave. Rate of Dependence for all non-Bible Sent.	.92 for 205 S	.92 for 146 S	1.6 for 86 S	.51 for 168 S	.01 for 97 S
8. Major <u>DA</u> Sources	Hanna 29 S Harris 15 S	Wayland 15 S Cumming 11 S	March 30 S	Hanna 23 S	

1. Independent use of Bible quotations has not been counted as source parallels and therefore is not included in the averages. Percentage figures are listed according to the nearest full percent.

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS - Page 4

Summary Questions	Chapter 37	Chapter 39	Chapter 46	Chapter 53	Chapter 56
9. Minor <u>DA</u> Sources	Miller 10 S Pentecost 5 S Cumming 1 S	Hanna 5 S Farrar 2 S March 4 S Pentecost 2 S	Hanna 4 S Fleetwood 2 S Cumming 1 S Nichol 1 S	Lange 2 S Geikie 1 S	Geikie 1 S
10. Pre- <u>DA</u> Sources	Hanna 28 S Harris 1 S Miller 1 S Pentecost 1 S	Hanna 4 S Cumming 10 S March 4 S Wayland 3 S	March 23 S Fleetwood 3 S Hanna 1 S	Hanna 5 S	
11. Is <u>DA</u> Text More or less Dependent than Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Less	Inconclusive ¹	Less	No basis for comparison	Does not apply
12. How does <u>DA</u> Dependent Content Compare with Independent Content?	Same	Same	Same	Inconclusive	Does not apply
13A. Is <u>DA</u> Chapt. Thematic Structure Dependent on Literary Sources?	No	No	Yes	No	No
13B. Are <u>DA</u> Chapt. Sub-units Structurally Dependent?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
14. Are Pre- <u>DA</u> txts dependent in structure?	No	Yes in some sub-sections	Partly	No basis for comparison ²	No

1. The DA text takes over much of the earlier material and yet there is a great amount of independent text. The content of the Pre-DA writings would have to be fully evaluated before one could make the comparison.
2. Chapter 53 covers a journey of Christ with many episodes whereas the SP account treats only the sending out of the seventy.

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS - Page 5

698

Summary Questions	Chapter 72	Chapter 75	Chapter 76	Chapter 83	Chapter 84
1A. HW or CC <u>DA</u> Texts?	Neither	Handwritten ¹ Partly	Copy Text ² Partly	Copy Text ² Partly	Copy Text ² Partly
1B. Pre- <u>DA</u> HW or CC Txts	Copy Text	Copy Text	Copy Text	Copy Text	Copy Text
2. Is <u>DA</u> Txt Expansion or Reduction?	Expansion	Reduction	Expansion	Reduction	Expansion
3. How does <u>DA</u> Content Compare with Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Same	Same	No basis for comparison	Same	Same
4. How is <u>DA</u> Different from Pre- <u>DA</u> Txt?	Only treats Lord's supper	Arrangement & adds pre-trial before Annas	None	None	Adds comment on Holy Spirit
5A. Dependent Sentences <u>DA</u>	40 of 201	168 of 351	55 of 173	68 of 116	95 of 138
5B. % of Chapt. Dependence	20%	48%	32%	59%	69%
6A. Independent <u>DA</u> Sent.	136 of 201	168 of 351	115 of 173	39 of 116	28 of 138
6B. % Chapt. Independence	68%	48%	67%	34%	20%
7A. Ave. Rate of Dependence for Dependent Sent.	3.75 for 40 S	3.63 for 168 S	3.47 for 55 S	3.41 for 68 S	3.66 for 95 S
7B. Ave. Rate of Dependence for all non-Bible Sent.	.75 for 176 S	1.8 for 336 S	1.12 for 170 S	2.17 for 107 S	2.83 for 123 S
8. Major <u>DA</u> Sources	Hanna 17 S	Hanna 64 S Farrar 55 S Ingraham 17 S	Edersheim 26 S	Hanna 30 S March 38 S	Hanna 61 S March 34 S

1. A few independent sentences from Diary Book 14, 1894 appear in the DA text. We list them as DA text but they could also be viewed as Pre-DA material.
2. The sentences from manuscripts written in 1897 appear to have been written as DA texts even though they have been edited and have been combined with other materials to form the chapter of the DA text.

ANSWERS TO THE 14 SUMMARY QUESTIONS AS FOUND IN THE 15 CHAPTERS - Page 6

Summary Questions	Chapter 72	Chapter 75	Chapter 76	Chapter 83	Chapter 84
9. Minor <u>DA</u> Sources	Boyd 8 S March 4 S Pentecost 4 S Cumming 2 S Jones 2 S Lange 1 S Farrar 1 S Geikie 1 S	Bennett 8 S March 4 S Kitto 4 S Harris 3 S Edersheim 3 S Krummacher 2 S Hall 2 S Deems 2 S Andrews 2 S Jones 1 S Geikie 1 S	Hanna 10 S Ingraham 7 S Dods 7 S Smith 2 S Farrar 2 S Thayer 1 S	None	None
10. Pre- <u>DA</u> Sources	Boyd 8 S Hanna 6 S March 1 S	Farrar 82 S Hanna 43 S March 9 S Bennett 3 S Ingraham 2 S Kitto 2 S	Krummacher 1 S	Hanna 61 S March 47 S	Hanna 38 S March 30 S
11. Is <u>DA</u> Text More or less Dependent than Pre- <u>DA</u> ?	Inconclusive	Same	Same	Same	Same
12. How does <u>DA</u> Dependent Content Compare with Independent Content?	Dependent is descriptive, Independent is discursive	Same except for emphasis	Same except for emphasis	Same except for emphasis	Same except for emphasis
13A. Is <u>DA</u> Chapt. Thematic Structure Dependent on Literary Sources?	No	No	Yes	No	No
13B. Are <u>DA</u> Chapt. Sub-units Structurally Dependent?	Yes, partly	Yes, partly	Yes	Yes	Yes
14. Are Pre- <u>DA</u> txts dependent in structure?	No	Yes in some subsections	Partly	Partly	Yes in some subsections

Summary and Conclusions

Question #1. Do we have primary source material for the Ellen White text? By "primary" we refer to "first-hand" material, text written by the hand of Ellen White. We have extended this definition of "primary" to include the typed copies of Ellen White's handwritten materials made by her secretaries who were employed to make corrected copies of Ellen White's manuscript. The corrections are understood to have been limited to punctuation, capitalization, and spelling.

The examination of the original documents or at least the earliest work of Ellen White is necessary for understanding the role of Ellen White and that of her secretaries in the production of the Ellen White writings. This question opens the way to the careful analysis of the documents behind the published works as we know them.

Answer. Yes and no. No, if by text we have in mind a complete chapter. Searches by the staff of the White Estate office and our own investigations have failed to turn up any handwritten texts for a single one of the 87 chapters of the DA text. In fact, there is not even a secretarial copy of a single DA chapter as typed from an Ellen White manuscript text.¹ The answer is yes, however, if we refer

¹We exclude the DA "Working Manuscript" which contains about one-third of the DA text in chapter form as typed by one or more of Ellen White's literary assistants. We indicated earlier in this report, Introduction, Part B, page 193, that the text appears to have been a working manuscript of a portion of the DA text and there is no evidence that any of it was typed directly from Ellen White's handwritten text.

Summary and Conclusions

to sentences and chapter portions. We do have several sentences in chapter 14 which are first found in Diary Book 32, 1899, a few sentences in chapter 24 which are also found in Diary Book 14, 1889, 1890, and a number of independent comments in chapter 75 from Diary Book 18, 1894. Three additional DA chapters have significant portions which may be found in typed copies of manuscripts dating from 1897, only a year before the DA was published. Neither handwritten nor corrected copy texts were found for 9 of the 15 DA chapters of our study. The pre-DA materials yielded the greater amount of "primary" text material for Ellen White's writings. In these writings, including unpublished texts on the life of Christ, texts written and/or published as independent articles, letters, or manuscripts, and texts never picked up for the DA, we found handwritten and corrected-copy portions treating the content of 10 of the 15 chapters. The handwritten texts as well as the secretarial copies contained both dependent and independent sentences.

Question #2. Does the DA text represent an expansion or reduction in comparison with Ellen White's earlier published volumes on the life of Christ, Spirit of Prophecy, Volume II, and the first 19 chapters of Volume III, 1877 and 1878? The concern behind this question has to do with the influence of literary sources on the expansion of Ellen White's writings from the four-volume work of Spiritual Gifts which was completed by 1864 to the larger page format

Summary and Conclusions

and multiple-volume sets of the The Spirit of Prophecy, Testimonies for the Church, and Conflict of the Ages series, not to mention independent works providing counsels to the youth, to ministers and workers, and memoirs on the progress of the Advent Movement and the White family in particular, all of which may be found included to some extent in the earlier Spiritual Gifts. Is there an expansion of the same subject matter in these later treatments, and if so, is it to be explained on the grounds of Ellen White's leaning more heavily on the writings of others?

Answer. On the question of expansion or reduction the evidence presents a mixed picture. According to the summaries of the 15 chapters, 7 chapters involved an expansion, 4 a reduction, 2 were about the same length as the earlier publication, and 2 were of so different a content that a comparison was not possible.

It is clear that Ellen White used additional sources in her writings on the life of Christ during the years following the production of the Spirit of Prophecy volumes. On some topics she wrote so much more that the chapter in the DA text, though longer than the SP text, was still a reduction when compared to her previous writings. The length of several of the 15 chapters was about the same as the comparable Spirit of Prophecy chapter but the treatment of the subject was so different that we could not help but wonder if the question still applied.

Summary and Conclusions

In regard to the basic issue behind the question, however, a rather consistent image emerged. Ellen White continued to write on certain topics because they were of special value in her encouragement and counsel for the Advent believers. She also found some topics lent themselves well to the evangelical purpose behind the writing of The Desire of Ages. There is no question but that she found help in the additional sources but the evidence does not indicate that the source parallels alone account for the expansion. In every chapter involving expansion her independent comment was also found. The fact that the DA text is generally less dependent than the earlier texts supports this contention.

Question #3. How does the content of the DA text compare in general with the content of Ellen White's earlier writings on the life of Christ where the same subject matter is involved? The concern here is not to provide an in-depth content analysis of the text. This is a study in source criticism. The question is primarily directed to the concern as to whether the use of more or different sources influenced the direction of Ellen White's writings. We would expect that the purpose of the DA text differs somewhat from that of the earlier SP productions and that Ellen White's points of view would have undergone a natural development and maturity as happens to any individual, especially a public religious figure.

Summary and Conclusions

Answer. There is strong agreement over the 15 chapters that the content of the DA text is basically the same as found in the SP text. We would expect that some differences would occur in the very process of revision. These differences will be discussed under question 4 which follows. A consistent variation found in the DA text was the stronger spiritual appeals and lessons. It is difficult to explain this dissimilarity by an appeal to the influence of sources. The spiritual emphasis is not characteristic of the sources. Rather it is likely that Ellen White emphasizes this aspect because the DA was designed to be a work for colporteurs. Ellen White was anxious that as a result of this study of the life of Christ many would be led to the foot of the cross.

Question #4. Are there any significant differences in content between the DA text and the pre-DA writings? Once again the interest in the question is not one of content analysis as such. We are looking for major source influence on the material content of the chapter.

Answer. Under question 3 we learned that no major differences were found between the DA text and the earlier writings on the life of Christ apart from the spiritual emphasis which went along with the differing purpose for publishing the DA. We therefore changed the question slightly in our summary chart so that we could point out differences without giving them the standing of

Summary and Conclusions

"significant" or "major." The differences vary from chapter to chapter and it is difficult to ascertain the degree of influence exerted by the literary sources, especially when we take into consideration that parallels from Hanna's life of Christ are found in both the SP and the DA texts.

The variations between the SP and DA text appear to fall into two broad categories. There are differences in the stories included in the chapter or in the arrangement of the chapter. We might label these dissimilarities as editorial or redactional differences. A second type of variation involved revision. Modifications of this type brought the text into greater harmony with Scripture.

It is not at all clear that the sources influenced all of these changes. Hanna has no comparable chapter to that of DA chapter 3 and Ellen White's only source was Harris whose work was not narrative or chronological. We would expect Ellen White to broaden the application of John's life and mission (chapter 10) from the more limited Adventist context to include Christianity in general. Ellen White herself or Marian Davis could have recognized from a general reading of the Gospel records that John's visit to Jesus in the wilderness and his discipleship prior to the call by the Jordan as mentioned in the earlier SP text is extrabiblical and would probably best be left out of chapters 13 and 14 of DA. The same explanation would apply to the different harmonization of the Scripture accounts on feeding the five

Summary and Conclusions

thousand (chapter 39) and reducing the number of cock crowings from three to two in commenting on the denials of Peter (chapter 75). The best arguments in favor of source influence seem to be found in the content and arrangement of chapter 75 on the Jewish trials of Jesus and perhaps the development of a separate chapter on the life of Judas (chapter 76). It must be recognized in the latter case, however, that the sources she used emphasized the general character of Judas and Ellen White had already developed several articles on the life of Judas. Though Hanna is used heavily in commenting on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit in chapter 84, the addition of this section on the Holy Spirit is a natural revision of the SP account which already had the two upper-room appearances of Jesus following His resurrection. The Gospel of John is singular in recording both occasions and only John describes the second appearance and the bestowal of the Holy Spirit on the night of the resurrection. Either Marian Davis or Ellen White would have noticed the SP account did not include this important aspect of the first encounter between Jesus and His disciples.

It seems fair to say, therefore, that the sources do not play a significant role in effecting the differences that we have noted between the DA and pre-DA texts.

Question #5. What is the nature of the dependency of the DA text on literary sources? What proportion of the chapter contains sentences which in their literary

Summary and Conclusions

composition reflect the influence of sources?

Answer. This question points to the very heart of the investigation. Before summarizing the results of our analysis of the 15 chapters let us also present questions 6 and 7. These three questions are closely related as are their answers. We have chosen to present a composite summary answer on questions 5, 6, and 7, following question 7 below.

Question #6. What is the nature of the independence of the DA text from the influence of literary sources? What proportion of the chapter contains sentences which do not reflect the influence of literary sources in their composition?

Answer. See under our answer for question 7 which follows.

Question #7. What is the degree of dependence for the dependent sentences when evaluated according to the rating scale? How do the dependent sentences rate when figured against all sentences in the chapter other than Bible quotations?

Answer. The answers to questions 5 through 7 for each of the 15 chapters have been supplied in the six-page chart above. To assist the reader in following through on how these separate figures have been processed for our summary answers to these three questions, we have developed a separate chart which appears on the following page. On

STATISTICS ON SOURCE PARALLEL EVALUATIONS FOR THE DA TEXT

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
DA TEXT	Sentences in each chapter	Bible quotations	Strict Independence	Partial Independence	Source Bible	Loose Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Strict Paraphrase	Verbatim	Strict Verbatim	Dependent sentences	Chapter % Bible	% Strict Independence	Chapter % dependent	Ave. rate dependency all sentences	Ave. rate dependent sentences	Sentences showing some independence	Chapter % showing some independence
ABC* Type	No. of Sent.	B2 0	I1 0	I2 1	B1 2	P3 3	P2 4	P1 5	V2 6	V1 7	Cols. 5-11	Col. 3	Col. 4	Col. 12	Cols. 4-12	Col. 12	Cols. 3-5	Cols. 3-5
46-A	89#	3	48	8	0	2	15	11	2	0	38	3%**	54%	43%	1.64	3.7	59	66%
56-A	97	0	96	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0%	99%	1%	.01	1.0	97	100%
83-A	116#	9	39	17	7	2	18	21	3	0	68	7%	34%	59%	2.17	3.41	65	56%
13-A	127	9	110	5	0	0	3	0	0	0	8	7%	87%	6%	.14	2.1	124	98%
3-A	130	4	67	24	5	20	9	0	1	0	59	3%	52%	45%	1.08	2.3	95	73%
A-Tot	559	25	360	55	12	24	45	32	6	0	174	4.5%	64.4%	31.1%	0.99	3.03	440	78.7%
84-B	138#	15	28	17	7	2	39	25	5	0	95	11%	20%	69%	2.83	3.66	60	43%
24-B	153	9	112	9	3	8	10	1	1	0	32	6%	73%	21%	.63	2.8	130	85%
39-B	158	12	107	6	4	3	20	5	1	0	39	8%	68%	25%	.92	3.4	125	79%
76-B	173	3	115	8	1	14	21	11	0	0	55	1%	67%	32%	1.12	3.47	126	71%
53-B	193	25	142	4	5	2	9	6	0	0	26	13%	74%	13%	.51	3.31	171	89%
B-Tot	815	64	504	44	20	29	99	48	7	0	247	7.9%	61.8%	30.3%	1.13	3.44	612	75.1%
72-C	201	25	136	7	0	3	16	14	0	0	40	12%	68%	20%	.85	3.75	168	84%
37-C	217	12	146	9	14	12	9	10	5	0	59	6%	67%	27%	.92	3.2	167	77%
10-C	231	30	166	10	3	5	15	2	0	0	35	13%	72%	15%	.50	2.9	206	89%
14-C	250	18	132	15	22	18	31	9	5	0	100	7%	53%	40%	1.34	3.1	165	66%
75-C	351	15	168	38	13	2	41	68	6	0	168	4%	48%	48%	1.82	3.6	221	63%
C-Tot	1250	100	748	79	52	40	112	103	16	0	402	8.0%	59.8%	32.2%	1.18	3.39	927	74.2%
Total	2624	189	1612	178	84	93	256	183	29	0	823	7.2%	61.4%	31.4%	1.12	3.33	1979	75.4%

* - ABC indicates chapter length; A=5 shortest, B=5 medium length, C=longest. # - Evaluation units not sentences; chapter 46 has 88 sentences, 83 has 109, and 84 has 137, or 2615 for the 15 chapters. ** - Percentages for each chapter have been rounded to the nearest full percent.

Summary and Conclusions

this chart the "Statistics on Source Parallel Evaluations for the DA Text" are presented in 19 columns beginning from left to right. We invite the reader to follow the chart as we summarize the answers for questions 5, 6, and 7. For the purpose of registering source dependency, it matters not if Ellen White or Marian Davis did the writing and/or editing.

Please note that the chapters are not listed in column 1 in the natural sequential order. We have listed the chapters in groups of five according to their length. The first five chapters constitute the "A" group (46-A, 56-A, 83-A, 13-A, and 3-A). They are the shortest of the 15 randomly selected DA chapters. The next group, the "B" group, is composed of the medium-length DA chapters, and the "C" group is the designation for the five longest of the 15 chapters. The 87 chapters were listed by length from the shortest to the longest and the random sampling was stratified so as to select five of the shortest, five from the medium-length chapters, and five from the longest chapters. These three groups made up the 15 chapters of the study. The chart lists them from the shortest to the longest as may be confirmed by noting the number of sentences or sentence-evaluation units given in column 2.

Under columns 3 through 11 we list the number of source parallels for each chapter according to the type of literary dependency. At the head of these columns we indicate the sentence type, such as Strict Independence or Loose

Summary and Conclusions

Paraphrase. We also list the symbol indicating the type of dependency or independence as well as the valuation rate for each type. Strict Independence rates a zero (0) dependency rate for not showing any dependence. The highest rate, 7, is given to Strict Verbatim which is the most dependence a sentence can show, i.e., a virtual duplication of the source sentence. These sentence parallels for each chapter have been summed up in column 11 and compared against the total sentences of the chapter for a percentage rating under column 15. These same sentence parallels are rated according to the value for each type or degree of dependency and then averaged for each chapter under columns 16 and 17. Column 16 gives the rate when the dependency is averaged for all sentences of the chapter, including the independent sentences. Column 17 gives the average dependency rate for the chapter when figuring only the dependent sentences. In neither calculation do we include the Bible quotations in the DA text which are not dependent upon the influence of the source.

The final two columns at the margin on the right, columns 18 and 19, give a positive value to the Partial Independence sentences and count the Bible Quotations as independent since their use was not influenced by the source. In the previous figures the Partial Independent sentences were given a negative credit, i.e., were given a point for dependency. In columns 18 and 19 these same

Summary and Conclusions

sentences are given a point for independence since Ellen White added a measure of independence to the sentences which also show the influence of sources. So often in source critical studies the emphasis is placed on the use of sources and the independence of the writer is minimized. We have attempted to at least partially protect ourselves against this accusation by making this positive evaluation for Ellen White in columns 18 and 19. We recognize that there are subtle influences of the source in content and arrangement of sentences which bear no similarity in verbal expression. We estimate that these influences are more than equaled by the work of the writer in those sentences which are dependent but not verbatim. The hand of the writer is apparent in the composition of a Loose Paraphrase sentence even though we only list the sentence under dependency.

The last line of the chart where the totals for the 15 chapters are listed provides the data we need to answer questions 5 through 7. Our research on the DA text covered 2,624 evaluation units for the 2,615 actual sentences of the text. Several sentences were split into independent clauses for evaluation purposes. Of these 2,624 sentence units, 823 were rated as dependent (col. 12). On an average we may say that 31.4 percent of the DA text is dependent to some extent on literary sources (col. 15). Turning to question 6, these same 2,624 sentence units included 1,612 sentences which rated Strict Independence. On a percentage basis our

Summary and Conclusions

figures indicate that 61.4 percent of the DA text has to be credited to the independent work of Ellen White and her literary assistants. To put it another way, there are twice as many independent sentences as there are dependent sentences. The rate of dependency, which is the concern of question 7, averages out at 3.33 or at the level of Loose Paraphrase when viewing the degree of dependency for dependent sentences (col.17). When looking at the average dependency rate for an entire chapter, including the independent sentences, the rate drops to 1.12 or about the level of Partial Independence (col. 16).

Question #8. What were the major sources used by Ellen White in writing The Desire of Ages? By major sources we have in mind those literary works which provided more than 10 sentence parallels for any one chapter.

Answer. We have listed on page 884 the 10 works by 9 writers which functioned as major literary sources in the writing of the DA text. Of course some of these same writers served as minor sources as well for chapters where their use is not so dominant. William Hanna is by far the most frequently used source, appearing to some degree in all but two of the 15 chapters and furnishing the greatest number of parallels. Daniel March takes second place, furnishing parallels for 7 of the 15 chapters through two of his works which include material on selected events in the life of Jesus. Apart from these two authors Ellen White

MAJOR SOURCES FOR THE DA TEXT¹
(Number of parallels per DA chapter)

Authors and Titles	Chs.	3	10	13	14	24	37	39	46	53	56	72	75	76	83	84	Total
William Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>			8	8	49	13	29	5	4	23		17	64	10	30	61	321
Daniel March, <u>Night Scenes of the Bible</u>															38	34	72
John Harris, <u>The Great Teacher</u>	44						15						3				62
Frederic Farrar, <u>The Life of Christ</u>					2			2				1	55	2			62
Daniel March, <u>Walks and Homes of Jesus</u>						15		4	30			4	4				57
George Jones, <u>Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels</u>			5		44							2	1				52
Alfred Edersheim, <u>The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah</u>													3	26			29
J. H. Ingraham, <u>The Prince of the House of David</u>					2								17	7			26
Francis Wayland, <u>Salvation by Christ</u>								15									15
John Cumming, <u>Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament: St. John</u>								11									11

1. A MAJOR source is any source which has furnished more than ten parallels for any given chapter. We list all parallels furnished by the major source for all chapters of the DA text.

Summary and Conclusions

appears to have utilized a given book for writing on a specific topic. Harris' work on Christ is arranged thematically and on occasion Ellen White will dip into his text when treating a topic rather than an event or series of events such as called for in a narrative text. Her use of Harris for chapter 3 and for several sentences of chapter 37 illustrates such usage. The other six authors are used mainly for one chapter. Another characteristic of Ellen White's use of sources is that, with the exception of Hanna who is frequently utilized, more often than not she will use only one major source per chapter. Discounting the input from Hanna, two chapters did have three major sources and three chapters had no major source even when Hanna's contribution was included. We shall have more to say on this point under question 10 below.

Question #9. What were the minor sources used by Ellen White in writing The Desire of Ages? Minor sources are those which have furnished no more than 10 sentence parallels for any given chapter.

Answer. On pages 886 and 887 below we list the 21 minor sources and their 20 authors, two of which, Cumming and March, also wrote works which served Ellen White as major sources. Several of these writers provided as few as one or two sentence parallels for only one chapter out of the 15. Were this the only pattern of Ellen White's use of sources we would be tempted to discount such figures. But

MINOR SOURCES FOR THE DA TEXT¹ - Page 1
(Number of parallels per DA chapter)

Authors and Titles	Chs.	3	10	13	14	24	37	39	46	53	56	72	75	76	83	84	Total
John Fleetwood, <u>The Life of Our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ</u>			10		1				2								13
Cunningham Geikie, <u>The Life and Words of Christ</u>			9							1	1	1	1				13
George Pentecost, <u>Bible Studies</u> (1888, 1889)							5	2				4					11
James Miller, <u>Week-Day Religion</u>							10										10
Robert Boyd, <u>The World's Hope</u>												8					8
James Bennett, <u>Lectures on the History of Jesus Christ</u>													8				8
Marcus Dods, <u>The Gospel of John</u>														7			7
E. W. Thayer, <u>Sketches from the Life of Jesus</u>	6													1			7
John Kitto, <u>Daily Bible Illustrations</u>			2										4				6
William S. Kennedy, <u>Messianic Prophecy</u>	5																5
Daniel March, <u>Days of the Son of Man</u>						4											4
Johann Lange, <u>The Life of the Lord Jesus Christ</u>										2		1					3

1. A MINOR source is any source which has furnished no more than ten parallels for any given chapter.

MINOR SOURCES FOR THE DA TEXT¹ - Page 2
(Number of parallels per DA chapter)

Authors and Titles	Chs.	3	10	13	14	24	37	39	46	53	56	72	75	76	83	84	Total
Samuel J. Andrews, <u>The Life of our Lord upon the Earth...</u>													2				2
John Cumming, <u>Minor Works, (Third Series)</u>												2					2
John Cumming, <u>Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament: St. Matthew</u>							1		1								2
Charles F. Deems, <u>Who Was Jesus</u>													2				2
Joseph Hall, <u>Contemplations on the Histical Essays of the Old and New Testaments</u>													2				2
Frederick Wilhelm Krummacher, <u>The Suffering Saviour</u>													2				2
Henry Melvill, <u>Sermons</u>					2												2
William Smith, ed. <u>A Dictionary of the Bible</u>															2		2
W. R. Nicoll, <u>The Incarnate Saviour, A Life of Christ</u>									1								1
(Multiple authors in various combinations) ¹		4	1														(5)

1. In several instances it appears that Ellen White combined material from two authors in the composition of one sentence. Rather than list the combinations separately we have placed these parallels under one heading.

Summary and Conclusions

we cannot overlook the fact that a number of our major sources, such as Farrar, Jones, and Ingraham, furnished as few as one or two parallels for certain chapters. It is altogether possible, if not probable, that some of these minor sources for the 15 chapters also served as major sources for chapters not treated in this investigation. Further evidence pointing in this direction may be found under our answer for question 10 below.

Before leaving question 9 there are two more aspects of the evidence to be noticed. In harmony with the general pattern of major source usage, generally the use of the minor source was concentrated in one chapter. Fleetwood supplies 10 parallels for chapter 10 and only three parallels for two other chapters. Geikie is used 9 times in chapter 10 and only once in four other chapters. Overall, 14 of the 22 sources were only used in one chapter, 5 sources furnished parallels for 2 chapters, 2 sources provided parallels for 3 chapters, and 1 source was used in 5 chapters. Looking at the evidence from the point of view of the chapter, the typical pattern shows that a chapter is likely to use few minor sources. Three chapters listed more than 3 sources (75 used 7, 72 used 5, and 10 used 4), but the remaining 12 contained parallels from three or less.

Question #10. What sources were used by Ellen White in the production of her articles, letters, and manuscripts on the life of Christ? We have already clearly shown that

Summary and Conclusions

The Desire of Ages was intended to be a revision of those portions of the Spirit of Prophecy which dealt with the life of Christ. It would be developed by Marian Davis, Ellen White's "bookmaker," from a scrapbook to be compiled on the materials Ellen White had written through the years on the life and ministry of Christ as well as from specific manuscripts Ellen White would add to complete the narrative commentary. Though we do not know the contents of that scrapbook which served as the storehouse for the various texts to be selected for the DA, any document on the life of Christ written before the mid-1890s would likely have been included between its covers.

We have taken into account in this basic category all of the pre-1898 texts, since even the 1897 manuscripts do not represent a chapter of the DA text. The DA chapters were evidently constructed from the selected textual portions of articles, letters, manuscripts, and diary notations, published and unpublished, written throughout the years right up to the time of the publishing of The Desire of Ages. This question focuses our attention on the source parallels to be found in these separate documents on the life of Christ as well as in the earlier volumes of the Spirit of Prophecy which are at the heart of the revision. Naturally we include in the review some texts which were not incorporated into the DA and other materials at a stage before they became edited and combined with companion texts

Summary and Conclusions

to form the text of DA. These earlier texts are included for the purpose of source analysis. No attempt is made to study their independent sentences.

Answer. Since the DA text is largely an edited compilation of text portions written by Ellen White in earlier documents, including letters, articles, manuscripts, and to a small extent her diary notations, we would naturally expect that the source parallels found in the DA text are first to be found in the earlier writings. This is exactly what we find for most of the chapters. Because of the duplication of the earlier text in the DA chapters, we often omitted the previous writings from our text presentation. An exception to this practice was when we found the earlier text not duplicated in the DA or when the earlier text exhibited greater dependency than the later DA text.

The overlapping of the DA with the previous writings results in the same source parallels being found in both the pre-DA and DA texts. A few source parallels occur only in the earlier materials because portions of the earlier writings were not utilized in the DA text. On the following page we have included a chart listing those sources which furnished at least 10 parallels on the content of one of our 15 chapters. We have underscored the word "content" because we include in this term the content of any Ellen White document which in part touches on the subject matter of the

SOURCES FOR THE PRE-DA TEXT¹
(Number of parallels per DA chapter
pre-DA material)

Authors and Titles	Chs.	3	10	13	14	24	37	39	46	53	56	72	75	76	83	84	Total
William Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>			21	28		9	28	4	1	5		6	43		61	38	244
John Harris, <u>The Great Teacher</u>	100			30			1										131
Henry Melvill, <u>Sermons</u>				21	68												89
Frederic Farrar, <u>The Life of Christ</u>													82				82
Daniel March, <u>Night Scenes of the Bible</u>															47	30	77
Daniel March, <u>Walks and Homes of Jesus</u>						37		4	23			1	9				74
Octavius Winslow, <u>The Glory of the Redeemer</u>					53												53
John Fleetwood, <u>The Life of Our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ</u>			17	6					3								26
Cunningham Geikie, <u>The Life and Words of Christ</u>			23														23
John Cumming, <u>Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament: St. John</u>								10									10

1. The sources providing parallels for the Pre-DA texts were not classified as "Major" or "Minor." We list here those which furnished ten or more parallels for Ellen White's earlier writings on the life of Christ.

Summary and Conclusions

chapter as found in the DA text. For example in chapter 14 of the DA Ellen White comments on Jesus' statement to Nathanael that "Hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending on the Son of man." (DA, p. 142) When she was commenting on this same topic in Manuscript 13, 1884, she extended her comment to include the dream of Jacob in which he saw a ladder stretching from earth to heaven. In so doing she drew quite heavily on one of Melvill's sermons. In Manuscript 13 Ellen White was writing on the life of Christ and on the content of chapter 14 even though some of her comment in the earlier text was not used in developing the DA text. The same kind of situation may be found in Ellen White's writings on the temptations of Christ which are covered in chapters 12 and 13 of the DA text. Many of the sentences of Diary Books 14 and 32 where she writes on the subject of Christ's humiliation are dealing with the experience of Jesus' temptation. She is writing on the life of Christ even though not all of her comments are picked up in the DA text. We have therefore included this material where it revealed the use of sources because the text, being earlier and found in Ellen White's handwriting, more accurately represents her use of sources. The DA text as an edited text cannot help but to some degree mask that usage.

The list of sources utilized in the pre-DA writings shows that as with the DA text, William Hanna provides the

Summary and Conclusions

largest number of parallels. Daniel March furnished the second largest number of parallels through Ellen White's use of two of his books. John Harris' The Great Teacher as a single book supplied the second highest number of parallels. We may also note that Ellen White tended to concentrate her use of a source. Most books were used for only one or two subjects.

The pre-DA sources add only one new author to our list of literary sources, Octavius Winslow. Henry Melvill was named under the minor sources for supplying two parallels but here we find him to be a major contributor with 89 parallels.

In discussing the use of parallels in the pre-DA material it may be of interest to the reader to notice the parallels we found in Ellen White's diary materials and in her letters and manuscripts. It is well known that Ellen White's secretaries helped to compose her journal articles from her writings. We have already reviewed in the introduction to this study the role of Marian Davis, Ellen White's "bookmaker." Some students of Ellen White's writings have wondered if these literary assistants were involved in copying or paraphrasing the works of these authors we find represented in the writings of Ellen White. On pages 894 and 895 which follow we have prepared a chart on the handwritten and typescript texts of Ellen White. These texts are as close as we can come to the original work

MANUSCRIPT EVIDENCE FOR USE OF SOURCES BY ELLEN G. WHITE

DA Chapter	Handwritten Texts	Typescript Texts ¹	Parallels	Literary Sources Used
3	Diary Book 17, 1891 (Pages 98-100) -----	MS 24, 1891 [copied in 1903] Lt 43, 1895 MS 9, 1896	10 3 20	Harris - <u>The Great Teacher</u> Harris - <u>The Great Teacher</u> Harris - <u>The Great Teacher</u>
10	-----	-----		
13	----- Diary Book 14, 1890 (Pages 272-5, 282-3, 293-5) Diary Book 32, 1899 (Pages 5-37)	Lt 1a, 1872 ----- -----	10 26 33	Hanna - <u>The Life of Christ</u> Winslow - <u>Glory of the Redeemer</u> Winslow, Melvill and Harris [Sources used in blocks]
14	Manuscript 13, 1884 Diary Book 32, 1899 (Pages 39-48)	----- -----	56 8	Melvill, "Jacob's Vision and Vow" Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>
24	Diary Book 14, 1889,90 (Pages 73-77)	----- Lt 4, 1889	2 9	March, <u>Walks and Homes of Jesus & Days of the Son of Man</u> March, <u>Walks and Homes of Jesus</u>
37	-----	-----		
39	-----	-----		
46	-----	-----		
53	-----	-----		
56	-----	-----		

¹Typescript Texts are typed texts of Ellen White's handwritten materials, i.e., letters, manuscripts, diary notations, etc., as taken from her writing journals by her secretaries.

MANUSCRIPT EVIDENCE FOR USE OF SOURCES BY ELLEN G. WHITE - Page 2

DA Chapter	Handwritten Texts	Typescript Texts	Parallels	Literary Sources Used
72	- - - -	MS 35, 1897 ¹	8	Boyd - <u>The World's Hope</u>
75 ²	- - - -	MS 51, 1897	83	Farrar - <u>The Life of Christ</u>
	- - - -	MS 102, 1897	3	Hanna's & Farrar's <u>Life of Christ</u>
	- - - -	MS 104, 1897	11	Hanna's & Farrar's <u>Life of Christ</u>
76	- - - -	MS 28, 1897	9	Dods, <u>Gospel of John</u>
	- - - -	MS 120, 1897	16	Edersheim, <u>Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah</u>
83	- - - -	MS 113, 1897 (partly)	14	March, <u>Night Scenes</u> and Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>
84	- - - -	MS 113, 1897 (partly)	12	March, <u>Night Scenes</u> and Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>
	- - - -	MS 149, 1897	22	Hanna, <u>The Life of Christ</u>

1. Manuscript 47, 1897 contains a few sentences on the topic of chapter 72 but no source parallels were found in the text.
2. Some handwritten material from Diary Book 18, 1894, was carried over into DA chapter 75 via Manuscript 111, 1897. Since these sentences involved independent comments of Ellen White they are not listed here.

Summary and Conclusions

of Ellen White, given the documents preserved in the White Estate Office. The pre-DA documents clearly show that Ellen White herself was involved in copying from the literary sources. We list in the table the number of source parallels as well as the particular source from which the parallels came.

Question #11. How does the DA text compare with the pre-DA text in the use of literary sources? When this question was first formulated the concern was to discover if Ellen White's handwritten texts or earlier writing methods used sources, and if so, was such usage different from her later writings, particularly in such edited works as the DA. We were also interested in discovering if the same or other sources were used at different periods in the writings of Ellen White and if the ways of using these sources differed.

Answer. As the research project developed it soon became apparent that we would not be able to give the pre-DA text the comprehensive review necessary for making a comparative evaluation between the various earlier documents and the DA text. Research assistance and time demanded that we limit our study of the earlier materials to the location and evaluation of source parallels. Since the DA text was largely based upon these previous writings we expected and found many duplicate sentence units between the pre-DA and the DA texts. In those chapters where there was heavy dependence on earlier writings we listed the duplicated units in Table A of the analysis.

Summary and Conclusions

We usually omitted from the text presentation of each chapter those sentence units which duplicated the DA text and also those which our source studies indicated as being independent. We included the sentence units which contain literary source parallels not included in the DA text or which demonstrated a greater degree of dependency than did the DA text. Exceptions to this policy were made when we needed to establish the context to justify the legitimacy of the comparison or where we were presenting an entire text.

The statistics given on page 898, immediately following, relate to the sentence units from the pre-DA text which are found in the text presentations. The figures do not include the dependent sentences which duplicate the DA text nor the independent sentences of the pre-DA materials (apart from the exceptions already noted). For this reason we were not able to complete the comparisons as called for in columns 13-16, 18, and 19.

Even though complete comparisons are not possible for the reasons stated, the statistics appear to support the general conclusion given on page 868 to question 11. Every chapter on which there is enough evidence, i.e., where there are pre-DA texts, and where the content of the earlier text matches that of the DA text, the DA text shows itself to be less dependent or of about the same dependency as the earlier texts. We did find an exception here and there when in preparing the DA text the writer evidently returned to

STATISTICS ON SOURCE PARALLEL EVALUATIONS FOR THE PRE-DA TEXT

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
<u>DA</u> TEXT	Sentences in each chapter	Bible quotations	Strict Independence	Partial Independence	Source Bible	Loose Paraphrase	Simple Paraphrase	Strict Paraphrase	Verbatim	Strict Verbatim	Dependent sentences	Chapter % Bible	% Strict Independence	Chapter % dependent	Ave. rate dependency all sentences	Ave. rate dependent sentences	Sentences showing some independence	Chapter % showing some independence
ABC Type	No. of Sent.	B2 0	I1 0	I2 1	B1 2	P3 3	P2 4	P1 5	V2 6	V1 7	Cols. 5-11	Col. 3	Col. 4	Col. 12	Cols. 4-12	Col. 12	Cols. 3-5	Cols. 3-5
46-A	29	0	2	8	1	0	7	9	2	0	27					3.5		
56-A	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0					0.0		
83-A	113	2	3	22	0	5	35	38	8	0	108					3.8		
13-A	246	2	106	48	9	8	32	33	7	1	138					3.1		
3-A	100	1	5	28	8	19	29	6	4	0	94					2.9		
A-Tot	488	5	116	106	18	32	103	86	21	1	367	DOES	DOES	DOES	DOES	3.31	DOES	DOES
84-B	70	0	2	12	5	3	13	26	9	0	68	NOT	NOT	NOT	NOT	3.93	NOT	NOT
24-B	57	0	8	11	0	4	14	11	9	0	49	NOT	NOT	NOT	NOT	3.8	NOT	NOT
39-B	24	1	2	7	0	2	7	5	0	0	21	NOT	NOT	NOT	NOT	3.1	NOT	NOT
76-B	49	1	9	9	0	10	14	6	0	0	39	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	3.2	APPLY	APPLY
53-B	5	0	0	1	0	0	3	1	0	0	5	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	3.6	APPLY	APPLY
B-Tot	205	2	21	40	5	19	51	49	18	0	182	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	APPLY	3.65	APPLY	APPLY
72-C	16	0	1	3	3	0	5	4	0	0	15					3.3		
37-C	39	1	7	5	14	2	4	4	2	0	31					2.8		
10-C	68	0	4	9	2	2	24	18	9	0	64					4.0		
14-C	102	0	22	13	3	7	9	19	24	5	80					4.4		
75-C	262	24	98	29	9	2	42	52	6	0	140					3.7		
C-Tot	487	25	132	59	31	13	84	97	41	5	330					3.82		
Total	1180	32	269	205	54	64	238	232	80	6	879					3.57		

Summary and Conclusions

the source rather than merely taking the earlier version of Ellen White's comments on the life of Christ.

When we compare the statistics from the parallel evaluations for the 15 chapters of the DA text found on page 879 with the parallel evaluations from the pre-DA materials the greater dependency for the earlier texts is readily apparent. The 1,180 sentences of the pre-DA writings contained 80 sentences we evaluated as Verbatim while the 2,624 DA sentences yielded only 29 sentences in this category. The earlier writings produced 232 Strict Paraphrase sentences against 183 such sentences for over twice as many sentences for the DA text.

The greater degree of dependency for the earlier texts apparently comes from a direct use of the sources in the pre-DA text whereas the DA text is an edited text which for the most part has been compiled from various earlier materials. We found no clear indication of a different method of borrowing from literary sources in the later materials when compared against the earlier texts. We found verbatim and paraphrase passages in the later manuscripts as well as in the earlier manuscript and diary writings.

Question #12. How does the content of the dependent sentences compare with the content of the independent sentences? This question was set forth to direct our attention to the type of material taken from the sources. Did Ellen White mainly use sources to furnish historical and

Summary and Conclusions

geographical background information which she, having no formal education beyond the elementary level, would not have studied? Did the sources provide descriptive color not to be expected from the visions which would have given Ellen White the theological and spiritual content? Finally, would the visions have provided some "eye-witness" details not available to the ordinary writer commenting on the life of Christ?

Answer. Apart from chapters 13 and 56 which did not contain enough literary parallels to make such a comparison, we found no basic difference in the type of content between the dependent and independent sentences. One is not able to look at a sentence and confidently conclude on the basis of content that it is dependent or independent. Both types of sentences include descriptive, devotional, spiritual, theological, and moral exhortation.

The differences we noted were in the proportion of sentences, or the emphasis. Sources seem to be employed more often to provide background and descriptive comment than for devotional and evangelical comment. Chapter 72 provides an example of this different emphasis. One is more apt to find Ellen White's independent comment in the moralizing or theological commentary. Where the source might treat the Christian appeal in a sentence or two, Ellen White is more likely to have a paragraph or two. Where a source might only make a brief reference to the reaction of

Summary and Conclusions

heaven or the purposes of the evil one, Ellen White might develop several paragraphs on the topic. Chapters 75, 76, 83, and 84 are good examples of similar content but with differing degrees of stress.

We also found that where the source would be indefinite and suggestive Ellen White would often be positive and definite. Where the source might invoke the use of imagination and supposition or in other words make clear that it was not necessarily dealing with the real facts of the case, Ellen White's descriptive commentary reads like a work of history. The reader is not left imagining what happened but imagining what it must have been like to have lived back there and to have witnessed the events which happened as described.

Question #13. Is the literary or thematic structure of the chapters of the DA text dependent on the literary structures of the sources used in composing the DA text? What about the literary subunits of the chapter? Do they reflect the same thematic development as found in the subunits of the sources?

This question gets at the redaction or editing of the chapters of the DA text. A writer may borrow from another writer ideas of structure, thematic arrangement and development, chapter titles, and even pictures, in addition to using sentences from the writer's text. The question of dependency of the DA text is broadened in this question to

Summary and Conclusions

include source influence on arrangement of the DA chapter, either in terms of the whole chapter or with reference to its subsections.

Answer. To the question of source influence on the chapters as a complete composition we would answer that in most cases the DA text is independent. The DA often uses more than one source for each chapter and therefore the resulting arrangement is a construction involving multiple sources. That combination makes for a new composition developed by the editor or writer of the DA text. The structure of chapter 24 apparently comes from March who combined the two Nazareth visits into one event. This approach to the rejection of Jesus by His friends of Nazareth does not follow the biblical account nor the typical chronological outline usually found in the DA. The basic order of chapter 46 is Lukan but the elaborations on the lessons to be learned follows the outline of March. Chapter 76 combines the influences of three sources but the basic development of a character study of Judas and the episodes from his life which are used to sketch the inner life of Judas depend heavily on Edersheim and to some degree on Hanna.

Apart from chapters 10 and 13 we find there is definite dependence in the literary construction of the chapter subunits. The subunits of the DA text are often developed out of the individual manuscripts which made up the pre-DA

Summary and Conclusions

writings. Ellen White would use one source to write on a given unit of a particular story and then take another source to comment on a second part of the story. At other times she would write an article on one aspect of the life of Jesus using one source and later write a second article on the same aspect using a different source. In the DA text these earlier writings would be brought together and it would appear that Ellen White was mixing her sources in the writing of the DA chapter. Actually the mix was the result of combining earlier Ellen White materials which independently used different sources. Because of the different ways in which the earlier materials were written we have some subunits following the outline of a source and some sections combining sources. It is clear that in most cases Ellen White used one source in writing on a topic and in doing so she usually followed the thematic outline of the source. A good example of this can be found in her use of Hanna to add the section on the bestowal of the Holy Spirit to the account of the upper room encounters of Jesus with His disciples as given in chapter 84.

Question #14. Are the pre-DA texts dependent on sources for their thematic arrangement? In this question we raise question 13 for the content of the earlier writings. Here, however, we do not have to separate the chapter from its subunits. The pre-DA writings are for the most part manuscripts and articles on a given topic insofar as the

Summary and Conclusions

life of Christ is involved. At least they do not exist as chapters of a book, as is the DA text.

Answer. As indicated in the answer to question 13 above and also in our elaboration of question 14, the earlier writings do not always limit themselves to one source or to one topic on the life of Christ. Ellen White's original writings as found in her diary or journal entries seem to follow no particular theme. Often her comments will open with a theme but soon will become rather "free floating." No doubt her frequent interruptions contributed to this sense of disconnectedness found sometimes in her materials. Apparently she often put down her impressions as they came to mind and/or used sources as she came across ideas she valued. She had assistants who could piece together articles, and in some instances manuscripts, from these jottings.

The answers for question 14 on the summaries vary, therefore, according to the nature of the earlier texts. Where no prior source is used to any major extent, such as in chapters 56 and 72, the answer is no. Where the earlier texts follow the Scriptural outline as in chapter 37 the answer is also no. But where the earlier document stays on one of the topics found in one of our chapters, and where the earlier document limited itself to one source, Ellen White usually also followed the thematic development of the source. She did not dip into the source for an occasional

Summary and Conclusions

sentence. Her sentences usually reflect the ongoing sentence arrangement of the source though she may be more concise than the source in certain places and extend the comment far beyond the source in another instance. And finally, where the earlier texts are partly on the topic of the DA chapter and partly independent, following Scripture, or using more than one source, we must also answer "partly" or limit our "yes" to some sections only, rather than to the entire earlier document.

We have attempted a summary of the 14 summary questions which are rather specific in their concern. These questions helped us keep the research focused and kept our feet to the fire in gathering the data which would permit us to draw some general conclusions. Had we developed the questions after making a preliminary survey of the research on the 15 chapters perhaps some questions would have been presented in a different manner and other questions would have been added. At any rate these questions and their answers have brought us to the place where we are entitled to draw some conclusions from our study, conclusions which if not applicable to the entire text of The Desire of Ages at least are appropriate for the 15 chapters which have been the subject of this investigation.

Summary and Conclusions

GENERAL CONCLUSION

The conclusions which follow are limited to the scope of the research project as outlined in the Introduction, especially Part A. In view of the length of this study, many readers may be tempted to bypass the introduction and the analysis, choosing rather to check the "bottom line" only. In the interest of these readers a few words of background and caution may be in order. We suggest the readers consult the introduction of this study for a more complete treatment of these concerns.

It has not been possible to answer all the questions which have been raised in connection with Ellen White's use of sources. Our study has been limited to 15 chapters of the text of The Desire of Ages, which randomly selected chapters represent the whole text of 87 chapters. Our main interest has been to discover the nature and scope of literary borrowing in these 15 chapters

We have some idea of Mrs. White's dependency on sources when writing The Great Controversy. The latest editions of that work now list the sources of her quotations. Quite a few of her comments there refer to events of history. Many Adventists were not surprised to find that Ellen White used sources to provide historical background to visions that were usually limited to panoramic surveys of significant events in the history of the great controversy.

What intrigued even more Adventists was the question of

Summary and Conclusions

source dependency in Ellen White's devotional and theological writings, particularly in the Desire of Ages, no doubt the most popular Ellen White book among Seventh-day Adventists. For this reason, when time and research assistance did not permit the investigation of Ellen White's complete writings on the life of Christ, nor even the full text of The Desire of Ages, 15 chapters were selected at random from a list of the 87 chapters which had been ordered with respect to length of the text. Out of each three lists, the 29 longest chapters, the 29 middle-length, and 29 shortest, 5 chapters were randomly selected, and these three groups of 5 chapters furnished the 15 chapters for our investigation.

This study on the use of sources did not include an investigation into the origin of Mrs. White's ideas. While thoughts are expressed through words, the use of the words of another writer does not necessarily imply that the writer who furnished the words also provided the thoughts. Any number of writers can express the same thought in different verbal expressions, as a comparative study of the numerous "lives" of Christ clearly shows. In order to evaluate the dependency of Ellen White's thoughts on the ideas of others, we would have to examine her works in terms of the ideas they express, and we would also have to study the writings and sermons of her associates who would have had the opportunity to influence her thinking, as well as an almost

Summary and Conclusions

unlimited number of works of contemporary authors who were not a part of Ellen White's circle of acquaintances.

Another question not addressed in this source study is the issue as to whether Mrs. White used sources in recounting her visions or in her comments following her "I was shown" statements. In the 15 chapters of this project there is no mention of "vision" as a source. Apart from the earliest account in Spiritual Gifts, which to our knowledge is not dependent on sources when covering the episodes in the life of Christ corresponding to the 15 chapters of the DA text we reviewed, the expression "I was shown" is not used.

During the last six years many individuals have raised the question of Ellen White's inspiration and prophetic role. It is clear that for some the use of sources is incompatible with their understanding of prophetic ministry. This project was never designed to cover that theological and doctrinal question. For those readers who may be interested in the writer's position, particularly after he has completed the research project, a personal postscript follows this conclusion.

In the foregoing summary was presented compiled data and the summary of the conclusions to 14 questions addressed to each of the 15 chapters. These 14 questions were developed to assist us in our analysis of the 15 chapters. It was our hope that by applying the same set of

Summary and Conclusions

questions to the study of each chapter we could achieve a higher degree of consistency in our investigation of diverse chapter content.

The conclusions which follow will consist of a series of numbered statements based upon the questions posed in the introduction to our study. There is no intended correspondence between the numbers of the statements of conclusions and the numbers relative to the summary questions addressed to each chapter. Usually these statements and the questions to which they speak are more broad in nature than the more specific analytical questions of the individual chapter summaries and the general summary above. At this juncture of our study we are interested in the general issues raised by those who sponsored the research project. Each statement, however, will be followed by supporting arguments based upon the evidence generated by the research and summarized earlier in this chapter.

This study is only one investigation into Ellen White's use of sources. Other efforts have been undertaken, and no doubt still more research on this issue will be made in the future. As with most research projects, the process of drawing conclusions on certain questions also raised additional issues which call for further study. To assist the church and its leaders and students in this ongoing study of Ellen White's writings, we will include several ideas for future projects as part of the conclusion. These

Summary and Conclusions

problems will be listed in conjunction with the statement and/or evidence which has given rise to the suggestion in each case.

These suggestions for further research are not listed to lessen the impact of this study in any way. They are not offered to dilute the reasonableness of the arguments or to suggest that this research project is incomplete and therefore its conclusions are invalid. And they are definitely not set forth to frustrate the efforts one might face in coming to terms with Ellen White's use of sources or to add confusion to our understanding of Ellen White as a writer.

Before turning to the statements of conclusion a final word of caution seems appropriate.

The fundamental purpose of this project was to attempt a careful and thorough study of Ellen White as a writer, noting particularly how and to what extent she used literary sources in her writings on the life of Christ. Such a study demanded that I set forth the evidence as I found it, and that I admit what can be fairly concluded from that evidence and to indicate, furthermore, what still remains to be either studied, clarified, or solved. I have gone to great lengths to place the evidence and my analysis of that evidence before the reader. Obviously there is room, at least on certain points, for one to come to different conclusions. Hopefully those who may find serious cause for

Summary and Conclusions

disagreement with the following conclusions will also do the church, fellow students of Ellen White, and myself the favor of suggesting their own viewpoints and how they arrived at their differing positions.

The conclusions which follow reflect the results of the entire research endeavor, not merely the answers given to the 14 questions summarized above. My summations involve interpretation of data, and subjectivity cannot be avoided. I have tried, however, to separate my opinion from what I think the evidence indicates to be a fact.

I have attempted to set forth the five statements of conclusion in as concise a manner as accuracy would allow. To properly understand the meaning and limits of the following statements, the accompanying explanatory material and supporting arguments should be carefully studied.

1. Ellen White used literary sources when writing The Desire of Ages.

As it stands this statement does not appear to say anything new. We knew the factuality of this claim before this project was ever undertaken. This basic conclusion is important, nevertheless, especially for what it does not say. In the first place it should be clearly noted that Ellen White, not her literary assistants, did the literary borrowing. My purpose is not to claim that her secretaries did not borrow. Their work was not the major focus of this study. We may someday find evidence that they also composed

Summary and Conclusions

portions of the text on behalf of Ellen White and in so doing utilized the works of others without giving credit to their sources. What I intend to say with this statement is that there is clear evidence from Ellen White's personal handwriting that she herself composed textual materials on the life and Christ and that these handwritten materials noticeably show that she took literary expressions from the works of other authors without giving them credit as her sources.¹

Few of these comments for which we have the handwritten text are to be found in the DA text in their original form, whether written in 1884 or in 1897. Marian Davis as Ellen White's "bookmaker" had the freedom both to reconstruct the text of Ellen White, selecting from the various articles, manuscripts, diary journal notes, and the earlier published Spirit of Prophecy, volumes II and III, and to edit the text of the DA. But there seems to be no compelling reason to lay the responsibility for the construction of the basic textual content and the use of literary sources involved in its composition on the shoulders of Marian Davis or any other of Ellen White's literary assistants.

¹I found no evidence to support Alice Gregg's claim that "Marian herself was clearly searching, studying, and selecting pertinent material not from Ellen's scrapbooks alone but from the works of other religious writers (Alfred Edersheim, William Hanna, John Harris, Daniel March, Henry Melvill, to name some) . . ." (Alice Gregg, "Marian the 'Bookmaker,' Adventist Currents, February, 1984, p. 23.)

Summary and Conclusions

Secondly, it should be noted that this conclusion is not qualified by such expressions as "minimal borrowing," "wholesale borrowing," or some percentage estimate. All such qualifiers are in the first place relative and imprecise terms. Individuals who use these terms are often understood as either dismissing the fact of Ellen White's use of sources or stressing the unusual amount of borrowing. The effect of their approach, on the one hand, is that the hearer gets the impression that sources played an insignificant role in Ellen White's writings and for all practical purposes one can dismiss the issue of sources, and that her writings were basically independent of source influence. Albeit, on the other hand, when one speaks of "large-scale borrowing" the impression is left that Ellen White's work is no more than a compilation of the writings of others apart from a few connecting expressions.

The research indicates that Ellen White at times felt free to take verbatim expressions from the writings of others but that for the most part she paraphrased her sources. Generally the closer one is able to move back through the textual tradition to Ellen White's own hand, the greater is the degree of literary dependency. By the time Marian Davis is reworking the writings of Ellen White for the DA text the literary dependency is much less apparent. Since the basis of our comparison was the literary expression, once we determined Marian Davis had modified the

Summary and Conclusions

literary form we no longer could claim we were necessarily working with Ellen White's literary hand. For this reason it would not have been a fair assessment had we limited the evaluation of Ellen White's use of sources to the analysis of the DA text. At the same time, the analysis of the earlier writings of Ellen White was only partial. We looked mainly at the material exhibiting some dependency, and only recorded the sentences which showed greater dependence than those of the DA text. We gave scant attention to sentences which appeared to have literary independence. Therefore even though the dependency rate of the earlier texts is generally greater than the rate found for the DA text, I would not be making a fair evaluation of Ellen White's dependency to overemphasize the greater frequency of the verbatim expressions noted in the earlier materials. Many sentences exhibited the same dependency as the DA text and for that reason were omitted from the text presentation.

My findings point to the need for further study if we want to establish more precisely the degree of literary dependency for Ellen White's writings. One such investigation might well take a serious look at Ellen White's handwritten materials or at typewritten texts which are known to represent Ellen White's work and are unedited apart from obvious spelling and punctuation corrections. Each Ellen White text should be treated as a whole and fully evaluated for both dependency and independency. The texts

Summary and Conclusions

could be identified as to content and then their evaluations of dependency/non-dependency compared. Then and only then, would we be in a position to establish a general dependency level for Ellen White's writings. Once such a study of several independent documents and published articles has been made, a second inquiry could be launched comparing Ellen White's use of sources with that of her contemporaries. This comparative analysis would enable us to make a fair statement regarding charges that Ellen White was guilty of plagiarism.¹

A very serious question that still remains regarding Ellen White's use of sources is the concern over her non-admission or even denial of dependency, whether implicit or explicit. How do we square her statements, and similar

¹The report of Attorney Vincent L. Ramik of the law firm of Diller, Ramik and Wight of Washington, D.C., August 14, 1981, concluded that "Ellen G. White was not a plagiarist and her works did not constitute copyright infringement/privacy." (pp. 26, 27). This conclusion was based upon a review of the literary dependency found in The Great Controversy, The Desire of Ages, and Sketches From the Life of Paul. Furthermore, Mr. Ramik was concerned with copyright infringement and with the legality of Ellen White's literary borrowing. (See the ADVENTIST REVIEW, Sept. 17, 1981, for more complete statement on the Ramik study.) Legal questions have their place but there are also ethical considerations of honesty and integrity. These issues relate not only to Ellen White and her published books but also to her manuscripts and articles which she published and which others have later published in her name. The plagiarism question has to be studied in terms of the literary conventions of her time and place and must include her writings in their unpublished as well as published form. Now that we know more about her use of sources in the production of her manuscripts, the ethical questions must also be addressed to those who publish her writings in compilations or in separate journal articles.

Summary and Conclusions

ones made by her associates, with the textual evidence?¹ Any attempt to address this problem of incongruency should include a serious study of Ellen White's self-understanding of inspiration and her prophetic role in the context of nineteenth century views on inspiration, especially within Adventism.

The investigation also suggests that it would be helpful to take an in-depth look at the work of Ellen White's literary helpers. One might make a comparison of Ellen White's description of their work with the statements of the assistants and with the evidence we have of how they modified Ellen White's manuscripts. It might even prove useful to make a stylistic comparison between Ellen White and her assistants, particularly Marian Davis. Such a study might help us in our efforts to give proper credit to both Ellen White and Marian Davis for the production of The Desire of Ages.

2. The content of Ellen White's commentary on the life and ministry of Christ, The Desire of Ages, is for the most part derived rather than original.

This conclusion, as it reads, might appear to some readers as being unwarranted, even unjustified by the evidence, and rather demeaning. Hopefully, as further discussion is provided, it will be understood to be an

¹Cf. Introduction, Part A, pages 30, 31, and Part B, pages 139, 140, and 147-150.

Summary and Conclusions

accurate and concise statement of a fair judgment.

In an ultimate spiritual sense Ellen White has always insisted that her works were derivative. Both Spiritual Gifts, where she first comments on the life of Christ, and the later extended commentary on the great controversy, Spirit of Prophecy, open with an introductory chapter on the gift of prophecy. Ellen White, her publishers, and her readers in the Adventist Church viewed her writings as stemming from her prophetic role as a messenger of God. Her first words in her earliest treatment of the life of Christ are, "Then I was carried down to the time when Jesus was to take upon himself man's nature," In the paragraphs following we read such expressions as "I was pointed down to the last days"; "I saw"; "I was then shown"; "I then viewed Jesus in the garden . . . "; and "I was informed." The most frequent expression is "I saw."¹ The fact that Spirit of Prophecy omitted these expressions is no indication that she or Adventists had changed their positions.²

It is clear from these passages and from her statements on the nature of her writings that Ellen White understood the content of her writings to have been derived from the Lord. The following statement specifically refers to her testimonies, even though Ellen White viewed the origin of all her messages from God as equally inspired.

¹Spiritual Gifts, Vol. I, pp. 28-79.

²There are a few exceptions. For an example note "I was then carried back to the creation, and was shown. . . ," Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. I, p. 85.

Summary and Conclusions

You know how the Lord has manifested Himself through the spirit of prophecy. Past, present, and future have passed before me. . . . I have been aroused from my sleep with a vivid sense of subjects previously presented to my mind; and I have written, at midnight, letters that have gone across the continent. . . .¹

Ellen White's claim for the heavenly origin of her content is at the crux of the source problem. In the course of our research many have asked the question, "How are we to understand what she meant by such expressions when it is so obvious that she used contemporary sources written by authors who did not claim such heavenly origins for their work?"²

The DA text may be viewed as derived in a second sense. The basic source of information is the Bible, particularly the Gospels. A footnote at the beginning of nearly every chapter gives the passages of Scripture that the "chapter is based on." In view of the general readership anticipated for the DA, every attempt was made to omit those elements which are not discussed in Scripture.

Since these books are sent out without explanation as to the authority by which the author speaks, it was thought best to avoid, as far as we could, statements for which the Bible seems to furnish no proof, or which to the ordinary reader appear to contradict the Bible. . . .³

¹Testimonies for the Church, Vol. 5, pp. 64, 65.

²This question is not a part of this study. The office of the Ellen G. White Estate has a number of helpful monographs on this subject. Several publications by the Ellen G. White Estate have been listed in the introduction and in the bibliography of this report.

³Marian Davis to J. E. White, Dec. 22, 1895. (Cited in "The Desire of Ages," Ellen G. White Estate Document, May 23, 1979, p. 30.)

Summary and Conclusions

With respect to the Scriptures, Ellen White is no more or less derivative than are a number of the writers from whom she borrowed. I shall have more to say about the content and style of Ellen White's literary sources.

The most obvious meaning of this second conclusion, however, clearly suggests that the content of these chapters of the DA text does not provide insights and information not already available in earlier commentaries on the life of Christ. The statement should not be read as a denial that Ellen White received, by divine inspiration, the same ideas that she found in the sources she used, and therefore only used the literary sources for what they could provide as a way to express these ideas. Without a record of the content of her impressions and/or visions in the night seasons or at other times there is no way to verify or to falsify that claim. The point of the conclusion relates to the often raised question, "What is unique or different about the content of Ellen White's commentary from that of the sources to which she obviously referred?" A similar question asks: "What difference do you note between the content of an independent sentence and that of a dependent sentence?"

As indicated in the introduction to this report, at the outset of this project we already knew that the DA contained literary parallels from the works of William Hanna, Daniel March, John Harris, Frederic Farrar, and possibly Alfred Edersheim and several others. We did not know the extent these authors were represented in the DA nor how many others

Summary and Conclusions

might have contributed to its content. The search for possible sources led us to over 500 works, most of which were on the life of Christ. We found literary parallels to the 15 selected chapters of the DA text in 32 works by 28 authors, though we found similar content in many more "lives" of Christ. Of the 15 chapters only one, chapter 56, was found to be virtually without a single parallel. Chapter 13 contained 8 parallels (second least found) if we discount pre-DA materials on the same content.

We have emphasized all along that the project was primarily directed toward literary rather than content analysis. Even so it is not possible to separate entirely the questions of form from those of content. Indeed, as several of the summary questions clearly indicate, we have dealt with content, albeit not in depth or conclusively. So while we found a good number of literary parallels between the comments of Ellen White and those of her sources, particularly in the earlier materials, the resemblance between the DA text and the source texts is all the more striking when one looks at the content. While Ellen White was often given credit for independent literary construction when the thoughts being expressed were basically the same as those of the authors she was obviously using, we also noted a larger degree of agreement between the sources themselves on the level of content than in terms of literary expression.

It is very possible that by not concentrating on the

Summary and Conclusions

content alone we missed some significant differences in content between the DA and the sources we know she used. On the other hand, were we to treat the question of content seriously, we would have to add many texts to our survey, including the writings of Ellen White's contemporaries in Adventism.

We did not find much similarity between the content of chapter 56, "Blessing the Children," and the lives of Christ we surveyed. There are many valuable insights in this chapter on motherhood, fatherhood, and the family. It may be that here we have some unique content. But at least three factors argue against using the content of this chapter to establish the original nature of Ellen White's commentary on the life of Christ--the special nature of the subject material, the fact that this chapter is the second shortest chapter of the 15, and our inability for want of time to search the literature which would most likely have covered the topic of family and parental attitudes toward children. We did, however, credit the literary composition of chapter 56 to Ellen White's independence.

In the summary we pointed out that 61.4 percent of the individual sentences were rated independent, and 31.4 percent involved literary dependency at the paraphrase level. On the basis of these figures it might be assumed that conclusion statement number two is invalid. But when you add to the literary dependence the similarity of ideas, particularly with reference to the events in the life of

Summary and Conclusions

Jesus, and the way in which the arrangement of the subunits of the chapters reflect the same thematic development as found in the sources, it becomes apparent that Ellen White is more dependent on her sources than the actual verbal parallels indicate. The nature and extent of Ellen White's literary dependency is also discussed under conclusion statement four below. It is of course very possible that a more careful scrutiny of the text would reveal additional subtle differences than at first meet the eye.

The practical intention of this conclusion is to declare that one is not able to recognize any general category of content or catalog of ideas that are unique to Ellen White's comments in the DA text. We found source parallels in the theological, devotional, narrative, descriptive, and spiritual comments of Ellen White. The larger literary units, or what might be called the subunits of the chapter, were also in most instances constructed in a sequence of thought development very similar to that of another writer. Thus it is not only the content of the individual sentence that on the surface is not identifiable as unique to Ellen White. The structural arrangement of the sentences in certain and/or specific chapter divisions quite typically follows that of the respective source supplying some of the literary expressions.

Even though Marian Davis, and evidently also Ellen White, intended to omit items "for which the Bible seems to furnish no proof," a number of such statements were included

Summary and Conclusions

in the DA text. In these obviously extrabiblical materials we also found literary parallels.

The references to the inner thoughts of Jesus, to the visit of the disciple John to Jesus during the forty days of temptation in the wilderness, to the details of Jesus' interview with the two disciples on the road to Emmaus, His visit in their home, and the presence of their invisible Companion on their return to Jerusalem, all of which are not mentioned in Scripture, clearly reveal the influence of other writers. One cannot on the face of a given statement, regardless of the nature of its content, conclude that a similar statement reflecting the same basic thought cannot be found in an earlier source. A detail not found in the biblical text may not with certainty be attributed to Ellen White's visions or special insights of the Holy Spirit. Most of these details noted in the DA text were also found in the literature available to Ellen White. The one item we did not locate in any other writer we reviewed was the way in which Jesus entered the upper room after His resurrection. Only Ellen White described Jesus as invisibly entering at the time the two disciples gained entrance. It is very possible that we missed other isolated unique features of the DA text, but the evidence points to such special information as being the exception rather than the rule.

Before turning to the next conclusion, which attempts to address the special character of the Ellen White text, I

Summary and Conclusions

would note some suggestions for further study. It is clear from our limited study of the content of the DA text that serious attention should be given to the thought of Ellen White. How do her writings and the basic thoughts they express compare with her 19th century contemporaries? What special theological or practical spiritual insights are unique to the writings of Ellen White? It is regrettable that we were not able to include in our study the two additional books Ellen White wrote on the ministry of Christ. Possibly the distinctive character of Ellen White's content is more obvious in such books as Christ's Object Lessons and Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing.

There is also the matter of the content of Ellen White's visions on the life of Christ. We have mentioned above how her earliest treatment of the life of Christ as found in Spiritual Gifts includes such comments as "I was shown," "I saw," and "I was carried down." What follows, however, is almost a paraphrase of the biblical text. We do not have nearly the amount of detail and commentary on the text or incident in the life of Jesus that we find in these later works which omit the references to vision. Does Ellen White leave us any record of what she saw and when, so that we may be able to identify the nature of the content of the visions independent of her commentary on the life of Christ which exhibits the use of sources? Can we show from a record of her visions that Ellen Wite had the content

Summary and Conclusions

generally in mind prior to their expression in a document which reveals literary dependency?

The writings of Ellen White on the life of Christ are replete with expressions reflecting her confidence in the leading of the Holy Spirit. Her references to being aroused in the night seasons and to being impressed to write do not always include comment on a vision. Perhaps we need to look at the total picture. Are all her "revelatory" experiences to be accounted for by her "visions"? What did Ellen White mean when she spoke of "visions"? And what was the role of these visions in the overall prophetic experience of Ellen White?

Finally, regarding content, how do Ellen White's writings compare among themselves when viewed in chronological sequence? There appears to be a development or contrast in her writings over a period of time. If this clearly is the case, what is the nature of that development or difference? To what influences can such contrasts be attributed? We did notice that her comments on a given topic prior to 1888 differed to some degree in later years but we did not notice such a pattern apart from a general expansion of her comments. Actually much of her earlier remarks were carried over into the later DA text.

3. The special character of Ellen White's commentary is to be found in its practical use of Scripture and in its stress on spiritual realities and personal devotion.

The previous conclusion that Ellen White's writings,

Summary and Conclusions

that is to say the 15 chapters of the DA, are for the most part derivative rather than original should not be understood as denying to these writings any originality, or as suggesting that Ellen White was slavishly dependent upon literary sources in writing down her thoughts. Even though at times she deeply recognized her lack of education and literary ability and depended to a great extent on her literary assistants, it is clear from her diaries that she could write and knew how to express her thoughts. Though she was not strong physically and had only minimal formal education, she was a person of great natural intelligence and through the years became widely read. Also she was a speaker of some renown. Over and over she demonstrates that she was able to take the essence of the source commentary and adapt it to her purposes.

The net result is that while the basic content of her thoughts can also usually be found in the sources she used, the finished product of her own hand (and/or that of her literary helpers) bore a special Ellen White character, flavor, or perhaps some would say "style." And while I think we must credit Marian Davis with the final drafting of the chapters, most of what I wish to say about the genius of Ellen White's own work can also be legitimately applied to her manuscripts and journal notations. The writings clearly demonstrate her ability to recognize the better literary construction of her helpers and of the sources from which she borrowed.

Summary and Conclusions

This is not to say that at times she did not have great difficulty expressing herself. There are some passages in her original handwritten manuscripts which defy one's best efforts to understand them. Other portions are poorly composed. But typically her writings are readable and easily understood. To prepare them for publication usually required that they be finessed in matters of syntax, spelling, and punctuation. Having read most of her handwritten materials I feel sure that anyone aware of Ellen White's limited formal education would be surprised at the high level of readability, the clarity, and the literary force her original writings exhibit. Nevertheless, perhaps we should credit Marian Davis with the literary style and construction of the final DA text insofar as the beauty and clarity of expression, the syntactical, structural composition of the sentences, and the arrangement of the chapter content.

The point of this conclusion is to recognize Ellen White's role in her writings and to note what there is about these writings that "stamp" them as Ellen White's work. What is it that identifies them as hers apart from their literary style which in part is to be attributed to Marian Davis? I would argue that not one but several features together give Ellen White's writings their peculiar character.

In the first place Ellen White appears to approach Scriptures from a practical point of view. She does not

Summary and Conclusions

attempt to approach them theologically or as a scholar, i.e., as a trained exegete. She takes their obvious, almost literal meaning and is not disturbed when Marian Davis or another suggests changes in order to bring her writings into harmony with the text of Scripture. And when the source she is consulting tries at length to harmonize the Gospel accounts or attempts to handle another technical problem, Ellen White blithely skips over these concerns and chooses one Gospel position, takes a solution one of the sources has worked out, or arranges the basic elements of the various accounts into a harmony which appeals to her, and moves on with her narrative as if there is no problem.

Another distinct character of Ellen White's work on the the life of Christ is the stress given to what for lack of a better term I have labeled "spiritual realities." Though not every chapter lends itself to this emphasis, often when a source makes a fleeting reference to God's activity or point of view, to the angels of heaven and their feelings, point of view or activity, or to Satan and his angels and their desires or activities, the DA text will go to some length in developing the theme. Ellen White seems to have had a great interest in the "other world," in the invisible and real world of the spiritual beings of the universe. When the text lent itself to speak of the great controversy between Christ and Satan, sometimes expressed in the sources as between God and Satan, Ellen White usually extends the

Summary and Conclusions

discussion beyond that of the source.

Ellen White's concern over "reality" may also be noted in the lack of supposition and probability in her statements. When in reference to the life of Christ, His viewpoint, or that of His disciples, the source uses such expressions as "we can well imagine," "it may be supposed," or "no doubt," Ellen White will use a positive expression. Something did or did not happen. Somebody said or thought or did not say or think a given word or thought. Ellen White does not comment on all aspects of a given topic or event but what she does treat is handled with a reporter's style. That is to say her account reads as a factual record; nothing is supposed. Ellen White writes as if she is dealing with realities, whether on earth or beyond the world we see. The reader is not left to imagine anything except what it would have been like to have been in Palestine in the time of Jesus and to have faced the realities she is describing.

A more subtle way in which Ellen White stressed "spiritual realities" was in her use of illustrations and language. She refused to use pictures which in her judgment would distort a realistic portrayal.¹ Ellen white was also very careful not to be carried away in the attempt to

¹In a letter "To Those in Responsible Positions in our Publishing Houses" she wrote the following note on January 9, 1897: "I am troubled in regard to the use of pictures in our publications. Some of our papers seem bent on using them in season and out of season. And some of the cuts used

Summary and Conclusions

present a literary text. Whenever her sources used hyperbolic statements, embellished the text with obvious literary expressions, or left the main point to develop some interesting sidelight or curiosity, Ellen White bypassed their comment and stayed with the main storyline and with the essential elements of the background and characterizations. The reader of the DA is hardly ever conscious of the text itself or impressed with the literary skill of the author. One is caught up with the narrative and its meaning and appeal. This cannot always be said of the sources she used.

Finally, the fingerprint of Ellen White may be found in the devotional, moral, or Christian appeals or lessons which may be expected anywhere in the chapter, but are often placed at the end. We find such entreaty and moralizing in Hanna and in March, as well as in other sources reflected in the text of DA, but nowhere to the extent found in Ellen

are very inferior, and poorly illustrate the subjects represented." Speaking of the illustrations selected by the publishers for Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing she calls them "miserable representations" that "do such injustice to the subject."

The cuts in Gospel Reader also displeased Ellen White. She objected to a picture of Moses which "is not in any sense a correct representation of Moses. It looks more like a picture of the great deceiver, Satan, after he had lost paradise." The illustration of the cherubim on the ark was unacceptable on two counts. The heavenly angels were such that "a child might take the representation as a bird hunched up." But perhaps the most important reason for Ellen White's objection was because "the sacred ark, which represented Jehovah amid his people, was always covered, that no curious eye might look upon it. Let it ever be covered." (EGW Letter 28a, 1897).

Summary and Conclusions

White's text. It would seem that Ellen White is quite aware of her stress on the moral lessons to be learned from the teachings of Christ and of one's need to respond in faith and obedience to God. In one of her letters to her children Ellen White makes reference to Marian Davis' suggestions on improving some articles, and she writes, "I think I can make the articles specified more full, and as I am famous for moralizing, this will be no cross."¹ We should not forget that Ellen White's main objective for revising her earlier work on the life of Christ was to prepare a work to be sold by colporteurs in the interest of bringing people to Jesus Christ.

The sections of the narrative where the work of God, of the angels, or of Satan and his angels, are described; where the great controversy motif is discussed; and passages where moralizing or devotional appeals occur are more likely to contain Ellen White's independent comment than the narrative, historical, or biblical portions of the text. Having said this we should not conclude that Ellen White did not use sources in writing on such topics, or that her thoughts in these areas are different from what may be found in other writers of the period. The general theme of Ellen White's remarks will usually be found in one of the sources. But the way the theme is developed, its length, and its placement in the chapter's context, are generally unique to Ellen White.

¹EGW Letter W-38-1885.

Summary and Conclusions

The fact that we often found independent material in Ellen White's devotional or moralizing commentary may also be due to our inability to review contemporary sermons and devotional works. For example, there is great similarity between the devotional comments of Ellen White in Steps to Christ and the thoughts of Andrew Murray, a famous 19th century preacher. A number of people suggested that our research include these devotional writers in our search for literary parallels. To have gone this route would have led us into a whole new type of literature including the study of sermons.¹

Even though I would argue that Ellen White's independent sentences are more likely to be found in the sections where these types of content appear, it should not be taken for granted that any one sentence of this nature is strictly original with Ellen White. While her literary sources do not stress these concerns to the extent she does, they do make similar comments, and therefore one cannot be certain that a given sentence in Ellen White is not to some degree reflecting a literary source parallel.

In my judgment the notice of special doctrinal issues in presenting the life and teachings of Jesus would be characteristic of any Adventist writer and would not

¹We made a few cursory attempts to locate literary parallels in several books of sermons and in a number of works by Andrew Murray, but found little to encourage our continued efforts in view of our time constraints.

Summary and Conclusions

identify the commentary as the work of Ellen White. It would be natural for any Adventist to stress the place of the Sabbath and the doctrine of the nonimmortality of the soul in the teachings and practice of Jesus.

I am convinced that the evidence provided by the larger context, the chapter as compared to a given sentence or literary subunit, gives some definition for identifying the special characteristics of Ellen White's comments on the life of Christ. Ellen White makes a contribution in her own right. There is no question that she used sources but she was selective. She evidently was governed by her own purposes and priorities. The sources were her slaves, never her masters.

To deny her indebtedness to literary sources or to underplay their influence would in my judgment not be a fair assessment of the evidence, as I tried to point out under the second conclusion. But to stress the literary borrowing to such an extent that Ellen White's special contributions as a writer and as a messenger, for the content she wished to communicate, are severely downplayed or denied, is also in my opinion an inaccurate evaluation of the evidence.

This is not to say there are no further problems to consider in respect to Ellen White's use of sources, particularly in regard to their influence on the content of her writings. We need further study to bring into sharper definition how Ellen White's comments differ from or reflect

Summary and Conclusions

those of her sources. The comparative studies should also be extended to cover devotional and theological content. The theologians in the church will want to study the implications of Ellen White's use of sources on the church's claim for her inspiration. Of course, as we mentioned earlier, such an investigation must also somewhere along the line treat the charges that Ellen White denied she engaged in the kind of literary borrowing this study and others indicate took place.

No doubt a thorough look at Ellen White's use of Scripture would also prove helpful. What role do the Scriptures play in the DA text? Is there more than one way to approach Scripture? Should we always be concerned with the academic or scholarly issues? If not always, do the technical problems of Scripture at some point have a legitimate place in the life of the church? Should Ellen White's writings control Adventist interpretation of Scripture?

4. Ellen White used a minimum of 23 sources of various types of literature, including fiction, in her writings on the life of Christ.

Earlier in our summary statement we mentioned that 28 writers and 32 sources were used in composing the 15 chapters of the DA on the life of Christ. These figures include the sources for the pre-DA text. In this conclusion I am taking a more conservative stance since several of the sources listed in the summary provided only one or two

Summary and Conclusions

parallels according to my reckoning. The total of 23 sources includes only those books which have furnished at least 5 parallels for a given chapter.

Our concern here is not to minimize the number of sources Ellen White used in writing on the life of Christ. For if our conclusion is correct that Ellen White often concentrated her use of a particular source in a specific chapter, it is quite reasonable to project that in the 62 remaining chapters of the DA and in the two books on the life and teachings of Christ not reviewed, i.e., Mount of Blessing and Christ's Object Lessons, she used several additional sources.¹ At the same time one would not be justified in concluding that based on this average of one and one-half sources per chapter reviewed we can expect to find Ellen White used about 130 literary works in producing the 87 chapters of DA.

The point of this conclusion is not to set forth the degree of Ellen White's dependency, though some statistics have been included below. The issue here is the nature of the sources and how they influenced the DA text.

William Hanna's work on the life of Christ was used in the writing of 13 of the 15 chapters. Two books by Daniel March were used in 4 chapters, and John Harris was clearly used in another two chapters. The other sources are concentrated each largely in one chapter respectively. Just

¹For example, Charles Beecher's Redeemer and Redeemed (Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1864), p. 65, is quoted in DA, p. 25.

Summary and Conclusions

how Ellen White went about choosing her sources and selecting which ones to use for any given chapter is a matter of conjecture. It is not difficult to imagine that Hanna's life of Christ would have been particularly attractive to Ellen White given her purposes in writing DA. According to Daniel Pals, "Hanna designed his work along practical and devotional lines."¹ Hanna had taken a trip to Palestine in an effort to capture the local color, geography, and setting for his portrayal of the life of Jesus. His earliest writings on the life of Christ were developed from his Edinburgh sermons and he had a special ability to mix "antiquarian romance and solid theological orthodoxy."² All of this, the historical realism, the devotional emphasis, the orthodox viewpoints on the divinity of Christ, and the trustworthiness of the Gospel accounts, would have provided Ellen White with an ideal source.

It is rather unlikely that Ellen White would have fortuitously chosen a particular work to use for every chapter. It is perhaps unrealistic to hold that Ellen White would have reviewed source after source looking for the right one to use in commenting on the topic at hand. Judging from the way her journals read it is more likely that Ellen White reviewed these and other unknown sources

¹Daniel L. Pals, The Victorian "Lives" of Jesus (San Antonio, Texas: Trinity University Press, 1982), p. 69.

²Ibid., pp. 70, 71.

Summary and Conclusions

The sources represented in the text of DA that we surveyed are not all of the same literary genre. Most of the works referred to were lives of Christ. The writings of Bennett, Hanna, Edersheim, Farrar, Fleetwood, Geikie, and Jones fall into this popular category. Samuel Andrews' life of Christ was apparently used to establish the chronology of the narrative of The Desire of Ages. Andrews included in his work a harmony of the Gospels which was used by many writers of the period. A brief biographical sketch of the authors of the major works used in the DA text reviewed in this study appears in Appendix E of this report.

In addition to these "lives" of Jesus, Ellen White used a devotional work by J. R. Miller, Bible Lessons by George Pentecost, sermons by Henry Melvill, a Gospel commentary by John Cumming, essays on selected themes relevant to viewing Jesus as The Great Teacher taken from the Gospels by John Harris, essays on the the glory of Jesus as revealed in the prophetic expectations of the Old Testament, in the incarnation, in the resurrection, and in His ascension by Octavius Winslow (The Glory of the Redeemer in His Person and Work), and two books by Daniel March which focus on the places Jesus visited (Walks and Homes of Jesus) or on episodes recounted in Scripture which happened at night (Night Scenes of the Bible).

Perhaps the most interesting work from the point of view, style and genre, was the work by J. H. Ingraham.

Summary and Conclusions

His work falls into a popular category. The typical "lives" of the mid-19th century combined history, geography, and imagination in what may be called a "historical romance." These works do not even merit a mention in Albert Schweitzer's The Quest of the Historical Jesus.¹

Ingraham wrote his life of Jesus to prove the divinity of Christ. The scenes are "narrated as if by an eye-witness of them" and therefore the work is obviously fictional. The entire work is cast in the form of a collection of letters written by the daughter of a wealthy Jew living in Egypt who resides in Palestine during the time of Jesus' ministry.² Schweitzer refers to Ingraham's work, which had appeared in German translation, as one of the "'edifying' romances on the life of Jesus intended for family reading."³

Ellen White evidently read extensively in literature of her times. She found useful material in both fictional and non-fictional works as well as in works of differing literary type, theological perspective, and scholarly depth. This conclusion is supported by the evidence of this investigation and is corroborated by the contents of her personal libraries at Elmshaven, near St. Helena, California, her last home.⁴

¹Albert Schweitzer, The Quest of the Historical Jesus, translated by W. Montgomery from Von Reimarus zu Wrede, 1910 (London: A. & C. Black, Ltd., 1910). It is possible that Schweitzer limited his review to works which were available to him in the German language.

²Ingraham, op. cit., pp. ix, x. (See text, p. 551.)

³Schweitzer, op. cit., p. 328, note 1.

⁴See Introduction, Part A, p. 57.

Summary and Conclusions

Ellen White used these "lives" of Christ in various ways. So when it comes to the extent of literary dependency we must speak of various types and degrees. Dependence is evident in the use of chapter titles, in the arrangement of the literary subunits of the chapters, and in the formation of individual sentences. In the subunits of the chapter and at times in the sequence of several subunits the DA commentary will often follow the narrative development of the source. The overall arrangement of the chapter, however, will usually follow Ellen White's or Marian Davis' independent construction. At times one can trace the similarity of compositional arrangement between the DA and a source to the Bible narrative which undergirds both accounts.

The compilation method of composing the DA text from multiple sources and from earlier Ellen White materials may have had some bearing on the duplication of content materials within the same chapter. This system of working for the most part with the revision of earlier texts evidently contributed to the enlarged DA text and to the necessity of bringing out two additional volumes, Christ's Object Lessons and Mount of Blessing, to complete the commentary on the life of Christ. I found no evidence that the larger coverage was due to a greater use of the sources. The longer chapters and/or the additional chapters in the DA text may easily be accounted for on the basis of a larger treatment of the life of Christ. More incidents are

Summary and Conclusions

included in the narrative, and Ellen White had written on many of these topics in journal articles produced after Volumes II and III of The Spirit of Prophecy, the earlier work upon which the DA text is based. The net effect of using this compilation technique often demanded that the resulting accumulation of material be reduced to manageable length for publication.

The degree of dependency registered for independent sentence units averaged out at the "Loose Paraphrase" level. The 2,624 sentences of the DA text included 1,612 "Strict Independence" sentences and 823 dependent sentences of various types. "Verbatim" was the evaluation for 29 of these dependent sentences. The pre-DA writings contained a greater ratio of verbatim sentences, 80 out of 1,180. I found it quite typical for the earlier writings and the later individual manuscripts of Ellen White's to exhibit a greater degree of literary dependency than the DA text. Once the various streams flow together to form the river of the DA text the original compositional form is no longer discernible and dependency is less obvious and harder to establish with certainty. For those looking for some percentage of dependency I think it is safe to say that about 31 percent of the DA text measured some degree of literary dependency and about 61 percent registered independence. The rest represents the use of Scripture.

Even though I have attempted an evaluation of Ellen White's literary dependency in respect to verbal parallels

Summary and Conclusions

found in her sentence constructions and have also made some general judgments relative to the redaction or editorial arrangement of the content of the chapters in DA, I freely admit that these assessments are only generalizations. The conclusions in respect to dependency and independency are not as precise as the statistics might suggest. I would urge the reader to take the time to study the text presentations of each chapter and the additional materials in Appendix D. The contribution of this investigation is found primarily in the completeness of its textual base. By carefully comparing Ellen White's work with the sources one is able to note Ellen White's independence within dependent sentences and her dependence in sentences we have rated as independent. The entire chapter of the DA text may be compared with the larger context of the source text and the larger dimensions of the literary dependency questions can then be addressed. Once one has personally studied the texts themselves the statistical evaluations will be seen as indicators of trends or of proportionate dependency/independency ratings and not as precise and accurate evaluations.

It may be surprising for many to discover that Ellen White was so broad in her reading selections. Evidently the early Advent believers were encouraged to read widely in the area of religion. Elder William C. White, one of Ellen White's sons and close collaborator in the production of her books, included one of Ellen White's literary sources in his

Summary and Conclusions

book promotions. In a letter dated six years before the publication of DA he wrote:

You will notice in recent numbers of the ECHO [Australian version of The Signs of the Times] that we have begun to advertise some reference books and some juvenile books. Most of these I am personally acquainted with. Many of them are works that we have handled for years in America and sold large numbers. I am sure that it will be greatly to the advantage of our people, if in connection with their Sabbath-school studies they will read such works as Geikie's Life of Christ and Conybeare and Howson's Life and Epistles of St. Paul.¹

The time constraints on this research project did not permit us to examine the letterbooks of W. C. White for information on Ellen White's use of sources and literary assistants. We do have several of his comments on these topics which have been collected and published by members of the Ellen G. White Estate office.² Perhaps it would be useful to make a thorough study of all such references, particularly in respect to the reading selections, in the letters of Adventist pioneers, in the advertisements of the various church journals, and in the articles appearing in Adventist papers authored by Christians of other faiths. Once we are able to contextualize Ellen White's reading habits we will be in a position to say whether her practice of reading from such diverse sources was different from that followed by James White in his editorial activities or by other Adventist writers of the time.

¹WCW Letter to Mrs. M. H. Tuxford, December 8, 1892.

²These publications are described in the introduction of this report.

Summary and Conclusions

5. Ellen White's literary assistants, particularly Marian Davis, are responsible for the published form of The Desire of Ages.

The role of Ellen White's literary secretaries was never the primary focus of this investigation. Their activities, however, cannot be entirely divorced from a study of Ellen White's use of sources. In Part B of the introduction to this study we reviewed the general nature of their work, particularly in respect to the editing and publishing of The Desire of Ages. The research into Ellen White's use of sources confirmed that while no complete division of labor existed between Ellen White's work and that of her secretaries, there was a practical separation of writing responsibilities.

We know that Ellen White wrote the initial stage of the text in the form of handwritten notations in her journals. She provided the original form of the text using various sources and/or developing her comments from her own thoughts, reflections, and Bible study. Without specific information which she alone could supply we have no way of knowing what materials came from visions or through other sources of inspiration available to her. Once these thoughts were put on paper they were handed to her literary assistants for editing and, in the case of the DA text, for compilation into chapters for book publication.

Our research indicates that once the handwritten text

Summary and Conclusions

came into the hands of the secretaries and literary assistants they evidently had the freedom to rearrange word and sentence order as well as to add and omit words or short phrases. The basic content usually remained the same. We did not find one DA chapter in handwritten form though some late manuscripts did contain the basic text of what later came to be large portions of a chapter. This evidence suggests to me that her literary helpers had the task of making up the chapters from the various manuscripts Ellen White wrote. We found that Marian Davis rearranged paragraphs, modified sentence and chapter length, and generally followed through with the many details involved in getting a book to press.

An overlap in responsibilities took place when Marian made suggestions to Ellen White on what was needed to round out a chapter or incident and when Ellen White checked the finished text once it had been compiled and edited by Marian Davis. Often others joined Ellen White for the final approval.

Ellen White considered helpers like Marian Davis her "bookmakers." When Marian Davis is experiencing some difficulties Ellen White is no longer able to say, "Here, Marian, is a book I will put in your hands to arrange."¹ Ellen White freely admits since "you (Marian) have been severely taxed in preparing the work Desire of Ages, we

¹EGW Let. D-248, dated October 20, 1899.

Summary and Conclusions

would plan for you to let go of all this kind of work in preparation of books. I shall feel this laying down of the work more than any other one can possibly feel it."¹ This "work" involved much more than correcting syntax and grammar. When Sarah Peck, a trained educator, arrived in Australia to assist Ellen White she complained that there was no one to teach her her job. In a private letter to W. C. White, Ellen White wrote, "She says she cannot see why she was sent for to come here from Africa to help me, with no one to instruct her, to educate her in the work."²

When the manuscripts as they came from the hand of Ellen White are compared with the finished DA text it becomes clear that Ellen White is heavily dependent upon these special assistants. She is confident about her speaking ability but one never finds that confidence expressed in her comments on her writing skills.³ It does seem reasonable to conclude that more credit should be given to these special assistants when referring to Ellen White as an author of published works.

No doubt a more accurate estimation of Ellen White as a writer demands a careful analysis of her manuscripts. A serious study of her handwritten text of a complete manuscript would reveal more about how she structured her

¹Ibid.

²EGW Let. W-198, dated March 9, 1900.

³One example may be found in a letter to her children where she speaks about her sister, their aunt. "She is a powerful singer. This is as much her talent as speaking is mine. I think I never heard a voice that would thrill the soul like hers." Letter W-10-72.

Summary and Conclusions

thoughts, expressed her views, and utilized sources. A project of this kind might also shed some light on the authorship of some of Ellen White's manuscripts which carry no written signature of Ellen White, consist largely of excerpts from Ellen White's earlier writings, and exist today only in typewritten form with no indication of being a copy of an Ellen White handwritten manuscript. It may be that Ellen White authorized her helpers to develop manuscripts on certain topics from her earlier writings even as she allowed them to use her materials to construct journal articles and book chapters. We might also be able to tell if the manuscripts of 1897 were pre-DA writings or intended as rough drafts of the DA text.

Finally, some attention needs to be given to the foreign language editions of Ellen White's works. Our study of the French edition of Ellen White's life of Christ raised several questions relating to the work of translators or editors. Our comparison of the relevant chapters of the French text with the earlier Spirit of Prophecy volumes indicated that it was basically a direct translation. There were, however, revisions made to the earlier text and new material added, some of which was heavily dependent on literary sources. Was the entire work meant to be a translation, a revision, or both? Was the new commentary a translation of Ellen White's manuscripts written in English by her while in Europe but not preserved for use in the later English version?

Summary and Conclusions

We have at last come to the end of a very long and involved research project on a selected portion of Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ. In the process we have also raised additional questions for future investigations. I think the study has clearly revealed that Ellen White's writings on the life of Christ, at least in respect to these 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages, were both original and derivative. No doubt continued investigations will turn up additional sources and literary parallels. If we can judge by the findings of this research, however, all such future study will also reveal more about the creative role of Ellen White as a writer. She, with the aid of her literary assistants, built out of the common quarry of stones not a replica of another's work but rather a customized literary composition which reflects the particular faith and Christian hope she was called to share with her fellow Adventists and the Christian community at large. It is perhaps more accurate to speak of her creative and independent use of her own writings and that of others than to minimize the amount of her borrowing. It is the finished product, whether sentence, paragraph, chapter, or book, that should be compared in the final analysis. A reading of the full report will readily reveal that the multiple aspects of literary dependence or independence are often too subtle, too intertwined and too complex to be precisely and consistently evaluated.

Summary and Conclusions

Postscript

In October of 1980, soon after I accepted the responsibility for conducting this research into Ellen White's use of sources, I was advised to back out of my commitment. The project was described as a "no win" situation. There was no way, so I was told, that I could please both the General Conference administrators who had commissioned the study and those in the church who were raising the questions about Ellen White's writing methods. As I now draw the project to a close I am no closer than I was then to knowing whether my "prophet" friend was correct in his prediction. We will just have to wait and see. After nearly eight years with the project, however, I remain confident that the evidence will speak for itself. Truth is at stake here. It is not a matter of winning or losing.

We must also remember this project is not the only study on Ellen White which has been made in the past several years. Many have contributed to the current Adventist understanding of Ellen White and her writings and they will continue to shape the future role of Ellen White's ministry in Adventism. This investigation did not address all the questions being raised in respect to Ellen White, her ministry, and her writings. Indeed, the study raised additional issues which should be taken up in future studies. There are, however, several questions which have been addressed to me personally many times over the past few

Summary and Conclusions

years. Since four of these questions have to do with personal perspectives relative to this research project, perhaps this is the appropriate place to answer them.

Church members have been curious as to why I have been willing to give a major segment of time out of my life to the study of an academic problem about Ellen White. If the study had to do with church doctrine there would be no question, but why give this time to the issue of sources? My answer is as follows. In the first place the study is justified by the number of people interested. The interested ones are not only those asking the question but those who don't want to know the answer. These latter ones are interested in not knowing. The fact that so many "reports" have minimized the use of sources by Ellen White is evidence of this "negative" interest in the topic. No true faith in Ellen White and her writings can be persuasive if it cannot stand the light of truth. Our faith in Ellen White must rest upon evidence, not upon myth. I think it is very important for the future of Adventism and for Adventist confidence in the ministry of Ellen White that we base our beliefs on our best knowledge of the truth. Likewise, if there are those who find it hard to accept, or necessary to leave Adventism, I would prefer that they do so on the basis of a correct understanding of Adventism and not because they reject or have difficulty with misconceptions of Adventism.

There is also a professional basis for my interest in this project. My area is biblical interpretation and while

Summary and Conclusions

many Adventists may not realize it, we are indebted to many such research studies by others in the past for our knowledge of the Bible, its text, its history, and its background. It is becoming increasingly necessary for us to obtain similar knowledge of the writings of Ellen White if we expect them to have continuing significance for the church today. Even though we are only 150 years away from the days of Ellen White, there has been a far greater increase of knowledge in these 15 decades than has taken place during the four thousand years from Abraham's day to that of Ellen White. It is imperative that we develop appropriate principles of interpretation for understanding and applying the truths to be found in the writings of Ellen White. These principles are developed from a knowledge of the text and not superimposed on the text. Hence we need studies such to this one to help us understand the text of Ellen White.

A second concern has to do with the charge by some that Ellen White was guilty of plagiarism. People want to know if the evidence of literary dependency uncovered by this study shows that charge to be a valid one.

Let me first point out that this research project did not treat the question of plagiarism. In fact, I have suggested under the first conclusion above that serious attention be given to this question. At this point my personal opinion is that such a study when concluded will show that Ellen White was not a plagiarist. My reasons for

Summary and Conclusions

holding this opinion are as follows. There is no question in my mind that Ellen White used literary sources, even verbatim quotes, without giving credit to her sources. But the charge of plagiarism can only be legitimately placed against a writer when that writer's literary methods contravene the established practices of the general community of writers producing similar writings of the same literary genre within a comparable cultural context and time period.

In the course of our research in the "lives" of Jesus produced in the 19th century we often found similarities and even verbatim expressions among the sources used by Ellen White. There were times when we were uncertain as to which literary source the DA parallel was to be credited. The writers used by Ellen White often exhibited literary parallels among themselves equal to those found between the writings of Ellen White and these same writers.

My comments here are not intended to settle the question of plagiarism in respect to the Ellen White writings. They are also not included here to minimize the extent of her literary dependence. The point I do wish to make is that a careful study of the writings of Ellen White and any fair attempt to treat the plagiarism issue will also recognize Ellen White's creative work. Such an analysis will give due credit to Ellen White and to Marian Davis for their individuality which comes to expression in the processes of rejection, selection, paraphrasing, and

Summary and Conclusions

rearrangement of the source text. It will take pains to emphasize the dissimilarities as well as the similarities. When the Ellen White writings are evaluated against the practices of other writers of this period and genre instead of against the expectations of those who put Ellen White as a writer in a special category, the question of plagiarism becomes a much more complicated issue.

Another question often raised in connection with the plagiarism issue has to do with Ellen White's denial of literary borrowing. Adventists have asked me how I personally solved the problem. Did I think the introductory statement to The Great Controversy constituted an adequate admission of literary dependence?

I must admit that I find The Great Controversy preface much too limited to answer for all of Ellen White's use of sources. The statement comes rather late in her history of writing; it is too narrow and perhaps too vague in its reference to historians and reformers; it minimizes the use of sources; and it does not cover her practice of paraphrasing her sources.

In my opinion we must first try to grasp how Ellen White understood her role as God's special messenger. What was her view of inspiration and revelation? What did her charismatic experience include or exclude? How would she probably have justified her literary practices to herself? What do we know about the extent of her visions, and how are

Summary and Conclusions

we to interpret her descriptions of those many times when she was impressed to write yet makes no specific reference to having had a vision on the topic.

Her explanations and descriptions must not be held accountable to criteria we have developed from our experiences. Rather, they must be approached in a similar fashion to our attempts to understand the prophetic experiences of others, including the men and women spoken of in Scripture. In my view it would be as illegitimate to force Ellen White into our contemporary mold of expectations as it is for a strictly scientific view to demand that the miracles of Scripture be denied or explained on a cause-effect nexus modern man could accept. Until someone has made this kind of an investigation into the prophetic experiences of Ellen White, the questions over her admission or nonadmission of literary dependency should in my judgment be left open.

The fourth question relates to the subject of Ellen White's inspiration. Church members want to know if I believe that Ellen White was inspired of God, and some push the question further by asking me to explain what I mean by "inspiration." In view of the fact that I have been directing a research project involving the analysis of Ellen White's writings for the Adventist church I have never felt that this question was out of order. Of course the issue of "inspiration" is a theological question and it also happens to be a doctrine on which the church has never clearly

Summary and Conclusions

defined its position. It is therefore not surprising to find that there is not a single orthodox Adventist view on inspiration. The net effect is that one's belief in the area of inspiration is quite personal. It is this personal nature of the question that permits me to be more positive in my answer.

I came to this study at the request of the officers of the General Conference. My background and training was in the language, text, interpretation, and theology of the New Testament. Along with nearly every other Adventist associate in biblical studies I was not troubled by the discoveries over Ellen White's use of sources.

Inspiration, to my way of thinking, is not dependent upon originality. It is clear that much of the material content of Scripture makes no claim to being new and different from what anyone else was saying or from what had been said by someone in the past. In fact, Luke 1:1-3 clearly states that what followed in the record of Jesus' life was taken from the oral or written accounts of others. Why should we expect something more or different in the experience of Ellen White?

Now, having been given the privilege of reading so much of her writings in handwritten, typescript, and published form, I find that my respect for and appreciation of her writings and ministry have grown. I covet for all her supporters and critics alike the opportunity to read her writings in their original context. To be able to freshly

Summary and Conclusions

discover their breadth of interest and involvement, her judgment and devotion, her humor and humaneness, and her piety and spirituality, was both informative and faith building.

Obviously she was human, had personal and character weaknesses, and was far from perfect and infallible. She never claimed to be otherwise. In my judgment, the problems her interpreters face in giving the appropriate recognition to both the time-conditioned and timeless statements to be found in her writings, are no different from those the Jewish and Christian church have had to deal with throughout the history of God's revelatory activities.

I am under the strong conviction, now more than before I began this research project, that the issue is not one of deciding if Ellen White was a prophet or merely a religious leader. It is not a case of "either/or." Rather, it is an issue of "both/and." She was both a 19th-century prophetic voice in her ministry to the Adventist church and through that calling to the larger society, and a voice out of that Christian community of the past which still deserves to be heard today in those messages which speak to the issues still relevant in the latter part of the 20th century. Her writings also deserve to be preserved into the 21st century so that the church may continue to profit from her timeless counsel.

To my way of thinking, one sure way to destroy the continuing effectiveness of Ellen White's ministry is to

Summary and Conclusions

take the either/or, the all or nothing, approach. She fought against such a view in her own lifetime. She would not permit her testimonies to be put in "concrete," to be taken out of the living context in which they were given and formulated into literal prescriptive statements that were to be understood and applied in the same way regardless of the life situation. Her words will only be preserved if they are allowed to speak dynamically under the continued power of the Holy Spirit and with the common-sense understanding God has given to mankind.

Let me repeat. The question is not one of deciding which of her writings were inspired and which portions were not. It is not a case of deciding when to exchange her "prophetic" hat for her "editorial" cap. It is rather one of deciding which comments of this "special messenger of the Lord" still address our world and the realities of our life situation which we cannot humanly escape and which the honest minds of the Christian community force us to accept as true for us today.

If there is one general conclusion generated from my countless hours spent in reading and studying her writings over the past seven years it is this. Ellen White was above all a practical believing Christian. Her writings were written to inform and to build personal faith in and personal obedience to God's will as it comes to expression in His Word, the Bible. We may wish with all our hearts that she could serve us today as scientist or psychologist,

Summary and Conclusions

as technician or theologian, or as conference or college president, but that is not to be. My firm conviction is that she was not nor can be any one of these for us. She was rather a woman of God, driven by His Spirit to call us back to Himself, to His Word and His ways, that living under the name of Christ we might glorify Him before those who know Him not.

APPENDIX A

List of sentence evaluations for each of the 15 chapters of The Desire of Ages and source references for dependent DA sentences. In those instances where space does not allow for the full name of the author, the reader should consult the source quotation as given in the text presentation for that particular DA sentence.

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	Bible	B2	051.		I1
002.	Thayer SLJ/2.8	P3	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.		I1	054.		I1
005.		I1	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.	Kennedy MP/174.2	I2	057.	Harris GT/31/52	I2
008.	Kennedy MP/174.6	I2	058.	Harris GT/31/52	B1
009.		I1	059.	Harris GT/35a/52	B1
010.		I1	060.	Harris GT/35b/52	B1
011.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	061.	Kennedy MP/174.2	B1
012.		I1	062.		I1
013.	Bible	B2	063.		I1
014.		I1	064.		I1
015.	Bible	B2	065.	Harris GT/1/49	V2
016.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	066.		I1
017.	Thayer SLJ/22.1	I2	067.	Harris GT/6/145	P2
018.	Bible	B2	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.	Harris GT/6/145	I2
020.	Thayer SLJ/21.6	P3	070.	Harris GT/25/229	P2
021.	Thayer SLJ/21.8	P2	071.	Harris GT/27/229	P2
022.		I1	072.		I1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.	MP/174.7 SLJ/14.5	I2	074.		I1
025.	MP/174.7 SLJ/14/5	I2	075.		I1
026.	MP/174.8 SLJ/16.3	I2	076.		I1
027.	Harris GT/4/49	P3	077.		I1
028.	Harris GT/19/50,51	I2	078.		I1
029.	Harris GT/8/49+	I2	079.		I1
030.		I1	080.		I1
031.	Harris GT/8,17/49+	I2	081.		I1
032.		I1	082.		I1
033.	Harris GT/21b/51	B1	083.		I1
034.	Harris GT/21b/51	I2	084.	Harris GT/111.3	I2
035.	GT/16,22/50,52	P3	085.		I1
036.	Harris GT/18,19/50	P3	086.		I1
037.		I1	087.		I1
038.	Harris GT/20/51	P3	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.	Harris GT/22/51	I2	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.	GT/24/51 MP/174.8	I2	093.		I1
044.	Kennedy MP/174.9	P3	094.		I1
045.	Kennedy MP/174.9	I2	095.		I1
046.	Harris GT/25,26/51	P3	096.		I1
047.	GT/25-29/51,52	I2	097.		I1
048.	Harris GT/23,25/51	P3	098.		I1
049.		I1	099.	Harris GT/39/230	P3
050.	Harris GT/37/52	P3	100.	Harris GT/40a/230	P2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 3

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	Harris GT/40b/230	P3	151. -		
102. -	Harris GT/40c/230	P3	152. -		
103. -	Harris GT/40d/230	I2	153. -		
104. -	Harris GT/42/231	P2	154. -		
105. -	Harris GT/42/231	P2	155. -		
106. -	Harris GT/43b/231	P3	156. -		
107. -	Harris GT/43c/231	P3	157. -		
108. -	Harris GT/43c/231	P3	158. -		
109. -	Harris GT/43d/231	P3	159. -		
110. -	Harris GT/43d/231	P2	160. -		
111. -	GT/34/229;102.9	I2	161. -		
112. -	GT/11,12/102	P3	162. -		
113. -		I1	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -	GT/10,17,18/102,3	I2	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -		I1	167. -		
118. -		I1	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -	Harris GT/18b/103	P3	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -	GT/16-18/103	I2	172. -		
123. -	Harris GT/3/101	P2	173. -		
124. -	Harris GT/2/101	P3	174. -		
125. -	Harris GT/4/101	I2	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -			181. -		
132. -			182. -		
133. -			183. -		
134. -			184. -		
135. -			185. -		
136. -			186. -		
137. -			187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.	Geikie LC/61.8	P2	054.		I1
005.	Bible	B2	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.	Geikie LC/13/70	P1	057.		I1
008.	Geikie LC/ 7/70	P3	058.		I1
009.	Geikie LC/ 7/70	B1	059.		I1
010.	Geikie LC/ 7/70	I2	060.		I1
011.		I1	061.	Hanna LC/33/70	I2
012.		I1	062.		I1
013.	Bible	B2	063.		I1
014.	Bible	B2	064.		I1
015.	Bible	B2	065.		I1
016.	Bible	B2	066.		I1
017.	Bible	B2	067.		I1
018.	Bible	B2	068.		I1
019.	Fleetwood LC/6/21	T2	069.		I1
020.	Fleetwood LC/6/21	P3	070.		I1
021.	Fleetwood LC/6/21	P3	071.		I1
022.		I1	072.		I1
023.		I1	073.	Bible	B2
024.		I1	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.		I1
026.		I1	076.		I1
027.		I1	077.		I1
028.		I1	078.		I1
029.		I1	079.		I1
030.		I1	080.		I1
031.		I1	081.		I1
032.		I1	082.		I1
033.		I1	083.		I1
034.		I1	084.		I1
035.		I1	085.		I1
036.		I1	086.		I1
037.		I1	087.		I1
038.	Bible	B2	088.		I1
039.	F LC/3,10b/20	P2	089.		I1
040.	Bible	B2	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.	Bible	B2	093.		I1
044.		I1	094.	Hanna LC/25a/70	P2
045.	Bible	B2	095.	Kitto DBI/169.6	P2
046.	Bible	B2	096.	Kitto DBI/169.6	P2
047.		I1	097.	Hanna LC/26-29/70	P2
048.	Bible	B2	098.	Hanna LC/30/70	P3
049.	Bible	B2	099.	Hanna LC/30/70	P3
050.	Bible	B2	100.	Hanna LC/31,32/70	I2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Jones LSFG/20/24	I2
102. -		I1	152. -	Jones LSFG/3/17	I2
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -		I1	155. -		I1
106. -		I1	156. -	Geikie LC/275.7+	P2
107. -		I1	157. -	G/275.7+H/82.83/74	P2
108. -		I1	158. -		I1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -	Fleetwood LC/1/44	P2
112. -		I1	162. -	Fleetwood LC/2/44	P2
113. -		I1	163. -	Fleetwood LC/3/45	I2
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -		I1	166. -		I1
117. -		I1	167. -		I1
118. -		I1	168. -	Bible	B2
119. -		I1	169. -	Bible	B2
120. -		I1	170. -	Fleetwood/4/45	B1
121. -	Geikie LC/264.6	I2	171. -	Fleetwood/5/45	B1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -		I1	173. -		I1
124. -		I1	174. -	Bible	B2
125. -		I1	175. -	Bible	B2
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -		I1	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -	Geikie LC/264.3	P2	180. -		I1
131. -	Geikie LC/264.3	I2	181. -		I1
132. -	Jones LSFG/12/23	P2	182. -		I1
133. -		I1	183. -	Bible	B2
134. -		I1	184. -		I1
135. -		I1	185. -		I1
136. -		I1	186. -		I1
137. -		I1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -		I1	189. -		I1
140. -		I1	190. -		I1
141. -	Hanna LC/47-51/72	P2	191. -		I1
142. -		I1	192. -		I1
143. -		I1	193. -	Bible	B2
144. -		I1	194. -		I1
145. -	Hanna LC/54/71	P2	195. -		I1
146. -		I1	196. -		I1
147. -		I1	197. -		I1
148. -	Jones LSFG/2.3/17	P2	198. -		I1
149. -	Jones LSFG/3/17	P1	199. -		I1
150. -		I1	200. -	Bible	B2

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 10

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -	Bible	B2	251. -		
202. -		I1	252. -		
203. -		I1	253. -		
204. -		I1	254. -		
205. -		I1	255. -		
206. -		I1	256. -		
207. -		I1	257. -		
208. -		I1	258. -		
209. -		I1	259. -		
210. -	Bible	B2	260. -		
211. -	Bible	B2	261. -		
212. -	Bible	B2	262. -		
213. -	Bible	B2	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -		I1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -	Bible	B2	267. -		
218. -		I1	268. -		
219. -		I1	269. -		
220. -		I1	270. -		
221. -	Bible	B2	271. -		
222. -		I1	272. -		
223. -		I1	273. -		
224. -		I1	274. -		
225. -		I1	275. -		
226. -		I1	276. -		
227. -		I1	277. -		
228. -		I1	278. -		
229. -		I1	279. -		
230. -	Fleetwood LC/8/46	I2	280. -		
231. -		I1	281. -		
232. -			282. -		
233. -			283. -		
234. -			284. -		
235. -			285. -		
236. -			286. -		
237. -			287. -		
238. -			288. -		
239. -			289. -		
240. -			290. -		
241. -			291. -		
242. -			292. -		
243. -			293. -		
244. -			294. -		
245. -			295. -		
246. -			296. -		
247. -			297. -		
248. -			298. -		
249. -			299. -		
250. -			300. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 13

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	Bible	B2	051. -		I1
002. -		I1	052. -		I1
003. -		I1	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -		I1	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -		I1	057. -		B2
008. -		I1	058. -		B2
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -		I1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -	Bible	B2
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -		I1
016. -		I1	066. -	Hanna LC/121/97	I2
017. -		I1	067. -	Bible	B2
018. -		I1	068. -	Bible	B2
019. -		I1	069. -		I1
020. -		I1	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -		I1	073. -		I1
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -	Hanna LC/75-77	P2	075. -		I1
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -	Bible	B2	077. -		I1
028. -	Bible	B2	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -		I1	085. -		I1
036. -		I1	086. -		I1
037. -		I1	087. -		I1
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -		I1
041. -		I1	091. -	Bible	B2
042. -		I1	092. -	Hanna LC/108/96	I2
043. -		I1	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -		I1
045. -		I1	095. -		I1
046. -		I1	096. -		I1
047. -		I1	097. -		I1
048. -		I1	098. -	Hanna LC/156a/99	P2
049. -	Bible	B2	099. -		I1
050. -	Hanna LC/153/98	I2	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 13

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -		
102. -		I1	152. -		
103. -		I1	153. -		
104. -		I1	154. -		
105. -		I1	155. -		
106. -		I1	156. -		
107. -		I1	157. -		
108. -	Hanna LC/125a/97	I2	158. -		
109. -		I1	159. -		
110. -	Hanna LC/125b/97	P2	160. -		
111. -		I1	161. -		
112. -		I1	162. -		
113. -	Hanna LC/161/99	I2	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -		I1	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -		I1	167. -		
118. -		I1	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -		I1	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -		I1	172. -		
123. -		I1	173. -		
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -	Bible	B2	177. -		
128. -			178. -		
129. -			179. -		
130. -			180. -		
131. -			181. -		
132. -			182. -		
133. -			183. -		
134. -			184. -		
135. -			185. -		
136. -			186. -		
137. -			187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	B1	051. -		I1
002. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	P3	052. -		I1
003. -	Jones LSFG/23.7	P3	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -	Bible	B2
005. -		I1	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -		I1	057. -	Bible	B2
008. -	Jones LSFG/12/38	P3	058. -		I1
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -		I1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -	Jones LSFG/3/37	P2	063. -		I1
014. -	Jones LSFG/3/37	P1	064. -		I1
015. -	Jones LSFG/4,5/37	P1	065. -		I1
016. -	Jones LSFG/5/37	P1	066. -		I1
017. -	Jones LSFG/7/38	P2	067. -		I1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -		I1	069. -		I1
020. -	Jones LSFG/11/38	P2	070. -	Hanna LC/12/101	I2
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -	Jones LSFG/13/38	P2	073. -		I1
024. -	Jones LSFG 14/38	P2	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -		I1
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -	Hanna LC/9/101	I2
032. -	Fleetwood LC/53.5	P2	082. -	Jones LSFG 19/96	I2
033. -		I1	083. -	Bible	B2
034. -	Jones LSFG/41,42/42	P2	084. -	Jones LSFG/72/46	P2
035. -	Jones LSFG/40,41/42	P2	085. -	Jones LSFG/71/46	P2
036. -	Jones LSFG/42/42	P2	086. -	Jones LSFG/69,71/46	P2
037. -	Jones LSFG/56-66/45	B1	087. -	Jones LSFG/70/46	P2
038. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	088. -		I1
039. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	089. -		I1
040. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	090. -	Bible	B2
041. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	091. -		I1
042. -	LSFG/56-66/45	B1	092. -		I1
043. -	LSFG/56-66	B1	093. -		I1
044. -	LSFG/56-66	B1	094. -		I1
045. -	Bible	B2	095. -	Hanna LC/1/100	P2
046. -	Bible	B2	096. -	Hanna LC/17/101	B1
047. -	Bible	B2	097. -	Hanna LC/17/101	B1
048. -	Bible	B2	098. -	Hanna LC/18/101	B1
049. -	Jones LSFG/66/45	P2	099. -	Hanna LC/19/101	B1
050. -		I1	100. -	Hanna LC/19/101	B1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	Hanna LC/21/101	Bl	151.		I1
102.	Hanna LC/22/101	Bl	152.		I1
103.		I1	153.		I1
104.		I1	154.		I1
105.		I1	155.		I1
106.		I1	156.		I1
107.		I1	157.		I1
108.		I1	158.		I1
109.	Jones LSFG/77/46	I2	159.	Farrar LC/123.6	P3
110.	Jones LSFG/5/95	P2	160.		I1
111.		I1	161.	Hanna LC/87/106	P3
112.	Ingraham PhD/141.7	I2	162.	Hanna LC/88/106	I2
113.	I/156.8,157.6	I2	163.	Bible	B2
114.	Jones LSFG/79/46	P3	164.		I1
115.	J/79/46,16/96	P3	165.		I1
116.		I1	166.	Hanna LC/90/100	P2
117.	J/4-6/95,79/46,16/96	P3	167.	Hanna LC/91/106	P2
118.	Jones LSFG/5/195	P3	168.	Bible	B2
119.	Jones LSFG/16,15/96	P2	169.		I1
120.	Jones LSFG/13,15/96	P3	170.		I1
121.	Jones LSFG/15/96	P3	171.	Jones LSFG/99.3	P2
122.	Jones LSFG/17/96	P3	172.		I1
123.	Jones LSFG/17/96	P3	173.		I1
124.		I1	174.		I1
125.		I1	175.	HannaLC/107,108/107	P3
126.		I1	176.		I1
127.	Jones LSFG/18/96	P1	177.		I1
128.	Jones LSFG/19/96	V2	178.		I1
129.	Jones LSFG/20/96	V2	179.		I1
130.	Hanna LC/55/104	P3	180.		I1
131.	Hanna LC/55/104	P3	181.		I1
132.	Hanna LC/53/104	P3	182.		I1
133.	Bible	Bl	183.	Bible	B2
134.	Fa/122.6,H/61/104	P1	184.	Melvill GL (50)81.5	V2
135.	Hanna LC/68/105	I2	185.	Bible	B2
136.	Hanna LC/72/105	I2	186.	Bible	B2
137.	Hanna LC/72/105	P3	187.	Bible	B2
138.	Hanna LC/72/105	I2	188.	Bible	B2
139.	Hanna LC/73/105	Bl	189.		I1
140.	Hanna LC/74/105	P2	190.		I1
141.		I1	191.	Hanna LC/113/107	I2
142.		I1	192.	Hanna LC/113/107	I2
143.	Hanna LC/78/105	Bl	193.	Bible	B2
144.	Hanna LC/76/105	P1	194.		I1
145.	Hanna LC/77/105	P2	195.		I1
146.	Hanna LC/79a/105	Bl	196.		I1
147.	Hanna LC/79b/105	Bl	197.		I1
148.		I1	198.		I1
149.		I1	199.		I1
150.		I1	200.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 14

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -		
202. -	Hanna LC/128/109	P3	252. -		
203. -	Hanna LC/136/109	P2	253. -		
204. -	Hanna LC/136/109	P2	254. -		
205. -	Hanna LC/136/109	P2	255. -		
206. -	Hanna LC/137/109	P2	256. -		
207. -	Hanna LC/138/109+	P2	257. -		
208. -		I1	258. -		
209. -		I1	259. -		
210. -		I1	260. -		
211. -	Hanna LC/134/109	I2	261. -		
212. -	Hanna LC/134/109	I2	262. -		
213. -		I1	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -		I1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -		I1	267. -		
218. -		I1	268. -		
219. -		I1	269. -		
220. -		I1	270. -		
221. -		I1	271. -		
222. -		I1	272. -		
223. -		I1	273. -		
224. -		I1	274. -		
225. -		I1	275. -		
226. -		I1	276. -		
227. -		I1	277. -		
228. -		I1	278. -		
229. -		I1	279. -		
230. -		I1	280. -		
231. -		I1	281. -		
232. -		I1	282. -		
233. -	Bible	B2	283. -		
234. -		I1	284. -		
235. -		I1	285. -		
236. -	Hanna LC/116/108	P2	286. -		
237. -	Hanna LC/117a/108	B1	287. -		
238. -		I1	288. -		
239. -	Hanna LC/117b/108	B1	289. -		
240. -	Hanna LC/118/108	P1	290. -		
241. -	Hanna LC/119/108	I2	291. -		
242. -	Hanna LC/120a/108	V2	292. -		
243. -	Hanna LC/120b/108	P1	293. -		
244. -	Hanna LC/120b/108	V2	294. -		
245. -	Hanna LC/120c/108	P2	295. -		
246. -		I1	296. -		
247. -		I1	297. -		
248. -		I1	298. -		
249. -	Hanna LC/123/108	P2	299. -		
250. -	Melville MS/286a.9	P1	300. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -		I1
002. -		I1	052. -		I1
003. -	Bible	B2	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -	March WHJ/65/56	P3	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -		I1	058. -		I1
009. -	M/WHJ/71,88/57,59	P3	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -	M/WHJ/88-90/59	I2	061. -		I1
012. -	Hanna LC/40,42/168	I2	062. -		I1
013. -	M/DSM/18/95	P3	063. -		I1
014. -	Bible	B2	064. -		I1
015. -	Bible	B2	065. -		I1
016. -	Hanna LC/51/169	B1	066. -		I1
017. -	Bible	B2	067. -	M/WHJ/101/61	I2
018. -	Bible	B2	068. -		I1
019. -	M/WHJ/73/57	P2	069. -		I1
020. -	Hanna LC/55/169	P3	070. -		I1
021. -	M/DSM/41/98	P3	071. -	M/WHJ/102,104a,b/61	P2
022. -		I1	072. -	M/WHJ/104c	P1
023. -		I1	073. -	M/WHJ/104d/61	V2
024. -	M/DSM/43,45/99	P2	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -	M/WHJ/105,106/61	I2
026. -	Hanna LC/59a/170	P3	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -		I1
032. -	M/DSM/29/96	P2	082. -		I1
033. -	M/WHJ/88-87/59	P2	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -		I1	085. -	Hanna LC/106/173	P2
036. -		I1	086. -	Hanna LC/107/173	B1
037. -		I1	087. -	H/LC/108,109/173	P3
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
041. -		I1	091. -	Hanna LC/109/173	P2
042. -		I1	092. -	Hanna LC/109/173	I2
043. -	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	093. -	M/WHJ/109/62	I2
044. -	Hanna LC/67/170	B1	094. -	M/WHJ/109/62	P2
045. -	Bible	B2	095. -	M/WHJ/110/62	P2
046. -	Bible	B2	096. -	M/WHJ/115/62	P2
047. -	Bible	B2	097. -		I1
048. -	Hanna LC/67/170	I2	098. -		I1
049. -		I1	099. -		I1
050. -		I1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 24

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	M/WHJ/117/62	P3	151. -		11
102. -		11	152. -		11
103. -		11	153. -		11
104. -		11	154. -		
105. -		11	155. -		
106. -		11	156. -		
107. -		11	157. -		
108. -		11	158. -		
109. -		11	159. -		
110. -		11	160. -		
111. -		11	161. -		
112. -		11	162. -		
113. -		11	163. -		
114. -		11	164. -		
115. -		11	165. -		
116. -		11	166. -		
117. -		11	167. -		
118. -	Bible	B2	168. -		
119. -		11	169. -		
120. -		11	170. -		
121. -		11	171. -		
122. -		11	172. -		
123. -		11	173. -		
124. -		11	174. -		
125. -		11	175. -		
126. -		11	176. -		
127. -		11	177. -		
128. -		11	178. -		
129. -		11	179. -		
130. -		11	180. -		
131. -		11	181. -		
132. -		11	182. -		
133. -		11	183. -		
134. -		11	184. -		
135. -		11	185. -		
136. -		11	186. -		
137. -		11	187. -		
138. -		11	188. -		
139. -		11	189. -		
140. -		11	190. -		
141. -		11	191. -		
142. -		11	192. -		
143. -		11	193. -		
144. -		11	194. -		
145. -		11	195. -		
146. -		11	196. -		
147. -		11	197. -		
148. -		11	198. -		
149. -		11	199. -		
150. -		11	200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -		I1
002. -		I1	052. -		I1
003. -		I1	053. -		I1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -		I1	055. -		I1
006. -		I1	056. -	Hanna LC/19,27/269	P3
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -		I1	058. -		I1
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -		I1	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -	Hanna LC/37/269	P1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -		I1
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -		I1
016. -		I1	066. -		I1
017. -	Hanna LC/17/269	B1	067. -	Hanna LC/38a/269	B1
018. -		I1	068. -	Hanna LC/38b/269	B1
019. -	Pentecost 67.3	P2	069. -	Hanna LC/40-47/270	P2
020. -		I1	070. -	Hanna LC/46/270	P3
021. -	Pentecost 67.3	P3	071. -	Harris GT/308a	P1
022. -	Pentecost 67.3	I2	072. -	Harris GT/308b	P3
023. -	Hanna LC/23/269	I2	073. -	Harris GT/308c	I2
024. -	Hanna LC/20,21/269	I2	074. -		I1
025. -	Hanna LC/25/269	B1	075. -	Harris GT/308d	P2
026. -		I1	076. -	Harris GT/308e	P3
027. -	Harris GT/343.1	P3	077. -	Harris GT/308e	V2
028. -		I1	078. -	Harris GT/308f	P3
029. -	Harris GT/343.4	P2	079. -	Harris GT/308g	I2
030. -	Harris GT/343.5a,5b	V2	080. -	Harris GT/308g	P3
031. -	Harris GT/343.5b	P2	081. -	Bible	B2
032. -	Harris GT/343.7	V2	082. -	Miller 7/187	P1
033. -		I1	083. -	Miller 1/187	P1
034. -	Harris GT/343.9	V2	084. -	Miller 2,3,4/187	P1
035. -		I1	085. -	Miller 5/187	P1
036. -		I1	086. -	Miller 8/187	I2
037. -		I1	087. -	Miller 9/187	I2
038. -		I1	088. -	Miller 9/187	P2
039. -		I1	089. -	Miller 12/187	V2
040. -		I1	090. -	Miller 13/187	P2
041. -		I1	091. -	Miller 14/187	P2
042. -		I1	092. -		I1
043. -		I1	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -		I1
045. -		I1	095. -		I1
046. -	Pentecost 401.8	P3	096. -		I1
047. -	Pentecost 401.8	I2	097. -		I1
048. -		I1	098. -		I1
049. -		I1	099. -		I1
050. -		I1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Hanna LC 51/271	P1
102. -		I1	152. -	Hanna LC 52/271	P1
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -	Bible	B2	154. -	Hanna LC 54/271	P1
105. -		I1	155. -		I1
106. -		I1	156. -		I1
107. -		I1	157. -	Hanna LC 56/271	P3
108. -		I1	158. -	Hanna LC 57/271	B1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -		I1	162. -		I1
113. -		I1	163. -		I1
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -	Bible	B2	165. -		I1
116. -		I1	166. -		I1
117. -		I1	167. -	Hanna LC 59/271	B1
118. -		I1	168. -	Hanna LC 64a/271	I2
119. -		I1	169. -		I1
120. -		I1	170. -		I1
121. -		I1	171. -		I1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -	Bible	B2	173. -		I1
124. -	Bible	B2	174. -		I1
125. -		I1	175. -		I1
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -		I1	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -		I1	180. -		I1
131. -		I1	181. -		I1
132. -	Bible	B2	182. -		I1
133. -	Bible	B2	183. -		I1
134. -	Bible	B2	184. -		I1
135. -	Bible	B2	185. -	Hanna LC/61/271	P1
136. -	Bible	B2	186. -		I1
137. -		I1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -		I1	189. -		I1
140. -		I1	190. -	Hanna LC/62/271	B1
141. -		I1	191. -	Hanna LC/64b/271	B1
142. -		I1	192. -		I1
143. -		I1	193. -		I1
144. -		I1	194. -		I1
145. -		I1	195. -		I1
146. -	Bible	B2	196. -		I1
147. -		I1	197. -		I1
148. -		I1	198. -		I1
149. -		I1	199. -		I1
150. -		I1	200. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 37

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -		
202. -		I1	252. -		
203. -		I1	253. -		
204. -		I1	254. -		
205. -	Hanna LC/65/271	B1	255. -		
206. -	Hanna LC/66/271	P3	256. -		
207. -	Hanna LC/67/271	B1	257. -		
208. -	C/87.8	P2	258. -		
209. -	Hanna LC/69/271	P3	259. -		
210. -	Hanna LC/72/272	B1	260. -		
211. -	Hanna LC/74/272	B1	261. -		
212. -		I1	262. -		
213. -	Hanna LC/78/272	B1	263. -		
214. -		I1	264. -		
215. -	Hanna LC/80/272	B1	265. -		
216. -		I1	266. -		
217. -	Bible	B2	267. -		
218. -			268. -		
219. -			269. -		
220. -			270. -		
221. -			271. -		
222. -			272. -		
223. -			273. -		
224. -			274. -		
225. -			275. -		
226. -			276. -		
227. -			277. -		
228. -			278. -		
229. -			279. -		
230. -			280. -		
231. -			281. -		
232. -			282. -		
233. -			283. -		
234. -			284. -		
235. -			285. -		
236. -			286. -		
237. -			287. -		
238. -			288. -		
239. -			289. -		
240. -			290. -		
241. -			291. -		
242. -			292. -		
243. -			293. -		
244. -			294. -		
245. -			295. -		
246. -			296. -		
247. -			297. -		
248. -			298. -		
249. -			299. -		
250. -			300. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.		I1	051.		I1
002.		I1	052.		I1
003.		I1	053.		I1
004.	March DSM 2b/183	P2	054.		I1
005.	March DSM 3/183	P2	055.		I1
006.		I1	056.		I1
007.		I1	057.		I1
008.		I1	058.	Cumming SR-J 5,6/89	P1
009.		I1	059.	Cumming SR-J 8/89	P3
010.		I1	060.	Cumming SR-J 6/89	P2
011.	March WHJ 1/99	I2	061.	Cumming SR-J 6,7/89	I2
012.	March WHJ 2/99	B1	062.	Cumming SR-J 7,8/89	P2
013.		I1	063.		I1
014.	Pentecost BS 8/3	I2	064.		I1
015.		I1	065.	Cumming SR-J 2/90	P2
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.		I1	067.		I1
018.		I1	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.		I1
020.	Farrar LC 303.1	P1	070.		I1
021.		I1	071.		I1
022.		I1	072.	Cumming SR-J9,10/88	B1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.		I1	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.	Cumming SR-J 10/88	P2
026.	Wayland SBC 245.1	P2	076.		I1
027.	Bible	B2	077.	Cumming SR-J 11c/88	P2
028.		I1	078.	Cumming SR-J 11c/88	P2
029.	Hanna LC 35/278	P3	079.		I1
030.	Hanna LC 35/278	B1	080.		I1
031.	Hanna LC 36/278	P1	081.		I1
032.	Bible	B2	082.		I1
033.	Hanna LC 38,39/279	B1	083.		I1
034.	Hanna LC 40/279	P2	084.		I1
035.	Bible	B2	085.		I1
036.	Bible	B2	086.		I1
037.	Bible	B2	087.		I1
038.	Pentecost BS 9.5	P2	088.		I1
039.		I1	089.		I1
040.		I1	090.		I1
041.		I1	091.		I1
042.		I1	092.		I1
043.		I1	093.		I1
044.	Bible	B2	094.		I1
045.	Cumming SR-J2,4a/89	P1	095.	Wayland SBC 8/246	P1
046.		I1	096.	Wayland SBC 9/246	P3
047.		I1	097.		I1
048.			098.	Wayland SBC 10/246	V2
049.		I1	099.		I1
050.	Farrar LC 303.3	I2	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 39

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Wayland SBC 23/247	P1
102. -	Wayland SBC 10/246	P2	152. -		I1
103. -	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	153. -	Wayland SBC 18/247	P2
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -	Wayland SBC 11/246	P2	155. -	Bible	B2
106. -	Wayland SBC 12/246	P2	156. -	Bible	B2
107. -	Bible	B2	157. -	Bible	B2
108. -	Bible	B2	158. -	Bible	B2
109. -		I1	159. -		
110. -		I1	160. -		
111. -		I1	161. -		
112. -		I1	162. -		
113. -		I1	163. -		
114. -		I1	164. -		
115. -		I1	165. -		
116. -		I1	166. -		
117. -	Wayland SBC 17/246	I2	167. -		
118. -		I1	168. -		
119. -		I1	169. -		
120. -		I1	170. -		
121. -		I1	171. -		
122. -		I1	172. -		
123. -		I1	173. -		
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -		I1	178. -		
129. -		I1	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -	Wayland SBC 22/247	I2	181. -		
132. -		I1	182. -		
133. -	Wayland SBC 33/247	P2	183. -		
134. -		I1	184. -		
135. -		I1	185. -		
136. -	Wayland SBC 248.2	P2	186. -		
137. -		I1	187. -		
138. -		I1	188. -		
139. -		I1	189. -		
140. -		I1	190. -		
141. -		I1	191. -		
142. -		I1	192. -		
143. -		I1	193. -		
144. -		I1	194. -		
145. -		I1	195. -		
146. -		I1	196. -		
147. -		I1	197. -		
148. -		I1	198. -		
149. -		I1	199. -		
150. -	Wayland SBC 22/247	P2	200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 46

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	M/34,40/149,150	P2	049. -		I1
002. -	March WHJ/46/150	V2	050. -		I1
003a. -	March WHJ/47/150	P1	051. -		I1
003b. -	March WHJ/48/150	P1	052. -		I1
004. -	March WHJ/42/150	P1	053. -		I1
005. -	March WHJ/55/152	P2	054. -	March WHJ/97/158	I2
	(HannaLC/16,17/330)		055. -	Fleetwood LC/5/182	P2
006. -		I1	056. -		I1
007. -	March WHJ/49/151	V2	057. -		I1
008. -	March WHJ/50/151	P1	058. -	Bible	B2
009. -		I1	059. -		I1
010. -	March WHJ/51/151	P3	060. -	March WHJ/8/145	P2
011. -		I1	061. -	March WHJ/102/159	I2
012. -	March WHJ/67,68/154	P2	062. -		I1
013. -	March WHJ/71/154	P1	063. -		I1
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -		I1
016. -	March WHJ/66/154	I2	066. -	Nicoll/ISLJC/42.2	P2
017. -		I1	067. -		I1
018. -		I1	068. -		I1
019. -	March WHJ/68/154	I2	069. -		I1
020. -	March WHJ/70,71/154	I2	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -	Cumming SR-Mt/163.9	P2	073. -		I1
024. -	March WHJ/72/155	P2	074. -		I1
025. -	March WHJ/72/155	P2	075. -	Fleetwood LC/2/182	P3
026. -	March WHJ/73/155	P1	076. -		I1
027. -	March WHJ/74,75/155	P2	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -	March WHJ/75,76/155	P2	079. -		I1
030. -	March WHJ/75/155	P2	080. -		I1
031. -	March WHJ/76/155	I2	081. -		I1
032. -	March WHJ/77/155	P1	082. -		I1
033. -	March WHJ/78/155	P2	083. -	March WHJ/97/158	P1
034. -	March WHJ/78/155	I2	084. -	Bible	B2
035. -	Hanna LC/30/331	P2	085. -	March WHJ/86,90/157	P1
036. -	March WHJ/79/155	I2	086. -	Hanna LC/42-44/332	P1
037. -		I1	087. -	Hanna LC/46/332	P2
038. -		I1	088. -	Hanna LC/46/332	P1
039. -		I1	089. -		
040. -	Bible	B2	090. -		
041. -		I1	091. -		
042. -		I1	092. -		
043. -		I1	093. -		
044. -		I1	094. -		
045. -		I1	095. -		
046. -		I1	096. -		
047. -		I1	097. -		
048. -		I1	098. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 53

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -	H/33/405	I2
002. -	H/63/407	P2	052. -	H/31/405	P2
003. -		I1	053. -	H/34,35/405	B1
004. -	H/62/407	P3	054. -	H/37/405	B1
005. -	H/413.5	P2	055. -	H/37/405	B1
006. -		I1	056. -	Bible	B2
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -	H/63-65/407	P3	058. -		I1
009. -		I1	059. -	H/40/405	I2
010. -	H/67,68/408	P2	060. -		I1
011. -		I1	061. -		I1
012. -	Bible	B2	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -		I1
014. -		I1	064. -		I1
015. -		I1	065. -	H/412.7	B1
016. -		I1	066. -	H/414.6	P2
017. -		I1	067. -	H/415.1	P1
018. -		I1	068. -	Bible	B2
019. -		I1	069. -		I1
020. -		I1	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -		I1	072. -		I1
023. -		I1	073. -	H/70,73/408	P2
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -		I1
026. -		I1	076. -		I1
027. -		I1	077. -		I1
028. -		I1	078. -		I1
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -		I1	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -	Bible	B2
035. -		I1	085. -	Bible	B2
036. -		I1	086. -		I1
037. -		I1	087. -	Bible	B2
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -	Bible	B2	090. -	Bible	B2
041. -		I1	091. -	L/441.5	P1
042. -		I1	092. -	L/441.5	B1
043. -	H/20/404	P1	093. -	Bible	B2
044. -		I1	094. -	Bible	B2
045. -		I1	095. -		I1
046. -		I1	096. -		I1
047. -		I1	097. -		I1
048. -	H/29,32/405	P2	098. -		I1
049. -	H/32/405	I2	099. -		I1
050. -	H/23/404	P1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 53

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.		I1	151.		I1
102.		I1	152.		I1
103.		I1	153.		I1
104.		I1	154.		I1
105.	Bible	B2	155.	Bible	B2
106.		I1	156.	Bible	B2
107.		I1	157.		I1
108.		I1	158.		I1
109.		I1	159.		I1
110.		I1	160.		I1
111.		I1	161.		I1
112.		I1	162.		I1
113.	Bible	B2	163.		I1
114.	Bible	B2	164.		I1
115.		I1	165.		I1
116.		I1	166.	Bible	B2
117.		I1	167.		I1
118.		I1	168.		I1
119.		I1	169.		I1
120.		I1	170.		I1
121.		I1	171.		I1
122.		I1	172.		I1
123.	Bible	B2	173.		I1
124.		I1	174.		I1
125.		I1	175.		I1
126.		I1	176.	H/415.4	P2
127.		I1	177.	H/421.2	P1
128.		I1	178.	G/637.4	I2
129.		I1	179.		I1
130.		I1	180.		I1
131.		I1	181.		I1
132.		I1	182.	H/424.7-9	P1
133.		I1	183.	H/426.7-427.4	P2
134.		I1	184.		I1
135.	Bible	B2	185.	Bible	B2
136.		I1	186.	Bible	B2
137.		I1	187.	Bible	B2
138.	Bible	B2	188.		I1
139.		I1	189.		I1
140.		I1	190.		I1
141.		I1	191.		I1
142.		I1	192.	Bible	B2
143.	Bible	B2	193.	Bible	B2
144.		I1	194.		
145.		I1	195.		
146.		I1	196.		
147.		I1	197.		
148.		I1	198.		
149.		I1	199.		
150.		I1	200.		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	Bible	B2	051.	Geikie LC/713.1	P2
002.	Bible	B2	052.		I1
003.	Bible	B2	053.		I1
004.		I1	054.	Bible	B2
005.	March WHJ/3/307	P2	055.	Bible	B2
006.	March WHJ/3,4/307	P1	056.	Hanna LC/24/614	P2
007.	March WHJ/3,4/307	P2	057.		I1
008.	March WHJ/4/307	P1	058.		I1
009.	Pentecost(88)/123.2	P1	059.		I1
010.		I1	060.	Bible	B2
011.		I1	061.		I1
012.	Pentecost(88)/123.2	P3	062.	Bible	B2
013.		I1	063.	Bible	B2
014.		I1	064.	Hanna LC/56/616	P2
015.	Lange LOLJC/126.7	P2	065.		I1
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.		I1	067.	Pentecost(89)/155.9	P1
018.		I1	068.		I1
019.	Jones LSFG/342.5	P3	069.		I1
020.	Farrar LC/561.2	P1	070.	Hanna LC/89/618	I2
021.	Jones LSFG/342.7	P1	071.		I1
022.		I1	072.	Hanna LC/89/618	P1
023.		I1	073.		I1
024.		I1	074.		I1
025.		I1	075.	Hanna LC/90/618	P3
026.		I1	076.		I1
027.		I1	077.		I1
028.	Bible	B2	078.	Hanna LC/64/616	P1
029.	Bible	B2	079.	Hanna LC/65/616	I2
030.	Bible	B2	080.	Hanna LC/67/616	P1
031.		I1	081.	Hanna LC/71/617	P1
032.		I1	082.	Hanna LC/71/617	I2
033.		I1	083.		I1
034.		I1	084.		I1
035.		I1	085.		I1
036.	Bible	B2	086.		I1
037.		I1	087.		I1
038.		I1	088.		I1
039.	Bible	B2	089.		I1
040.	Hanna LC/33/615	P2	090.		I1
041.	Hanna LC/16/614	P2	091.		I1
042.	Hanna LC/19/614	I2	092.		I1
043.	Hanna LC/19,20/614	P2	093.		I1
044.		I1	094.		I1
045.		I1	095.		I1
046.	Hanna LC/21,22/614	P1	096.		I1
047.		I1	097.		I1
048.	Hanna LC/23/614	P2	098.		I1
049.	Hanna LC/29/614	I2	099.	Cumming MW(3)/35.4	P1
050.	Pentecost(88)121.9	P2	100.		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 72

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -		I1
102. -	Cumming MW(3)/35.4	P1	152. -	Bible	B2
103. -	Bible	B2	153. -		I1
104. -	Bible	B2	154. -		I1
105. -	Bible	B2	155. -		I1
106. -		I1	156. -		I1
107. -		I1	157. -		I1
108. -		I1	158. -		I1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -		I1	162. -		I1
113. -		I1	163. -		I1
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -		I1	166. -	Bible	B2
117. -		I1	167. -		I1
118. -		I1	168. -		I1
119. -		I1	169. -	Bible	B2
120. -		I1	170. -	Bible	B2
121. -		I1	171. -		I1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -		I1	173. -		I1
124. -		I1	174. -		I1
125. -		I1	175. -		I1
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -		I1	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -		I1	180. -		I1
131. -		I1	181. -	Bible	B2
132. -		I1	182. -		I1
133. -		I1	183. -		I1
134. -	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	184. -		I1
135. -	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	185. -	Bible	B2
136. -	Boyd WH/565.1	I2	186. -	Bible	B2
137. -		I1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -	Boyd WH/565.1	P2	189. -		I1
140. -		I1	190. -		I1
141. -		I1	191. -		I1
142. -		I1	192. -		I1
143. -	Boyd WH/566.2	P1	193. -		I1
144. -	Boyd WH/566.2	P2	194. -		I1
145. -	Boyd WH/566.2	P1	195. -		I1
146. -	Boyd WH/566.2	I2	196. -		I1
147. -		I1	197. -		I1
148. -		I1	198. -		I1
149. -	Bible	B2	199. -		I1
150. -	Bible	B2	200. -		I1
			201. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	<u>Farrar LC/10/596</u>	P1	051.	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	I2
002.	<u>Bennett LHJC/361.2</u>	P2	052.	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	P1
003.	<u>Bennett LHJC/361.1</u>	P1	053.	<u>Bennett LHJC/364.6</u>	P2
004.	<u>Farrar LC/10/596</u>	P2	054.		I1
005.	<u>Geikie LC/744.9</u>	P1	055.		I1
006.	<u>March WHJ/7/310</u>	P2	056.		I1
007.	<u>March WHJ/7/310</u>	P1	057.		I1
008.	<u>Edersheim LTJM547.7</u>	P3	058.		I1
009.	<u>Edersheim LTJM547.7</u>	P2	059.		I1
010.	<u>Hanna LC/10/633</u>	V2	060.		I1
011.	<u>Andrews LOL/511.2</u>	P1	061.		I1
012.	<u>Andrews LOL/511.2</u>	P1	062.		I1
013.		I1	063.		I1
014.		I1	064.		I1
015.		I1	065.		I1
016.		I1	066.		I1
017.		I1	067.		I1
018.		I1	068.		I1
019.		I1	069.		I1
020.	<u>Hanna LC/17b/664</u>	P1	070.		I1
021.	<u>Deems WWJ/641.9</u>	P1	071.	<u>Farrar LC/68a/602</u>	I2
022.	<u>Deems WWJ/641.9</u>	P1	072.	<u>Hanna LC/48/666</u>	P1
023.		I1	073.	<u>Hanna LC/11/663</u>	P2
024.	<u>Hanna LC/16,17a/664</u>	P1	074.		I1
025.	<u>Hanna LC/18,19/664</u>	P2	075.		I1
026.	<u>Hanna LC/20/664</u>	P2	076.		I1
027.	<u>Hanna LC/23/664</u>	P2	077.		I1
028.	<u>Hanna LC/23,24/664</u>	P1	078.		I1
029.	<u>Hanna LC/24/664</u>	P1	079.		I1
030.	<u>Hanna LC/25/664</u>	B1	080.		I1
031.	<u>Farrar LC/59a/602</u>	P2	081.		I1
032.		I1	082.		I1
033.		I1	083.		I1
034.	<u>Farrar LC/59b/602</u>	P2	084.		I1
035.	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	P1	085.		I1
036.	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	V2	086.	<u>Bible</u>	B2
037.		I1	087.	<u>Farrar LC/69,70/602</u>	P1
038.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	088.	<u>Farrar LC/69/602</u>	P1
039.	<u>Hanna LC/29/665</u>	P1	089.		I1
040.		I1	090.	<u>March WHJ/1,8/310</u>	P1
041.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	091.	<u>Hanna LC/12,16/663</u>	I2
042.	<u>Hanna LC/34/665</u>	P1	092.	<u>Hanna LC/46/666</u>	P1
043.	<u>Hanna LC/36/665</u>	I2	093.	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.2,7</u>	P2
044.	<u>Hanna LC/37/665</u>	P2	094.	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.7</u>	P2
045.	<u>Bible</u>	B2	095.	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.7</u>	P1
046.		I1	096.		I1
047.	<u>Hanna LC/42-44/666</u>	I2	097.		I1
048.		I1	098.	<u>Ingraham PHD/360.7</u>	V2
049.		I1	099.	<u>Ingraham PHD/361.1</u>	P2
050.	<u>Harris GT/340.2</u>	V2	100.	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.3</u>	P1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/359.3</u>	I2	151. -	<u>Hall HPONT/575a.5</u>	V2
102. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/360.7</u>	I2	152. -		I1
103. -		I1	153. -	<u>Krummacher SS/178.3</u>	P1
104. -		I1	154. -	<u>Hanna LC/64/667</u>	I2
105. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/360.8</u>	P1	155. -		I1
106. -	<u>Ingraham PHD 361.1</u>	P2	156. -		I1
107. -	<u>Edersheim LTJM/558.5</u>	I2	157. -		I1
108. -		I1	158. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -	<u>Krummacher SS/176.9</u>	P1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -	<u>Hanna LC/50/666</u>	I2	162. -		I1
113. -	<u>Farrar LIC/79/603</u>	P2	163. -		I1
114. -	<u>Farrar LC/82/604</u>	P1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -	<u>Hanna LC/49/666</u>	P2	166. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
117. -		I1	167. -	<u>Hanna LC/70/667</u>	P1
118. -		I1	168. -		I1
119. -	<u>Hanna LC/50/666</u>	I2	169. -	<u>Hanna LC/70/667</u>	I2
120. -	<u>Farrar LC/71/615</u>	P2	170. -		I1
121. -		I1	171. -		I1
122. -		I1	172. -		I1
123. -	<u>Farrar LC/88b/664</u>	P1	173. -		I1
124. -		I1	174. -		I1
125. -	<u>Bennett LHJC/365.9</u>	B1	175. -		I1
126. -		I1	176. -		I1
127. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	177. -		I1
128. -		I1	178. -		I1
129. -		I1	179. -		I1
130. -		I1	180. -		I1
131. -		I1	181. -		I1
132. -		I1	182. -	<u>FarrarLC/116-120/606</u>	P1
133. -		I1	183. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
134. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2	184. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
135. -		I1	185. -	<u>Bible</u>	B2
136. -		I1	186. -		I1
137. -	<u>Hall HPONT 574b.8</u>	P1	187. -		I1
138. -		I1	188. -		I1
139. -	<u>Farrar LC/95/605</u>	P1	189. -		I1
140. -	<u>Kitto DBI/407.9</u>	P1	190. -		I1
141. -	<u>Farrar LC/97,98/605</u>	P1	191. -	<u>Bennett LHJC/369.2</u>	P2
142. -	<u>Farrar LC/101/605</u>	P1	192. -		I1
143. -	<u>Kitto DBI/408.3</u>	V2	193. -		I1
144. -	<u>Kitto DBI/408.3</u>	P1	194. -		I1
145. -	<u>Farrar LC/107/605</u>	P2	195. -		I1
146. -	<u>Farrar LC/107,108/605</u>	B1	196. -	<u>Farrar LC/606</u>	I2
147. -	<u>Farrar LC/109b/605</u>	P1	197. -		I1
148. -	<u>Kitto DBI/407.9</u>	B1	198. -		I1
149. -	<u>Jones LSFG/362.4</u>	I2	199. -		I1
150. -	<u>Farrar LC/113/606</u>	P1	200. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
201. -		I1	251. -	Bible	B2
202. -		I1	252. -	Hanna LC/24,30/654	P1
203. -		I1	253. -		I1
204. -		I1	254. -	Farrar LC/10/609	P2
205. -		I1	255. -	Hanna LC/79/656	I2
206. -		I1	256. -	Hanna LC/78-80/656	P1
207. -		I1	257. -	Hanna LC/80/656	P1
208. -		I1	258. -		I1
209. -		I1	259. -	Hanna LC/71,74/656	P2
210. -		I1	260. -	Hanna LC/69,70/656	I2
211. -	Farrar LC/606	P2	261. -	Hanna LC/56-60/655	P1
212. -		I1	262. -	Hanna LC/87/656	I2
213. -		I1	263. -	Hanna LC/87/656	P2
214. -		I1	264. -	Hanna LC/87/656	P1
215. -	Bennett LHJC/372.7	P1	265. -	Hanna LC/87/656	I2
216. -	Bennett LHJC/372.7	I2	266. -		I1
217. -		I1	267. -	Hanna LC/64/655	P3
218. -		I1	268. -	Hanna LC/70/656	I2
219. -		I1	269. -		I1
220. -		I1	270a. -	Hanna LC/73/656	P1
221. -		I1	270b. -	Bennett LHJC/377.2	P2
222. -		I1	271. -		I1
223. -	Farrar LC/2/608	P2	272. -	Bible	B2
224. -	Farrar LC/2/608	P1	273. -		I1
225. -	Farrar LC/3/608	P2	274. -	Farrar LC/33,36/611	B1
226. -	Farrar LC/8/608	I2	275. -	Bible	B2
227. -	Farrar LC/3/608	I2	276. -		I1
228. -		I1	277. -		I1
229. -	Farrar LC/52/612	I2	278. -	Bible	B2
230. -	Farrar LC/52/612	I2	279. -		I1
231. -	Farrar LC/53/612	P1	280. -	HannaLC/87-100/656+	P1
232. -	Farrar LC/53/612	P1	281. -		I1
233. -		I1	282. -	HannaLC/101,102/657	I2
234. -		I1	283. -	Farrar LC/42-44/612	P2
235. -	Farrar LC/6/608	P1	284. -	Hanna LC/93,94/657	P1
236. -	March WHJ/10/311	P1	285. -	Hanna LC/93,94/657	P1
237. -	Farrar LC/9/609	P1	286. -	Hanna LC/113/658	I2
238. -		I1	287. -	Hanna LC/114/658	I2
239. -	Farrar LC/10/609	I2	288. -	Hanna LC/108/658	I2
240. -	Farrar LC/15/609	P1	289. -	Hanna LC/119/658	P1
241. -	Hanna LC/8/653	P1	290. -	Hanna LC/106/657	P2
242. -	Hanna LC/8,10/653,4	B1	291. -	Hanna LC/120/658	B1
243. -	Hanna LC/9/653	P1	292. -	Hanna LC/112/658	P2
244. -	Hanna LC/9/653	P2	293. -		I1
245. -	Hanna LC/11,12/654	P1	294. -	Hanna LC/121/658	P1
246. -	Hanna LC/13-16/654	I2	295. -	HannaLC/122,123/659	I2
247. -	Farrar LC/17/609	P2	296. -	Hanna LC/126/659	P1
248. -	Hanna LC/17/654	B1	297. -		I1
249. -	Hanna LC/17,18/654	P1	298. -	Hanna LC/126/659	I2
250. -	Hanna LC/21,22/654	I2	299. -		I1
			300. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 75

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
301. -		I1	351. -		
302. -		I1	352. -		
303. -	<u>Hanna LC/126/659</u>	I2	353. -		
304. -		I1	354. -		
305. -		I1	355. -		
306. -		I1	356. -		
307. -		I1	357. -		
308. -		I1	358. -		
309. -		I1	359. -		
310. -		I1	360. -		
311. -		I1	361. -		
312. -		I1	362. -		
313. -		I1	363. -		
314. -		I1	364. -		
315. -		I1	365. -		
316. -	<u>Farrar LC/78/615</u>	I2	366. -		
317. -	<u>Farrar LC/77/615</u>	P2	367. -		
318. -	<u>Farrar LC/79a/615</u>	P1	368. -		
319. -	<u>Farrar LC/79b/615</u>	P2	369. -		
320. -	<u>Farrar LC/79b/615</u>	P2	370. -		
321. -		I1	371. -		
322. -	<u>Farrar LC/80/615</u>	P1	372. -		
323. -		I1	373. -		
324. -	<u>Farrar LC/86,87/616</u>	B1	374. -		
325. -	<u>Farrar LC/88/616</u>	B1	375. -		
326. -	<u>Farrar LC/89/616</u>	B1	376. -		
327. -	<u>Farrar LC/90/616</u>	B1	377. -		
328. -	<u>Farrar LC/91/616</u>	B1	378. -		
329. -	<u>Farrar LC/92a/616</u>	I2	379. -		
330. -	<u>Farrar LC/92b/616</u>	P2	380. -		
331. -	<u>Farrar LC/93/617</u>	P1	381. -		
332. -	<u>Farrar LC/93/617</u>	P2	382. -		
333. -		I1	383. -		
334. -		I1	384. -		
335. -	<u>Hanna LC/82/668</u>	I2	385. -		
336. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/361.7</u>	P1	386. -		
337. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.8</u>	P1	387. -		
338. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.9</u>	P2	388. -		
339. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/366.9</u>	P2	389. -		
340. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/367.3</u>	P1	390. -		
341. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/367.4</u>	P2	391. -		
342. -		I1	392. -		
343. -		I1	393. -		
344. -		I1	394. -		
345. -		I1	395. -		
346. -	<u>Ingraham PHD/368.7</u>	P1	396. -		
347. -		I1	397. -		
348. -		I1	398. -		
349. -		I1	399. -		
350. -		I1	400. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 76

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -		I1	051. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/95/77</u>	P3
002. -		I1	052. -	<u>Eder LTJM/75,76/473</u>	P1
003. -		I1	053. -	<u>Eder LTJM/76,77/473</u>	P1
004. -		I1	054. -		I1
005. -		I1	055. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77a/473</u>	P3
006. -		I1	056. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77b/473</u>	P1
007. -		I1	057. -		I1
008. -		I1	058. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	I2
009. -	<u>Hanna LC/110/649</u>	P2	059. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P3
010. -	<u>Hanna LC/84/648</u>	P3	060. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P2
011. -	<u>Hanna LC/83/648</u>	P2	061. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P1
012. -		I1	062. -		I1
013. -		I1	063. -		I1
014. -	<u>Eder LTJM/68,69/473</u>	P1	064. -		I1
015. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	065. -		I1
016. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	066. -		I1
017. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	067. -		I1
018. -	<u>Eder LTJM/69/473</u>	P2	068. -		I1
019. -	<u>Eder LTJM/73,74/473</u>	P2	069. -		I1
020. -		I1	070. -		I1
021. -		I1	071. -		I1
022. -	<u>Dods EB/55/96</u>	P2	072. -		I1
023. -		I1	073. -		I1
024. -		I1	074. -		I1
025. -		I1	075. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/77c/473</u>	P2
026. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/74/473</u>	P1	076. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/82/474</u>	P2
027. -		I1	077. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/82/474</u>	B1
028. -		I1	078. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/91/475</u>	I2
029. -		I1	079. -		I1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/50/472</u>	P3	081. -		I1
032. -		I1	082. -		I1
033. -		I1	083. -		I1
034. -		I1	084. -		I1
035. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	085. -		I1
036. -	<u>Dods EB/57a/96</u>	I2	086. -		I1
037. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	087. -		I1
038. -	<u>Dods EB/57b/96</u>	I2	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -		I1
040. -		I1	090. -		I1
041. -		I1	091. -		I1
042. -	<u>Hanna LC/93/648</u>	P2	092. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/88/474</u>	P2
043. -		I1	093. -		I1
044. -		I1	094. -		I1
045. -	<u>Dods EB/93,94/101</u>	I2	095. -		I1
046. -		I1	096. -		I1
047. -		I1	097. -		I1
048. -		I1	098. -		I1
049. -	<u>Eder LTJM/92,93/77</u>	P2	099. -	<u>Edersh LTJM/88/474</u>	P2
050. -		I1	100. -		I1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 76

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
101. -		I1	151. -	Bible	B2
102. -		I1	152. -	Bible	B2
103. -		I1	153. -		I1
104. -		I1	154. -		I1
105. -	Edersh LTJM/89/474	P2	155. -		I1
106. -	Hanna LC/103/649	P3	156. -		I1
107. -		I1	157. -		I1
108. -		I1	158. -		I1
109. -		I1	159. -		I1
110. -		I1	160. -		I1
111. -		I1	161. -		I1
112. -		I1	162. -		I1
113. -		I1	163. -		I1
114. -		I1	164. -		I1
115. -		I1	165. -		I1
116. -	Edersh LTJM/52/475	P3	166. -	Hanna LC/125/650	P1
117. -	Farrar LC/556.6	P3	167. -	Ingraham PHD/1/402	P2
118. -	Farrar LC/556.6	P3	168. -	Ing PHD/12,13/402+	P1
119. -	Edersh LTJM/53/475	P3	169. -	Ingraham PHD/1/403	P1
120. -		I1	170. -	Ingrah PHD/2,3/403	P1
121. -		I1	171. -	Ingrah PHD/2,3/403	P1
122. -		I1	172. -	Ingraham PHD/4/403	I2
123. -		I1	173. -	Ingraham PHD/7/403	P2
124. -		I1	174. -		
125. -		I1	175. -		
126. -		I1	176. -		
127. -		I1	177. -		
128. -	Dods EB/99.7	P3	178. -		
129. -	Hanna LC/112/649	P2	179. -		
130. -		I1	180. -		
131. -		I1	181. -		
132. -	Smith BD/320a.8	P3	182. -		
133. -	Smith BD/320a.8	P3	183. -		
134. -		I1	184. -		
135. -	Hanna LC/42,43/645	P2	185. -		
136. -		I1	186. -		
137. -		I1	187. -		
138. -	Hanna LC/122/650	P2	188. -		
139. -		I1	189. -		
140. -		I1	190. -		
141. -	Hanna LC/124/650	P3	191. -		
142. -		I1	192. -		
143. -		I1	193. -		
144. -		I1	194. -		
145. -		I1	195. -		
146. -	Bible	B2	196. -		
147. -		I1	197. -		
148. -		I1	198. -		
149. -		I1	199. -		
150. -		I1	200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 83

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
001. -	March NS/17/415	P1	045. -		I1
02a. -	Hanna LC/10/795	P1	046. -		I1
02b. -	Hanna LC/11/795	I2	047. -		I1
003. -		I1	048. -		I1
004. -	Hanna LC/33/796	P2	049. -		I1
005. -	March NS/17/415	I2	050. -		I1
006. -	March NS/18/415	I2	051. -		I1
007. -	March NS/7,9/413-4	P2	052. -		I1
008. -		I1	053. -		I1
09a. -	March NS/21/415	P1	054. -		I1
09b. -	Hanna LC/17/795	P2	055. -		I1
010. -	March NS/22/415	P2	056. -		I1
11a. -	Hanna LC/24/795	B1	057. -		I1
11b. -	Hanna LC/32/796	P2	058. -		I1
012. -	Hanna LC/21/795	I2	059. -		I1
013. -	Hanna LC/23-26/795	I2	060. -		I1
014. -		I1	061. -	Bible	B2
15a. -		I1	062. -	March NS/31/416	I2
15b. -	Hanna LC/19-21/795	P2	063. -	March NS/27,30/416	P3
016. -	Hanna LC/66/798	I2	064. -	Hanna LC/98/800	I2
017. -	Bible	B2	065. -	March NS/30/416	P1
018. -	Bible	B2	066. -	March NS/29/416	P2
19a. -	Hanna LC/73/799	P1	067. -	March NS/32-35/416-7	P1
19b. -	Bible	B2	068. -	March NS/40/417	V2
19c. -	Bible	B2	069. -	Hanna LC/112/802	B1
020. -	Bible	B2	070. -	Hanna LC/114/802	P2
021. -	Hanna LC/80a/799	I2	071. -	Hanna LC/115/802	P2
022. -	Hanna LC/80b/799	I2	072. -	Bible	B2
023. -		I1	073. -	Hanna LC/116/802	B1
024. -		I1	074. -	Hanna LC/120/802	B1
025. -	Bible	B2	075. -	March NS/41/418	P1
026. -		I1	076. -	March NS/42/418	V2
027. -	Bible	B2	077. -	March NS/43b/418	P1
028. -	March NS/25a,24/416	P1	078. -	March NS/45,43b/418	P1
029. -		I1	079. -	March NS/43c/418	P1
030. -		I1	080. -		I1
031. -	March NS/25b/416	I2	081. -	March NS/44,47/418	I2
032. -	Hanna LC/86/799	B1	082. -	March NS/50,51/418	P1
033. -		I1	083. -	Hann LC/123,124/802	P2
034. -		I1	084. -	March NS/51/418	V2
035. -		I1	085. -	March NS/52/419	P1
036. -		I1	086. -	Hanna LC/126/802	P2
037. -		I1	087. -	March NS/53/419	P1
038. -		I1	088. -		I1
039. -		I1	089. -	March NS/56,57/419	P1
040. -	Hanna LC/87/799	P2	90a. -	March NS/58/419	P1
041. -	Hanna LC/88/800	I2	90b. -	Hanna LC/132/802	B1
042. -	Hanna LC/88/800	P3	091. -		I1
043. -	Hanna LC/95b/800	B1	092. -	Hanna LC/4/803	I2
044. -		I1	093. -	March NS/60,61/419	P1

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 83

No. -	Source	Dependency	No. -	Source	Dependency
094. -	March NS/60-63/419	P1	151. -		
095. -	March NS/69/420	P1	152. -		
096. -	Hanna LC/8/803	I2	153. -		
097. -	March NS/69/420	P2	154. -		
098. -	March NS/69/420	I2	155. -		
099. -	March NS/69, 72/420	P2	156. -		
100. -	March NS/64-66/419	I2	157. -		
101. -	March NS/65, 66/419	P1	158. -		
102. -	March NS/67/419	P1	159. -		
103. -	March NS/67/419	P2	160. -		
104. -		I1	161. -		
105. -		I1	162. -		
106. -	March NS/68/419	P2	163. -		
107. -	Hanna LC/10/803	P2	164. -		
108. -		I1	165. -		
109. -	March NS/71-74/420	P2	166. -		
117. -			167. -		
118. -			168. -		
119. -			169. -		
120. -			170. -		
121. -			171. -		
122. -			172. -		
123. -			173. -		
124. -			174. -		
125. -			175. -		
126. -			176. -		
127. -			177. -		
128. -			178. -		
129. -			179. -		
130. -			180. -		
131. -			181. -		
132. -			182. -		
133. -			183. -		
134. -			184. -		
135. -			185. -		
136. -			186. -		
137. -			187. -		
138. -			188. -		
139. -			189. -		
140. -			190. -		
141. -			191. -		
142. -			192. -		
143. -			193. -		
144. -			194. -		
145. -			195. -		
146. -			196. -		
147. -			197. -		
148. -			198. -		
149. -			199. -		
150. -			200. -		

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
001.	March NS/75/420	P1	051.	H LC/36,46c/804,806	P1
002.	March NS/76-78/420+	P1	052.	Hanna LC/48/806	B1
003.	March NS/78/421	P1	053.	Hanna LC/53/806	V2
004.	March NS/79/421	P1	054.	Hanna LC/54/806	P1
005.	March NS/79,80/421	P2	055.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
006.	March NS/81/421	P1	056.	Hanna LC/50/806	P2
007.	March NS/82/421	P1	057.	Hanna LC/50/806	I2
008.	March NS/82/421	P2	058.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
009.	March NS/83a/421	P1	059.	Hanna LC/48,56/806	P2
10a.	March NS/83b/421	P1	060.	Hanna LC/51/806	I2
10b.		I1	061.		I1
011.	March NS/85a/421	P2	062.	Hanna LC/57/807	I2
012.	Hanna LC/15/803	P1	063.	Hanna LC/58/807	B1
013.	March NS/84b/421	B1	064.	Hanna LC/60/807	P3
014.	March NS/85ab/421	P1	065.	Hanna LC/69a/808	I2
015.	March NS/86/421	P2	066.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
016.	March NS/88/422	V2	067.	Hanna LC/76/808	P2
017.	March NS/89/422	P1	068.		I1
018.	March NS/91/422	V2	069.	Bible	B2
019.	March NS/87,93/422	P1	070.		I1
020.	March NS/94/422	P2	071.		I1
021.		I1	072.		I1
022.	Bible	B2	073.		I1
023.	Bible	B2	074.		I1
024.	Bible	B2	075.	Bible	B2
025.	Bible	B2	076.		I1
026.	March NS/95/422	P1	077.		I1
027.	March NS/94/422	P2	078.	Hanna LC/77/808	P2
028.	Bible	B2	079.	Hanna LC/59/807	P2
029.	Bible	B2	080.	Hanna LC/77/808	I2
030.	Bible	B2	081.		I1
031.	March NS/99/422	B1	082.	Bible	B2
032.	Hanna LC/30/804	I2	083.		I1
033.	March NS/105/423	I2	084.	Hanna LC/88/809	I2
034.	Mar NS/102,105/422+	P1	085.	Hanna LC/93/810	P2
035.	March NS/110/423	P2	086.	Hanna LC/90/810	P2
036.	March NS/113/423	P2	087.	Hanna LC/89,90/809	P2
037.	March NS/114/423	B1	088.	Bible	B2
038.	March NS/147/426	P2	089.	Hanna LC/89/809	B1
039.	March NS/148/426	P1	090.		I1
040.	March NS/152/426	P1	091.		I1
041.	March NS/154/426	P2	092.		I1
042.	March NS/158/427	P2	093.	Hanna LC/59,77/807+	P2
043.	March NS/157/427	P2	094.	Han LC/87,78/809,08	P2
044.	March NS/156/427	I2	095.	Hanna LC/88/809	P2
045.	Bible	B2	096.	Hanna LC/78/808	P2
046.	Bible	B2	097.	Hanna LC/83,85/809	P2
047.	Bible	B2	098.		I1
048.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	099.	Hanna LC/1/811	P1
049.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1	100.	Hanna LC/7/811	P2
050.	Hanna LC/36/804	P1			

THE DESIRE OF AGES SENTENCE EVALUATIONS FOR CHAPTER 84

No.	Source	Dependency	No.	Source	Dependency
101.	Hanna LC/7,8/811-12	P3	151.		
102.	Han LC/7,22/811,812	P2	152.		
103.	Hanna LC/71/816	P2	153.		
104.	Hanna LC/7/811	P1	154.		
105.	Hanna LC/13/812	B1	155.		
106.	Hanna LC/56/815	P2	156.		
107.		I1	157.		
108.		I1	158.		
109.		I1	159.		
110.	Hanna LC/81,87/816	P2	160.		
111.		I1	161.		
112.	Bible	B2	162.		
113.	Hanna LC/89/817	B1	163.		
114.	Hanna LC/91,93/817	I2	164.		
115.	Hanna LC/91a/817	V2	165.		
116.	Hanna LC/91b/817	P1	166.		
117.	Hanna LC/93/817	P2	167.		
118.	Hanna LC/98/817	P2	168.		
119.	Hanna LC/100/817	P2	169.		
120.	Hanna LC/110-12/818	P2	170.		
121.	Hanna LC/115/818	I2	171.		
122.	Hanna LC/117/818	I2	172.		
123.	Hanna LC/118/818	P2	173.		
124.	Hanna LC/119/818	I2	174.		
125.		I1	175.		
126.		I1	176.		
127.		I1	177.		
128.		I1	178.		
129.		I1	179.		
130.	Hanna LC/132/819	P2	180.		
131.	Hanna LC/132/819	I2	181.		
132.	Han LC/133,136/819	P2	182.		
133.	Hanna LC/137/819	P1	183.		
134.	Han LC/135,137/819	P1	184.		
135.		I1	185.		
136.		I1	186.		
137.	Hanna LC/138/819	I2	187.		
138.			188.		
139.			189.		
140.			190.		
141.			191.		
142.			192.		
143.			193.		
144.			194.		
145.			195.		
146.			196.		
147.			197.		
148.			198.		
149.			199.		
150.			200.		

APPENDIX B

List of sentence evaluations for the pre-DA material quoted for each of the 15 chapters. The second column carries the evaluations. The third column gives the DA sentence number under which the earlier text appears.

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 3

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	MS(24)2	P2	23	051.	-	ST(90)26	P2	66
002.	-	MS(24)3	P3	23	052.	-	ST(90)29	I2	66
003.	-	ST(90)1	B1	27	053.	-	ST(90)30	B1	66
004.	-	ST(90)2	I2	27	054.	-	DA(MS)4/54:2	I2	69
005.	-	ST(90)5	P3	27	055.	-	RH(95)1	V2	69
006.	-	MS(24)4	P3	27	056.	-	RH(95)2	P3	69
007.	-	MS(24)20	P3	28	057.	-	RH(95)6a	I1	69
008.	-	MS(24)21	P2	28	058.	-	RH(95)6b	P1	69
009.	-	ST(90)7	I2	28	059.	-	RH(95)7	I2	69
010.	-	ST(90)3	I2	32	060.	-	RH(95)8	P2	69
011.	-	MS(24)16	P3	32	061.	-	RH(95)9	P2	69
012.	-	MS(24)17	P2	32	062.	-	RH(95)10	P2	69
013.	-	ST(98)3	V2	33	063.	-	Lt(43)28	P2	69
014.	-	MS(24)14	I2	34	064.	-	RH(95)11	I2	69
015.	-	ST(98)4	P3	34	065.	-	RH(95)12	P1	69
016.	-	ST(98)5	P3	34	066.	-	RH(95)13	I2	69
017.	-	ST(90)8	P3	35	067.	-	Lt(43)29	P2	70
018.	-	BE(97)10	P1	50	068.	-	RH(95)31	P2	71
019.	-	ST(90)10	B1	58	069.	-	RH(95)33	P3	76
020.	-	ST(90)11	B1	58	070.	-	RH(95)34	P3	99
021.	-	MS(24)5	P2	65	071.	-	Lt(43)9	P2	100
022.	-	FE2/399	P3	65	072.	-	RH(95)39	P2	103
023.	-	MS(24)1	P2	65	073.	-	RH(95)40	P1	105
024.	-	FE1/399	I2	66	074.	-	RH(95)41	P1	105
025.	-	BE(97)17	I2	66	075.	-	ST(94)1	P2	111
026.	-	BE(97)21	V2	66	076.	-	ST(94)2	B1	111
027.	-	FE3/400	P2	66	077.	-	ST(94)3	B1	111
028.	-	FE4/400	P2	66	078.	-	ST(94)4	I1	111
029.	-	BE(97)18	P2	66	079.	-	ST(94)5	I1	111
030.	-	BE(97)19	P1	66	080.	-	ST(94)6	I2	111
031.	-	FE5/400	P2	66	081.	-	ST(94)7	I2	111
032.	-	FE8/400	V2	66	082.	-	ST(94)8	I1	111
033.	-	FE9/400	B2	66	083.	-	ST(94)9	P3	111
034.	-	FE10/400	I2	66	084.	-	ST(94)10	I2	111
035.	-	FE11/400	P2	66	085.	-	ST(94)11	I2	111
036.	-	FE12/400	P3	66	086.	-	ST(94)12	I2	111
037.	-	FE13/400	P2	66	087.	-	ST(94)13	I2	111
038.	-	FE15/400	P2	66	088.	-	ST(94)14	I2	111
039.	-	FE17/400	P2	66	089.	-	ST(94)15	I2	112
040.	-	FE18/400+	I2	66	090.	-	ST(94)16a	I2	115
041.	-	FE19/401	P2	66	091.	-	ST(94)16b	I1	116
042.	-	FE20/401	P2	66	092.	-	ST(94)17	I2	122
043.	-	FE21/401	I2	66	093.	-	ST(94)18	I2	124
044.	-	FE22/401	I2	66	094.	-	ST(94)19	I2	124
045.	-	FE23/401	I2	66	095.	-	ST(94)20	B1	124
046.	-	ST(90)23	P2	66	096.	-	ST(94)21	P3	124
047.	-	ST(90)24	P3	66	097.	-	ST(94)22	P3	124
048.	-	ST(90)25	P3	66	098.	-	ST(94)23	P3	125
049.	-	FE24/401	P2	66	099.	-	ST(94)24	P2	125
050.	-	FE25/401	P2	66	100.	-	ST(94)25	B1	125

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 10

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	2SP 4/41	P2	5	051.	-	2SP 97/47	P2	141
002.	-	2SP 6/41	P2	5	052.	-	2SP 8/41	P2	141
003.	-	Vie 21/49	P1	5	053.	-	2SP 98/47+	P2	145
004.	-	Vie 22/49	P2	5	054.	-	2SP 101/48	P2	148
005.	-	Vie 23/49	V2	5	055.	-	2SP 103/48	I2	151
006.	-	Vie 24/49	P2	5	056.	-	2SP 110/49	I2	151
007.	-	Vie 25/49	P2	5	057.	-	2SP 108/48	P2	155
008.	-	Vie 26-28/49	T2	5	058.	-	2SP 106/48	P1	160
009.	-	Vie 29/49+	P1	5	059.	-	2SP 115/49	V2	160
010.	-	Vie 30/50	P1	5	060.	-	2SP 116/49	P1	161
011.	-	Vie 31/50	P2	5	061.	-	2SP 117/49	P1	162
012.	-	Vie 32/50	P1	5	062.	-	2SP 118/49	P2	164
013.	-	Vie 33-35/50	I1	5	063.	-	2SP 119/49	I2	164
014.	-	Vie 36/50	B1	5	064.	-	2SP 214/57	P1	230
015.	-	Vie 37/50	P1	6	065.	-	2SP 218/57	P2	230
016.	-	Vie 38/50	P2	6	066.	-	2SP 219/57	P2	230
017.	-	Vie 39/50	V2	6	067.	-	2SP 220/57	I2	230
018.	-	Vie 40/50	V2	6	068.	-	2SP 221/57	I2	230
019.	-	Vie 41/50	V2	6	069.	-			
020.	-	Vie 42/50	V2	6	070.	-			
021.	-	Vie 43/51	V2	6	071.	-			
022.	-	Vie 44/51	V2	6	072.	-			
023.	-	Vie 49/51	P2	10	073.	-			
024.	-	Vie 48/51	I1	11	074.	-			
025.	-	Vie 50/51	I1	12	075.	-			
026.	-	2SP 52/44	P1	19	076.	-			
027.	-	2SP 55/44	P1	21	077.	-			
028.	-	2SP 56/44	P2	21	078.	-			
029.	-	Vie 58/52	I2	21	079.	-			
030.	-	Vie 59/52	I1	21	080.	-			
031.	-	Vie 60/52	P1	21	081.	-			
032.	-	2SP 57/44+	B1	38	082.	-			
033.	-	2SP 58/45	P1	38	083.	-			
034.	-	2SP 59/45	V2	38	084.	-			
035.	-	2SP 60/45	P1	39	085.	-			
036.	-	2SP 61/45	P1	39	086.	-			
037.	-	Vie 45/51	P2	39	087.	-			
038.	-	2SP 66/45	P1	43	088.	-			
039.	-	2SP 96/47	I2	61	089.	-			
040.	-	YI (97) 26	P3	61	090.	-			
041.	-	YI (97) 27	P3	61	091.	-			
042.	-	YI (97) 8b	P2	87	092.	-			
043.	-	YI (97) 9	P2	87	093.	-			
044.	-	2SP 72/45+	P2	87	094.	-			
045.	-	2SP 73/46	P1	87	095.	-			
046.	-	2SP 75/46	P1	96	096.	-			
047.	-	YI (97) 1	I2	97	097.	-			
048.	-	YI (97) 12	P2	97	098.	-			
049.	-	2SP 84/46	P2	102	099.	-			
050.	-	2SP 89/46	P2	102	100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	1 RL 2/48	P2	12	051.	-	Di (90) 47	I1	60
002.	-	1 RL 3/48	I1	12	052.	-	Di (90) 48	I1	60
003.	-	1 RL 4/48	P2	12	053.	-	Di (90) 49	I1	60
004.	-	1 RL 6/48	B1	12	054.	-	Di (90) 50	I1	60
005.	-	1 RL 9/48	P1	12	055.	-	Di (90) 51	I1	60
006.	-	2 RL 39.7	P3	12	056.	-	Di (90) 52	I1	60
007.	-	2 RL 39.9+	P2	12	057.	-	Di (90) 53	I1	60
008.	-	2 RL 47.7	P2	7	058.	-	Di (90) 54	I1	60
009.	-	2 RL 47.8	P3	7	059.	-	Di (90) 55	I1	60
010.	-	2 SP 93/94	I2	7	060.	-	Di (90) 56	I1	60
011.	-	2 SP 94/94	I2	25	061.	-	Di (90) 57	I1	60
012.	-	2 SP 95/94	P2	25	062.	-	Di (90) 58	I1	60
013.	-	BE (92) 5	P2	25	063.	-	Di (90) 59	I1	60
014.	-	2 RL 48.6	P2	25	064.	-	Di (90) 60	I2	60
015.	-	1 RL 13/49	P2	32	065.	-	Di (90) 61	I1	60
016.	-	Lt (1a) 4	P1	50	066.	-	Di (90) 62	I2	60
017.	-	Lt (1a) 6	P1	50	067.	-	Di (90) 63	P1	60
018.	-	3T 482.6	P2	50	068.	-	Di (90) 64	I1	60
019.	-	Di (90) 15	I1	60	069.	-	2 RL 52.2	P1	66
020.	-	Di (90) 16	I1	60	070.	-	2 RL 51.5	P1	66
021.	-	Di (90) 17	I1	60	071.	-	2 SP 116a/96	P2	66
022.	-	Di (90) 18	I1	60	072.	-	2 SP 112/96	P2	66
023.	-	Di (90) 19	I1	60	073.	-	2 SP 111/95+	P2	69
024.	-	Di (90) 20	P1	60	074.	-	2 RL 52.3	P2	91
025.	-	Di (90) 21	P2	60	075.	-	1 RL 28/50	P1	91
026.	-	Di (90) 22	I2	60	076.	-	Lt (1a) 10	P1	98
027.	-	Di (90) 23	I2	60	077.	-	Lt (1a) 11	P1	98
028.	-	Di (90) 24	I2	60	078.	-	Lt (1a) 13	P1	98
029.	-	Di (90) 25	I2	60	079.	-	Lt (1a) 14	I2	98
030.	-	Di (90) 26	P1	60	080.	-	Lt (1a) 15	P2	103
031.	-	Di (90) 27	P1	60	081.	-	2 RL 54.1	P2	106
032.	-	Di (90) 28	I2	60	082.	-	2 RL 54.1	P1	110
033.	-	Di (90) 29	P1	60	083.	-	Lt (1a) 16	P2	113
034.	-	Di (90) 30	P1	60	084.	-	Lt (1a) 17	P3	113
035.	-	Di (90) 31	P1	60	085.	-	Lt (1a) 18	P1	113
036.	-	Di (90) 32	P1	60	086.	-	Di (99) 1	I1	127
037.	-	Di (90) 33	P1	60	087.	-	Di (99) 2	I1	127
038.	-	Di (90) 34	I2	60	088.	-	ST (98) 11	I1	127
039.	-	Di (90) 35	V2	60	089.	-	Di (99) 3	I2	127
040.	-	Di (90) 36	I2	60	090.	-	ST (98) 12	P2	127
041.	-	Di (90) 37	I2	60	091.	-	ST (98) 13	I1	127
042.	-	Di (90) 38	I1	60	092.	-	Di (99) 4	V2	127
043.	-	Di (90) 39	P2	60	093.	-	Di (99) 5	P2	127
044.	-	Di (90) 40	P2	60	094.	-	ST (98) 79	P1	127
045.	-	Di (90) 41	I2	60	095.	-	Di (99) 6	I2	127
046.	-	Di (90) 42	P1	60	096.	-	Di (99) 7	P2	127
047.	-	Di (90) 43	P1	60	097.	-	Di (99) 8	P2	127
048.	-	Di (90) 44	I1	60	098.	-	Di (99) 9	I2	127
049.	-	Di (90) 45	I1	60	099.	-	Di (99) 10	I2	127
050.	-	Di (90) 46	I1	60	100.	-	Di (99) 11	B1	127

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
101.	-	Di (99) 12	V2	127	151.	-	ST (98) 42	I1	127
102.	-	Di (99) 13	I2	127	152.	-	ST (98) 43	I1	127
103.	-	Di (99) 14	B1	127	153.	-	Di (99) 50	I1	127
104.	-	Di (99) 15	I2	127	154.	-	Di (99) 51	I1	127
105.	-	ST (98) 69	I2	127	155.	-	Di (99) 52	P1	127
106.	-	Di (99) 16	B1	127	156.	-	ST (98) 41	P2	127
107.	-	Di (99) 17	I2	127	157.	-	Di (99) 53	I1	127
108.	-	Di (99) 18	P1	127	158.	-	Di (99) 54	I1	127
109.	-	Di (99) 19	P2	127	159.	-	Di (99) 55	I1	127
110.	-	Di (99) 20	B1	127	160.	-	ST (98) 46	I1	127
111.	-	Di (99) 21	B1	127	161.	-	ST (98) 47	I1	127
112.	-	Di (99) 22	B1	127	162.	-	Di (99) 56	I1	127
113.	-	Di (99) 23	P3	127	163.	-	Di (99) 57	I2	127
114.	-	Di (99) 24	P2	127	164.	-	Di (99) 58	I2	127
115.	-	Di (99) 25	B1	127	165.	-	Di (99) 59	P3	127
116.	-	Di (99) 26	I1	127	166.	-	Di (99) 60	I1	127
117.	-	ST (98) 21	I1	127	167.	-	Di (99) 61	I2	127
118.	-	ST (98) 22	I1	127	168.	-	Di (99) 62	I2	127
119.	-	ST (98) 23	I1	127	169.	-	Di (99) 63	I2	127
120.	-	Di (99) 27	I1	127	170.	-	Di (99) 64	P1	127
121.	-	Di (99) 28	I1	127	171.	-	Di (99) 65	P1	127
122.	-	Di (99) 29	I1	127	172.	-	Di (99) 66	I2	127
123.	-	ST (98) 1	I1	127	173.	-	Di (99) 67	B1	127
124.	-	Di (99) 30	I1	127	174.	-	Di (99) 68	I1	127
125.	-	Di (99) 31	I1	127	175.	-	Di (99) 69	I2	127
126.	-	Di (99) 32	I1	127	176.	-	Di (99) 70	I2	127
127.	-	Di (99) 33	I1	127	177.	-	Di (99) 71	B2	127
128.	-	ST (98) 31	I1	127	178.	-	ST (98) 57	B2	127
129.	-	ST (98) 2	I1	127	179.	-	Di (99) 72	I1	127
130.	-	Di (99) 34	I1	127	180.	-	Di (99) 73	I2	127
131.	-	ST (98) 3	I1	127	181.	-	Di (99) 74	P1	127
132.	-	Di (99) 35	I1	127	182.	-	Di (99) 75	I1	127
133.	-	Di (99) 36	I1	127	183.	-	Di (99) 76	I1	127
134.	-	ST (98) 83	I1	127	184.	-	Di (99) 77	I1	127
135.	-	ST (98) 4	I1	127	185.	-	Di (99) 78	P3	127
136.	-	Di (99) 37	I1	127	186.	-	Di (99) 79	I2	127
137.	-	Di (99) 38	I1	127	187.	-	Di (99) 80	V2	127
138.	-	ST (98) 68	I1	127	188.	-	Di (99) 81	P2	127
139.	-	Di (99) 39	I2	127	189.	-	Di (99) 82	P3	127
140.	-	Di (99) 40	I2	127	190.	-	Di (99) 83	I2	127
141.	-	Di (99) 41	I1	127	191.	-	Di (99) 84	I1	127
142.	-	Di (99) 42	I1	127	192.	-	Di (99) 85	I2	127
143.	-	Di (99) 43	P1	127	193.	-	Di (99) 86	P2	127
144.	-	ST (98) 36	P1	127	194.	-	Di (99) 87	I1	127
145.	-	Di (99) 44	I2	127	195.	-	Di (99) 88	I1	127
146.	-	Di (99) 45	I2	127	196.	-	Di (99) 89	I1	127
147.	-	Di (99) 46	V2	127	197.	-	Di (99) 90	I1	127
148.	-	Di (99) 47	I1	127	198.	-	Di (99) 91	I2	127
149.	-	Di (99) 48	I2	127	199.	-	Di (99) 92	P1	127
150.	-	Di (99) 49	I1	127	200.	-	Di (99) 93	V2	127

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
201.	-	Di (99) 94	I1	127	251.	-			
202.	-	Di (99) 95	I2	127	252.	-			
203.	-	Di (99) 96	I2	127	253.	-			
204.	-	Di (99) 97	P2	127	254.	-			
205.	-	Di (99) 98	P2	127	255.	-			
206.	-	Di (99) 99	P3	127	256.	-			
207.	-	Di (99) 100	I2	127	257.	-			
208.	-	Di (99) 101	I2	127	258.	-			
209.	-	Di (99) 102	I2	127	259.	-			
210.	-	Di (99) 103	I2	127	260.	-			
211.	-	Di (99) 104	P3	127	261.	-			
212.	-	Di (99) 105	P1	127	262.	-			
213.	-	Di (99) 106	P1	127	263.	-			
214.	-	Di (99) 107	I1	127	264.	-			
215.	-	Di (99) 108	I1	127	265.	-			
216.	-	Di (99) 109	I1	127	266.	-			
217.	-	Di (99) 110	I1	127	267.	-			
218.	-	Di (99) 111	I1	127	268.	-			
219.	-	Di (99) 112	I1	127	269.	-			
220.	-	Di (99) 113	I1	127	270.	-			
221.	-	Di (99) 114	I1	127	271.	-			
222.	-	Di (99) 115	I1	127	272.	-			
223.	-	Di (99) 116	I1	127	273.	-			
224.	-	Di (99) 117	I2	127	274.	-			
225.	-	Di (99) 118	V2	127	275.	-			
226.	-	Di (99) 119	V1	127	276.	-			
227.	-	Di (99) 120	I1	127	277.	-			
228.	-	Di (99) 121	I1	127	278.	-			
229.	-	Di (99) 122	I1	127	279.	-			
230.	-	Di (99) 123	I1	127	280.	-			
231.	-	Di (99) 124	I1	127	281.	-			
232.	-	Di (99) 125	P2	127	282.	-			
233.	-	Di (99) 126	I2	127	283.	-			
234.	-	Di (99) 127	I1	127	284.	-			
235.	-	Di (99) 128	I1	127	285.	-			
236.	-	Di (99) 129	I1	127	286.	-			
237.	-	Di (99) 130	I1	127	287.	-			
238.	-	Di (99) 131	I1	127	288.	-			
239.	-	Di (99) 132	I1	127	289.	-			
240.	-	Di (99) 133	I1	127	290.	-			
241.	-	Di (99) 134	I1	127	291.	-			
242.	-	Di (99) 135	I1	127	292.	-			
243.	-	Di (99) 136	I1	127	293.	-			
244.	-	Di (99) 137	I1	127	294.	-			
245.	-	Di (99) 138	I1	127	295.	-			
246.	-	Di (99) 139	I1	127	296.	-			
247.	-				297.	-			
248.	-				298.	-			
249.	-				299.	-			
250.	-				300.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 14

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	Di (99) 156	I2	70	052.	-	MS (13) 11	I1	250
002.	-	Di (99) 159	I1	76	053.	-	MS (13) 12	P2	250
003.	-	Di (99) 160	I1	77	054.	-	MS (13) 13	I2	250
004.	-	Di (99) 161	I1	78	055.	-	MS (13) 275	I2	250
005.	-	Di (99) 162	I1	79	056.	-	MS (13) 276	V2	250
006.	-	Di (99) 163	I1	79	057.	-	MS (13) 277	P2	250
007.	-	Di (99) 154	P2	81	058.	-	MS (13) 5	P3	250
008.	-	Di (99) 151	P2	83	059.	-	MS (13) 6	P3	250
009.	-	Di (99) 164	I1	93	060.	-	MS (13) 7	I1	250
010.	-	2SP 53/61+	P1	95	061.	-	MS (13) 8	I1	250
011.	-	Di (99) 166	I2	95	062.	-	MS (13) 9	P3	250
012.	-	Di (99) 172	P1	104	063.	-	MS (13) 10	I2	250
013.	-	Di (99) 173	V2	104	064.	-	MS (13) 278	P1	250
014.	-	Di (99) 174	V2	104	065.	-	MS (13) 279	P1	250
015.	-	Di (99) 175	P1	104	066.	-	Lt (47) 10.7	P1	250
016.	-	DA(MS)114/178	P2	120	067.	-	RH (90) 59	V2	250
017.	-	2SP 123/66	P1	206	068.	-	MS (13) 156	I2	250
018.	-	2SP 138/67	P1	245	069.	-	MS (13) 280	V2	250
019.	-	MS (13) 1	I1	250	070.	-	ST (84) 51	P1	250
020.	-	MS (13) 2	B1	250	071.	-	MS (13) 281	P1	250
021.	-	MS (13) 3	V2	250	072.	-	ST (84) 52	V2	250
022.	-	MS (13) 4	V1	250	073.	-	MS (13) 282	V2	250
023.	-	MS (13) 251	I2	150	074.	-	MS (13) 283	I2	250
024.	-	MS (13) 14	P2	250	075.	-	Lt (47) 11.3	I2	250
025.	-	MS (13) 252	V2	250	076.	-	MS (13) 284	P3	250
026.	-	MS (13) 253	P2	250	077.	-	ST (84) 57	P1	250
027.	-	ST (84) 38	P1	250	078.	-	MS (13) 285	P1	250
028.	-	MS (13) 254	P1	250	079.	-	MS (13) 286	V2	250
029.	-	MS (13) 255	P1	250	080.	-	MS (13) 287	I1	250
030.	-	ST (84) 34	P2	250	081.	-	MS (13) 288	P3	250
031.	-	MS (13) 256	V2	250	082.	-	MS (13) 289	I1	250
032.	-	ST (84) 35	V2	250	083.	-	MS (13) 290	I1	250
033.	-	MS (13) 257	P3	250	084.	-	MS (13) 291	V2	250
034.	-	MS (13) 258	I2	250	085.	-	MS (13) 292	V2	250
035.	-	MS (13) 259	P3	250	086.	-	MS (13) 293	V2	250
036.	-	MS (13) 260	I1	250	087.	-	MS (13) 294	I1	250
037.	-	MS (13) 261	I2	250	088.	-	MS (13) 295	I1	250
038.	-	MS (13) 262	I1	250	089.	-	MS (13) 296	I2	250
039.	-	MS (13) 263	I1	250	090.	-	MS (13) 297	B1	250
040.	-	MS (13) 264	I1	250	091.	-	MS (13) 298	V2	250
041.	-	MS (13) 155	I1	250	092.	-	MS (13) 299	P2	250
042.	-	MS (13) 265	B1	250	093.	-	MS (13) 299a	V1	250
043.	-	MS (13) 266	P1	250	094.	-	MS (13) 300	P1	250
044.	-	MS (13) 267	V1	250	095.	-	MS (13) 301	V2	250
045.	-	MS (13) 268	V1	250	096.	-	MS (13) 302	V2	250
046.	-	MS (13) 269	P1	250	097.	-	ST (84) 83	I2	250
047.	-	MS (13) 270	V2	250	098.	-	MS (13) 303	I1	250
048.	-	MS (13) 271	V1	250	099.	-	MS (13) 304a	V2	250
049.	-	MS (13) 272	V2	250	100.	-	MS (13) 304b	I1	250
050.	-	MS (13) 273	P1	250	101.	-	ST (84) 85	V2	250
051.	-	MS (13) 274	V2	250	102.	-	ST (84) 86	V2	250

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 24

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	YI (73) 16	V2	—	051.	-	1RL 91/58	P2	98
002.	-	YI (73) 17	P1	—	052.	-	Lt (4) 24	P2	101
003.	-	YI (73) 18	P2	—	053.	-	1RL 95/58	I2	109
004.	-	YI (73) 19	P1	—	054.	-	Lt (4) 25	I2	109
005.	-	YI (73) 20	P1	—	055.	-	Lt (4) 43a	V2	153
006.	-	YI (73) 21	I1	—	056.	-	Lt (4) 43b	I1	153
007.	-	YI (73) 22	P2	—	057.	-	Lt (4) 44	I2	153
008.	-	YI (73) 23	P2	—	058.	-			
009.	-	YI (73) 24	V2	—	059.	-			
010.	-	1RL 19/53	P1	—	060.	-			
011.	-	Di (89) 4	P2	5	061.	-			
012.	-	1RL 25/26/54	P3	9	062.	-			
013.	-	1 RL 28/54	P1	11	063.	-			
014.	-	Lt (4) 10	P1	11	064.	-			
015.	-	Lt (4) 11	P1	11	065.	-			
016.	-	1RL 29/54	P2	13	066.	-			
017.	-	2SP 162/111	V2	16	067.	-			
018.	-	1RL 46/55	V2	17	068.	-			
019.	-	1RL 50/55	P1	19	069.	-			
020.	-	Lt (4) 4	P2	19	070.	-			
021.	-	2SP 163a/111	P3	20	071.	-			
022.	-	1RL/52/56	V2	21	073.	-			
023.	-	2SP 163b/111	P3	21	074.	-			
024.	-	2SP 164/111	P2	21	075.	-			
025.	-	Di (89) 12	I1	23	076.	-			
026.	-	Di (89) 13	I1	23	077.	-			
027.	-	2SP 166/111	P2	24	078.	-			
028.	-	2SP 167/111	I2	26	079.	-			
029.	-	1RL 59/56	P1	32	080.	-			
030.	-	1RL 57/56	P1	33	081.	-			
031.	-	1RL 58/56	P2	33	082.	-			
032.	-	1RL 60/56	P2	33	083.	-			
033.	-	Lt (4) 9	I2	33	084.	-			
034.	-	Di (89) 22	P3	37	085.	-			
035.	-	2SP 174/112	P2	38	086.	-			
036.	-	2SP 175a/112	I1	39	087.	-			
037.	-	2SP 175b/112	I1	42	088.	-			
038.	-	2SP 176/112	I2	43	089.	-			
039.	-	2SP 181/112	I2	48	090.	-			
040.	-	2SP 190/114	I1	62	091.	-			
041.	-	1RL 74/57	I2	67	092.	-			
042.	-	1RL 75/57	P2	71	093.	-			
043.	-	1RL 76/57	V2	72	094.	-			
044.	-	1RL 77/57	V2	73	095.	-			
045.	-	1RL 80/57	I2	75	096.	-			
046.	-	Di (89) 37	I1	76	097.	-			
047.	-	1RL 88/58	P1	94	098.	-			
048.	-	1RL 90/58	I2	95	099.	-			
049.	-	Lt (4) 21	I2	95	100.	-			
050.	-	1RL 92/58	V2	96	100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 37

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	DA(MS)15/471	B2		051.	-			
002.	-	DA(MS)17/471	B1		052.	-			
003.	-	3RL 96/59	B1		053.	-			
004.	-	2SP 159/255	B1		054.	-			
005.	-	DA(MS)18/471	B1		055.	-			
006.	-	3RL 97/59	B1		056.	-			
007.	-	2SP 160/255	B1		057.	-			
008.	-	DA(MS)20/471	I1		058.	-			
009.	-	3RL 98/59	I1		059.	-			
010.	-	DA(MS)22/471	I1		060.	-			
011.	-	3RL 102/59	I1		061.	-			
012.	-	DA(MS)25/471	B1		062.	-			
013.	-	RH (93) 1	I1	1	063.	-			
014.	-	RH (93) 2	I1	2	064.	-			
015.	-	RH (93) 3	I1	17	065.	-			
016.	-	2SP 163/256	I2	17	066.	-			
017.	-	2SP 164/256	P2	18	067.	-			
018.	-	RH (92) 48	I2	21	068.	-			
019.	-	2SP 165/256	P1	23	069.	-			
020.	-	2SP 166a/256	V2	23	070.	-			
021.	-	2SP 166b/256	P1	23	071.	-			
022.	-	2SP 166c/256	I2	23	072.	-			
023.	-	DA(MS)58/474	V2	34	073.	-			
024.	-	2SP 167/256	P3	66	074.	-			
025.	-	2SP 168/256+	P2	67	075.	-			
026.	-	2SP 169/257	P2	67	076.	-			
027.	-	2SP 170/257	B1	68	077.	-			
028.	-	SC 13/12	P1	88	078.	-			
029.	-	2SP 171a/257	P2	157	079.	-			
030.	-	2SP 171b/257	B1	158	080.	-			
031.	-	2SP 173a/257	P3	167	081.	-			
032.	-	2SP 173b/257	B1	167	082.	-			
033.	-	2SP 172/257	I2	167	083.	-			
034.	-	2SP 174/257	P1	168	084.	-			
035.	-	2SP 175/257	B1	185	085.	-			
036.	-	2SP 176/257	B1	185	086.	-			
037.	-	2SP 177/257	B1	185	087.	-			
038.	-	2SP 178/257	I2	185	088.	-			
039.	-	2SP 179/258	B1	185	089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 39

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	ST (97) 3	I1	3	051.	-			
002.	-	2SP 4/259	I2	4	052.	-			
003.	-	2SP 5/259	P3	7	053.	-			
004.	-	2SP 6/259	I2	7	054.	-			
005.	-	2SP 8/259	P3	10	055.	-			
006.	-	2SP 9/259	I2	11	056.	-			
007.	-	2SP 14/259	I2	14	057.	-			
008.	-	2SP 15/259	P2	14	058.	-			
009.	-	2SP 36/261	B2	27	059.	-			
010.	-	2SP 46/262	P1	34	060.	-			
011.	-	ST (97) 51	P1	59	061.	-			
012.	-	ST (97) 45	P1	60	062.	-			
013.	-	ST (97) 46	P2	61	063.	-			
014.	-	ST (97) 48	P2	62	064.	-			
015.	-	ST (97) 47	P2	63	065.	-			
016.	-	ST (97) 49	P2	63	066.	-			
017.	-	ST (97) 54	P2	65	067.	-			
018.	-	ST (97) 55	P2	65	068.	-			
019.	-	ST (97) 56	I1	66	069.	-			
020.	-	ST (97) 57	I2	66	070.	-			
021.	-	ST (97) 75	I2	86	071.	-			
022.	-	ST (97) 102	P1	106	072.	-			
023.	-	ST (97) 103	P1	106	073.	-			
024.	-	ST (97) 104	I2	106	074.	-			
025.	-				075.	-			
026.	-				076.	-			
027.	-				077.	-			
028.	-				078.	-			
029.	-				079.	-			
030.	-				080.	-			
031.	-				081.	-			
032.	-				082.	-			
033.	-				083.	-			
034.	-				084.	-			
035.	-				085.	-			
036.	-				086.	-			
037.	-				087.	-			
038.	-				088.	-			
039.	-				089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 46

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	2SP 4/324+	V2	---	051.	-	---	---	---
002.	-	2SP 8/325	P1	---	052.	-	---	---	---
003.	-	2SP 9/325	P1	---	053.	-	---	---	---
004.	-	2SP 14/325+	P1	---	054.	-	---	---	---
005.	-	2SP 16/326	I2	---	055.	-	---	---	---
006.	-	2SP 18/326	P2	---	056.	-	---	---	---
007.	-	2SP 19/326	P2	---	057.	-	---	---	---
008.	-	2SP 20/326	P1	1	058.	-	---	---	---
009.	-	2SP 22/326	I2	2	059.	-	---	---	---
010.	-	2SP 23/326	P1	3b	060.	-	---	---	---
011.	-	2SP 24/326	I2	3b	061.	-	---	---	---
012.	-	2SP 30/327	I2	12	062.	-	---	---	---
013.	-	2SP 39/328	P2	31	063.	-	---	---	---
014.	-	2SP 40/328	V2	32	064.	-	---	---	---
015.	-	2SP 41/328	P1	33	065.	-	---	---	---
016.	-	2SP 56/330	P1	33	066.	-	---	---	---
017.	-	2SP 37/328	BL	35	067.	-	---	---	---
018.	-	2SP 44/328	P2	36	068.	-	---	---	---
019.	-	2SP 45/329	I2	36	069.	-	---	---	---
020.	-	2SP 74/336	I1	52	070.	-	---	---	---
021.	-	2SP 75/336	I1	52	071.	-	---	---	---
022.	-	2SP 58/330	I2	54	072.	-	---	---	---
023.	-	2SP 59/330+	P2	55	073.	-	---	---	---
024.	-	2SP 60/331	P2	58	074.	-	---	---	---
025.	-	2SP 55/330	P2	75	075.	-	---	---	---
026.	-	2SP 66/331	P1	85	076.	-	---	---	---
027.	-	2SP 67/331	P1	86	077.	-	---	---	---
028.	-	2SP 71/336	I2	88	078.	-	---	---	---
029.	-	2SP 72/336	I2	88	079.	-	---	---	---
030.	-	---	---	---	080.	-	---	---	---
031.	-	---	---	---	081.	-	---	---	---
032.	-	---	---	---	082.	-	---	---	---
033.	-	---	---	---	083.	-	---	---	---
034.	-	---	---	---	084.	-	---	---	---
035.	-	---	---	---	085.	-	---	---	---
036.	-	---	---	---	086.	-	---	---	---
037.	-	---	---	---	087.	-	---	---	---
038.	-	---	---	---	088.	-	---	---	---
039.	-	---	---	---	089.	-	---	---	---
040.	-	---	---	---	090.	-	---	---	---
041.	-	---	---	---	091.	-	---	---	---
042.	-	---	---	---	092.	-	---	---	---
043.	-	---	---	---	093.	-	---	---	---
044.	-	---	---	---	094.	-	---	---	---
045.	-	---	---	---	095.	-	---	---	---
046.	-	---	---	---	096.	-	---	---	---
047.	-	---	---	---	097.	-	---	---	---
048.	-	---	---	---	098.	-	---	---	---
049.	-	---	---	---	099.	-	---	---	---
050.	-	---	---	---	100.	-	---	---	---

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 53

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	ST (94) 36	P2	4	051.	-			
002.	-	ST (94) 38	P2	8	052.	-			
003.	-	ST (94) 40	P1	10	053.	-			
004.	-	ST (94) 41	P2	10	054.	-			
005.	-	ST (94) 42	I2	10	055.	-			
006.	-				056.	-			
007.	-				057.	-			
008.	-				058.	-			
009.	-				059.	-			
010.	-				060.	-			
011.	-				061.	-			
012.	-				062.	-			
013.	-				063.	-			
014.	-				064.	-			
015.	-				065.	-			
016.	-				066.	-			
017.	-				067.	-			
018.	-				068.	-			
019.	-				069.	-			
020.	-				070.	-			
021.	-				071.	-			
022.	-				072.	-			
023.	-				073.	-			
024.	-				074.	-			
025.	-				075.	-			
026.	-				076.	-			
027.	-				077.	-			
028.	-				078.	-			
029.	-				079.	-			
030.	-				080.	-			
031.	-				081.	-			
032.	-				082.	-			
033.	-				083.	-			
034.	-				084.	-			
035.	-				085.	-			
036.	-				086.	-			
037.	-				087.	-			
038.	-				088.	-			
039.	-				089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 72

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	3SP 22/83	RI		051.	-			
002.	-	3SP 23/83	P1		052.	-			
003.	-	3SP 27/83	P2		053.	-			
004.	-	3SP 28/83	P2		054.	-			
005.	-	3SP 29/84	RI		055.	-			
006.	-	3SP 30/84	RI		056.	-			
007.	-	3SP 73/87	I1	83	057.	-			
008.	-	3SP 74/87	P2	83	058.	-			
009.	-	RH (97) 65	P2	134	059.	-			
010.	-	RH (97) 66	P1	134	060.	-			
011.	-	RH (97) 69	P1	135	061.	-			
012.	-	RH (97) 70	I2	136	062.	-			
013.	-	RH (97) 72	P1	139	063.	-			
014.	-	RH (97) 73	I2	139	064.	-			
015.	-	RH (97) 74	I2	139	065.	-			
016.	-	RH (97) 92	P2	144	066.	-			
017.	-				067.	-			
018.	-				068.	-			
019.	-				069.	-			
020.	-				070.	-			
021.	-				071.	-			
022.	-				072.	-			
023.	-				073.	-			
024.	-				074.	-			
025.	-				075.	-			
026.	-				076.	-			
027.	-				077.	-			
028.	-				078.	-			
029.	-				079.	-			
030.	-				080.	-			
031.	-				081.	-			
032.	-				082.	-			
033.	-				083.	-			
034.	-				084.	-			
035.	-				085.	-			
036.	-				086.	-			
037.	-				087.	-			
038.	-				088.	-			
039.	-				089.	-			
040.	-				090.	-			
041.	-				091.	-			
042.	-				092.	-			
043.	-				093.	-			
044.	-				094.	-			
045.	-				095.	-			
046.	-				096.	-			
047.	-				097.	-			
048.	-				098.	-			
049.	-				099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	MS (51) 1	V2	1
002.	-	3SP 1/106	P1	2
003.	-	3SP 2/106	P1	3
004.	-	3SP 3/106	P1	4
005.	-	MS (51) 2	P1	4
006.	-	MS (51) 3	P2	4
007.	-	MS (51) 4a	P1	4
008.	-	MS (51) 4b	P2	4
009.	-	MS (51) 5	P2	4
010.	-	MS (51) 6	P2	4
011.	-	MS (51) 7	B2	4
012.	-	MS (51) 8	I2	4
013.	-	MS (51) 9	V2	4
014.	-	MS (51) 10	P1	4
015.	-	MS (51) 11	P2	4
016.	-	MS (51) 12	I1	4
017.	-	MS (51) 13	I1	4
018.	-	MS (51) 14	I2	4
019.	-	MS (51) 15	P1	4
020.	-	MS (51) 16	P1	9
021.	-	MS (51) 17	I1	9
022.	-	3SP 85/113	P2	20
023.	-	3SP 86/113	P2	22
024.	-	MS (51) 18	P1	24
025.	-	3SP 93/114	P2	26
026.	-	3SP 94/114	P2	29
027.	-	MS (51) 19	B1	30
028.	-	MS (51) 22	P2	31
029.	-	MS (51) 23	P2	34
030.	-	MS (51) 127	P1	35
031.	-	MS (51) 128	V2	36
032.	-	3SP 95/114	B2	38
033.	-	MS (51) 20	B2	38
034.	-	3SP 96/114	P1	39
035.	-	3SP 97/114	I1	40
036.	-	3SP 98/114	I1	41
037.	-	MS (51) 21	B1	41
038.	-	MS (51) 24	I1	41
039.	-	MS (51) 25	I1	41
040.	-	3SP 99/114	I2	42
041.	-	MS (51) 26	P2	42
042.	-	3SP 100/114	P2	43
043.	-	MS (51) 27	I1	43
044.	-	3SP 101/114+	P2	44
045.	-	MS (51) 28	P2	44
046.	-	MS (51) 29	I1	44
047.	-	MS (51) 30	I1	44
048.	-	MS (51) 31	I1	46
049.	-	MS (51) 32	I2	46
050.	-	MS (51) 33	P1	47

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
051.	-	MS (51) 34	I1	52
052.	-	MS (51) 35	I1	52
053.	-	3SP 103/115	I2	53
054.	-	MS (51) 36	V2	71
055.	-	MS (51) 39	P1	87
056.	-	MS (51) 37	P1	88
057.	-	MS (51) 38	P2	88
058.	-	3SP 1/107	P1	90
059.	-	3SP 2/107	P1	90
060.	-	3SP 84/113	P2	91
061.	-	3SP 3/107	P1	91
062.	-	MS (51) 40	P1	112
063.	-	MS (51) 41	I2	112
064.	-	MS (51) 42	P2	113
065.	-	MS (51) 43	P1	114
066.	-	MS (51) 117	P1	119
067.	-	MS (51) 44	I2	119
068.	-	MS (51) 115	P2	120
069.	-	MS (51) 45	B1	122
070.	-	MS (51) 46	P1	122
071.	-	MS (51) 47	I2	122
072.	-	MS (51) 48	P1	122
073.	-	MS (51) 49	I2	122
074.	-	MS (51) 50	P2	123
075.	-	MS (51) 51	P1	125
076.	-	MS (51) 52	I2	136
077.	-	MS (51) 53	P1	137
078.	-	MS (51) 54	I1	138
079.	-	MS (51) 55	P2	139
080.	-	MS (51) 56	P2	140
081.	-	MS (51) 57	P2	141
082.	-	MS (51) 58	P2	141
083.	-	MS (51) 59	P1	142
084.	-	MS (51) 60	V2	143
085.	-	MS (51) 61	P2	144
086.	-	MS (51) 62	P2	145
087.	-	MS (51) 63	B1	146
088.	-	MS (51) 64	I2	146
089.	-	MS (51) 65	V2	147
090.	-	MS (51) 66	P2	148
091.	-	MS (51) 67	P1	149
092.	-	3SP 161/119	I2	155
093.	-	3SP 166/120	P1	157
094.	-	MS (51) 68	I1	161
095.	-	3SP 167/120	P3	169
096.	-	MS (102) 14	P2	169
097.	-	MS (102) 15	I1	170
098.	-	MS (102) 27	I1	172
099.	-	MS (102) 28	I1	173
100.	-	MS (102) 31	I1	174

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
101.	-	MS (102) 32	I1	175	151.	-	MS (111) 88	I1	205
102.	-	MS (102) 33	I1	176	152.	-	Di (94) 2	I1	205
103.	-	MS (102) 34	I1	177	153.	-	MS (111) 89	I1	205
104.	-	MS (102) 35	I1	178	154.	-	Di (94) 3	I1	205
105.	-	MS (102) 36	I1	180	155.	-	MS (111) 90	I1	205
106.	-	MS (102) 37	I1	181	156.	-	MS (111) 91	I1	205
107.	-	3SP 172/120	P2	182	157.	-	MS (102) 61	I1	206
108.	-	MS (51) 69	B1	182	158.	-	MS (102) 62	I1	207
109.	-	MS (102) 38	B2	182	159.	-	MS (102) 63	I1	208
110.	-	MS (102) 39	B2	183	160.	-	MS (102) 64	I1	209
111.	-	MS (51) 70	B2	184	161.	-	MS (102) 65	I1	210
112.	-	MS (102) 40	B2	184	162.	-	MS (102) 66	P2	211
113.	-	3SP 174/121	B2	184	163.	-	MS (102) 67	I1	212
114.	-	MS (51) 71	B2	184	164.	-	MS (102) 68	I1	213
115.	-	MS (102) 41	B2	184	165.	-	MS (102) 69	P1	215
116.	-	MS (102) 44	I1	193	166.	-	MS (102) 82	I2	216
117.	-	Di (94) 11	I1	194	167.	-	MS (102) 102	I1	217
118.	-	MS (102) 45	I1	194	168.	-	MS (102) 103	I1	218
119.	-	MS (111) 45	I1	194	169.	-	MS (102) 104	I1	220
120.	-	Di (94) 10	I1	195	170.	-	MS (51) 73	P2	223
121.	-	MS (102) 46	I1	195	171.	-	MS (51) 72	P1	224
122.	-	MS (111) 44	I1	195	172.	-	MS (51) 74	P2	225
123.	-	MS (102) 48	I1	196	173.	-	MS (51) 75	I2	228
124.	-	MS (102) 49	I1	196	174.	-	MS (51) 99	I2	228
125.	-	MS (102) 47	I1	197	175.	-	MS (51) 100	I2	230
126.	-	MS (102) 53	I1	198	176.	-	MS (51) 101	I1	230
127.	-	MS (102) 54	I1	199	177.	-	MS (51) 102	P1	231
128.	-	Di (94) 12	I1	200	178.	-	MS (51) 103	P1	232
129.	-	MS (111) 46	I1	200	179.	-	MS (51) 104	I2	232
130.	-	MS (111) 47	I1	201	180.	-	MS (51) 105	I1	233
131.	-	MS (111) 48	I1	202	181.	-	MS (51) 106	I1	234
132.	-	Di (94) 13	I1	203	182.	-	MS (51) 76	I1	234
133.	-	MS (111) 49	I1	203	183.	-	MS (51) 77	I1	234
134.	-	MS (111) 50	I1	204	184.	-	MS (51) 78	P1	234
135.	-	Di (94) 14	I1	205	185.	-	MS (51) 79	I1	234
136.	-	MS (111) 51	I1	205	186.	-	3SP 4/107	P1	236
137.	-	Di (94) 15	I1	205	187.	-	MS (51) 80	P1	236
138.	-	Di (94) 16	I1	205	188.	-	3SP 5/107	P1	236
139.	-	Di (94) 17	I1	205	189.	-	MS (51) 81	P1	236
140.	-	MS (111) 82	I1	205	190.	-	MS (51) 82	I1	236
141.	-	Di (94) 18	I1	205	191.	-	MS (51) 83	B2	236
142.	-	MS (111) 83	I1	205	192.	-	MS (51) 84	I2	236
143.	-	MS (111) 84	I1	205	193.	-	3SP 6/107	P1	237
144.	-	Di (94) 19	I1	205	194.	-	MS (51) 85	B2	237
145.	-	MS (111) 85	I1	205	195.	-	MS (51) 86	I1	238
146.	-	Di (94) 20	I1	205	196.	-	3SP 9/107	P1	240
147.	-	MS (211) 86	I1	205	197.	-	3SP 10/107	P1	241
148.	-	Di (94) 21	I1	205	198.	-	3SP 11/108	B1	242
149.	-	MS (111) 87	I1	205	199.	-	MS (51) 87	B2	242
150.	-	Di (94) 1	I1	205	200.	-	MS (104) 93	I2	246

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
201.	-	MS (104) 94	P2	247	251.	-	MS (51) 98	P1	294
202.	-	3SP 14/108	P1	248	252.	-	MS (104) 125	I2	295
203.	-	MS (51) 88	B2	248	253.	-	3SP 52/110+	P2	303
204.	-	MS (104) 95	B1	248	254.	-	MS (104) 126	P2	303
205.	-	MS (104) 96	P1	249	255.	-	MS (104) 127	I1	303
206.	-	MS (104) 97	I2	250	256.	-	MS (51) 122	I2	316
207.	-	MS (51) 89	B2	251	257.	-	MS (51) 123a	P1	317
208.	-	MS (104) 98	B2	251	258.	-	MS (51) 123b	P2	318
209.	-	MS (104) 99	P1	252	259.	-	MS (51) 124	P1	319
210.	-	MS (104) 100	I1	253	260.	-	MS (51) 134	B1	328
211.	-	3SP 221/108	I2	260	261.	-	MS (51) 136	P2	330
212.	-	RH (91) 42	P2	261	262.	-	MS (51) 137	P1	331
213.	-	RH (91) 43	P2	261					
214.	-	MS (104) 109	I1	268					
215.	-	MS (104) 110	I1	271					
216.	-	RH (91) 39	P2	271					
217.	-	3SP 29/109	P2	272					
218.	-	3SP 30/109	I2	272					
219.	-	RH (91) 41	I2	272					
220.	-	MS (104) 114	B2	274					
221.	-	MS (51) 90	B2	275					
222.	-	MS (104) 115	B2	275					
223.	-	3SP 33/109	I1	277					
224.	-	MS (51) 91	B2	277					
225.	-	MS (104) 116	I1	277					
226.	-	3SP 34/109	I1	278					
227.	-	MS (51) 92	B2	278					
228.	-	MS (104) 117	I1	278					
229.	-	MS (51) 94	B2	279					
230.	-	MS (104) 118	B2	279					
231.	-	3SP 35/109	P1	280					
232.	-	MS (51) 93	B2	280					
233.	-	MS (104) 119	I2	280					
234.	-	3SP 36/109	I1	281					
235.	-	MS (104) 120	I1	281					
236.	-	MS (104) 121	I2	282					
237.	-	RH (92) 77	P2	283					
238.	-	MS (51) 96	P1	283					
239.	-	MS (51) 97	I2	283					
240.	-	MS (104) 122	I1	283					
241.	-	MS (104) 123	I1	283					
242.	-	MS (104) 124	P2	283					
243.	-	3SP 38a/109	P1	286					
244.	-	3SP 38b/109+	P1	286					
245.	-	3SP 38c/110	I2	286					
246.	-	3SP 45/110	P2	290					
247.	-	3SP 41/110	P3	292					
248.	-	3SP 42/110	P1	292					
249.	-	3SP 43/110	I1	292					
250.	-	MS (51) 95	B2	294					

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 76

No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>	No.	-	Text	Eval.	<u>DA</u>
001.	-	3SP3/81	I1	7	051.	-			
002.	-	3SP4/81+	P2	7	052.	-			
003.	-	3SP5/82	P1	9	053.	-			
004.	-	3SP6/82	P2	9	054.	-			
005.	-	3SP7/82	P3	10	055.	-			
006.	-	3SP15/82	P2	11	056.	-			
007.	-	3SP16/82	P3	11	057.	-			
008.	-	3SP17/82+	P3	11	058.	-			
009.	-	3SP18/83	P3	11	059.	-			
010.	-	3SP8/82	I2	13	060.	-			
011.	-	3SP9/82	P3	13	061.	-			
012.	-	MS(28)30	P2	22	062.	-			
013.	-	MS(28)31	I2	22	063.	-			
014.	-	MS(28)3	P2	31	064.	-			
015.	-	MS(28)27	P1	31	065.	-			
016.	-	MS(28)34	I1	32	066.	-			
017.	-	MS(28)35	I1	33	067.	-			
018.	-	MS(28)36	I1	34	068.	-			
019.	-	MS(28)37	I2	35	069.	-			
020.	-	MS(28)38	I2	36	070.	-			
021.	-	MS(28)39	I2	37	071.	-			
022.	-	MS(28)44	P2	38	072.	-			
023.	-	MS(120)27	P3	51	073.	-			
024.	-	MS(120)28	P1	53	074.	-			
025.	-	MS(120)29	I1	54	075.	-			
026.	-	MS(120)30	P3	55	076.	-			
027.	-	MS(120)31	P1	56	077.	-			
028.	-	MS(120)33	I2	58	078.	-			
029.	-	MS(120)34	P3	59	079.	-			
030.	-	MS(120)35	P2	60	080.	-			
031.	-	MS(120)36	P1	61	081.	-			
032.	-	MS(120)38	P2	76	082.	-			
033.	-	MS(120)40	I2	78	083.	-			
034.	-	MS(120)42	I2	78	084.	-			
035.	-	MS(120)44	I2	78	085.	-			
036.	-	MS(120)45	P1	92	086.	-			
037.	-	MS(120)47	P2	99	087.	-			
038.	-	MS(120)50	P2	105	088.	-			
039.	-	MS(120)64	P3	118	089.	-			
040.	-	MS(28)48	P2	118	090.	-			
041.	-	MS(28)49	I1	130	091.	-			
042.	-	MS(28)50	I1	132	092.	-			
043.	-	3SP27/125	P3	141	093.	-			
044.	-	3SP33/126	B2	146	094.	-			
045.	-	3SP16/124	I1	157	095.	-			
046.	-	3SP28/125	I1	157	096.	-			
047.	-	3SP32/126	P2	166	097.	-			
048.	-	MS(120)101	P2	167	098.	-			
049.	-	3SP37/126	P2	173	099.	-			
050.	-				100.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	MS(113)1	P3	—	051.	-	ST(88)25	I2	62
002.	-	MS(113)2	I1	—	052.	-	3SP62b/212	P2	65
003.	-	MS(113)3	P1	—	053.	-	ST(88)49b	V2	65
004.	-	3SP1/206	B2	—	054.	-	3SP63/212	P2	66
005.	-	3SP2/206	I1	—	055.	-	ST(88)49a	V2	66
006.	-	MS(113)4	I2	—	056.	-	ST(88)39	P1	67
007.	-	MS(113)5	V2	—	057.	-	ST(88)47	P1	67
008.	-	MS(113)6	P1	—	058.	-	ST(88)48	P1	67
009.	-	MS(113)7	I1	—	059.	-	3SP88/214	I2	67
010.	-	MS(113)8	P3	—	060.	-	3SP65/212	I2	67
011.	-	MS(113)15	P2	1	061.	-	3SP66/212	P2	67
012.	-	RH(78)1	P2	1	062.	-	3SP67/212	P1	67
013.	-	3SP7a/207	V2	2a	063.	-	3SP68/212	P1	67
014.	-	3SP7b/208	I2	2b	064.	-	3SP68b/212	P1	67
015.	-	3SP4/206	I2	3	065.	-	3SP69/212	P1	68
016.	-	3SP5/206	P2	4	066.	-	ST(88)44	P1	68
017.	-	3SP15/207	P3	4	067.	-	3SP70a/212	P1	68
018.	-	3SP6/206	I2	5	068.	-	3SP70b/212	P2	68
019.	-	MS(113)16	I2	6	069.	-	ST(88)45	P2	70
020.	-	ST(88)3	P1	8	070.	-	3SP71/212	P2	71
021.	-	ST(88)4	P1	8	071.	-	3SP74/213	P2	74
022.	-	3SP8a/207	P1	9a	072.	-	ST(88)50	P1	74
023.	-	ST(88)5a	P1	9a	073.	-	RH(78)12	I2	75
024.	-	MS(113)21	P1	9a	074.	-	ST(88)42b	V2	76
025.	-	3SP8b/207	P1	9b	075.	-	ST(88)40	P2	77
026.	-	ST(88)5b	P1	9b	076.	-	ST(88)42a	P3	77
027.	-	3SP11a/207	P1	11a	077.	-	3SP77/213	P2	77
028.	-	3SP11b/207	I2	13	078.	-	3SP78/213	I2	81
029.	-	MS(113)26	I2	13	079.	-	ST(88)51	P1	81
030.	-	MS(113)20	P2	13	080.	-	3SP79a/213	P1	82
031.	-	3SP12/207	P2	13	081.	-	RH(78)10a	P1	82
032.	-	3SP13/207	P1	13	082.	-	3SP79b/213	I2	83
033.	-	3SP14/207	P2	13	083.	-	3SP80a/213	P2	83
034.	-	3SP16a/207	P1	13	084.	-	MS(113)85	V2	85
035.	-	3SP16b/2007	P2	13	085.	-	3SP82/213	P2	86
036.	-	3SP17/207	P1	13	086.	-	ST(88)55	P1	87
037.	-	MS(113)28b	P2	15b	087.	-	ST(88)56	P1	87
038.	-	RH(78)5a	I2	18	088.	-	ST(88)57	P1	88
039.	-	RH(78)5b,c	I2	19c	089.	-	ST(88)58	P1	89
040.	-	3SP26/208	P2	31	090.	-	3SP86/213	P2	89
041.	-	3SP27/208	P1	31	091.	-	ST(88)59	P1	89
042.	-	3SP28a/208	I2	31	092.	-	3SP85a/213	P1	90a
043.	-	3SP62a/212	I2	31	093.	-	3SP85b/213	P2	90b
044.	-	3SP28b/208	V2	31	094.	-	3SP91/214	I2	90b
045.	-	3SP89/214	I2	34	095.	-	3SP92a/214	P2	90b
046.	-	3SP46/210	P3	38	096.	-	3SP93/214	P2	90b
047.	-	3SP30b/208	P2	40	097.	-	3SP94/215	P2	90b
048.	-	3SP39/210	I2	50	098.	-	3SP97b/215	P2	92
049.	-	3SP42/210	I2	52	099.	-	3SP97a/215	P2	93
050.	-	3SP18/207	B2	61	100.	-	ST(88)64	V2	93

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
101.	-	3SP99a/215	P1	94	151.	-			
102.	-	ST(88)65	P2	94	152.	-			
103.	-	3SP100/215	P2	96	153.	-			
104.	-	3SP101/215	P2	96	154.	-			
105.	-	3SP104/215	P2	96	155.	-			
106.	-	3SP99c/215	P2	99	156.	-			
107.	-	MS(113)95	I2	100	157.	-			
108.	-	3SP103/215	P1	100	158.	-			
109.	-	ST(88)69	P2	100	159.	-			
110.	-	ST(88)68	P1	103	160.	-			
111.	-	ST(88)66	P1	106	161.	-			
112.	-	3SP107/215	P2	107	162.	-			
113.	-	3SP108/215	P1	109	163.	-			
114.	-				164.	-			
115.	-				165.	-			
116.	-				166.	-			
117.	-				167.	-			
118.	-				168.	-			
119.	-				169.	-			
120.	-				170.	-			
121.	-				171.	-			
122.	-				172.	-			
123.	-				173.	-			
124.	-				174.	-			
125.	-				175.	-			
126.	-				176.	-			
127.	-				177.	-			
128.	-				178.	-			
129.	-				179.	-			
130.	-				180.	-			
131.	-				181.	-			
132.	-				182.	-			
133.	-				183.	-			
134.	-				184.	-			
135.	-				185.	-			
136.	-				186.	-			
137.	-				187.	-			
138.	-				188.	-			
139.	-				189.	-			
140.	-				190.	-			
141.	-				191.	-			
142.	-				192.	-			
143.	-				193.	-			
144.	-				194.	-			
145.	-				195.	-			
146.	-				196.	-			
147.	-				197.	-			
148.	-				198.	-			
149.	-				199.	-			
150.	-				2:0.	-			

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Text Evaluations for Chapter 84

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	3SP1/216	P1	1	051.	-	MS(149)45	I2	65
002.	-	3SP2/216	P1	2	052.	-	MS(149)46	P1	66
003.	-	3SP3/216	P1	4	053.	-	MS(149)51	B1	66
004.	-	MS(113)112	P1	4	054.	-	MS(149)52	B1	66
005.	-	MS(113)113	P2	5	055.	-	MS(149)53	B1	66
006.	-	3SP5/216	P1	5	056.	-	MS(149)54	B1	66
007.	-	MS(113)114	P1	6	057.	-	MS(149)59	P1	67
008.	-	MS(113)115	P1	7	058.	-	MS(149)61	P1	67
009.	-	MS(113)116	P2	8	059.	-	MS(149)62	I2	67
010.	-	MS(113)117	P1	9	060.	-	MS(149)55	I2	95
011.	-	3SP6a/216	P1	10a	061.	-	MS(149)86	P2	96
012.	-	ST(88)71	P2	10a	062.	-	MS(149)56	V2	97
013.	-	3SP6b/216	I1	10b	063.	-	3SP49/219	P1	99
014.	-	ST(88)72	P1	11	064.	-	3SP47/219	P1	99
015.	-	3SP7/216	P2	12	065.	-	3SP63/221	P1	119
016.	-	3SP9a/216	V2	12	066.	-	3SP64/221	P1	120
017.	-	3SP9b/216	I2	12	067.	-	3SP65/221	I2	121
018.	-	3SP10/216+	P2	12	068.	-	3SP72/222	I2	131
019.	-	3SP11/217	P2	13	069.	-	3SP73/222	P1	133
020.	-	MS(113)121	P1	14	070.	-	3SP74/222	P1	134
021.	-	MS(113)122	P3	14	071.	-			
022.	-	MS(113)123	P3	14	072.	-			
023.	-	MS(113)124	P3	14	073.	-			
024.	-	MS(113)125	P2	14	074.	-			
025.	-	MS(113)126	V2	15	075.	-			
026.	-	3SP14/217	P2	15	076.	-			
027.	-	3SP15/217	V2	15	077.	-			
028.	-	ST(88)73	P1	15	078.	-			
029.	-	ST(88)75	P1	17	079.	-			
030.	-	ST(88)76	V2	19	080.	-			
031.	-	3SP35/218	I2	33	081.	-			
032.	-	3SP36/218	V2	34	092.	-			
033.	-	3SP37/219	P2	35	083.	-			
034.	-	3SP40a/219	V2	37	084.	-			
035.	-	3SP40b/219	P1	37	085.	-			
036.	-	3SP40c/219	I2	37	086.	-			
037.	-	3SP41/219	P2	37	087.	-			
038.	-	3SP44/219	V2	40	088.	-			
039.	-	3SP31/218	P1	48	089.	-			
040.	-	MS(149)28	P2	51	090.	-			
041.	-	MS(149)29	I2	52	091.	-			
042.	-	MS(149)36	V2	53	092.	-			
043.	-	MS(149)35	I2	57	093.	-			
044.	-	MS(149)34	P1	58	094.	-			
045.	-	MS(149)38	P2	59	095.	-			
046.	-	MS(149)39	P1	59	096.	-			
047.	-	MS(149)33	I2	60	097.	-			
048.	-	MS(149)40	I1	61	098.	-			
049.	-	MS(149)47	B1	61	099.	-			
050.	-	MS(149)48	I2	62	100.	-			

APPENDIX C

Source reference for each sentence of the pre-DA material quoted for each of the 15 DA chapters. The first initial of the last name is used when space does not permit the full name to be used. The source is identified by the same initials taken from the source title as used in the text presentation.

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 3

No.	Text	Sources	No.	Text	Sources
001.	MS(24)2	*H/3/49	051.	ST(90)26	H/54/54
002.	MS(24)3	H/3/49	052.	ST(90)29	H/55/54
003.	ST(90)1	H/7/49	053.	ST(90)30	H/60/55+
004.	ST(90)2	H/4-7/49	054.	DA(MS)4/54:2	H/6/145
005.	ST(90)5	H/5,6/49	055.	RH(95)1	H/12a/227
006.	MS(24)4	H/6,9/49+	056.	RH(95)2	H/12b/227
007.	MS(24)20	H/19/50+	057.	RH(95)6a	
008.	MS(24)21	H/19/50+	058.	RH(95)6b	H/12c/227
009.	ST(90)7	H/19/50+	059.	RH(95)7	H/13/227
010.	ST(90)3	H/9/50	060.	RH(95)8	H/14/228
011.	MS(24)16	H/10/50	061.	RH(95)9	H/14/227
012.	MS(24)17	H/10/50	062.	RH(95)10	H/15/227
013.	ST(98)3	H/21b/51	063.	Lt(43)28	H/19/228
014.	MS(24)14	H/15/50	064.	RH(95)11	H/20/228
015.	ST(98)4	H/14,15/51	065.	RH(95)12	H/21/228
016.	ST(98)5	H/15/50	066.	RH(95)13	H/21/228
017.	ST(90)8	H/17,18/50	067.	Lt(43)29	H/25/229
018.	BE(97)10	H/37/52	068.	RH(95)31	H/27/229
019.	ST(90)10	H/31/52	069.	RH(95)33	H/31,33/229
020.	ST(90)11	H/32/52	070.	RH(95)34	H/39/230
021.	MS(24)5	H/1/49	071.	Lt(43)9	H/40a/230
022.	FE2/399	H/39+/230	072.	RH(95)39	H/40/230
		H/39/52+	*	H denotes Harris GT	
023.	MS(24)1	H/2/49	073.	RH(95)40	H/42/231
024.	FE1/399	H/41/53	074.	RH(95)41	H/43a/231
025.	BE(97)17	H/41/53	075.	ST(94)1	H/6a/101
026.	BE(97)21	H/40/52	076.	ST(94)2	Bible
027.	FE3/400	H/40/52	077.	ST(94)3	Bible
028.	FE4/400	H/40/52	078.	ST(94)4	
029.	BE(97)18	H/41/52	079.	ST(94)5	
030.	BE(97)19	H/41/52	080.	ST(94)6	H/6b/101
031.	FE5/400	H/41,44/52	081.	ST(94)7	H/6c/101
032.	FE8/400	H/44/52	082.	ST(94)8	
033.	FE9/400	H/44/52	083.	ST(94)9	H/6d/101
034.	FE10/400	H/41/52	084.	ST(94)10	H/6e/101
035.	FE11/400	H/46a/52	085.	ST(94)11	H/6e/101
036.	FE12/400	H/46b/52	086.	ST(94)12	H/6f/101
037.	FE13/400	H/47/52	087.	ST(94)13	H/6g/101
038.	FE15/400	H/48/53+	088.	ST(94)14	H/6g/101
039.	FE17/400	H/49/54	089.	ST(94)15	H/10-18/102+
040.	FE18/400+	H/50/54	090.	ST(94)16a	H/10-18/102+
041.	FE19/401	H/51/54	091.	ST(94)16b	
042.	FE20/401	H/51/54	092.	ST(94)17	H/18b/103
043.	FE21/401	H/52/54	093.	ST(94)18	H/20/103+
044.	FE22/401	H/52/54	094.	ST(94)19	H/21/104
045.	FE23/401	H/53/54	095.	ST(94)20	Bible
046.	ST(90)23	H/54/54	096.	ST(94)21	H/22/104
047.	ST(90)24	H/54/54	097.	ST(94)22	H/22/104
048.	ST(90)25	H/54/54	098.	ST(94)23	H/22,23/104
049.	FE24/401	H/54/54	099.	ST(94)24	H/23/104
050.	FE25/401	H/54/54	100.	ST(94)25	H/23/104

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 10

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	2SP 4/41	H/43,45/71	051.	-	2SP 97/47	H/47-51/72
002.	-	2SP 6/41	H/43,45/71	052.	-	2SP 8/41	H/47-51/72
003.	-	Vie 21/49	G/1/69	053.	-	2SP 98/47+	H/54/72
004.	-	Vie 22/49	G/1/69	054.	-	2SP 101/48	J/3/17
005.	-	Vie 23/49	G/2/69	055.	-	2SP 103/48	J/20/24
006.	-	Vie 24/49	G/2/69	056.	-	2SP 110/49	J/20/24
007.	-	Vie 25/49	G/2,3/69	057.	-	2SP 108/48	H/82,83/74
008.	-	Vie 26-28/49	G/4,6/69	058.	-	2SP 106/48	H/64,65/73
009.	-	Vie 29/49+	G/5/69	059.	-	2SP 115/49	F/1/44
010.	-	Vie 30/50	G/6/69	060.	-	2SP 116/49	F/1/44
011.	-	Vie 31/50	G/7/69a	061.	-	2SP 117/49	F/2/45
012.	-	Vie 32/50	G/7/69b	062.	-	2SP 118/49	F/3/45
013.	-	Vie 33-35/50		063.	-	2SP 119/49	F/3/45
014.	-	Vie 36/50	G/8/70	064.	-	2SP 214/57	F/8/45
015.	-	Vie 37/50	G/9/70	065.	-	2SP 218/57	F/8/46
016.	-	Vie 38/50	G/10/70	066.	-	2SP 219/57	F/8/46
017.	-	Vie 39/50	G/9,11a/70	067.	-	2SP 220/57	F/125/78
018.	-	Vie 40/50	G/11b/70	068.	-	2SP 221/57	H/125/78
019.	-	Vie 41/50	G/12a/70	069.	-		
020.	-	Vie 42/50+	G/12b/70	070.	-		
021.	-	Vie 43/51	G/13/70	071.	-		
022.	-	Vie 44/51	G/14/70	072.	-		
023.	-	Vie 49/51	G/7/70	073.	-		
024.	-	Vie 48/51		074.	-		
025.	-	Vie 50/51		075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 52/44	F/5/21	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 55/44	F/6/21	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 56/44	F/6/21	078.	-		
029.	-	Vie 58/52	G/27/71	079.	-		
030.	-	Vie 59/52		080.	-		
031.	-	Vie 60/52	G/28/71	081.	-		
032.	-	2SP 57/44+	F/8,9/21+	082.	-		
033.	-	2SP 58/45	F/9/21	083.	-		
034.	-	2SP 59/45	F/9/21	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 60/45	F/3/20	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 61/45	F/10b/22	086.	-		
037.	-	Vie 45/51	G/16/70	087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 66/45	F/10c/22	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 96/47	H/33/70	089.	-		
040.	-	YI (97) 26	H/33/70	090.	-		
041.	-	YI (97) 27	H/33/70	091.	-		
042.	-	YI (97) 8b	H/25b/70	092.	-		
043.	-	YI (97) 9	H/25c25d/70	093.	-		
044.	-	2SP 72/45+	H/25b/70	094.	-		
045.	-	2SP 73/46	H/25c/70	095.	-		
046.	-	2SP 75/46	H/25d/70	096.	-		
047.	-	YI (97) 11	H/26,27/70	097.	-		
048.	-	YI (97) 12	H/27/70	098.	-		
049.	-	2SP 84/46	H/33/70+	099.	-		
050.	-	2SP 89/46	H/33/70+	100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	1 RL 2/48	F/50.9	051.	-	Di (90) 47	
002.	-	1 RL 3/48		052.	-	Di (90) 48	
003.	-	1 RL 4/48	F/50.9	053.	-	Di (90) 49	
004.	-	1 RL 6/48	F/51.3	054.	-	Di (90) 50	
005.	-	1 RL 9/48	F/51.5	055.	-	Di (90) 51	
006.	-	2 RL 39.7	H/44/91	056.	-	Di (90) 52	
007.	-	2 RL 39.9+	H/48/92	057.	-	Di (90) 53	
008.	-	2 RL 47.7	H/63,64/93	058.	-	Di (90) 54	
009.	-	2 RL 47.8	H/65/93	059.	-	Di (90) 55	
010.	-	2 SP 93/94	H/68/93	060.	-	Di (90) 56	
011.	-	2 SP 94/94	H/80/94	061.	-	Di (90) 57	
012.	-	2 SP 95/94	H/75-77/94	062.	-	Di (90) 58	
013.	-	BE (92) 5	H/75-77/94	063.	-	Di (90) 59	
014.	-	2 RL 48.6	H/77-80/94	064.	-	Di (90) 60	W/113b/113c
015.	-	1 RL 13/49	F/52.2	065.	-	Di (90) 61	
016.	-	Lt (1a) 4	H/151/98	066.	-	Di (90) 62	W/113d/135
017.	-	Lt (1a) 6	H/153/98	067.	-	Di (90) 63	W/113e/135
018.	-	3T 482.6	H/153/98	068.	-	Di (90) 64	
019.	-	Di (90) 15		069.	-	2 RL 52.2	H/121,122/97
020.	-	Di (90) 16		070.	-	2 RL 51.5	H/94/95
021.	-	Di (90) 17		071.	-	2 SP 116a/96	H/121,122/97
022.	-	Di (90) 18		072.	-	2 SP 112/96	H/94/95
023.	-	Di (90) 19		073.	-	2 SP 111/95+	H/106,108/96
024.	-	Di (90) 20	W/78/132	074.	-	2 RL 52.3	H/124/97
025.	-	Di (90) 21	W/81/132	075.	-	1 RL 28/50	F/51.9
026.	-	Di (90) 22	W/81/132	076.	-	Lt (1a) 10	H/156a/99
027.	-	Di (90) 23	W/81/132	077.	-	Lt (1a) 11	H/156b/99
028.	-	Di (90) 24	W/82/132	078.	-	Lt (1a) 13	H/157a/99
029.	-	Di (90) 25	W/82/132	079.	-	Lt (1a) 14	H/157b/99
030.	-	Di (90) 26	W/83,84/132	080.	-	Lt (1a) 15	H/159/99
031.	-	Di (90) 27	W/85,86a	081.	-	2 RL 54.1	H/125a/97
032.	-	Di (90) 28	W/86c/133	082.	-	2 RL 54.1	H/125b/97
033.	-	Di (90) 29	W/87/133	083.	-	Lt (1a) 16	H/161/99
034.	-	Di (90) 30	W/87/133	084.	-	Lt (1a) 17	H/163/99
035.	-	Di (90) 31	W/89/133	085.	-	Lt (1a) 18	H/166.167/99
036.	-	Di (90) 32	W/90/133	086.	-	Di (99) 1	
037.	-	Di (90) 33	W/91/133	087.	-	Di (99) 2	
038.	-	Di (90) 34	W/92-94/133	088.	-	ST (98) 11	
039.	-	Di (90) 35	W/95/133	089.	-	Di (99) 3	W/43,46/128
040.	-	Di (90) 36	W/96/133	090.	-	ST (98) 12	&129
041.	-	Di (90) 37	W/98/133	091.	-	ST (98) 13	
042.	-	Di (90) 38		092.	-	Di (99) 4	W/44/128
043.	-	Di (90) 39	W/98/133	093.	-	Di (99) 5	W/45a/129
044.	-	Di (90) 40	W/99/133+	094.	-	ST (98) 79	W/45a/129
045.	-	Di (90) 41	W/100a/134	095.	-	Di (99) 6	W/45b/129
046.	-	Di (90) 42	W/109b/135	096.	-	Di (99) 7	W/45c/129
047.	-	Di (90) 43	W/110/135	097.	-	Di (99) 8	W/46/129
048.	-	Di (90) 44					M/15a.1, .2
049.	-	Di (90) 45		098.	-	Di (99) 9	M/15a.1, .2
050.	-	Di (90) 46		099.	-	Di (99) 10	W/46/129
				100.	-	Di (99) 11	W/48a/129

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
101.	-	Di (99) 12	W/48b/129	151.	-	ST (98) 42	
102.	-	Di (99) 13	W/49a/129	152.	-	ST (98) 43	
103.	-	Di (99) 14	W/49b/129	153.	-	Di (99) 50	
104.	-	Di (99) 15	W/51a,b/129	154.	-	Di (99) 51	
105.	-	ST (98) 69	W/51a,b/129	155.	-	Di (99) 52	M/13b.5
106.	-	Di (99) 16	W/51b,52/"	156.	-	ST (98) 41	M/13b.5
107.	-	Di (99) 17	W/53/129	157.	-	Di (99) 53	
108.	-	Di (99) 18	W/53/129	158.	-	Di (99) 54	
109.	-	Di (99) 19	W/54/130	159.	-	Di (99) 55	
110.	-	Di (99) 20	W/55/130	160.	-	ST (98) 46	
111.	-	Di (99) 21	W/29/128	161.	-	ST (98) 47	
112.	-	Di (99) 22	W/29/128	162.	-	Di (99) 56	
113.	-	Di (99) 23	W/30/128	163.	-	Di (99) 57	M/13b.7
114.	-	Di (99) 24	W/31,32,35"	164.	-	Di (99) 58	M/13b.7
115.	-	Di (99) 25	W/69b/131	165.	-	Di (99) 59	M/13b.9+
116.	-	Di (99) 26		166.	-	Di (99) 60	
117.	-	ST (98) 21		167.	-	Di (99) 61	M/14a.1
118.	-	ST (98) 22		168.	-	Di (99) 62	M/14a.4
119.	-	ST (98) 23		169.	-	Di (99) 63	M/14a.5
120.	-	Di (99) 27		170.	-	Di (99) 64	M/14a.5
121.	-	Di (99) 28		171.	-	Di (99) 65	H/xxv.8
122.	-	Di (99) 29		172.	-	Di (99) 66	H/xxv.7
123.	-	ST (98) 1		173.	-	Di (99) 67	H/xxiv.5
124.	-	Di (99) 30		174.	-	Di (99) 68	
125.	-	Di (99) 31		175.	-	Di (99) 69	H/xxxv.6
126.	-	Di (99) 32		176.	-	Di (99) 70	H/xxxv.6
127.	-	Di (99) 33		177.	-	Di (99) 71	Bible
128.	-	ST (98) 31		178.	-	ST (98) 57	Bible
129.	-	ST (98) 2		179.	-	Di (99) 72	
130.	-	Di (99) 34		180.	-	Di (99) 73	H/xxiv.2
131.	-	ST (98) 3		181.	-	Di (99) 74	H/xxiii.9+
132.	-	Di (99) 35		182.	-	Di (99) 75	
133.	-	Di (99) 36		183.	-	Di (99) 76	
134.	-	ST (98) 83		184.	-	Di (99) 77	
135.	-	ST (98) 4		185.	-	Di (99) 78	H/xxiv.3
136.	-	Di (99) 37		186.	-	Di (99) 79	H/xxiv.3
137.	-	Di (99) 38		187.	-	Di (99) 80	H/xxiv.3
138.	-	ST (98) 68		188.	-	Di (99) 81	H/xxiv.4
139.	-	Di (99) 39	M/12a.3,.4	189.	-	Di (99) 82	H/xxiv.7
140.	-	Di (99) 40	M/12a.5	190.	-	Di (99) 83	H/xxiv.9
141.	-	Di (99) 41		191.	-	Di (99) 84	
142.	-	Di (99) 42		192.	-	Di (99) 85	H/xxiv.9
143.	-	Di (99) 43	M/11b.6	193.	-	Di (99) 86	H/xxiv.9
144.	-	ST (98) 36	M/11b.6	194.	-	Di (99) 87	
145.	-	Di (99) 44	M/13b.2	195.	-	Di (99) 88	
146.	-	Di (99) 45	M/13b.1	196.	-	Di (99) 89	
147.	-	Di (99) 46	M/13b.3	197.	-	Di (99) 90	
148.	-	Di (99) 47		198.	-	Di (99) 91	H/xxv.4
149.	-	Di (99) 48	M/13b.4,.7	199.	-	Di (99) 92	H/xxv.4
150.	-	Di (99) 49		200.	-	Di (99) 93	H/xxv.5

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 13

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
201.	-	Di (99) 94		251.	-		
202.	-	Di (99) 95	H/xxvi.3,.4	252.	-		
203.	-	Di (99) 96	H/xxvi.3	253.	-		
204.	-	Di (99) 97	H/xxvi.3	254.	-		
205.	-	Di (99) 98	H/xxvi.4	255.	-		
206.	-	Di (99) 99	H/xxvi.4	256.	-		
207.	-	Di (99) 100	H/xxvi.4,.7	257.	-		
208.	-	Di (99) 101	H/xxvi.4	258.	-		
209.	-	Di (99) 102	H/xxvi.6,.7	259.	-		
210.	-	Di (99) 103	H/xxvi.7,.8	260.	-		
211.	-	Di (99) 104	H/xxvi.9	261.	-		
212.	-	Di (99) 105	H/xxvi.9+	262.	-		
213.	-	Di (99) 106	H/xxvii.2	263.	-		
214.	-	Di (99) 107		264.	-		
215.	-	Di (99) 108		265.	-		
216.	-	Di (99) 109		266.	-		
217.	-	Di (99) 110		267.	-		
218.	-	Di (99) 111		268.	-		
219.	-	Di (99) 112		269.	-		
220.	-	Di (99) 113		270.	-		
221.	-	Di (99) 114		271.	-		
222.	-	Di (99) 115		272.	-		
223.	-	Di (99) 116		273.	-		
224.	-	Di (99) 117	M/15a.2	274.	-		
225.	-	Di (99) 118	M/15a.1	275.	-		
226.	-	Di (99) 119	M/15a.1	276.	-		
227.	-	Di (99) 120		277.	-		
228.	-	Di (99) 121		278.	-		
229.	-	Di (99) 122		279.	-		
230.	-	Di (99) 123		280.	-		
231.	-	Di (99) 124		281.	-		
232.	-	Di (99) 125	W/59,63c	282.	-		
233.	-	Di (99) 126	W/63c,65	283.	-		
234.	-	Di (99) 127		284.	-		
235.	-	Di (99) 128		285.	-		
236.	-	Di (99) 129		286.	-		
237.	-	Di (99) 130		287.	-		
238.	-	Di (99) 131		288.	-		
239.	-	Di (99) 132		289.	-		
240.	-	Di (99) 133		290.	-		
241.	-	Di (99) 134		291.	-		
242.	-	Di (99) 135		292.	-		
243.	-	Di (99) 136		293.	-		
244.	-	Di (99) 137		294.	-		
245.	-	Di (99) 138		295.	-		
246.	-	Di (99) 139		296.	-		
247.	-			297.	-		
248.	-			298.	-		
249.	-			299.	-		
250.	-			300.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 14

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	Di (99) 156	H/12/101	052.	-	MS (13) 11	
002.	-	Di (99) 159		053.	-	MS (13) 12	M/29b/286
003.	-	Di (99) 160		054.	-	MS (13) 13	M/29b/286
004.	-	Di (99) 161		055.	-	MS (13) 275	M/30a/286
005.	-	Di (99) 162		056.	-	MS (13) 276	M/30b/286
006.	-	Di (99) 163		057.	-	MS (13) 277	M/31/286
007.	-	Di (99) 154	H/8,9/101	058.	-	MS (13) 5	M/33/287
008.	-	Di (99) 151	H/7/100	059.	-	MS (13) 6	M/34/287
009.	-	Di (99) 164		060.	-	MS (13) 7	
010.	-	2SP 53/61+	H/1/100	061.	-	MS (13) 8	
011.	-	Di (99) 166	H/1/100	062.	-	MS (13) 9	M/35/287
012.	-	Di (99) 172	H/24,25/101	063.	-	MS (13) 10	M/35/287
013.	-	Di (99) 173	H/26/101	064.	-	MS (13) 278	M/42/287
014.	-	Di (99) 174	H/27/101	065.	-	MS (13) 279	M/43/287
015.	-	Di (99) 175	H/28/101	066.	-	Lt (47) 10.7	M/42,43/287
016.	-	DA (MS) 114/178	J/13,15/96	067.	-	RH (90) 59	M/43/287
017.	-	2SP 123/66	H/137/109	068.	-	MS (13) 156	M/47/287
018.	-	2SP 138/67	H/120c/108	069.	-	MS (13) 280	M/47/287
019.	-	MS (13) 1		070.	-	ST (84) 51	M/47/287
020.	-	MS (13) 2	M/1,2/285	071.	-	MS (13) 281	M/47/287
021.	-	MS (13) 3	M/3a/285	072.	-	ST (84) 52	M/47/287
022.	-	MS (13) 4	M/3b/285	073.	-	MS (13) 282	M/48/287
023.	-	MS (13) 251	M/4/285	074.	-	MS (13) 283	M/48/287
024.	-	MS (13) 14	M/5,8/285	075.	-	Lt (47) 11.3	M/48/287
025.	-	MS (13) 252	M/8a/285	076.	-	MS (13) 284	M/49/287
026.	-	MS (13) 253	M/8b/285	077.	-	ST (84) 57	M/49/287
027.	-	ST (84) 38	M/9/285	078.	-	MS (13) 285	M/49/287
028.	-	MS (13) 254	M/11/285	079.	-	MS (13) 286	M/49/287
029.	-	MS (13) 255	M/12/285	080.	-	MS (13) 287	
030.	-	ST (84) 34	M/12/285	081.	-	MS (13) 288	M/50a/288
031.	-	MS (13) 256	M/12/285	082.	-	MS (13) 289	
032.	-	ST (84) 35	M/12/285	083.	-	MS (13) 290	
033.	-	MS (13) 257	M/13,14/285	084.	-	MS (13) 291	M/50b/288
034.	-	MS (13) 258	M/15a/286	085.	-	MS (13) 292	M/50c/288
035.	-	MS (13) 259	M/15b/286	086.	-	MS (13) 293	M/50c,51/288
036.	-	MS (13) 260		087.	-	MS (13) 294	
037.	-	MS (13) 261	M/16/286	088.	-	MS (13) 295	
038.	-	MS (13) 262		089.	-	MS (13) 296	M/124/291
039.	-	MS (13) 263		090.	-	MS (13) 297	M/125/291
040.	-	MS (13) 264		091.	-	MS (13) 298	M/125/291
041.	-	MS (13) 155		092.	-	MS (13) 299	M/126/291
042.	-	MS (13) 265	M/18/286	093.	-	MS (13) 299a	M/127/291
043.	-	MS (13) 266	M/21/286	094.	-	MS (13) 300	M/129/291
044.	-	MS (13) 267	M/19/286	095.	-	MS (13) 301	M/131/291
045.	-	MS (13) 268	M/19/286	096.	-	MS (13) 302	M/131/291
046.	-	MS (13) 269	M/19,20/286	097.	-	ST (84) 83	M/131/291
047.	-	MS (13) 270	M/21/286	098.	-	MS (13) 303	
048.	-	MS (13) 271	M/24/286	099.	-	MS (13) 304a	M/138/292
049.	-	MS (13) 272	M/27/286	100.	-	MS (13) 304b	
050.	-	MS (13) 273	M/28/286	101.	-	ST (84) 85	M/138/292
051.	-	MS (13) 274	M/29a/286	102.	-	ST (84) 86	M/138/292

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 24

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	YI (73) 16	M/33/51+	051.	-	1RL 91/58	M/113,114/62
002.	-	YI (73) 17	M/34a/52	052.	-	Lt (4) 24	M/117/62
003.	-	YI (73) 18	M/34b/52	053.	-	1RL 95/58	M/118/62
004.	-	YI (73) 19	M/39-41/52,53	054.	-	Lt (4) 25	M/118/62
005.	-	YI (73) 20	M/46/54	055.	-	Lt (4) 43a	M/127/64
006.	-	YI (73) 21		056.	-	Lt (4) 43b	
007.	-	YI (73) 22	M/47,48/54	057.	-	Lt (4) 44	M/134/64
008.	-	YI (73) 23	M/50,51/54	058.	-		
009.	-	YI (73) 24	M/53/54+	059.	-		
010.	-	1RL 19/53	M/60/55	060.	-		
011.	-	Di (89) 4	M/WHJ/65/56	061.	-		
012.	-	1RL 25,26/54	M/71,88/57,59	062.	-		
013.	-	1RL 28/54	M/89,90/59	063.	-		
014.	-	Lt (4) 10	M/88/59	064.	-		
015.	-	Lt (4) 11	M/88,90/59	065.	-		
016.	-	1RL 28/54	M/72/57	066.	-		
017.	-	2SP 162/111	H/51/169	067.	-		
018.	-	1RL 46/55	M/83/59	068.	-		
019.	-	1RL 50/55	M/73/57	069.	-		
020.	-	Lt (4) 4	M/76/58	070.	-		
021.	-	2SP/163a/111	H/55/169	071.	-		
022.	-	1RL/52/56	M/84/59	072.	-		
023.	-	2SP 163b/111	H/56/169	073.	-		
024.	-	2SP 164/111	H/57,58/169	074.	-		
025.	-	Di (89) 12		075.	-		
026.	-	Di (89) 13		076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 166/111	H/59a/170	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 167/111	H/59a,b/170	078.	-		
029.	-	1RL 59/56	M/29/96	079.	-		
030.	-	1RL 57/56	M/85,86/59	080.	-		
031.	-	1RL 58/56	M/86,87/59	081.	-		
032.	-	1RL 60/56	M/87/59	082.	-		
033.	-	Lt (4) 9	M/86,87/59	083.	-		
034.	-	Di (89) 22	M/56/100	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 174/112	H/64/170	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 175a/112		086.	-		
037.	-	2SP 175b/112		087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 176/112	H/67/170	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 181/113	H/67/170	089.	-		
040.	-	2SP 190/114		090.	-		
041.	-	1RL 74/57	M/101/61	091.	-		
042.	-	1RL 75/57	M/102,104a,b/61	092.	-		
043.	-	1RL 76/57	M/104c/61	093.	-		
044.	-	1RL 77/57	M/104d/61	094.	-		
045.	-	1RL 80/57	M/105/61	095.	-		
046.	-	Di (89) 37		096.	-		
047.	-	1RL 88/58	M/109/62	097.	-		
048.	-	1RL 90/58	M/110/62	098.	-		
049.	-	Lt (4) 21	M/109,110/62	099.	-		
050.	-	1 RL 92/58	M/115/62	100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 37

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	DA(MS)15/471	Bible	051.	-		
002.	-	DA(MS)17/471	H/3/268	052.	-		
003.	-	3RL 96/59	H/3/268	053.	-		
004.	-	2SP 159/255	H/3/268	054.	-		
005.	-	DA(MS)18/471	H/4/268	055.	-		
006.	-	3RL 97/59	H/4/268	056.	-		
007.	-	2SP 160/255	H/4/268	057.	-		
008.	-	DA(MS)20/471		058.	-		
009.	-	3RL 98/59		059.	-		
010.	-	DA(MS)22/471		060.	-		
011.	-	3RL 102/59		061.	-		
012.	-	DA(MS)25/471	H/5-6/268	062.	-		
013.	-	RH (93) 1		063.	-		
014.	-	RH (93) 2		064.	-		
015.	-	RH (93) 3		065.	-		
016.	-	2SP 163/256	H/8,9/268	066.	-		
017.	-	2SP 164/256	H/17/269	067.	-		
018.	-	RH (92) 48	P/67.3	068.	-		
019.	-	2SP 165/256	H/24/269	069.	-		
020.	-	2SP 166a/256	H/26/269	070.	-		
021.	-	2SP 166b/256	H/27/269	071.	-		
022.	-	2SP 166c/256	H/28/269	072.	-		
023.	-	DA(MS)58/474	H/GT/343.9	073.	-		
024.	-	2SP 167/256	H/36/269	074.	-		
025.	-	2SP 168/256+	H/38a/269	075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 169/257	H/38b/269	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 170/257	H/38b/269	077.	-		
028.	-	SC 13/12	M/10/187	078.	-		
029.	-	2SP 171a/257	H/56/271	079.	-		
030.	-	2SP 171b/257	H/57/271	080.	-		
031.	-	2SP 173a/257	H/58/271	081.	-		
032.	-	2SP 173b/257	H/59/271	082.	-		
033.	-	2SP 172/257	H/60/271	083.	-		
034.	-	2SP 174/257	H/63,64a/271	084.	-		
035.	-	2SP 175/257	H/61/271	085.	-		
036.	-	2SP 176/257	H/61/271	086.	-		
037.	-	2SP 177/257	H/62/271	087.	-		
038.	-	2SP 178/257	H/64b/271	088.	-		
039.	-	2SP 179/258	H/65/271	089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 39

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	ST (97) 3		051.	-		
002.	-	2SP 4/259	M/2b/99	052.	-		
003.	-	2SP 5/259	H/22/278	053.	-		
004.	-	2SP 6/259	H/22/278	054.	-		
005.	-	2SP 8/259	H/23/278	055.	-		
006.	-	2SP 9/259	M/1/99	056.	-		
007.	-	2SP 14/259	M/5/99+	057.	-		
008.	-	2SP 15/259	M/5/99+	058.	-		
009.	-	2SP 36/261	Bible	059.	-		
010.	-	2SP 46/262	H/42,43/279	060.	-		
011.	-	ST (97) 51	C/8/89	061.	-		
012.	-	ST (97) 45	C/6/89	062.	-		
013.	-	ST (97) 46	C/6,7/89	063.	-		
014.	-	ST (97) 48	C/6,8/89	064.	-		
015.	-	ST (97) 47	C/6,7/89	065.	-		
016.	-	ST (97) 49	C/7/89	066.	-		
			C/2/90	067.	-		
017.	-	ST (97) 54	C/1/90	068.	-		
018.	-	ST (97) 55	C/2/90	069.	-		
019.	-	ST (97) 56		070.	-		
020.	-	ST (97) 57	C/2/90	071.	-		
021.	-	ST (97) 75	C/12/88	072.	-		
022.	-	ST (97) 102	W/14/246	073.	-		
023.	-	ST (97) 103	W/13/246	074.	-		
024.	-	ST (97) 104	W/13/246	075.	-		
025.	-			076.	-		
026.	-			077.	-		
027.	-			078.	-		
028.	-			079.	-		
029.	-			080.	-		
030.	-			081.	-		
031.	-			082.	-		
032.	-			083.	-		
033.	-			084.	-		
034.	-			085.	-		
035.	-			086.	-		
036.	-			087.	-		
037.	-			088.	-		
038.	-			089.	-		
039.	-			090.	-		
040.	-			091.	-		
041.	-			092.	-		
042.	-			093.	-		
043.	-			094.	-		
044.	-			095.	-		
045.	-			096.	-		
046.	-			097.	-		
047.	-			098.	-		
048.	-			099.	-		
049.	-			100.	-		
050.	-						

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 46

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	2SP 4/324+	M/16/146+	050.	-		
002.	-	2SP 8/325	M/22/147	051.	-		
003.	-	2SP 9/325	M/23/147	052.	-		
004.	-	2SP 14/325+	M/27/148	053.	-		
005.	-	2SP 16/326	M/28/148	054.	-		
006.	-	2SP 18/326	M/32/148	055.	-		
007.	-	2SP 19/326	M/33/148+	056.	-		
008.	-	2SP 20/326	M/37,40/150	057.	-		
009.	-	2SP 22/326	M/46,39/150	058.	-		
010.	-	2SP 23/326	M/48/150	059.	-		
011.	-	2SP 24/326	M/46,39/150	060.	-		
012.	-	2SP 30/327	M/68,71/154	061.	-		
013.	-	2SP 39/328	M/75,76/155	062.	-		
014.	-	2SP 40/328	M/77/155	063.	-		
015.	-	2SP 41/328	M/78/155	064.	-		
016.	-	2SP 56/330	M/82/156	065.	-		
017.	-	2SP 37/328	H/30/331	066.	-		
018.	-	2SP 44/328	M/79/155	067.	-		
019.	-	2SP 45/329	M/79/155+	068.	-		
020.	-	2SP 74/336		069.	-		
021.	-	2SP 75/336		070.	-		
022.	-	2SP 58/330	M/97/158	071.	-		
023.	-	2SP 59/330+	F/5/182	072.	-		
024.	-	2SP 60/331	M/81/156	073.	-		
			(F/1/183)	074.	-		
025.	-	2SP 55/330	F/2/182	075.	-		
026.	-	2SP 66/331	M/86,90/157	076.	-		
027.	-	2SP 67/331	F/9/183	077.	-		
028.	-	2SP 71/336	M/169.3	078.	-		
029.	-	2SP 72/336	M/170.3	079.	-		
030.	-			080.	-		
031.	-			081.	-		
032.	-			082.	-		
033.	-			083.	-		
034.	-			084.	-		
035.	-			085.	-		
036.	-			086.	-		
037.	-			087.	-		
038.	-			088.	-		
039.	-			089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 53

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	ST (94) 36	H/60-62/407	051.	-		
002.	-	ST (94) 38	H/63-65/407	052.	-		
003.	-	ST (94) 40	H/67/408	053.	-		
004.	-	ST (94) 41	H/68/408	054.	-		
005.	-	ST (94) 42	H/70/408	055.	-		
006.	-			056.	-		
007.	-			057.	-		
008.	-			058.	-		
009.	-			059.	-		
010.	-			060.	-		
011.	-			061.	-		
012.	-			062.	-		
013.	-			063.	-		
014.	-			064.	-		
015.	-			065.	-		
016.	-			066.	-		
017.	-			067.	-		
018.	-			068.	-		
019.	-			069.	-		
020.	-			070.	-		
021.	-			071.	-		
022.	-			072.	-		
023.	-			073.	-		
024.	-			074.	-		
025.	-			075.	-		
026.	-			076.	-		
027.	-			077.	-		
028.	-			078.	-		
029.	-			079.	-		
030.	-			080.	-		
031.	-			081.	-		
032.	-			082.	-		
033.	-			083.	-		
034.	-			084.	-		
035.	-			085.	-		
036.	-			086.	-		
037.	-			087.	-		
038.	-			088.	-		
039.	-			089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 72

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	3SP 22/83	H/1/613	051.	-		
002.	-	3SP 23/83	H/2/613	052.	-		
003.	-	3SP 27/83	H/8/613	053.	-		
004.	-	3SP 28/83	H/3/613	054.	-		
005.	-	3SP 29/84	H/10a/613	055.	-		
006.	-	3SP 30/84	H/10b/613	056.	-		
007.	-	3SP 73/87		057.	-		
008.	-	3SP 74/87	M/8/308	058.	-		
009.	-	RH (97) 65	BoydWH/565.1	059.	-		
010.	-	RH (97) 66	BoydWH/565.1	060.	-		
011.	-	RH (97) 69	Boyd/565.1	061.	-		
012.	-	RH (97) 70	Boyd/565.1	062.	-		
013.	-	RH (97) 72	Boyd/565.1	063.	-		
014.	-	RH (97) 73	Boyd/565.1	064.	-		
015.	-	RH (97) 74	Boyd/565.1	065.	-		
016.	-	RH (97) 92	Boyd/566.2	066.	-		
017.	-			067.	-		
018.	-			068.	-		
019.	-			069.	-		
020.	-			070.	-		
021.	-			071.	-		
022.	-			072.	-		
023.	-			073.	-		
024.	-			074.	-		
025.	-			075.	-		
026.	-			076.	-		
027.	-			077.	-		
028.	-			078.	-		
029.	-			079.	-		
030.	-			080.	-		
031.	-			081.	-		
032.	-			082.	-		
033.	-			083.	-		
034.	-			084.	-		
035.	-			085.	-		
036.	-			086.	-		
037.	-			087.	-		
038.	-			088.	-		
039.	-			089.	-		
040.	-			090.	-		
041.	-			091.	-		
042.	-			092.	-		
043.	-			093.	-		
044.	-			094.	-		
045.	-			095.	-		
046.	-			096.	-		
047.	-			097.	-		
048.	-			098.	-		
049.	-			099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	MS (51) 1	F/10/596	051.	-	MS (51) 34	
002.	-	3SP 1/106	M/6/310	052.	-	MS (51) 35	
003.	-	3SP 2/106	B/361.1	053.	-	3SP 103/115	M/319.0
004.	-	3SP 3/106	M/6,7/310	054.	-	MS (51) 36	F/68a/602
005.	-	MS (51) 2	F/10//596	055.	-	MS (51) 39	F/171,72/603
006.	-	MS (51) 3	F/30/599	056.	-	MS (51) 37	F/68b,69/602
007.	-	MS (51) 4a	F/35/600	057.	-	MS (51) 38	F/70/602
008.	-	MS (51) 4b	F/37/600	058.	-	3SP 1/107	M/1,8/310
009.	-	MS (51) 5	F/39/600	059.	-	3SP 2/107	M/8/310
010.	-	MS (51) 6	F/43,44/600+	060.	-	3SP 84/113	H/12,16/663
011.	-	MS (51) 7	Bible	061.	-	3SP 3/107	M/311.0
012.	-	MS (51) 8	F/46/60	062.	-	MS (51) 40	F/76/603
013.	-	MS (51) 9	F/45/601	063.	-	MS (51) 41	F/78/603
014.	-	MS (51) 10	F/45/601	064.	-	MS (51) 42	F/79/603
015.	-	MS (51) 11	F/47,48/601	065.	-	MS (51) 43	F/82/604
016.	-	MS (51) 12		066.	-	MS (51) 117	F/72/615
017.	-	MS (51) 13		067.	-	MS (51) 44	F/83/604
018.	-	MS (51) 14	F/50/601	068.	-	MS (51) 115	F/71/615
019.	-	MS (51) 15	F/51/601	069.	-	MS (51) 45	F/84/604
020.	-	MS (51) 16	F/52/601	070.	-	MS (51) 46	F/85a/604
021.	-	MS (51) 17		071.	-	MS (51) 47	F/85a/604
022.	-	3SP 85/113	H/17b/664	072.	-	MS (51) 48	F/85b/604
023.	-	3SP 86/113	H/17b/664	073.	-	MS (51) 49	F/88a/604
024.	-	MS (51) 18	F/53/601	074.	-	MS (51) 50	F/88b/604
025.	-	3SP 93/114	H/18-20/664	075.	-	MS (51) 51	F/92/604
026.	-	3SP 94/114	H/24/664	076.	-	MS (51) 52	F/94a/604
027.	-	MS (51) 19	F/54,55/601	077.	-	MS (51) 53	F/94b/604
028.	-	MS (51) 22	F/59a/602	078.	-	MS (51) 54	
029.	-	MS (51) 23	F/59b/602	079.	-	MS (51) 55	F/95/605
030.	-	MS (51) 127	F/80/615	080.	-	MS (51) 56	F/97/605
031.	-	MS (51) 128	F/80/615	081.	-	MS (51) 57	F/97,98/605
032.	-	3SP 95/114	Bible	082.	-	MS (51) 58	F/99,100/605
033.	-	MS (51) 20	Bible	083.	-	MS (51) 59	F/101/605
034.	-	3SP 96/114	H/29/665	084.	-	MS (51) 60	K/408.3
035.	-	3SP 97/114		085.	-	MS (51) 61	F/105/605
036.	-	3SP 98/114		086.	-	MS (51) 62	F/107/605
037.	-	MS (51) 21	F/57,58/601	087.	-	MS (51) 63	F/108/605
038.	-	MS (51) 24		088.	-	MS (51) 64	F/109a/605
039.	-	MS (51) 25		089.	-	MS (51) 65	F/109a/605
040.	-	3SP 99/114	F/62/602	090.	-	MS (51) 66	K/408.3
041.	-	MS (51) 26	F/62/602	091.	-	MS (51) 67	F/110/605
042.	-	3SP 100/114	H/36/665	092.	-	3SP 161/119	H/64/667
043.	-	MS (51) 27		093.	-	3SP 166/120	H/69/667
044.	-	3SP 101/114+	H/37/665	094.	-	MS (51) 68	
045.	-	MS (51) 28	F/63/602	095.	-	3SP 167/120	H/70/667
046.	-	MS (51) 29		096.	-	MS (102) 14	H/70/667
047.	-	MS (51) 30		097.	-	MS (102) 15	
048.	-	MS (51) 31		098.	-	MS (102) 27	
049.	-	MS (51) 32	F/65/602	099.	-	MS (102) 28	
050.	-	MS (51) 33	F/66/602	100.	-	MS (102) 31	

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
101.	-	MS (102) 32		151.	-	MS (111) 88	
102.	-	MS (102) 33		152.	-	Di (944) 2	
103.	-	MS (102) 34		153.	-	MS (111) 89	
104.	-	MS (102) 35		154.	-	Di (94) 3	
105.	-	MS (102) 36		155.	-	MS (111) 90	
106.	-	MS (102) 37		156.	-	MS (111) 91	
107.	-	3SP 172/120	H/72-79/667	157.	-	MS (102) 61	
108.	-	MS (51) 69	F/116-120/606	158.	-	MS (102) 62	
109.	-	MS (102) 38	Bible	159.	-	MS (102) 63	
110.	-	MS (102) 39	Bible	160.	-	MS (102) 64	
111.	-	MS (51) 70	Bible	161.	-	MS (102) 65	
112.	-	MS (102) 40	Bible	162.	-	MS (102) 66	F/606
113.	-	3SP 174/121	Bible	163.	-	MS (102) 67	
114.	-	MS (51) 71	Bible	164.	-	MS (102) 68	
115.	-	MS (102) 41	Bible	165.	-	MS (102) 69	B/372.9
116.	-	MS (102) 44		166.	-	MS (102) 82	B/372.9
117.	-	Di (94) 11		167.	-	MS (102) 102	
118.	-	MS (102) 45		168.	-	MS (102) 103	
119.	-	MS (111) 45		169.	-	MS (102) 104	
120.	-	Di (94) 10		170.	-	MS (51) 73	F/2/608
121.	-	MS (102) 46		171.	-	MS (51) 72	F/2/608
122.	-	MS (111) 44		172.	-	MS (51) 74	F/3/608
123.	-	MS (102) 48		173.	-	MS (51) 75	F/3/608
124.	-	MS (102) 49		174.	-	MS (51) 99	F/52/612
125.	-	MS (102) 47		175.	-	MS (51) 100	F/52/612
126.	-	MS (102) 53		176.	-	MS (51) 101	
127.	-	MS (102) 54		177.	-	MS (51) 102	F/53/612
128.	-	Di (94) 12		178.	-	MS (51) 103	F/53/612
129.	-	MS (111) 46		179.	-	MS (51) 104	F/57/613
130.	-	MS (111) 47		180.	-	MS (51) 105	
131.	-	MS (111) 48		181.	-	MS (51) 106	
132.	-	Di (94) 13		182.	-	MS (51) 76	
133.	-	MS (111) 49		183.	-	MS (51) 77	
134.	-	MS (111) 50		184.	-	MS (51) 78	F/1/608
135.	-	Di (94) 14		185.	-	MS (51) 79	
136.	-	MS (111) 51		186.	-	3SP 4/107	M/10/311
137.	-	Di (94) 15		187.	-	MS (51) 80	F/67/608
138.	-	Di (94) 16		188.	-	3SP 5/107	M/10/311
139.	-	Di (94) 17		189.	-	MS (51) 81	F/6/608
140.	-	MS (111) 82		190.	-	MS (51) 82	
141.	-	Di (94) 18		191.	-	MS (51) 83	Bible
142.	-	MS (111) 83		192.	-	MS (51) 84	M/10/311
143.	-	MS (111) 84		193.	-	3SP 6/107	H/1-4/653
144.	-	Di (94) 19		194.	-	MS (51) 85	Bible
145.	-	MS (111) 85		195.	-	MS (51) 86	
146.	-	Di (94) 20		196.	-	3SP 9/107	H/5,6/653
147.	-	MS (111) 86		197.	-	3SP 10/107	H/8/653
148.	-	Di (94) 21		198.	-	3SP 11/108	H/8,10/693,4
149.	-	MS (111) 87		199.	-	MS (51) 87	Bible
150.	-	Di (94) 1		200.	-	MS (104) 93	H/13-16/654

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 75

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
201.	-	MS (104) 94	F/17/609	251.	-	MS (51) 98	H/121/658
202.	-	3SP 14/108	H/17/654	252.	-	MS (104) 125	H/122,123/659
203.	-	MS (51) 88	Bible	253.	-	3SP 52/110+	H/126/659
204.	-	MS (104) 95	H/17/654	254.	-	MS (104) 126	H/126/654
205.	-	MS (104) 96	H/17,18/654	255.	-	MS (104) 127	
206.	-	MS (104) 97	H/21,22/654	256.	-	MS (51) 122	F/78/615
207.	-	MS (51) 89	Bible	257.	-	MS (51) 123a	F/77/615
208.	-	MS (104) 98	Bible	258.	-	MS (51) 123b	F/79a/615
209.	-	MS (104) 99	H/24,30/654	259.	-	MS (51) 124	F/79b/615
210.	-	MS (104) 100		260.	-	MS (51) 134	F/91/616
211.	-	3SP 22/108	H/69-74/656	261.	-	MS (51) 136	F/92b/617
212.	-	RH (91) 42	H/56-63/655	262.	-	MS (51) 137	F/93/617
213.	-	RH (91) 43	H/56/655				
214.	-	MS (104) 109					
215.	-	MS (104) 110					
216.	-	RH (91) 39	H/29-30/654				
217.	-	3SP 29/109	H/35/654				
218.	-	3SP 30/109	H/31,32/654				
219.	-	RH (91) 41	H/41/655				
220.	-	MS (104) 114	Bible				
221.	-	MS (51) 90	F/33,36/611				
222.	-	MS (104) 115	Bible				
223.	-	3SP 33/109					
224.	-	MS (51) 91	Bible				
225.	-	MS (104) 116					
226.	-	3SP 34/109					
227.	-	MS (51) 92	Bible				
228.	-	MS (104) 117					
229.	-	MS (51) 94	Bible				
230.	-	MS (104) 118	Bible				
231.	-	3SP 35/109	H/87-100/656+				
232.	-	MS (51) 93	Bible				
233.	-	MS (104) 119	H/87-100/656+				
234.	-	3SP 36/109					
235.	-	MS (104) 120					
236.	-	MS (104) 121	H/101,102/657				
237.	-	RH (92) 77	I/364.8				
238.	-	MS (51) 96	F/42-44/612				
239.	-	MS (51) 97	F/44/612				
240.	-	MS (104) 122					
241.	-	MS (104) 123					
242.	-	MS (104) 124	I/364.8				
243.	-	3SP 38a/109	H/93,94/657				
244.	-	3SP 38b/109+	H/93,94/657				
245.	-	3SP 38c/110	H/113/658				
246.	-	3SP 45/110	H/106/657				
247.	-	3SP 41/110	H/112/658				
248.	-	3SP 42/110	H/107/658				
249.	-	3SP 43/110					
250.	-	MS (51) 95	Bible				

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 76

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	3SP3/81		051.	-		
002.	-	3SP4/81+	H/15/644	052.	-		
003.	-	3SP5/82	H/110/649	053.	-		
004.	-	3SP6/82	H/110/649	054.	-		
005.	-	3SP7/82	H/84/648	055.	-		
006.	-	3SP15/82	H/83/648	056.	-		
007.	-	3SP16/82	H/129/650	057.	-		
008.	-	3SP17/82+	H/130/650	058.	-		
009.	-	3SP18/83	H/130/650	059.	-		
010.	-	3SP8/82	H/83/648	060.	-		
011.	-	3SP9/82	H/83/648	061.	-		
012.	-	MS(28)30	D/55/96	062.	-		
013.	-	MS(28)31	D/55/96	063.	-		
014.	-	MS(28)3	D/57/96	064.	-		
015.	-	MS(28)27	D/60/97	065.	-		
016.	-	MS(28)34		066.	-		
017.	-	MS(28)35		067.	-		
018.	-	MS(28)36		068.	-		
019.	-	MS(28)37	D/57b/96	069.	-		
020.	-	MS(28)38	D/57a/96	070.	-		
021.	-	MS(28)39	D/57c/96	071.	-		
022.	-	MS(28)44	D/58/96	072.	-		
023.	-	MS(120)27	E/95/77	073.	-		
024.	-	MS(120)28	E/76,77a/473	074.	-		
025.	-	MS(120)29		075.	-		
026.	-	MS(120)30	E/77a/473	076.	-		
027.	-	MS(120)31	E/77b/473	077.	-		
028.	-	MS(120)33	E/77c/473	078.	-		
029.	-	MS(120)34	E/77c/473	079.	-		
030.	-	MS(120)35	E/77c/473	080.	-		
031.	-	MS(120)36	E/77c/473	081.	-		
032.	-	MS(120)38	E/82/474	082.	-		
033.	-	MS(120)40	E/91/475	083.	-		
034.	-	MS(120)42	E/85/474	084.	-		
035.	-	MS(120)44	E/87/474	085.	-		
036.	-	MS(120)45	E/88/474	086.	-		
037.	-	MS(120)47	E/88/474	087.	-		
038.	-	MS(120)50	E/89/474	088.	-		
039.	-	MS(120)64	F/556.6	089.	-		
040.	-	MS(28)48	D/81/100	090.	-		
041.	-	MS(28)49		091.	-		
042.	-	MS(28)50		092.	-		
043.	-	3SP27/125	H/124/650	093.	-		
044.	-	3SP33/126	Bible	094.	-		
045.	-	3SP16/124		095.	-		
046.	-	3SP28/125		096.	-		
047.	-	3SP32/126	H/125/650	097.	-		
048.	-	MS(120)101	I/1/402	098.	-		
049.	-	3SP37/126	K/209.8	099.	-		
050.	-			100.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
001.	-	MS(113)1	M/8, 11a/414	051.	-	ST(88)25	March31/416
002.	-	MS(113)2		052.	-	3SP62b/212	M/26, 30/416
003.	-	MS(113)3	M/11a/414	053.	-	ST(88)49b	March30/416
004.	-	3SP1/206	Bible	054.	-	3SP63/212	M/28, 29/416
005.	-	3SP2/206		055.	-	ST(88)49a	March29/416
006.	-	MS(113)4	March 9/414	056.	-	ST(88)39	March35/417
007.	-	MS(113)5	March10/414	057.	-	ST(88)47	March27/416
008.	-	MS(113)6	March10/414	058.	-	ST(88)48	March35/417
009.	-	MS(113)7		059.	-	3SP88/214	H/100f/801
010.	-	MS(113)8	M/11b/414	060.	-	3SP65/212	March37/417
011.	-	MS(113)15	March17/414	061.	-	3SP66/212	March37/417
012.	-	RH(78)1	M/7, 9, 17/414f	062.	-	3SP67/212	March37/417
013.	-	3SP7a/207	Hannal0/795	063.	-	3SP68/212	March38/417
014.	-	3SP7b/208	Hannal1/795	064.	-	3SP68b/212	March38/417
015.	-	3SP4/206	H/32, 33/796	065.	-	3SP69/212	March40/417
016.	-	3SP5/206	H/32, 33/796	066.	-	ST(88)44	March40/417
017.	-	3SP15/207	H/32, 33/796	067.	-	3SP70a/212	Hannal10/801
018.	-	3SP6/206	March17/415	068.	-	3SP70b/212	Hannal11/801
019.	-	MS(113)16	March18/415	069.	-	ST(88)45	Hannal14/802
020.	-	ST(88)3	March20/415	070.	-	3SP71/212	H/112-116/802
021.	-	ST(88)4	M/19, 20/415	071.	-	3SP74/213	M/49, 50a/418
022.	-	3SP8a/207	March21/415	072.	-	ST(88)50	M/49, 50a/418
023.	-	ST(88)5a	March21/415	073.	-	RH(78)12	March41/418
024.	-	MS(113)21	March21/415	074.	-	ST(88)42b	March42/418
025.	-	3SP8b/207	March22/415	075.	-	ST(88)40	M/43b/418
026.	-	ST(88)5b	Hannal7/795	076.	-	ST(88)42a	M/43a/418
027.	-	3SP11a/207	Hanna26/795	077.	-	3SP77/213	M/44, 45/418
028.	-	3SP11b/207	Hanna26/795	078.	-	3SP78/213	March50/418
029.	-	MS(113)26	H/23-26/795	079.	-	ST(88)51	March50/418
030.	-	MS(113)20	Hanna27/795	080.	-	3SP79a/213	March51/418
031.	-	3SP12/207	H/27, 28/795f	081.	-	RH(78)10a	Hannal22/802
032.	-	3SP13/207	Hanna31/796	082.	-	3SP79b/213	H/123f/802
033.	-	3SP14/207	Hanna29/796	083.	-	3SP80a/213	Hannal23/802
034.	-	3SP16a/207	Hanna42/796	084.	-	MS(113)85	March52/419
035.	-	3SP16b/2007	Hanna43/796	085.	-	3SP82/213	Hannal26/802
036.	-	3SP17/207	H/43, 44/796	086.	-	ST(88)55	March54/419
037.	-	MS(113)28b	H/19-21/795	087.	-	ST(88)56	March54/419
038.	-	RH(78)5a	Hanna69/798	088.	-	ST(88)57	Hannal28/802
039.	-	RH(78)5b,c	Hanna70/798	089.	-	ST(88)58	M/56, 57/419
040.	-	3SP26/208	M/25b/416	090.	-	3SP86/213	March57/419
041.	-	3SP27/208	March26/416	091.	-	ST(88)59	March57/419
042.	-	3SP28a/208	March26/416	092.	-	3SP85a/213	Hannal29/802
043.	-	3SP62a/212	M/26, 27/416	093.	-	3SP85b/213	Hannal31/802
044.	-	3SP28b/208	M/26b/416	094.	-	3SP91/214	Hannal03/801
045.	-	3SP89/214	H/104/801	095.	-	3SP92a/214	Hannal05/801
046.	-	3SP46/210	Hanna83/799	096.	-	3SP93/214	March59/419
047.	-	3SP30b/208	Hanna87/799	097.	-	3SP94/215	Hanna 1/802
048.	-	3SP39/210	Hanna92/800	098.	-	3SP97b/215	Hanna 4/803
049.	-	3SP42/210	Hanna94/800	099.	-	3SP97a/215	M/60, 61/419
050.	-	3SP18/207	Bible	100.	-	ST(88)64	March60/419

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 83

No.	-	Text	Sources	No.	-	Text	Sources
101.	-	3SP99a/215	H/5,6/803	151.	-		
102.	-	ST(88)65	Hanna6/803	152.	-		
103.	-	3SP100/215	H/8,9/803	153.	-		
104.	-	3SP101/215	Hanna9/803	154.	-		
105.	-	3SP104/215	March69/420	155.	-		
106.	-	3SP99c/215	Hanna7/803	156.	-		
107.	-	MS(113)95	M/64,65/419	157.	-		
108.	-	3SP103/215	M/64-66/419	158.	-		
109.	-	ST(88)69	M/65-66/419	159.	-		
110.	-	ST(88)68	March67/419	160.	-		
111.	-	ST(88)66	March68/419	161.	-		
112.	-	3SP107/215	Hanna10/803	162.	-		
113.	-	3SP108/215	M/71-74/420	163.	-		
114.	-			164.	-		
115.	-			165.	-		
116.	-			166.	-		
117.	-			167.	-		
118.	-			168.	-		
119.	-			169.	-		
120.	-			170.	-		
121.	-			171.	-		
122.	-			172.	-		
123.	-			173.	-		
124.	-			174.	-		
125.	-			175.	-		
126.	-			176.	-		
127.	-			177.	-		
128.	-			178.	-		
129.	-			179.	-		
130.	-			180.	-		
131.	-			181.	-		
132.	-			182.	-		
133.	-			183.	-		
134.	-			184.	-		
135.	-			185.	-		
136.	-			186.	-		
137.	-			187.	-		
138.	-			188.	-		
139.	-			189.	-		
140.	-			190.	-		
141.	-			191.	-		
142.	-			192.	-		
143.	-			193.	-		
144.	-			194.	-		
145.	-			195.	-		
146.	-			196.	-		
147.	-			197.	-		
148.	-			198.	-		
149.	-			199.	-		
150.	-			2:0.	-		

Pre-Desire of Ages Ellen White Literary Sources for Chapter 84

No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA	No.	-	Text	Eval.	DA
001.	-	3SP1/216	M/75/420		051.	-	MS(149)45	H/69a/808	
002.	-	3SP2/216	M/76-78/420		052.	-	MS(149)46	H/88/809	
003.	-	3SP3/216	M/78,79/421		053.	-	MS(149)51	H/69b/808	
004.	-	MS(113)112	M/75-78/420f		054.	-	MS(149)52	H/70/808	
005.	-	MS(113)113	M/79,80/421		055.	-	MS(149)53	H/71/808	
006.	-	3SP5/216	M/80/421		056.	-	MS(149)54	H/72/808	
007.	-	MS(113)114	M/81/421		057.	-	MS(149)59	H/76/808	
008.	-	MS(113)115	M/82/421		058.	-	MS(149)61	H/76/808	
009.	-	MS(113)116	M/82/421		059.	-	MS(149)62	H/76/808	
010.	-	MS(113)117	M/83a/421		060.	-	MS(149)55	H/83/808	
011.	-	3SP6a/216	M/83ab/421		061.	-	MS(149)86	H/78-80/808	
012.	-	ST(88)71	M/82,83b/421		062.	-	MS(149)56	H/85/809	
013.	-	3SP6b/216			063.	-	3SP49/219	H/1/811	
014.	-	ST(88)72	M/83,85a/421		064.	-	3SP47/219	H/6/811	
015.	-	3SP7/216	H/15/803		065.	-	3SP63/221	H/100/817	
016.	-	3SP9a/216	H/16a/803		066.	-	3SP64/221	H/110-112/818	
017.	-	3SP9b/216	H/16b/803		067.	-	3SP65/221	H/115/818	
018.	-	3SP10/216+	H/17a/803		068.	-	3SP72/222	H/132/819	
019.	-	3SP11/217	H/17b/803		069.	-	3SP73/222	H/133,136+/819	
020.	-	MS(113)121	M/85ab/421		070.	-	3SP74/222	H/135,137/819	
021.	-	MS(113)122	M/85c/421		071.	-			
022.	-	MS(113)123	M/85d, f/421		072.	-			
023.	-	MS(113)124	M/85f/421		073.	-			
024.	-	MS(113)125	M/85e, g/421		074.	-			
025.	-	MS(113)126	M/86/421		075.	-			
026.	-	3SP14/217	H/17-19/803		076.	-			
027.	-	3SP15/217	H/21/803		077.	-			
028.	-	ST(88)73	M/86/421		078.	-			
029.	-	ST(88)75	M/90/422		079.	-			
030.	-	ST(88)76	M/87,91/422		080.	-			
031.	-	3SP35/218	M/105/423		081.	-			
032.	-	3SP36/218	M/102,105+/423		092.	-			
033.	-	3SP37/219	M/110/423		083.	-			
034.	-	3SP40a/219	M/118/424		084.	-			
035.	-	3SP40b/219	M/119/424		085.	-			
036.	-	3SP40c/219	M/120/424		086.	-			
037.	-	3SP41/219	M/135/425		087.	-			
038.	-	3SP44/219	M/152/426		088.	-			
039.	-	3SP31/218	H/36/804		089.	-			
040.	-	MS(149)28	H/47/806		090.	-			
041.	-	MS(149)29	H/49/806		091.	-			
042.	-	MS(149)36	H/53/806		092.	-			
043.	-	MS(149)35	H/50/806		093.	-			
044.	-	MS(149)34	H/51/806		094.	-			
045.	-	MS(149)38	H/56/806		095.	-			
046.	-	MS(149)39	H/48,50/806		096.	-			
047.	-	MS(149)33	H/50,51/806		097.	-			
048.	-	MS(149)40			098.	-			
049.	-	MS(149)47	H/55/806		099.	-			
050.	-	MS(149)48	H/57/807		100.	-			

APPENDIX D

Appendix D contains the documentary evidence to support Ellen G. White and source quotations referred to in the analyses of certain chapters of the study. The exhibits for each chapter will be described on the title sheet for that particular section of Appendix D. The sections of the appendix will be designated according to the DA chapters for which they contain documents.

The exhibits vary as to nature and extent. Space limitations did not allow us in every case to present the full text of the Ellen White letter, manuscript, or article. The same limitations apply to source documents. We have endeavored, however, to present enough of the text in each instance to provide a literary context for the portion selected.

When there are multiple presentations of the Ellen White text we follow a chronological order. If we have the handwritten text of Ellen White it will be given first in photocopy form. The secretary's copy will follow, and the published form(s) come last. For duplication purposes we have re-typed the typescript copies exactly as they appear (except perhaps for paging). We have also added sentence numbers corresponding to the references given in the text presentation of the body of this research report. The published articles have been pasted up and photocopied in their published format. We have not usually carried the underlining and bold lettering into the appendices. We have attempted to present the textual evidence in a neutral form for study by the reader.

TABLE OF CONTENTS
APPENDIX D

<u>DA</u> Chapter 3	Diary Book 17/MS 24, 1891	1
(pre- <u>DA</u> material)		
.	Ltr 43, 1895	6
.	RH Oct. 22, 1893	16
<u>DA</u> Chapter 13	Diary Book 14, 1890	19
.	Diary Book 32, 1899	33
.	MS 143, 1897	65
.	ST June 9, 1898	79
<u>DA</u> Chapter 14	2SP 61-68	81
.	MS 13, 1884	89
.	ST July 31, 1884	120
.	RH Nov. 11, 1890	124
.	Ltr 47, 1893	127
.	Diary Book 32, 1899	132
<u>DA</u> Chapter 24	MS 40, 1887	149
.	ST June 16, 1887	156
.	RH Feb. 7, 1888	159
.	Ltr 4, 1889	162
.	Diary Book 14, 1889	166
<u>DA</u> Chapter 37	DA(MS) 36 [37]	169
<u>DA</u> Chapter 53	MS 55, 1894	172
.	ST Dec. 10, 1894	179
<u>DA</u> Chapter 56	HR Oct., 1871	183
.	HR July, 1877	188
.	HR Aug., 1877	190
.	HR July, 1896	193
.	ST Apr. 9, 1897	196
<u>DA</u> Chapter 72	3SP ch. 6	198
.	MS 35, 1897	204
.	RH June 22, 1897	220
.	MS 47, 1897	224
.	RH May 31, 1898	228
.	RH June 7, 1898	231
<u>DA</u> Chapter 75	Diary Book 18, 1894	234
.	MS 51, 1897	238
.	MS 101, 1897	250
.	MS 102, 1897	256
.	MS 104, 1897	266
.	MS 111, 1897	276
.	Farrar <u>Life of Christ</u>	283

Table of Contents - Appendix D

<u>DA</u> Chapter 76	3SP chs. 6-8	296
.	ST Dec. 18, 1893	304
.	ST Dec. 24, 1894	307
.	MS 28, 1897	310
.	DA ch. 62 (part)	332
.	RH Oct., 1897	336
.	MS 120, 1897	341
.	Sources	350
<u>DA</u> Chapter 83	3SP ch. 15	363
.	ST Jan. 20, 1888	375
.	MS 113, 1897	379
.	Sources	388
<u>DA</u> Chapter 84	3SP ch. 16	399
.	ST Jan. 20, 1888	408
.	MS 113, 1897	409
.	MS 149, 1897	413
.	Sources	421

APPENDIX D - Chapter 3

Introduction to Manuscript 24

Manuscript 24, 1891, was not written as a manuscript by Ellen White. It is one of a special type of manuscripts compiled by a secretary from the journals of Ellen White. In the case of Manuscript 24, the material was first selected and copied by C. C. Crisler, one of Ellen White's secretaries, from Diary Book 17. He entitled the compilation "Diary" and gave it the reference number, Manuscript 5. He dated it 1903, the year he made it up from various diary entries of Ellen White in the journal which now has entries also from the years 1892 and 1909.

Sometime later it was discovered that the excerpts he selected came from entries which for the most part carried the date of 1891. The manuscript was then reindexed as Manuscript 24, 1891.

Crisler separated the various portions he selected by using a line across the page. This line indicated that he was not copying a continuous Ellen White script. Crisler also supplied the subtitles to be found throughout MS 24 including the one which called attention to content associated with what Ellen White was covering in DA, chapter 3. Crisler found the date of March 5 on a page just prior to where he had selected the text on the rejection of Christ. He accordingly dated his material taken from pages 98-100 as originally written in March, 1891.

The White Estate has no record that this material from Diary Book 17 had ever been copied before Crisler did it in 1903.

Our text presentation begins several paragraphs earlier than does the material on chapter 3 of DA. This extra material will show how Ellen White combines thoughts on different topics in her manuscripts, and further, how Chrisler edited her text. We have endeavored to parallel the typescript with Ellen White's handwritten text to assist the reader in following the latter.

copied. 97
 If man passes from the earth to heaven and
 makes man a new creature in Christ Jesus,
 the transforming grace of God, make men and
 the body of Christ - laborers together with
 God and man becomes one. God through
 the grace of Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit
 a standing evidence of what the truth
 can do to sanctify the receiver, and man
 enlightened by the Word of God by eating that
 Word become a vessel to the Word to
 the angels and to men, whoever hears
 these sayings of Jesus and doeth them shall
 live him unto a wise man who will
 know when a seed is sown by the
 Word of God will be positive that it
 is monumental, commemorating the great
 fact of the birth of Christ. May we henceforth
 in the sign of the cross of God and the
 commandments, the Sabbath of the fourth com-
 mandment be a sign to us and to all men
 of our generation forever, for the signifying of what is
 Truth, Parkman, error and superstition and fiction.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 3

Manuscript 24, 1891

. . . It [Bible knowledg] turns man's mind from the earth heavenward, and makes the repentant sinner a new creature in Christ Jesus. The transforming grace of God leads men to take upon themselves the yoke of Christ, and to become "laborers together with God." Thus through grace man becomes one with the Father, and gives to the world unmistakeable [sic] evidence of what the truth can do in sanctifying the receiver. Enlightened by daily partaking of the Word, man becomes a spectacle to the unfallen worlds, to angels, and to his fellow men.

"Whosoever heareth these sayings of Mine, and doeth them, I will liken him unto a wise man, which built his house upon a rock." The character of the Christian will be positive and stable; it will be monumental, commemorating the great truths of the Bible, that others may be benefited by the sign of obedience he carries. "If ye love Me, keep My commandments." The Sabbath of the fourth commandment "is a sign between Me and you throughout your generations; that ye may know that I am the Lord that doth sanctify you."

Let the inquiry be, "What is truth?" The darkness of error and superstition and falsehood

Copies.
I have entered the world and gross darkness
the people, when in the darkness they came
to our Lord a dark and narrow world the
curse of spiritual darkness and a jealousy
It has been demonstrated that man by seeking
cannot find out God (the most solemn) men of the
day, and the people and the people of the
legislators could not interpret the principles
of God, they could not see that the Father himself
was in the ancient ^{pages of the} writings of God our Father
and loved but could not solve the problem
But when the Lord Jesus came to our world in
human form then light was revealed. The Lord
Jesus the Son of the Jews had become purified
about in darkness of unbelief, they did not know
the commandments of God but their own traditions
The Lord said to them be not like the Pharisees
the commandments of men, for they have burdens
and grievous to be born but will touch them
with one of your fingers. A gain he said be not
like the scribes and the Pharisees
who when they had added commandments upon themselves
as exalted above all men they have claimed and

has covered the earth, and gross darkness the people.

THE CAUSES OF THE JEWISH REJECTION OF CHRIST. March, 1891.

¹It has been demonstrated that man by searching can not find out God. ²The most learned men in the days of Christ, --philosophers, legislators, priests,--in all their pride and superiority, could not interpret God's character. ³They could not discern spiritual things. ⁴The ancient pages of the oracles of the gods were turned over and over again, but did not give the wise men any help in solving the problem.

⁵When, in the fulness of time, Christ came to our world, it was darkened and marred by the curse of apostasy and spiritual wickedness. ⁶The Jews had wrapped themselves about with the dark mantle of unbelief. ⁷They kept not the commandment of God, but regarded as of more importance their own traditions. ⁸"In vain do they worship Me," the Saviour declared, "teaching for doctrines the commandments of men. ⁹For laying aside the commandment of God, ye hold the tradition of men, as the washing of pots and cups: and many other such like things ye do. . . . ¹⁰Full well ye reject the commandment of God, that ye may keep your own tradition." ¹¹And at another time He said, "Ye do err, not knowing the Scriptures, nor the power of God."

¹²Those whom He addressed regarded themselves as exalted above all other peoples. ¹³To them, they proudly boasted, had

99
^{copies}
have committed the crimes of God. The earth was em-
pining for a teacher sent from God, but when
he came just as the living oracles specified he
would come the priests and instructors of the people
could not discern Christ in the representation
of the manner of his coming, more accustomed to
take the word just as it reads the Bible being
their interpreter, they read the Bible in the light
of the traditions and the preaching men
they had. It has been more customed to gaze
and study the truth through men to discern the
mystery, they turned from the truth to the tradition
"they say" there was so much of which seemed
human, ignorance gave way, would there be a
thirst for knowledge of God and virtue would
there be an awakening until the throat opened
from into a living as David longed for the
waters from the well of Bethesda, opened the
fountains from the human influences which
through false teachers had perverted their
senses, and they see the God for themselves
and many were sitting in the darkness and
shadow of death waiting for the Son of glory.

been committed the oracles of God. ¹⁴The earth was languishing for a teacher sent from God; but when He came just as the living oracles specified He would come, the priests and the instructors of the people could not discern that He was their Saviour, nor could they understand the manner of His coming. ¹⁵Unaccustomed to accept God's word exactly as it reads, or to allow it to be its own interpreter, they read it in the light of their maxims and traditions. ¹⁶So long had they neglected to study and contemplate the Bible, that its pages were to them a mystery. ¹⁷They turned with aversion from the truth of God to the traditions of men.

¹⁸The Jewish Nation had reached a critical time in its history. ¹⁹Much was at stake. ²⁰Would human ignorance give way? ²¹Would there be a thirsting for a deeper knowledge of God? ²²Would this thirst develop into a longing for spiritual drink, as the thirst of David developed into a longing for water from the well of Bethlehem? ²³Would the Jews turn from the influence of false teachers, which had perverted their senses, and call upon God for divine instruction?

²⁴Many were sitting in the shadow of death, waiting for the Sun of Righteousness

^{copied.}
to break forth upon them, ^{and} but when. But they
came many were ready to receive him of the
Priests and rulers had only been true to God
to guided them into the true interpretation
of what is truth, but misapplication of the
scriptures had so long been followed that
the ~~see~~ falsehood had come to be ^{misleading} so much
that the misapplication of the utterance
of the word of God was the chosen chief.
Thus the Jews as a nation ^{separated and} went away from the
only one who could save them from eternal
ruin, thus it is to our sorrow today there is
a strong determined influence with men claiming
to understand the scriptures and then reject
the law of God and preach against the law of
God and make it a matter of condemnation
to break the commandments of God. What is the
result look at the South group appeared as

^{copied} MS 5-1903 (originally,
but now listed as
MS. 24, 1891)
(written in 1891)

to break forth upon them. ²⁵And when Christ came as a human being, a flood of light was shed upon the world. ²⁶Many would have received Him gladly, choosing to walk in the light, if the priests and the rulers had only been true to God, and had guided the people aright by giving to them a true interpretation of the truths of the Word. ²⁷But so long had the leaders misapplied the Scriptures, that the people were misled by falsehoods. ²⁸It seemed as if a misapplication of the teachings of God's Word was the special work of those who should have stood as faithful sentinels of truth.

²⁹The Jews, as a nation, refused to accept Christ. ³⁰They turned from the only One who could have saved them from eternal ruin. ³¹A similar condition of things exists in the so-called Christian world to-day. ³²Men who claim to understand the Scriptures are rejecting God's law, and are exerting a strong, determined influence against it. ³³They make the keeping of God's commandments a matter of condemnation. ³⁴What is the result?--³⁵Look at the course of the youth growing up around us.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 3

Introduction to Letter 43, 1895

On June 14, 1895, Ellen White wrote a long letter to Dr. John Harvey Kellogg of Battle Creek, Michigan. In this letter she includes lengthy comment on the work and purposes of Satan. In that same context she makes observations on the first advent of Christ and on the world into which He came.

Some of her comments touch on the content of chapter 3 of DA and contribute toward the development of the literary form of that text. Since pages 18-22 of the Kellogg letter, where these comments on the incarnation appear were published in the Review and Herald several months later, the article is also reproduced in this section of the Appendix.

We have added page one of the Kellogg letter to show the literary context of Ellen White's remarks on Satan's efforts to thwart the work of Christ.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 3

Letter 43, 1895

Dr. J. H. Kellogg,

Dear Brother,--I thank you for the letters you have sent, and will now try to reply to them as best I can. The first American mail for this month was sent off yesterday, but another mail goes by the Vancouver on the 20th, by which you will receive this letter. Bro. McCoy wrote me in reference to enlarging some of your buildings, and especially mentioned the enlarging of your bakery, saying that this was very much needed. I must leave you to settle the matter as you think best; for your necessities are known to yourselves and to God. I have given you the light that God has given me in regard to investing means in erecting buildings, and I must have no voice in saying anything different further about the matter.

I have been much pained because means have been invested in putting up additional school buildings at Battle Creek, when this investment was uncalled for. The College was large enough to accomodate all the students that could be managed successfully in the school. The fact of the matter was that those in charge were not able to manage the students that were already in attendance as they should be managed, and the money invested in putting up new buildings was greatly needed in planting the standard of truth in cities in America, and in opening new fields to the living minister. We have great need of means in this far off portion of the Lord's vineyard. But I dare not counsel you

on the matter of which you have spoken. . . .

¹Speaking of Satan, our Lord says that "he abode not in the truth." ²He was once the covering cherub, glorious in beauty and holiness. ³He was next to Christ in exaltation and character. ⁴It was with Satan that self-exaltation had its origin. ⁵He became jealous of Christ, and falsely accused him, and then laid blame upon the Father. ⁶He was envious of the position that was held by Christ and the Father, and he turned from his allegiance to the high commander of heaven, and lost his high and holy estate. ⁷Though the angels had a knowledge of God and of Jesus Christ, though they were happy in the glorious service which they did for the King of heaven, yet through the deceptive power of the evil one, through his crooked representations of Christ and the Father, he deceived a great company of angels, drew them into sympathy with himself, and associated them with himself in rebellion. ⁸Satan and his sympathisers became the avowed antagonists of God, established their own infernal empire, and set up a standard of rebellion against the God of heaven. ⁹All the principalities and powers of evil rallied to the work of overthrowing the government of God.

¹⁰Satan accomplished the fall of man, and since that time it has been his work to efface in man the image of God, and to stamp upon human hearts his own image. ¹¹Possessing supremacy in guilt, he claims supremacy for himself, and exercises over his subjects the power of royalty. ¹²He

cannot expel God from his throne, but through the system of idolatry, he plants his own throne between the heaven and the earth, between God and the human worshipper. ¹³He intercepts every ray of light that comes from God to man, and appropriates the worship due to God.

¹⁴Satan has wrought with deceiving power, bringing in a multiplicity of errors that obscure the truth. ¹⁵Error could not stand alone, and would soon become extinct, if it did not fasten itself like a parasite upon the tree of truth. ¹⁶Error draws its life from the truth of God. ¹⁷The traditions of men, like floating germs, attach themselves to the truth of God, and men regard them as a part of the truth. ¹⁸Through false doctrines Satan gains a foothold, and captivates the minds of men, causing them to hold theories that have no foundation in truth. ¹⁹Men boldly teach for doctrines the commandments of men, and as traditions pass on from age to age, they acquire a power over the human mind. ²⁰But age does not make error truth, neither does its burdensome weight cause the plant of truth to become a parasite. ²¹The tree of truth bears its own genuine fruit, showing its true origin and nature. ²²The parasite of error also bears its own fruit, and makes manifest that its character is diverse from the plant of heavenly origin.

²³It is through false theories and traditions that Satan gains his power over the human mind. ²⁴We can see the extent to which he exercises his power by the disloyalty

that is in the world. ²⁵Even the churches that profess to be Christian have turned from the law of Jehovah, and have erected a false standard. ²⁶Satan has had his hand in all this for by directing men to false standards, he misshapes the human character, and causes humanity to acknowledge him as supreme. ²⁷He works counter to the holy law of God, and denies God's jurisdiction. ²⁸It is at Lucifer's throne that every evil work finds its starting point, and obtains its support.

²⁹Satan has charged injustice upon God, and at various times has set in motion all his supernatural agencies in order to shut off from man the knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God and His sanctuary, and to establish his own kingdom in the earth. ³⁰At different times he has almost succeeded in spreading idolatry throughout the world. ³¹The history of the past shows that he has striven to obtain the mastery upon earth, and that his strife for supremacy has seemed to be almost wholly successful. ³²He has worked in such a manner that the Prince of heaven has seemed to be lost sight of. ³³It has seemed that the confederacy of idolatry has borne supreme sway, and that Satan had indeed become the god of this world. ³⁴But the only begotten Son of God has looked upon the scene, has beheld human suffering and misery. ³⁵With pity he has seen how his human agencies have been blinded by the deceptions of the enemy, and have become victims of satanic cruelty. ³⁶He has seen how Satan has

exalted men simply for the purpose of casting them down, how he has flattered them in order to draw them into his net and then destroy them. ³⁷He looked upon the schemes of Satan by which he works to blot from the human soul every trace of likeness to God. ³⁸How he [Satan] leads them into intemperance so as to destroy the moral powers which God gave to man as a most precious, priceless endowment [sic]. ³⁹He [Christ] saw how that through indulgence in appetite brain power is destroyed, and the temple of God is in ruins. ⁴⁰He looked with compassion upon men who were becoming corrupted, ruined, murdered, and lost. ⁴¹Through choosing a ruler who chained them to his car as captives, and yet these slaves were so bewildered, so beguiled and deceived, that they were actually pleased with their slavery as they moved on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,--to death in which is no hope of life, toward night, to which cometh no morning [sic]. ⁴²He saw human beings possessed by devils, saw satanic agencies incorporated with men, saw the bodies of men become the habitations for the degrading indwelling of demons. ⁴³Men made for the dwelling place of God became the habitation of dragons. ⁴⁴The senses, the nerves, the passions, the organs of man were worked by supernatural agencies in the indulgence of the grossest, vilest lust. ⁴⁵The very stamp of demons was impressed upon the countenances of men, and human faces reflected the expression of the legions of evil with which they were possessed. ⁴⁶Such was the prospect upon which the world's

Redeemer looked. ⁴⁷What a horrible spectacle for the eyes of infinite Purity to behold! ⁴⁸Wherein can he behold his image? ⁴⁹And yet God, the infinite God, so loved the world, that he gave his only begotten Son, (for such a world!) that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life."

⁵⁰Christ came to our world, the Sent of God to take human nature upon him. ⁵¹The mysterious union was to be formed between human nature and the divine nature. ⁵²Christ was to become a man, in order that he might unfold to man as fully as possible the mysteries of the science of redemption. ⁵³But the scheme of redemption far exceeds the comprehension of the human mind. ⁵⁴The great condescension on the part of God is a mystery that is beyond our fathoming. ⁵⁵The greatness of the plan can not be fully comprehended, nor could infinite Wisdom devise a plan that would surpass it. ⁵⁶It could only be successful by the clothing of divinity with humanity, by Christ becoming man, and suffering the wrath which sin has made because of the transgression of God's law. ⁵⁷Through this plan the great, the dreadful God can be just, and yet be the justifier of all who believe in Jesus, and who receive him as their personal Saviour. ⁵⁸This is the heavenly science of redemption, of saving men from eternal ruin, and can be carried out through the incarnation of the Son of God in humanity, through his triumph over sin and death, and in seeking to fathom this plan all finite intelligences are

baffled.

⁵⁹Before the world was created infinite Wisdom provided for the terrible possibility of man's disloyalty. ⁶⁰Though man transgressed God's law, yet the law was not weakened in the slightest particular. ⁶¹It stands fast for ever and ever as his eternal throne. ⁶²No hope could be found for man through the alteration of God's law, but God so loved the world that he gave himself in Christ to the world to bear the penalty of man's transgression. ⁶³God suffered with his Son as the divine Being alone could suffer, in order that the world might be reconciled to him.

⁶⁴From the moment that Christ entered the world the whole confederacy of Satanic agencies were set at work to deceive and overthrow him as Adam had been deceived and overthrown. ⁶⁵Could he win the victory over Christ, the world that God had created would become his empire.

⁶⁶When Christ was born in Bethlehem the angels of God appeared to the shepherds who were watching their flocks by night, and gave divine credentials of the authority of the newborn babe; Satan knew that one had come to the earth with a divine commission to dispute his authority. ⁶⁷He heard the angels as they sang, "Behold, I bring you good tidings of great joy, which shall be to all people. ⁶⁸For unto you is born this day in the city of David a Saviour, which is Christ the Lord. ⁶⁹And this shall be a sign unto you; ye shall find the babe wrapped in swaddling clothes, lying in a manger. ⁷⁰And suddenly there was with the angel a multitude

of the heavenly host, praising God, and saying, Glory to God in the highest, and on earth peace, goodwill toward men."

⁷¹The heavenly heralds aroused all the wrath of the synagogue of Satan. ⁷²He followed the steps of those who had charge of the infant Jesus. ⁷³He heard the prophecy of Simeon in the temple courts, who had long been waiting for the consolation of Israel. ⁷⁴The Holy Ghost was upon him and he came by the Spirit into the temple. ⁷⁵Taking the infant Saviour in his arms, he blessed God, and said, "Lord, now lettest thou thy servant depart in peace according to thy word; for mine eyes have seen thy salvation, which thou hast prepared before the face of all people. ⁷⁶A light to lighten the Gentiles, and the glory of thy people Israel. ⁷⁷Satan was filled with frenzy as he saw that the aged Simeon recognized the divinity of Christ.

⁷⁸The commander of heaven was assailed by the tempter. ⁷⁹He had no clear unobstructed passage through the world. ⁸⁰He was not left free to win to his kingdom the souls of men by his gracious mercy and lovingkindness and without hindrance. ⁸¹From the time that he was a helpless babe in Bethlehem, when the agencies of hell sought to destroy him in his infancy through the jealousy of Herod, until he came to Calvary's cross he was continually assailed by the Evil One. ⁸²In the councils of Satan it was determined that he must be overcome. ⁸³No human being had come into the world and escaped the power of the deceiver. ⁸⁴The whole forces of the confederacy of evil were set upon his track to engage

in warfare against him, and if possible to prevail over him.
⁸⁵The fiercest and most inveterate enmity was put between
the seed of the woman and the serpent. ⁸⁶The serpent
himself made Christ the mark of every weapon of hell.
⁸⁷Satan knew that he must either conquer or himself be
conquered. ⁸⁸Success or failure involved too much for him
to leave the work with any one of his agents of evil. ⁸⁹The
Prince of evil himself must personally conduct the warfare,
since all other enterprises were inferior to this. ⁹⁰He
came in determined opposition against Christ from the very
beginning of his work. ⁹¹"But the child grew and waxed
strong in spirit, filled with wisdom: and the grace of God
was upon him. . . . ⁹²And Jesus increased in wisdom and
stature, and in favor with God and man."

⁹³Satan saw the image of God in the character and
person of Jesus Christ. ⁹⁴He knew that if Christ carried
out his plan his Satanic authority would be at an end.
⁹⁵Therefore the life of Christ was a perpetual warfare
against Satanic agencies. ⁹⁶The conflict increased in
fierceness and malignity, as again and again the prey was
taken out of his hands. ⁹⁷He rallied the whole energies of
apostacy [sic] against the Son of God.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 3

Introduction to RH Article, October 22, 1895

The article, "Satan's Malignity Against Christ and His Service," reproduces portions of Letter 43, 1895, to J. H. Kellogg. It is possible that Marian Davis took portions of the article into her scrapbook for use in the proposed work on the life of Christ. She need not have returned to the original text in Kellogg's letter. Nearly all of the text of Kellogg's letter found in chapter 3 also appears in this article. In any case, it is clear that Ellen White is presenting material from Harris' work, The Great Teacher, when composing the letter to Kellogg.

ADVENT REVIEW AND SABBATH HERALD.

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., OCTOBER 22, 1895.

SATAN'S MALIGNITY AGAINST CHRIST
AND HIS PEOPLE.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ SPEAKING of Satan, our Lord says that "he abode not in the truth." ²He was once the covering cherub, glorious in beauty and holiness. He was next to Christ in exaltation and character. ³It was with Satan that self-exaltation had its origin. ⁴He became jealous of Christ, and falsely accused him, and then laid blame upon the Father. ⁵He was envious of the position that was held by Christ and the Father, and he turned from his allegiance to the Commander of heaven and lost his high and holy estate. Though the angels had a knowledge of God and of Jesus Christ, though they were happy in the glorious service which they did for the King of heaven, yet, through his crooked representations of Christ and the Father, the evil one deceived a great company of angels, drew them into sympathy with himself, and associated them with himself in rebellion. ⁶Satan and his sympathizers became the avowed antagonists of God, established their own infernal empire, and set up a standard of rebellion against the God of heaven. ⁷All the principalities and powers of evil rallied to the work of overthrowing the government of God.

⁸Satan accomplished the fall of man, and since that time it has been his work to efface in man the image of God, and to stamp upon human hearts his own image. ⁹Possessing supremacy in guilt, he claims supremacy for himself, and exercises over his subjects the power of royalty. ¹⁰He cannot expel God from his throne, but through the system of idolatry, he plants his own throne between the heaven and the earth, between God and the human worshiper. ¹¹He intercepts every ray of light that comes from God to man, and appropriates the worship that is due to God.

¹²Satan has wrought with deceiving power, bringing in a multiplicity of errors that obscure the truth. ¹³Error cannot stand alone, and would soon become extinct if it did not fasten itself like a parasite upon the tree of truth. ¹⁴Error draws its life from the truth of God. ¹⁵The traditions of men, like floating germs, attach themselves to the truth of God, and men regard them as a part of the truth. ¹⁶Through

false doctrines, Satan gains a foothold, and captivates the minds of men, causing them to hold theories that have no foundation in truth. ¹⁷Men boldly teach for doctrines the commandments of men; and as traditions pass on from age to age, they acquire a power over the human mind. ¹⁸But age does not make error truth, neither does its burdensome weight cause the plant of truth to become a parasite. ¹⁹The tree of truth bears its own genuine fruit, showing its true origin and nature. ²⁰The parasite of error also bears its own fruit, and makes manifest that its character is diverse from the plant of heavenly origin.

²¹It is through false theories and traditions that Satan gains his power over the human mind. ²²We can see the extent to which he exercises his power by the disloyalty that is in the world. ²³Even the churches that profess to be Christian have turned from the law of Jehovah, and have erected a false standard. ²⁴Satan has had his hand in all this; for by directing men to false standards, he misshapes the human character, and causes humanity to acknowledge him as supreme. ²⁵He works counter to the holy law of God, and denies God's jurisdiction. ²⁶It is at his throne that every evil work finds its starting-point and obtains its support.

²⁷Satan has charged injustice upon God, and at various times has set in motion all his supernatural agencies, in order to cut off from men the knowledge of God, to turn their attention from the temple of God, and to establish his own kingdom in the earth. ²⁸At different times he has almost succeeded in spreading idolatry throughout the world. ²⁹The history of the past shows that he has striven to obtain the mastery upon earth, and that his strife for supremacy has seemed to be almost wholly successful. ³⁰He has worked in such a manner that the Prince of heaven has seemed to be lost sight of. ³¹It has seemed that the confederacy of idolatry has borne supreme sway, and that Satan had indeed become the god of this world. ³²But the only begotten Son of God has looked upon the scene, has beheld human suffering and misery. ³³With pity he has seen how his human agencies have been blinded by the deceptions of the enemy, and have become victims of Satanic cruelty. ³⁴He has seen how Satan has exalted men simply for the purpose of casting them down, how he has flattered them, in order to draw them into his net and destroy them. ³⁵He looked upon the

schemes by which Satan works to blot from the human soul every trace of likeness to God; how he led them into intemperance so as to destroy the moral powers which God gave to man as a most precious, priceless endowment. ³⁹He saw how, through indulgence in appetite, brain power was destroyed, and the temple of God was in ruins. ⁴⁰He looked with compassion upon men who were becoming corrupted, ruined, murdered, and lost, through choosing a ruler who chained them to his car as captives, and yet these slaves were so bewildered, so beguiled and deceived, that they were actually pleased with their slavery as they moved on in gloomy procession toward eternal ruin,—to death in which is no hope of life, toward night to which comes no morning. ⁴¹He saw human beings possessed by devils, saw Satanic agencies incorporated with men, saw the bodies of men become the habitations for the degrading indwelling of demons. ⁴²Man, made for the dwelling-place of God, became the habitation of dragons. ⁴³The senses, the nerves, the passions, the organs of man, were worked by supernatural agencies in the indulgence of the grossest, vilest lust. ⁴⁴The very stamp of demons was impressed upon the countenances of men, and human faces reflected the expression of the legions of evil with which they were possessed. ⁴⁵Such was the prospect upon which the world's Redeemer looked. ⁴⁶What a horrible spectacle for the eyes of infinite purity to behold! ⁴⁷Wherein can he behold his image? ⁴⁸And yet God, the infinite One, "so loved the world, that he gave his only begotten Son [for such a world!], that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life."

⁴⁹Christ came to our world, sent of God to take human nature upon him. ⁵⁰The mysterious union was to be formed between human nature and the divine nature. ⁵¹Christ was to become a man, in order that he might unfold to men as fully as possible the mysteries of the science of redemption. ⁵²But the scheme of redemption far exceeds the comprehension of the human mind. ⁵³The great condescension on the part of God is a mystery that is beyond our fathoming. ⁵⁴The greatness of the plan cannot be fully comprehended, nor could infinite Wisdom devise a plan that would surpass it. ⁵⁵It could be successful only by the clothing of divinity with humanity, by Christ becoming man, and suffering the wrath which sin has made because of the transgression of God's law. ⁵⁶Through this plan the great, the dreadful God can be just, and yet be the justifier of all who believe in Jesus, and who receive him as their personal Saviour. ⁵⁷This is the heavenly science of redemption, of saving men from eternal ruin, and can be carried out through the incarnation of the Son of God, through his triumph over sin and death. ⁵⁸In seeking to fathom this plan, all finite intelligences are baffled.

⁵⁹Before the world was created, infinite Wisdom provided for the terrible possibility of man's disloyalty. ⁶⁰Though man transgressed God's law, yet the law was not weakened in the slightest particular. ⁶¹It stands fast forever and ever as his eternal throne. ⁶²No hope could be found for man through the alteration of God's law, but God so loved the world that he gave himself in Christ to the world to bear the penalty of man's transgression. ⁶³God suffered with his Son, as the divine Being alone could suffer, in order that the world might become reconciled to him.

(Concluded next week.)

APPENDIX D - Chapter 13

Introduction to Diary Book 14, 1890

As the reader might have noted on page 142 of this research work, the at-hand section of Diary Book 14, 1890, is entitled "Christ's Humiliation." We have made our own typescript, endeavoring to be faithful to the manuscript of the author. In these pages of diary material Ellen White describes in general the temptations of Christ in the wilderness, while touching upon the conflict between good and evil in terms of the origin of evil with Lucifer who now comes as an angel of light to tempt Christ and lure Him from His allegiance to God, His Father. The different stages of Christ's humiliation are presented--namely, His taking upon Himself the nature of man and then having to "meet the strong man armed with all his weapons of deception and falsehood." Finally, a view of Christ's signal victory is given, which victory placed humanity in "an elevated scale."

Some might consider this whole selection from the pen of Ellen White a christological gem.

27th Book 14

Christ's humiliation is not understood and not appreciated. Forty days and nights was Jesus subjected to the temptations of the enemy the One who was once an angel next to Christ in majesty in ~~fronts~~ glory in the heavenly courts. ~~the~~ It is stated that ~~he~~ was seated among the ~~heavens~~ &c., but he wanted to have the place of Christ and Christ was one with the Infinite God and because this was not accorded him he became jealous and became the originator of sin. ^{Satan} He ~~then~~ wished to change the government of God, to place his own seal to the rules of God's kingdom. Christ would not be brought in to this desire and here

Di(90) Bk 14

¹Christ's humiliation is not understood and not appreciated; forty days and nights was Jesus subjected to the temptations of the enemy, the one who was once an angel next to Christ in majesty, in glory, in the heavenly courts. ²It is stated, Thou was [sic] exalted because of thy beauty &c. ³But he wanted to have the place of Christ and Christ was one with the Infinite God and because this was not accorded him he became jealous [sic] and became the originator of sin. ⁴Satan wished to change the government of God, to fix his own seal to the rules of God's [sic] kingdom. ⁵Christ would not be brought in to this desire and here

the warfare against Christ commenced
 and waxed strong working in secrecy
 but known to God. Lucifer was
 of a deceiving character
 he told falsehood for truth, he was
 expelled from heaven and apparently
 Christ was alone with him in the
 wilderness of temptation. ⁶Yet he was not
 alone for angels were around him, just as angels
 of God are commissioned to minister unto those
 who are under the fearful assaults of the
 enemy. Christ was in the wilderness
 with the one with whom there was war
 in heaven and the one whom he
 overcame and Satan was defeated.
 Now Satan meets him under
 different circumstances, the glory

Di (90) Bk 14

the warfare against Christ
 commenced and waxed strong,
 working in secrecy but known
 to God. Lucifer became a
 deceiving character [sic].

⁶He told falsehood for
 truth. ⁷He was expelled
 from heaven and apparently
 Christ was alone with him in
 the wilderness of
 temptation. ⁸Yet he was not

alone for angels were around
 him, just as angels of God
 are commissioned to minister
 unto those who are under the
 fearful assaults of the
 enemy. ⁹Christ was in the

wilderness with the one with
 whom there was war in heaven
 and the one whom he
 overcame, and Satan was
 defeated. ¹⁰Now Satan meets
 him under different
 circumstances. ¹¹The glory

that was round about him is no longer of visible. He has humbled himself with men himself our nature and he came in to world to stand at the head of humanity whom Satan had deceived and to fight his battles for him in behalf of the race whom he has deceived through his lying power. His whole effort was to draw Christ away from his allegiance to God to undermine in a deceptive way his principles in his allegiance to the Lord God. He passed through what mental anguish, what grief, what torture of mind. He was face to

that was round about him is no longer visible. ¹²He has humbled himself, taken upon himself our nature, and he came into the world to stand at the level of humanity whom Satan had deceived and to fight his battles in behalf of the race whom he has deceived through his lying power. ¹³His whole effort was to draw Christ away from his allegiance [sic] to God, to undermine in a deceptive way his principles in his allegiance [sic] to the Lord God. ¹⁴Here what mental anguish Christ passed through, what grief, what torture of mind. ¹⁵He was face to

face not with a hideous monster as is
 represented with bats wings and a
 cloven feet but a beautiful angel
 of light apparently just from the presence
 of God, and his deceiving powers which
 was so great that the third of the heavenly
 angels were induced to believe him
 to be right and unite with him against
 God and his Son Jesus Christ. And now
 was Satans personal contact in this
 world with Christ of a most determined
 character for if he succeeded here in
 his strong and wily efforts he was
 conqueror and the Prince of the World
 but all his claims to the kingdoms
 of the world he knew was false and
 could not be sustained unless he should
 be deemed overcome Christ

Di(90) Bk 14

face not with a hideous
 monster as is represented
 with bats wings and cloven
 feet but a beautiful angel
 of light apparently just
 from the presence of God,
 and his deceiving powers
 which was [sic] so great
 that the third of the
 heavenly angels were [sic]
 induced to believe him to be
 right and unite with him
 against God and his Son
 Jesus Christ. ¹⁶ And now was
 Satans [sic] personal
 contact in this world with
 Christ of a most determined
 character [sic] for if Satan
 succeeded here in his strong
 and wily efforts he was
 conqueror and the prince of
 the World, but all his
 claims to the kingdoms of
 the world he knew was [sic]
 false and could not be
 sustained unless he should
 overcome Christ.

276

It is impossible to take in the depth and the force of these temptations unless the Lord shall bring man where he can open these scenes before him by a revelation of the matter and then compressed into humanity it can only be but partially comprehended.

His assaults were prepared for the circumstances in accordance with the exalted character with which he had to deal. If he gains the victory in the one the first temptation he would secure him in all the rest. Satan had never aimed his darts at ^{him} so shining a mark. Our Lord's trial and test

Di(90) Bk 14

17 It is impossible to take in the depth [sic] and the force of these temptations unless the Lord shall bring man where he can open these scenes before him by a revelation of the matter and then impressed with humanity it can only be but partially comprehended.

18 His assaults were prepared for the circumstances in accordance [sic] with the exalted character [sic] with which he had to deal. 19 If he gains the victory in the first temptation he would secure him in all the rest.

20 Satan had never aimed his darts at so shining a mark.

21 Our Lords [sic] trial and test

and proving shows that he could yield ²⁷⁷ to
 these temptations else this battle was all
 a farce But he did not yield to the solicitation
 of the enemy even his thus evidencing
 that the human nature of man united
 with the divine nature by faith ~~and~~
 did not yield to the strong and malignant
 Satans temptations Hence perfect
 humanity is the same that man
 may have through connection with
 Christ, As God Christ could not be
 tempted any more than he was not
 tempted from his allegiance in heaven
 but as a man Christ humbled himself
 to the nature of man he could be
 tempted ²⁶ he had not taken on him
 even the nature of the angels but
 human nature perfectly identical with our
 own nature except without the taint of sin

Di(90) Bk 14

and proving shows [sic] that
 he could yield to these
 temptations else the battle
 was all a farce. ²² But he
 did not yield to the
 solicitation of the enemy,
 thus evidencing that the
 human nature of man united
 with the divine nature by
 faith may be strong and
 withstand Satans [sic]
 temptations. ²³ Christ [sic]
 perfect humanity is the same
 that man may have through
 connection with Christ.
²⁴ As God Christ could not be
 tempted any more than he was
 not tempted from his
 allegiance [sic] in heaven.
²⁵ But as Christ humbled
 himself to the nature of men
 he could be tempted. ²⁶ He
 had not taken on him even
 the nature of the angels but
 humanity perfectly identical
 with our own nature except
 without the taint of sin.

276 ⁽²⁷⁾ A human body a human mind with all the peculiar properties he has bone brain and muscle a man of our flesh ⁽²⁸⁾ he was compassed with the weakness of humanity and that the circumstances of his life was of that character that he was exposed to all the inconvenience that belong to men not in wealth nor in ease but in poverty and want and humiliation ⁽²⁹⁾ He breathed the very air man must breathe ⁽³⁰⁾ he trod our earth as man ⁽³¹⁾ He had reason conscience memory will and affections of the human soul which was united with his divine nature ⁽³²⁾ Our Lord was tempted as man is tempted.

Di (90) Bk 14

27 A human body, a human mind with all the peculiar properties, he was bone, brain and muscle, a man of our flesh. ²⁸ He was compassed with the weakness of humanity and the circumstances of his life was [sic] of that character [sic] that he was exposed to all the inconvenience that belong to men, not in wealth nor in ease, but in poverty and want and humiliation. ²⁹ He breathed the very air man must breathe [sic]. ³⁰ He trod our earth as man. ³¹ He had reason, conscience, memory, will and affections of the human soul which was united with his divine nature. ³² Our Lord was tempted as man is tempted.

(33) he was capable of yielding to temptations²⁷⁹
 as ~~the~~ human being. (34) His finite nature
 was pure and spotless but the God the
 divine nature that led him to say to
 Philip he that hath seen me hath
 seen the Father also was not humanized
 neither was humanity deified by the
 blending or union of the two natures
 (35) each retained its essential character
 and properties unchanged and unaltered
 (36) But here we must not be concerned
 in ideas common and earthly and in
 our perverted ideas (that the
 liability of Christ to yield to temptations^{salp}
 degrades his humanity and he
 possesses the same sinful corrupt
 propensities as man the di-
 vine nature combined with the human

Di(90) Bk 14

33 He was capable of yielding
 to temptations as are human
 beings. 34 His finite nature
 was pure and spotless but
 the divine nature that led
 him to say to Philip he that
 hath seen me hath seen the
 Father also, was not
 humanized neither was
 humanity deified by the
 blending or union of the two
 natures. 35 Each retained
 its essential character
 [sic] and properties. 36 But
 here we must not become in
 our ideas common and earthly
 and in our perverted ideas
 we must not think that the
 liability of Christ to yield
 to Satans [sic] temptations
 degrades his humanity and he
 possesses the same sinful
 corrupt propensities as man.
 37 The divine nature combined
 with the human

made him capable of yielding
 to Satans temptations here the test
 to Christ was far greater than
 that of Adam and Eve, for
 Christ took our nature fallen
 but not corrupted and would not
 be corrupted unless he
 received the words of Satan
 in the place of the words of
 God. ³⁹ Was not capable of
 yielding to temptation
 places him where he cannot
 be a perfect example for man
 and the force and the power
 of this part of Christ [sic]
 humiliation which is the
 most eventful is no
 instruction or help to human
 beings. ⁴⁰ But the facts of
 this history is [sic] not
 fable

made him capable of yielding
 to Satans [sic] temptations.

³⁸ Here the test to Christ
 was far greater than that of
 Adam and Eve, for Christ
 took our nature fallen but
 not corrupted, and would not
 be corrupted unless he
 received the words of Satan
 in the place of the words of
 God. ³⁹ Was not capable of
 yielding to temptation
 places him where he cannot
 be a perfect example for man
 and the force and the power
 of this part of Christ [sic]
 humiliation which is the
 most eventful is no
 instruction or help to human
 beings. ⁴⁰ But the facts of
 this history is [sic] not
 fable

into my active experience: and²⁸
 to reveal to Jesus of his greatest
 glory which enshrouded him as a
 garment on this world on the field
 of battle with the relentless foe
 and he is not reckoned reckoned with
 the transgressor because he ~~was~~
 descended in his humiliation to
 be tempted as man would be tempted
 and his nature was that of man
 capable of yielding to temptation
 His very purity and holiness was
 assailed by a fallen foe the very
 one because he became corrupted
 and he ejected from Heaven from
 deeply and must believe transfer
 this humiliation

Di(90) Bk 14

but a living active
 experience, and [which false
 theory] would rob Jesus of
 his greatest glory,
 allegiance [sic] to God,
 which enshrouded him as a
 garment in this world on the
 field of battle with the
 relentless foe; and he is
 not reckoned with the
 transgressor because he
 descended in his humiliation
 to be tempted as man would
 be tempted and his nature
 was that of man capable of
 yielding to temptation.

⁴¹His very purity and
 holiness was [sic] assailed
 by a fallen foe, the very
 one that he [sic] became
 corrupted and then been
 [sic] ejected from Heaven.

⁴²How deeply and cruelly
 must Christ have felt this
 humiliation.

283

Christ's Humiliation
 When this pure and uncontaminated
 one the Prince of life through the different
 stages of his humiliation when they
 look upon the scene, the Son of the
 Living God humiliated to take upon
 himself the nature of man, and
 meet the strong man armed with
 his weapons of deception and falsehood
 to overcome Jesus
 Christ, and every victory gained
 how precious it is in behalf of the
 human family exalting, elevating,
 ennobling when Satan the workman
 of God and Satan that has been
 at work for centuries to do the
 work of degrading, debasing, and
 prostituting all his powers to do his
 hellish work

Di (90) Bk 14

49 Christ's

humiliation--How do angels
 fallen look upon this pure
 and uncontaminated One, the
 Prince of life through the
 different stages of his
 humiliation, when they look
 upon the scene, the Son of
 the Living God humiliated to
 take upon himself the nature
 of man; and meet the strong
 man armed with all his
 weapon of deception and
 falsehood to overcome Jesus
 Christ? 50 And every victory
 gained how precious it is.
 51 It is in behalf of the
 human family, exalting,
 elevating, ennobling the
 Workmanship of God; and
 Satan that has been at work
 for centuries to do the work
 of degrading, debasing, and
 prostituting all his powers
 to do his hellish work.

Humiliation of Christ 293
 All Humanity of Christ received the
 fallen foe and engaged in battle
 with him. ⁷⁵He was sustained in
 the conflict by divine power just as
 man will be sustained by his
 being a partaker of the divine
 nature. He gained victory after
 victory as our champion the
 Captain of our Salvation and
 the divine approval of God
 and all the Universe of heaven
 flowed into his soul his nature
 was shocked almost unto death
 but the heavenly angels
 ministered unto the suffering
 one

Di (90) Bk 14

⁷⁵The Humanity of
 Christ received the fallen
 foe and engaged in battle
 with him. ⁷⁶He was
 sustained in that conflict
 by divine power just as man
 will be sustained by his
 being a partaker of the
 divine nature. ⁷⁷He gained
 victory after victory as our
 champion, the Captain of our
 Salvation and the divine
 approval of God and all the
 universe of heaven flowed
 into his soul. ⁷⁸His nature
 was shocked almost unto
 death but the heavenly
 angels ministered unto the
 suffering one.

294

All heaven rejoiced because
 the ^{humanity} ~~form~~ of God was
 placed in an
 elevated scale with God
 by the signal victory gained
 which was more than conqueror
 leaving the way open that
 man may be more than
 conqueror through Christ's
 merits because he
 loved him. ⁸⁰ Christ
 was more than conqueror
 leaving the way open that
 man may be more than
 conqueror through Christ's
 merits because he
 loved him. ⁸¹ The Son of the
 Infinite God is brought into
 the tenderest sympathies
 with the tempted church.
⁸² He knows how to succor
 those who shall be tempted
 because he was himself
 tempted.

he was himself tempted,

Di (90) Bk 14

79 All heaven rejoiced
 because the humanity, the
 workmanship of God, was
 placed in an elevated scale
 with God by the signal
 victory gained. ⁸⁰ Christ
 was more than conqueror
 leaving the way open that
 man may be more than
 conqueror through Christ's
 [sic] merits because he
 loved him. ⁸¹ The Son of the
 Infinite God is brought into
 the tenderest sympathies
 with the tempted church.
⁸² He knows how to succor
 those who shall be tempted
 because he was himself
 tempted.

295

APPENDIX D - Chapter 13

Introduction to Diary Book 32, 1899

This special diary section on the temptations of Christ carries the date of 1899 as designated by the White Estate. However, in the handwritten text, on the page with a number 25 in the upper righthand corner, this interesting statement is penned: "Therefore, the minds of his disciples do not comprehend important matters of truth even in 1889, for the same reason." There is good evidence to indicate that all but 33 or so sentences of the 164 sentences of MS 143, 1897, have been directly, or in some cases less, influenced by Diary Book 32, this selection. (Page 144 of this research paper contains a brief description and discussion of the MS 143 material.) Intriguingly, sentence 128 of MS 143 states: "And for the same reason Christ's disciples of 1897 do not comprehend important matters of truth." (The 18- was typed; the -97 was added by hand.) It appears from such internal evidence that this particular diary book portion should have been dated ten years earlier than it is.

This section of Diary Book 32, as has been noted on page 143 of the research paper, evidently comprised part of the life of Christ collection of materials which were drawn upon by Marian Davis in composing the book Desire of Ages.

¹Perfect to accuse the temptation in
 the wilderness was a most trying ordeal.
²What a picture was this for Heaven
 to look upon, that Christ who knew
 not the least moral
 taint of defilement of sin took our nature
 in its deteriorated condition which was
 humiliation indeed greater than finite
 man can comprehend. He was holy,
 harmless, undefiled, separate from
 sin and sinners. ³There must be not the
 faintest lines of misgiving in regard to
 the perfect freedom from sinfulness
 in the human nature of Jesus Christ.
 Our faith must be an intelligent faith
 looking unto Jesus in perfect confidence,
 in full and entire faith in the
 atoning sacrifice. ⁴This is essential that the soul
 may not be enshrouded in
 darkness. ⁵The least taint of sin in
 Jesus Christ, Satan would have
 bruised his head.

¹The temptation in the
 wilderness was a most trying
 ordeal. ²What a picture was this
 for Heaven to look upon. ³Christ
 who knew not the least moral
 taint of defilement of sin took
 our nature in its deteriorated
 condition which was humiliation
 indeed greater than finite man
 can comprehend. ⁴He was holy,
 harmless, undefiled; separate
 from sin and sinners.

⁵There must be not the
 faintest lines of misgiving in
 regard to the perfect freedom
 from sinfulness in the human
 nature of Christ. ⁶Our faith
 must be an intelligent faith
 looking unto Jesus in perfect
 confidence, in full and entire
 faith in the atoning sacrifice.
⁷This is essential that the soul
 may not be enshrouded in
 darkness.

⁸The least taint of sin in
 Jesus Christ, Satan would have
 bruised his head,

but he could only touch the heel, Had
 the head been touched, the hope of the
 whole race has perished. Divine wrath
 would have come upon Christ as upon
 Adam, and himself, and the church
 would have no hope. He knew
 no sin. He was the perfect Lamb
 without blemish. His Holy Substitute
 is able to save to the uttermost
 presented to the wondering universe
 perfect and complete himself in
 his human character and perfect
 obedience to all the requirements
 of God and thus is why repenting
 man may be made the righteousness
 of God in Jesus Christ. Taking
 upon himself man's nature in its fallen
 state does not make him in the
 least a participant in their sins

Di(99) Bk 32

but he could only touch the heel.

9 Had the head been touched, the
 hope of the whole race has
 perished. 10 Divine wrath would
 have come upon Christ as upon
 Adam, and himself, and the church
 would have no hope. 11 "He knew
 no sin." 12 He was the Lamb
 without blemish.

13 This Holy Substitute is
 able to save to the uttermost for
 he presented to the wondering
 universe perfect and complete
 humility in his human character
 [sic] and perfect obedience to
 all the requirements of God.
 14 This is why repenting,
 believing man may be made the
 righteousness of God in Jesus
 Christ.

15 Taking upon himself man's
 nature in its fallen state does
 not make him in the least a
 participant in their sins.

3 ~~subject to~~ ^{subject to}
~~not subject to~~ ^{not subject to} ~~the~~ ^{the} ~~infirmities~~ ^{infirmities}
 and ~~weaknesses~~ ^{weaknesses} ~~of the flesh~~ ^{of the flesh} ~~which~~ ^{which} ~~humanity~~ ^{humanity}
 was encompassed, "that a ~~man~~ ^{man} ~~of~~ ^{of} ~~the~~ ^{the} ~~world~~ ^{world}
 full of ~~infirmities~~ ^{infirmities} ~~and~~ ^{and} ~~weaknesses~~ ^{weaknesses} ~~of the flesh~~ ^{of the flesh} ~~which~~ ^{which} ~~humanity~~ ^{humanity}
 the prophet says, "I will take our infirmities and bear our sicknesses."
 "When we contemplate that Jesus
 was on this earth a man of sorrows
 and acquainted with grief, that in
 order to save fallen man from
 eternal ruin he for our sakes became
 poor that we through his poverty
 might be made rich, it should
 lay in the mind all our pride and
 put to shame all our vanity,
 and reveal to us our sin of self suffi-
 ciency, behold him making the wants
 and trials and griefs and sufferings

Di(99) Bk 32

16 Notwithstanding he is subject
 to infirmities and weaknesses of
 the flesh with which humanity was
 encompassed, "that it might be
 fulfilled which was spoken by
 Esaias the prophet saying,
 Himself took our infirmities and
 bear our sicknesses." *

17 When we contemplate that
 Jesus was on this earth a man of
 sorrows and acquainted with
 grief, that in order to save
 fallen man from eternal ruin he
 for our sakes became poor that we
 through his poverty might be made
 rich, it should lay in the dust
 all our pride and put to shame
 all our vanity and reveal to us
 our sin of self sufficiency.
 18 Behold him making the wants and
 trials and griefs and sufferings

*This "sentence" may well be a continuation of No. 15. Throughout the
 sentence divisions are more or less arbitrary and therefore not neces-
 sarily representing the author's intent.

of sinful man his own. Can we not take home the lesson that God personally and sympathetically entered into humiliation of the sufferings and bruises of the soul in consequence of sin and yet he was without spot. He was touched with all the feelings of our infirmities in all points tempted like as we are tempted. God was manifest in the flesh.

He humbled himself. What subject for thought, deep earnest contemplation so infinitely great the Majesty of heaven and he stooped so low but without losing one atom of his dignity or lessening in any degree his glory and yet steps still

of sinful man his own. ¹⁹Can we not take home the lesson that God personally and sympathetically entered into humiliation of the sufferings and bruises of the soul in consequence of sin and yet he was without spot. ²⁰He was touched with the feelings of our infirmities in all points tempted like as we are tempted.

²¹God was manifest in the flesh. ²²He humbled himself. ²³What subject for thought [sic] deep earnest contemplation! ²⁴So infinitely great that he was the Majesty of heaven and he stooped so low, yet without losing one atom of his dignity or lessening in any degree his glory and yet steps still

Still lower, he was in his ^{to}embowered
 which he made, ^{in poverty}in the
 depths of abasement and humiliation
 among men. He submitted to insult
 and ^{but the Son of man lived in dishonor to his heart}mockery
 and contempt to
 ridicule to bear false statements
 to hear his message freighted
 with love and goodness and mercy
 misapplied, misstated, and himself
 called the Prince of Devils because
 he had the divine power to testify
 to his being the Son of God, for no one
 could do the works that he did do
 unless his power came from
 heaven. What moved his own
 nation to throw such scorn
 upon Jesus, it was the purity

Di(99) Bk 32

lower, he was in his world which
 he made yet in poverty in the
 depths of abasement and
 humiliation among men. ²⁵He
 stated, "The foxes have holes and
 the birds of the air of [sic]
 nests, but the Son [of] man had
 not where to lay his head." ²⁶He
 submitted to insult and mockery
 and contempt to ridicule to bear
 false statements to hear his
 message freighted with love and
 goodness and mercy misapplied,
 misstated, and himself called the
 Prince of Devils because he had
 the divine power to testify to
 his being the Son of God, for no
 one could do the works that he
 did do unless his power came from
 heaven.

²⁷What moved his own nation
 to throw such scorn upon Jesus?

²⁸It was the purity

and sinlessness of Christ's
 humanity that stirred up the
 [sic] such Satanic hatred,
 because truth was revealing
 falsehoods.
 29 He, Satan, had declared
 that the sin of Adam revealed
 that human beings could
 not keep the law of God and he
 thus sought to carry the mission
 with him in this decision. Christ
 came on the earth, to ^{to} ~~show~~ ^{represent} humanity
 and standing as man's representative,
 to show in the conflict ~~that~~
 controversy with Satan that he
 was a liar that Man as God
 created him, connected with
 the Father and the Son, could
 obey every requirement of God,
 God speaking through him.

Di(99) Bk 32

and sinlessness of Christ's
 humanity that stirred up the
 [sic] such Satanic hatred,
 because truth was revealing
 falsehoods.

29 He, Satan, had declared
 that the sin of Adam revealed
 that human beings could not keep
 the law of God, and he thus
 sought to carry the universe with
 him in this decision. 30 Christ
 came to the earth, taking
 humanity and standing as man's
 representative, to show in the
 conflict and controversy with
 Satan that he was a liar, that
 man, as God created him,
 connected with the Father and the
 Son, could obey every requirement
 of God.

31 God speaking through his

servants declare, "and his commandments are not grievous, sin separated man from his God and keeps or maintains this separation." Satan's words proved apparent to be truth, Christ came to unmask Satan and reveal him as a liar. Christ came that through trial and disputing of Satan's claims in the great conflict, he should demonstrate the matter, that a ransom had been found, that no less than the Majesty of heaven would undertake in man's behalf, taking man's nature and with the same facilities that man may obtain, he will stand

Di (99) Bk 32

servants declare, "and his commandments are not grievous [sic]." ³²Sin separated man from his God and, keeping or maintaining this separation, Satan's words would appear to be truth. ³³Christ came to unmask Satan and reveal him as a liar, pure truth against error. ³⁴Christ came that through trial and disputing of Satan's claims in the great conflict, he should demonstrate the matter, that a ransom had been found, that no less than the Majesty of heaven would undertake in man's behalf, taking man's nature and with the same facilities that man may obtain, he will stand

The test and proving of God as man must
 stand the same trial, Divinity and
 humanity combined he was victor
 and man was not left in his
 human strength in the warfare
 with Satan, but divine power was
 placed upon man, that God
 was a partaker of the divine
 nature, he overcomes the corruption
 that is in the world through
 lust. Now Satan sees that
 his true character before all
 the universes of heaven and all
 the worlds which God had created
 would go wholly on the side of
 God, and his prospect of future
 influence with these would
 be cut off entirely.

Di(99) Bk 32

the test and proving of God as
 man must stand the same test and
 trial.

35 Divinity and humanity
 combined, he was victor, and man
 was not left in his human
 strength in the warfare with
 Satan, but divine power was
 placed upon man that, at the
 seeking and asking of man, man
 may become a partaker of the
 divine nature; "let him take hold
 of my strength and make peace
 with me and he shall make peace
 with me, saith the Lord." 36 He
 overcomes the corruption that is
 in the world through lust.

37 Now Satan sees that his
 true character [sic] before all
 the universe of heaven and all
 the worlds which God had created
 would go wholly on the side of
 God, and his prospect of future
 influence with these would be cut
 off entirely. 38 Christ's

^{13.} ^{glad} humanity has demonstrated for
 eternal ages the matter which
 would settle the controversy
 The enmity in the prophecy in Eden was
 to be universal and confined merely
 to Satan and the Prince of Life but
 he begets all mankind between
^{the seed of the serpent} ~~the seed of the serpent~~ ^{the seed of the serpent}
 Satan is wicked men, who resist
 the Spirit of God (who will call his
 law, as did their father the Serp-
 ent) a wholly bondage. The great
 enmity is of the Devil
 Sin is the transgression of the Law
 of God. The enmity was supernaturally
 put between the seed of the woman
 against the seed of the Serp-
 ent. The enmity was natural
 in another supernatural elements and elements

Di(99) Bk 32

humanity has demonstrated for
 eternal ages the matter which
 would settle the controversy.
 39 The enmity in the prophecy in
 Eden was to be universal, not
 confined merely to Satan and the
 Prince of Life, but be felt by
 all mankind between the serpent's
 seed and the seed of the woman.

40 The seed of Satan is
 wicked men who resist the Spirit
 of God, who will call his law, as
 did their father the Devil, a
 yoke of bondage. 41 He that
 committeth sin is of the Devil.
 42 Sin is the transgression of the
 law. 43 The enmity was
 supernaturally put between the
 seed of the woman against the
 seed of the Devil. 44 With Christ
 the enmity was in one sense
 natural, in another, supernatural
 as humanity and divinity

was combined 18
 Never was the enmity developed in
 such a ~~marked degree~~ as when
 Christ was a resident of this
 earth his divinity clothed with
 humanity, Never had there been
 a being upon the earth that hated
 sin with the perfect hatred
 as Jesus Christ. He had seen
 its deceiving, infatuating power upon
 the holy angels which resulted
 in their revolt, and all his power
 was enlisted against Satan.
 This is the secret which stirred up
 Satan with such an intense hatred
 against Christ, the truth was
 flashing its light in the purity and
 holiness of Jesus Christ amid
 the moral darkness that Satan

Di (99) Bk 32

was [sic] combined. 45 Never was
 the enmity developed in such
 marked degree as when Christ was
 a resident of this earth, his
 divinity clothed with humanity.

46 Never had there been a being
 upon the earth that hated sin
 with so perfect a hatred as Jesus
 Christ. 47 He had seen its
 deceiving, infatuating power upon
 the holy angels which resulted in
 their revolt, and all his power
 was enlisted against Satan.

48 This is the secret which
 stirred up Satan with such an
 intense hatred against Christ.

49 The truth was flashing its
 light in the purity and holiness
 of Jesus Christ amid the moral
 darkness wherewith Satan

¹¹ had enshrouded the world and
 thus was exposing his falsehoods
 and deceiving character of sin,
 and spoiling his corrupting
 influence. ⁵⁰ Satan and the whole
 lust [host] of fallen beings was
 determined to urge the
 warfare most vigorously for this
 stood one in the world so pure a
~~perfect~~ ^{all} ~~heaven represented~~
 He was a perfect representation
 of the Father and in his character
 and practices was a refutation
 of Satan's. This representation
 of the character of God, the pure
 life and holiness of God was
 heavens light in contrast
 with Satan's darkness.

Di (99) Bk 32

had enshrouded the world and thus
 was exposing his falsehoods and
 deceiving character [sic] of sin,
 and spoiling his corrupting
 influence. ⁵⁰ Satan and the whole
 lust [host] of fallen beings was
 determined to urge the warfare
 most vigorously, for there stood
 one in the world, so pure he was
 a perfect representation of the
 Father, and in character [sic]
 and practices was a refutation of
 Satan's misrepresentations of the
 character [sic] of God.

⁵¹ The pure life and holiness
 of God was heaven's light in
 contrast with Satanic darkness,

12
 truth pure and heavenly in contrast
 with error and darkness, thus a
 perpetual reproach ~~was~~ of all
 sin was in the ~~world~~ a world
 of sensuality and sin, because of
 spotless righteousness who did no
 sin neither was guile found in his
 mouth, ~~with what intense interest~~
 was this controversy watched by the
 loyal angels and the unfallen
 worlds, as the honor of the law
 of God was being vindicated
 not merely for this world but for the
 universes of heaven and the worlds
 that God had created. Was to
 have the controversy forever
 settled, ~~Satan saw God whom~~
 he had charged with the attributes

Di(99) Bk 32

truth pure and heavenly in contrast with error and darkness.

52 Thus a perpetual reproach of all sin was in a world of sensuality and sin, because of his spotless righteousness who did no sin, neither was guile found in his mouth. 53 With what intense interest was this controversy watched by the loyal angels and the unfallen worlds, as the honor of the law of God was being vindicated. 54 Not merely for this world, but for the universe of heaven and the worlds that God had created was [sic] to have the controversy forever settled.

55 Satan saw God, whom he had charged with the attributes

¹⁴ himself possessed revealed in ¹⁵ his true light of a compassionate
 Merciful God not willing that any
 should perish, ^{but that all sinful men come to repentance} that all should have
 eternal life, But (was what enraged
 Satan and ^{It} was not ^{wholly} the
 absence of eternal life and riches
 and glory which caused the Jews
 to reject Jesus. ^{but it was Son of}
 righteousness, shining amid the
 moral darkness in such distinct
 rays, it revealed the contrast
 between sin and holiness, purity
 and defilement, and such light
 was not welcome to them. ^{Christ}
 was not such an one as themselves,
 and every miracle which he wrought
 which ~~did not~~ ^{emphasized} some of his
 divine character answered to them

Di(99) Bk 32

himself possessed, revealed in
 Christ in his true light, of a
 compassionate, merciful God, not
 willing that any should perish,
 but that all sinful men come to
 repentance and should have
 eternal life. ⁵⁶ This was what
 enraged Satan.

⁵⁷ It was not wholly the
 absence of external honor and
 riches and glory which caused the
 Jews to reject Jesus, but it was
 Son of righteousness, shining
 amid the moral darkness in such
 distinct rays, it revealed the
 contrast between sin and
 holiness, purity and defilement,
 and such light was not welcome to
 them. ⁵⁸ Christ was not such an
 one as themselves, and every
 miracle which he wrought did
 convince some of his divine
 character [sic], answering to
 them

14
 the specifications of messiah in prophecy
 but those who did not receive the light
 of heaven but set themselves the more
 determinedly to ~~mislead~~ ^{mislead} against this
 evidence to ~~mislead the people~~, I had
 a man in the common walks of life
 done the same works in ~~miracles~~ that
 Christ ~~done~~ all ~~Christ~~ ^{Christ} have given evidence
 that he was working by the power of God
 The sick were healed persons afflicted
 with demoniac demonstrations
 were ~~healed~~ ^{healed} and sitting at the feet of
 Jesus clothed and in their right mind
 lepers and paralytics and dumb
 were ~~healed~~ ^{healed} the dumb spoke the
 deaf heard ears of the deaf were opened
 the dead were brought to life and
 that which Christ specified would
 characterize his work, the poor would

Di(99) Bk 32

to specifications of messiah in
 prophecy; but those who did not
 receive this light of heaven set
 themselves the more determinedly
 against this evidence to mislead
 the people.

59 Had a man in the common
 walks of life done the same works
 in miracles that Christ done
 [sic], all would have given
 credence that he was working by
 the power of God. 60 The sick
 were healed, persons afflicted
 with demoniac demonstrations were
 healed and sitting at the feet of
 Jesus clothed and in their right
 mind, lepers and paralytics were
 healed, the dumb spoke, the ears
 of the deaf were opened, the dead
 were brought to life and that
 which Christ specified would
 characterize [sic] his work, the
 poor would

¹⁵
 have the Gospel preached to them
 The Jews were expecting an earthly prince to
 deliver them from that which the Lord had
 told them would take place if they did
 not keep the commandments of God,
 the way of the Lord in obeying his statutes
 and his commandments, ^{and his laws} ~~How~~ they had
^{small} ~~small~~ ^{small} their proud boasts that Israel's
 king, the star arising from Judah,
 would break them through and the
 Jewish nation would be a kingdom of
 Priests, ^{by} ~~but~~ could have borne
 this disappointment better than the
 righteous denunciation of every abomin-
 ation in the land, ^{He} ~~He~~ laid bare their
 in parables their professed sanctity
 as whitened sepulchers deceiving the people
 by pretensions to sanctity ^{the} ~~the~~ teachings
 & about in the sowing of the seed

Di (99) Bk 32

have the Gospel preached to them.

⁶¹The Jews were expecting an
 earthly prince to deliver them
 from that which the Lord had told
 them would take place if they did
 not keep the way of the Lord in
 obeying his statutes and his
 commandments, and his laws.

⁶²The Jews had made their proud
 boasts that Israel's king, the
 star arising from Judah, would
 break their thralldom and the
 Jewish nation would be a kingdom
 of Priests. ⁶³They could have
 borne this disappointment better
 than the righteous denunciations
 of every abomination in the land.

⁶⁴He laid bare in parables their
 professed sanctity as whitened
 sepulchers deceiving the people
 by pretensions to sanctity.

⁶⁵The teachings of Christ is
 [sic] the sowing of the seed

to be afterwards transplanted and
 cultivated by his disciples He scattered
 the heavenly pearls grain like precious
 pearls here and there (which minds and
 hearts also desired light and knowledge
 and skillfully gather up as precious
 treasures sent them from heaven
 When opened he their understanding
 that they might understand the
 scriptures. Every thing seemed to be
 transposed by the working of the arts of
 Satan, truth was covered up with rubbish
 of error hidden from finite sight; and
 the special work of Christ was occupied
 in adjusting the claims between heaven
 and earth. The inordinate attachment to
 earthly things had eclipsed the heavenly
 and put the Lord out of their sight and
 knowledge, and false theories as false

to be afterwards transplanted and
 cultivated by his disciples.

66 He scattered the heavenly grain
 like precious pearls here and
 there which minds and hearts who
 desired light and knowledge would
 skillfully gather up as precious
 treasures sent them from heaven.

67 After his resurrection, then
 opened he their understanding,
 that they might understand the
 scriptures.

68 Everything seemed to be
 transposed by the working of the
 arts of Satan. 69 Truth was
 covered up with rubbish of error,
 hidden from finite sight, and the
 special work of Christ was
 occupied in adjusting the claims
 between heaven and earth. 70 The
 inordinate attachment to earthly
 things had eclipsed the heavenly,
 and put the Lord out of their
 sight and knowledge, and false
 theories as false

¹⁹
 gods, which they cherished and worshipped
 in the place of God, the tempter said to him
 & thou wilt worship me all the kingdoms
 of the world shall be thine. Intense worldliness
 has been one of Satan's most successful
 temptations to keep the minds and hearts
 of men so completely filled that with
 worldly attractions and worldly business
 that there is no room for heavenly things.
 The work of Jesus Christ was to set forth
 truths more spiritual and deep because
 of their importance than they had ever
 heard before from rulers & scribes and
 elders. The sayings of Christ are to be
 regarded & appreciated not merely
 in that measure of understanding
 of those who heard him, but in their
 important bearings which he himself
 attached to them, He took the
 old old truths which himself was

Di(99) Bk 32

gods which they cherished and worshipped in the place of God.

71 The tempter said to Christ, "If thou wilt worship me, all the kingdoms of the world shall be thine."

72 Intense worldliness has been one of Satan's most successful temptations to keep the minds and hearts of men so completely filled with worldly attractions and worldly business that there is no room for heavenly things. 73 The work of

Jesus Christ was to set forth truths more spiritual and deep because of their importance than they had ever heard before from rulers, scribes and elders.

74 The sayings of Christ are to be appreciated not merely in that measure of understanding of those who heard him, but in their important bearings which he himself attached to them. 75 He took the old, old truths which himself was

¹⁴⁶
 the originator and placed them before
 his hearers in heaven's own light. Their
 different ²² ~~more~~ ^{than} meaning, what a flood
 of meaning and brightness ~~was~~ and
 spontaneity was brought into the explan-
 ations of these truths. When Christ
 referred to his limitation, rejection
 and crucifixion the disciples could
 not take in his meaning. It had been
 a part of their education to expect
 Christ to set up a temporal
 kingdom and when he spoke of his
 sufferings they could not comprehend
 his words. He ~~did~~ reprove them
 because of their slowness of apprehension.
 He promised that when the comforter
 should come that he would bring
 many things to their remembrance.

Di (99) Bk 32

the originator and placed them
 before his hearers in heaven's
 own light. ⁷⁶How different were
 their meanings! ⁷⁷What a flood of
 meaning and brightness and
 spirituality was brought into the
 explanations of these truths!

⁷⁸When Christ referred to
 his humiliation, rejection, and
 crucifixion, the disciples would
 not take in his meaning. ⁷⁹It
 had been a part of their
 education to expect Christ to set
 up a temporal kingdom, and when
 he spoke of his sufferings, they
 could not comprehend his words.
⁸⁰He reprove them because of
 their slowness of apprehension.
⁸¹He promised that when the
 comforter should come that he
 would bring many things to their
 remembrance.

19
 The truth that is opened to the understanding which the mind grasps as truth is capable of constant expansion and new developments when seen in all its bearings, while looking at the truth is seen in all its bearings on life and character and becomes more clear and certain and beautiful while the mind grasps it in its preciousness, in its heavenly properties, and all who hold upon it becomes [sic] elevated, ennobled, sanctified.

22
 The world is sending divine rays back to enlighten the entire Jewish economy and the minds that have been accepting the sayings of men as the commandments of God now look to God himself as the Author of all truth and man's inventions.

Di (99) 3x 32

82 The truth that is opened to the understanding, which the mind grasps as truth, is capable of constant expansion and new developments, while looking [at] it, the truth is seen in its bearings on life and character [sic] and becomes more clear and certain and beautiful [sic] while the mind grasps it in its preciousness, in its heavenly properties, and all who hold upon it becomes [sic] elevated, ennobled, sanctified.

83 The Light of the world is sending his divine rays back to enlighten the earlier Jewish economy and the truth relating to himself in figures and types, and the minds that through false interpretation of Scripture have been accepting the sayings of men as the commandments of God now look to God himself as the Author of all truth and man's inventions

and traditions as unreliable and not
 only so but dangerous for the people
 men whose God blessed be, the Son of
 of men are put ^{under a law which the Lord} ~~the works of~~
 God blessed be, the light and life,
 Jesus the world's Redeemer, who
 after his resurrection shows us
 the key and he unlocks the treasure
 house of the old testament, opens
 and explores hidden things he separates
 the precious truth from superstition
 errors, and ^{the} ~~devisings~~ and imaginings
 of men, and yet many truths he had
 to say to his disciples which the
 law could not be said because it did
 not advance with the shining of the
 light which was flashed upon the
 whole Levitical law and the
 sacrificial offerings ^{which had become corrupted with the traditions of men} ~~with the traditions of men~~.

and traditions as unreliable, and
 not only so, but dangerous, for
 they place men where God should
 be. ⁸⁴The sayings of men are put
 where a Thus saith the Lord
 should be. ⁸⁵The light and life,
 Jesus the world's redeemer, after
 his resurrection, shows he
 possesses the key and he unlocks
 the treasure house of the old
 testament, opens and explores
 hidden things. ⁸⁶He separates
 the precious truth from
 superstitious errors and
 devisings and imaginings of men,
 and yet many truths he had to say
 to his disciples which could not
 be said because they did not
 advance with the shining of the
 light which was flashed upon the
 whole Levitical laws and the
 sacrificial offerings [sic].
⁸⁷They had become corrupted with
 the traditions of men.

At this 21st of his disciples
 therefore minds do not comprehend im-
 portance of truth even in 1889 for the
 same reason Christ assigned why he
 could not say the many things he
 longed to say to them because
 they did not advance with the light
 embrace the light and follow on
 to still greater brightness in the
 future as Providence leads the way
 so dull have been the comprehension
 of even those who teach the truth
 to others that many things cannot be
 opened to them until we each learn
 it ought not to be so but as men's
 minds become narrow they think they
 know all, and set one stake after
 another in points of truth as they have
 only a glimpse of it and shut their Christ.

Di(99) Bk 32

88 Therefore, the minds of
 his disciples do not comprehend
 important matters of truth even
 in 1889, for the same reason.
 89 Christ assigned (told) why he
 could not say the many things he
 longed to say to them because
 they did not advance with the
 light, embrace the light and
 follow on to still greater
 brightness as Providence leads
 the way. 90 So dull have been the
 comprehension of even those who
 teach the truth to others that
 many things cannot be opened to
 them until we reach heaven. 91 It
 ought not to be so, but as men's
 minds become narrow they think
 they know all, and set one stake
 after another in points of truth
 as they have only a glimpse of it
 and close the mind

22
 as though there was no more for them to learn.
 out showed the Lord attempt to lead them
 on the road but take up with the increased
 light but being the spot where they see a
 glimmer of light, when it is only a link in
 the living chain of truths and promises to
 be studied to find entrance into the mind.
 They have only a rough outline of what
 is to follow. The entire system of Judaism
 was the Gospel veiled. Far, very
 far are human minds from grasping
 the teaching of Christ, old truths
 in new settings, but I have been
 shown that these people will not consider
 like the Jews that it is humbling to their
 dignity and pride to work the mines of
 truth, the harmonious relation
 of truth like links in a chain, just
 as fast as the mind is quickened by
 the spirit of God to comprehend the

Di(99) Bk 32

as though there was [sic] no more
 room for them to learn; and
 should the Lord attempt to lead
 them on, they will not take up
 with this increased light, but
 hug the spot where they think
 they see a glimmering [sic] of
 light when it is only a link in
 the living chain of truths and
 promises to be studied to find
 entrance into the mind. 92 They
 have only a rough outline of what
 is to follow.

93 The entire system of
 Judaism was the Gospel veiled.

94 Far, very far are human minds
 from grasping (in) the teachings
 of Christ, old truths in new
 settings, but I have been shown
 that those who will not consider
 are like the Jews. 95 It is
 humbling to their dignity and
 pride to work the mines of truth,
 the harmonious relation of truth
 like links in a chain. 96 Just as
 fast as the mind is quickened by
 the spirit of God to comprehend

27
 light and in ²⁷humbleness of mind appropriate
 it that it shall be diffused ^{spread} to others
 and reflect back glory to God ^{in increased}
~~development~~ ^{of truth} light will ~~be~~ ^{be} forth on such
 development will be reward of for the
 reward of the humble hearted ^{obedient}
^{And also} fear God ^{who} walk with God, ^{human}
~~Many~~ ^{Many} very many who are
 teachers are generally content with a
 supposition in regard to the truth
 they have crude ideas and are content
 with a surface ~~work~~ ^{work} in searching
 for truth taking for granted they have
 all ^{that is} essential in ~~searching~~ ^{searching} for
 the sayings of men and are too
 indolent to put ^{themselves to} rigorous earnest
 labor represented as digging
 for the truth as for hidden
 treasure, ^{sharp} clear conceptions

Di(99) Bk 32

the light and in humbleness of
 mind appropriate it that it shall
 be diffused to others and reflect
 back glory to God in increased
 light [sic]. ⁹⁷Development of
 truth will be the reward of the
 humble-hearted diligent men who
 fear God, who walk with God.

⁹⁸Many, very many who are
 teachers are generally content
 with a supposition in regard to
 the truth. ⁹⁹They have crude
 ideas and are content with a
 surface work in searching for
 truth, taking for granted they
 have all that is essential.
¹⁰⁰They take the sayings of men
 and are too indolent to put
 themselves to vigorous, earnest
 labor represented as digging for
 the truth as for hidden treasure.

¹⁰¹Sharp clear conceptions [of]

26
 Truth will never be the reward of
 indolence, investigation of every
 point that has been accepted as
 truth must be richly repaid the
 earnest seeker in finding precious
 gems of old truths in new settings
 in closely investigating every jot and
 tittle in ideas of truth that are
 established truth beyond
 controversy, in comparing scripture
 with scripture searching to see if
 there is no flaw in the interpretation
 of scripture, errors may be discovered
 and while digging in the mines of truth
 examining the ore
 precious jewels will be found of
 inestimable value
 Jesus would have the searcher
 of the scriptures sink down the
 mines of truth to find the precious jewels

29
 truth will never be the reward of
 indolence. 102 Investigation of
 every point that has been
 accepted as truth would richly
 repay the earnest seeker in
 finding precious gems of old
 truths in new settings. 103 In
 closely investigating every jot
 and tittle in ideas of truth that
 we think is established truth
 beyond controversy, in comparing
 Scripture with Scripture,
 searching to see if there is no
 flaw in the interpretation of
 Scripture, errors may be
 discovered; and while digging in
 the mines of truth, examining the
 ore, precious jewels will be
 found of inestimable value.

104 Jesus would have the
 searcher of the Scriptures sink
 down the

shaft deeper ^{24. the mine of truth} which they have been working
~~upward~~ out of the Spirit of research is properly
 conducted they will be ^{discover of truth} ~~finders of~~
 precious ~~at~~ golden treasures in the
^{the Scripture} field, for ~~it is~~ the store house
 of the unsearchable riches of Christ.
 This was the character of the teachings
 of Christ. I am the Way the Truth
 and the Life the rich treasures of truth
 opened before the hungry & starving
 people & attracted and charmed their
 senses & ^{marked} contrast with
 the dry lifeless spiritless expositions
 of the old testament scriptures &
 the miracles which he wrought
 kept constantly before the minds
 of the glory and honor of God, he
 seemed to his hearers to be a messenger
 direct from heaven for he spoke not

Di (99) Bk 32

shaft deeper in the mines of
 truths of vital importance to
 their present and eternal
 interest, truth which they have
 been working upon, and if the
 (Spirit of) research is properly
 conducted there will be
 discovered lodes of precious
 golden treasury. ¹⁰⁵The
 Scripture is the field, for it is
 the storehouse of the
 unsearchable riches of Christ.

¹⁰⁶This was the character
 [sic] of the teachings of Christ.

¹⁰⁷I am the Way, the Truth, and
 the life. ¹⁰⁸The rich treasures

of truth opened before the hungry
 starving people attracted and
 charmed their senses. ¹⁰⁹It was

so in contrast with the dry
 lifeless spiritless expositions
 of the old testament scriptures,
 and the miracles which he wrought
 kept constantly before the minds
 the glory and honor of God.

¹¹⁰He seemed to his hearers to be
 a messenger direct from heaven

for he spoke not

²⁴
 to their ears, but to their hearts. After
 listening to about the doctrines and
 teachings of the Priests and rulers was
 dry and painful to the senses, and
^{the priests and rabbis saw}
 that could not lead the people
 then excited the jealousy and hostility
 of the dignitaries of the temple and
 synagogue. He stood forth in his
 humility but in Majesty and dignity
 as one born to command. A power
 attended him wherever he went
 and hearts were melted in to tenderness
 and earnest desire was created
 to be in his presence to listen to
 his voice which uttered truths
 with solemn melody. Satan
 was earnest and determined
 to win his enemy against
 Christ.

Di(99) Bk 32

to their ears, but to their
 hearts. ¹¹¹After listening to
 Christ, the doctrines and
 teachings of the Priests and
 rulers was [sic] dry and painful
 to the senses, and the priests
 and rabbis saw they could not
 hold the people. ¹¹²This excited
 the jealousy and hostility of the
 dignitaries of the temple and
 synagogue.

¹¹³He stood forth in his
 humility but in majesty and
 dignity as one born to command.
¹¹⁴A power attended him wherever
 he went and hearts were melted
 into tenderness, and earnest
 desire was created to be in his
 presence to listen to his voice
 which uttered truths with solemn
 melody.

¹¹⁵And Satan was earnest and
 determined in his enmity against
 Christ.

Even angels conspired with evil
 men and the whole energies of apostasy
 was aroused because one stood in
 the midst unlike themselves
 the whole confederacy of darkness
 was watching critically a semblance
 of a chance to rise in triumph
 over the divine ^{and} human substitute
 and surety for the human race
 that he might shout victory
 and the world and its inhabitants
 forever become his kingdom.
 But Satan reached only the
 heel he could not touch the
 head. The circumstances of his
 birth was of divine, but was treated
 by his own nation, those who had
 blinded their eyes to divine things.

116 Evil angels conspired with
 evil men and the whole energies
 of apostasy was [sic] aroused
 because one stood in their midst
 unlike themselves. 117 The whole
 confederacy of darkness was
 watching critically a semblance
 of a chance to rise in triumph
 over the divine and human
 substitute and surety for the
 human race, that he might shout
 "Victory!" and the world and its
 inhabitants forever become his
 kingdom.

118 But Satan reached only
 the heel. 119 He could not touch
 the head.

120 The circumstances of his
 birth was [sic] divine, but [he]
 was treated by his own nation,
 those who had blinded their eyes
 to spiritual things,

as a blot and stain upon him. ²⁷ ²⁴ ²⁹ ²⁸ ²⁶ ²⁵ ²³ ²² ²¹ ²⁰ ¹⁹ ¹⁸ ¹⁷ ¹⁶ ¹⁵ ¹⁴ ¹³ ¹² ¹¹ ¹⁰ ⁹ ⁸ ⁷ ⁶ ⁵ ⁴ ³ ² ¹

Di(99) Bk 32

as a blot and stain upon him.
 121 These insinuations and charges
 against him was [sic] a small
 part of the abasement he endured
 in his life, not easy for
 humanity to bear. 122 There was
 not a part of the bitterness
 which he did not taste, and the
 bitter woe and curse which he did
 not endure, that he might bring
 many sons and daughters unto
 glory.

123 He was in his youth
 subject unto his parents, and
 example to all youth in obedience
 and honoring his parents. 124 He
 was the Majesty of heaven but in
 the divine plan he must descend
 from his high and holy estate to
 take humanity that humanity might
 touch humanity

248 and divinity combined, ^{with humanity's lowliness of} ~~divinity~~ ^{divinity}
 In his youth he ~~was~~ ^{employed as} he learned
 the trade of a carpenter and employed
 his time in earning his bread by the
 sweat of his ^{brow} face, thus he
 honored physical labor and gave
 this as a lesson in his practical life
 in his lowly occupation. ^{Not only} ~~Not only~~ ^{but} ~~he~~
 he encouraged every human being in performing the common
 place duties of life that Jesus labored
 and toiled to provide ^{for} his own ^{temporal} ~~temporal~~ ^{needs}
 temporal wants and he was God in
 human flesh. His entire life was marked
 with humility. And every thing connected
 with Christ was not after the world's
 habits and customs and practices.
 What a lesson is given to the Christian
 churches throughout the world not
 to exalt themselves above Jesus the

Di(99) Bk 32

and divinity combined with
 humanity by hold of divinity.

125 In his youth he learned
 the trade of a carpenter and
 employed his time in earning his
 bread by the sweat of his brow.
 126 Thus he honored physical labor
 and gave this as a lesson in his
 practical life, in his lowly
 occupation, which should be an
 encouragement to strengthen every
 human being in performing the
 common place duties of life that
 Jesus labored and toiled to
 provide for his own temporal
 wants; and he was God in human
 flesh.

127 His entire life was
 marked with humility, and
 everything connected with Christ
 was not after the world's habits
 and customs and practices.

128 What a lesson is given to the
 Christian churches throughout the
 world not to exalt themselves
 above Jesus the

^{copies}
(Majesty of heaven their Redeemer.
What do they find in the example of
Christ for their feelings of superiority
keeping themselves apart from their
fellow men hiding themselves from
their own flesh? The cause one has obtained
more of the world's goods than his neighbor
because the world honors the wealthy
and despises the poor, will those who claim
to follow Jesus do this, whose leading
and example are they imitating?
Certainly not the example of him who
said, I came to preach the Gospel to
the poor to heal the broken hearted
&c.

Di(99) Bk 32

Majesty of heaven their Redeemer.

129 What do they find in the
example of Christ for their
feelings of superiority, keeping
themselves apart from their
fellow men, hiding themselves
from their own flesh? 130 Because

one has obtained more of this
worlds [sic] goods than his
neighbor, because the world
honors the wealthy and despises
the poor, will those who claim to
follow Jesus do this? 131 whose

leading and example are they
imitating? 132 Certainly not the
example of him who said, "I came
to preach the Gospel to the poor,
to heal the broken hearted &c.

[sic]

Satan Controls the Minds of men in their
 devotion and love of the Good, they
 are so attached to worldly things that all
^{ways of} sin will be committed in order to gain
 some worldly advantage. Satan
 thought to succeed with Christ on
 this point that the ^{humanity of Christ} ~~Savior~~ ^{Jesus} ~~men~~
 might easily be overcome by his
 temptations but Christ was not
 moved. God must be supreme in
 every mind. Christ used the only
 weapons justifiable for human beings
 to use that is the Word of God who
 is mighty in counsel. "It is written."
 Man is dazzled and charmed with the
 glitter and tinsel of the Good,

Di(99) Bk 32

133 Satan controls the minds of
 men in their devotion and love of
 the world. 134 They are so
 attached to worldly things that
 all kinds of sins will be
 committed in order to gain some
 worldly advantage. 135 Satan
 thought to succeed with Christ on
 this point. 136 He thought that
 the humanity of Christ might
 easily be overcome by his
 temptations, but Christ was not
 moved.

137 God must be supreme in
 every mind. 138 Christ used the
 only weapons justifiable for
 human beings to use, that is the
 word of him who is mighty in
 council, "It is written." 139 Man
 is dazzled and charmed with the
 glitter and tinsel of the world.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 13

Introduction to Manuscript 143, 1897

MS 143 represents the second stage in the development of a text tradition on the temptations of Christ originating with the diary material, Di(99), just preceding this. The content of MS 143 is very similar to that of Diary Book 32, 1899, focusing on the nature of Christ and the temptations which He had to meet, touching on the conflict between good and evil, and closing with a discussion of "truth" and how it is made practical to believers.

The reader may wish to examine the three stages of development, from diary material (Di(99), Bk 32), to manuscript (MS 143, 1897), to Signs article (June 9, 1898), and discover for himself/herself the correspondence of thoughts, either verbatim or paraphrased. Our cursory examination would suggest that the following sentences of MS 143 seem not to correspond directly to the diary text: 22-24, 44, 54, 62, 65-68, 70, 80-85, 98-102, 105, 132-134, 137, 151-156, 162.

Furthermore we would list six instances of similar thoughts being carried over; they are as follows: sentence 2 with Di(99)33; 37 with Di(99)35, 36; 69 with Di(99)71; 108 with Di(99)109; 126 with Di(99)89; 135 with Di(99)96.

The several paragraphs of MS 143 which would apply more directly to the content of DA chapter 13 begin with sentence 60.

MS 143, 1897 - Christ's Mission to Earth

¹In heaven Satan had declared that the sin of Adam revealed that human beings could not keep the law of God, and he sought to carry the universe with him in this belief. ²Satan's words appeared to be true, but Christ came to unmask the deceiver. ³He came that through trial and dispute of the claims of Satan in the great conflict, he might demonstrate that a ransom had been found. ⁴The Majesty of heaven would undertake the cause of men, and with the same facilities that man may obtain, stand the test and proving of God as man must stand it.

⁵Christ came to the earth, taking humanity and standing as man's representative, to show in the controversy with Satan that he was a liar, and that man, as God created him, connected with the Father and the Son, could obey every requirement of God. ⁶Speaking through his servant he declares, "His commandments are not grievous." ⁷It was sin that separated man from his God, and it is sin that maintains this separation.

⁸What a sight was this for heaven to look upon. ⁹Christ, who knew not the least moral taint or defilement of sin, took our nature in its deteriorated condition. ¹⁰This was humiliation greater than finite man can comprehend. ¹¹He was the Majesty of heaven, but in the divine plan he descended from his high and holy estate to take humanity, that humanity might touch humanity, and divinity, combined with humanity, take hold upon divinity.

¹²God was manifest in the flesh. ¹³He humbled himself. ¹⁴What a subject for thought, for deep, earnest contemplation. ¹⁵So infinitely great that he was the Majesty of heaven [sic], and yet he stooped so low without losing an atom of his dignity or glory. ¹⁶Christ stooped to poverty and to the deepest abasement and humiliation among men. ¹⁷"For our sake he became poor, that we through his poverty might be made rich." ¹⁸"The foxes have holes," he said, "the birds of the air have nest, but the Son of man hath not where to lay his head. ¹⁹Christ submitted to insult and mockery, contempt and ridicule. ²⁰He heard his message, which was fraught with love and goodness and mercy, misapplied and misstated. ²¹He heard himself called the prince of the devils because he testified to his Sonship with God. ²²The circumstances of his birth were divine, but by his own nation, those who had blinded their eyes to spiritual things, it was regarded as a blot and a stain. ²³But these insinuations and charges were but a small part of the abuse he endured in his life. ²⁴There was not a drop of bitter woe which he did not taste, not a part of the curse which he did not endure, that he might bring many sons and daughters to God.

²⁵When we contemplate the fact that Jesus was on this earth as a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief; that in order to save fallen man from eternal ruin, he left his heavenly home, we should lay in the dust all our pride. ²⁶This fact should put to shame all our vanity, and reveal

to us our sin of self-sufficiency. ²⁷Behold him making the wants, the trials, the grief and suffering of sinful men his own. ²⁸Can we not take home the lesson that God endured these sufferings and bruises of soul in consequence of sin.

²⁹By taking upon himself man's nature in its fallen condition, Christ did not in the least participate in its sin. ³⁰He was subject to the infirmities and weaknesses of the flesh with which humanity is encompassed, "that it might be fulfilled that was spoken by the prophet Esaias, Himself took our infirmities and bare our sicknesses." ³¹He was touched with the feeling of our infirmities, and was in all points tempted like as we are. ³²And yet he was without a spot.

³³There should not be the faintest misgivings in regard to the perfect freedom from sinfulness in the human nature of Christ. ³⁴Our faith must be an intelligent faith, looking unto Jesus in perfect confidence, in full and entire faith in the atoning sacrifice. ³⁵This is essential that the soul may not be enshrouded in darkness. ³⁶This holy Substitute is able to save to the uttermost, for he presented to the wondering universe perfect and complete humility in his human character, and perfect obedience to all the requirements of God. ³⁷Divine power is placed upon man, that he may become a partaker of the divine nature, having escaped the corruption that is in the world through lust. ³⁸This is why repenting, believing man can be made the righteousness of God in him.

³⁹The purity and holiness of Christ, the spotless righteousness of Him who did no sin, neither was guile found in his mouth, was heaven's light in contrast with Satanic darkness. ⁴⁰In him was a perpetual reproach upon all sin in a world of sensuality and sin.

⁴¹The enmity referred to in the prophecy in Eden was not to be confined merely to Satan and the Prince of life. ⁴²It was to be universal. ⁴³Satan and his angels were to feel the enmity of all mankind. ⁴⁴"I will put enmity," said God, "between thee and the woman, between thy seed and her seed; it shall bruise thy head, and thou shalt bruise his heel." ⁴⁵The seed of Satan is wicked men, who resist the Spirit of God, and who call the law, as did their father the devil, a yoke of bondage. ⁴⁶"Sin is transgression of the law," said Christ. ⁴⁷"He that committeth sin is of the devil."

⁴⁸The enmity put between the seed of the serpent and the seed of the woman was supernatural. ⁴⁹With Christ the enmity was in one sense natural, in another sense it was supernatural, as humanity and divinity were combined. ⁵⁰And never was the enmity developed to such a marked degree, as when Christ became a resident of this earth. ⁵¹Never before had there been a being upon the earth who hated sin with so perfect a hatred as did Christ. ⁵²He had seen its deceiving, infatuating power upon the holy angels, causing them to revolt, and all his powers were enlisted against Satan. ⁵³In the purity and holiness of his life, Christ

flashed the light of truth amid the moral darkness with which Satan had enshrouded the world. ⁵⁴Christ exposed his falsehoods, and deceiving character, and spoiled his corrupting influence.

⁵⁵It was this that stirred Satan with such an intense hatred of Christ. ⁵⁶With his hosts of fallen beings he determined to urge the warfare most vigorously; for there stood one in the world who was a perfect representation of the Father, and in his character and practices was a refutation of Satan's misrepresentations of the character of God.

⁵⁷It was the purity and sinlessness of Christ's humanity that stirred up such Satanic hatred. ⁵⁸His truth revealed their falsehoods. ⁵⁹Satan saw God, whom he had charged with the attributes which he himself possessed, revealed in Christ in his true character,--a compassionate, merciful God, not willing that any should perish but that all should come to him in repentance and have eternal life.

⁶⁰Intense worldliness has been one of Satan's most successful temptations. ⁶¹He designs to keep the minds and hearts of men so completely filled with worldly attractions that there will be no room for heavenly things. ⁶²He controls the minds of men in their love of the world. ⁶³The inordinate attachment to earthly things eclipses the heavenly, and puts the Lord out of the sight and understanding of men. ⁶⁴False theories and false gods are cherished in the place of the true.

⁶⁵Men are dazed and charmed with the glitter and tinsel of the world. ⁶⁶They are so attached to the things of earth that they will commit any sin in order to gain some worldly advantage. ⁶⁷Satan thought to overthrow Christ on this point. ⁶⁸He thought that the humanity of Christ would be easily overcome by his temptations. ⁶⁹"And the devil taketh him up into an exceeding high mountain, and sheweth him all the kingdoms of the world, and the glory of them; and said unto him, All these things will I give thee if thou wilt fall down and worship me."

⁷⁰But Christ was unmoved; and he used only the weapons justifiable for human beings to use,--the word of Him who is mighty in council, "It is written."

⁷¹Had there been the least taint of sin in Christ, Satan would have bruised his head. ⁷²As it was, he could only touch his heel. ⁷³Had the head of Christ been touched, the hope of the human race would have perished. ⁷⁴Divine wrath would have come upon Christ as it came upon Adam. ⁷⁵Christ and the church would have been without hope. ⁷⁶But Christ "knew no sin." ⁷⁷He was the lamb "without blemish and without spot."

⁷⁸With what intense interest was this controversy watched by the heavenly angels and the unfallen worlds as the honor of the law was being vindicated. ⁷⁹Not merely for this world, but for the universe of heaven and the worlds that God had created was the controversy to be forever settled. ⁸⁰The confederacy of darkness were watching for

the semblance of a chance to rise and triumph over the divine and human substitute and surety of the human race, that the apostate might shout, Victory, and the worlds and its inhabitants forever become his kingdom. ⁸¹But Satan reached only the heel, he could not touch the head. ⁸²Now he sees that his true character is clearly revealed before all heaven, and that the heavenly beings and the worlds that God has created would be wholly on the side of God. ⁸³He sees that his prospects of future influence with them will be entirely cut off. ⁸⁴Christ's humanity will demonstrate for eternal ages the question which settled the controversy.

⁸⁵What was it that moved his own nation to throw such scorn upon Jesus? ⁸⁶The Jews were expecting an earthly prince, who would deliver them from the power which God had declared would rule over them if they refused to keep the way of the Lord, and obey his statutes, his commandments and his laws. ⁸⁷They had made their proud boast that Israel's king, the star arising from Judah, would break their thralldom, and make of them a kingdom of priests.

⁸⁸But it was not the absence of external honor and riches and glory that caused the Jews to reject Jesus. ⁸⁹The Sun of Righteousness shining amid the moral darkness in such distinct rays revealed the contrast between sin and holiness, purity and defilement, and much light was not welcome to them. ⁹⁰Christ was not such an one as themselves. ⁹¹The Jews could have borne their disappointed hopes better than they could the righteous denunciation of

their sins. ⁹²In parables Christ laid bare their professed sanctity. ⁹³He compared them to whited sepulchers, deceiving the people by their pretensions to piety.

⁹⁴That which Christ had specified would be his work, was fulfilled. ⁹⁵The sick were healed, demoniacs were restored, lepers and paralytics were made whole. ⁹⁶The dumb spake, the ears of the deaf were opened, the dead were brought to life, and the poor had the gospel preached to them. ⁹⁷Had a man in the common walks of life done the same works that Christ did, all would have declared that he was working by the power of God. ⁹⁸Every miracle wrought by Christ convinced some of them of his true character, which answered to the specifications of the Messiah of prophecy; but those who did not receive the light of heaven set themselves more determinedly against this evidence.

⁹⁹In his youth Christ was subject unto his parents,--an example of obedience to all the youth. ¹⁰⁰In his youth he learned the trade of a carpenter, and earned his bread by the sweat of his brow. ¹⁰¹Thus he honored physical labor, and gave it as a lesson in his practical life. ¹⁰²It should be an encouragement and source of strength to every human being in the performance of the common place duties of life to know that Jesus labored and toiled to provide for his own temporal wants.

¹⁰³The teachings of Christ, in precept and example were the sowing of the seed, to be afterward cultivated by his disciples. ¹⁰⁴He scattered the heavenly grain like precious

pearls, which minds and hearts that desired light and knowledge might skilfully gather up as precious treasures sent from heaven.

¹⁰⁵Christ set truths more spiritual and deep than had ever before been heard from rulers, scribes, or elders. ¹⁰⁶"I am the way, the Truth, and the Life," he declared. ¹⁰⁷The rich treasures of truth opened before the people attracted and charmed their senses. ¹⁰⁸They were in marked contrast with the dry, lifeless, spiritless expositions of the Old Testament Scriptures by the rabbis. ¹⁰⁹And the miracles which he wrought kept constantly before his hearers the honor and glory of God. ¹¹⁰He seemed to them a messenger direct from heaven, for he spoke not to their ears only but to their hearts.

¹¹¹After listening to Christ the doctrines of the priests and rabbis were dry and painful to the ears of the people. ¹¹²These dignitaries of the temple saw that they could not hold the people, and they were filled with jealousy and hostility. ¹¹³Christ stood forth in his humility, yet in dignity and majesty, as one born to command. ¹¹⁴A power attended him wherever he went, and hearts were melted into tenderness. ¹¹⁵An earnest desire was created to be in his presence, to listen to the voice of Him who uttered truths with such solemn melody.

¹¹⁶The sayings of Christ are to be valued, not merely in accordance with the measure of the understanding of those who hear; they are to be considered in the important bearing

which Christ himself attaches to them. ¹¹⁷He took the old truths of which he himself was the originator, and placed them before his hearers in heaven's own light. ¹¹⁸How different was the representation. ¹¹⁹What a flood of meaning and brightness and spirituality was brought in by their explanation.

¹²⁰After his resurrection, Christ opened the understanding of his followers, that they might understand the Scriptures. ¹²¹Everything had been transformed by the working of the arts of Satan. ¹²²Truth was covered up by the rubbish of error, and hidden from finite sight. ¹²³When Christ referred to his humiliation, rejection, and crucifixion, the disciples could not take in his meaning. ¹²⁴It had been a part of their education to expect Christ to set up a temporal kingdom, and when he spoke of his sufferings they could not understand his words. ¹²⁵He reproved them because of their slowness of apprehension, and promised them that when the Comforter should come, he would bring many things to their remembrance.

¹²⁶Christ had many truths to give to his disciples, of which he could not speak, because they did not advance with the light that was flashed upon the Levitical laws and the sacrificial offerings. ¹²⁷They did not embrace the light, advance with the light, and follow on to still greater brightness as Providence should lead the way.

¹²⁸And for the same reason Chrst's disciples of 1897 do not comprehend important matters of truth. ¹²⁹So dull has

been the comprehension of even those who teach the truth to others that many things cannot be opened to them until they reach heaven. ¹³⁰It ought not to be so. ¹³¹But as men's minds become narrow, they think they know it all, and set one stake after another in points of truths of which they have only a glimpse. ¹³²They close their minds as though there were no more for them to learn, and should the Lord attempt to lead them on, they would not take up with the increased light. ¹³³They cling to the spot where they think they see a glimmer of light when it is only a link in the living chain of truths and promises to be studied. ¹³⁴They know very little of what it means to follow in the footsteps of Christ.

¹³⁵The harmonious relation of truth, like links in a chain, will, just as fast as the mind is quickened by the Spirit of God to comprehend light and in humbleness of mind appropriate it, be dispensed to others, and give the glory back to God. ¹³⁶The development of truth will be the reward to the humble-hearted seeker, who will fear God and walk with him. ¹³⁷The truth which the mind grasps as truth is capable of constant expansion and new developments. ¹³⁸While beholding it, the truth is seen in all its bearings in the life and character, and becomes more clear, and certain, and beautiful. ¹³⁹As the mind grasps it in its preciousness, it becomes elevated, ennobled, sanctified.

¹⁴⁰The entire system of Judaism was the gospel veiled. ¹⁴¹Far, very far are human minds from grasping the teachings

of Christ. ¹⁴²These are old truths in new settings. ¹⁴³I have been shown that those who will not consider are like the Jews. ¹⁴⁴It is humbling to their dignity and pride to work the mines of truth. ¹⁴⁵The Light of the world is sending his divine rays back to enlighten the entire Jewish economy, and the minds that have been accepting the sayings of men as the commandments of God are now educated [to] look to God himself as the Author of all truth.

¹⁴⁶Man's inventions and traditions are not only unreliable, but dangerous; for they place men where God should be. ¹⁴⁷They place the sayings of men where a "Thus saith the Lord" should be. ¹⁴⁸The world's Redeemer possesses the key, and unlocks the treasure house of the Old Testament. ¹⁴⁹He explores hidden things. ¹⁵⁰He separates the precious truth from superstition and error and the devisings and imaginings of men.

¹⁵¹Christ's habits and customs and practices were not after the standard of the world. ¹⁵²What a lesson he gives to the Christian churches throughout the world not to exalt themselves above the Majesty of heaven, their Redeemer. ¹⁵³What do men find in the example of Christ to justify their feeling of superiority, keeping themselves apart from their fellow-men, hiding themselves from their own flesh, because he has obtained more of this world's goods than his neighbor? ¹⁵⁴Because the world honors the wealthy and despises the poor, shall those who claim to follow Jesus do the same? ¹⁵⁵Whose leading and example are such following?

¹⁵⁶Certainly not the example of Him who said, "He hath sent me to heal the broken hearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised," "to preach the gospel to the poor."

¹⁵⁷Very many teachers are content with a supposition in regard to the truth. ¹⁵⁸They have crude ideas, and are content with a surface work in searching for truth, taking for granted that they have all that is essential. ¹⁵⁹They take the sayings of other men for truth, being too indolent to put themselves to diligent, earnest labor, represented in the word as digging for hidden treasure.

¹⁶⁰Sharp, clear conceptions of truth will never be the reward of indolence. ¹⁶¹Investigation of every point that has been received as truth will richly repay the searcher in finding precious gems. ¹⁶¹In closely investigating every joy and tittle which we think is established truth beyond controversy, in comparing Scripture with Scripture, searching to see if there is no flaw in their interpretation, errors may be discovered; Christ would have the searcher of the Scripture sink the shaft down deeper into the mines of truth. ¹⁶³If the search is properly conducted, precious jewels of inestimable value will be found. ¹⁶⁴The word of God is the mine of the unsearchable riches of Christ.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 13

Introduction to Signs June 9, 1898

The following much-published selection, entitled "Tempted in All Points Like as We Are," was evidently prepared by one of Ellen White's editors, Minnie Hawkins. This article appears to have stemmed from the earlier materials just included in Appendix D, namely, Diary Book 32, 1899 (1889) and MS 143, 1897.

This particular reprint is from Selected Messages, I, pages 252-255.

INCARNATION—THE NATURE OF CHRIST

35.

*"Tempted in All Points**Like as We Are"*

After the fall of man, Satan declared that human beings were proved to be incapable of keeping the law of God, and he sought to carry the universe with him in this belief. Satan's words appeared to be true, and Christ came to unmask the deceiver. The Majesty of heaven undertook the cause of man, and with the same facilities that man may obtain, withstood the temptations of Satan as man must withstand them. This was the only way in which fallen man could become a partaker of the divine nature. In taking human nature, Christ was fitted to understand man's trials and sorrows and all the temptations wherewith he is beset. Angels who were unacquainted with sin could not sympathize with man in his peculiar trials. Christ condescended to take man's nature, and was tempted in all points like as we, that He might know how to succor all who should be tempted. In assuming humanity Christ took the part of every human being. He was the Head of humanity. A Being divine and human, with His long human arm He could encircle humanity, while with His divine arm He could lay hold of the throne of the Infinite.

* This article appeared in *The Signs of the Times*, June 9, 1898.

254

SELECTED MESSAGES—I

that separated man from his God, and it is sin that maintains this separation.

The Prophecy in Eden

The enmity referred to in the prophecy in Eden was not to be confined merely to Satan and the Prince of life. It was to be universal. Satan and his angels were to feel the enmity of all mankind. "I will put enmity," said God, "between thee and the woman, and between thy seed and her seed; it shall bruise thy head, and thou shalt bruise his heel" (Gen. 3:15). The enmity put between the seed of the serpent and the seed of the woman was supernatural. With Christ the enmity was in one sense natural; in another sense it was supernatural, as humanity and divinity were combined. And never was the enmity developed to such a marked degree as when Christ became an inhabitant of this earth. Never before had there been a being upon the earth who hated sin with so perfect a hatred as did Christ. He had seen its deceiving, infatuating power upon the holy angels, and all His powers were enlisted against it. The purity and holiness of Christ, the spotless righteousness of Him who did no sin, was a perpetual reproach upon all sin in a world of sensuality and sin. In His life the light of truth was flashed amid the moral darkness with which Satan had enshrouded the world. Christ exposed Satan's falsehoods and deceiving character, and in many hearts destroyed his corrupting influence. It was this that stirred Satan with such intense hatred. With his hosts of fallen beings he determined to urge the warfare most vigorously; for there stood in the world One who was a perfect representative of the Father, One whose character and practices refuted Satan's misrepresentation of God. Satan had charged upon God the attribute he himself possessed. Now in Christ he saw God revealed in His true character—a compassionate, merciful Father, not willing that any should perish, but that all should come to Him in repentance, and have eternal life. Intense worldliness has been one of Satan's most suc-

"TEMPTED IN ALL POINTS"

253

What a sight was this for Heaven to look upon! Christ, who knew not the least taint of sin or defilement, took our nature in its deteriorated condition. This was humiliation greater than finite man can comprehend. God was manifest in the flesh. He humbled Himself. What a subject for thought, for deep, earnest contemplation! So infinitely great that He was the Majesty of heaven, and yet He stooped so low, without losing one atom of His dignity and glory! He stooped to poverty and to the deepest abasement among men. For our sake He became poor, that we through His poverty might be made rich. "The foxes have holes," He said, "and the birds of the air have nests; but the Son of man hath not where to lay his head" (Matt. 8:20).

Christ submitted to insult and mockery, contempt and ridicule. He heard His message, which was fraught with love and goodness and mercy, misrated and misapplied. He heard Himself called the prince of demons, because He testified to His divine Sonship. His birth was supernatural, but by His own nation, those who had blinded their eyes to spiritual things, it was regarded as a blot and a stain. There was not a drop of our bitter woe which He did not taste, nor a part of our curse which He did not endure, that He might bring many sons and daughters to God.

The fact that Jesus was on this earth as a man of sorrows and acquainted with grief, that in order to save fallen man from eternal ruin, He left His heavenly home, should lay in the dust all our pride, put to shame all our vanity, and reveal to us the sin of self-sufficiency. Behold Him making the wants, the trials, the griefs and sufferings of sinful men His own. Can we not take home the lesson that God endured these sufferings and bruises of soul in consequence of sin?

Christ came to the earth, taking humanity and standing as man's representative, to show in the controversy with Satan that man, as God created him, connected with the Father and the Son, could obey every divine requirement. Speaking through His servant He declares, "His commandments are not grievous" (1 John 5:3). It was sin

"TEMPTED IN ALL POINTS"

255

cessful temptations. He designs to keep the hearts and minds of men so engrossed with worldly attractions that there will be no room for heavenly things. He controls their minds in their love of the world. Earthly things eclipse the heavenly, and put the Lord out of their sight and understanding. False theories and false gods are cherished in the place of the true. Men are charmed with the glitter and tinsel of the world. They are so attached to the things of the earth that many will commit any sin in order to gain some worldly advantage.

It was on this point that Satan thought to overthrow Christ. He thought that in His humanity He could be easily overcome. "The devil taketh him up into an exceeding high mountain, and sheweth him all the kingdoms of the world, and the glory of them; and saith unto him, All these things will I give thee, if thou wilt fall down and worship me" (Matt. 4:8, 9). But Christ was unmoved. He felt the strength of this temptation; but He met it in our behalf, and conquered. And He used only the weapons justifiable for human beings to use—the word of Him who is mighty in counsel—"It is written" (Matt. 4:4, 10).

With what intense interest was this controversy watched by the heavenly angels and the unfallen worlds, as the honor of the law was being vindicated. Not merely for this world, but for the universe of heaven, was the controversy to be forever settled. The confederacy of darkness was also watching for the semblance of a chance to triumph over the divine and human Substitute of the human race, that the apostate might shout, "Victory," and the world and its inhabitants forever become his kingdom.

But Satan reached only the heel; he could not touch the head. At the death of Christ, Satan saw that he was defeated. He saw that his true character was clearly revealed before all heaven, and that the heavenly beings and the worlds that God had created would be wholly on the side of God. He saw that his prospects of future influence with them would be entirely cut off. Christ's humanity would demonstrate for eternal ages the question which settled the controversy.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. II, pages 61-68

Following is the SP material which was the primary ground for chapter 14 of DA, since both have basically the same content and many sentences were taken over verbatim from the earlier work. However, perhaps the reader has already noted from page 252 of this research manuscript that the DA chapter 14 is enlarged in number of sentences over the SP account by at least double.

"The Mission of Christ"

⁵²After this, Jesus withdrew into the wilderness, to be tempted of the devil forty days. ⁵³His long fast ended, the victory won, he returns to the banks of the Jordan, mingling again with the disciples of John, yet giving no outward evidence of his special work, and taking no measure to bring himself to notice.

⁵⁴Men were sent from the highest authority in Jerusalem to inquire in regard to the great agitation John was creating. ⁵⁵He was calling whole cities and towns to listen to his voice of warning; and they would know the prophet's authority for thus claiming the attention of the people, and turning the world upside down. ⁵⁶These messengers challenged John to tell them certainly if he was the Messiah. ⁵⁷John confessed, I am not the Christ. ⁵⁸And they asked him, What then? ⁵⁹Art thou Elias? ⁶⁰And he saith, I am not. ⁶¹Art thou that prophet? ⁶²And he answered, No. ⁶³Then said they unto him, Who art thou? that we may give an answer to them that sent us. ⁶⁴What sayest thou of thyself? ⁶⁵He said, I am the voice of one crying in the wilderness. ⁶⁶Make straight the way of the Lord, as said the prophet Esaias. ⁶⁷John is then questioned as to his authority for baptizing, and thus agitating the people, when he does not claim to be Christ, or Elias, neither that prophet. ⁶⁸The words, "That prophet," has reference to Moses. ⁶⁹The Jews

2SP Chapter IV

had been inclined to the belief that Moses would be raised from the dead, and taken to heaven. ⁷⁰They did not know that Moses had already been resurrected.

⁷¹When John came, baptizing with water, the Jews thought that he might be the prophet Moses risen from the dead; for he seemed to have a thorough knowledge of the prophecies, and to understand the history of the Hebrews and their wanderings in the wilderness in consequence of their unjust murmurings and continual rebellion. ⁷²They also called to mind the peculiar circumstances of John's birth, and wonderful manifestation of God to Zacharias, his father, in the temple, by the visitation of the angel from the presence of God, and the power of speech, being taken from zacharias, because he did not believe the words of the angel, and the unloosing of his tongue at the birth of John. ⁷³These important facts had in the past thirty years been measurably forgotten. ⁷⁴But when John appeared as a prophet, the manifestation of the Spirit of God at his birth was called to mind.

⁷⁵When the messengers from the highest authority in Jerusalem were communing with John in reference to his mission and work, he could have taken honor to himself, had he been so disposed. ⁷⁶But he would not assume honors that did not belong to him. ⁷⁷While conversing with the messengers, suddenly his eye kindled, his countenance lighted up, and his whole being seemed stirred with deep emotion, as he discovered the person of Jesus in the

2SP Chapter IV

concourse of people. ⁷⁸He raised his hand, pointing to Christ, saying, There standeth One among you whom ye know not. ⁷⁹I have come to prepare the way before him whom ye now see. ⁸⁰He is the Messiah. ⁸¹He it is who coming after me is preferred before me, whose shoe's latchet I am not worthy to unloose.

⁸²"The next day John seeth Jesus coming unto him, and saith, Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world! ⁸³This is he of whom I said, After me cometh a man which is preferred before me; for he was before me. ⁸⁴And I knew him not; but that he should be made manifest to Israel, therefore am I come baptizing with water. ⁸⁵And John bare record, saying, I saw the Spirit descending from Heaven like a dove, and it abode upon him. ⁸⁶And I knew him not. ⁸⁷But he that sent me to baptize with water, the same said unto me, Upon whom thou shalt see the Spirit descending, and remaining on him, the same is he which baptizeth with the Holy Ghost. ⁸⁸And I saw and bare record, that this is the Son of God. ⁸⁹Again, the next day after, John stood, and two of his disciples; and looking upon Jesus as he walked, he saith, Behold the Lamb of God!" ⁹⁰And the two disciples heard him speak, and they followed Jesus. ⁹¹Then Jesus turned and saw them following, and saith unto them, What seek ye? ⁹²The disciples confessed that they were seeking Christ, and that they desired to become acquainted with him, and to be instructed by him at his home. ⁹³These two disciples were charmed with the deeply

2SP Chapter IV

impressive, yet simple and practical, lessons of Christ. ⁹⁴Their hearts had never been so moved before. ⁹⁵Andrew, Simon Peter's brother, was one of these disciples. ⁹⁶He was interested for his friends and relatives, and was anxious that they also should see Christ, and hear for themselves his precious lessons. ⁹⁷Andrew went in search of his brother Simon, and with assurance claimed to have found Christ, the Messiah, the Saviour of the world. ⁹⁸He brought his brother to Jesus, and as soon as Jesus looked upon him, he said, Thou art Simon, the son of Jona; thou shalt be called Cephas, which is by interpretation a stone. ⁹⁹The next day Christ selected another disciple, Philip, and bade him follow him. ¹⁰⁰Philip fully believed that Christ was the Messiah, and began to search for others to bring them to listen to the teachings of Christ, which had so charmed him. ¹⁰¹Then Philip found Nathanael. ¹⁰²He was one of the number who heard John proclaim, "Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world." ¹⁰³He felt deeply convicted, and retired to a grove, concealed from every human eye, and there meditated upon the announcement of John, calling to his mind the prophecies relating to the coming of the Messiah and his mission. ¹⁰⁴He queried thus: Could this indeed be the Messiah for whom they had so long waited, and were so desirous to see? ¹⁰⁵Hope sprang up in the heart of Nathanael that this might be the one that would save Israel. ¹⁰⁶He bowed before God and prayed that if the person whom John had declared to be the Redeemer of the

2SP Chapter IV

world was indeed the promised deliverer, that it might be made known to him. ¹⁰⁷The Spirit of the Lord rested upon Nathanael in such a special manner that he was convinced that Christ was the Messiah. ¹⁰⁸While Nathanael was praying, he heard the voice of Philip calling him, saying, "We have found him, of whom Moses in the law, and the prophets did write, Jesus of Nazareth, the son of Joseph. ¹⁰⁹And Nathanael said unto him, Can there any good thing come out of Nazareth? ¹¹⁰Philip saith unto him, Come and see. ¹¹¹Jesus saw Nathanael coming to him, and saith of him, Behold an Israelite indeed, in whom is no guile! ¹¹²Nathanael saith unto him, Whence knowest thou me? ¹¹³Jesus answered and said unto him, Before that Philip called thee, when thou wast under the fig tree, I saw thee."

¹¹⁴Nathanael's wavering faith was now strengthened, and he answered and said, "Rabbi, thou art the son of God; thou art the King of Israel. ¹¹⁵Jesus answered and said unto him, Becausee I said unto thee, I saw thee under the fig tree, believest thou? ¹¹⁶Thou shalt see greater things than these. ¹¹⁷And he saith unto him, Verily, verily, I say unto you, Hereafter ye shall see Heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of Man."

¹¹⁸In these first few disciples the foundation of the Christian church was being laid by individual effort. ¹¹⁹John first directed two of his disciples to Christ. ¹²⁰Then one of these finds a brother, and brings him to Christ. ¹²¹He then calls Philip to follow him, and he went

2SP Chapter IV

in search of Nathanael. ¹²²Here is an instructive lesson for all the followers of Christ. ¹²³It teaches them the importance of personal effort, making direct appeals to relatives, friends, and acquaintances. ¹²⁴There are those who profess to be acquainted with Christ for a life time who never make personal effort to induce one soul to come to the Saviour. ¹²⁵They have left all the work with the minister. ¹²⁶He may be well qualified for his work; but he cannot do the work which God has left upon the members of the church. ¹²⁷Very many excuse themselves from being interested in the salvation of those who are out of Christ, and are content to selfishly enjoy the benefits of the grace of God themselves, while they make no direct effort to bring others to Christ. ¹²⁸In the vineyard of the Lord there is a work for all to do, and unselfish, interested, faithful workers will share largely of his grace here, and of the reward he will bestow hereafter. ¹²⁹Faith is called into exercise by good works, and courage and hope are in accordance with working faith. ¹³⁰The reason many professed followers of Christ have not a bright and living experience, is because they do nothing to gain it. ¹³¹If they would engage in the work which God would have them do, their faith would increase, and they would advance in the divine life.

¹³²Jesus was pleased with the earnest faith of Nathanael that asked for no greater evidence than the few words he had spoken. ¹³³And he looked forward with pleasure to the work he was to do in relieving the oppressed, healing

the sick, and in breaking the bands of Satan. ¹³⁴In view of these blessings which Christ came to bestow, he says to Nathanael, in the presence of the other disciples, "Hereafter ye shall see heaven opened, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of Man."

¹³⁵Christ virtually says, On the bank of Jordan the heavens were opened before me, and the Spirit descended like a dove upon me. ¹³⁶That scene at Jordan was but a token to evidence that I was the Son of God. ¹³⁷If you believe in me as such, your faith shall be quickened, and you shall see that the heavens will be opened, and shall never be closed. ¹³⁸I have opened them for you, and the angels of God, that are united with me in the reconciliation between earth and Heaven, uniting the believers on the earth with the Father above, will be ascending, bearing the prayers of the needy and distressed from the earth to the Father above, and descending, bringing blessings of hope, courage, health, and life, for the children of men.

¹³⁹The angels of God are ever moving up and down from earth to Heaven, and from Heaven to earth. ¹⁴⁰All the miracles of Christ performed for the afflicted and suffering were, by the power of God, through the ministration of angels. ¹⁴¹Christ condescended to take humanity, and thus he unites his interests with the fallen sons and daughters of Adam here below, while his divinity grasps the throne of God. ¹⁴²And thus Christ opens the communication of man with God, and God with man. ¹⁴³All the blessings from God to man are through the ministration of holy angels.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Manuscript 13, 1884 (Abridgment)

In the next few pages we present an abridgment of MS 13, 1884, namely 82 sentences out of the 304 total. The abridgment contains the portion of the manuscript most heavily influenced by Melvill. As we should note from page 254 of this research work, the MS 13 material does not appear in the DA but is related to the ladder concept discussed near the end of DA chapter 14, as the opening paragraph of MS 13 will confirm.

Of interest in the pages to follow are the editorial changes made by Martha Montgomery Odom, in the year 1959, as she produced the only typescript copy available from the White Estate. These changes will be commented upon in the footnotes.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 14

MS 13 - 1884

(A typescript from Ellen White's handwritten manuscript.)¹

Here is made a revelation of Jesus Christ as the only connecting link between God and sinful man, that the repenting sinner may find pardon. Christ said words to Nathanael which had reference to this mystic ladder: "Verily, verily, I say unto you, hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man."²

Here Christ associates Himself, as the Son of man, with the mystic ladder. The angels of God are ascending and descending on the one even as they did on the other. A constant correspondence is by means of this ladder kept up between heaven and earth,³ and the actions and affairs of this earth are all known in heaven. The counsels of heaven are executed on earth and the doings of men are judged in heaven.

Providence does its work gradually. The ladder that man must climb are successive steps heavenward like the rounds of a ladder, step above step upward to the wisdom of God whose glory is at the upper end of the ladder.⁴ Angels

¹Our typescript has corrected the MS only with respect to capitalization, punctuation and spelling. In further footnotes we will indicate editorial changes made by Martha Montgomery Odom on April 8, 1959 in the copy for the White Estate. Underlining indicates words/phrases changed.

²To this second sentence is added the scripture reference, "John 1:51."

³Sentence rearranged; "correspondence" changed to "communication."

⁴The word "are" changed to "is made up of."

rest not day nor night from active service in the positions assigned them. They ascend to bear their testimony of record of what they have done, of the state of individuals, and receive further orders; and, descend to execute the orders they have received.¹

The mediation of Christ, He is the ladder,--the foot on the earth in His human nature, the top in heaven in His divine nature.² His human arm encircles the race while His divine arm lays hold upon the Infinite. All the intercourse between heaven and earth, since the fall, is by the Ladder.

. . . To lure us away from all this is the precious ladder.³ The eye is attracted to God above the ladder. The invitation comes from glory above it, Come up higher. The heart is attracted. The steps, taken in advance one after another.⁴ Higher and still higher is the ascent.⁵ At every step the attraction becomes greater. Higher, holier ambitions take possession of the soul. The guilt of the past life is left behind. They dare not look down the ladder at those, which long poisoned the springs of true happiness and kindled remorse, weakened and depraved the will, and repressed every better impulse.⁶ The eye,⁷ steadfastly fixed, with grateful, trembling emotion, upon God above the ladder. Christ is the ladder. By laying

¹Small words added: "and," "to," "they."

²"The mediation of Christ, He" to "Christ."

³"lure" to "draw."

⁴"The steps" to "Steps are."

⁵"is the ascent" to "we ascend."

⁶"They" to "We"; "things" added after "those."

⁷"is" added.

hold¹ on Christ, climbing up by Christ, resolving to return to the Father above the ladder, broken, contrite, subdued.² The offers of God's mercy, of living connection with God, of grace multiplied as they step by step make the distance more apparent from earth.³

The aim of God's Word is to inspire hope, to fasten the hands to the ladder and climb step by step heavenward with ever-advancing vigor and in godliness is the increase of spiritual life.⁴ It is the key to the senses in which we partake of the nature of God. . . .

Let us consider this ladder which was presented to Jacob. The human race was cut off from intercourse with God. They may look at a paradise lost but, no means of entering it and holding communion with heaven.⁵ The sin of Adam cut off all intercourse between heaven and earth. Up to the moment of man's transgression of God's law there had been free communion between earth and heaven. (?) seemed connected by a path which Deity loved to traverse.⁶ But transgression of God's law broke up this path and man separated from God.⁷

As soon as Satan seduced man to disobedience of God's

¹"By laying hold" to "We lay hold."

²"broken, contrite, subdued" placed earlier in the sentence.

³"they step by step" to "we advance step by step"; "more apparent" to the end of the sentence.

⁴"to lead us" added before "to fasten"; "advancing" to "increasing"; "in godliness is . . ." dropped.

⁵"may" to "might"; "could see" added after "but."

⁶"(?) seemed" to "They were"; "loved to" to "could."
 (?) indicates a problem word.

⁷"was" added after "man."

holy law, every link seemed broken which bound earth to heaven and finite man to the infinite God.¹ Man might look to heaven, but how to attain?² But joy to the world! The Son of God, the sinless³, the One perfect in obedience, becomes the channel through which the lost communion may be renewed, the way through which the lost paradise may be regained. Through Christ, man's substitute and surety, man may keep the commandments of God. He may return to his allegiance and God will accept him.

Christ is that ladder.⁴ "By me if any man enter in, he shall be saved, and shall go in and out and find pasture."⁵

This is the ladder, the base of it resting upon the earth, the top reaching to the highest heavens. The broken links have been repaired. A highway has been thrown up along which the weary and heavy-laden may pass. They may enter heaven and find rest.

The ladder is the medium of communication between God and man. Through the mystic ladder was the gospel preached to Jacob.⁶ As the ladder stretched from earth, reaching to the highest heavens, and the glory of God, above the ladder, Christ in His divine nature reached immensity and was one with the Father.⁷ As the ladder, though its top penetrated

1 "seemed broken" to end of sentence; "finite" dropped.

2 "how to attain" to "could he attain it."

3 "One" added after "sinless."

4 "that" to "the."

5 Scripture reference added, "John 10:9."

6 "was" placed after "gospel."

7 "was seen" added after "glory of God"; "so" added

into heaven, its base was upon the earth,¹ so Christ, though God, clothed His divinity with humanity and was in the world "found in fashion as a man." The ladder would be of no useless² if it rested not on the earth or if it reached not to the heavens.

God appeared in glory above the ladder, looking down with compassion on erring, sinful Jacob, addressing to Him words of encouragement. It is through Christ that the Father beholds sinful man. The ministering angels were communicating to the inhabitants of the earth through the medium of the ladder. The only way that man can be saved is by clinging to Christ.

We ascend to heaven by climbing the ladder, step by step, the whole height of Christ's work.³ There must be a holding fast to Christ, a climbing up by the merits of Christ. To let go is to cease to climb, is to fall, to perish. We are to mount by the Mediator and all the while to keep hold on the Mediator, ascending by successive steps, round above round, stretching the hand from one above the other.⁴ In the work of redemption they have a knowledge of Jesus Christ by planting the feet on one round after another in perfect obedience to all the commandments of God.⁵ This is a necessity for each individual, striving and making

before "Christ in His. . ."

¹"was" deleted; "had" added before "its base."

²"of no" dropped.

³Long phrase placed after "ladder."

⁴"above the other" changed to "to the next above."

⁵"they" changed to "we may."

progress at every step. It is simply impossible to enter heaven without constant striving. There is fearful peril in relaxing our efforts in spiritual diligence for a moment, for we are hanging, as it were, between heaven and earth.

We must keep the eye directed upward to God above the ladder. There is the question with men and women gazing heavenward, Can I obtain the mansions for the blessed?¹ It is by being partakers of the divine nature. It is by escaping the pollutions in the world through lust.² It is by entering into the holiest by the blood of Jesus, laying hold of the hope set before me in the gospel.³ It is by fastening yourself to Christ and straining every nerve to leave the world behind, laboring to diminish by successive steps your distance from God, who is at the top of the ladder. In Christ and yet led by Christ, by believing and working, trusting in Jesus, yet working upon the plan of addition, holding on Christ and constantly mounting to a greater nearness to God supported by the Surety and yet (?) upward toward God.⁴

When the successive steps have, been reached,⁵ when the graces have been added one after another, the crowning grace is the perfect love of God--supreme love to God and love to our fellow men. And then the abundant entrance into the kingdom of God.

¹"There is" dropped; "How" placed before "Can."

²"pollutions in" to "corruption that is in."

³"me" to "you."

⁴"It is by being" added at beginning of sentence; long underlined phrase deleted; (?) indicates problem word.

We point you to the mansions Christ is preparing for all those who love Him. We point you to that city that hath foundations, whose builder and maker is God. We show you its massive walls, with the twelve foundations of the city of God,¹ and tell you that these walls must be scaled. You look discouraged at the magnitude of the work before you. How can we surmount walls that?² We point you to the ladder set up on earth, reaching to the city of God. Plant your feet on the ladder. Forsake your sins. Climb step by step and you will reach God above the ladder, the Holy City of God.³ For none who will resolutely mount up on the ladder will fail of everlasting life: "For so an entrance shall be ministered unto you . . . in the everlasting kingdom of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ."⁴

⁵"all" added at first comma; "reached" to "mounted."

¹"of the city of God" dropped.

²Whole clause deleted.

³"and" added before "the Holy City of God."

⁴"For" dropped; "abundantly into" added at elipsis.

N.B. The major portion of this manuscript "as grammatically corrected" by Martha Montgomery Odom, appears in Our High Calling, pages 66-75. The reader may also wish to refer again to the chapter 14 analysis, pages 247-251.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Manuscript 13, 1884

So that the reader might appreciate the abridged portion as an integral component of the broader context we now present MS 13 in total, both the handwritten form from the pen of Ellen White and our typescript of it, which are set up in page-to-page correspondence. The handwritten manuscript was rather poor copy on legal length paper. Thus further copying as well as reduction do not provide very clear text. The reader will please bear this in mind. However, it will be of benefit to be able to gain a better appreciation of Ellen White as a writer, to see her flow of thought and theme throughout the whole of the manuscript, right in its original form.

For further insights on MS 13, 1884, please refer to pages 247-251 of this research work.

Sept 14/84

Nov. 1884

MS-13-1884

There is a connection of Jesus Christ as living
connecting with nature & God and subject matter. Jesus Christ
after repenting sinners may find pardon (Christ's soul
is a human one which had reference to this & the ladder
merely merely I say into 3 in love after he placed in heaven
then, and the angels & God God ascending and descending
upon the "Gong" (man) where Christ associates himself
as the "Gong" (man) with the "Gong" (ladder) the courses
of God are ascending and descending on the one even with
God on the other. A constant correspondence is in means
the ladder takes up between heaven and earth and the
actions and affairs of the earth are all in heaven
the counsel of heaven are executed on earth and the
things of heaven are judged in heaven (evidence does its
work gradually the ladder itself is a man must climb
are successive steps heavenward like the rungs of a ladder
step above step upward to God the goodness of God (Christ's)
is at the upper end of the ladder and the soul of man
morning from action service in the first place and
then (2) ascend to hear the testimony of second of what
they have done of the state of mind which and receive faith
orders and descend to execute the order they have received
(the mediation of Christ is the ladder the first on the
earth in his human nature the top in heaven in his
divine nature his human arm encircles the earth while
his divine arm lays hold upon the infinite. After
intercourse between heaven and earth, since the fall
is of the ladder.

¹Here is made a revelation of Jesus Christ as the only connecting link between God and sinful man, that the repenting sinner may find pardon. ²Christ said words to Nathanael which had reference to this mystic ladder: "Verily, verily, I say unto you, hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man."

³Here Christ associates Himself, as the Son of man, with the mystic ladder. ⁴The angels of God are ascending and descending on the one even as they did on the other. ⁵A constant correspondence is by means of this ladder kept up between heaven and earth, and the actions and affairs of this earth are all known in heaven. ⁶The counsels of heaven are executed on earth and the doings of men are judged in heaven.

⁷Providence does its work gradually. ⁸The ladder that man must climb are [sic] successive steps heavenward like the rounds of a ladder, step above step upward to the wisdom of God whose glory is at the upper end of the ladder. ⁹Angels rest not day nor night from active service in the positions assigned them. ¹⁰They ascend to bear their testimony of record of what they have done, of the state of individuals, and receive further orders; and, descend to execute the orders they have received.

¹¹The mediation of Christ, He is the ladder,--the foot on the earth in His human nature, the top in heaven in His divine nature. ¹²His human arm encircles the race while His divine arm lays hold upon the Infinite. ¹³All the intercourse between heaven and earth, since the fall, is by the Ladder.

Simon Peter, a servant and apostle of Jesus Christ
to them that have obtained the precious faith by the precious
blood of Jesus Christ, through the righteousness of God
and our gracious Jesus Christ, this is a genuine faith it is
not a spiritual faith, but saving is a precious treasure
of inestimable value it is not superficial but just trust
faith a truly sincere belief like life it is strongly felt
that the steps are taken one at a time and the end of the
faith must be cultivated, it unites the human with the divine
origin. Our life of obedience to all of God's commandments
is a life of progression and constant advancement, grace
and peace are multiplied through the knowledge of God and
Jesus our Lord, do not the elect precious love increased is
understanding of the Father, Son and Holy Spirit, they are
and grasp the rich promises that come through the righteousness
of Christ, the more they receive of the divine grace the more they
crave the more a desire for the perfect is true and peace
and be multiplied through the knowledge of God and Jesus
our Lord, there is the source of all spiritual power
and faith, must be in constant exercise, for all divine
life is from Christ Jesus and the knowledge of God and Jesus
the the only channel to the Father, Son and Holy Spirit
elevates nobles using the soul as it is through the knowledge
of God brought up the high attempts of glory and virtue
according as his divine power is in us all
things that mortals with hope and confidence through
the knowledge of our Father called us to glory and to
eternal life in Christ Jesus our Lord. There the Christian is encouraged
to by an assurance of divine truth, if they will comply with
the conditions to.

¹⁵"Simon Peter, a servant and an apostle of Jesus Christ, to them that have obtained like precious faith." 2 Peter 1:1-4. ¹⁶"Like precious faith" "through the righteousness of God and our Saviour Jesus Christ." ¹⁷This is a genuine faith. ¹⁸It is not a fruitless faith. ¹⁹True, saving faith is a precious treasure of inestimable value. ²⁰It is not superficial. ²¹The just lives by faith a truly spiritual, Christlike life. ²²It is through faith that the steps are taken one at a time up the ladder of progress. ²³Faith must be cultivated. ²⁴It unites the human with the divine nature.

²⁵The life of obedience to all of God's commandments is a life of progression, a life of constant advancement. ^{25b}Grace and peace are multiplied through the knowledge of God and Jesus our Lord. ²⁶As the elect, precious, have increased understanding of the mediatorial work of Jesus Christ, they see and grasp the rich promises that come through the righteousness of Christ. ²⁷The more they receive of the divine grace the more they work on the plan of addition.

²⁸"Grace and peace" will be multiplied "through the knowledge of God and of Jesus our Lord." ²⁹Here is the Source of all spiritual power, and faith must be in constant exercise, for all spiritual life is from Christ. ³⁰Knowledge of God inspires faith in Him as the only channel to convey heavens [sic] blessing to the soul, elevating, ennobling, refining the soul, as it is through the knowledge of God brought up [to] the high attainments of glory and virtue. ³¹"According as his divine power hath given unto us all things that pertain unto life and godliness, through the knowledge of him that hath called us to glory and virtue" (verse 4 insert). ³²Here the Christian is encouraged by an assurance of divine help, if they [sic] will comply with the conditions.

And inside this going all diligence add to your
faith with me, there is no special given of the one who is
the apostle is in his testimony before him to execute the will
to advancement in grace and in wisdom by already perfect in
in the truth they have a knowledge of the previous faith
make foundation of the doctrine of truth - and then if they were
they will rise the more they are received by more of perfect
the apostles prayed that grace and peace might be multiplied
to them as are in a mind the riches of progressive wisdom
giving all diligence to persevere after death in order to
above the ladder there is no any ground in peace and
grace and the body of wisdom, strong and Jesus that a day
enter into the strong gate of truth, etc, etc, etc, the
wisdom is marked out by God as the ladder, his
endeavors will be in vain if he was not. it is of
character a practical knowledge of Christ through his
to all his requirements, Oh, how love faith must be careful
to know the faith by the words it is that is the way
spirit of Christ. It is common for men and women to speak
themselves as Christians whose lives are a mirror with
professing, assuming the name without reveal that they
are partakers of the divine nature by do not reveal one
for Jesus or for religious things before the words and the
spirit and the character is concerned no one would
suspect they were Christians who assent to the truth
has one, while this is truth for nothing in the sight of God
One faith works by love and gives the soul truth and
action, virtues, services, etc. more and more and more
so that there is a constant upward movement
Peter and the ladder Jacob - down to the Lord above the
ladder and step of climbing the hill is always a

³³"And beside this, giving all diligence, add to your faith virtue." ³⁴There is no promise given to the one who is retrograding. ³⁵The apostle, in his testimony, is aiming to excite the believers to advancement in grace and holiness. ³⁶They already profess to be living the truth, they have a knowledge of the precious faith, they have been made partakers of the divine nature. ³⁷But if they stop here they will lose the grace they have received. ³⁸They must go forward. ³⁹The apostle prayed that grace and peace might be multiplied to them. ⁴⁰They were to climb the ladder of progression.

⁴¹Without giving "all diligence" to make step after step upward to God above the ladder, there is no gaining ground in peace and grace and the work of holiness. ⁴²"Strive," said Jesus, "to enter in at the strait gate." [Luke 13:24] ⁴³The way of the believer is marked out by God above the ladder. ⁴⁴All his endeavors will be in vain if he has not virtue of character, a practical knowledge of Christ through obedience to all His requirements. ⁴⁵Those who have faith must be careful to show their faith by their works.

⁴⁶It is common for men and women to speak of themselves as Christians whose whole claim lies in the assuming of the name. ⁴⁷They do not reveal that they are partakers of the divine nature. ⁴⁸They do not reveal love for Jesus or for religious things. ⁴⁹As far as their words and their spirit and their character are concerned no one would suspect they were Christians. ⁵⁰Their ascent to the truth has no virtue. ⁵¹This counts for nothing in the sight of God.

⁵²True faith works by love and purifies the soul. ⁵³Truth is an active, working principle, molding heart and life so that there is a constant upward movement, climbing the ladder Jacob saw to the Lord above the ladder. ⁵⁴In every step of climbing, the will is obtaining a

[illegible]

new spring of action. ⁵⁵The moral tone of the man and woman is becoming more like the mind and character [sic] of Christ. ⁵⁶The progressive Christian has grace and love which passes [sic] knowledge, for the divine insight into the mind and character [sic] of Christ takes a deep hold upon our [his] affections. ⁵⁷The glory of God revealed above the ladder can only be appreciated by the progressive climber, [who is] ever attracted higher, to nobler aims which Christ reveals. ⁵⁸All the faculties of mind and body must be enlisted.

⁵⁹"Add to your faith virtue; and to virtue knowledge"--knowledge of the truth as it is in Jesus, knowledge of the great plan of salvation. ⁶⁰To be ignorant of God's commandments and laws will not excuse a soul. ⁶¹He will not dare to plead around the throne of God "I did not know the truth. ⁶²I was ignorant." ⁶³The Lord has given His Word to be our guide, our instructor, and with this heavenly enlightening there is no excuse for ignorance. ⁶⁴Christ speaks of those who have eyes but see not, ears but they hear not. ⁶⁵God has given them precious hours of probation. ⁶⁶He has given them His truth. ⁶⁷He has said plainly if they do his will they shall know of the doctrine. ⁶⁸Therefore those that might be wise in the knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ but do not choose this wisdom will be banished from his presence when the judgment shall sit and the books be opened.

⁶⁹To knowledge must be added temperance. ⁷⁰"Know ye not that they which run in a race run all, but one receiveth the prize? ⁷¹So run, that ye may obtain. ⁷²And every man that striveth for the mastery is temperate in all things.

[illegible]

⁷³Now they do it to obtain a corruptible crown; but we are incorruptible. ⁷⁴I therefore so run, not as uncertainly; so fighting ["fight I"], not as one that beateth the air: but I keep under my body, and bring it into subjection; lest that by any means when I have preached to others, I myself should be a castaway." [1 Cor. 9:24-27]

⁷⁵They that run in a race to obtain a corruptible crown are careful in their diet. ⁷⁶"Every man that striveth for the mastery is temperate in all things." ⁷⁷The strict, severe habits of discipline are essential to give a full, healthful tone to all the nerves and muscles.

⁷⁸They [athletes] cheerfully comply with the conditions to be trained for the highest taxation of their physical strength. ⁷⁹They do not indulge appetite, but put a constant restraint upon themselves, [refraining] from food which would weaken or lessen the full power of any of their organs. ⁸⁰Yet they fight "as one that beateth the air," while Christians are in a real contest. ⁸¹Should not Christians do as much as the combatants in the games for a mere perishable laurel? ⁸²The Christians have before them a glorious crown of immortality, incorruptible. ⁸³And in this heavenly race there is plenty of room for all to obtain the prize. ⁸⁴Not one will fail if he runs well, if he does according to the light which shines upon him, according to the exercise of his abilities which he has to the best of his knowledge, [been] keeping in a healthful condition.

⁸⁵The combatants in the games used a spare, coarse diet, and denied themselves of luxuries to be able to keep their muscles in a healthful condition. ⁸⁶Paul says he was doing the same that he might win eternal life. ⁸⁷The apostle

[illegible]

mentions that the body must be kept under; while the enemies train the physical powers fighting as one that beateth the air Christs [sic] are in real combat. ⁸⁸The body Paul mentions to be kept under is the fleshly appetites and inclinations which need to be continually curbed. ⁸⁹Any habit or practice which will weaken the nerve [and] brain power or the physical strength disqualifies for the exercise of the next grace which comes in after temperance. [Crossed out: It is impossible for one who uses stimulating drinks to be a patient . . .] ⁹⁰Add "to temperance patience."

⁹¹It was through intemperate appetite [that] Adam and Eve lost Eden and it will be through habits of strict temperance and denial of hurtful indulgences that we shall have calm nerves and mental acuteness to discern good from evil. ⁹²An intemperate man who uses stimulating indulgences--beer, wine, strong drinks, tea and coffee, opium, tobacco, or any of these substances that are deleterious to health--that can[not] be a patient man. ⁹³So temperance is a round of the ladder that we must plant our feet upon before we can add the grace of patience. ⁹⁴In food, in raiment, in work, in regular hours, in healthful exercise--we must be regulated by the knowledge which it is our duty to obtain that we may place ourselves in right relation to life and health, through earnest endeavor which we can make.

⁹⁵The apostle says we

9

Incorrecting the great importance of the
patience, patient endurance. It is not
in days and nights, but it is not
in one hour and a minute to be made into, with
Set your trials be what they will, patiently and seriously
suffering if you can, exercise patience a calm
and unexcited when under trying positions & solemn
places the control of ones' self above the exploits of the
bravest and most successful heroes, this is a moral practice
in being patient under trials and provocations.
"He that is slow to anger is better than the mighty,
and he that subdueth his own spirit than he that taketh
a city." It requires discipline and in many places
that will not give us freedom to our passion and that
will present at all times the same thing, that we should
never escape the lips that will discipline the character
character, self control will be the valuable acquisition
to the grace of the spirit and Parents should learn
the children by precept and example this divine
lesson of patience and self control patience implies
that we have difficulties to encounter and
to meet. Obedience to God. A soft anger and no wrath
any wrath but grievous words that will strike and
burst in the heart to be angry for anger sceth in the
cream of fools, but in junction of the inspired apostle
is he swift to hear slow to speak, slow to wrath, anger
provokes anger, we can see the wisdom of Peter in placing
temper to be added to knowledge before patience

succeed in the grace of temperance that we may add patience.

⁹⁶Patience under trials will keep us from saying and doing those things which will injure our own souls and injure those we associate with.

⁹⁷Let your trials be what they will, nothing can seriously injure you if you exercise patience, a calm and unexcited [sic] when under trying positions.

⁹⁸Solomon places the control of ones' [sic] self above the exploits of the bravest and most successful heroes. ⁹⁹There is a moral grandeur in being patient under trials and provocations. ¹⁰⁰"He that is slow to anger is better than the mighty; and he that ruleth his spirit than he that taketh a city." [Prov. 16:32] ¹⁰¹It requires discipline and firmness of purpose that will not give expression to passion and that will preserve at all times the care taking that no words shall escape the lips that will dishonor the Christian character [sic]. ¹⁰²Self-control will be the valuable acquisition to the graces of the Spirit, and parents should teach their children, by precept and example, this [-?-] lesson of patience and self control.

¹⁰³Patience implies that we have difficulties to encounter, annoyances to meet. ¹⁰⁴The Word of God [says], "A soft answer turneth away wrath: but grievous words stir up strife ["anger"]." [Prov. 15:1]

¹⁰⁵"Be not hasty in thy spirit to be angry: for anger resteth in the bosom of fools." [Eccl. 7:9] ¹⁰⁶The injunction of the inspired

apostle is to "be swift to hear, slow to speak, slow to wrath." [James 1:19] ¹⁰⁷Anger provokes anger.

¹⁰⁸We can see the wisdom of Peter in placing temperance to be added to knowledge before patience.

and is one strong reason for increasing the discipline
for all students for as the nervous system reacts under
the influence of these irritative substances in many
and various ways, it is that we are alone, but the result of
use of the stimulating activities of food will not be
the nerves and by irritating the mechanism and
some power, this is the necessity of the discipline
and the patient to temperance. You will need to be
your principles are fixed now, purpose to not offend in respect
to which culture and conscience, the feeling of
this, then must be a rising above the customs of the world
in order to wear a patch of disappointment and
without one. Therefore, with more planning, the
the same and it is easier to act the part of a martyr
than to be patient under provocation and culture
and temper. Some religious principles must be
wrought into the life to express anger better than in
peace it is going to do it. But the better than
Jesus is our example. He taught us anger and
if we control that anger and avoid the expression
of expressions of nasty feelings we will not respect
of our brethren or respect for ourselves. Anger, patience
is a necessary attribute and a virtue. Must cultivate
it. We must not ever look upon us that we are right
the way but the justified one. We are a large body
and create that one which we alone of our selves
to suspect. Our feelings will be done times daily

¹⁰⁹This is one strong reason for overcoming the appetite for all stimulants, for as the nerves become excited under the influence of these irritating substances, how many and grievous are the evils that are done! ¹¹⁰But the healthful use of the unstimulating articles of food will not excite the nerves by irritating the stomach and [debilitating] brain nerve power. ¹¹¹There is the necessity of the Christian adding patience to temperance. ¹¹²There will need to be the firm principle, the fixedness of purpose to not offend in word or action either our own conscience or the feelings of others. ¹¹³There must be a rising above the customs of the world in order to bear reproach, disappointment, losses and crosses without one murmur, but with uncomplaining dignity.

¹¹⁴It is easier to act the part of a martyr than to be patient under provocation and control a bad temper. ¹¹⁵Sound religious principles must be brought into the life to repress anger rather than inflame it by giving vent to it. ¹¹⁶But the pattern, Christ Jesus, is our example. ¹¹⁷We may feel very angry, but if we control that anger and are not betrayed into expressions of hasty feelings we will not lose the respect of our brethren or respect for ourselves. ¹¹⁸Patience is a heavenly attribute and Christians must cultivate it.

¹¹⁹We must not ever keep before us [the feeling] that we are slighted. ¹²⁰The very fact [that] we suspect evil will go a long way toward creating that evil which we allowed ourselves to suspect. ¹²¹Our feelings will be sometimes deeply

[illegible]

hurt, our temper sadly tried, but the sooner we shall forget the cause of this disturbance the better will it be for us and all connected with us.

¹²²A lying tongue will stir us to make some sharp thrusts, but it is only for a moment that to lie will have force. ¹²³If we treat these falsehoods as they deserve--with neglect--other persons will soon see there is no foundation for them. ¹²⁴We are to leave [our] reputation with God. ¹²⁵Slander may be lived down but can never be talked down.

¹²⁶A petulant, ill-natured man or woman really knows not what it is to be happy. ¹²⁷Every cup which he puts to his lips seems to be bitter as wormwood and his path seems strewn with rough stones, with briars and thorns; but he must add to temperance patience and he will not see or feel slights. ¹²⁸Alexander and Ceasar found it easier to subdue a world than to subdue themselves. ¹²⁹After conquering nation after nation, they fell--one of them the victim to beastly intemperance, the other to mad ambition.

¹³⁰Patience must have its perfect work or we cannot be perfect and entire, wanting nothing. ¹³¹Troubles and afflictions are appointed unto us, and shall we bear them all patiently or shall we make everything bitter by our complaining? ¹³²The gold is put into the furnace that the dross may be removed. ¹³³Shall we, then, not be patient under the eye of the refiner? ¹³⁴We must refuse to sink into a sad and disconsolate state of mind, but show calm trust in God, counting it all joy when we are permitted to endure trials for Christ [sic] sake.

[illegible]

¹³⁵Having added patience to temperance, we are then to ascend the ladder of progress and add to patience godliness. ¹³⁶This is the very outgrowth of patience. ¹³⁷Said the Apostle Paul, "We glory in tribulations also: knowing that tribulation worketh patience; and patience experience; and experience hope: and hope maketh not ashamed; because the love of God is shed abroad in our hearts by the Holy Chost which is given unto us." [Rom. 5:3, 4]

¹³⁸Here, then, is an advance grace, godliness, which is to have the spirit and the likeness of the character of Jesus Christ. ¹³⁹To raise us to His divine ideal is the one end of all the dealings of God with us, and of the whole plan of salvation. ¹⁴⁰For this his Spirit strives with us to exalt us to this great purpose. ¹⁴¹The corruption of the world is seeking to steal our senses, all the unholy influences on every side are working to hold us to a low, earthly level--blinding our sensibilities, degrading our desires, enfeebling our conscience and crippling our religious faculties by urging us to give sway to the lower nature. ¹⁴²Corruptions around us find corruptions within. ¹⁴³Each works upon the other.

¹⁴⁴To lure us away from all this is the precious ladder. ¹⁴⁵The eye is attracted to God above the ladder. ¹⁴⁶The invitation comes from the glory above it, Come up higher. ¹⁴⁷The heart is attracted. ¹⁴⁸The steps taken in advance, one after another [sic]. ¹⁴⁹Higher and still higher is the ascent. ¹⁵⁰At every step the attraction becomes greater. ¹⁵¹Higher, holier ambitions take possession of the

13

And, all great of the most life kept united together -
not cohesion - the budding of these. Metaphors
penetrate the living, the true consciousness, and
limited as these be, and and depraved the will
expressed in every impulse, in every word, in every
with grateful trusting, and then upon the whole the
addition of the addition, the addition, the addition
similarity of the addition, the addition, the addition
more the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
of the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
multiplied as the addition, the addition, the addition
more apparent from the addition, the addition, the addition
the east - the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
faster the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
steps upward, the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
in the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
of the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
and parting, the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
in the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
can reproduce the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
him who is at the top of the addition, the addition, the addition
within the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
and retains the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition
fixed and transformed is his addition, the addition, the addition
down in itself, the addition, the addition, the addition, the addition

soul. ¹⁵²The guilt of the past life is left behind. ¹⁵³They dare not look down the ladder at these [things] which long poisoned the springs of true happiness and kindled remorse, weakened and depraved the will, and repressed every better impulse. ¹⁵⁴The eye [is] steadfastly fixed, with grateful, trembling emotion, upon God above the ladder. ¹⁵⁵Christ is the ladder. ¹⁵⁶By laying hold on Christ, climbing up by Christ, resolving to return to the Father above the ladder, broken, contrite, subdued. ¹⁵⁷The offers of God's mercy, of living connection with God, of grace multiplied as they step by step make the distance [sic] more apparent from earth.

¹⁵⁸The aim of God's word is to inspire hope, to fasten our hands to this Ladder and climb step by step heavenward, with ever advancing vigor and in godliness is the increase of spiritual life. ¹⁵⁹It is the key [?] to the senses in which we partake of the nature of God. ¹⁶⁰We attain a likeness of character to God by the imparting of His own grace. ¹⁶¹In the measure of our limited powers we can be holy as He is holy and can reproduce the truth and love which exists [sic] in Him who is at the top of the ladder. ¹⁶²As wax [?] takes the counterpart of the seal, so the soul receives and retains the moral image of God. ¹⁶³We become filled and transfigured by His brightness, as the cloud--dark in itself--when filled with the light is turned to stainless whiteness.

is a man - the only person who is not likely to be
 doing as you are in a letter.
 I am sure that all the other people who
 make a list of good things, including children
 and the like, are only a profession of faith
 and not a sincere, earnest practice of good things.
 He must state that in particular, that I must
 believe in the fact that we are representing the civil rights
 character and practice of the people, and that
 the coming generation will not be a generation
 that promises enjoying the grace given during the
 last, will not be a generation from which all the other
 together with God the grace given in the last
 generation to be a good and kind and happy to
 our brother. This is no matter of mere profession
 and a great change to be brought to the world,
 which will not be any action, and our hope
 of a new one will not be a new world, but a
 generation with fear and with trembling, brought
 and brought in as a gift to the world and to
 our pleasure. The only way to bring it
 and to bring it to the world to the world and
 to the world to the world to the world to the world
 is an earnest practice of good things and a
 generation of good things, and a generation of
 good things, and a generation of good things.

163b They borrow the glory from God which glory is shining upon the ladder.

164 There are still additional steps to make. 165 Add "to godliness brotherly kindness." 166 Thus there will not be merely a profession of Bible religion, but a sincere, earnest practice of godliness. 167 We must be partakers of the divine nature before we can represent the Christlike character [sic] and practise the works of Christ. 168 The climbing Christian will not sit passive, claiming the promises, enjoying the grace given them [sic] of God, but will work from principle. 169 He is [a] worker together with God. 170 The grace given him of God teaches him how to be kind and tender and helpful to his brethren. 171 There is no waiting for an overpowering, magical change to be wrought to the converting of others without any action of our own. 172 Life becomes an [sic] humble but earnest working out of salvation with fear and with trembling, knowing that God worketh in us both to will and do of his own good pleasure. 173 The very exercise of brotherly kindness assimilates the soul to Christ and brings him into sympathy with Christ.

174 Growing in grace is an earnest working out [of] what God works in. 175 It is an earnest of future glory, the working out here upon the earth of the spirit that is cherished in heaven.

[illegible]

¹⁷⁶The Word of God enjoins upon every one of His children: "Be ye all of one mind, having compassion one of another, love as brethren, be pitiful, be courteous." [1 Peter 3:8] ¹⁷⁷Now unless godliness was added to patience man would not show that brotherly kindness. ¹⁷⁸Christ has shown man in His mission to our world the graces of the Spirit of God which, when accepted, fashions [sic] and molds [sic] the entire man, externally as well as internally, by abasing his pride and leading him to not esteem himself highly but to esteem his brother as valuable in the sight of God because Christ paid an infinite price for his soul. ¹⁷⁹When man is valued as Gods [sic] property then we will be kind, amiable, and condescending [toward him].

¹⁸⁰The religion of Jesus Christ is a system of the true heavenly politeness and leads to a practical exhibition of habitual tenderness of feeling, kindness of deportment. ¹⁸¹He who possesses godliness will also add this grace, tak[ing] a step higher on the ladder. ¹⁸²The higher he mounts the ladder, the more of the grace of God is revealed in his life, his sentiments, his principles. ¹⁸³He is learning, ever learning the terms of his acceptance with God, and the only way to obtain an inheritance in the heavens is to become like Christ in charicter [sic]. ¹⁸⁴The whole scheme of mercy is to soften down what is harsh in temper,

[illegible]

and refine whatever is rugged in [the] deportment. ¹⁸⁵The internal change reveals itself in the external actions. ¹⁸⁶The graces of the Spirit of God work with hidden power in the transformation of character [sic]. ¹⁸⁷The religion of Christ never will reveal a sour, coarse, and uncourteous action. ¹⁸⁸Courtesy is a Bible virtue. ¹⁸⁹The virtue of this grace [of] brotherly kindness characterized [sic] the life of Christ. ¹⁹⁰Never was such courtesy exhibited upon the earth as Christ revealed, and we cannot overestimate its value.

¹⁹¹The next step in the ladder is charity. ¹⁹²Add "to brotherly kindness charity," which is love. ¹⁹³Love to God and love to our neighbor constitute the whole duty of man. ¹⁹⁴Without brotherly kindness we cannot exhibit the grace of love to God or to our fellow men.

¹⁹⁵This last step in the ladder gives to the will a new spring of action. ¹⁹⁶Christ offers a love that passeth knowledge. ¹⁹⁷This love is not something kept apart from our life, but it takes hold of the entire being. ¹⁹⁸The heaven to which the Christian is climbing will be only attained by those who have this crowning grace. ¹⁹⁹This is the new affection which pervades the soul. ²⁰⁰The old is left behind. ²⁰¹Love is the great controlling power. ²⁰²When love leads, all the faculties of mind and spirit are enlisted. ²⁰³Love to God and love to man will give the clear title to heaven.

No one can love God sincerely and truly ^{enough} his
commandments, the heart that is not ^{enough} joined
with the heart of Christ and ^{enough} united by
the pure and holy rules which he has given us,
will lead to the ^{enough} practice of his
command to love and ^{enough} others from forth within
abundance. In my years of faith I have seen
a true loving act. What evidence has been
that we ~~are~~ have the heart of Christ, without a
Jesus is a ^{enough} great and his commandments
the heart of Christ, his commandments and his love
then we it is that ^{enough} the heart of Christ is
Christ love can also be ^{enough} in our hearts
We are to love our brethren as Christ has loved
us, We are to be perfect in love and obedience is
lacking the Christ love which tells us that we are
perfect the love even of Christ Jesus and his
infinite greatness is the love of God which is our love
It is not the greatness of our sin but the depth of our
repentance that brings the purifying love of God to our
hearts then there is much forgiveness the heart loves
much. Love is a tender plant it needs to be
constantly nurtured on a good garden and the
seed these good the Christ love the Christ love the
in the length of the cross, for if there is no love
in our hearts.

204 No one can love God supremely and transgress one of His commandments. 205 The heart softened and subdued with the beauty of Christs [sic] charicter [sic] and bridled by the pure and lofty rules which he has given us,--will lead to the putting in practice what it has learned of love, and follow Jesus forthwith in humble obedience. 206 The Living power of faith will reveal itself in true loving acts.

207 What evidence have we that we have the pure love without alloy? 208 God has erected a standard--His commandments. 209 "He that hath my commandments and keepeth them, he it is that loveth me." [John 14:21] 210 The words of God must have an abiding place in our hearts. 211 We are to love our brethren as Christ has loved us. 212 We are to be patient [and] kind, and yet there is something lacking--we must love. 213 Christ tells us that we must forgive the erring even seventy times seven, and how infinitely greater is the love of God than is our love. 214 It is not the greatness of our sin but the depth of our repentance that brings the pardoning love of God to our hearts. 215 When there is much forgiven, the heart loves much. 216 Love is a tender plant. 217 It needs to be constantly cultured or it will wither and die.

218 All these graces we must have. 219 We must climb the whole length of the ladder. 220 For if these things be in you

~~Don't make a mistake that will be too late~~

~~Handwritten text, possibly a signature or name, crossed out with a horizontal line.~~

do not drop in on me and attend my mother's
 school at Middlebury, where her influence
 in the knowledge of our good Jesus abides, and I have

If there were only drafts of the Constitution to be considered in his efforts to amend it, even the many, well-known, and

the positions the all-angles is well known in
insurance for these policies and will be of great good

will ~~not~~ look for him on the floor of the Senate
so that they may well be in and able to do in the future —
neither subject

life and in the most of our human nature
in the knowledge of Jesus Christ, there abounds in

the Christian success will be great & as every Christian
in all practical Christians and will practice
the same in the same manner as the

will produce the same fruit that the vine
will produce much fruit. Blueberries do not

climb the ladder of progress and add grace to grace is
like a bird and cannot fly off, he fails to discern

blind and could see afar off, the same
 that just cut taking these successive steps in ascending,
 the ladder would after being in going in full and

the knowledge of our good Jesus Christ, is not placing myself
in a position where the light of God alone the Father
is reflected upon him and ~~there~~ as he does not add grace to
himself

220 "If these things be in you and abound, they make you that ye shall neither be barren nor unfruitful in the knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ. 221 But he that lacketh these things is blind, and cannot see afar off, and hath forgotten that he was purged from his old sins. 222 Wherefore the rather, brethren, give diligence to make your calling and election sure: for if ye do these things, ye shall never fall." [2 Pet. 1:8-10]

223 The only safety of the Christian is to be unwearied in his efforts to live on the plan of addition. 224 The apostle shows the advantages to be gained in thus doing. 225 For those who add grace to grace, God will work on the plan of multiplication, so that the graces will be in and abound in the religious life and he will not "be barren neither unfruitful in the knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ." 226 Those abounding in the Christian graces will be zealous [sic], lively, vigorous in all practical Christianity and will practice righteousness--just as the branch abideth [sic] in the vine will produce the same fruit that the vine bears and will bring forth much fruit.

227 Those who do not climb the ladder of progress and add grace to grace is [sic] "blind, and cannot see afar off." 228 He fails to discern that without taking these successive steps in ascending the ladder round after round in growing in grace and the knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ he is not placing himself in a position where the light of God above the ladder is reflected upon him. 229 As he does not add grace to grace,

[illegible]

he has forgotten the claims of God upon him, and that he was to receive the forgiveness of sins through obedience to the requirements of God. ²³⁰And he is in the position of a sinner before God. ²³¹If he has the graces of Christ he will exercise and increase them but as he does not bear fruit in good works to the glory of God he remains in a state of blindness and ignorance, self-indulgence and sin. ²³²He cannot see afar off. ²³³His eyes are fastened upon the earthly, not on God above the ladder.

²³⁴This class can [may have] earthly advantages but has [sic] no discernment of the privileges and blessings of living in the light which shines from God above the ladder. ²³⁵They know not the things that make for their peace. ²³⁶They cannot look backward with a clear spiritual sight, as they do not view things in the light of heaven. ²³⁷They once enjoyed the love of God. ²³⁸They repented of their sins and enlisted to become servants of Jesus Christ, but all those vows made to God, all the solemn obligations taken upon themselves at baptism, to seek for glory, honor, immortality and eternal life, they forgot.

²³⁹Says the apostle, "If ye then be risen with Christ, seek those things that are above, where Christ sitteth at the right hand of God. ²⁴⁰Set your affections on things above, not on things on the earth. ²⁴¹For ye are (through the baptism and vows) dead (to the world, dead to its customs, its ambition, its pride, its pursuits), and your life is hid with Christ in God.

²⁴²When Christ, who is your life shall appear, then shall ye also appear with him in glory." [Col. 3:1-4]

²⁴³These things are to be often in mind. ²⁴⁴Meditate upon them.

²⁴⁵Your serious obligations you have entered into, (and) do not defraud God by violating any one of your solemn promises.

²⁴⁶"Wherefore the rather, brethren, give diligence to make your calling and election sure." [2 Pet. 1:10] ²⁴⁷We need not have a supposed hope, but an assurance. ²⁴⁸To make our calling and election sure is to follow in the Bible plan to closely examine ourselves, make strict inquiry whether we are indeed converted, our minds are drawn out after God and heavenly things, our wills renewed, our whole souls changed. ²⁴⁹To make our calling and election sure requires far greater diligence than many are giving to this important matter. ²⁵⁰"For if ye do these things," live on the plan of addition, growing in grace and the knowledge of our Lord Jesus Christ, ye shall mount up step by step the ladder Jacob saw, and "ye shall never fall: for so an entrance shall be ministered unto you abundantly into the everlasting kingdom of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ."

251 Let us consider this ladder which was presented to Jacob.
 252 The human race was cut off from intercourse with God. 253 They may
 look at a paradise lost but [could see] no means of entering it and
 holding communion with heaven. 254 The sin of Adam cut off all
 intercourse between heaven and earth. 255 Up to the moment of mans
 [sic] transgression of Gods [sic] law there had been free communion
 between earth and heaven. 256 [They] seemed connected by a path which
 Deity loved to traverse. 257 But the transgression of Gods [sic] law
 broke up this path and man [was] separated from God.

258 As soon as Satan seduced man to disobedience of Gods [sic]
 holy law, every link seemed broken which bound earth to heaven and
 finite man to the infinite God. 259 Man might look to heaven, but how
 to attain it? 260 But joy to the world! 261 The Son of God, the
 sinless [One], the One perfect in obedience, becomes the channel
 through which the lost communion may be renewed, the way through which
 the lost paradise may be regained. 262 Through Christ, mans [sic]
 substitute and surety, man may keep the commandments of God. 263 He
 may return to his allegiance [sic] and God will accept him.

264 Christ is that ladder. 265 "By me if any man enter in, he
 shall be saved, and shall go in and out and find pasture." [John
 10:9]

266 This is the ladder, the base of it resting upon the earth, the
 top reaching to the highest heavens. 267 The broken links have been
 repaired. 268 A highway has been thrown up along which the weary and
 heavy laden may pass. 269 They may enter heaven and find rest.

[illegible]

²⁷⁰The ladder is the medium of communication between God and man.
²⁷¹Through the mystic ladder was the gospel preached to Jacob. ²⁷²As
 the ladder stretched from earth, reaching to the highest heavens, and
 the glory of God [was seen] above the ladder, [so] Christ in his
 divine nature reached immensity and was one with the Father. ²⁷³As
 the ladder, though its top penetrated into heaven, its base was upon
 the earth, so Christ though God clothed his divinity with humanity and
 was in the world "found in fashion as a man." ²⁷⁴The ladder would be
 of no useless [sic] if it rested not on the earth or if it reached not
 to the heavens.

²⁷⁵God appeared in glory above the ladder, looking down with
 compassion on erring, sinful Jacob, addressing to him words of
 encouragement. ²⁷⁶It is through Christ that the Father beholds sinful
 man. ²⁷⁷The ministering angels were communicating to the inhabitants
 of the earth through the medium of the ladder. ²⁷⁸The only way that
 man can be saved is by clinging to Christ.

²⁷⁹We ascend to heaven by climbing the ladder, step by step the
 whole height of Christs [sic] work. ²⁸⁰There must be a holding fast
 to Christ, a climbing up by the merits of Christ. ²⁸¹To let go is to
 cease to climb, is to fall, to perish. ²⁸²We are to mount by the
 Mediator and all the while to keep hold on the Mediator, ascending by

successive steps, round above round, stretching the hand from one round above the other. ²⁸³In the work of redemption they [may] have a knowledge of Jesus Christ by planting the feet on one round after another in perfect obedience to all the commandments of God. ²⁸⁴This is a necessity for each individual striving and making progress at every step. ²⁸⁵It is simply impossible to enter heaven without constant striving. ²⁸⁶There is fearful peril in relaxing our efforts in spiritual diligence for a moment, for we are hanging, as it were, between heaven and earth.

²⁸⁷We must keep the eye directed upward to God above the ladder. ²⁸⁸There is the question with men and women gazing heavenward, Can I obtain the mansions for the blessed? ²⁸⁹It is by being partakers of the divine nature. ²⁹⁰It is by escaping the pollutions "in the world through lust." ²⁹¹It is by entering into the holiest by the blood of Jesus, laying hold of the hope set before me in the gospel. ²⁹²It is by fastening yourself to Christ and straining every nerve to leave the world behind, laboring to diminish by successive steps your distance from God, who is at the top of the ladder. ²⁹³It is by being in Christ and yet led by Christ; by believing and working--trusting in Jesus, yet working upon the plan of addition, holding onto Christ and constantly mounting to a greater nearness to God supported by the Surety and yet [-?-] upward toward God.

When the successive notes were unrolled and
 the grains were unrolled one after another
 the rising grain is the perfect cone. I did hope
 one to get and one to get from them.
 And then the student's silence with the light
 and the point for to the thousands of
 passing small things there are and the point for
 is that city that with perfection has
 much and that is good for many
 as possible was the main production of
 the city and that for best kind of
 work we found, for which we were at the
 important of the knowledge for we can be
~~sure that~~ the point for to that city
 let when we are ready to the city and
 that for part on the ladder, as we can
 this same still is shown and we will not off -
 much the ~~same~~ and we are the ladder
 the & the city and for some who will
 assist. And upon the ladder full of
 everlastingly life and so on and so on
 this time will give us the everlastingly
 for good and so on just as we

²⁹⁴When the successive steps have been reached, when the graces have been added one after another, the crowning grace is the perfect love of God--supreme love to God and love to our fellow men. ²⁹⁵And then the abundant entrance into the kingdom of God.

²⁹⁶We point you to the mansions Christ is preparing for all those who love him. ²⁹⁷We point you to that city that hath foundations, whose builder and maker is God. ²⁹⁸We show you its massive walls, with the twelve foundations of the city of God, and tell you that these walls must be scaled. ²⁹⁹You look discouraged at the magnitude of the work before you. ^{300a}How can we surmount walls that [Last 3 words were crossed out.] ^{300b}We point you to the ladder set up on earth, reaching to the city of God. ³⁰¹Plant your feet on the ladder. ³⁰²Forsake your sins. ³⁰³Climb step by step and you will reach God above the ladder, [and] the Holy City of God. ³⁰⁴For none who will resolutely mount up on the ladder will fail of everlasting life: "For so an entrance shall be ministered unto you in the everlasting kingdom of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Signs July 31, 1884

The Signs of the Times article for July 31, 1884, is apparently a transcription of a sermon Ellen White delivered at the Los Angeles campmeeting on May 10 of 1884. Her topic was "The Vision at Bethel," and the thoughts seem to be drawn from the first fourteen sentences as well as the last fifty or so sentences of Manuscript 13, 1884. Also it appears that fresh ideas were taken from the Melvill source (see page 248 of this work) which was a sermon of his by the title, "Jacob's Vision and Vow," published in a book of sermons, 1850.

VOLUME 10. OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA, FIFTH-DAY, JULY 31, 1884. NUMBER 29.

The Signs of the Times.

The Vision at Bethel.*

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

"AND Jacob went out from Beer-sheba, and went toward Haran. And he lighted upon a certain place, and tarried there all night, because the sun was set; and he took of the stones of that place, and put them for his pillows, and lay down in that place to sleep. And he dreamed, and behold a ladder set up on the earth, and the top of it reached to Heaven; and behold the angels of God ascending and descending on it. And, behold, the Lord stood above it, and said, I am the Lord God of Abraham thy father, and the God of Isaac; the land whereon thou liest, to thee will I give it, and to thy seed; and thy seed shall be as the dust of the earth, and thou shalt spread abroad to the west, and to the east, and to the north, and to the south; and in thee and in thy seed shall all the families of the earth be blessed. And, behold, I am with thee, and will keep thee in all places whither thou goest, and will bring thee again into this land; for I will not leave thee until I have done that which I have spoken to thee of. And Jacob awaked out of his sleep, and he said, Surely the Lord is in this place, and I knew it not. And he was afraid, and said, How dreadful is this place! this is none other but the house of God, and this is the gate of Heaven." Gen. 28:10-17.

"Jacob was not perfect in character." He sinned against his father, his brother, his own soul, and against God. Inspiration faithfully records the faults of good men, those who were distinguished by the favor of God; indeed, their faults are much more fully transcribed than their virtues. They were compassed with infirmities; they were assaulted by temptations, and were often overcome by them; but they were willing to learn in the school of Christ. Were these characters presented before us as faultless, it would tend to discourage us in our strivings after righteousness. We should not take pleasure in the faults of others; but it may give us courage to know that men of like passions with ourselves have fought the good fight of faith, and bruised Satan under their feet. The record of their lives may serve as a warning to us. It shows that God will by no means clear the guilty. He sees sin in his most favored ones, and he punishes them even more decidedly than those who have less light and responsibility. But in contrast with the sins and errors of humanity there is presented one perfect character,—that of the Son of God, who clothed his divinity with humanity, and walked a man among the children of men. He is our Pattern, pure, sinless, and undefiled.

"Jacob obtained by fraud the blessing designed for his brother." God had promised him the birthright, and the promise would have been fulfilled in good time had he been willing to wait. But like many who now profess to be the children of God, he lacked faith, and thought he must do something himself, instead of submissively leaving the matter in the hands of the Lord. As a result, he was a fugitive from his father's house, hurrying for fear of his life from the rage of his brother, Esau.

As he pursued his lonely way, he was greatly cast down and discouraged. He feared that through his own rash course he had lost the blessing God designed to give him, and that his opportunity was gone forever; and Satan was ready to take advantage of his depression and press in his temptations. Yet God did not utterly forsake Jacob. His mercy was still extended to his erring, distrustful servant, although he would permit afflictions to come upon him until he should learn the lesson of patient submission. The Lord graciously and compassionately revealed just what Jacob needed, a Saviour. He had sinned; but his heart was filled with gratitude as he saw revealed a way by which he could be restored to the favor of God.

Wearied with his journey, the wanderer lay down upon the ground, with a stone for his pillow. And while he slept, the Lord gave him a vision. He beheld a ladder, bright and shining, whose base rested upon earth while the top reached to Heaven. Upon this ladder angels were ascending and descending, and above it was the Lord of glory, who addressed Jacob in words of wonderful encouragement. He assured Jacob that he was under divine guardianship in his absence from home, and that the land whereon he lay as an exile and a fugitive should be given to him and his posterity. The promise given to Abraham was solemnly renewed, "In thee and in thy seed shall all the families of the earth be blessed."

The Lord knew the evil influences that would surround Jacob, and the perils to which he would be exposed; and the future was opened before him, that, fully understanding the divine purpose with reference to himself, he might be prepared to resist the temptations that would surely come to him alone amid idolaters and scheming men. There would be ever before him the high standard at which he must aim, and the knowledge that through him the purpose of God was reaching its accomplishment would be a constant guard and shield.

Jacob awoke with a solemn sense of the presence of God. "The Lord is in this place," said he, "and I knew it not." Through the Spirit of God, the plan of redemption was revealed to him, not fully, but such parts as it was essential

for him to know.³³ The time of Christ's first advent was yet far in the future; but God would not let his servant remain in ignorance of the fact that sinful man had been provided an Advocate with the Father.

³⁴Up to the time of man's rebellion against the government of God, there had been free communion between God and man.³⁵ Heaven and earth had been connected by a path that the Lord loved to traverse.³⁶ But the sin of Adam and Eve separated earth from Heaven.³⁷ The curse of sin was upon the human race, and was so offensive to God that man could have no communion with his Maker, however much he might desire it.³⁸ He could not climb the battlements of Heaven and enter the city of God; for there entereth into it nothing that defileth.³⁹ The ladder represents Jesus, the appointed medium of communication.⁴⁰ Had he not with his own merits bridged the gulf that sin had made, the ministering angels, ascending and descending on that ladder, would have held no communication with fallen man.

⁴¹All this was revealed to Jacob in his dream.⁴² Although his mind at once grasped a part of the revelation, its great and mysterious truths were the study of his life-time, and unfolded to his understanding more and more.⁴³ In his conversation with Nathanael, Jesus referred to this mystic ladder on which Jacob gazed with pleased wonder.⁴⁴ Said he, "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Hereafter ye shall see Heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man."

⁴⁵It is our life-work to commence at the lowest round of the ladder, and step by step to ascend toward Heaven.⁴⁶ There is earnest work in this, but we can gain eternal life in no other way.⁴⁷ We must take up our daily duties.⁴⁸ There must be self-sacrifice, self-denial, and walking in the humble path of obedience.⁴⁹ Earnest battles must be fought with self and with the powers of darkness.⁵⁰ We shall meet with strong temptations to go with the crowd, which is pressing downward; for by this means we can avoid being singular.⁵¹ But we must have a firm hold on Christ, and keep on climbing.⁵² To look back is to become dizzy; to let go is to perish.⁵³ The eye of faith must be continually directed upward to discern a mighty helper in our tender heavenly Father.

⁵⁴We ascend by successive steps.⁵⁵ When we let go of one round, it is to grasp another that is still higher.⁵⁶ Thus the hand is constantly reaching upward for successive degrees of grace, and the feet are planted on one round after another, until finally an abundant entrance shall be administered to us into the kingdom of our Lord and Saviour, Jesus Christ.

⁵⁷There is necessity for striving, and yet it will be of no avail unless we strive lawfully.⁵⁸ To profess to climb up by Christ, and claim his righteousness, while living in disobedience to the law of God, is to continue in sin that grace may abound.⁵⁹ It is to cry, Christ, Christ, and trust in him, while in daily rebellion against God. We must have repentance toward God, whose law we have broken, as well as faith in Christ, through whom our offenses are pardoned.⁶⁰ Man lost paradise through the transgression of God's holy law, and he can regain it only through obedience to that law.

⁶¹We have reason to rejoice that the world has not been left in solitary hopelessness.⁶² Jesus left the royal throne and his high command in Heaven, and became poor that we through his poverty might be made rich.⁶³ He took upon himself our nature, that he might teach us how to live.⁶⁴ In the steps which the sinner must take in conversion,—repentance, faith, and baptism,—he led the way.⁶⁵ He did not repent for himself, for he was sinless, but in behalf of man.⁶⁶ Jesus became "the repairer of the breach, the restorer of paths to dwell in."⁶⁷ He became an exile to earth to bring back the one lost, straying sheep, the one world ruined by sin. In him were combined the earthly and the heavenly, the human and the divine; otherwise, he could not be a Mediator whom the sinful could approach, and through whom they could be reconciled to their Maker.⁶⁸ But now he encircles the race in arms of sympathy and love while he grasps the throne of the Infinite, thus uniting man in his weakness and helplessness with the Source of strength and power.

⁶⁹As Jesus prayed after his baptism, the Holy Spirit, in the form of a dove of burnished gold, hovered over him, and a voice was heard, saying, "This is my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased."⁷⁰ Through the gates ajar there streamed bright beams of glory from the throne of Jehovah, and this light shines even upon us. The assurance given to Christ is assurance to every repenting, believing, obedient child of God that he is accepted in the Beloved.

⁷¹We are indebted to Jesus for all the blessings we enjoy.⁷² We should be deeply grateful that we are the subjects of his intercession.⁷³ But Satan deceives men and women by presenting the service of Christ before them in a false light, and making them think that it is a condescension on their part to accept Jesus as their Redeemer.⁷⁴ If we viewed the Christian privilege in the right light, we should consider it the highest exaltation to be accounted a child of God, an heir of Heaven; and we should rejoice that we can walk with Jesus in his humiliation.



July 31, 1864

- ¹⁸ But our Saviour assures us that there are some who would like to climb up some other way, than the toilsome, self-denying way of the cross.
- ¹⁹ They would avoid reproach and shun sacrifices. Christ calls such thieves and robbers. ²⁰ If we are not willing to breast the storm of opposition, if we choose to float with the current, we shall lose eternal life.
- ²¹ And now the question for each one to settle is, Will you leave the dark abodes of sin and woe, and seek the mansions Jesus has gone to prepare for his followers? ²² In his name we beseech you to plant your feet firmly on the ladder, and climb upward. ²³ Forsake your sins, overcome your defects of character, and cling with all your powers to Jesus, the way, the truth, and the life. ²⁴ We may every one of us succeed. ²⁵ None who shall persevere will fail of everlasting life. ²⁶ Those who believe on Christ shall never perish, neither shall any pluck them out of his hand. ²⁷ Evil angels will try to weaken their hold on Christ, and to attract their eyes to earth; but God will send holy, ministering angels to help them and to strengthen their hands.
- ²⁸ The Lord showed Jacob the open heavens. He beheld earth linked with Heaven, and saw the bright array of angels and the majesty of Deity. ²⁹ A divine voice addressed the repenting, discouraged one in words of gracious assurance, and spoke to him of great things to come. ³⁰ And so, through the merits of our Redeemer, the Father looks upon us with tender compassion, and speaks to us hopefully the language of forgiveness and love.
- ³¹ Eye hath not seen, nor ear heard, neither have entered into the heart of man the things that God hath prepared for them that love him. ³² The farther the Christian advances on the Heavenward way, the more clearly will he discern the nothingness of earthly things, while by an eye of faith he views the glories of the unseen, eternal world. ³³ We point you, dear fellow-traveler, to a city that hath foundations, whose builder and maker is God. ³⁴ But the hills to which we journey are not on earth, and we might well despair of ever reaching them, were it not for the glorious ladder whose base is on earth while its top reaches the highest Heaven.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Review Nov. 11, 1890

Six years after Manuscript 13, 1884, was first penned, a newly-produced writing of themes revolving around the ladder concept was presented in the Review and Herald of November 11, 1890. This new article was entitled, "The Mystic Ladder." Again, it seems evident from our research that Ellen White was drawing from her earlier work, MS 13, as well as from the Melvill sermon, "Jacob's Vision and Vow." Some new applications regarding salvation through Christ alone are made.

The Review and Herald,
ISSUED WEEKLY BY THE
Seventh-day Adventist Publishing Association,
 Battle Creek, Michigan.

THE MYSTIC LADDER.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹JACOB's experience as a wanderer from his home, when he was shown the mystic ladder, on which descended and ascended the angels of heaven, was designed to teach a great truth in regard to the plan of salvation. ²The purposes of God were opened to the discouraged man, who felt himself cut off from God and man. ³In marvelous love, Christ presented before him in a dream the way of life. ⁴The truth was unfolded before him in the emblem, and its significance is as great in our day as it was in his.

⁵"And he dreamed, and behold a ladder set up on the earth, and the top of it reached to heaven: and behold the angels of God ascending and descending on it." ⁶And, behold, the Lord stood above it, and said, I am the Lord God of Abraham thy father, and the God of Isaac: the land whereon thou liest, to thee will I give it, and to thy seed; and thy seed shall be as the dust of the earth; and thou shalt spread abroad to the west, and to the east, and to the north, and to the south: and in thee and in thy seed shall all the families of the earth be blessed. ⁷And, behold, I am with thee, and will keep thee in all places whither thou goest, and will bring thee again into this land; for I will not leave thee, until I have done that which I have spoken to thee of. ⁸And Jacob awaked out of his sleep, and he said, Surely the Lord is in this place; and I knew it not. ⁹And he was afraid, and said, How dreadful is this place! this is none other but the house of God, and this is the gate of heaven. . . . ¹⁰And he called the name of that place Bethel."

"Although the plan of salvation was not then as clearly unfolded as it is in our day, the Lord Jesus communicated most wonderful things to his children.

¹²The ladder represented Christ; he is the channel of communication between heaven and earth, and angels go to and fro in continual intercourse with the fallen race. ¹³The words of Christ to Nathanael were in harmony with the figure of the ladder, when he said, "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Hereafter ye shall see heaven open, and the angels of God ascending and descending upon the Son of man." ¹⁴Here the Redeemer identifies himself as the mystic ladder, that makes communication possible between heaven and earth.

¹⁵When Jesus said, "I am the way, the truth, and the life," he uttered a truth of wonderful significance. ¹⁶The transgression of man had separated earth from heaven, and finite man from the infinite God. ¹⁷As an island is separated from a continent, so earth was cut off from heaven, and a wide channel intervened between man and God. Jesus bridged this gulf, and made a way for man to come to God. ¹⁸He who has no spiritual light sees no way, has no hope; and men have originated theories of their own regarding the way to life. ¹⁹The Romanist points the sinner to the Virgin Mary, to penances, indulgences, and the absolution of the priest; and to this theory come those who would be saved in their sins, and those who would be saved by their own merit. ²⁰But the only name given among men whereby they can be saved is Jesus. ²¹Across the gulf that sin has made come his words, "I am the way, the truth, and the life." ²²There is but one mediator between God and man. ²³In heaven this great truth was announced. ²⁴A voice from the throne was heard, saying, "Sacrifice and offering thou wouldst not, but a body hast thou prepared me." ²⁵Isaiah, looking forward in prophetic vision, writes, "Unto us a child is born, unto us a son is given: and the government shall be upon his shoulder: and his name shall be called Wonderful, Counselor, The mighty God, The everlasting Father, The Prince of Peace. ²⁶Of the increase of his government and peace there shall be no end, upon the

throne of David, and upon his kingdom, to order it, and to establish it with judgment and with justice, from henceforth even forever." ²³And from the wilderness, the voice of the messenger cries, "Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world." ²⁴The beloved disciple declares of him: "In the beginning was the Word, and the Word was with God, and the Word was God. ²⁵The same was in the beginning with God. ²⁶All things were made by him; and without him was not anything made that was made. ²⁷In him was life; and the life was the light of men. ²⁸And the light shineth in darkness; and the darkness comprehended it not. . . . ²⁹And the Word was made flesh, and dwelt among us (and we beheld his glory, the glory as of the only begotten of the Father), full of grace and truth."

³⁰Christ only is the way, the truth, the life; and man can be justified alone through the imputation of Christ's righteousness. ³¹Man is justified freely by God's grace through faith, and not by works, lest any man should boast. ³²Salvation is the gift of God through Jesus Christ our Lord. Many have felt their hopeless condition, and have asked in perplexity, "How shall we gain admission to the world to come?" ³³Earth lies under the curse, and is doomed to destruction; how shall we be able to enter the city of God? ³⁴We would point you to Christ, the way, the truth, the life—the mystic ladder between heaven and earth.

³⁵After the enemy had betrayed Adam and Eve into sin, the connection between heaven and earth was severed; and had it not been for Christ, the way to heaven would never have been known by the fallen race. ³⁶But "God so loved the world, that he gave his only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in him should not perish, but have everlasting life." ³⁷Christ is the mystic ladder, the base of which rests upon the earth, and whose topmost round reaches to the throne of the Infinite. ³⁸The children of Adam are not left desolate and alienated from God; for through Christ's righteousness we have access unto the Father.

³⁹"By me," said Christ, "if any man enter in, he shall be saved, and shall go in and out, and find pasture." ⁴⁰Let earth be glad, let the inhabitants of the world rejoice, that Christ has bridged the gulf which sin had made, and has bound earth and heaven together. ⁴¹A highway has been cast up for the ransomed of the Lord. ⁴²The weary and heavy laden may come unto him, and find rest to their souls. ⁴³The pilgrim may journey toward the mansions that he has gone to prepare for those who love him.

⁴⁴In assuming humanity, Christ planted the ladder firmly upon the earth. ⁴⁵The ladder reaches unto the highest heaven, and God's glory shines from its summit and illuminates its whole length,

while the angels pass to and fro with messages from God to man, with petition and praise from man to God. ⁴⁶Through the divine nature, Christ was one with the Father; and by assuming humanity, he identified himself with man. ⁴⁷He, "being in the form of God, thought it not robbery to be equal with God: but made himself of no reputation, and took upon him the form of a servant, and was made in the likeness of men."

⁴⁸In the vision of Jacob was represented the union of the human and the divine in Christ.

⁴⁹As the angels pass to and fro on the ladder, God is represented as looking down with favor upon the children of men because of the merit of his Son.

⁵⁰Every minister should learn the lessons which Christ taught, that he may be able to instruct sinners in the way of salvation. ⁵¹Christ said, "And I, if I be lifted up from the earth, will draw all men unto me." ⁵²The sinner cannot take one step unless the Spirit draws him; he must cling to Christ if he would be saved. ⁵³If he ascends to heaven, it must be by mounting up step by step the whole height of Christ's work, so that Christ shall be his wisdom, righteousness, sanctification, and redemption.

⁵⁴The gaining of eternal life is no easy thing.

⁵⁵By living faith we are to keep on reaching forward, ascending the ladder round by round, seeing and taking the necessary steps; and yet we must understand that not one holy thought, not one unselfish act, can be originated in self.

⁵⁶It is only through Christ that there can be any virtue in humanity. ⁵⁷Without Christ we can do no good thing, but with him we may do all things. ⁵⁸It is at this point that many stumble, to their ruin. ⁵⁹They think that they must struggle in their own strength to grow into goodness, before they can receive a new heart. ⁶⁰But such effort is in vain. ⁶¹All warfare is useless unless Christ's power is combined with human effort.

⁶²But while we can do nothing without him, we have something to do in connection with him. ⁶³At no time must we relax our spiritual vigilance; for we are hanging, as it were, between heaven and earth. ⁶⁴We must cling to Christ, climb up by Christ, become laborers together with him in the saving of our souls.

⁶⁵We are not merely to see a way by which to cross the gulf of sin, but we are to appreciate the value of the ransom paid for our souls; we are to realize something of what has been suffered that we might be forgiven, and rescued from destruction. ⁶⁶We are to rejoice that the atonement is complete; and believing in Christ as our complete Saviour, we may know that the Father loves us, even as he loves his Son.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Letter 47, 1893

The writing of the last quarter of the following twelve-page letter to Professor W. W. Prescott on October 25, 1893, appears to have been dependent on Manuscript 13, 1884, and the Melvill source used in the two articles just preceding this selection. Being reproduced here are the last three pages of the letter, beginning with sentence 154. In these pages Ellen White is discussing Peter's ladder of Christian progression as well as the ladder connecting earth with heaven and representing Jesus Christ.

Letter to Prescott No. 47, October 25, 1893

¹⁵⁴Never flatter the youth with ideas of the great things they can do, nor lead them to think that they have not been appreciated in their home life. ¹⁵⁵Point them to the ladder, Peter's ladder of eight rounds, and place their feet, not on the highest round, but on the lowest, and with earnest solicitation urge them to climb to the very top: step by step they may climb to the top of this ladder. ¹⁵⁶See 2 Peter 1:2-11.

¹⁵⁷In this scripture is represented man's cooperation with God in the plan of salvation. ¹⁵⁸The apostle Paul presents it thus: "Work out your own salvation with fear and trembling; for it is God that worketh in you both to will and to do of his good pleasure." ¹⁵⁹God works in and through the human agents; they become partakers of the divine nature, having escaped the corruption that is in the world through lust. ¹⁶⁰They are to work upon the plan of addition as set forth by Peter. ¹⁶¹Not that one grace is to be added after another, but all are to be manifest in the Christian character. ¹⁶²"For if these things be in you, and abound, they make you that ye shall neither be barren nor unfruitful." ¹⁶³"Wherefore the rather, brethren, give diligence to make your calling and election sure; for if ye do these things (adding constantly to the graces here mentioned), ye shall never fall. ¹⁶⁴For so an entrance shall be ministered unto you abundantly into the everlasting kingdom of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ." ¹⁶⁵Here is a

life-insurance policy in which there can be no failure; for it is from the God of heaven. ¹⁶⁶It assures us eternal life through growth in grace and knowledge of Jesus Christ.

¹⁶⁷The ladder is Christ, who connects earth with heaven. ¹⁶⁸We are saved by climbing round after round of the ladder, looking to Christ, clinging to Christ, mounting step by step to the heights of Christ, so that He is made unto us wisdom and righteousness and sanctification and redemption.

¹⁶⁹It is no easy matter to gain the priceless treasure of eternal life. ¹⁷⁰No one can do this and drift with the current of the world. ¹⁷¹He must come out from the world and be separate, and touch not the unclean. ¹⁷²No one can act like worldlings without being carried down by the current of the world. ¹⁷³No one will be borne upward without stern persevering effort in the conflict. ¹⁷⁴All must engage in this warfare for themselves; no one else can fight their battles. ¹⁷⁵"We wrestle not against flesh and blood, but against principalities, against powers, against the rulers of the darkness of this world, against spiritual wickedness in high places." ¹⁷⁶We have unseen foes to meet, evil men are agents for the powers of darkness to work through, and without spiritual discernment the soul will be ignorant of Satan's devices, and be ensnared and stumble and fall. ¹⁷⁷He who would overcome must hold fast to Christ. ¹⁷⁸he must not look back, but keep the eye ever upward. ¹⁷⁹Mount up by the Mediator, keeping hold of the Mediator,

reaching upward to one line of work after another, making no provision for the flesh, to fulfill the lusts thereof. ¹⁸⁰There is no such thing as our entering into the heavenly portals through indulgence and folly, amusement, selfishness, but only by constant watchfulness and unceasing prayer.

¹⁸¹Spiritual vigilance on our part individually is the price of safety. ¹⁸²Swerve not to Satan's side a single inch, lest he gain advantage over you. ¹⁸³He is playing the game of life for your souls. ¹⁸⁴We may enter into the Holiest by the blood of Jesus; we may lay hold of the hope set before us in the gospel; we may follow on to know the Lord, until we shall know that His goings forth are prepared as the morning. ¹⁸⁵If we ever reach heaven, it will be by linking our souls to Christ, leaning incessantly upon Him, and cutting loose from the world, its follies and enchantments. ¹⁸⁶There must be on our part a spiritual cooperation with the heavenly intelligences. ¹⁸⁷We must believe and work and pray and watch and wait.

¹⁸⁸I would address the pupils of the school: Do not wait for a high-wrought state of feeling, but calmly view the whole ground, and candidly consider whether you will be sons and daughters of God. ¹⁸⁹Decide now, without delay, and in doing this you will have manifest evidence of the companionship and protection of all the heavenly intelligences. ¹⁹⁰Angels of God are ascending and descending the mystic ladder, and God is above, the light of

His glory shining down its entire length, comforting, encouraging all who are climbing faithfully by painful yet cheerful steps. ¹⁹¹Not one will fail who will perseveringly climb this ladder.

¹⁹²May the Lord guide you all, teachers and pupils and church members, to make diligent work for eternity. ¹⁹³The end of all things is at hand. ¹⁹⁴There is need now of men armed and equipped to battle for God. ¹⁹⁵Please read Ezekiel 9. ¹⁹⁶Who bear the sign, the mark of God in their foreheads?--The men that sigh and cry for the abominations done in the midst of Jerusalem,--among those that profess to be God's people--not those who are engrossed in games for their selfish amusement. ¹⁹⁷After the mark had been set upon this class--who are registered in the books of heaven as overcomers--by the angelic messenger of God, the command is given to the ministers of destruction: "Go ye after him through the city, and smite: let not your eye spare, neither have ye pity. ¹⁹⁸slay utterly old and young, both maids and little children, and women; but come not near any man upon whom is the mark. ¹⁹⁹And begin at my sanctuary. ²⁰⁰Then they began at the ancient men which were before the house." ²⁰¹God grant that these solemn predictions which are so speedily to be fulfilled, may be impressed upon the hearts of all! ²⁰²See Rev. 7:1-4, 12-17; Zech. 3.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 14

Introduction to Diary Book 32, pp. 39-48

In the chapter 13 appendix materials we have already noted the use of earlier pages from the same Diary Book 32, labeled for the year 1899 but actually written a few years prior to that, we have concluded. The evidence seems quite conclusive that Ellen White used this diary portion, as well as the SP account, in the composition of chapter 14 of DA. Hanna's life of Christ was a source for the diary selection.

Since there is manuscript text available, we have provided a comparison of that text alongside a typescript of the same.

Immediately following that presentation is another typescript of the same material but with underlining to indicate the sentences used in the Desire of Ages text.

used in L. C.
 John had spoken
 hesitatingly in regard to the one
 about being the one for whom
 he was preparing the way for he had been promised
 he should have a sign from heaven
 signifying who was the one to come
 After the wonderful demonstration
 at Jordan then he no longer
 had any question. He had
 the honor to baptise the worlds
 Redeemer the Son of the living
 God the deputies obtained
 so little light in regard to
 John they felt little
 interest

Di(99) Bk 32

151 Hitherto John had
 spoken hesitatingly in
 regard to Christ being the
 One for whose coming he was
 preparing the way, for he
 had been promised he should
 have a sign from heaven
 symbolizing who was the one
 to come. 152 After the
 wonderful demonstration at
 Jordan then he no longer had
 any question. 153 He had the
 honor to baptise [sic] the
 worlds [sic] Redeemer, the
 Son of the living God.
 154 The deputies obtained so
 little light in regard to
 John they felt little
 interest

used in L. C.
 Hitherto John had spoken
 hesitatingly in regard to the ^{one}
 Christ being the One for whom
 he was preparing the way for he had been promised
 he should have a sign from heaven
 symbolizing who was the one to come.
 After the wonderful demonstration at
 Jordan then he no longer had
 any question. He had the
 honor to baptise the worlds
 Redeemer, the Son of the living God.
 The deputies obtained so
 little light in regard to
 John they felt little
 interest

Di(99) Bk 32

151 Hitherto John had
 spoken hesitatingly in
 regard to Christ being the
 One for whose coming he was
 preparing the way, for he
 had been promised he should
 have a sign from heaven
 symbolizing who was the one
 to come. 152 After the
 wonderful demonstration at
 Jordan then he no longer had
 any question. 153 He had the
 honor to baptise [sic] the
 worlds [sic] Redeemer, the
 Son of the living God.
 154 The deputies obtained so
 little light in regard to
 John they felt little
 interest

to know who this worthier
 than John was, I baptize
 unto water, but there
 standeth one among you whom
 ye know not; he it is who
 coming after me is preferred
 [sic] before me, whose shoes
 [sic] latchet I am not
 worthy to unloose. ¹⁵⁵But
 there were many who were
 deeply stirred believing
 John to be a prophet of God.
¹⁵⁶Many were present at the
 baptism of John, but the
 revelation or ensign given
 John they did not see.
¹⁵⁷Spiritual things are
 spiritually discerned.
¹⁵⁸Many things transpire

Di(99) Bk 32

to know who this worthier
 than John was: I baptize
 unto water, but there
 standeth one among you whom
 ye know not; he it is who
 coming after me is preferred
 [sic] before me, whose shoes
 [sic] latchet I am not
 worthy to unloose. ¹⁵⁵But
 there were many who were
 deeply stirred believing
 John to be a prophet of God.
¹⁵⁶Many were present at the
 baptism of John, but the
 revelation or ensign given
 John they did not see.
¹⁵⁷Spiritual things are
 spiritually discerned.
¹⁵⁸Many things transpire

in the very midst of many people
 on varied occasions but they
 when Christ himself is working
 his presence is among them, and
 angels that accompany him
 is with him in the very congregations
 but they know him not they
 realize nothing unusual but some
 he is revealed his presence is felt
 gladness peace and joy animates
 their hearts, they are comforted they
 are encouraged they are blessed
 John is looking and expecting that
 on the return of Christ from the desert
 the one in their midst will give
 some sign that he will be recog-
 nized in his true character

Di(99) Bk 32

in the very midst of many
 people on varied occasions
 where Christ himself is
 working. ¹⁵⁹His presence is
 among them, demonstrating
 his mission and angels
 unseen that accompany him is
 [sic] with him in the very
 congregations, but they know
 him not. ¹⁶⁰They realize
 nothing unusual. ¹⁶¹But to
 some, he is revealed; his
 presence is felt.
¹⁶²Gladness, peace and joy
 animates [sic] their hearts.
¹⁶³They are comforted, they
 are encouraged, they are
 blessed. ¹⁶⁴John is looking
 and expecting that on the
 return of Christ from the
 desert [sic] the one in
 their midst will give some
 sign that he will be
 recognized in his true
 character [sic],

in the very midst of many people
 on varied occasions but they
 know Christ himself is working
 his presence is among them, and
 angels that accompany him
 is with him in the very congregations
 but they know him not they
 realize nothing unusual but some
 he is revealed his presence is felt
 gladness peace and joy animates
 their hearts. They are comforted they
 are encouraged they are blessed
 John is looking and expecting that
 the one in their midst will give
 some sign that he will be recog-
 nized in his true character

Di(99) Bk 32

in the very midst of many
 people on varied occasions
 where Christ himself is
 working. ¹⁵⁹His presence is
 among them, demonstrating
 his mission and angels
 unseen that accompany him is
 [sic] with him in the very
 congregations, but they know
 him not. ¹⁶⁰They realize
 nothing unusual. ¹⁶¹But to
 some, he is revealed; his
 presence is felt.
¹⁶²Gladness, peace and joy
 animates [sic] their hearts.
¹⁶³They are comforted, they
 are encouraged, they are
 blessed. ¹⁶⁴John is looking
 and expecting that on the
 return of Christ from the
 desert [sic] the one in
 their midst will give some
 sign that he will be
 recognized in his true
 character [sic],

but the prophet sees that Christ makes no move in this direction. ¹⁶⁵He will not bear witness of himself. ¹⁶⁶John is waiting almost impatiently to hear his voice lifted up declaring himself, but Jesus is among them as a common personage all day.

The next day as John sees Jesus coming, his eye lights up, his countenance is beaming as with the bright rays of light from the Sun of righteousness and he, in a most earnest meaning and with speech of intense feeling, reaching forth both hands toward Jesus, he exclaims,

Di(99) Bk 32

but the prophet sees that Christ makes no move in this direction. ¹⁶⁵He will not bear witness of himself. ¹⁶⁶John is waiting almost impatiently to hear his voice lifted up declaring himself, but Jesus is among them as a common personage all day.

¹⁶⁷The next day as John sees Jesus coming, his eye lights up, his countenance is beaming as with the bright rays of light from the Sun of righteousness and he, in a most earnest meaning and with speech [sic] of intense feeling, reaching forth both hands toward Jesus, he exclaims,

43
 Behold the Lamb of God, which
 taketh away the sins of the world.
 This is he of whom I ^{said} ~~said~~ unto you
 said, After me cometh one man
 which is preferred before me, and I
 knew him not; but that he should be
 made manifest to Israel, therefore
 am I come baptizing with water.
 The same said unto me, I
 saw the Spirit descending from heaven like a
 dove and it abode upon him, and I
 knew him not but he that
 sent me to baptize with water,
 the same said unto me, Upon whom thou shalt see
 the Spirit descending, and remaining
 on him, the same is he which
 baptizeth with the Holy Ghost.

DI(99) Bk 32

Behold the Lamb of God,
 which taketh away the sins
 of the world; this is he of
 whom I said, After me cometh
 [a] man which is preferred
 before me, and I knew him
 not; but that he should be
 made manifest to Israel,
 therefore am I come
 baptizing with water.
 168 The same said unto me, I
 saw the Spirit descending
 from heaven like a dove and
 it abode upon him, and I
 knew him not but he that
 sent me to baptize with
 water, the same said unto
 me, Upon whom thou shalt see
 the Spirit descending [sic],
 and remaining on him, the
 same is he which baptizeth
 with the Holy Ghost;

and I saw and bear record
 that this is the Son of God,"
 The large crowd heard the
 message in clear distinct
 utterances like the trumpet
 giving a certain sound,
 And the deputies from the
 Sanhedrin heard all this, but the
 testimony they had so wanted
 to hear was not spoken, that Jesus
 would now establish as a
 king his throne in Jerusalem
 and exalt the Jews above all
 the people upon the face of
 the whole earth, for such a
 king they had a reception,
 for such a king

Di(99) Bk 32

and I saw and bear record
 that this is the Son of
 God." 169 The large crowd
 heard the message in clear
 distinct utterances, like
 the trumpet giving a certain
 sound. 170 The deputies from
 the Sanhedrin heard all
 this, priests and rulers
 heard it, but the testimony
 they had so wanted to hear
 was not spoken, that Jesus
 would now establish as a
 king his throne in Jerusalem
 and exalt the Jews above all
 the people upon the face of
 the whole earth, for such a
 king they had a reception,
 for such a king

They had been waiting and looking
 who would reign in regal splendor
 upon the throne of David in Jerusalem
 and by force of arms subdue all the
 kingdoms of the world under his
 rule. But one who was to make
 the world better by the
 virtue of his righteousness
 and to proclaim, as did
 John, they must repent of
 their sins, leave off their
 injustice and overcome their
 pride, ambition and love of
 display, and deal justly man
 with his fellow man to become
 the subjects of his kingdom. They
 would not receive him determinedly
 and resolutely reject. John did
 not proclaim him king of Israel

Di(99) Bk 32

they had been waiting and
 looking, who would reign in
 regal splendor upon the
 throne of David in Jerusalem
 and by force of arms subdue
 all the kingdoms of the
 world under his rule.
 171 But one who was to make
 the world better by the
 virtue of his righteousness
 and to proclaim, as did
 John, they must repent of
 their sins, leave off their
 injustice and overcome their
 pride, ambition and love of
 display, and deal justly man
 with his fellow man, to
 become the subjects of his
 kingdom, they would not
 receive but determinedly and
 resolutely reject.

172 John did not
 proclaim him king of Israel,

Messiah the Prince but John
 declares him to be the Son of God
 He had heard the voice from
 the Infinite One saying these
 words, My beloved Son in whom
 I am well pleased. John was
 receiving the testimony of God
 himself John did not take in
 the full significance of the words
 of John the Baptist in the
 But few realize even to day the bearing
 of these words, when the Lord's voice
 was heard from the heavens that
 the Lord was well pleased this is my
 beloved Son in whom I am well pleased
 it was a pledge from God to man that
 the human family was accepted in the
 beloved, the long human arm of Christ
 encircled the race while his divine

Messiah the Prince, but John
 declares him to be the Son
 of God. ¹⁷³He had heard the
 voice from the Infinite One
 saying, This [is] my beloved
 son, in whom I am well
 pleased. ¹⁷⁴John was
 receiving the testimony of
 God himself. ¹⁷⁵John did
 not take in the full
 significance of the words of
 the Father. ¹⁷⁶But few
 realize even to day [sic]
 the bearing of these words.
¹⁷⁷When the Lord's voice was
 heard from the Heavens, This
 is my beloved Son in whom I
 am well pleased, it was a
 pledge from God to man that
 the human family was
 accepted in the beloved.
¹⁷⁸The long human arm of
 Christ encircled the race,
 while his divine

Jesus said lived upon the throne of
 the infinite thus uniting finite man with
 the infinite God and connecting earth with
 heaven. His work Christ came to the
 earth to accomplish, the connection
 which had been broken between God
 and man has resumed through
 Jesus Christ and now as his mission
 in the world has commenced,
 the communication is opened with
 the human family in Gods testimony
 to shew for the ears of men, the door
 in heaven is opened never more to
 be closed until the the prayers and
 praise of the people of God have been
 ascending to heaven through the
 substitute and surety of the race
 and now, Gods voice is heard
 to assure human beings that God is
 well pleased with the great sacrifice

Di (99) Bk 32

power laid hold upon the throne of the infinite.

179 This unites finite man with the infinite God and connecting [sic] earth with heaven. 180 This work Christ came to the earth to accomplish. 181 The

connection which had been broken between God and man was resumed through Jesus Christ and now as his mission in the world had commenced, the communication is opened with the human family in Gods [sic] testimony spoken for the ears of men. 182 The door in

heaven is opened never more to be closed. 183 The prayers and praise of the people of God have been ascending to heaven through the Substitute and Surety of the race and now the Fathers [sic] voice is heard to assure human beings that God

is well pleased with the great sacrifice

entered upon by his beloved Son
to bring many sons and daughters to
glory. The prayers of the needy suffering
ones may ascend to God for he will
hear them. While Christ in person
remained with them his divine power was
in all his teachings. Yet this great blessing
was not appreciated when Christ ascended
the promise of the comforter was in their
minds; and whatsoever ye shall ask in
my name, that will I do, that the Father
may be glorified in the Son ye shall
ask anything in my name I will do it.

Di(99) Bk 32

entered upon by his beloved
son to bring many sons and
daughters to glory. ¹⁸⁴The
prayers of the needy,
suffering ones may ascend to
God, for he will hear them.
¹⁸⁵While Christ in person
remained with them, his
divine power was in all his
teachings. ¹⁸⁶Yet, this
great blessing was not
appreciated. ¹⁸⁷When Christ
ascended the promise of the
comforter was in their
minds, and whatsoever ye
shall ask in my name, that
will I do, that the Father
may be glorified in the Son.
¹⁸⁸If ye shall ask anything
in my name, I will do it.

Diary Book 32

¹⁵¹Hitherto John had spoken hesitatingly in regard to Christ being the One for whose coming he was preparing the way, for he had been promised he should have a sign from heaven symbolizing who was the one to come.¹ ¹⁵²After the wonderful demonstration at Jordan then he no longer had any question. ¹⁵³He had the honor to baptize the world's Redeemer, the Son of the living God. ¹⁵⁴The deputies obtained so little light in regard to John they felt little interest to know who this worthier than John was: "I baptize with water, but there standeth one among you whom ye know not; he it is who coming after me is preferred before me whose shoes latchet I am not worthy to unloose." ¹⁵⁵But there were many who were deeply stirred believing John to be a prophet of God. ¹⁵⁶Many were present at the baptism of John, but the revelation or sign given John they did not see. ¹⁵⁷Spiritual things are spiritually discerned. ¹⁵⁸Many things transpire in the very midst of many people on varied occasions where Christ himself is working. ¹⁵⁹His presence is among them, (demonstrating his mission)² and angels (unseen)² that accompany him is with him in the very congregations, but they know him not. ¹⁶⁰They realize nothing unusual. ¹⁶¹But to some, he is revealed; his presence is felt. ¹⁶²Gladness,

¹Underlining throughout denotes sentences used in the DA text.

²Words enclosed in parentheses appear in the original text as interlineations.

peace and joy animates their hearts. ¹⁶³ They are comforted,
they are encouraged, they are blessed. ¹⁶⁴ John is looking and
expecting that on the return of Christ from the desert the
one in their midst will give some sign that he will be
recognized in his true character, but the prophet sees that
Christ makes no move in this direction. ¹⁶⁵ He will not bear
witness of himself.¹ ¹⁶⁶ John is waiting almost impatiently to
hear his voice lifted up declaring himself, but Jesus is
among them as a common personage all day.

¹⁶⁷ The next day as John sees Jesus coming, his eye lights
up, his countenance is beaming as with the bright rays of
light from the Sun of righteousness and he, in a most
earnest meaning and with speech of intense feeling, reaching
forth both hands toward Jesus, he exclaims, "Behold the Lamb
of God, which taketh away the sins of the world; this is he
of whom I said, After me cometh man which is preferred
before me, and I knew him not; but that he should be made
manifest to Israel, therefore am I come baptizing with
water. (The same said unto me,) ² ¹⁶⁸ I saw the Spirit
descending from heaven like a dove and it abode upon him,
and I knew him not, but he that sent me to baptize with
water, the the same said unto me, Upon whom thou shalt see
the Spirit descending and remaining on him, the same is he
which baptizeth with the Holy Ghost; and I saw and bear
record that this is the Son of God." ¹⁶⁹ The large crowd

¹This is an apparent parallel to Hanna, but not quoted
in DA, Cf. Hanna, LC 15/101.

²Clause that was crossed out in the ms.

heard the message in clear distinct utterances, like the trumpet giving a certain sound. ¹⁷⁰The deputies from the Sanhedrin heard all this, priests and rulers heard it, but the testimony they had so wanted to hear was not spoken, that Jesus would now establish as a king his throne in Jerusalem and exalt the Jews above all the people upon the face of the whole earth, for such a king they had a reception, for such a king they had been waiting and looking who would reign in regal splendor upon the throne of David in Jerusalem and by force of arms subdue all the kingdoms of the world under his rule. ¹⁷¹But one who was to make the world better by the virtue of his righteousness and to proclaim, as did John, they must repent of their sins, leave off their injustice and overcome their pride, ambition and love of display, and deal justly man with his fellow man, to become the subjects of his kingdom, they would not receive but determinedly and resolutely reject.

¹⁷²John did not proclaim him king of Israel, Messiah the Prince, but John declares him to be the Son of God. ¹⁷³He had heard the voice from the Infinite One saying, "This (is) my beloved Son, in whom I am well pleased." ¹⁷⁴John was re-echoing the testimony of God himself. ¹⁷⁵John did not take in the full significance of the words of the Father. ¹⁷⁶But few realize even today the bearing of these words. ¹⁷⁷When the Lord's voice was heard from the Heavens, "This is my beloved Son in whom I am well pleased," it was a pledge from God to man that the human family was accepted in the

beloved. ¹⁷⁶The long human arm of Christ encircled the race, while his divine power laid hold upon the throne of the infinite. ¹⁷⁷This unites finite man with the infinite God and connecting earth with heaven. ¹⁸⁰This work Christ came to the earth to accomplish. ¹⁸¹The connection which had been broken between God and man was resumed through Jesus Christ and now as his mission in the world had commenced, the communication is opened with the human family in God's testimony spoken for the ears of men. ¹⁸²The door in heaven is opened never more to be closed. ¹⁸³The prayers and praise of the people of God have been ascending to heaven through the Substitute and Surety of the race and now the Father's voice is heard to assure human beings that God is well pleased with the great sacrifice entered upon by his beloved son to bring many sons and daughters to glory. ¹⁸⁴The prayers of the needy, suffering ones may ascend to God, for he will hear them. ¹⁸⁵While Christ in person remained with them, his divine power was in all his teachings. ¹⁸⁶Yet, this great blessing was not appreciated. ¹⁸⁷When Christ ascended, the promise of the comforter was in their minds, and whatsoever ye shall ask in my name, that will I do, that the Father may be glorified in the Son. ¹⁸⁸If ye shall ask anything in my name, I will do it.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 24

Introduction to MS 40, 1887

This is the latter portion of the Manuscript 40, 1887, being that part which refers to the visit of Jesus to the synagogue at Nazareth on the Sabbath day. Actually only the first two pages, or 23 sentences, are missing from our typescript of the unedited copy from the White Estate. MS 40, 1887, was the basis for several periodical articles; see the discussion about it on page 287 of this work.

MS 40, 1887 - PERIL OF DOUBT AND UNBELIEF
First part, see ST 6-23-1887

. . . ¹If the light which God bestows upon men is not appreciated it becomes darkness to them. ²And the greater the light bestowed the greater the darkness which follows its rejection. ³There is a solemn warning to us in the words of Christ to the men of Nazareth. ⁴Upon visiting the little town where He had been brought up, the Saviour, according to His custom, went into the synagogue on the Sabbath day, and stood up to read. ⁵The book of the prophet Isaiah was handed Him, and He read the words, "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he hath anointed me to preach the gospel to the poor; he hath sent me to heal the brokenhearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised, to preach the acceptable year of the Lord." Luke 4:18, 19. ⁶And then, as the eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened on Him, He said unto them, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears." ⁷"And all bare him witness, and wondered at the gracious words which proceeded out of his mouth." Verses 21, 22.

⁸The scripture which He had read was understood by all to refer to the Messiah. ⁹And when Jesus explained the prophet's words, and pointed out the sacred office of the Messiah, as a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of the captive, a healer of the sick, and a revealer of truth to the world, the people were filled with joy, and responded to

His words by hearty amens and praises to God. ¹⁰His impressive manner, the mighty import of His words, the divine light that shone from His countenance, thrilled that listening company, as Jesus stood before them, a living exposition of the prophet's words.

¹¹Not one who looked upon that scene could doubt that this was indeed the promised Deliverer, the hope of Israel.

¹²Now was the golden opportunity for the men of Nazareth to accept Christ, and receive the blessings which He came to bring. ¹³Angels of God were in that assembly, watching with

intense interest the decision of the hour. ¹⁴Angels of

Satan also were on the ground to suggest doubts and arouse prejudice. ¹⁵The people had long indulged pride and

unbelief and the current of their thoughts soon returned to the natural channel. ¹⁶They forgot the power of divine love

which had stirred their souls, and turned to consider the lowly birth and humble life of Him who claimed to be their Messiah.

¹⁷In their pride they had expected a king who should appear in earthly pomp and power; and as they recalled these hopes they asked themselves, Is not this the son of Joseph and Mary, whose home has been so long among the poor inhabitants of the town? ¹⁸Can this be the promised

Deliverer of Israel? ¹⁹If this man be the Christ, why does He not give some mighty evidence of His power? ²⁰And blind,

unreasoning prejudice followed close in the steps of unbelief.

²¹But Jesus gave them a proof of His divine character by reading, as from an open book, the secrets of their hearts: "And he said unto them, Ye will surely say unto me this proverb, Physician, heal thyself: whatsoever we have heard done in Capernaum, do also here in thy country. ²²And he said, Verily I say unto you, No prophet is accepted in his own country. ²³But I tell you of a truth, many widows were in Israel in the days of Elias, when the heaven was shut up three years and six months, when great famine was throughout all the land; but unto none of them was Elias sent, save unto Sarepta, a city of Sidon, unto a woman that was a widow. ²⁴And many lepers were in Israel in the time of Eliseus the prophet; and none of them was cleansed, saving Naaman the Syrian." Luke 4:23-27.

²⁵In the days of Elijah, Israel had departed from the living God. ²⁶In vain the Lord by His prophets spoke to that backsliding and rebellious people. ²⁷In vain He reproved their sins, and threatened them with His judgments. ²⁸The message which might have been a savor of life unto life, proved to them a savor of death unto death. ²⁹They would not heed the warning which called them to a life of humility and faith. ³⁰Instead of leading them to repent of their sins, and thus remove the cause that had provoked against them the anger of the Lord, the words of warning offended their pride, and aroused their hatred against the messenger of God. ³¹Thus they multiplied their sins, and aggravated the guilt which had already brought the judgments

of God upon the land. ³²Now they sought to find and destroy Elijah, as though by silencing him, they would prevent the fulfillment of his words. ³³But God found among the heathen a hiding-place for His servant, and by terrible judgments upon the land of Israel He attested the divine authority of the prophet's message.

³⁴By this relation of events in the life of a prophet of God the Saviour met the secret doubts and questionings of those whom He was addressing. ³⁵In the apostasy of Israel in Elijah's day He presented before His hearers a vivid picture of their own true condition. ³⁶The unbelief and self-exaltation of the ancient Jewish nation made it a necessity for the Lord to pass by the many widows in Israel, and to find an asylum for His servant among a heathen people, and to entrust him to the kindness and liberality of a heathen widow; but she who was thus favored had lived in strict accordance with all the light she possessed. ³⁷God also passed over the many lepers in Israel, because their unbelief closed the door of good to them. ³⁸Instead of making a right use of God's blessings, they would pervert the precious tokens of His grace to exalt themselves. ³⁹Thus they had placed themselves in a position where the Lord could not manifest His power in their behalf. ⁴⁰A heathen nobleman who had been true to his convictions of right, and who felt his great need of help, was in the sight of God more worthy of His blessing than were the afflicted in Israel, who had slighted and despised their God-given

privileges. ⁴¹God would work for those who would appreciate His favors and respond to the light given them from Heaven.

⁴²Even the heathen who live according to the best light they have, doing right as far as they are able to distinguish right from wrong, are regarded with greater favor by God than are those who have had great light, but who are thereby only rendered more proud, boastful, and self-sufficient.

⁴³Jesus stood before the men of Nazareth calmly revealing their secret thoughts, and pressing home upon them the unpalatable truth of their unrighteousness. ⁴⁴His words cut to their hearts as their ingratitude, their selfishness, their strife for the supremacy, their pride and unbelief, their secret crimes, were all laid before them. ⁴⁵They knew that the eye of Christ could search the hidden recesses of their souls. ⁴⁶Did they then turn for help to Him who alone could help them? ⁴⁷For one brief moment they had been inclined to believe on Christ; but by opening their hearts to unbelief they had given place to Satan, and now his power controlled them. ⁴⁸They decided then and there that this Jesus should not reign over them. ⁴⁹They now scorned in their hearts the spirit of tenderness, faith, and reverence which had first inspired them. ⁵⁰From unbelief sprung malice. ⁵¹They had rejected Christ because He told them the truth, and now they were inspired by Satan with wrath and hatred against Him.

⁵²That a man who had sprung from poverty and lowliness

should dare to reprove them, filled the Jews with madness.
⁵³The assembly broke up in confusion. ⁵⁴The people laid
hands on Jesus, thrusting Him from the synagogue and out of
their city. ⁵⁵They hurried Him to the brow of a hill,
intending to cast Him down headlong; shouts and maledictions
filled the air; some were hurling stones at Him. ⁵⁶Suddenly
He disappeared from the midst of them. ⁵⁷Angels of God
surrounded the world's Redeemer, and conducted Him to a
place of safety. ⁵⁸The infuriated throng found themselves
seizing one another, but the man they sought to destroy was
gone. . . .

APPENDIX D - Chapter 24

Introduction to Signs June 16, 1887

The following article from Ellen White when she was in Basel, Switzerland, is one which is generally and largely excerpted from Manuscript 40, 1887. In fact most of the sentences were taken over verbatim; there are only a few added phrases or whole units in the entire article of 55 sentences, which represents only a small portion of the original nineteen pages of handwritten pages of MS 40, 1887.

The Signs of the Times.

OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA,

FIFTH-DAY, JUNE 16, 1887.

JESUS REJECTED AT NAZARETH.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

"And he said unto them, Ye will surely say unto me this proverb, Physician, heal thyself; whatsoever we have heard done in Capernaum, do also here in thy country. And he said, Verily I say unto you, No prophet is accepted in his own country. But I tell you of a truth, many widows were in Israel in the days of Elias, when the heaven was shut up three years and six months, when great famine was throughout all the land; but unto none of them was Elias sent, save unto Sarepta, a city of Sidon, unto a woman that was a widow. And many lepers were in Israel in the time of Eliseus the prophet; and none of them was cleansed, saving Naaman the Syrian."

¹ THERE is a solemn warning to us in these words of Christ to the men of Nazareth. ² Upon visiting the little town where he had been brought up, the Saviour, according to his custom, went into the synagogue on the Sabbath-day, and stood up to read. ³ The book of the prophet Isaiah was handed him, and he read the words: "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he hath anointed me to preach the gospel to the poor; he hath sent me to heal the broken-hearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised, to preach the acceptable year of the Lord." ⁴ And then, as the eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened on him, he said unto them: "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears."

⁵ The scripture which he had read was understood by all to refer to the Messiah. ⁶ And when Jesus explained the prophet's words, and pointed out the sacred office of the Messiah as a reliever of the oppressed, a liberator of the captive, a healer of the sick, and a revealer of truth to the world, "all bare him witness, and wondered at the gracious words that proceeded out of his mouth." ⁷ His impressive manner, the mighty import of his words, the divine light that shone from his countenance, thrilled that listening company; their hearts were filled with joy, and they responded to his words with hearty praises to God.

⁸ Not one who looked upon that scene could doubt that this was indeed the promised Deliverer, the hope of Israel. ⁹ Now was the golden opportunity for the men of Nazareth to accept Christ, and receive the blessings that he came to bring. ¹⁰ Angels of light were in that assembly, watching with intense inter-

est the decision of the hour. ¹¹ Angels of Satan also were on the ground to suggest doubts and arouse prejudice. ¹² The people had long indulged pride and unbelief, and the current of their thoughts soon returned to the natural channel. ¹³ They forgot the power of divine love which had stirred their souls, and turned to consider the lowly birth and humble life of Him who claimed to be their Messiah.

¹⁴ In their pride they had expected a king who should appear in earthly pomp and power; and as they recalled these hopes, they asked themselves, Is not this the son of Joseph and Mary, whose home has been so long among us? ¹⁵ Can this be the promised deliverer of Israel? ¹⁶ If this man is the Christ, why does he not give some mighty evidence of his power? ¹⁷ And blind, unreasoning prejudice followed close on the steps of unbelief.

¹⁸ Jesus gave them a proof of his divine power by reading, as from an open book, the secrets of their hearts: "And he said unto them, Ye will surely say unto me this proverb, Physician, heal thyself; whatsoever we have heard done in Capernaum, do also here in thy country." ¹⁹ And he said, Verily I say unto you, No prophet is accepted in his own country."

²⁰ Jesus continued: "But I tell you of a truth, many widows were in Israel in the days of Elias, when the heaven was shut up three years and six months, when great famine was throughout all the land; but unto none of them was Elias sent, save unto Sarepta, a city of Sidon, unto a woman that was a widow. ²¹ And many lepers were in Israel in the time of Eliseus the prophet; and none of them was cleansed, saving Naaman the Syrian."

²² In the days of Elijah, Israel had departed from the living God. ²³ In vain the Lord by his prophets spoke to that backsliding and rebellious people. ²⁴ In vain he reproved their sins, and threatened them with his judgments.

²⁵ The message which might have been a savor of life unto life, proved to them a savor of death unto death. ²⁶ They would not heed the warning which called them to a life of humility and faith. ²⁷ Instead of leading them to repentance, the prophet's words offended their pride, and aroused their hatred against the messenger of God. ²⁸ Thus they multiplied their sins, and aggravated the guilt which had already brought the judgments of God upon the land. ²⁹ They sought to find and destroy Elijah, as though by silencing him, they would prevent the fulfillment of his words.

³⁰ But God found among the heathen a hiding-place for his servant.

² By this relation of events in the life of a prophet of God, the Saviour met the secret doubts and questionings of those whom he was addressing.³ The apostasy of Israel in Elijah's day was a vivid picture of their own true condition.³² The unbelief and self-exaltation of the ancient Jewish nation made it necessary for the Lord to find an asylum for his servant among a heathen people; and, passing by the many widows in Israel, to intrust him to the kindness and liberality of a heathen woman; but the widow who was so highly favored had lived in accordance with all the light she possessed.

³⁴ God also passed over the many lepers in Israel, because their unbelief closed the door of good to them.³⁵ A heathen nobleman who had been true to his convictions of right, and who felt his need of help, was in the sight of God more worthy of his blessing than were the afflicted in Israel, who had slighted and despised their God-given privileges.³⁶ God works for those who appreciate his favors, and respond to the light given them from Heaven.

³⁷ Jesus stood before the men of Nazareth, calmly revealing their secret thoughts, and pressing home upon them the unpalatable truth of their unrighteousness.³⁸ His words cut to their hearts, as their ingratitude, their selfishness, their strife for the supremacy; their pride and unbelief, their secret crimes, were all laid before them.³⁹ They knew that they were in the presence of One who could read their souls.⁴⁰ For one brief moment they had been inclined to accept him as the Christ; but they had given place to Satan, and now his power controlled them.⁴¹ And they scorned in their hearts the spirit of tenderness, faith, and reverence which had first inspired them.

⁴² From unbelief sprung malice.⁴³ That a man who had sprung from poverty and a lowly birth should dare to reprove them, filled the hearts of the Nazarenes with hatred amounting to madness.⁴⁴ The assembly broke up in confusion.⁴⁵ The people laid hands on Jesus, thrusting him from the synagogue and out of

their city.⁴⁶ They hurried him to the brow of a hill, intending to cast him down headlong, and shouts and maledictions filled the air. Suddenly he disappeared from among them.⁴⁷ Angels from Heaven surrounded the world's Redeemer, and conducted him to a place of safety.

⁴⁹ The history of Christ's rejection by the men of Nazareth contains an important and solemn lesson for our time.⁵⁰ The spirit of enmity which in every age has been manifested against those who preach the simple, cutting truths of God's word, is seen in a greater degree as we near the close of time.

⁵¹ Our Saviour asks, "When the Son of man cometh, shall he find faith on the earth?" implying that true faith will then be almost extinct.⁵² The spirit of doubt and criticism is destroying confidence in the word and work of God.⁵³ All who desire to doubt or cavil will find occasion; for it is impossible for the carnal mind to understand or appreciate the mind of the Almighty.⁵⁴ Those who refuse to obey God till they can see all occasion of doubt removed, will be left in darkness; while those who, in humility of heart, walk in the light as it shines upon them, will receive clearer and clearer light.⁵⁵ Their path will be that of the "just, that shineth more and more unto the perfect day."

Basel, Switzerland.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 24

Introduction to Review Feb. 7, 1888

Important to Desire of Ages, chapter 24, are the aspects of truth covered in the RH article by Ellen White on February 7, 1888. The title is, "Sanctify Them Through Thy Truth." Most of sentences 47 to 82 contributed to chapter 24. However, our research did not turn up other links to suggest what an earlier text tradition might be, nor any possible sources for the writing of this article.

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 1888.

The Review and Herald.

ISSUED WEEKLY BY THE
Seventh-day Adventist Publishing Association,
Battle Creek, Michigan.

TWO DOLLARS A YEAR (50 NUMBERS) IN ADVANCE.

Address all communications, and make all Drafts and Money
Orders payable to
REVIEW AND HERALD, Battle Creek, Mich.

"SANCTIFY THEM THROUGH THY TRUTH."

BY MRS. R. A. WHITE.

¹ BEFORE JESUS went forth to his final conflict with the powers of darkness, he lifted up his eyes to heaven and prayed for his disciples. He said: "I pray not that thou shouldst take them out of the world, but that thou shouldst keep them from the evil." ² They are not of the world, even as I am not of the world. ³ Sanctify them through thy truth: thy word is truth. . . . ⁴ Neither pray I for these alone, but for them also which shall believe on me through their word.

⁵ The burden of Jesus' request was that those who believed on him might be kept from the evil of the world, and sanctified through the truth. He does not leave us to vague surmising as to what the truth is, but adds, "Thy word is truth."

⁶ The word of God is the means by which our sanctification is to be accomplished. ⁷ It is of the greatest importance, then, that we acquaint ourselves with the sacred instruction of the Bible. ⁸ It is as necessary for us to understand the words of life as it was for the early disciples to be informed concerning the plan of salvation. ⁹ We shall be inexcusable if, through our own negligence, we are ignorant of the claims of God's word. ¹⁰ God has given us his word, the revelation of his will, and has promised the Holy Spirit to them that ask

him, to guide them into all truth; and every soul who honestly desires to do the will of God shall know of the doctrine.

¹¹ The world is full of false teaching; and if we do not resolutely search the Scriptures for ourselves, we shall accept its errors for truth, adopt its customs, and deceive our own hearts. ¹² The doctrines and customs of the world are at variance with the truth of God. ¹³ Those who seek to turn from the service of the world to the service of God, will need divine help. ¹⁴ They will have to set their faces like a flint toward Zion. ¹⁵ They will feel the opposition of the world, the flesh, and the Devil, and will have to go contrary to the spirit and in-

fluences of the world. ¹⁶ Since the time when the Son of God breasted the haughty prejudices and unbelief of mankind, there has been no change in the attitude of the world toward the religion of Jesus. ¹⁷ The servants of Christ must meet the same spirit of opposition and reproach, and must go "without the camp, bearing his reproach."

¹⁸ The mission of Jesus was demonstrated by convincing miracles. ¹⁹ His doctrine astonished the people. ²⁰ It was not the contradictory jargon of the scribes, full of mysticism, burdened with absurd forms and meaningless exactions; but it was a system of truth that met the wants of the heart.

²¹ His teaching was plain, clear, and comprehensive.

²² The practical truths he uttered, had a convincing power, and arrested the attention of the people.

²³ Multitudes lingered at his side, marveling at his wisdom. ²⁴ His manner corresponded with the great truths he proclaimed. ²⁵ There was no apology, no hesitancy, not the shadow of a doubt or uncertainty that it might be other than he declared. ²⁶ He spoke of the earthly and the heavenly, of the human and the divine, with positive authority; and the people "were astonished at his doctrine; for his word was with power."

²⁷ He had declared himself to be the Messiah, but the people would not receive him, though they saw his wonderful works and marvelled at his wisdom.

²⁸ He did not meet their expectation of the Messiah.

²⁹ They had been instructed to look for earthly pomp and glory at the advent of their Deliverer, and they dreamed that under the power of "the Lion of the tribe of Judah" the Jewish nation would be exalted to pre-eminence among the nations of the world. ³⁰ With these ideas they were not prepared to receive the humble Teacher of Galilee, although he came just as the prophets had foretold that he should come. ³¹ He was not recognized as "the truth," the "light of the world," although he spake as never man spake; for his appearance was humble and unpretending. ³² He came without attendants of earthly pageant and glory. ³³ There was, however, a majesty in his very presence that bespoke his divine character. ³⁴ His manners, though gentle and winning, possessed an authority that inspired respect and awe. ³⁵ He commanded, and disease left the sufferer. ³⁶ The dead heard his voice and lived, the sorrowing rejoiced, and the weary and heavy-laden found rest in his compassionate love.

³⁷ Spies watched him with suspicious glances, ready to put an evil construction on any word or action that was in the least questionable. ³⁸ They were continually lying in wait to find whereof they might accuse him. ³⁹ He was the central object of observation and scrutiny to the people of Judea.

⁴⁰ His steps were thronged with curious multitudes that waited for a sign. ⁴¹ The lame, the blind, the palsy-stricken, the leprous, and those afflicted with all manner of diseases, came to him, and he healed them all. ⁴² Those who had come to criticize and condemn, heard the people glorifying God; and his fame spread from city to city. ⁴³ Heaven indorsed

his claims with mighty manifestations; but the evil hearts of men, filled with unbelief born of prejudice, thrust aside the tokens of his truth, and clung to their empty traditions.⁴⁶ They were not prepared to acknowledge him as the long-looked-for Messiah, because of their false conceptions as to the manner of his advent and the character of his mission.⁴⁷ They walked in the obscuring shadow of man-made theories.

⁴⁸ The word of God, that they professed to believe, stated plainly every detail of his ministry, and again and again he quoted from the prophets, and declared, "This day is this scripture fulfilled in your ears."⁴⁹ But the minds of the Jewish people were so concentrated on the hope of earthly power and national elevation that they despised the humble Nazarene, and would not have him to reign over them.⁵⁰ Had they earnestly searched the Scriptures, and brought their theories and expectations to the test of God's word, Jesus need not have wept over their impenitence.⁵¹ He need not have declared, "Behold, your house is left unto you desolate," "because thou knowest not the time of thy visitation."⁵² They might have been acquainted with the evidences of his Messiahship, and the calamity that laid the proud city in ruins might have been averted.⁵³ The minds of the Jews had become dwarfed and narrowed by their unjust prejudices and unyielding bigotry.⁵⁴ The practical lessons of Christ revealed the deficiencies of their characters, and demanded thorough repentance.⁵⁵ If they accepted his teaching, their practices must be changed, their thoughts enlarged, and their cherished hopes relinquished.⁵⁶ They would have to sacrifice the honor of men, in order to be honored of heaven; and if they obeyed the words of this now "Rabbi," they would have to go contrary to the opinions of the great teachers and thinkers of the time.

⁵⁷ Many wonder at the unwillingness of the Jews to receive Christ as the promised Messiah.⁵⁸ Why did they cling to their false creeds, empty forms, and useless ceremonies, when the truth of heaven waited their acceptance?⁵⁹ They spent their money for chaff and husks, when the living Bread was within their reach.⁶⁰ Why did they not go to the word of God, and search diligently to know whether or not they were in error, and to discover to Jesus the absurdity of his claims and the evidences of his deception?⁶¹ The cause of their rejection of Christ was the same as that which keeps men in error to-day: they "loved darkness rather than light, because their deeds were evil."

⁶² Truth was unpopular in Christ's day.⁶³ Truth is unpopular in our day.⁶⁴ It has been unpopular ever since Satan first gave man a disrelish for it by presenting bewitching fables that lead to self-exaltation.⁶⁵ Do we not meet theories and doctrines to-day that have no foundation in the word of God?

⁶⁶ Men cling as tenaciously to them as did the Jews to their traditions and delusions.⁶⁷ We have the same difficulties to meet and resist as did the Redeemer of the world.

⁶⁸ The Jewish leaders were filled with spiritual pride.⁶⁹ Their desire for the glorification of self, manifested itself even in the services of the sanctuary.⁷⁰ They loved the highest seats in the synagogues, and the praise of men.⁷¹ They loved greetings in the market-places, and were gratified with the sound of their titles on the lips of men.⁷² As

real piety declined, they became more jealous for their traditions and ceremonies.⁷³ Do we not see the same perverseness in the Christian church of to-day?⁷⁴ Those who love God with sincere hearts should the more earnestly desire the truth as it is in Jesus.⁷⁵ They should search the Scriptures with humble hearts, intensely desiring to know what is truth; for Christ prayed that his disciples might be sanctified through the truth.

⁷⁶ The Jews, because their understanding was darkened by selfish prejudice, could not harmonize the strange power and authority of Christ's convicting words, with his humble life and appearance.⁷⁷ They did not appreciate the fact that real greatness can afford to go without display.

⁷⁸ This man's poverty and humility seemed wholly inconsistent with his claims to the great honor and power of the Messiah.⁷⁹ That he should announce himself as the Son of God, they deemed intolerable blasphemy.⁸⁰ They questioned, if he were the Messiah, why was he so unpretending?

⁸¹ What would become of their nation if he were satisfied to be without the force of arms?⁸² When and how would the glory and power, so long anticipated, bring the nations as subjects to the city of the Jews?⁸³ Had not the priests taught that they were to bear rule over all the earth? and could it be possible that the great religious teachers were in error?⁸⁴ The Lord had answered their query through Isaiah: "O my people, they which lead thee cause thee to err, and destroy the way of thy paths."

⁸⁵ The scribes, Pharisees, and Sadducees had wandered away from the truth, and Jesus exhorted the people to study the Scriptures for themselves.

⁸⁶ God has endowed men with intellect, and has made it possible for them to be enlightened by the word of life; but to-day, as then, people will accept the teaching and doctrines of men, rather than obey the plain word of God.⁸⁷ They choose to take the broad road that leads to death, rather than to bear their cross and follow the blood-stained path that leads to eternal life.

⁸⁸ Pharisees, Sadducees, and Herodians joined to oppose the Son of God.⁸⁹ Their rejection of the truth influenced many to turn from the Saviour.

⁹⁰ Those who cherish enmity to the pure principles of heaven, are acting in concert with the "rulers of the darkness of this world."⁹¹ When Christ met with success in his ministry, those who hated truth and rejected light manifested their spirit of opposition, and sought to silence him.⁹² The same spirit is apparent to-day, wherever the truth is brought in contact with long-established error of doctrine and custom.⁹³ With mad prejudice, men bitterly condemn that which disturbs their preconceived opinions.⁹⁴ It is a matter of the highest importance and interest to us that we understand what the truth is, and our petitions should go forth with intense earnestness that we may be guided into all truth.

⁹⁵ David appreciated the divine enlightenment, and recognized the power of the word of God.

⁹⁶ He declares, "The entrance of thy words giveth light; it giveth understanding unto the simple."

⁹⁷ Let those who want light, search the Scriptures, comparing scripture with scripture, and pleading with God for the illumination of the Holy Spirit.

⁹⁸ The promise is, that those who seek shall find.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 24

Introduction to Letter 4, 1889

The following letter of July 23, 1889, was written by Ellen White to Howard and Madison Miller, but in its full text has been generalized so as to apply to other readers as well as to the two specifically addressed. The apparent source for part of this letter which relates to Desire of Ages, chapter 24, is March's Walks and Homes of Jesus. We begin with sentences on page eight of the original typescript, presenting only a small portion of the whole text.

¹The king of glory appeared in the form of a servant, clothed in the garb of humanity. ²When he began his public ministry in Nazereth [sic], there was a sad and terrible exhibition of what human nature can and will be when Satan works on the heart. ³Jesus proclaimed himself to be the anointed one. ⁴No man had before, [sic] ventured to assume as much, not the learned or noble of the earth, not even the prophets or kings. ⁵He arose in the synagogue, and read from the prophet Isaiah these gracious words: "The spirit of the Lord God is upon me; because he hath anointed me to preach the gospel to the poor: he hath sent me to heal the broken hearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised, to preach the acceptable year of the Lord."

⁶The eyes of all in the synagogue were fastened upon him; for divinity flashed through humanity, and with one voice they witnessed to the gracious words that proceeded from his lips. ⁷God had spoken to their hearts, and given them a testimony which they acknowledged to be the truth; but soon doubt and unbelief arose. ⁸Who was this that claimed to be the Messiah? ⁹They did not expect Christ to come in this way: His family connections were humble, pious people, but not distinguished for riches, learning, rank, or power. ¹⁰The Jews expected the Messiah to come with pomp and ceremony as a great king. ¹¹They looked for him to

appear as a conqueror, to deliver Isreal [sic] from the Roman yoke. ¹²They thought they would be able to cry, "This is the king that will reign on David's throne." ¹³But this man who made the claim that he was the anointed one of God, was from the humble walks of life, the son of Joseph and Mary. ¹⁴They had seen him going up and down the hills, they had seen him toiling daily at the carpenter's bench, and could he be the Messiah? ¹⁵The very humiliation which Christ bore was foretold in the Scriptures as a specification of his divine character and mission, and should have commended him to every home and heart in the land, but to the proud and unbelieving Jews his humility was an offense.

¹⁶The men of Nazareth refused the prince of life. ¹⁷The power of God which has [sic] stirred their hearts as he read and expounded to them the Scriptures, was resisted, and their passions were stirred as he spoke truths that revealed to them their real condition. ¹⁸The lips that had so recently acknowledged and blessed him, now uttered curses, and with the fury of demons they laid hands on him, and dragged him from the synagogue, out of the city, and thought to thrust him over the brow of the hill. ¹⁹But the angels of God protected him, and hid him from the sight of the infuriated throng, and he passed on his way unnoticed.

²⁰The men of Nazareth did Satan's work; but Christ could not give them up without granting them another opportunity for salvation. ²¹After his fame had spread

through the country to every region [sic], after they had had time for prejudice to subside, and reason to take control of their minds, he came again to test them, that they might redeem their past rejection of him.

²²Jesus had given the people of Nazareth clear and distance [sic] evidence that his mission was just what he had claimed it to be. ²³Would they not retrace their steps?

²⁴With such tokens of his truth before them, would these blind, fanatical men see in Jesus nothing more than the carpenter of Nazareth, the son of Mary? ²⁵At the beginning [sic] of his ministry, they had taken their first steps in the rejection of Christ, they had committed themselves to the work and the will of Satan, and their pride was so strong, their prejudices so great, that at his second call, they would not acknowledge him as the Messiah although they had the most convincing proof [sic] of his divinity. ²⁶O, what will not pride, unbelief, and prejudice lead men to do!

. . . ⁴³It is indeed human to err, and the wisest often make mistakes, but it is noble to confess error [sic], and not enclose the heart in prejudice to make yourselves and others believe you have pursued a right course. ⁴⁴You reject Christ by rejecting the message he sends; in so doing, you place yourselves under the control of the prince of darkness.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 24

Introduction to Diary Book 14, pages 73-77

The following twenty sentences are excerpted from pages 73 to 77 of Diary Book 14, 1889. The theme is Christ at Nazareth when He visited the synagogue on the Sabbath day. The clearest apparent source to be cited is Daniel March's Days of the Son of Man. Our typescript was done from the handwritten material. Thus the reader will note that some of the words "defied" identification.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 24

EGW Diary, 1889-1890, Book 14, pages 73-76

Christ at Nazareth¹

¹The first sermon in the synagogue given by Christ was in his own native town Nazareth where he had passed his childhood and youth. ²And in the synagogue where he had worshiped in the presence of his brethren in the manner and form of the Jewish religion. ³On the Sabbath day he was requested to take part in the service to read a passage from the book of the prophets. ⁴Curiosity had been aroused concerning him. ⁵Jesus looked upon familiar faces; his Mother and his brethren and sisters were all there. ⁶Every eye was fastened upon him in curious expectancy. ⁷And there was delivered unto him the book or parchment roll of the prophet Isaiah, and when he had opened the book ⁸Their [sic] was a tenderness, a simplicity and yet a remarkable distinctness and fervor in his utterance.

⁹For this was to him a living reality. ¹⁰He had announced his mission and then said, This day is this Scripture fulfilled in your ears. ¹¹These words of appeal [sic] freighted with heavenly love and yearning tenderness to heal them from bodily infirmities as well as the sins of the soul. ¹²And the Spirit of the Lord was moving upon the hearts of the audience for they were impressed that these words were the words of God. ¹³With thrilling power they

¹This is a typescript of the handwritten original.

struck upon every heart and brought forth fervent response.

. . .

²²They wanted a mighty general, a military leader who with supernatural power should humiliate the Roman power and avenge their national wrongs and place the Jewish nation where they thought they deserved to be, the exalted of the world. . . .

³³The moment he made reference to the favors and blessings given to the Gentiles, the national pride was at once excited. ³⁴Words were now spoken in no gentle manner and his words were drowned in a tumult. ³⁵Those in the synagogue, they [sic] laid violent hands on Jesus, hurried him to the brow of a hill whereon their city was built with the purpose to cast him down headlong [insert: but some were seeking to remember (?) him (?)].¹ ³⁶Jesus in calm Majesty stood while their wrath was seething (?) around him and they contending what should be done unto him. ³⁷Angels of heaven preserved his life and provided (?) a way out of the throng and he went on his way. ³⁸Nazareth refused and rejected him.

¹(?) denotes a problem word, or one too difficult to decipher.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 37

Introduction to DA(MS) 36 [37]

The DA manuscript is a volume of an earlier draft of about the first forty chapters of The Desire of Ages. Of course it is typescript, but with handwritten emendations throughout. The manuscript-draft of chapter 37, first numbered as 36, is composed of 227 sentences, ten more than are found in the published DA text. These additional sentences are furnished here in Appendix D. See the footnote on page 321 of this research document for some comparisons which could be made.

DA(MS)31/472 They assisted in arranging the people, bringing the afflicted ones to the Saviour, and promoting the comfort of all.

DA(MS)32/472 As there was opportunity, they engaged in personal labor, explaining the Scriptures, and working for the spiritual benefit of those who came to hear.

DA(MS)33/472 They taught of what they had learned of Jesus, and thus became laborers together with their Lord, every day obtaining a rich experience.

DA(MS)34/472 But it was necessary for them to have an experience also in laboring alone.

DA(MS)35/472 They still needed much instruction, great patience and tenderness, before they could be prepared for the work to which the Lord had called them.

DA(MS)36/472 Now, while he was personally with them, to point out their errors, and counsel and correct them, Jesus sent them forth as his representatives.

DA(MS)37/472+ During the time they had been with him, the disciples, when brought in contact with the priests and Pharisees and the influence of their doctrines and maxims, had brought their perplexities to Jesus, and he had set before them the truths of the Old Testament in contrast with tradition.

DA(MS)38/473 His teaching, with the influence of his own life, had strengthened their confidence in God's word, and had in a great measure set them free from their old fear of the rabbis and their bondage to tradition.

DA(MS)39/473 In the training of his disciples, the Saviour's life, as a continual illustration and embodiment of the truth, had far greater power than that of mere doctrinal instruction.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 53

Introduction to MS 55 - December 10 1894

Though the following five-page manuscript has not yet been found to be literarily dependent, yet there is an interesting correspondence between MS 55, a Signs article of December 10, 1894, and the chapter 53 of DA. There are parallels from one to another, and among all three writings. "Sending Out Workers" is the title of MS 55, while the Signs article is entitled, "The Sending Out of the Seventy."

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 53

MS 55 - December 10, 1894

¹"After these things the Lord appointed other seventy also, and sent them two and two before his face into every city and place whither he himself would come. ²Therefore said he unto them, The harvest truly is great, but the laborers are few: pray ye therefore the Lord of the harvest, that he would send forth laborers into his harvest. ³Go your ways: behold I send you forth as lambs among wolves."

⁴When Jesus sent out the twelve previous to the sending out of the seventy, their mission differed somewhat in character to that of the mission of the seventy. ⁵They were sent out two and two, "not into the way of the gentiles," or "into any city of the Samaritans," but they were commanded to "Go rather to the lost sheep of the house of Israel," but when Christ appointed the seventy he sent them "into every city and place, whither he himself would come." ⁶He gave them directions similar to that which he had given to the twelve; but the seventy were sent into Samaria, into the regions where he had formerly forbidden his disciples to go. ⁷In his charge to the seventy Christ acted upon the principle that he announced in these words, "He that receiveth you receiveth me; he that heareth you heareth me; and he that despiseth you despiseth me; and he that despiseth me despiseth him that sent me."

⁸They were to preach along the same lines to the Samaritans as Christ had preached, presenting the message of

truth in all cities and places whither Christ himself would come. ⁹Christ had journeyed from Jerusalem because of the bitter opposition that was manifested against the truth which he had spoken to the Pharisees. ¹⁰They had been greatly offended at him and had taken up stones to cast upon him. ¹¹But though he had departed from Jerusalem, he now steadfastly set his face to return. ¹²He was finishing his public ministry, journeying slowly from place to place, and taking a circuitous route by which he might pass through many villages. ¹³He knew that persecution, denial, rejection, condemnation and death of a most cruel character awaited him. ¹⁴But he also knew that this path was marked out for him by his Father, and he would not for a moment yield to the temptation to change his course, and save himself. ¹⁵Satan made a most determined effort to assail the Son of God to influence him to avoid the terrible future; but he knew from whence these temptations came and he refused to listen to the enemy's suggestion. ¹⁶He set his face determinedly to go to Jerusalem, and he would not be turned aside. ¹⁷On every hand he saw the poor sheep without a shepherd and the enemy suggested that it would be better for him to wait, that he could alleviate much distress and woe by avoiding the path of pain. ¹⁸There was much that he could do to stay the tide of evil. ¹⁹He groaned in spirit as he said to his disciples, "The harvest truly is great, but the laborers are few: pray ye therefore the lord of the harvest that he would send forth laborers

into the harvest."

²⁰What yearning compassion pressed his soul as he saw the needs of the people. ²¹Darkness covered the earth, and gross darkness the people. ²²But when the Samaritans were assured that Christ had set his face steadfastly to go to Jerusalem, they were offended. ²³They refused the Majesty of heaven, jealous that he should pass by their temple of worship, and go to the feast at Jerusalem. ²⁴The Samaritans refused to be helped physically on account of bitter religious prejudice. ²⁵The Jews and the Samaritans were at bitter enmity one with another, and the fact that Christ would not go up to Mount Gerizim stirred up their feelings of hatred, and they refused to entertain him. ²⁶In their treatment of Christ and his disciples they violated the Oriental custom of showing courtesy to travelers. ²⁷They knew something of Jesus. ²⁸Many had heard of him. ²⁹If they had received him as an honored guest they would have been largely rewarded; for he bestowed blessings wherever he went. ³⁰For every grace manifested toward him in favor and courtesy, he requited a more precious and valuable grace. ³¹He gave the people light and rich blessing and made them co-laborers with himself; but the precious gifts bestowed by the world's Redeemer wherever he went were lost to the Samaritans on account of the bitter spirit that controlled them. ³²The disciples were much offended at the disrespect shown to their Lord. ³³They asked, "Wilt thou that we call down fire from heaven and consume them, as did Elijah?"

³⁴But Jesus rebuked their indignation, and said, "Ye know not what manner of spirit ye are of." ³⁵"The son of man came not to destroy men's lives, but to save them." ³⁶How effectually this lesson rebukes the spirit of persecution. ³⁷Professed Christians who would proscribe the faith of others have no authority in sacred record for seeking to force the conscience of anyone. ³⁸Those who are imbued with the spirit of Christ will be kind to their enemies, even as was Christ.

³⁹No more forcable [sic] evidence can be produced that a man possesses the spirit of Cain than the indulgence and manifestation of that spirit. ⁴⁰Cain destroyed Abel because his actions were contrary to his own ideas; but the Lord came not to destroy but to save. ⁴¹It was no new thing that Christ was repulsed. ⁴²Even now he neared the completion of his great work in fulfilling all righteousness; for his face was set steadfastly to go to Jerusalem, and he was urging his way against entreaty and remonstrance.

⁴³The spirit that animated the Samaritans is the same spirit that is found to-day in the religious world. ⁴⁴But religious bigotry to-day is a greater offense in the sight of God than it was in the days of the Samaritans, because of the light shining forth in the character of Christ is greater now than it was before his death, resurrection and ascension. ⁴⁵Any harm done to human agents by their fellowmen is registered in the books of heaven as though done unto Christ himself. ⁴⁶Oppression and persecution is

as offensive to God in this age as it was in the time when Christ spoke from the pillar of cloud or as when he spoke as a man when clothing his divinity with humanity. ⁴⁷The lesson which Christ gave to his disciples in regard to their treatment of the uncourteous Samaritans is a lesson that every one who desires that God's judgments should fall upon the disobedient, should take home to themselves. ⁴⁸We are not to show disrespect one to another by either word or manner. ⁴⁹The human agent is not to indulge in the spirit of revenge, he is not to desire that retribution shall fall upon one who dishonors the truth and the Author of truth.

⁵⁰Christ's disciples were indignant because the Samaritans did not courteously respect the request of Jesus. ⁵¹Knowing Jesus so well themselves, they thought the Samaritans ought to think themselves highly honored in having the opportunity of entertaining the Messiah. ⁵²The seventy were to plainly state the character of their guest. ⁵³Oh how much to learn the meekness and lowliness of Christ [sic]. ⁵⁴He is our example in all things. ⁵⁵Jesus came to represent the character of God, and if he had admitted that a vindictive spirit was proper upon such an occasion, he would not have left a true representation of the divine character. ⁵⁶Those who follow Christ whithersoever he goeth will be doers of his word. ⁵⁷He came to restore, to save. ⁵⁸His heart is ever touched with human woe, and he enjoined upon man the duty of respecting his brother man who was formed in the image of God. ⁵⁹The human family is the

Lord's property by creation and redemption and anyone who abuses his position or his power by oppressing his fellowman under any circumstances, will have to render an account to God, and meet his action as done to Christ in the person of him whom he has oppressed. ⁶⁰Christ identifies his interest with those of the suffering, the hungry, the naked, the imprisoned. ⁶¹He has paid the ransom for man in the price of his own blood.

(W.F.C. Dec. 10, 1894 [Typos corrected].)

APPENDIX D - Chapter 53

Introduction to ST - December 10 1894

Hanna's Life of Christ furnished some parallels for this Signs of the Times article entitled, "The Sending Out of the Seventy." In turn some of the sentences in the article found their way into the DA text. The reader will note that the MS 55, 1894, bears the same date as the Signs article.

Dec. 10, 1894

THE SIGNS OF THE TIMES.

THE SENDING OUT OF THE SEVENTY.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹"AFTER these things the Lord appointed other seventy also, and sent them two and two before his face into every city and place, whither he himself would come." ²The seventy were appointed to go on their missionary journeys some months after the twelve had been appointed to visit the lost sheep of the house of Israel. ³When the twelve were sent forth, they were restricted to the tribes of Israel, lest their missionary efforts should create prejudice among the Jews, whose teaching had been of such a character as to make them narrow in their ideas in regard to the extension of the gospel to other nationalities. The disciples themselves could scarcely comprehend the fact that the blessings of God were for the Gentiles as well as for the Jews, and had to unlearn many lessons that made them conservative in their views concerning the mission and work of the Messiah. ⁵But evidences were given them that prepared them to understand that the tidings of the kingdom of Christ were to be preached to all nations. ⁶Now that their sympathies were broadening, and their ideas expanding in regard to the purpose of God, Christ desired them to act out their faith before he should be removed from them, that there might be no misunderstanding in regard to the extension of the gospel.

⁷Jesus' great heart of love was filled with longing to proclaim the words of life to all nationalities, and he did this in a large measure. ⁸He placed himself in the great thoroughfares of travel, where the crowds passed to and fro, and preached to large concourses of different peoples. ⁹But he saw numerous fields opening up for missionary labor. ¹⁰There was abundant opportunity for the twelve disciples to work, and not only for them, but for a very large number of workers. ¹¹He educated a larger number to employ in missionary work, and, as he sent forth seventy more laborers into the harvest field, he said, "The harvest truly is great, but the laborers are few; pray ye therefore the Lord of the harvest, that he would send forth laborers into his harvest."

¹²In giving his laborers direction as they be-

gan this most important work, he said, "Salute no man by the way." ¹³The salutation to which he referred was not that of giving a friendly grasp to the hand, but was a long series of ceremonies, that consumed time to no profit, and their business was too urgent to trifle away precious moments in unnecessary forms. ¹⁴They were bearing a message that was to be as a savor of life unto life to those who received it, and as a savor of death unto death to those who rejected it; and all these superstitious positions and ceremonies of salutation, if performed, would lessen the importance of the message, and seem to make it of little moment.

¹⁵The sending out of the disciples on a missionary tour was a most important movement, as it was a breaking away from the old, narrow conservatism of the Jews, and would have a tendency to lead them away from their prejudices against other nations, and establish them in a larger charity. ¹⁶He wished them to be impressed with the necessity of planting the truth in the hearts of all men, with the thought that all who would come might come to him, and by believing in him have life through his name. ¹⁷The time was approaching when he should leave his followers, but he promised them that the Spirit should come to lead them into all truth, to illuminate to their minds the Scriptures which he had himself given to patriarchs and prophets. ¹⁸No longer were the Gentiles to be kept in heathenism, or, as it were, in the outer courts of the temple.

¹⁹The Pharisees were daily plotting to stop the spread of the gospel of Christ, and were misinterpreting God's word, by threatening the people, and seeking to intimidate them, and they deepened the darkness that enveloped the souls of men, and bound more firmly the chains of superstition and error that Jesus was breaking from those who believed in him. ²⁰The Pharisees and rulers and rabbis sought to controvert the truth by their assertions, and manifested great zeal in pursuing their evil course. ²¹They hesitated at nothing that would carry out their hatred of Christ.

²²The seventy were sent out with the warning, "Behold, I send you forth as lambs among wolves." ²³But though sent out to meet opposition, they were not to be spiritless, power-

less, and feeble.²⁴ They were to exercise every proper means that was consistent with the commission they were given, and spend and be spent in seeking to win souls to the kingdom of Jesus Christ.²⁵ A new and mighty movement was to be inaugurated, a new epoch was to be ushered in, advancing the truth to the world.

²⁶The world's Redeemer marks out the course the disciples were to pursue.²⁷ There must be no betraying of sacred trusts on the part of those intrusted with the work, no yielding save to one Guide.²⁸ Christ laid out before them the rules of action they were to follow, the manner in which they were to pursue their work, and there must be no swerving from God's word.²⁹ He sent them forth two and two.³⁰ This was the order in which the laborers were to go forth.³¹ He was about to leave the work, and he determined to put it in the hands of faithful men, who would teach others also to carry forward and proclaim the gospel of the kingdom to all nations, tongues, and peoples.³² He had revealed to his followers invisible realities, and had told them of coming events, reaching down to the end of earth's history.³³ He had opened up to them principles concerning redemption and moral government by holding forth to them the words of life, and all these great truths which he had communicated to them were not only for their enlightenment, but that they also might communicate truth to others who were in darkness.³⁴ The seventy were to go forth to do a work similar to that which was being done by the twelve.³⁵ They were all endowed with supernatural endowments as the seal of their heavenly calling.³⁶ They were ordained to proclaim that which Jesus at the beginning of his ministry had bidden them to keep secret.³⁷ Repeatedly Jesus had charged them not to proclaim his Messiahship, but to let the people receive him upon the testimony of his words and works.³⁸ His works presented the divine credentials that bore sufficient evidence of his claims.³⁹ But before the close of his earthly ministry, it was his purpose to give men unmistakable evidence of the fact that he was the Sent of God, that he was the center and soul of the kingdom of Israel; and this fact was to be proclaimed throughout all the borders of Judea; and in his last journey toward Jerusalem, prophecy should be so publicly fulfilled that

no student of Scripture need be in doubt concerning his character and mission.⁴⁰ The specifications of prophecy were to be fulfilled to the letter.

⁴¹It was the work of the seventy disciples to give publicity to his work.⁴² They were his delegated forerunners, sent forth to create an interest in him, and to bear their message heralding his approach.⁴³ The Saviour gave them special instruction as to how they were to conduct themselves, and what preliminary work must be done by them.⁴⁴ The instruction was after the same order as he gave to the twelve when he sent them forth.⁴⁵ Sell that ye have, and give alms; provide yourselves bags which wax not old, a treasure in the heavens that faileth not, where no thief approacheth, neither moth corrupteth.⁴⁶ They were not to keep their goods, bind them up in a napkin, and hide them in the earth.

⁴⁷The Lord would have them put to use the talents he had given them, and put them out to the exchangers, by using every ability of money, mind, or influence in furthering the communication of the light of truth to souls who sat in darkness.

⁴⁸He said to them, "Where your treasure is, there will your heart be also."⁴⁹ "What shall it profit a man, if he shall gain the whole world, and lose his own soul? or what shall a man give in exchange for his soul?"

⁵⁰The spirit of prophecy had distinctly predicted that God would raise up an inspired Teacher, who should instruct the people.

⁵¹This great Teacher had appeared among men, but they knew him not.⁵² Christ, the foundation of the whole Jewish economy, who had been prefigured in sacrifices and offerings, had appeared in the Jewish nation, but their eyes were blinded.⁵³ He had himself inspired the prophets to testify of the manner of his coming, and at sundry times and in divers places Christ himself had spoken to man.

⁵⁴There had been no time when he was not in communication with his chosen people.⁵⁵ The Jewish services all testify of him, pointing out the attributes of his divine character.

⁵⁶Important truth concerning him was veiled in types and shadows and symbols, and was to be fulfilled in Christ's mission and ministry.

⁵⁷From time to time the veil had been lifted and the mystery had been revealed concerning the plan of salvation.⁵⁸ The reality had

been made plain, the substance had appeared, explaining the shadow.⁵⁷ Jesus Christ was revealed, the One who was to give his life for the redemption of the world.⁵⁸ Those who believed in him in the ages before his personal advent, "died in faith, not having received the promises, but having seen them afar off, and were persuaded of them, and embraced them, and confessed that they were strangers and pilgrims on the earth."

⁶¹"By faith Moses, when he was come to years, refused to be called the son of Pharaoh's daughter; choosing rather to suffer affliction with the people of God, than to enjoy the pleasures of sin for a season; esteeming the reproach of Christ greater riches than the treasures in Egypt; for he had respect unto the recompense of the reward."⁶² Here is plain evidence that Moses understood the mission of Christ and the work he was to do.⁶³ He expected the substance to be revealed, and the unfinished economy of the Jewish nation would be completed in perfect fulfillment of every specification that God had given in types and shadows.⁶⁴ He would bring his own system of arrangements to perfection.⁶⁵ For Moses truly said unto the fathers: "A Prophet shall the Lord your God raise up unto you of your brethren, like unto me; him shall ye hear in all things whatsoever he shall say unto you."⁶⁶ And it shall come to pass, that every soul, which will not hear that prophet, shall be destroyed from among the people.⁶⁷ Yea, and all the prophets from Samuel and those that follow after, as many as have spoken, have likewise foretold of these days."⁶⁸ The work of the chosen twelve, and of the seventy who were sent out, was to proclaim the Messiahship of Jesus, and to herald his personal coming wheresoever they should go.⁶⁹ They were to say, "Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sin of the world!"

APPENDIX D - Chapter 56

Introduction to HR - October 1871

This particular Health Reformer article of October, 1871, from the pen of Ellen White illustrates her use of sources other than Scripture,--that is, when she quoted verbatim, using quotation marks. In one instance, she named the work from which she quoted. In the others, it appears that the name of the writer is inconsequential. The topic being treated in the article is that of health and happiness; in particular, the matter of dangerous fashions and cosmetics is being addressed.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 56

120

THE HEALTH REFORMER.

MRS. WHITE'S DEPARTMENT.

BE A WOMAN.

Oh I've heard a gentle mother,
As the twilight hours began,
Pleading with a son on duty,
Urging him to be a man.
But unto her blue-eyed daughter,
Though with love's words quite as ready,
Points she out the other duty—
"Strive, my dear, to be a lady."

What's a lady? It is something
Made of pads, and silks, and airs;
Used to decorate the parlor,
Like the fancy rings and chairs.
Is it one that wastes on novels
Every feeling that is human?
If 'tis this to be a "lady,"
'Tis not this to be a woman.

Mother, then, unto your daughter
Speak of something higher far
Than to be mere fashion's lady—
"Woman" is the brightest star.
If ye, in your strong affection,
Urge your son to be a true man,
Urge your daughter no less strongly
To arise and be a woman.

Yes, a woman! Brightest model
Of that high and perfect beauty,
Where the mind and soul and body
Blend to work out life's great duty.
Be a woman; nought is higher
On the gilded list of fame;
On the catalogue of virtue
There's no brighter, holier name.

Be a woman! on to duty;
Ruin the world from all that's low,
Place high in the social heaven
Nature's fair and radiant bow.
Lend thy influence to each effort
That shall raise our nature human;
Be not fashion's gilded lady—
Be a brave, whole-souled, true woman.

Words to Christian Mothers.

ON THE SUBJECT OF LIFE, HEALTH, AND
HAPPINESS.—NO. 2.

¹OBEDIENCE to the laws of our being should be regarded of great importance, and to every individual, a matter of personal duty. ²Indifference, and ignorance upon this subject is sin. ³The two great principles of God's moral government are supreme love to the Creator, and to love our neighbor as ourselves. ⁴We are under obligations to God to take care of the habitation he has given us, that we may preserve ourselves in the best condition of health, that all the powers of our being may be dedicated to his service, to glorify his name, whose we are, and whom we ought to serve. ⁵It is impossible to render to God acceptable service while we, through wrong habits, are diseased physically and mentally.

⁶We are also under obligation to ourselves, to pursue a course which will not bring unnecessary suffering upon ourselves, and make our lives wretched, we groaning under the weight of disease. ⁷If we injure unnecessarily our con-

stitution, we dishonor God, for we transgress the laws of our being. ⁸We are under obligation to our neighbors to take a course before them which will give them correct views of the right way to pursue to insure health. ⁹If we manifest an indifference upon this great subject of reform, and neglect to obtain the knowledge within our reach, and do not put that knowledge to a practical use, we will be accountable before God for the light he has given us, which we would not accept and act upon.

¹⁰I have heard many say, I know that we have wrong habits that are injuring our health; but our habits have become formed, and it is next to impossible to change, and do even as well as we know. ¹¹By hurtful indulgences these are working against their own highest interest and happiness in this life, and are, in so doing, disqualifying themselves to obtain the future life. ¹²Many who are enlightened still follow in a course of transgression, excusing themselves that it is very inconvenient to be singular. ¹³Because the world at large choose to war against themselves and their highest earthly and eternal interest, they who know better venture to do the same, disregarding the light and knowledge which hold them responsible for the result of their violation of nature's laws. ¹⁴God is not responsible for the suffering which follows the nonconformity to natural law and moral obligations to him. ¹⁵Enlightened transgressors are the worst of sinners, for they choose darkness rather than light. ¹⁶The laws that govern physical life, they may understand if they will; but the desire with them is so strong to follow popular, sensual indulgences of the day that are in opposition to physical and moral health, that they are insensible to its importance, and will not impress it upon others either by precept or example.

¹⁷Their neglect of this important subject exposes them to a fearful accountability. ¹⁸Not only are they suffering themselves the penalty of nature's violated law, but their example is leading others in the same course of transgression. ¹⁹But if men and women would net in reference to their highest temporal good, untrammelled by fashion, living naturally, we should see fewer pale faces, hear less complaint of suffering, and attend less death-beds and funerals.

²⁰Because the majority choose to walk in a path which God has positively forbidden, shall all feel compelled to tread the same path? ²¹The question is not, What will the world do? but, What shall we as individuals do? ²²Will we accept light and knowledge, and live simply and naturally, feeling that we are under obligation to society, to our children, and to God, to preserve health and a good constitution, serene tempers, and unimpaired judgment. ²³We have a duty to live for the interest of others. ²⁴In order to benefit others, many think they must conform to custom, or they will lose the influence they

might have upon the world.²⁵ But when they do this, their influence to reform and elevate is lost, and their example leads away from reform.

²⁶They are on a level with transgressors, therefore, cannot elevate them while their own example sanctions the customs and enslaving fashions of this age.²⁷ The only hope of benefiting society is in showing them a better way by proper instruction sustained by a correct course on our part.

²⁸Those who have means at their command, can do a good work if governed by religious principles.²⁹ They can demonstrate, if they will, to rich and poor, that happiness does not consist in outward adornings and needless display.³⁰ They may show by their own simplicity of dress and unaffected modesty of manners that there are higher and nobler attainments than conformity to the latest styles of fashion.

³¹If we would have happiness in this life, we must live for it, and show to society that we can preserve firm principles in defiance of extravagant and injurious fashion.³² If we conform to the world and bring on disease by violating the laws of life and health, fashionable society cannot relieve us of a single pain.³³ We shall have to suffer for ourselves, and if we sacrifice life, we shall have to die for ourselves.³⁴ We should as individuals seek to do right, and to take care of ourselves by living naturally instead of artificially.

³⁵We cannot afford to live fashionably, for in doing thus, we sacrifice the natural to the artificial.³⁶ Our artificial habits deprive us of many privileges and much enjoyment, and unfit us for useful life.³⁷ Fashion subjects us to a hard, thankless life.³⁸ A vast amount of money is sacrificed to keep pace with changing fashion, merely to create a sensation.³⁹ The votaries of fashion who live to attract the admiration of friends and strangers, are not happy—far from it.⁴⁰ Their happiness consists in being praised and flattered, and if they are disappointed in this, they are frequently unhappy, gloomy, morose, jealous, and fretful.⁴¹ As a weather vane is turned by the wind, those who consent to live fashionable lives are controlled by every changing fashion, however inconsistent with health and with real beauty.⁴² Very many sacrifice comfort and true elegance, to be in the train of fashion.⁴³ The most enfeebling and deforming fashions are now enslaving those who bow at her shrine.

⁴⁴Fashion loads the heads of women with artificial braids and pads, which do not add to their beauty, but give an unnatural shape to the head.⁴⁵ The hair is strained and forced into unnatural positions, and it is not possible for the heads of these fashionable ladies to be comfortable.⁴⁶ The artificial hair and pads covering the base of the brain, heat and excite the spinal nerves centering in the brain.⁴⁷ The head should ever be kept cool.⁴⁸ The heat caused by these artificials

induces the blood to the brain.⁴⁹ The action of the blood upon the lower or animal organs of the brain, causes unnatural activity, tends to recklessness in morals, and the mind and heart is in danger of being corrupted.⁵⁰ As the animal organs are excited and strengthened, the moral are enfeebled.⁵¹ The moral and intellectual powers of the mind become servants to the animal.

⁵²In consequence of the brain being congested its nerves lose their healthy action, and take on morbid conditions, making it almost impossible to arouse the moral sensibilities.⁵³ Such lose their power to discern sacred things.⁵⁴ The unnatural heat caused by these artificial deformities about the head, induces the blood to the brain, producing congestion, and causing the natural hair to fall off, producing baldness.⁵⁵ Thus the natural is sacrificed to the artificial.

⁵⁶Many have lost their reason, and become hopelessly insane, by following this deforming fashion.⁵⁷ Yet the slaves to fashion will continue to thus dress their heads, and suffer horrible disease and premature death, rather than be out of fashion.

⁵⁸Pleasure-seeking and frivolity blunt the sensibilities of the professed followers of Christ, and make it impossible for them to place a high estimate upon eternal things.⁵⁹ Good and evil, by them, are placed upon a level.⁶⁰ The high, elevated attainments in godliness, which God designed his people should reach, are not gained. These lovers of pleasure seem to be pleased with earthly and sensual things, to the neglect of the higher life.⁶¹ The enjoyments of this life, which God has abundantly provided for them in the varied works of nature, which have an elevating influence upon the heart and life, are not attractive to those who are conformed to the fashions of the world.⁶² They rush on unmindful of the glories of nature, seen in the works of God's hands, and seek for happiness in fashionable life, and in unnatural excitement which is in direct opposition to the laws of God established in our being.⁶³ *The Marshall Statesman* says:—

"A physician, writing a series of letters to a school-girl, devotes one to the nice keeping of the hair.⁶⁴ Among other directions he remarks that much is said against wearing switches, or jutes, or chignons, because they breed pestiferous vermin, whose life is fed by their drain on the small blood-vessels of the scalp; but all such objections to these monstrosities become as nothing compared with the objection which arises from the congested condition of the blood-vessels of the back brain by reason of their use. A switch or chignon is a substance which, in itself, is a great conductor of animal heat.⁶⁵ As the back of the head has a great deal of blood, and a great deal of blood has a great deal of heat in it, the surplussage of this heat should be allowed to pass off outwardly.⁶⁶ To wear one of

Source.

these appliances is to keep the heat in, and as the part thus dressed becomes excessively heated, disease takes place in a little while, and the whole bodily structure becomes affected.

⁶¹In women there is such an intimate connection between the back brain and the reproductive structure, that when the former becomes enfeebled the latter invariably takes on morbid conditions."

⁷⁰God has surrounded us with his glories, that the natural eye may be charmed. ⁷¹The splendor of the heavens, the adornments of nature in spring and summer, the lofty trees, the lovely flowers of every tint and hue, should call us out of our houses to contemplate the power and glory of God, as seen in the works of his hands.

⁷²But many close their senses to these charms.

⁷³They will not engage in healthful labor among the beautiful things of nature. ⁷⁴They turn from shrubs and flowers, and shut themselves in their houses, to labor and toil in closed walls, depriving themselves of the healthful, glorious sunlight, and the pure air, that they may prepare artificial adornments for their houses and their persons. ⁷⁵They impose upon themselves a terrible tax. ⁷⁶They sacrifice the glow of health God has given in the human face, the blended beauty of the lily and the rose, and tax the physical and mental in preparing the artificial to take the place of the natural. ⁷⁷The beauty of the soul, when compared with outward display, is regarded almost valueless. ⁷⁸In the anxiety to meet the standard of fashion, beauty of character is overlooked. ⁷⁹A writer has well said:—

Souls "Curis and cosmetics are all in requisition to enhance the beauty of 'the human face divine,' but what is the result? ⁸⁰Youth's roses only flee the faster—old age will creep on apace; rouge cannot hide its wrinkles, nor can it make any face beautiful. ⁸¹We are decided believers in the old adage, 'Handsome is that handsome does.' ⁸²No face has true beauty in it that does not mirror the deeds of a noble soul. ⁸³There is not a thought, word, or deed, that does not leave its autograph written on the human countenance; and we care not whether kind nature has given her child an ugly face or a handsome one, if the heart that beats underneath all is warm and loving. ⁸⁴And if the soul that looks out from the eyes be true and pure, the face will be beautiful always, for it has found the true fountain of youth; and though time may fold the hair in silver, and furrow the brow, yet there will ever be a beauty lighting it up that years cannot dim, for the heart and soul never grow old."

⁸⁵Another writer says under the caption,

"DANGEROUS FASHIONS,

Souls "The cruelties the tyrant of Fashion inflicts upon her slaves—willing though they be—are indeed appalling. ⁸⁶Just to think of ladies upon whom nature has lavished her charms, submit-

ting to the enameling process only to become subject to paralysis or drop dead from its effects. ⁸⁷Others, again, seeking to be fairer than the fairest, are allured by the glaring words, 'Laird's Bloom of Youth,' and similar poetic phrases, and eagerly seize upon the poisonous compounds, only to suffer the excruciating pains of neuralgia or breathe out a painful and lingering existence from the effects of slow poison introduced into the system by their use."

⁸⁸The majority of pleasure lovers attend the fashionable night gatherings, and spend in exciting amusements the hours God has given them for quiet rest and sleep in order to invigorate the body. ⁸⁹Hours are spent in dancing. ⁹⁰The blood becomes heated; the system is exhausted; and while in this feverish state of excitement, the late suppers are introduced, and the unnatural appetite is indulged, to the injury, not only of the physical, but the moral health. ⁹¹Those things which irritate and burden the stomach, benumb the finer feelings of the heart, and the entire system must feel it, for this organ has a controlling power upon the health of the entire body. ⁹²If the stomach is diseased, the brain nerves are in strong sympathy with the stomach, and the moral powers are overruled by the baser passions. ⁹³Irregularity in eating and drinking, and improper dressing, deprave the mind and corrupt the heart, and bring the noble attributes of the soul in slavery to the animal passions.

⁹⁴Many in returning to their homes from these night scenes of dissipation, expose themselves to the damp, chilly air of night. ⁹⁵They are thinly clad with thin slippers upon their feet, the chest not properly protected, and health and life are sacrificed. ⁹⁶By the limbs and feet becoming chilled the circulation of the blood through the system is unbalanced. ⁹⁷Very many have, by pursuing this course, brought upon themselves lung difficulties and various distressing infirmities, which have, in a few months, carried them to an untimely grave.

⁹⁸Many are ignorantly injuring their health and endangering their life by using cosmetics. ⁹⁹They are robbing the cheeks of the glow of health, and then to supply the deficiency use cosmetics. ¹⁰⁰When they become heated in the dance the poison is absorbed by the pores of the skin, and is thrown into the blood. ¹⁰¹Many lives have been sacrificed by this means alone.

¹⁰²The following selection we here insert hoping that it may arrest the attention of some of the votaries of fashion, and excite their fears, if it does not arouse their consciences, to put away the pride and sin which produces such dangerous results:—

"THE FATAL EFFECTS OF PAINTING.

¹⁰³No one can ride or walk through the fashionable portion of New York City, attend any place of amusement, or go to any evening party,

without becoming aware of the horrible fact that many women of whom better things might be expected, have fallen into the pernicious habit of applying to their skins the enamels which, under various attractive names, are advertised and sold in all parts of the land.

¹⁰¹"Not only faded faces, but countenances so young, plump and pretty in outline that they must in their natural condition be attractive, are lacquered over with an unnatural polish of fine porcelain, which produces an effect such as one might imagine if a china doll were afflicted with the consumption.

¹⁰⁵"This practice is as pernicious as it is disgusting—the seeds of death or paralysis being hidden in every pot and jar of those mixtures, which are supposed to be not only innocent, but also to possess the virtues of the undiscovered fountain of perpetual youth.

¹⁰⁶"Some who use them will suddenly have a severe illness; and receiving a private warning from the family physician, will cease the use of the cause of their disorder, and recovering, go through life with an extremely bad complexion, as a reminder of their folly.

¹⁰⁷"Others will drop suddenly, with their features twisted on one side, and perhaps deprived of the use of their limbs. ¹⁰⁸"Others will die outright, no one guessing why! ¹⁰⁹"The effect on any particular person cannot be calculated. ¹¹⁰"What one suffers paralysis from, may kill another outright. ¹¹¹"The only safety is in having nothing to do with any of these baneful preparations."

¹¹²"If God had required of society so great a sacrifice for his sake, what mourning we should bear of the terrible burdens imposed upon those who follow Christ. ¹¹³"But the slaves to fashion take these burdens upon themselves, and make their own life very wearisome with needless care, in their anxiety to keep pace with fashion! ¹¹⁴"They lay upon the altar of fashion, health, happiness, life and Heaven.

¹¹⁵"Christians cannot afford to make this great sacrifice. ¹¹⁶"They cannot afford to sow to the flesh and reap corruption. ¹¹⁷"That which ye sow ye shall also reap. ¹¹⁸"Now is the sowing time. ¹¹⁹"The reaping time hasteth. ¹²⁰"What will the harvest be? ¹²¹"The inspired apostle addresses us, "I beseech you therefore, brethren, by the mercies of God, that ye present your bodies a living sacrifice, holy, acceptable unto God, which is your reasonable service. ¹²²"And be not conformed to this world; but be ye transformed by the renewing of your mind, that ye may prove what is that good, and acceptable, and perfect, will of God."

¹²³"After completing the foregoing, I found the following. ¹²⁴"I have had some experience in using Mrs. S. A. Allen's World's Hair Restorative, also Hall's Vegetable Sicilian Hair Restorative. ¹²⁵"I have made applications of these preparations

upon the head of my husband, to prevent the falling off of the hair. ¹²⁶"I observed that when using these preparations, he frequently complained of giddiness of the head, and weakness and pain of the eyes.

¹²⁷"In applying these preparations, my eyes, that were naturally strong, grew weak, and twice seemed to be greatly inflamed. ¹²⁸"Eruptions appeared upon the lids, and continued for weeks. ¹²⁹"I was convinced that I was poisoned by applying these preparations to the head of my husband. ¹³⁰"We discontinued the use of these altogether, and I have had no weakness of the eyes since. ¹³¹"My husband has been free from the peculiar sensations he experienced while using these preparations, and my experience has been for twenty years, that pure soft water is best for my head and hair.

Z. G. W.

Evils of Hair-Dyes and Cosmetics.

BY SARA B. CHASE, M. D.

THE composition of a very large majority of the "hair-washes," "hair-tonics," and hair restoratives, so largely advertised throughout the country, and which line the shelves of all the drug-shops in every town in the land, consist chiefly of acetate of lead, flowers of sulphur, and some neutral substance as a medium, as water or glycerine.

Many, in former years, took the following formula upon their own responsibility to the druggist, or purchased the crude materials and compounded them for themselves, as they had occasion to use the wash:

Sulphur.....	1 drachm.
Sugar of Lead.....	$\frac{1}{2}$ drachm.
Rose Water.....	4 ounces.

Some found that they experienced unpleasant and, oft-times, serious effects from its use, and would leave it and resort to some one of the various patent preparations so loudly extolled, without knowing that they were using the very same deleterious substances gotten up and sent out with attractive labels under high sounding names: "Mrs. S. A. Allen's World's Hair Restorative," "Ring's Ambrosia," "Hall's Vegetable Sicilian Hair Restorer," etc.

Of course, all physicians acquainted with the pathogenesis of lead in its various forms, must condemn all these mixtures as dangerous to health and life. Some persons are extremely susceptible to the influence of this metal, and cannot use it for a short time even without feeling its bad effects. Others may use it for years with impunity. The latter have no right to offer their experience as proof that it is harmless, for a much wider experience than they can possess, proves it is dangerous.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 56

Introduction to HR - July 1877

Ellen White addressed numerous articles for the various periodicals on the theme of the responsibilities and duties of parents, and, especially mothers. The article appearing in the Health Reformer of July, 1877, is entitled, "The Mother's Work." As far as we could ascertain, only one sentence (#7) later found its way into the book Desire of Ages.

LITERARY MISCELLANY?

Devoted to Natural History, Mental and Moral Culture, Social Science,
and other Interesting Topics.

TEMPERANCE.

If thou well observe
The rule of not too much, by temperance taught,
In what thou eat'st and drink'st, seeking from thence
Due nourishment, not glistenous delight,
Till many years over thy head return;
So mayest thou live, till like ripe fruit thou drop
Into thy mother's lap, or be with ease
Gathered, not harshly plucked, for death mature.

—Milton.

The Mother's Work.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ No work can equal that of the Christian mother. ² She takes up her work with a sense of what it is to bring up her children in the nurture and admonition of the Lord. ³ How often will she feel her burden's weight heavier than she can bear; and then how precious the privilege of taking it all to her sympathizing Saviour in prayer. ⁴ She may lay her burden at his feet, and find in his presence a strength that will sustain her, and give her cheerfulness, hope, courage, and wisdom in the most trying hours. ⁵ How sweet to the care-worn mother is the consciousness of such a friend in all her difficulties. ⁶ If mothers would go to Christ more frequently, and trust him more fully, their burdens would be easier, and they would find rest to their souls.

Ja sil. 5

⁷ Jesus is a lover of children. ⁸ The important responsibility of training her children should not rest alone upon the mother. ⁹ The father should act his part, uniting his efforts with those of the mother. ¹⁰ As her children, in their tender years, are mostly under her guidance, the father should encourage and sustain the mother in her work of care by his cheerful looks and kind words. ¹¹ The faithful mother's labor is seldom appreciated.

¹² It is frequently the case that the father returns from his business to his home, bringing his cares and perplexities with him. ¹³ He has no cheerful smile for home, and if he does not find everything for his accommodation, and to meet his ideas, he expresses his disappointment in a clouded brow and censoring words.

¹⁴ He does not take into the account the care the mother must have had with the restless children, to keep everything moving smoothly.

¹⁵ Her children must have her time and atten-

tion, if they are brought up, as the apostle directs, "in the nurture and admonition of the Lord."

¹⁶ The Word of God should be judiciously brought to bear upon the youthful minds, and be their standard of rectitude, correcting their errors, enlightening and guiding their minds, which will be far more effectual in restraining and controlling the impulsive temperament than harsh words, which will provoke to wrath. ¹⁷ This training of children to meet the Bible standard will require time, perseverance, and prayer. ¹⁸ This should be attended to if some things about the house are neglected.

¹⁹ Many times in the day is the cry of, Mother, mother, heard, first from one little troubled voice and then another. ²⁰ In answer to the cry, mother must turn here and there to attend to their demands. ²¹ One is in trouble, and needs the wise head of the mother to free him from his perplexity. ²² Another is so pleased with some of his devices he must have his mother see them, thinking she will be as pleased as he is. ²³ A word of approval will bring sunshine to the heart for hours. ²⁴ Many precious beams of light and gladness can the mother shed here and there among her precious little ones. ²⁵ How closely can she bind these dear ones to her heart, that her presence will be to them the sunniest place in the world. ²⁶ But frequently the patience of the mother is taxed with these numerous little trials, that seem scarcely worth attention. ²⁷ Mischievous hands and restless feet create a great amount of labor and perplexity for the mother. ²⁸ She has to hold fast the reins of self-control, or impatient words will slip from her tongue. ²⁹ She almost forgets herself time and again, but a silent prayer to her pitying Redeemer calms her nerves, and she is enabled to hold the reins of self-control with quiet dignity. ³⁰ She speaks with calm voice, but it has cost her an effort to restrain harsh words and subdue angry feelings, which, if expressed, would have destroyed her influence, which it would have taken time to regain.

³¹ The perception of children is quick, and they discern patient, loving tones from the impatient, passionate command, which dries up the moisture of love and affection in the hearts of children. ³² The true Christian mother will not drive her children from her

APPENDIX D - Chapter 56

Introduction to HR - August 1877

"The Mother's Duty--Christ her Strength" is the name of the article in the August, 1877, issue of the Health Reformer, which article provided nine sentences that were taken over to the DA. Note sentences 1, 2, and 50-56 of HR which correspond to sentences 27-30, 35, and 36, of chapter 56 in DA. The HR article of August, 1877, was republished the same year in the Signs, November 29.

LITERARY MISCELLANY?

Devoted to Natural History, Mental and Moral Culture, Social Science,
and other Interesting Topics.

GOD'S IMAGE.

THE Maker's image then
Forsook them when themselves they vilified
To serve ungoverned appetite, and took
His image whom they served, a brutish vice,
Inductive mainly to the sin of Eve.
Therefore so abject is their punishment,
Disfiguring not God's likeness but their own;
Or, if his likeness, by themselves defaced,
While they pervert pure nature's healthful rules
To loathsome sickness; worthily, since they
God's image did not reverence in themselves.

—Paradise Lost.

The Mother's Duty—Christ her Strength.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

DA 512.7+ He who said, "Suffer little children to come unto me, and forbid them not," still invites the mothers to lead up their little ones to be blessed of him.² Even the babe in its mother's arms may dwell as under the shadow of the Almighty through the earnest faith of that praying mother.³ The first and most urgent duty which the mother owes to the Creator is to train the children which he has given her for the Saviour.⁴ "Even a child is known by his doings, whether his work be pure and whether it be right."

⁵ Infant children are a mirror for the mother, in which she may see reflected her own habits and deportment, and may trace even the tones of her own voice. ⁶ How careful then should be her language and behavior in the presence of these little learners who take her for an example. ⁷ If she wishes them to be gentle in manners and tractable, she must cultivate those traits in herself.

⁸ When children love and repose confidence in their mother, and have become obedient to her, they have been taught the first lessons in becoming Christians. ⁹ They must be obedient to, and love and trust Jesus as they are obedient to, and love and trust their parents. ¹⁰ The love which the parent manifests for the child in right training and in kindness faintly mirrors the love of Jesus for his children.

¹¹ In view of the individual responsibility of mothers, every woman should develop a well-balanced mind and pure character, reflecting only the true, the good, and the beautiful.

¹² The wife and mother may bind her husband

and children to her heart by an unremitting love, shown in gentle words and courteous deportment, which, as a rule, will be copied by her children.

¹³ Politeness is cheap, but it has power to soften natures which would grow hard and rough without it. ¹⁴ Christian politeness should reign in every household. ¹⁵ The cultivation of a uniform courtesy, and a willingness to do by others as we would like them to do by us, would annihilate half the ills of life. ¹⁶ The principle inculcated in the injunction, "Be ye kindly affectioned one to another," is the corner-stone of the Christian character.

¹⁷ God designed that we should be tolerant of one another, that those of varied temperaments should be associated together, so that by mutual forbearance and consideration of one another's peculiarities, prejudices should be softened, and rough points of character smoothed. ¹⁸ Diversities of temperament and character are frequently marked in families; where this is the case there should be a mutual recognition of one another's rights. ¹⁹ Thus all the members may be in harmony, and the blending of varied temperaments may be a benefit to all. ²⁰ Christian courtesy is the golden clasp which unites the members of the family in bonds of love, becoming closer and stronger every day.

²¹ Many a home is made very unhappy by the useless repining of its mistress, who turns with distaste from the simple, homely tasks of her unpretending domestic life. ²² She looks upon the cares and duties of her lot as hardships, and that which, through cheerfulness, might be made not only pleasant and interesting, but profitable, becomes the merest drudgery.

She looks upon the slavery of her life with repugnance, and imagines herself a martyr.

²⁴ It is true that the wheels of domestic machinery will not always run smoothly; there is much to try the patience and tax the strength. ²⁵ But while mothers are not responsible for circumstances over which they have no control, it is useless to deny that circumstances make a great difference with mothers in their life-work. ²⁶ But their condemnation is when circumstances are allowed to rule, and to subvert their principle, when they grow tired and unfaithful to their high trust, and neglect their known duty.

²⁷ The wife and mother who nobly overcomes

difficulties, under which others sink for want of patience and fortitude to persevere, not only becomes strong herself in doing her duty, but her experience in overcoming temptations and obstacles qualifies her to be an efficient help to others, both by words and example.²³ Many who do well under favorable circumstances seem to undergo a transformation of character under adversity and trial; they deteriorate in proportion to their troubles.²⁴ God never designed that we should be the sport of circumstances.

³⁰Very many husbands and children who find nothing attractive at home, who are continually greeted by scolding and murmuring, seek comfort and amusement away from home, in the dram-shop, or in other forbidden scenes of pleasure.³¹ The wife and mother, occupied with her household cares, frequently becomes thoughtless of the little courtesies that make home pleasant to the husband and children, even if she avoids dwelling upon her peculiar vexations and difficulties in their presence.³² While she is absorbed in preparing something to eat or to wear, the husband and sons go in and come out as strangers.

⁵³While the mistress of the household may perform her outward duties with exactitude she may be continually crying out against the slavery to which she is doomed, and exaggerate her responsibilities and restrictions by comparing her lot with what she styles the higher life of woman, and cherishing unsanctified longings for an easier position, free from the petty cares and exactions that vex her spirit.³⁴ She little dreams that in that widely different sphere of action to which she aspires trials full as vexatious, though perhaps of a different sort, would certainly beset her.³⁵ While she is fruitlessly yearning for a different life she is nourishing a sinful discontent, and making her home very unpleasant for her husband and children.

³⁶The true wife and mother will pursue an entirely opposite course from this.³⁷ She will perform her duties with dignity and cheerfulness, not considering that it is degrading to do with her own hands whatever is necessary for her to do in a well-ordered household.³⁸ If she looks to God for her strength and comfort, and in his wisdom and fear seeks to do her daily duty, she will bind her husband to her heart, and see her children coming to maturity, honorable men and women, having moral stamina to follow the example of their mother.

³⁹There is no chance work in this life; the harvest will determine the character of the seed that has been sown.⁴⁰ Mothers may neglect present opportunities, and let their du-

ties and burdens fall upon others, but their responsibility remains the same, and they will reap in bitterness what they have sown in carelessness and neglect.

⁴¹Mothers, you are developing character. Your compassionate Redeemer is watching you in love and sympathy, ready to hear your prayers, and render you the assistance which you need in your life-work.⁴² Love, joy, peace, long-suffering, gentleness, faith, and charity are the elements of the Christian character.⁴³ These precious graces are the fruits of the Spirit.⁴⁴ They are the Christian's crown and shield.⁴⁵ The highest day-dreaming and most exalted aspirations can aim at nothing higher.⁴⁶ Nothing can give more perfect content and satisfaction.⁴⁷ These heavenly attainments are not dependent upon circumstances, nor the will or imperfect judgment of man.⁴⁸ The precious Saviour, who understands our heart-struggles and the weakness of our natures, pities, and forgives us our errors, and bestows upon us the graces which we earnestly desire.

⁵⁰Jesus knows the burdens of every mother's heart.⁵¹ He is her best friend in every emergency.⁵² His everlasting arms support the God-fearing, faithful mother.⁵³ That Saviour who, when upon earth, had a mother that struggled with poverty and privation, having many anxious cares and perplexities in rearing her children, sympathizes with every Christian mother in her labors, and hears her earnest prayers.⁵⁴ That Saviour who went a long journey for the purpose of relieving the anxious heart of a Canaanite woman whose daughter was possessed by a devil, will do as much for the afflicted mother of to-day, in blessing her children, as he did for the suppliant in that case.

⁵⁵He who gave back to the widow her only son, as he was being carried to the burial, is touched to-day by the woe of the bereaved mother.⁵⁶ He who gave back to Mary and Martha their buried brother, who wept tears of sympathy at the grave of Lazarus, who pardoned Mary Magdalene, who remembered his mother, when he was hanging in agony upon the cross, who appeared to the weeping women after his resurrection, and made them his messengers to preach a risen Saviour, saying, "Go tell my disciples that I go to my Father and to your Father, to my God and to your God," is woman's best friend to-day, and ready to aid her in her need if she will trust him.

⁵⁷If Jesus is woman's friend and helper, the husband, and father of her children, should never feel it beneath his dignity to encourage and sympathize with the mother in her cares, and assist in bearing her burdens.⁵⁸ He should

A 512.45

512.2

APPENDIX D - Chapter 56

Introduction to HR - July 1896

"Self-Discipline Necessary to Parents" is the name of one more Health Reforner article (July, 1896) which provided sentences for DA, chapter 56. The first paragraph on page 516 of the DA is the one containing sentences drawn from the HR article (sentences 8-12). The reader will find it interesting to note the modifications.



Home-Culture===

CONDUCTED BY
MRS. E. E. KELLOGG, A. M.

SELF-DISCIPLINE NECESSARY TO PARENTS.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ It is the work of parents to educate and discipline themselves in order that they may educate and discipline their children. ² Let parents remember that they have transmitted to their children their own hereditary tendencies. ³ Let them deal sternly with themselves as they see themselves mirrored in the dispositions of their children.

⁴ It is a mistake for parents to notice every little defect in the manners of their children. ⁵ They should not criticise them continually; but when they see wrong traits of character developing, they should make most strenuous efforts to correct the wrong by strengthening traits of an opposite nature. ⁶ If you roughly lay hold on these disagreeable developments, and battle with them concerning their objectionable traits, you will be in danger of causing two evils to exist in trying to eradicate one. ⁷ When children are inclined toward evil, seek to draw their minds away from the things that will mar them, and turn their attention in a different channel.

⁸ If you would train a rare pink, or rose, or lily, how would you minister to it? ⁹ Ask the gardener by what process he makes every branch and leaf to flourish so beautifully, to develop in symmetry and loveliness. ¹⁰ He will tell you that it is by no rude touch, no violent effort, for this would only break the boughs, but by little attentions oft repeated. ¹¹ He moistens the soil, and protects the plants from the fierce blasts and from the scorching sun, and God, by his miraculous power, causes the plants to flourish and to blossom into loveliness. ¹² Parents should follow the method of the gardener in dealing with their children; and if the grace of Christ is in the heart, they will seek in various ways to educate and train their children, and to fashion their characters after the divine model. ¹³ Parents

should not be satisfied until they see the image of the divine in the characters of their children.

¹⁴ That cannot be a happy home where love is not cultivated between husband and wife, between parents and children. ¹⁵ If parents have been self-centered, and have trained their children in an atmosphere where love was not manifested in affectionate words and actions, let them change the atmosphere of their home as quickly as possible. ¹⁶ Let husbands love their wives, and let the wives see that they reverence their husbands. ¹⁷ The plan of salvation was devised in order to transform the natural character, and fashion it after the divine image. ¹⁸ When the grace of Christ is received into the heart it will soften whatever is harsh, and subdue that which is coarse and unkind. ¹⁹ Courtesy will be expressed in the affairs of home life. ²⁰ Let father and mother remember that they themselves are but grown-up children. ²¹ Though greater light has shone upon their pathway, and they have had long experience, yet how easily are they stirred to envy, jealousy, and evil surmisings! ²² Because of their own mistakes and errors, they should learn to deal gently with their erring children.

²³ It is very delicate work to deal with human minds. ²⁴ The discipline necessary for one would crush another; therefore let parents study the characters of their children. ²⁵ Never be abrupt, or act from impulse. ²⁶ I have seen a mother snatch something from the hand of her child which was giving it special pleasure, and the child could not understand what to make of the deprivation. ²⁷ The little one burst forth into a cry, for it felt abused and injured. ²⁸ Then the parent, to stop its crying, gave it a sharp chastisement; and, as far as outward appearances were concerned, the battle was over. ²⁹ But that bat-

HOME CULTURE.

207

the left its impression on the tender mind of the child, and it could not be easily effaced.³² I said to the mother, "You have deeply wronged your child.³¹ You have hurt its soul, and lost its confidence in you.³² How this will be restored I know not."³³ This mother was very unwise; she followed her feelings, and did not move cautiously, reasoning from cause to effect.³⁴ Her harsh, injudicious management stirred up the worst passions in the heart of her child.³⁵ To act from impulse in governing a family is the very worst policy.³⁶ When parents contend with their children in such a way, it is a most unequal struggle that ensues.³⁷ How unjust it is to put years and maturity of strength against a helpless, ignorant little child!³⁸ Every exhibition of anger on the part of the parents confirms rebellion in the heart of the child.³⁹ It is not through one act that the character is formed, but by a repetition of acts, habits are established and character confirmed.⁴⁰ It takes far less time and pains to spoil the disposition of a child than to imprint upon the tablets of the soul, principles that will result in habits of righteousness.⁴¹ Let parents be careful never to correct their children in anger.⁴² Never lay your hand upon a child when you are provoked and filled with passion.⁴³ In so doing you will make him partaker of your own impulsive, passionate, unreasonable spirit.⁴⁴ You may ask, "Shall I never punish my child by the use of the rod?"⁴⁵ It may be necessary to whip a child at times.⁴⁶ But every other means should first be tried before you cause your child physical pain.⁴⁷ If you are a Christian father or mother, you will reveal the love you have for your poor, erring little ones.⁴⁸ If you do have to punish your child, you will manifest real sorrow for its affliction.⁴⁹ You will bow before God with the child, and with a heart full of sorrow will ask the Lord to forgive the erring little one, and not permit Satan to have control of his soul.⁵⁰ Present before the little one the sympathizing Redeemer.⁵¹ Speak his own words to him, telling him that Jesus said, "Suffer the little children to come unto me, and forbid them not; for of such is the kingdom of God."⁵² Your prayer, uttered in con-

trition of soul, will bring angels to your side, and the child's heart may be all broken in penitence, and thus the victory be gained without the necessity for using the rod at all.

⁵³ But if you take a child and correct it in the heat of passion, you pursue a course that may make a demon of your child; and then you may wonder why it is that your children have such unlovely traits of character, when you have so faithfully tried to break their stubborn wills.⁵⁴ Here is where so many make a great mistake, in thinking that it is necessary to break and destroy a child's will.⁵⁵ What you are to do is to guide and discipline and train that will by precept and example.⁵⁶ In order to do this you must first learn how to control your own hasty temper, to subdue your own will in order that you may mold and fashion the character of your child.⁵⁷ If you act out your hasty temper, and show an undisciplined will before your child, you will certainly educate him to imitate your words and actions, and you will have no reason to wonder why your children are so bad.⁵⁸ It is your manner of training that is ruining your household.

⁵⁹ Have you love for your child?⁶⁰ Do you cultivate affection for the little ones you have brought into the world, and express that love in your words and manners?⁶¹ If your child is playing with something that is not a proper article for him to use as a toy, do not snatch it from him, but get him to exchange it for something that will be proper for him, and that will give him as much pleasure.⁶² Let your children have evidence that you love them, and that you want to make them happy.⁶³ The more unlovely they are, the greater pains you must take to win their confidence and love; and when they realize that father and mother will use every justifiable means to make them happy, the barriers will be broken down.⁶⁴ What a victory is gained when it is possible to mold the character of your children after the character of Christ!⁶⁵ It should be the constant aim of parents to develop the characters of their children in such a way that they will be fitted to honor God and bless humanity.

A MOTHER'S UNSELFISH LOVE.—"We are told," says Dean Farrar, "of the Chinese sage, Mengtsen, that when he was a child, his mother's home was near a slaughter-house, and that she instantly left her home when she saw the child watching with indifference the pain inflicted upon animals. Her second home was near a graveyard, and again she left when she saw the boy imitating, at his play, the rites of

superstition. That is what a pagan mother did. Would we do the same? Would we at once give up a freehold in an eligible neighborhood if we saw it was tending to make our daughter worldly? Would we give up the chance of a good living,—what the world calls success,—for our son, if it were in some work that would not make him a better man?"

APPENDIX D - Chapter 56

Introduction to ST - April 9 1897

The greatest number of sentences taken over to the DA, chapter 56, from an earlier writing by Ellen White comes from a Signs article of April 9, 1896. Its title is "The Christian Mother a Coworker with God." Sentences 9-28 are the ones evidently used in Desire of Ages, chapter 56 (sentences DA7-DA23).

THE SIGNS OF THE TIMES. April 9, 1896. Vol. 22, No. 15.

THE CHRISTIAN MOTHER A COWORKER
WITH GOD.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

"¹ THEN were there brought unto him little children, that he should put his hands on them, and pray; and the disciples rebuked them. ² But Jesus said, Suffer little children, and forbid them not, to come unto me; for of such is the kingdom of heaven. ³ And he laid his hands on them." + Mark gives a little different version of the circumstance, and says: "And they brought young children to him, that he should touch them; and his disciples rebuked those that brought them. ⁴ But when Jesus saw it, he was much displeased, and said unto them, Suffer the little children to come unto me, and forbid them not; for of such is the kingdom of God. ⁵ Verily I say unto you, Whosoever shall not receive the kingdom of God as a little child, he shall not enter therein. ⁷ And he took them up in his arms, put his hands upon them, and blessed them."

⁸ The disciples thought that the work of the Master was altogether too important to be interrupted, or, as they thought, hindered, by the introduction of a company of children who were being conducted by their mothers into the presence of Christ. ⁹ The disciples supposed that these children were too young to be benefited by an interview with Jesus, and concluded that he would be much displeased and annoyed by their presence. ¹⁰ But it was the disciples with whom he was displeased. ¹¹ The Saviour understood the care and burden of the mothers who were seeking to train their children according to the word of God. ¹² He knew their travail of soul; he had seen them engaged in earnest prayer in behalf of their little ones. ¹³ He himself had drawn them into his presence. ¹⁴ One weary mother had left her home with her little ones clinging to her. ¹⁵ As she went on her way, she met a neighbor, and made known her errand, and created a desire in her neighbor's

heart to have Christ also bless her children.

¹⁶ Thus several mothers came together, leading their little ones along. ¹⁷ Some of the children had passed beyond the age of babyhood to childhood and youth. ¹⁸ When they made known their errand, Jesus heard with sympathy and compassion their timid, tearful requests. ¹⁹ But he waited to see how the

disciples would treat these mothers and their little ones. ²⁰ When he saw them sending them away, mistakenly supposing that they were doing the Master a great favor, he showed them their error, and tenderly received the mothers and their little ones. ²¹ He took the children in his arms, and laid his hands upon their heads. ²² He pillowed the weary heads of the little ones upon his breast of infinite love. ²³ He gave them the blessing for which they came.

²⁴ On the occasion of receiving the children, Christ gave his disciples a lesson which they never forgot. ²⁵ They listened with amazement to the words, "Suffer the little children to come unto me, and forbid them not; for of such is the kingdom of God." ²⁶ The mothers who had led their children to Jesus, were comforted by his compassion. ²⁷ But the mothers of to-day are also to understand and cherish these words. ²⁸ They are to lay hold of them with the same faith as did the women who brought their children to Jesus, who had sought Christ with trembling fear and yet with eager earnestness. ²⁹ These mothers were encouraged to take up with new cheerfulness their burden of care and love, and to work hopefully for their children. ³⁰ Every care-burdened mother should receive the words of Christ in the same spirit.

³¹ But he also stated truth that is of general application. ³² He said, "Whosoever shall not receive the kingdom of God as a little child [ready to be taught and led of Christ, ready to believe in him as a personal Saviour], he shall not enter therein." ³³ Men and women are only grown-up children. ³⁴ They are under discipline to God even as children are under discipline to their earthly parents. ³⁵ The church is composed of men and women who have the same nature, the same dispositions, as did the little children who were brought to Christ. ³⁶ The members of our churches are composed of persons who have like impulses, who manifest the likes and dislikes, who display the same passions, as did the children who upon receiving Christ were to compose his heavenly kingdom.

³⁷ How appropriate it was that these children should be brought to Christ for his intercession and blessing! ³⁸ They were types of what the members of his church should become.

³⁹ The children of God are to possess the humility, the loving trust, the teachable spirit, the innocence, uncorrupted by worldly deception, that were possessed by the little children.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to SP, Volume III, Ch. VI

The chapter in the Spirit of Prophecy, Volume III, entitled "The Passover Supper" covers topics treated in three DA chapters, namely, the betrayal agreement of Judas with the Jewish leaders, the service of humility as introduced by Jesus to His disciples in the upper room, and the communion service. We include here only the sentences dealing with the latter two events. It is a nice exercise to see which sentences, or sentence units, from the SP were taken over to the DA.

APPENDIX D - CHAPTER 72
Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter VI
The Passover Supper

21/83 Jesus met his disciples in the upper chamber, and they soon perceived that something weighed heavily upon his mind.

22/83 At length, in a voice of touching sadness, he addressed them thus: "With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer."

23/83 He clearly foresaw the events which were to transpire in the near future.

24/83 His heart was wrung with grief as he contemplated the ingratitude and cruelty of those he had come to save, and saw pictured before him the terrible fate that awaited them in consequence.

25/83 The interviews between Jesus and his disciples were usually seasons of calm joy, highly prized by all of them.

26/83 The passover suppers had been scenes of special interest; but upon this occasion Jesus was troubled in spirit, and his disciples sympathized with his grief although they knew not its cause.

27/83 This was virtually the last passover that was ever to be celebrated; for type was to meet antitype in the slaying of the Lamb of God for the sins of the world.

28/83+ Christ was soon to receive his full baptism of suffering; but the few quiet hours between him and Gethsemane were to be spent for the benefit of his disciples.

29/84 "And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer; for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God.

30/84 And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves; for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine, until the kingdom of God shall come.

31/84 And he took bread, and gave thanks, and brake it, and gave unto them, saying, This is my body which is given for you; this do in remembrance of me.

32/84 Likewise also the cup after supper, saying, This cup is the new testament in my blood, which is shed for you."

Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter VI

33/84 At this last passover the Lord's supper was instituted.

34/84 Jesus, by his example, then gave his disciples a lesson of humility.

35/84 Having girded himself like a servant, he washed the feet of his disciples, conversing with them the while in solemn tenderness.

36/84 He, the spotless Son of God, stooped to wash the feet of his followers, as one of the last tokens of his love for them.

37/84 When he had completed the task, he said unto them, "Know ye what I have done unto you?"

38/84 Ye call me Master and Lord; and ye say well; for so I am.

39/84 If I then, your Lord and Master, have washed your feet, ye also ought to wash one another's feet; for I have given you an example, that ye should do as I have done unto you."

40/84+ A contention had arisen among the disciples of Jesus as to who should be most honored in his kingdom; for notwithstanding the express instruction they had so often received to the contrary, they had clung to the idea that Jesus would establish a temporal kingdom in Jerusalem; and the late demonstrations upon his entering the city, and the manner in which he had received them, revived this belief in their minds.

41/85 Jesus had checked their aspirations for honor, and now strengthened the lesson by an act of humility and love, calculated to impress them with a sense of their obligations to one another, and that instead of quarreling for place, each should count the others better than himself.

42/85 As the disciples sat at the passover with their beloved Master, they observed that he still appeared greatly troubled and depressed.

43/85 A cloud settled over them all, a premonition of some dreadful calamity, the character of which they did not understand.

44/85 As they ate in silence, Jesus said, "Verily, I say unto you that one of you shall betray me."

45/85 Amazement and consternation seized them at these words.

Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter VI

46/85 They could not comprehend how any one of them could deal treacherously by their divine Teacher.

47/85 For what cause could they betray him, and to whom?

48/85 Whose heart could give birth to such a design!

49/85 Surely not one of the favored twelve who had been privileged above all others to hear his teachings and who had experienced his marvelous love, and for whom he had shown such great respect by bringing them into close communion with himself!

50/85 As they realized the full import of his words, and remembered how true his sayings were, a sudden fear and self-distrust seized them.

51/85 They began to examine their own hearts to ascertain if one thought against the Master found lodgment there.

52/85+ - With the most painful feelings, one after another inquired, "Lord, is it I?"

53/86 - But Judas sat silent.

54/86 - John, in deep distress, inquired at last, Who is it, Lord? and Jesus answered, "He that dippeth his hand with me in the dish, the same shall betray me.

55/86 - The Son of man goeth as it is written of him, but woe unto that man by whom the Son of man is betrayed; it had been good for that man if he had not been born."

56/86 - The disciples had searched one another's faces closely as they asked, "Lord, is it I?" and now the silence of Judas drew all eyes to himself.

57/86 - Amid the confusion of questions and the expressions of astonishment, Judas had not heard the words of Jesus in answer to John's question.

58/86 - But now, to escape the searching scrutiny of the disciples, he asked as they had done, "Master, is it I?"

59/86 - Jesus replied with solemn accents, "Thou hast said."

60/86 - Confused and overcome by the unexpected discovery of his crime, Judas hastily rose to leave the room; but as he went out, Jesus said, "What thou doest, do quickly."

Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter VI

61/86 - There was a touching forbearance manifested in the dealing of Jesus with Judas.

62/86 - It evinced an infinite mercy, giving him one more chance of repentance, by showing him that all his thoughts and purposes were fully known to the Son of God.

63/86 - He deigned to give one final, convincing proof of his divinity to Judas before the consummation of his treachery, that he might turn from his purpose before repentance was too late.

64/86 - But Judas, although surprised and alarmed, was not moved to repentance.

65/86 - He only became more firmly settled in his plan as the discovery of his guilt was made apparent.

66/86 - He went forth and proceeded to carry out the work he had engaged to do.

67/87 - The purpose of the Saviour in pronouncing the woe upon Judas was twofold: First, to give the false disciple a last opportunity to save himself from the betrayer's doom; and, secondly, to give the disciples a crowning evidence of his Messiahship, in revealing the hidden purpose of Judas.

68/87 - Said Jesus: "I speak not of you all; I know whom I have chosen; but that the scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me.

69/87 - Now I tell you before it come, that when it is come to pass, ye may believe that I am he."

70/87 - Had Jesus remained silent, in apparent ignorance of that which was to come upon him, an impression might have been left on the minds of his disciples that their Master had not divine foresight, and had been deceived, surprised and betrayed into the hands of a murderous mob.

71/87 - A year before, Jesus had told the disciples that he had chosen twelve, but that one was a devil; and now his words to Judas on the occasion of the passover, showing that his treachery was fully known to his Master, would strengthen the faith of his true followers during his humiliation.

72/87 - And when Judas should have come to his dreadful end, they would remember the woe which Jesus had pronounced upon the betrayer.

Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter VI

73/87 - The withdrawal of Judas was a relief to all present.

74/87 - The Saviour's face lighted immediately, and the oppressive shadow was lifted from the disciples, as they saw the peace of Heaven return to the pale, worn countenance of their Lord.

75/87 - Jesus had much to say to his beloved disciples that he did not wish to say in the presence of the multitude, who could not understand the sacred truths he was about to unfold.

76/87+ - Even the disciples could not fully understand them till after the resurrection should have taken place.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to MS 35 - April 6 1897

Manuscript 35, 1897, is part of the textual tradition for DA chapter 72. It has 174 sentences, which include a number of Scripture texts. An abbreviated version appeared as an article in the June 22, 1897, Review and Herald. The title was "The Ordinances." About a year later the Review carried the full text of MS 35, 1897, in two articles, May 31 and June 7. This time the number of sentences had increased to 259. The addition of biblical quotations made the difference.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Manuscript 35 - April 6 1897

The Ordinances of the Lord's House¹

¹Then came the day of unleavened bread, when the Passover must be killed. ²And he sent Peter and John, saying, Go and prepare us the Passover, that we may eat. ³And they said unto him, Where wilt thou that we prepare? ⁴And he said unto them, Behold, when ye are entered into the city, there shall a man meet you, bearing a pitcher of water; follow him unto the house where he entereth in. ⁵And he shall say unto the good man of the house, The Master saith unto thee, Where is the guest chamber, where I shall eat the Passover with my disciples? ⁶And he shall show you a large upper room furnished: there make ready. ⁷And they went, and found as he had said unto them; and they made ready the Passover. ⁸And when the hour was come, he sat down, and the twelve apostles with him. ⁹And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this Passover with you before I suffer; for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God. ¹⁰And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves: for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine until the kingdom of God shall come."

¹¹The symbols of the Lord's house are simply and

¹For the purposes of this report simple "typo" corrections have been made.

plainly to be understood, and the truths represented by them are of the deepest significance to us. ¹²In instituting the sacramental service to take the place of the Passover, Christ left for his church a memorial of his great sacrifice for man. ¹³"This do," he said, "in remembrance of me." ¹⁴This was the point of transition between two economies, and their two great festivals. ¹⁵The one was to close forever; the other, which he has just established, is to take its place, and to continue through all time as a memorial of his death.

¹⁶"And he took bread, and gave thanks, and brake it, and gave unto them, saying, This is my body which is given for you; this do in remembrance of me. ¹⁷Likewise also the cup after supper, saying, This cup is the New Testament in my blood, which is shed for you. ¹⁸But, behold, the hand of him that betrayeth me is with me on the table. ¹⁹And truly the Son of man goeth as it was determined; but woe unto him by whom he is betrayed." ²⁰"I speak not of you all; I know whom I have chosen; but that the Scripture may be fulfilled, 'He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me.'

²¹With the rest of the disciples, Judas partook of the bread and wine symbolizing the body and blood of Christ. ²²This was the last time that Judas would be present with the twelve. ²³But that the Scripture might be fulfilled, he left the sacramental table, Christ's last gift to his

disciples, to complete his work of betrayal. ²⁴Why did not Judas at that solemn service recognize in its true light the awful work he had pledged himself to perform. ²⁵Why did he not seat himself penitent at the feet of Jesus? ²⁶He had not yet passed the boundary of God's mercy and love. ²⁷But when his decision was made to carry out his purpose, when he left the presence of his Lord, and his fellow-disciples, that barrier was passed.

²⁸In this last act of Christ in partaking with his disciples of the bread and wine, he pledged himself to them as their Redeemer by a new covenant, in which it was written and sealed that upon all who will receive Christ by faith will be bestowed all the blessings that heaven can supply, both in this life, and in the future, immortal life.

²⁹This covenant deed was to be ratified with Christ's own blood, which it had been the office of the old sacrificial offerings to keep before their minds. ³⁰This was understood by the apostle Paul, who said, "The law having a shadow of good things to come, and not the very image of the things, can never with these sacrifices which they offered year by year continually make the comers thereunto perfect. ³¹For then would they not have ceased to be offered? ³²Because that the worshipers once purged would have had no more conscience of sins. ³³But in those sacrifices was a remembrance made again of sin once every year. ³⁴For it is not possible that the blood of bulls and

of goats should take away sins. ³⁵Wherefore when he cometh into the world, he said, Sacrifice and offering thou wouldest not, but a body hast thou prepared me: in burnt offerings and sacrifices for sin thou hast had no pleasure. ³⁶Then said I, Lo, I come (in the volume of the book it is written of me) to do thy will, O God. ³⁷Above when he said, Sacrifice and offerings and burnt offerings and offerings for sin thou wouldest not, neither hadst pleasure therein, which are offered by the law; then said he, Lo, I come, to do thy will, O God. ³⁸He taketh away the first, that he may establish the second. ³⁹By the which will we are sanctified by the offering of the body of Jesus Christ once for all. ⁴⁰And every priest standeth daily ministering, and offering oftentimes the same sacrifices, that can never take away sin; but this man, after he had offered one sacrifice for sins forever, sat down on the right hand of God."

⁴¹Christ designed that this supper should be often commemorated, in order to bring to our remembrance his sacrifice in giving his life for the remission of the sins of all who will believe and receive him. ⁴²And this ordinance is not to be exclusive, as many would make it. ⁴³Each must participate in it publicly, and thus bear witness, "I accept Christ as my personal Saviour. ⁴⁴He gave his life for me, that I might be rescued from death."

⁴⁵"And supper being ended, the devil having now put it into the heart of Judas Iscariot, Simon's son, to betray

him; Jesus knowing that the Father had given all things into his hands, and that he was come from God, and went to God; he riseth from supper, and laid aside his garments, and took a towel, and girded himself. ⁴⁶After that he poureth water into a basin, and began to wash the disciples' feet, and to wipe them with the towel wherewith he was girded. ⁴⁷Then cometh he to Simon Peter, and Peter saith unto him, Lord, dost thou wash my feet? ⁴⁸Jesus answered and said unto him, What I do thou knowest not now, but thou shalt know hereafter. ⁴⁹Peter saith unto him, Thou shalt never wash my feet. ⁵⁰Jesus answered him, If I wash thee not, thou hast no part with me. ⁵¹Simon Peter saith unto him, Lord, not my feet only, but also my hands and my head. ⁵²Jesus saith to him, He that is washed, needeth not save to wash his feet, but is clean every whit; and ye are clean, but not all. ⁵³For he knew who should betray him; therefore said he, Ye are not all clean."

⁵⁴The children of God are to bear in mind that God is brought sacredly near in every such occasion as the service of feet washing. ⁵⁵As they come up to this ordinance, they should bring to their remembrance the words of the Lord of life and glory, "Know ye not what I have done to you? ⁵⁶Ye call me Master and Lord and ye say well; for so I am. ⁵⁷If I then, your Lord and Master, have washed your feet; ye also ought to wash one another's feet. ⁵⁸For I have given you an example, that ye should do as I have done to you. ⁵⁹Verily,

verily, I say unto you, The servant is not greater than his lord; neither he that is sent greater than he that sent him.

⁶⁰If ye know these things happy are ye if ye do them."

⁶¹The object of this service is to call to mind the humility of our Lord, and the lessons he has given in washing the feet of his disciples. ⁶²There is in man a

disposition to esteem himself more highly than his brother, to work for himself, to serve himself, to seek the highest place, and often evil surmisings and bitterness of spirit spring up over mere trifles. ⁶³This ordinance, preceding

the Lord's supper, is to clear away these misunderstandings, to bring man out of his selfishness, down from his self-exaltation, to the humility of spirit that will lead him to wash his brother's feet. ⁶⁴It is not in God's plan

that this should be deferred because some are thought to be unworthy to engage in it. ⁶⁵The Lord washed the feet of

Judas. ⁶⁶He did not refuse him a place at the table, although he knew that Judas would leave that table to act his part in the betrayal of his Lord. ⁶⁷It is not possible

for human beings to tell who is worthy and who is not.

⁶⁸They cannot read the secrets of the soul. ⁶⁹It is not for

them to say, I will not attend the ordinance if such a one

is present to act a part. ⁷⁰Nor has God left it to a man to

say who shall present themselves on these occasions.

⁷¹The ordinance of feet washing has been especially

enjoined by Christ. ⁷²And on these occasions the Holy

Spirit is present to witness and put a seal to the ordinance. ⁷³He is there to convict and soften the heart. ⁷⁴He draws the believers together, and makes them one in heart. ⁷⁵They are made to feel that Christ indeed is present to clear away the rubbish that has accumulated to separate the hearts of the children of God.

⁷⁶These ordinances are regarded too much as a form, and not as a sacred thing to call to mind the Lord Jesus. ⁷⁷Christ ordained them, and he delegated his power to his ministers, who have the treasure in earthen vessels. ⁷⁸They are to superintend these special appointments of the one who established them to continue till the close of time. ⁷⁹It is on these, his own appointments, that he meets with and energizes his people by his personal presence. ⁸⁰Notwithstanding that there may be hearts and hands that are unsanctified that will administer the ordinance, yet Jesus is in the midst of his people, to work on human hearts. ⁸¹All who in the act of feet washing keep before them the humiliation of Christ, all who will keep their hearts humble, who will keep in view the service in the true tabernacle, which the Lord pitched and not man, will not fail to derive benefit from every discourse given, and spiritual strength from every communion. ⁸²These are established for a purpose. ⁸³Christ's followers are to bear in mind his example in his humility. ⁸⁴This ordinance is to encourage humility, but it should never be termed

humiliating in the sense of being degrading to humanity.

⁸⁵It is to tender our hearts toward each other.

⁸⁶Those who come to the sacramental service with their hearts open to the influence of the spirit of God will be greatly blessed, even if the ones who officiate are not benefited thereby. ⁸⁷Christ is there to make the heart the

receptacle for his Holy Spirit, and to discern the entire dependence of his people upon him for their salvation.

⁸⁸"For thus saith the high and lofty One that inhabiteth eternity, whose name is Holy: I dwell in the high and holy place, with him also that is of a contrite and humble spirit, to revive the spirit of the humble, and to revive the hearts of the contrite ones. ⁸⁹For I will not contend

forever, neither will I be always wroth; for the spirit would fail before me, and the souls which I have made."

⁹⁰"For the iniquity of his covetousness was I wroth, and smote him; I hid me, and was wroth, and he went on frowardly in the way of his heart."

⁹¹These ordinances were established that all might have the privilege of acknowledging their wrongs, and confessing their sins. ⁹²And as the heart is softened and melted under

the movings of the Holy Spirit, the heavenly anointing gives them spiritual eyesight to discern their errors. ⁹³Jesus

has pledged himself to be present in the fulness of his grace, to change the current of the minds that are running

in selfish channels. ⁹⁴This service cannot be repeated

without one thought linking itself with another. ⁹⁵Thus a chain of thought calls up remembrances of blessings, of kindnesses, and of favors received from friends and brethren, that have passed out of mind. ⁹⁶The Holy Spirit with its quickening, vivifying power, presents the ingratitude and lack of love, that has been chilled and frozen by the hateful root of bitterness. ⁹⁷Link after link of memory's chain is strengthened. ⁹⁸The Spirit of God is at work upon human minds. ⁹⁹The defects of character, the neglect of duties, the ingratitude to God, are brought to the remembrance, and the thoughts are brought into captivity to Christ.

¹⁰⁰How the heart of Christ is pierced by the forgetfulness, the unwillingness and neglect to do the things that God has enjoined upon us. ¹⁰¹The heart is in need of being broken, that selfishness may be cut away from the soul, and put away from the practice. ¹⁰²Till we have learned the lessons that Christ desires to teach us in this preparatory service, the Witness will respond to the desires implanted in the heart for a higher spiritual life.

¹⁰³"Yet a little while, and the world seeth me no more; but ye see me: because I live, ye shall live also. ¹⁰⁴At that day ye shall know that I am in my Father, and ye in me, and I in you. ¹⁰⁵He that hath my commandments, and keepeth them, he it is that loveth me, and he that loveth me shall be loved of my Father, and I will love him, and will

manifest Myself to him." ¹⁰⁶Christ does indeed manifest himself unto the believers who thus reveal their faith by coming together at the communion table, with the simplicity of children, to remember Jesus, his words, and his requirements, determined to exclude from the heart all selfishness and love of deformity.

¹⁰⁷The broken bread and pure juice of the grape are to represent the broken body and spilled blood of the Son of God. ¹⁰⁸Bread that [is] leavened should not come on to the communion table. ¹⁰⁹The unleavened bread is the only correct representation of the Lord's body. ¹¹⁰Nothing fermented is to be used. ¹¹¹Only the pure fruit of the vine and the unleavened bread are to be employed.

¹¹²We do not come to the ordinance of the Lord's house merely as a form. ¹¹³As we gather around the table of our Lord, we are not to make it our business to ponder over our shortcomings and depreciate ourselves. ¹¹⁴The ordinance of feet washing embraces all this. ¹¹⁵"But the Comforter, which is the Holy Ghost, whom the Father will send in my name, he shall teach you all things, and bring all things to your remembrance, whatsoever I have said unto you." ¹¹⁶We are not to come with our minds diverted to our past experience in the religious life, whether that experience be elevating or depressing. ¹¹⁷We are not to come to revive in our minds the ill treatment we have received at the hands of our brethren. ¹¹⁸The ordinance of humility was to clear our

minds of the rubbish that has been permitted to accumulate.
119We have assembled now to meet with Jesus Christ, to
commune with him. 120Every heart is to be opened to the
bright beams of the Sun of Righteousness. 121Our minds and
hearts are to be fixed on Christ as the great center, on
whom our hopes of eternal life depend. 122We are not to
stand in the shadow, but in the saving light of the cross.
123With hearts cleansed with his most precious blood, and in
full consciousness of his presence, although unseen, we may
listen to his voice, that thrills the soul with the words,
"Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you; not as
the world giveth give I unto you. 124Let not your heart be
troubled, neither let it be afraid." 125On these occasions
heaven is brought very near to the true members of the
Lord's family, and they are brought into sweet communion one
with another.

126There can be no union between our souls and God
except through Christ. 127The union and love between
brother and brother must be cemented and rendered eternal by
the love of Jesus. 128Then do we not assemble around the
communion table to meet and converse with Jesus as we
receive the bread and wine that symbolizes his broken body
and spilled blood? 129Thus we must feed on Christ, or we
can have no communion with him.

130Christ knows that if we allow our minds to become
engrossed with earthly things, we should forget him in whom

our hopes of eternal life are centered; that we should love the life-giving power, the peace and joy, which the Lord wishes us to receive and retain. ¹³¹And he said, "If ye keep my commandments, ye shall abide in my love, even as I have kept my Father's commandments, and abide in his love. ¹³²These things have I spoken unto you, that my joy might remain in you, that your joy might be full. ¹³³This is my commandment, That ye love one another, as I have loved you."

¹³⁴These things we are never to forget. ¹³⁵The Lord [love] of Jesus, with its constraining power, is to be kept fresh in the memory. ¹³⁶We must not forget him who is our strength and our sufficiency. ¹³⁷He has instituted this service, that it may speak constantly to our hearts of the love of God that has been expressed in our behalf. ¹³⁸He gave us all that it is possible for him to give, he gave his life for the life of the world.

¹³⁹And his appeal to our love is strikingly made in the words of the apostle Paul, "For I have received of the Lord that which also I delivered unto you, That the Lord Jesus the same night in which he was betrayed took bread; and when he had given thanks, he brake it, and said, Take, eat; this is my body which is broken for you; this do in remembrance of me. ¹⁴⁰After the same manner also he took the cup when he had supped, saying, This cup is the New Testament in my blood; this do ye as oft as ye drink it, in remembrance of Me. ¹⁴¹For as often as ye eat this bread and drink this

cup, ye do show the Lord's death till he come. ¹⁴²Therefore whosoever shall eat this bread and drink this cup of the Lord unworthily, shall be guilty of the body and blood of the Lord. ¹⁴³But let a man examine himself, and so let him eat of that bread and drink of the cup. ¹⁴⁴For he that eateth and drinketh unworthily, eateth and drinketh damnation to himself, not discerning the Lord's body. ¹⁴⁵For this cause many are weak and sickly among you, and many sleep. ¹⁴⁶For if we would judge ourselves, we should not be judged. ¹⁴⁷But when we are judged, we are chastened of the Lord, that we should not be condemned with the world. ¹⁴⁸Wherefore, my brethren, when ye come together to eat, tarry one for another. ¹⁴⁹And if any man hunger, let him eat at home; that ye come not together unto condemnation. ¹⁵⁰And the rest will I set in order when I come."

¹⁵¹The second appearing of Christ in the clouds of heaven is ever to be kept before us. ¹⁵²Almost his last words of consolation to his disciples were, "Let not your hearts be troubled; ye believe in God, believe also in me. ¹⁵³In my Father's house are many mansions; if it were not so, I would have told you. ¹⁵⁴I go to prepare a place for you. ¹⁵⁵And if I go and prepare a place for you, I will come again, and receive you unto myself; that where I am, there ye may be also."

¹⁵⁶And the communion is to be a constant reminder of this. ¹⁵⁷Christ says, Under a conviction of sin, remember

that I died for you. ¹⁵⁸When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for my sake and the gospel's, remember that my love was so great that I gave my life for you. ¹⁵⁹Will you evince your love for me if required to die for me? ¹⁶⁰When you feel your duties stern and severe, and almost too heavy to bear, will you remember that it was for your sake that I endured the cross, despising the shame? ¹⁶¹When your hearts shrink from the trying ordeal, remember that your Redeemer liveth, to make intercession for you. ¹⁶²"Be of good cheer, I have overcome the world."

¹⁶³Christ declared, "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of man, and drink his blood, ye have no life in you." ¹⁶⁴We cannot as individuals maintain our bodily life unless we eat and drink for ourselves of temporal things. ¹⁶⁵In order to maintain spiritual life and health, we must feed on Christ by studying his word, and doing those things he has commanded us in the word. ¹⁶⁶This will constitute a close union with Christ. ¹⁶⁷The branch that bears fruit must be in the vine, a part of it, receiving nourishment from the parent stock. ¹⁶⁸This is living by faith upon the Son of God. ¹⁶⁹Christ has declared, "I am the true vine, and my Father is the husbandman. ¹⁷⁰Every branch in me that beareth not fruit, he taketh away; and every branch that beareth fruit, he purgeth it, that it may bring forth more fruit. ¹⁷¹Now ye are clean through the word which I have spoken unto you.

¹⁷²Abide in me, and I in you. ¹⁷³The branch cannot bear fruit of itself, except it abide in the vine, no more can ye, except ye abide in me. ¹⁷⁴I am the vine, ye are the branches; he that abideth in me, and I in him, the same bringeth forth much fruit; for without me ye can do nothing."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to RH - June 22 1897

"The Ordinances" is the title of the first RH article which stems in large part from Manuscript 35, 1897. The reader will notice that parallels to DA chapter 72 are scattered throughout, especially in sentences 65 through 83, and sentences 91 through 96.

THE REVIEW AND HERALD, JUNE 22, 1897

THE ORDINANCES.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

D 71, 72

The symbols of the Lord's house are simple and plainly understood, and the truths represented by them are of the deepest significance to us. In instituting the sacramental service to take the place of the Passover, Christ left for his church a memorial of his great sacrifice for man. ³ "This do," he said, "in remembrance of me." ⁴ This was the point of transition between two economies and their two great festivals. ⁵ The one was to close forever; the other, which he had just established, was to take its place, and to continue through all time as the memorial of his death. ⁶ "And he took bread, and gave thanks, and broke it, and gave unto them, saying, This is my body which is given for you: this do in remembrance of me." ⁷ Likewise also the cup after supper, saying, This cup is the new testament in my blood, which is shed for you. ⁸ But, behold, the hand of him that betrayeth me is with me on the table. And truly the Son of Man goeth, as it was determined: but woe unto that man by whom he is betrayed! ⁹ "I speak not of you all: I know

whom I have chosen: but that the scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me."

¹¹ With the rest of the disciples, Judas partook of the bread and wine symbolizing the body and blood of Christ. ¹² This was the last time that Judas would be present with the twelve; but that the scripture might be fulfilled, he left the sacramental table, Christ's last gift to his disciples, to complete his work of betrayal. ¹³ O why did not Judas at that solemn service recognize in its true light the awful work he had pledged himself to perform? ¹⁴ Why did he not throw himself penitent at the feet of Jesus? ¹⁵ He had not yet passed the boundary of God's mercy and love. ¹⁶ But when his decision was made to carry out his purpose, when he left the presence of his Lord and fellow disciples, that barrier was passed.

¹⁷ In this last act of Christ in partaking with his disciples of the bread and wine, he pledged himself to them as their Redeemer by a new covenant, in which it was written and sealed that upon all who will receive Christ by faith will be bestowed all the blessings that heaven can supply, both in this life and in the future immortal life.

¹⁸ This covenant deed was to be ratified by Christ's own blood, which it had been the office of the old sacrificial offerings to keep before the minds of his chosen people. ¹⁹ Christ designed that this supper should be often commemorated, in order

to bring to our remembrance his sacrifice in giving his life for the remission of the sins of all who will believe on him and receive him. ²⁰ This ordinance is not to be exclusive, as many would make it. ²¹ Each must participate in it publicly, and thus say: "I accept Christ as my personal Saviour. ²² He gave his life for me, that I might be rescued from death."

²³ The children of God are to bear in mind that God is brought sacredly near on every such occasion as the service of feet-washing. ²⁴ As they come up to this ordinance, they should bring to their remembrance the words of the Lord of life and glory: "Know ye what I have done to you? Ye call me Master and Lord: and ye say well; for so I am. ²⁵ If I then, your Lord and Master, have washed your feet; ye also ought to wash one another's feet. ²⁶ For I have given you an example, that ye should do as I have done to you. ²⁷ Verily, verily, I say unto you, The servant is not greater than his lord; neither he that is sent greater than he that sent him. ²⁸ If ye know these things, happy are ye if ye do them."

²⁹ The object of this service is to call to mind the humility of our Lord, and the lessons he has given in washing the feet of his disciples. ³⁰ There is in man a disposition to esteem himself more highly than his brother, to work for himself, to serve himself, to seek the highest place; and often evil surmisings and bitterness of spirit spring up over mere trifles. ³¹ This ordinance, preceding the Lord's Supper, is to clear away these misunderstandings, to bring man out of his selfishness, down from his stilts of self-exaltation, to the humility of spirit that will lead him to wash his brother's feet. ³² It is not in God's plan that this should be deferred because some are considered unworthy to engage in it. ³³ The Lord washed the feet of Judas. ³⁴ He did not refuse him a place at the table, although he knew that he would leave that table to act his part in the betrayal of his Lord. ³⁵ It is not possible for human beings to tell who is worthy, and who is not. ³⁶ They cannot read the secrets of the soul. ³⁷ It is not for them to say, "I will not attend the ordinance if such a one is present to act a part." ³⁸ Nor has God left it to man to say who shall present themselves on these occasions.

³⁹ The ordinance of feet-washing has been especially enjoined by Christ, and on these occasions the Holy Spirit is present to witness and put a seal to his ordinance. ⁴⁰ He is there to convict and soften the heart. ⁴¹ He draws the believers together, and makes them one in heart. ⁴² They are made to feel that Christ indeed is present to clear away the rubbish that has accumulated to separate the hearts of the children of God from him.

June 22, 1897

ADVENT REVIEW AND SABBATH HERALD.

⁴⁴These ordinances are regarded too much as a form, and not as a sacred thing to call to mind the Lord Jesus. ⁴⁵Christ ordained them, and delegated his power to his ministers, who have the treasure in earthen vessels. ⁴⁶They are to superintend these special appointments of the One who established them to continue to the close of time. ⁴⁷It is in these, his own appointments, that he meets with and energizes his people by his personal presence. ⁴⁸Notwithstanding that there may be hearts and hands that are un sanctified who will administer the ordinance, yet Jesus is in the midst of his people to work on human hearts. ⁴⁹All who keep before them, in the act of feet-washing, the humiliation of Christ, all who will keep their hearts humble, who will keep in view the true tabernacle and service, which the Lord pitched and not man, will never fail to derive benefit from every discourse given, and spiritual strength from every communion. ⁵⁰They are established for a purpose. ⁵¹Christ's followers are to bear in mind the example of Christ in his humility. ⁵²This ordinance is to encourage humility, but it should never be termed humiliating in the sense of being degrading to humanity. ⁵³It is to tender our hearts toward one another. ⁵⁴Those who come to the sacramental service with their hearts open to the influences of the Spirit of God will be greatly blessed, even if the ones who officiate are not benefited thereby.

⁵⁵How the heart of Christ is pierced by the forgetfulness, the unwillingness and neglect, to do the things that God has enjoined upon us!

⁵⁶The heart needs to be broken, that selfishness may be cut away from the soul and put away from the practise. ⁵⁷If we have learned the lessons that Christ desires to teach us in this preparatory service, the witness will respond to the feelings implanted in the heart for a higher spiritual life.

⁵⁸The broken bread and pure juice of the grape are to represent the broken body and spilled blood of the Son of God. ⁵⁹Bread that is leavened must not come on the communion table.

⁶⁰The unleavened bread is the only correct representation of the Lord's Supper. ⁶¹Nothing fermented is to be used—only the pure fruit of the vine and unleavened bread are to be used.

⁶²We do not come to the ordinances of the Lord's house merely as a form. ⁶³We do not make it our business, as we gather around the table of our Lord, to ponder about and mourn over our shortcomings. ⁶⁴The ordinance of feet-washing embraced all this. ⁶⁵"But the Comforter, which is the Holy Ghost, whom the Father will send in my name, he shall teach you all things, and bring all things to your remembrance, whatsoever I have said unto you." ⁶⁶We do not come

with our minds diverted to our past experience in the religious life, whether that experience is elevating or depressing. ⁶⁷We do not come to revive in our minds the ill-treatment we have received at the hands of our brethren. ⁶⁸The ordinance of humility is to clear our moral horizon of the rubbish that has been permitted to accumulate. ⁶⁹We have assembled now to meet with Jesus Christ, to commune with him. ⁷⁰Every heart is to be open to the bright beams of the Son of Righteousness. ⁷¹Our minds and hearts are to be fixed on Christ as the great center on whom our hopes of eternal life depend. ⁷²We are not to stand in the shadow, but in the saving light of the cross. ⁷³With hearts cleansed by his most precious blood, and in full consciousness of his presence, although unseen, we may listen to his voice that thrills the soul with the words: "Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you." ⁷⁴Let not your heart be troubled, neither let it be afraid. ⁷⁵On these occasions, heaven is brought very near to the true members of the Lord's family, and they are brought into sweet communion one with another.

⁷⁶These things we are never to forget. ⁷⁷The love of Jesus, with its convincing power, is to be kept fresh in the memory. ⁷⁸We must not forget him who is our strength and our sufficiency. ⁷⁹He has instituted this service that it may speak constantly to our senses of the love of God that has been expressed in our behalf. ⁸⁰He gave us all that it was possible for him to give,—he gave his life for the life of the world,—and his appeal to our love is strikingly made in the words of the apostle Paul, recorded in 1 Cor. 11:23-34.

⁸¹The second appearing of Christ in the clouds of heaven is ever to be kept before us. ⁸²Almost his last words of consolation to his disciples were: "Let not your heart be troubled: ye believe in God, believe also in me." ⁸³In my Father's house are many mansions: if it were not so, I would have told you. ⁸⁴I go to prepare a place for you. ⁸⁵And if I go and prepare a place for you, I will come again, and receive you unto myself: that where I am, there ye may be also."

⁸⁶And the communion is to be a constant reminder of this. ⁸⁷Says Christ: Under a conviction of sin, remember that I died for you. ⁸⁸When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for my sake and the gospel's, remember that my love was so great that I gave my life for you. ⁸⁹Will you evidence your love for me, if required to die for me? ⁹⁰When you feel your duties stern and severe, and almost too heavy to bear, will you remember that it was for your sake that I endured the cross, despising the shame? ⁹¹When

The Review and Herald,

your heart shrinks from the trying ordeal, remember that your Redeemer liveth to make intercession for you.⁹² "Be of good cheer; I have overcome the world."

⁹³ Christ declared, "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of Man, and drink his blood, ye have no life in you."

⁹⁴ We cannot as individuals maintain our bodily life unless we eat and drink for ourselves of temporal food.⁹⁵ In order to maintain spiritual life and health, we must feed on Jesus Christ, which is studying his word, and doing those things that he has commended in that word.⁹⁶ This will constitute a close union with Christ.⁹⁷ The branch that bears fruit must be in the vine, a part of it, receiving nourishment from the parent stalk.

⁹⁸ This is living by faith upon the Son of God.

⁹⁹ Christ has declared: "I am the true vine, and my Father is the husbandman.¹⁰⁰ Every branch in me that beareth not fruit he taketh away: and every branch that beareth fruit, he purgeth it, that it may bring forth more fruit.¹⁰¹ Now ye are clean through the word which I have spoken unto you.¹⁰² Abide in me, and I in you.¹⁰³ As the branch cannot bear fruit of itself, except it abide in the vine; no more can ye, except ye abide in me.¹⁰⁴ I am the vine, ye are the branches: he that abideth in me, and I in him, the same bringeth forth much fruit: for without me ye can do nothing."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to Manuscript 47 1897

Writings on the topic of the Lord's Supper written prior to Desire of Ages, chapter 72, are scarce. In fact there are four texts--that is, in book form, periodical article, or manuscript--that are precursors to the chapter at hand. Manuscript 47, 1897, is one of the four texts just mentioned. Actually, only pages 4-6 are given here. The topic is Judas and what he is experiencing at the time of the last sacramental supper with his Lord.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Manuscript 47 - 1897

¹Judas was given every opportunity to receive Christ as his personal Saviour, but he refused this gift. ²In many respects he acted as Christ's disciple. ³He manifested an interest in His work, and in a certain sense believed on Him. ⁴But Christ read beneath the surface. ⁵He saw the true inwardness of the heart. ⁶He knew that Judas was not converted. ⁷John says, "As many as received him, to them gave he power to become the sons of God." ⁸Judas had never received Christ; he was not a true son of God. ⁹He had not lost something once possessed. ¹⁰He had never experienced the soul cleansing, the change of character, that constitutes conversion.

¹¹"Ye are clean," Christ said, "but not all. . . . I speak not of you all. ¹²I know whom I have chosen." ¹³Who are Christ's chosen ones?--Those who are rendering obedience to his lessons. ¹⁴Judas was not chosen, because he was not obedient. ¹⁵He did not believe in Christ as his personal Saviour. ¹⁶He did not think that his character needed Christ's transforming grace.

¹⁷Judas had valuable qualities, but there were some traits in his character that would have to be cut away before he could be saved. ¹⁸He must be born again, not of corruptible seed, but of incorruptible. ¹⁹Knowing that he was being corrupted by covetousness, Christ gave him the privilege of hearing many precious lessons. ²⁰He heard

Christ laying down the principles outlining the character which all must possess who would enter Christ's kingdom.

²¹But Judas would not yield his will and his way to Christ.

²²Because Judas would not believe in Christ, he fulfilled the Scripture, "He that eateth bread with me (referring to the sacramental supper), hath lifted up his heel against me.

²³Now I tell you before it come to pass, that when it come to pass, ye may believe that I am he."

²⁴But though Jesus knew Judas from the beginning, He washed his feet. ²⁵He who was to betray his Lord was privileged to unite with Him in partaking of the sacrament.

²⁶And today none who claim to be Christians should be excluded from this service, for who can read hearts? ²⁷Who can distinguish the tares from the wheat?

²⁸I would that we could all remember as we assemble to celebrate the ordinances, that there are present messengers unseen by human eyes. ²⁹There may be a Judas in the

company, and if so, messengers from the prince of darkness are present, for they attend all who refuse to be worked by the Holy Spirit. ³⁰Heavenly angels are present also.

³¹They listened with regret to the contention between the disciples, which marred Christ's last evening with them.

³²But the disciples knew not that angels were present.

³³Those unseen visitants are present on every such occasion. ³⁴There may come in among you those who are not in heart united with truth and holiness, but who may wish to

take part in these services. ³⁵Forbid them not. ³⁶There
are witnesses present who were present when Jesus washed the
feet of His disciples, and of Judas. ³⁷More than human eyes
beheld the scene.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to RH - May 31 1898

The following Review article, entitled "The Lord's Supper and the Ordinance of Feet-Washing," essentially represents the first half of MS 35, 1897. The beginning portion of the article does deal with DA chapter 71, before getting into the actual occasion of chapter 72.

VOL. 75, No. 22.

The Review and Herald,

THE LORD'S SUPPER AND THE ORDINATION OF FEET-WASHING.—NO. 1.

MRS. E. G. WHITE. D 71, 72

“THEN came the day of unleavened bread; when the passover must be killed.² And he sent Peter and John, saying, Go and prepare us the passover, that we may eat.³ And they said unto him, Where wilt thou that we prepare? And he said unto them, Behold, when ye are entered into the city, there shall a man meet you, bearing a pitcher of water; follow him into the house where he entereth in.⁵ And ye shall say unto the goodman of the house, The Master saith unto thee, Where is the guest-chamber, where I shall eat the passover with my disciples? And he shall show you a large upper room furnished: there make ready.⁷ And they went, and found as he had said unto them: and they made ready the passover.⁸ And when the hour was come, he sat down, and the twelve apostles with him.⁹ And he said unto them, With desire I have desired to eat this passover with you before I suffer: for I say unto you, I will not any more eat thereof, until it be fulfilled in the kingdom of God.¹⁰ And he took the cup, and gave thanks, and said, Take this, and divide it among yourselves: for I say unto you, I will not drink of the fruit of the vine, until the kingdom of God shall come.”

The symbols of the Lord's house are simple and plainly understood, and the truths represented by them are of the deepest significance to us.¹² In instituting the sacramental service to take the place of the Passover, Christ left for his church a memorial of his great sacrifice for man.¹³ “This do,” he said, “in remembrance of me.”¹⁴ This was the point of transition between two economies and their two great festivals.¹⁵ The one was to close forever; the other, which he had just established, was to take its place, and to continue through all time as the memorial of his death.

“And he took bread, and gave thanks, and brake it, and gave unto them, saying, This is my body which is given for you: this do in remembrance of me.¹⁷ Likewise also the cup after supper, saying, This cup is the new testament in my blood, which is shed for you.¹⁸ But, behold, the hand of him that betrayeth me is with me on the table.¹⁹ And truly the Son of man

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., MAY 31, 1898.

goeth, as it was determined: but woe unto that man by whom he is betrayed!”²⁰ “I speak not of you all: I know whom I have chosen: but that the scripture may be fulfilled, He that eateth bread with me hath lifted up his heel against me.”

²¹ With the rest of the disciples, Judas partook of the bread and wine, symbolizing the body and blood of Christ.²² This was the last time that Judas was present with the twelve.²³ But that the Scripture might be fulfilled, he left the sacramental table, Christ's last gift to his disciples, to complete his work of betrayal.²⁴ O, why did not Judas at that solemn service recognize in its true light the awful work he had pledged himself to perform? ²⁵ Why did he not throw himself penitent at the feet of Jesus? He had not yet passed the boundary of God's mercy and love.²⁷ But when his decision was made to carry out his purpose, when he left the presence of his Lord and fellow disciples, that barrier was passed.

²⁸ In this last act of Christ in partaking with his disciples of the bread and wine, he pledged himself to them as their Redeemer by a new covenant, in which it was written and sealed that upon all who will receive Christ by faith will be bestowed all the blessings that heaven can supply, both in this life and in the future immortal life.

²⁹ This covenant deed was to be ratified with Christ's own blood, which it had been the office of the old sacrificial offerings to keep before their minds.³⁰ This was understood by the apostle Paul, who said: “For the law having a shadow of good things to come, and not the very image of the things, can never with those sacrifices which they offered year by year continually make the comers thereunto perfect.

³¹ For then would they not have ceased to be offered? because that the worshipers once purged should have had no more conscience of sins.³² But in those sacrifices there is a remembrance again made of sins every year.³³ For it is not possible that the blood of bulls and of goats should take away sins.³⁴ Wherefore when he cometh into the world, he saith, Sacrifice and offering thou wouldest not, but a body hast thou prepared me: in burnt-offerings and sacrifices for sin thou hast had no pleasure.

³⁵ Then said I, Lo, I come (in the volume of the book it is written of me), to do thy will, O God.³⁶ Above when he said, Sacrifice and offering and burnt-offerings and offering for sin thou wouldest not, neither hadst pleasure

MAY 31, 1892

ADVENT REVIEW AND SABBATH HERALD

therein; which are offered by the law; then said he, Lo, I come to do thy will, O God.

³⁵He taketh away the first, that he may establish the second. ³⁶By the which will we are sanctified through the offering of the body of Jesus Christ once for all. ³⁷And every priest standeth daily ministering and offering oftentimes the same sacrifices, which can never take away sins: but this man, after he had offered one sacrifice for sins forever, sat down on the right hand of God."

⁴²Christ designed that this supper should be often commemorated, in order to bring to our remembrance his sacrifice in giving his life for the remission of the sins of all who will believe on and receive him. ⁴¹[And this ordinance is not to be exclusive, as many would make it. ⁴²Each must participate in it publicly, and thus bear witness: I accept Christ as my personal Saviour. ⁴³He gave his life for me, that I might be rescued from death.]

⁴⁴"And supper being ended, the devil having now put into the heart of Judas Iscariot, Simon's son, to betray him; Jesus knowing that the Father had given all things into his hands, and that he was come from God, and went to God; he riseth from supper, and laid aside his garments; and took a towel, and girded himself.

⁴⁵After that he poureth water into a basin, and began to wash the disciples' feet, and to wipe them with the towel wherewith he was girded.

⁴⁶Then cometh he to Simon Peter: and Peter saith unto him, Lord, dost thou wash my feet? ⁴⁷Jesus answered and said unto him, What I do thou knowest not now; but thou shalt know hereafter. ⁴⁸Peter saith unto him, Thou shalt never wash my feet. ⁴⁹Jesus answered him, If I wash thee not, thou hast no part with me. ⁵⁰Simon Peter saith unto him, Lord, not my feet only, but also my hands and my head. ⁵¹Jesus said to him, He that is washed needeth not save to wash his feet, but is clean every whit: and ye are clean, but not all. ⁵²For he knew who should betray him; therefore said he, Ye are not all clean."

⁵³The children of God are to bear in mind that God is brought sacredly near on every such occasion as the service of feet-washing. ⁵⁴As they come up to this ordinance, they should bring to their remembrance the words of the Lord of life and glory: "Know ye what I have done to you? ⁵⁵Ye call me Master and Lord: and ye say well; for so I am. ⁵⁶It I then, your Lord and Master, have washed your feet; ye also ought to wash one another's feet. ⁵⁷For I have given you an example, that ye should do as I have done to you. ⁵⁸Verily, verily, I say unto you, The servant is not greater than his lord; neither he that is sent greater than he that sent him. ⁵⁹If ye know these things, happy are ye if ye do them."

⁶⁰The object of this service is to call to mind the humility of our Lord, and the lessons he has given in washing the feet of his disciples.

⁶¹There is in man a disposition to esteem himself more highly than his brother, to work for himself, to serve himself, to seek the highest place: and often evil-surmisings and bitterness of spirit spring up over mere trifles. ⁶²This ordinance preceding the Lord's Supper is to clear away these misunderstandings, to bring man out of his selfishness, down from his stilts of self-exaltation, to the humility of spirit that will lead him to wash his brother's feet. ⁶³It is not in God's plan that this should be deferred because some are considered unworthy to engage in it. ⁶⁴The Lord washed the feet of Judas.

⁶⁵He did not refuse him a place at the table, although he knew that he would leave that table to act his part in the betrayal of his Lord. ⁶⁶It is not possible for human beings to tell who is worthy; and who is not. ⁶⁷They can not read the secrets of the soul. ⁶⁸It is not for them to say, I will not attend the ordinance if such a one is present to act a part. ⁶⁹Nor has God left it to man to say who shall present themselves on these occasions.

⁷⁰The ordinance of feet-washing has been especially enjoined by Christ; and on these occasions the Holy Spirit is present to witness and put a seal to this ordinance. ⁷¹He is there to convict and soften the heart. ⁷²He draws the believers together, and makes them one in heart. ⁷³They are made to feel that Christ is indeed present to clear away the rubbish that has accumulated to separate the hearts of the children of God.

⁷⁴These ordinances are regarded too much as a form, and not as a sacred thing to call to mind the Lord Jesus. ⁷⁵Christ ordained them, and delegated his power to his ministers, who have the treasure in earthen vessels. ⁷⁶They are to superintend these special appointments of the One who established them to continue to the close of time. ⁷⁷It is on these, his own appointments, that he meets with and energizes his people by his personal presence. ⁷⁸Notwithstanding that there may be hearts and hands that are unsanctified who will administer the ordinance, still Jesus is in the midst of his people to work on human hearts. ⁷⁹All who keep before them, in the act of feet-washing, the humiliation of Christ, all who will keep their hearts humble, and keep in view the true tabernacle and service, which the Lord pitched and not man, will never fail to derive benefit from every discourse given, and spiritual strength from every communion. ⁸⁰These ordinances are established for a purpose. ⁸¹Christ's followers are to bear in mind the example of Christ in his humility. ⁸²This ordinance is to encourage humility, but it should never be termed humiliating, in the sense of being degrading to humanity. ⁸³It is to make tender our hearts toward one another.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 72

Introduction to RH - June 7 1898

The following Review article of June 7, 1898, is the second in a six-part series of articles entitled, "The Lord's Supper and the Ordinance of Feet-Washing." As has been stated earlier, there are a good number of parallels from these articles to the material of DA chapter 72. However, that does not mean this series was part of the textual tradition for chapter 72, because of the nearness to the publication date of the book, The Desire of Ages.

VOL. 75, No. 23.

The Review and Herald,

THE LORD'S SUPPER AND THE ORDINANCE OF FEET-WASHING.—NO. 2.

MRS. E. G. WHITE. D 72

Those who come to the sacramental service with their hearts open to the influences of the spirit of God will be greatly blessed, even if those who officiate are not benefited thereby. Christ is there to make the heart susceptible to the Holy Spirit, and to discern the entire dependence of his people upon him for their salvation. ³ "For thus saith the high and lofty One that inhabiteth eternity, whose name is Holy; I dwell in the high and holy place, with them also that is of a contrite and humble spirit, to revive the spirit of the humble, and to revive the heart of the contrite ones." ⁴ For I will not contend forever, neither will I be always wroth: for the spirit should fail before me, and the souls which I have made. ⁵ For the iniquity of his covetousness was I wroth, and smote him: he hid me, and was wroth, and he went on forwardly in the way of his heart."

These ordinances were established that all might have the privilege of acknowledging their wrongs, and confessing their sins at this time. ⁷ And as the heart is softened and melted under the movings of the Holy Spirit, the heavenly anointing gives them spiritual eyesight to discern their errors. ⁸ Jesus has pledged himself to be present in the fulness of his grace to change the current of the minds that are running in selfish channels. ⁹ This service can not be repeated without one thought's linking itself with another. Thus a chain of thought calls up remembrances of blessings, of kindnesses, and of favors received from friends and brethren, that have passed out of mind. ¹¹ The Holy Spirit, with its quickening, vivifying power, presents the ingratitude and lack of love that have sprung from the hateful root of bitterness. ¹² Link after link of memory's chain is strengthened. ¹³ The Spirit of God is at work upon human minds. ¹⁴ The defects of character, the neglect of duties, the ingratitude to God, are brought to the remembrance, and the thoughts are brought into captivity to Christ.

How the heart of Christ is pierced by the forgetfulness, unwillingness, and neglect to do the things that God has enjoined upon us! ¹⁶ The heart needs to be broken, that selfishness may be cut away from the soul, and put away from the practise. ¹⁷ If we have

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., JUNE 7, 1898.

learned the lessons that Christ desires to teach us in this preparatory service, the Witness will respond to the feelings implanted in the heart for a higher spiritual life.

¹⁸ "Yet a little while, and the world seeth me no more; but ye see me: because I live, ye shall live also. ¹⁹ At that day ye shall know that I am in my Father, and ye in me, and I in you. ²⁰ He that hath my commandments, and keepeth them, he it is that loveth me: and he that loveth me shall be loved of my Father, and I will love him, and will manifest myself to him. ²¹ Christ does indeed manifest himself unto the believers who thus reveal their faith by coming together at the communion table with the simplicity of children to remember Jesus, his words, and his requirements, determined to exclude from the heart all selfishness and love of supremacy.

²² The broken bread and pure juice of the grape are to represent the broken body and spilled blood of the Son of God. ²³ Bread that is leavened must not come on the communion table; unleavened bread is the only correct representation of the Lord's Supper. ²⁴ Nothing fermented is to be used. ²⁵ Only the pure fruit of the vine and the unleavened bread are to be used.]

²⁶ [We do not come to the ordinances of the Lord's house merely as a form.] ²⁷ We do not make it our business, as we gather around the table of our Lord, to ponder over and deprecate our shortcomings. ²⁸ The ordinance of feet-washing included all this. ²⁹ But the Comforter, which is the Holy Ghost, whom the Father will send in my name, he shall teach you all things, and bring all things to your remembrance, whatsoever I have said unto you."

³⁰ We do not come with our minds diverted to our past experience in the religious life, whether that experience be elevating or depressing. ³¹ We do not come to revive in our minds the ill-treatment we have received at the hands of our brethren. ³² The ordinance of humility is to clear our moral horizon of the rubbish that has been permitted to accumulate. ³³ We have assembled now to meet with Jesus Christ, to commune with him. ³⁴ Every heart is to be open to the bright beams of the Sun of Righteousness. ³⁵ Our minds and hearts are to be fixed on Christ as the great Center on whom our hopes of eternal life depend. ³⁶ We are not to stand in the shadow, but in the saving light, of the cross. ³⁷ With hearts cleansed by Christ's most precious blood, and in full consciousness of his presence, although unseen, we may listen to

his voice that thrills the soul with the words: "Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you." ³⁸Let not your heart be troubled, neither let it be afraid. ³⁹On these occasions, heaven is brought very near to the true members of the Lord's family, and they are brought into sweet communion one with another.

⁴⁰There can be no union between our soul and God except through Christ. ⁴¹Union and love between brother and brother must be cemented and rendered eternal by the love of Jesus.

⁴²Then do we not assemble around the communion table to meet and converse with Jesus as we receive the bread and wine symbolizing his broken body and spilled blood? ⁴³Thus we must feed on Christ, or we can have no communion with him.

⁴⁴Christ knows that if we should allow our minds to become engrossed with earthly things, we would forget him in whom our hopes of eternal life are centered, and so lose the life-giving power, the peace and joy, which the Lord wishes us to receive and retain. ⁴⁵And he said: "If ye keep my commandments, ye shall abide in my love; even as I have kept my Father's commandments, and abide in his love." ⁴⁶These things have I spoken unto you, that my joy might remain in you, and that your joy might be full. ⁴⁷This is my commandment, That ye love one another, as I have loved you."

⁴⁸These things we are never to forget. ⁴⁹The love of Jesus, with its convincing power, is to be kept fresh in the memory. ⁵⁰We must not forget him who is our strength and our sufficiency. ⁵¹He has instituted this service, that it may speak constantly to our senses of the love of God that has been expressed in our behalf. ⁵²He gave us all that it was possible for him to give,—he gave his life for the life of the world.

⁵³And his appeal to our love is strikingly made in the words of the apostle Paul: "For I have received of the Lord that which also I delivered unto you, That the Lord Jesus the same night in which he was betrayed took bread: and when he had given thanks, he brake it, and said, Take, eat: this is my body, which is broken for you: this do in remembrance of me." ⁵⁴After the same manner also he took the cup, when he had supped, saying, This cup is the new testament in my blood: this do ye, as oft as ye drink it, in remembrance of me. ⁵⁵For as often as ye eat this bread, and drink this cup, ye do show the Lord's death till he come. ⁵⁶Wherefore whosoever shall eat this bread, and drink this cup of the Lord, unworthily, shall be guilty of the body and blood of the Lord. ⁵⁷But let a man examine himself, and so let him eat of that bread, and drink of that cup. ⁵⁸For he that eateth and drinketh unworthily, eateth and drinketh damnation to

himself, not discerning the Lord's body. ⁵⁹For this cause many are weak and sickly among you, and many sleep. ⁶⁰For if we would judge ourselves, we should not be judged. ⁶¹But when we are judged, we are chastened of the Lord, that we should not be condemned with the world. ⁶²Wherefore, my brethren, when ye come together to eat, tarry one for another. ⁶³And if any man hunger, let him eat at home; that ye come not together unto condemnation. ⁶⁴And the rest will I set in order when I come. ⁶⁵Christ's second appearing, in the clouds of heaven, is ever to be kept before us. ⁶⁶Almost his last words of consolation to his disciples were: "Let not your heart be troubled: ye believe in God, believe also in me. ⁶⁷In my Father's house are many mansions: if it were not so, I would have told you. ⁶⁸I go to prepare a place for you. ⁶⁹And if I go and prepare a place for you, I will come again, and receive you unto myself; that where I am, there ye may be also."

⁷⁰And the communion is to be a constant reminder of this. ⁷¹Says Christ: Under a conviction of sin, remember that I died for you.

⁷²When oppressed and persecuted and afflicted for my sake and the gospel's, remember that my love was so great that I gave my life for you. ⁷³Will you evidence your love for me, if required, by dying for me? ⁷⁴When you feel your duties stern and severe, and almost too heavy to bear, will you remember that it was for your sake that I endured the cross, despising the shame? ⁷⁵When your heart shrinks from the trying ordeal, remember that your Redeemer liveth to make intercession for you. ⁷⁶"Be of good cheer; I have overcome the world."

⁷⁷Christ declared: "Verily, verily, I say unto you, Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of man, and drink his blood, ye have no life in you."

⁷⁸We can not, as individuals, maintain our bodily life unless we eat and drink for ourselves of temporal food. ⁷⁹In order to maintain spiritual life and health, we must feed on Jesus Christ by studying his word, and doing the things he has commanded in that word. ⁸⁰This will constitute a close union with Christ. ⁸¹The branch that bears fruit must be in the vine, a part of it, receiving nourishment from the parent stalk. ⁸²This is living by faith upon the Son of God. ⁸³Christ has declared: "I am the true vine, and my Father is the husbandman. ⁸⁴Every branch in me that beareth not fruit he taketh away: and every branch that beareth fruit, he purgeth it, that it may bring forth more fruit. ⁸⁵Now ye are clean through the word which I have spoken unto you. ⁸⁶Abide in me, and I in you. ⁸⁷As the branch can not bear fruit of itself, except it abide in the vine; no more can ye, except ye abide in me. ⁸⁸I am the vine, ye are the branches: he that abideth in me, and I in him, the same bringeth forth much fruit: for without me ye can do nothing."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Diary Book 18 1894

Ellen's White's original work, Diary Book 18, pages 43 and 45, appears here as the typescript (transcribed by Dr. Paul Stauffer) copy from the handwritten diary material. Pages 42 and 44 were missing in our copies of the latter mentioned. Possibly more thoughts from pages 42 and 44 would have combined naturally with those on pages 43 and 45, which treat on the priestly garments, etc. Actually what appears to have happened at the point of page 42 is that several of the pages had been cut out of the Diary Book 18. Since there is no way for the White Estate to retrieve this material, we present what is available. Manuscript 111, 1894, incorporates these thoughts from Diary Book 18. Since none of these sentences are taken directly into the DA chapter 75, though related, they are not part of the textual tradition.

AUGUST, 1894—32nd Week.

MONDAY 3 (215-150)

MONDAY 3 (215-150)
 The rent his priestly robe ^{which act brought him near}
 the sentence of death ^{which was made for him, for}
 him transgressed in ^{in the same sense} as they build. ^{we think must be originally in} Can any and by our law
 to die, but the law of the God of heaven made in ^{reference to}
 his own names glory, that ~~from~~ the priests under any circumstances
 not to remove his priestly turban & to ^{improve} ~~improve~~ his head or
 to end his priestly robe of his dis regard this law he was to die
 out of his perfection in dress, and attitude words and spirit even
 as acceptable to God, and represent in the earthly priest hood the ^{same}
 sacredness of the heavenly service, and the ^{holiness} of God men
 is holy and name greatness and glory and perfection must be as
 far as possible represented by the earthly service, Man's mind can

TUESDAY 4 (216-149)

My kind ^{kind} heart to contribute and broken spirit. But God alone
 God could discern this ^{TUESDAY 4 (216-149)} but the priestly garments must
 represent no break and our ^{mourning} ~~mourning~~ feature become this one & of the
 figure of the perfection of the offering becoming things (these things
 are so great for our burden but sometimes I must ease my mind & its
 burden in presenting the danger of many who claim to be Christians
 wearing their garments ^{are} making an outside show of remorse and repentance
 when the heart is not softened or broken or contrite this is the season

. . . ⁸refusal, he rent his garments, his priestly robe which act brought him with the sentence of death where Jesus could have said of him, You have transgressed. ⁹not in the same sense as they said of Christ Our law for Christ was the originator of the law and by our law he ought to die, but the law of God of heaven made in reference to his own names [sic] glory. ¹⁰That the priests under any circumstances were not to remove his priestly turban or to uncover his head or to rend his priestly robe. ¹¹If he disregard [sic] this law he was to die. ¹²Nothing but perfection in dress, and attitude words and spirit could be acceptable to God, and represent in the earthly priesthood the sacredness of the heavenly service, and the Worship of God who is holy and whose greatness and glory and perfection must be as far as possible represented by the earthly service. ¹³Man [sic] finite man may rend his own heart by a contrite and broken Spirit. ¹⁴God could discern this but the priestly garments must represent no break not one marring feature because this would spoil this figure of the perfection of heavenly things. ¹⁵These things are to [sic] great for me to handle. ¹⁶Yet some things I must mention. ¹⁷I must ease my mind of its burden in presenting them to others. ¹⁸The danger of many who claim to be Christians rending their garments making an outside show of remorse and repentance [sic] when the heart is not softened or broken or contrite; this is the

there are so continuous failures in the things those who claim to be
Christians, outward appearance of sorrow ^{in manifest} for turning away but
their repentance is not that repentance that would turn out to be repentant
of, May the Lord God grant into his church true contrition for
sin & that one may feel the great necessity in all our outward
appearance to reveal the true inwardness of the soul

AUGUST, 1894-32nd Week.

FRIDAY 7 (219-146)

My soul is pained, constantly in sorrow, because of the evidence
before me of the superficial ~~and~~ ^{many} ~~emissions~~ ^{emissions} ~~of~~ ^{also} ~~the~~ ^{claim to}
be Christians, The question arises in my mind do these persons
have any sense of the infinite sacrifice made in their behalf? It was a
priceless sacrifice of Jesus the one voluntary Victim to which ^{was the} ~~all~~ ^{the}
finish & end, all the appointed ceremonial offerings much
more ^{very} impressively pointing to the One complete offering for the sins of
the world, by which Christ had perfected forever them that are sanctified
which enabled him to proclaim on Calvary's Cross
and triumphal voice "It is finished" Who did he speak to? His
Father, ^{Go the word!} Listen to his voice be light hearted and joyful ones,
ones ~~my~~ ^{God my} Father the hour is come ^{Galatians} Save me from this error
What mighty heart tugging words angels of God must gather about

SATURDAY 8 (220-145)

reason there are so continuous failures in those who claim to be Christians. ¹⁹Outward appearance of sorrow is manifested for wrong doing but their repentance [sic] is not the repentance [sic] that needeth not to be repented of. ²⁰May the Lord God grant his church true contrition for sin ²¹0 that we may feel the great necessity in all our outward appearance to reveal the true inwardness of the soul.

Page 45

¹My soul is pained, constantly I sorrow, because of the evidence before me of the superficial conversions of many who claim to be Christians. ²The question arises in my mind do these persons have any sense of the infinite sacrifice made in their behalf. ³It was a priceless sacrifice of Him the one solitary victim to which all the Jewish economy, all the appointed ceremonial offerings made was very impressively pointing to the One complete offering for the sins of the world by which Christ had perfected forever them that are sanctified which enabled him to proclaim on Calvarys [sic] cross with triumphant voice "It is finished" ⁴who [sic] did he speak to? ⁵His Father. ⁶(To the world) ⁷Listen to his voice ye light hearted and frivolous ones My God my Father the hour is come. ⁸Father save me from this hour ⁹What melting heart tingling words ¹⁰Angels of God were gathering about the divine suffering and as they looked upon their loved commander his divinity clothed with

Diary Book 18

humanity they ask with intense emotion Will not the Lord Jehovah save Him? ¹¹Shall not that soul piercing cry of the only begotten Son of God prevail?" ¹²O we ask what if it should what if the doomed world is left to perish in their accumulated guilt and the commander of all heaven again take his kingly crown his regal robe and leave an ungrateful unappreciative people to perish in their sins. ¹³what saith the angels beholding the overmastering anguish of the Son of God. ¹⁴With suppressed emotion the words are spoken, "The Lord hath sworn by an oath and will not repent" ¹⁵Father and Son have clasped hands mutually and pledge to fulfill the terms of the everlasting covenant to give man fallen another trial. ¹⁶Words come from the lips of Christ

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Manuscript 51 1897

"In the Judgment Hall" is the title of Manuscript 51, dated May 20, 1897. The first 141 sentences have to do with DA chapter 75. It appears that nearly all of this particular manuscript follows Farrar's life of Christ as a literary source, sometimes with verbatim phrases and/or clauses, sometimes as a simple paraphrase, or as a loose one. In this same Appendix D the reader will also find a copy of the Farrar text with which to compare the selection that follows.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Manuscript 51 - May 20 1897

In the Judgment Hall

¹It was past midnight when Jesus was hurried from the garden of Gethsemane, through the hushed streets of the sleeping city, to the palace of the high priest. ²This palace was occupied by the principle actors in the plan of obtain[ing] possession of Chirst,--Annas, and his son-in-law, Caiaphas.

³Because Jesus had rebuked the hypocrisy and avarice of the chief priests and rulers, they evidenced a most bitter hatred against him. ⁴The Sadducees were still more bitter, although Jesus had not directed against them so plain and decided a reproof as against the Pharisees. ⁵But it was at his second act of cleansing the temple, that their most bitter enmity was aroused. ⁶In his act in interfering with the merchandise in the temple court, he set aside and condemned all the arrangement which to them was great gain. ⁷He told them that they had made the temple courts a den of thieves. ⁸By their extortion and dishonesty, they had made the service of God contemptible. ⁹Avarice was the besetting sin of the Jews. ¹⁰It was on this point that Judas was overcome. ¹¹The erection of stalls for sales brought in great profits, and any interference with these plans for extortion and commercial income, was an act that would not be tolerated.

¹²And now that Jesus was within their power, all

feelings of sympathy and humanity went out of their hearts. ¹³They were fiends. ¹⁴The bitter contempt and hatred which the ex-High priest had for Jesus, was illy concealed when he accosted him. ¹⁵But he was forced to keep his intense malice under cover as much as possible. ¹⁶They had no legal right to take this matter in hand at this time. ¹⁷They knew they had no charge against Christ by which they could hold him a prisoner or condemn him as a malefactor; but they designed in secret consultation, to charge him with guilt, and thus draw something from his own lips which they could with their own additions, their wresting and perversion, so construe as to make stand against him.

¹⁸The high priest questioned him in regard to his doctrines. ¹⁹But the answer was calmly given, "I spake openly to the world; I ever taught in the synagogue; and in the temple, whither the Jews always resort; and in secret have I said nothing. ²⁰Why askest thou me? ²¹Ask them which heard me," pointing to those around him; "what I have said unto them: behold, they know what I said."

²²Jesus would contrast his manner of work with that of his accusers. ²³This midnight seizure by a mob, this cruel mockery and abuse before he was even accused or condemned, was their manner, not his. ²⁴His work was open to all. ²⁵He had nothing in his doctrines that he concealed. ²⁶Thus he rebuked their position, and unveiled the hypocrisy of the Sadducees.

²⁷His accusers sought to turn the conversation by falling back upon the dignity of their position. ²⁸"Answerest thou the high priest so?" said one, while he smote the sacred face with his hand. ²⁹How did angels of God look upon this scene, and see their loved Commander smitten by sacrilegious hands? ³⁰They longed to take Jesus away from these wicked men. ³¹But Jesus did not retaliate. ³²This insult was a part of the humiliation he was to bear. ³³There was no resentment in his voice as he reproved the illegal act: "If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?"

³⁴At last Jesus entrenched himself in silence. ³⁵He saw that nothing would avail in such company, and before such a tribunal, where neither conscience or fear of God had any control, but whose worse passions were fired with intense hatred. ³⁶Then he was bound, signifying that he was condemned, though unheard and unsentenced. ³⁷Annas had him taken to Caiaphas, his son-in-law, a Sadducee, fully as severe, heartless and unscrupulous as himself, but wanting in force of character. ³⁸In his house Jesus was again illegally criticized. ³⁹Some of the most desperate enemies of Jesus were among the Sadducees, and who with the priests and rulers composed the Sanhedrim. ⁴⁰And as the very existence of the priestly rule was, they thought, endangered by the teachings of Christ, they would resort to any means to get him out of the way. ⁴¹They tried many ways of

waylaying and entangling him; and accused him of secret apostasy.

⁴²They were themselves in bitter animosity and controversy with one another, jealous, and daring not to approach certain points for fear of getting into a brawl with the Pharisees. ⁴³With a few words Jesus could have awakened the prejudices which existed between them and thus have averted their wrath from himself. ⁴⁴But there was one thing on which they were united,--their hatred for Christ, and their desire to put him to death. ⁴⁵To gain this end they sought false witness against him.

⁴⁶We may see the same spirit manifested to-day. ⁴⁷There will be a corrupt union formed between corrupt men, who will seek and employ false witnesses which will be obtained of those whose wrong course of action has been reproved. ⁴⁸The devil is not at a loss to supply the necessity.

⁴⁹Under the influence of the chief priests and rulers, the agents of Satan were willing, for the money offered them, to testify to any lie. ⁵⁰Yet their testimony was so false and contradictory; it revealed itself so plainly as a tissue of lies manufactured by the priests and rulers, that the judges, unjust, and without conscience as they were could not make their stories of any weight, or cause them to bear against Christ. ⁵¹The words they claimed to hear him say, "Destroy this temple, and in three days I will raise it

up again," were misstated. ⁵²It was perjury, having no semblance to the truth. ⁵³They hoped to construe this into a charge of blasphemy, but they failed even here. ⁵⁴And because they could find nothing whereby they might fasten condemnation upon him, they became furious, fearing that after all Jesus might not be delivered into their hands.

⁵⁵Patiently, and without one expression of revenge, Jesus listened to their conflicting testimony. ⁵⁶He was perfectly silent, answering not a word to their accusations. ⁵⁷At last his accusers were entangled, confused, and maddened; they had nothing that they could make stand as a charge against Jesus. ⁵⁸That silence was terrible for them to endure. ⁵⁹They saw that their plottings were liable to fail. ⁶⁰Caiaphas was desperate. ⁶¹He was determined to act. ⁶²Starting from the judgment seat, his face contorted with satanic passion, and voice and demeanor plainly indicating that were it in his power, he would strike down the Son of God, he exclaimed, "Answerest thou nothing? ⁶³What is it that these witness against thee?" ⁶⁴Jesus knew the nature of the men surrounding him, and the impotent madness of his accusers because they could not find occasion against him. ⁶⁵But he remained in silence. ⁶⁶The high priest was afraid that all their purposes were to be defeated unless they could make Jesus utter his own condemnation. ⁶⁷Standing over the prisoner as though he would annihilate him, he said, "I adjure thee by the living

God, that thou tell us whether thou be the Christ, the Son of God. ⁶⁸Jesus saith unto him, Thou hast said: nevertheless I say unto you, Hereafter shall ye see the Son of man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven. ⁶⁹Then the high priest rent his clothes, saying, He hath spoken blasphemy, what further need have we of witness? behold, now ye have heard his blasphemy. ⁷⁰What think ye? ⁷¹They answered and said, He is guilty of death."

⁷²In legal condemnation nothing could be done until the light of day and before a full session of the Sanhedrim. ⁷³And yet the priests had declared that he was worthy of death. ⁷⁴He was now considered fit to receive abuse from the lowest and vilest of human kind. ⁷⁵He was taken from the outer court to the guard room, on every side meeting with taunts and jeers, and cruel mockery in regard to his claims to be the Son of God; "sitting on the throne of his glory," and "coming in the clouds of heaven" were tauntingly and mockingly repeated.

⁷⁶How little did these Pharisees and Sadducees, these priests and rulers, understand the prophecies which they were in the very act of fulfilling to the letter. ⁷⁷What intense blindness comes to the human mind that has turned from light, rejected Bible evidence, and closed himself in with the impenetrable wall of prejudice. ⁷⁸For two thousand years the Jews had looked and waited for the Messiah, and this is the reception he receives at their hands. ⁷⁹That

nation which should have received him as the greatest blessing that heaven can bestow upon a fallen race, refused him, and gave him over to the mob for them under the inspiration of Satan to insult and mock and curse.

⁸⁰But that which caused Christ's soul the keenest anguish was that which he had foretold Peter would come.

⁸¹He heard the denial of Peter, he heard the wicked oaths, and this made more intensely bitter his cup of anguish.

⁸²Christ is now in his deepest humiliation; he is greeted with jeers, smitten by cruel hands, yet he utters no word of retaliation. ⁸³They spit in the face of the Lord Jesus.

⁸⁴And while thus insulted and mocked, Peter, his boldest disciple, is denying that he knows the man who has been his beloved Teacher,--the one he had owned to be the Son of the living God, and having the words of eternal life, when many of his fellow disciples were offended at Christ's words, and walked no more with him.

⁸⁵Then took they him, and led him, and brought him into the high priest's house. ⁸⁶And Peter followed afar

off. ⁸⁷And when they had kindled a fire in the midst of the hall, and were set down together, Peter sat down among them.

⁸⁸And a certain maid beheld him as he sat by the fire, and said, This man was also with him. ⁸⁹And he denied him,

saying, Woman, I know him not. ⁹⁰And about the space of one hour after another confidently affirmed, saying, Of a truth this fellow was also with him; for he is a Galilean. ⁹¹And

Peter said, Man, I know not what thou sayest. ⁹²And immediately while he yet spake, the cock crew. ⁹³And the Lord turned and looked upon Peter. ⁹⁴And Peter remembered the word of the Lord, how he had said unto him, Before the cock crow thou shalt deny me thrice. ⁹⁵And Peter went out, and wept bitterly."

⁹⁶That look was enough; it pierced the heart of Peter like an arrow. ⁹⁷The eloquent anguish of the Master he had loved and served was a picture so vivid, that he could not efface it from his memory. ⁹⁸And he rushed from the company, his heart broken, repentant, remorseful, agonized.

⁹⁹While waiting for his legal trial in the guard room, Christ was not protected. ¹⁰⁰The malice of the ignorant, the brutal cruelty with which he had been treated was assumed by them as a liberty. ¹⁰¹They made manifest the Satanic in their character. ¹⁰²His very nobility and God-like bearing goaded them to madness. ¹⁰³His meekness, his innocence, his majestic bearing filled them with a madness born of Satan. ¹⁰⁴Defenseless and alone, as a sheep before her shearers is dumb, so he opened not his mouth. ¹⁰⁵Justice and mercy were trampled upon. ¹⁰⁶Never was criminal treated in so merciless and inhuman a manner as was Jesus, the world's Redeemer.

¹⁰⁷Christ had reproved their avarice and their hypocrisy, he had laid open the ignorance of the scribes; he had rebuked the Pharisees and the Sadducees, and they had

not been able to controvert his arguments because they were [?] like Cain, this made them furious. ¹⁰⁸His noble, spotless character was so much higher than theirs that they were intent on having him, the representative of all righteousness and goodness, out of the way. ¹⁰⁹He had told them that while teaching the law, they had not kept it; but in its place had taught their own doctrines, the commandments of men. ¹¹⁰And this the teachers in our age are doing.

¹¹¹But now they have him in their power. ¹¹²If their words and arguments were weak, and failed to silence his voice, they have other weapons, such as the church of Rome has used to silence the voice of heretics,--suffering, and violence and death. ¹¹³They had suborned witnesses; but these had been so contradictory that they could not, dared not, use them. ¹¹⁴The charge of the Jews that he had broken the Sabbath of the fourth commandment had been made against him; but the work had been done to relieve suffering humanity and in working miracles, and they dared not come upon this ground for evidence. ¹¹⁵This would have revealed more than they desired to have revealed. ¹¹⁶He had also disregarded their tradition; but on this the Pharisees and Sadducees were at sword's point. ¹¹⁷They dare not bring this charge; for it would lead them into a quarrel with each other, and, warring against each other, they would fail to accomplish their object. ¹¹⁸His cleansing of the temple,

first at the commencement of his ministry, and then again at its close, was one of the chief things that they had against him. ¹¹⁹His authoritative manner in overturning the tables of the money changers, and driving out priests, rulers and cattle was insulting to their dignity and position. ¹²⁰But this they would not mention; for the people had seen and felt the injustice and iniquity practiced in their dishonest deal and avarice.

¹²¹But Christ had declared himself to be the Son of God, and they construed his own words into a charge against him. ¹²²Still, they could not condemn him on this, for half of them had not heard these words; and they knew that the Roman tribunal would find nothing in them to accuse him of guilt and secure his condemnation. ¹²³But if, from his own lips they could all hear the same words, they might construe them into a political seditious claim. ¹²⁴They tried their utmost to have him repeat his words, but he was silent. ¹²⁵He knew what they wanted to do with his words. ¹²⁶They had violated every principle of the law. ¹²⁷Their own rule of action declared that every criminal should be treated as innocent until his guilt was apparent.

¹²⁸But although they were so full of zeal, and in such haste to secure his condemnation, the trial made no headway. ¹²⁹At last he opens his lips and his voice of mournful pathos is heard, "If I tell you, ye will not believe; and if I ask you a question, ye will not answer me." ¹³⁰But that

they may hear every evidence, and be left without excuse, he addressed them in solemn warning, "Hereafter shall the Son of man sit on the right hand of the power of God." ¹³¹"Art thou then the Son of God?" they asked in one voice. ¹³²"And he said unto them, Ye say that I am." ¹³³Then they cried out as had the malignant Caiaphas, "What need we any further witness? for we ourselves have heard of our own mouth."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Manuscript 101 1897

Following is a manuscript, entitled "The True High Priest," which we have included only in part. The unworthiness of Caiaphas, the high priest, is described. Also, the role he played in the trial of Christ is alluded to. The thoughts expressed have a bearing on the content of DA, chapter 75, and therefore have been reproduced here for the interest of the readership.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Manuscript 101 - September 26 1897

The True High Priest

¹With Caiaphas the Jewish high priesthood ended. ²This proud, overbearing, wicked man proved his unworthiness ever to have worn the garments of the high priest. ³He had neither capacity, nor authority from heaven, for doing the work. ⁴He had not one ray of light from heaven to show him what the work of the priest was, or for what the office had been instituted. ⁵Such ministration could make nothing perfect, for in itself it was utterly corrupt. ⁶The priests were tyrannous and deceptive, and full of ambitious schemes. ⁷The grace of God had nought to do with this.

⁸Virtually Caiaphas was not high priest. ⁹He wore the priestly robes, but he had not vital connection with God. ¹⁰He was uncircumcised in heart. ¹¹With the other priests he instructed the people to choose Barabbas instead of Christ. ¹²They cried out for the crucifixion of Christ, and as representatives of the Jewish nation, placed themselves under the Roman jurisdiction, which they despised, by saying "We have no king but Ceasar." ¹³When they said this, they unchurched themselves.

¹⁴It is righteousness that exalts a nation. ¹⁵A disregard for the law of God will be the ruin of the religious world in the last days of this earth's history. ¹⁶Everything is becoming unsettled, but God's word is changeless and sure. ¹⁷It is his voice, speaking to us in

admonitions, entreaties, and warnings. ¹⁸Nothing can separate a living Christian from a living God.

¹⁹Caiaphas was filling the end of the priestly service; for the priesthood had become base and corrupt. ²⁰It had no longer any connected [sic] with God. ²¹Truth and righteousness was hateful in the eyes of the priests. ²²The last order of priests was so entirely perverted that the last work of the officiating high priest was to rend his robes in pretendedly pious horror, and in his perverted priestly authority accuse the Holy One of Israel of blasphemy.

²³The mock trial of Christ shows how base the priesthood had become. ²⁴The priests hired men to testify under oath to falsehood, that Jesus might be condemned. ²⁵But on this occasion, truth came to the help of Christ. ²⁶Pilate declared him to be without fault. ²⁷How significant was the oft-repeated statement, "I find no fault in him at all." ²⁸Thus it was shown that the testimonies borne against him were false, that the witnesses had been hired by men who cherished in their hearts the basest elements of corruption. ²⁹It was God's design that the men who delivered Jesus should hear the testimony of his innocence. ³⁰"I find no fault in him," Pilate declared. ³¹And Judas, throwing at the feet of the priests the money he had received for betraying Christ, bore testimony, "I have sinned, in that I have betrayed innocent blood."

³²Previously when the Sanhedrim had been called together, to lay plans for waylaying Christ, and putting him to death, Caiaphas said, Cannot ye see that the world is gone after him? ³³The voices of some members of the council were heard, pleading with the others to check their passion and hatred against Christ. ³⁴They wished to save him from being put to death. ³⁵In reply to them, Caiaphas said, "Ye know nothing at all, nor consider that it is expedient for us (he might have said, a corrupted priesthood) that one man should die for the people, and that the whole nation perish not."

³⁶These words were uttered by one who knew not their significance. ³⁷His ideas were demoralized. ³⁸He had lost the sense of the sacredness of the Jewish system of sacrifices. ³⁹He was condemning One whose death would end the need for types and shadows, whose death was prefigured in every sacrifice made. ⁴⁰But the high priest's words meant more than he or those who were combined with him knew. ⁴¹By them he bore testimony that the time had come for the Aaronic priesthood to cease forever. ⁴²He was indeed uttering words that closed the order of the priesthood. ⁴³He was showing that Christ was to fulfil the object of the foundation of the Jewish economy.

⁴⁴"This," added the evangelist, "spake he not of himself, but being high priest that year, he prophesied that Jesus should die for the nation, and not for that nation

only, but that also he should gather together in one the children of God that were scattered abroad.

⁴⁵Caiaphas was the one that was to be in office when types and shadow were to meet the reality, when the true high priest was to come into office. ⁴⁶Each actor in history stands in his lot and place; for God's great work after his own plan will be carried out by men who have prepared themselves to fill position for good or evil. ⁴⁷In opposition to righteousness, men become instruments of unrighteousness. ⁴⁸But their course of action is unforced. ⁴⁹They need not have become instruments of unrighteousness any more than need Cain. ⁵⁰God said to him, "If thou doest well, shalt thou not be accepted? and if thou doest not well, sin lieth at the door." ⁵¹Cain would not hear the voice of God, and as a result, he killed his brother.

⁵²Men of all characters, righteous and unrighteous, will stand in their positions. ⁵³With the characters they have formed, they will act their part in the fulfillment of history. ⁵⁴In a crisis, just at the right moment, men will stand in the places they have prepared themselves to fill. ⁵⁵Believers and unbelievers will fall into line as witnesses, to confirm truth which they do not themselves comprehend. ⁵⁶All will co-operate in accomplishing the purposes of God, as did Annas, Caiaphas, Pilate, and Herod.

⁵⁷Heaven and earth will pass away, but not one jot or tittle of the word of God will fail. ⁵⁸It will endure

forever. ⁵⁹All men, whatever their position, whatever their religion, loyal or disloyal to God, wicked or righteous, are fitting themselves to do their work in the closing scenes of the day of the Lord. ⁶⁰They will trample down each other as they act out their natural attributes and fulfil their purposes; but they will carry out the purpose of God. ⁶¹The priests thought that they were carrying out their own purposes, but unconsciously and unintentionally they were fulfilling the purpose of God. ⁶²He "revealeth the deep and secret things: he knoweth what is in the darkness, and the light dwelleth with him."

⁶³If the Bible student learns from the great Teacher who inspired Bible history, he will know the truth. ⁶⁴The word is light, and to those who search its pages diligently, it is illuminated by the bright beams of the Sun of Righteousness.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Manuscript 102 1897

Manuscript 102 of September, 1897, is a second manuscript on "Caiaphas." Of its 119 sentences, about 35 were used in the composition of chapter 75 of the Desire of Ages.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Manuscript 102 - September 1897

Caiaphas

¹"And the chief priests and the council sought for witness to put Jesus to death, and found none. ²For many bare false witness against him, but their witness agreed not together. ³And there arose certain, and bare false witness against him, saying, We heard him say, I will destroy this temple that is made with hands, and in three days I will build another made without hands. ⁴But neither did their witness agree together. ⁵And the high priest stood up in the midst, and asked Jesus, saying, Answerest thou nothing? ⁶What is it that these witness against thee? ⁷But he held his peace and answered nothing. ⁸Again the high priest asked him, and said unto him, Art thou the Christ, the Son of the Blessed?" ⁹"I adjure thee by the living God that thou tell me whether thou be the Christ, the Son of God." ¹⁰Jesus said unto him, Thou hast said: nevertheless I say unto you, Hereafter ye shall see the Son of Man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven." ¹¹"The Lord said unto my Lord, Sit thou on my right hand, until I make thine enemies My footstool." ¹²"And there was given unto him dominion and glory and a kingdom, that all people, nations, and languages should serve and obey him; his dominion is an everlasting dominion, which shall not pass away, and his kingdom that which shall not be destroyed." ¹³"And he shall send his angels with a

great sound of a trumpet, and they shall gather together his elect from the four winds, from one end of heaven to the other."

¹⁴At that day Christ, then standing before his judges, will be the Judge. ¹⁵Every secret thing will be set in the light of God's countenance. ¹⁶Sinners will see their sins without a shadow to veil or soften their hideousness. ¹⁷So awful will be the sight that they will desire to be hidden under the everlasting mountains or in the depths of the ocean, if only they can escape the wrath of the Lamb.

¹⁸What a contrast will there then be between the cases of those who have refused Christ and those who have received him as their personal Saviour. ¹⁹"As many as received him, to them gave he power to become the sons of God, even to them that believed on his name." ²⁰What a testimony will be borne in their behalf! ²¹They can say, "I believed in him who was condemned at Pilate's bar, and given up to the priests and rulers to be crucified. ²²Look not upon me, a sinner, but look upon my Advocate. ²³There is nothing in me worthy of the love he manifested for me; but he gave his life for me. ²⁴Behold me in Jesus. ²⁵He became sin for me that I might become the righteousness of God in him."

²⁶The time was to come when Christ's words to Caiaphas would be repeated again and again, and communicated to others. ²⁷But the idea that there was to be a resurrection of the dead, when all would stand at the bar of God, to be

awarded according to their works, was not a pleasant thought to Caiaphas. ²⁸He did not wish to think that in future he would receive sentence according to his works. ²⁹If there was to be no resurrection, he could flatter himself with the thought, How securely I can keep my counsel. ³⁰But if there was, what a revelation would be made of his dark deeds. ³¹There rushed before his mind as a panorama the scenes of the final judgment. ³²For a moment he saw the fearful spectacle of the graves giving up their dead, with the secrets he had hoped were hidden forever. ³³For a moment he felt as though he were standing before the eternal Judge, whose eye, which sees all things, was reading his soul, bringing to light mysteries supposed to be hidden with the dead.

³⁴The scene passed from the priest's vision. ³⁵Christ's words cut him, the Sadducee, to the quick. ³⁶He was maddened by Satanic fury. ³⁷Was this man, a prisoner before him, to assail his most cherished theories? ³⁸Rending his robe, that the people might see his pretended horror, he demanded that without further preliminaries the prisoner be condemned for blasphemy. ³⁹"The high priest rent his clothes, saying, He hath spoken blasphemy; what further need have we of witnesses? behold, now ye have heard his blasphemy." ⁴⁰"What think ye?" ⁴¹"And they all condemned him."

⁴²The act of the high priest in tearing his robe meant

more than many can see or understand; for their eyes are blinded. ⁴³Many read the record without taking in the meaning of this act, any more than did Caiaphas. ⁴⁴The high priest was not to rend his garment. ⁴⁵By the Levitical law, this was prohibited under penalty of death. ⁴⁶Under no circumstances, on no occasion, was the high priest to rend his garment. ⁴⁷Express command was given by Christ to Moses, that this should not be done.

⁴⁸It was the general custom for the garments to be rent at the death of friends. ⁴⁹The only exception to this was in the case of the high priest. ⁵⁰Even Aaron, when he lost his two sons because they did not glorify God as had been specified, was forbidden to show sorrow and mourning by rending his garments. ⁵¹The prohibition was positive. ⁵²"And Moses said unto Aaron, and unto Eleazar, and unto Ithamar, his sons, Uncover not your heads, neither rend your clothes; lest ye die, and lest wrath come upon all the people; but let your brethren, the whole house of Israel, bewail the burning which the Lord hath kindled."

⁵³This law was made because everything worn by the high priest was to be whole and without blemish. ⁵⁴By these beautiful official garments was represented the character of the great antitype, Jesus Christ. ⁵⁵The pattern of the priestly robes was made known to Moses in the mount. ⁵⁶Every article that the high priest was to wear, and how it should be made, was specified. ⁵⁷These garments were

consecrated to a most solemn purpose. ⁵⁸They covered the priest with glory and beauty, and striking the people with awe, made the dignity of the office appear. ⁵⁹When clothed with these garments, the high priest was fitted for his holy official work. ⁶⁰Then he presented himself as a representative character, representing the nation of Israel, and showing by his garments the glory that Israel should reveal to the world as the chosen people of God.

⁶¹The high priest who dared to appear in holy office and engage in the service of the sanctuary with a rent robe, was looked upon as having severed himself from God. ⁶²By rending his garment, he cut himself off from being a representative character. ⁶³Virtually, he was no longer accepted by God as an officiating priest. ⁶⁴This course of action, as exhibited by Caiaphas, showed human passion, human imperfection.

⁶⁵By rending his garment, Caiaphas made of none effect the law of God to follow the tradition of men. ⁶⁶A man made law provided that in case of blasphemy, a priest might rend his garments in horror at the sin, and be guiltless. ⁶⁷Thus the law of God was made void by the laws of men.

⁶⁸Each action of the high priest was watched with interest by many; and Caiaphas thought for effect to show his great outward piety. ⁶⁹But by his very act he was committing blasphemy against God. ⁷⁰He desired to show his great zeal and obedience; and by displaying a horror that

caused him to rend his beautiful and supposedly sanctified garments, he gained a fanatical admiration. ⁷¹But he transgressed the law of God as virtually as did Adam when he ate of the fruit of the tree forbidden by God. ⁷²It is disobedience to God's commands that creates every phase of sin.

⁷³This pretended horror for sin has been acted out over and over again in matters connected with church history. ⁷⁴The passions of a vile heart have been expressed by like deeds. ⁷⁵And by exaggerated religious zeal and pretended piety men will again deceive and delude their fellow-men.

⁷⁶Thus Caiaphas did. ⁷⁷But in so doing, he was acting blasphemously against the Son of God. ⁷⁸He showed that he did not believe the Old testament Scriptures, which contained the foundation principles that his official position represented, and that he was appointed to proclaim. ⁷⁹By his skepticism he was countermining all that God had established to keep in view the world unseen and the grand spiritual truth that there are angelic agencies who minister to the inhabitants of the earth, cooperating with those who choose truth, eternal truth, in regard to the resurrection of the dead and the future eternal life.

⁸⁰For thus rending his garment in pretended zeal, the high priest might have been arraigned before the Sanhedrim. ⁸¹He had done the very thing that the Lord had commanded should not be done. ⁸²Standing under the condemnation of

God, he pronounced sentence on Christ as a blasphemer. ⁸³He performed all his actions toward Christ as a priestly judge, as an officiating high priest, but he was not this by the appointment of God. ⁸⁴The priestly robe he rent in order to impress the people with his horror of the sin of blasphemy covered a heart full of wickedness. ⁸⁵He was acting under the inspiration of Satan. ⁸⁶Under a gorgeous priestly dress, he was fulfilling the work of the enemy of God. ⁸⁷This has been done again and again by priests and rulers, ⁸⁸The rent garment ended Caiaphas' priesthood. ⁸⁹By his own action he disqualified himself for the priestly office. ⁹⁰After the condemnation of Christ, he was unable to act without showing the most unreasonable passion. ⁹¹His tortured conscience scourged him, but he did not feel that sorrow that leads to repentance.

⁹²The religion of those that crucified Christ was a pretense. ⁹³The supposed holy vestments of the priests covered hearts that were full of corruption, malignity, and crime. ⁹⁴They interpreted gain to be godliness. ⁹⁵The priests were appointed, not by God, but by an unbelieving government. ⁹⁶The position of priest was bought and sold like goods of merchandise. ⁹⁷Thus it was that Caiaphas obtained the office. ⁹⁸He was not a priest after the order of Melchisedec, by God's appointment. ⁹⁹He was bought and sold to work wickedness. ¹⁰⁰He never knew what it was to be obedient to God. ¹⁰¹He had the form of godliness and this

gave him the power to oppress.

¹⁰²When Caiaphas rent his garment, his action was significant of the place that the Jewish nation as a nation would in future occupy toward God. ¹⁰³As a whole, the Jewish nation had apostatized. ¹⁰⁴The once favored people of God had become divorced from him. ¹⁰⁵Christ came to them with his message, but it was despised. ¹⁰⁶As he stood on the crest of Olivet just prior to his crucifixion, he wept over Jerusalem, and lamented the fall of her people, saying, "If thou hadst known, even thou in this thy day, the things which belong unto thy peace; but now they are hid from thine eyes. ¹⁰⁷For the days shall come upon thee that thine enemies shall cast a trench about thee, and keep thee on every side. ¹⁰⁸And shall lay thee even with the ground, and thy children within thee; and they shall not leave one stone upon another; because thou knewest not the time of thy visitation."

¹⁰⁹The most solemn period of responsibility for the Jewish nation was when Christ was in their midst, working the works of God. ¹¹⁰It was that generation that rejected the Messiah. ¹¹¹Christ addressed them as the most guilty, because they had the word of God. ¹¹²It is not only delegates, servants and prophets, to whom you have refused to listen, he declared, but your Redeemer. ¹¹³Ye would none of my counsel, ye despised all my reproof. ¹¹⁴Have I been so long time with you, and yet hast thou not known me?

¹¹⁵If thou art destroyed, O Jerusalem, thyself alone wilt be responsible. ¹¹⁶Ye will not come unto me that ye might have life.

¹¹⁷Christ wept in an agony of tears, not for himself, but for the doomed thousands in the devoted city. ¹¹⁸He was not flattered by the hollow shouts of the multitude. ¹¹⁹He foresaw the retribution coming upon Jerusalem, which the deluded, selfish, proud nation, disloyal to God, could not, would not, see.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Manuscript 104 1897

Manuscript 104 of 1897, by the title of "Condemned by the Jews," is one which brings together in its 153 sentences a number of facets used in DA chapter 75. One surprising detail is that in the portion on Peter a quantity of the sentences are drawn from 3SP. We have a faded typewritten copy of MS 104 that was apparently done by Minnie Hawkins on September 7, 1897.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Manuscript 104 - 1897

Condemned by the Jews

¹"Then the band and the captain and the officers of the Jews took Jesus, and bound him, and led him away to Annas first; for he was father-in-law to Caiaphas, which was the high priest that same year." ²"Now Caiaphas was he, which gave counsel to the Jews, that it was expedient that one man should die for the people." (See John 11:47-53.)

³"The high priest then asked Jesus of his disciples, and of his doctrine. ⁴Jesus answered him, I spake openly to the world; I ever taught in the synagogue, and in the temple, whither the Jews always resort; and in secret have I said nothing. ⁵Why askest thou me? ask them which heard me what I have said unto them; behold, they know what I said. ⁶And when he had thus spoken, one of the officers which stood by struck Jesus [in the face] with the palm of his hand, saying, Answerest thou the high priest so? ⁷Jesus answered him, If I have spoken evil, bear witness of the evil: but if well, why smitest thou me?" (John 18:19-23.)

⁸The followers of Christ should bear in mind that all the evil speeches made against Christ, all the abuse that He received, they must, as His followers, endure for His name's sake. ⁹The piety of the church may professedly be of a high order; but when the truth of the word of God is brought to bear upon the heart, and when conviction of truth is rejected and despised that they may keep in friendship with

the majority, they place themselves--that humanity which might be sanctified, refined, purified, ennobled, by obedience to the commandments of God--as rejecters of truth and light, on the side of the enemy. ¹⁰Satan stirs them up by a power from beneath, with an intensity that reveals his enmity to God and His laws. ¹¹They enact human laws that are oppressive and galling.

¹²"If the world hate you," said Christ, "ye know that it hated me before it hated you. ¹³If ye were of the world, the world would love his own; but because ye are not of the world, but I have chosen you out of the world, therefore the world hateth you. ¹⁴Remember the word that I said unto you, "The servant is not greater than his lord. ¹⁵If they have persecuted me, they will also persecute you; if they have kept my saying, they will keep yours also. ¹⁶But all these things will they do unto you for my name's sake, because they know not him that sent me. ¹⁷If I had not come and spoken unto them, they had not had sin; but now they have no cloke for their sin. ¹⁸He that hateth me hateth my Father also. ¹⁹If I had not done among them the works that none other man did, they had not had sin: but now have they both seen and hated both me and my Father. ²⁰But this cometh to pass, that the word might be fulfilled that is written in the law, They hated me without a cause."

²¹"These things have I spoken unto you, that ye should not be offended. ²²They shall put you out of the

synagogues: yea, the time cometh when whosoever killeth you will think that he doeth God service. ²³And these things will they do unto you because they have not known the Father nor me. ²⁴But these things have I told you, that when the time shall come, ye may remember that I told you of them. ²⁵And these things I said not unto you at the beginning, because I was with you."

²⁶The truth of these words of Christ has become a reality in the experience of those who have been loyal and true to the God of heaven, according to the light received. ²⁷"If they have persecuted me," He said, "they will also persecute you; if they have kept my sayings, they will keep yours also." ²⁸"All who will live [not merely profess] godly in Christ Jesus, shall suffer persecution." ²⁹"And these things will they do unto you, because they have not known [by experimental knowledge] the Father nor me."

³⁰As Christ was hated without cause, so will His people be hated without cause, merely because they are obedient to the commandments of God and do His works in the place of working directly contrary to them. ³¹If He who was pure, holy, and undefiled, who did good and only good in our world, was treated as a base criminal, and condemned to death without a vestige of evidence against Him, what can His disciples expect but similar treatment, however faultless may be their life and blameless their character. ³²Human enactments, laws manufactured by satanic agencies

under a plea of goodness and restriction of evil will be exalted, while God's holy enactments are despised and trampled under foot. ³³And all who prove their loyalty by obedience to the law of Jehovah must be prepared to be arrested, to be brought before councils that have not for their standard the high and holy law of God, but have made stringent laws inspired by him whose attributes were manifested at the trial of Christ. ³⁴"We have a law," these men said, "and by our law he ought to die."

³⁵"Then led they Jesus from Caiaphas unto the hall of judgment, and it was early." ³⁶The night was the most appropriate hour for their works of darkness. ³⁷In these religious zealots we have a sample of what humanity will do when they have the word that lighted every man that cometh into the world, and work directly contrary to it, irrespective of the consequence, the future retribution upon their neighbors or themselves. ³⁸"We have a law," they say, "and by that law, he ought to die."

³⁹But these priests, scribes, and rulers were so exact in regard to their own maxims and traditions that they would not enter the judgment hall, lest they should be defiled and that they might eat the passover. ⁴⁰The passover was a ceremony instituted by Christ Himself before His incarnation, but He who was the foundation of the whole Jewish economy was in their midst, His divinity clothed with humanity. ⁴¹Type was meeting antitype. ⁴²And they had ...

⁹⁰Simon Peter had followed Jesus, and so had another disciple, "that disciple [John] was known unto the high priest, and went in with Jesus into the palace of the high priest. ⁹¹But Peter stood at the door without. ⁹²Then went out that other disciple, which was known unto the high priest, and spake unto her that kept the door, and brought in Peter."

⁹³The look of dejection on Peter's face suggested to the woman the thought that this was one of the disciples of Christ. ⁹⁴She was one of the servants of Caiaphas' household, and was curious to know. ⁹⁵She said to Peter, "Art thou not also one of this man's disciples?" ⁹⁶Peter was startled and confused; the eyes of the company instantly fastened upon him. ⁹⁷He pretended not to understand her, but she was persistent, and said to those around her that this man was with Jesus. ⁹⁸Peter felt compelled to answer, and said angrily, "Woman, I know him not." ⁹⁹This was the first denial, and immediately the cock crew. ¹⁰⁰O Peter! so soon ashamed of thy Master! so soon to cowardly deny thy Lord! ¹⁰¹The Saviour is dishonored and deserted in His humiliation by one of His most zealous disciples.

¹⁰²Peter had confidently asserted, "Though all men should forsake thee, yet will not I." ¹⁰³"I will go with thee to prison and to death." ¹⁰⁴Where now was the confidence of this self-assured disciple? ¹⁰⁵Where his loyalty to his Master? ¹⁰⁶O Peter, this was the time when

thou shouldest have confessed thy Lord, and that without shame and unwillingness! ¹⁰⁷But another opportunity was given him. ¹⁰⁸The palace of the high priest was surrounded by a piazza or open court, into which the soldiers and chief priests and multitude had gathered. ¹⁰⁹And Peter took a place among the multitude. ¹¹⁰But attention was called to him the second time, and he was again charged with being a follower of Jesus. ¹¹¹"This fellow was also with Jesus," said one. ¹¹²He now denied the accusation with an oath. ¹¹³The cock crew the second time; but Peter heard it not, for he was now thoroughly intent upon carrying out the character which he had assumed. ¹¹⁴One of the servants of the high priest, being a near kinsman to the man whose ear Peter had cut off, asked him, "Did I not see thee in the garden with him?" ¹¹⁵"Surely thou art one of them; for thou art a Galilean, and thy speech agreeth thereto."

¹¹⁶At this Peter flew into a rage, and to fully deceive his questioners, and to justify his assumed character, he denied his Master with cursing and swearing. ¹¹⁷And immediately the cock crew the third time. ¹¹⁸Peter heard it then, and he remembered the words of Jesus, "Before the cock crow thou shalt deny me thrice." ¹¹⁹Christ was weary and faint from fasting when the denial of Peter reached Him; and while the degrading oaths were fresh upon his lips, and the shrill crowing of the cock was yet ringing in his ears, the Saviour turned His face from the frowning judges and looked

full upon His poor disciple. ¹²⁰At the same time Peter's eyes were involuntarily fixed upon his Master. ¹²¹He read in that gentle countenance deep pity and sorrow; but there was no anger there. ¹²²That face pale with suffering, those quivering lips, seemed to speak to Peter. ¹²³"Not know Me, Peter?" ¹²⁴The look was blended with pity, compassion, and forgiveness for the unfaithful one; and it pierced Peter's heart like an arrow. ¹²⁵He fled from the now crowded courts, he cared not where. ¹²⁶At last he found himself in the garden of Gethsemane and in the very spot where Jesus had poured out His soul in agony to His Father. ¹²⁷He fell on his face stricken and wounded, and so overwhelmed with what he had done that he wished he could die there.

¹²⁸"And the men that held Jesus mocked him and smote him. ¹²⁹And when they had blindfolded him, they struck him on the face, and asked him saying, Prophecy, who is it that smote thee? ¹³⁰And many other things blasphemously spake they against him."

¹³¹Here we see how professedly righteous men can act out the spirit of Satan to carry their wicked purposes through envy and jealousy and religious bigotry. ¹³²That enmity was spoken of in the first gospel sermon spoken in Eden. ¹³³"And I will put enmity between thee and the woman; between thy seed and her seed; it shall bruise thy head, and thou shalt bruise his heel." ¹³⁴This enmity was revealed as soon as men transgressed God's holy law. ¹³⁵His nature was

changed. ¹³⁶It became evil. ¹³⁷He was in harmony with the prince of darkness, and there was a confederacy formed. ¹³⁸There is no warfare between Satan and the sinner, between fallen angels and fallen men. ¹³⁹Both possess the same attributes, both are evil through apostasy and sin. ¹⁴⁰Then let all who read these words understand for a surety that wheresoever transgression against God's holy law exists there will always be a league against good. ¹⁴¹Fallen angels and fallen men will unite in desperate companionship. ¹⁴²Satan inspires the disloyal elements to work in harmony with his spirit.

¹⁴³The prediction given in Eden refers in a special manner to Christ, and to all who accept and confess Him as the only begotten Son of God. ¹⁴⁴Christ has pledged Himself to engage in the conflict with the prince and power of darkness and bruise the serpent's head, and all who are the sons of God are His chosen ones, His soldiers, to war against principalities and powers, against the rulers of the darkness of this world, against spiritual wickedness in high places. ¹⁴⁵It is an unwearied conflict of which there is to be no end, until Christ shall come the second time without sin unto salvation to destroy him who has destroyed so many souls through his masterly deceiving power.

¹⁴⁶"And as soon as it was day, the elders of the people, and the chief priests and the scribes came together, and led him unto their council, saying, Art thou the Christ?

tell us. ¹⁴⁷And he said unto them, If I tell you, you will not believe. ¹⁴⁸And if I also ask you, ye will not answer me, nor let me go. ¹⁴⁹Hereafter shall ye see the Son of man on the right hand of the power of God. ¹⁵⁰Then said they all, Art thou then the Son of God? ¹⁵¹And he said unto them, Ye say that I am. ¹⁵²And they said, What need we any further witness? for we ourselves have heard of his own mouth." (Luke 22:66-71.)

¹⁵³"And the whole multitude of them arose, and led him unto Pilate." (Luke 23:1.)

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Manuscript 111 1897

Included in this appendix are the first 91 sentences of Manuscript 111, dated October 7, 1897, which have to do with the content of chapter 75 of the DA. Otherwise, the manuscript is quite lengthy, covering points in chapters 64, 73, 75, 78, 79, 80, and 81 of DA. Manuscript 111, 1897, incorporates material from Diary Book 18 (1894), pages 43 and 45. DA chapter 75, in turn, draws from sentences in MS 111, not all of which may be traced to Diary Book 18.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Manuscript 111 - October 7 1897

Our Substitute and Surety

¹"And the high priest arose, and said unto him, Answerest thou nothing? ²What is it that these witness against thee? ³But Jesus held his peace. ⁴And the high priest answered and said unto him, I adjure thee by the living God, that thou tell us whether thou be the Christ, the Son of God."

⁵According to the Jewish form of administration, Christ was placed on oath by the priest: "I adjure thee by the living God that thou tell us whether thou art the Christ, the Son of God." ⁶This appeal was made by the first magistrate of the nation. ⁷He occupied a position higher than any in earthly courts. ⁸But his religion was a cloak that hid the deformities of a hard, cruel heart. ⁹He lorded it over the people, making his supposed godliness a source of gain. ¹⁰He was not at any time accepted by God as a typical high priest. ¹¹His fitness for the priesthood ended with the covering garment, set apart for the use of the priests, which he wore. ¹²He was incapable and unworthy.

¹³The priesthood itself had become corrupt. ¹⁴Priest after priest filled his appointment, and performed his religious duties as an actor in a theatre. ¹⁵Christ was fully aware of the high priest's unworthiness to occupy the position that he did. ¹⁶He knew that he had not the character that would enable God to connect with him. ¹⁷But

knowing all this, Christ responded. ¹⁸The true high priest stood before the false priest, to be criticized by one whom the people detested. ¹⁹Christ might have glorified himself there and then. ²⁰He might have shown a power that would have made his judges quail. ²¹He knew that he was appointed to his office by God. ²²But a body of flesh had been prepared for him. ²³He concealed his divinity by a garb of humanity. ²⁴Being found in fashion as a man, he humbled himself, that he might be qualified to represent man in the heavenly courts. ²⁵He took not on him the nature even of angels. ²⁶The highest of all angels, he girded himself with a towel, and washed the feet of his disciples. ²⁷He mourned and wept over the perversity and transgression of men. ²⁸He did not rend his robe, but his soul was rent. ²⁹His garment of human flesh was rent as he hung on the cross, the sin-bearer of the human race. ³⁰By his suffering and death, a new and living way was opened. ³¹By this he was to enter upon his priestly office forever. ³²There was no longer a wall of partition between Jew and Gentile. ³³As the high priest for the whole world, he entered the holy place.

³⁴To the charge of the high priest, Jesus said, "Thou hast said, Nevertheless, I say unto thee, Hereafter shall ye see [the] Son of God sitting on the right hand of power, and coming in the clouds of heaven." ³⁵These words were spoken with dignity and assurance. ³⁶They fell from the lips of One whose spirit went with the words. ³⁷Christ, the only

begotten Son of God, was the speaker, and his words came with ease, as if from the depths of a soul possessing the testimony to be given on earth. ³⁸Divinity flashed through humanity, and like an arrow, the conviction flashed into the hearts of the hearers that this man spake as never man spake.

³⁹"Then the high priest rent his robe." ⁴⁰Conviction, mingled with passion, caused him to do this. ⁴¹He was furious with himself for believing Christ's words, and instead of rending his heart, under a deep sense of truth, and confessing that Jesus was the Messiah, he rent his priestly robes in determined resistance. ⁴²By this act he placed himself under the penalty of death. ⁴³Under no circumstances were the priests to remove their turbans or rend their robes. ⁴⁴He who disregarded this law was to die. ⁴⁵Nothing but perfection, in dress and attitude, in word and spirit, could be acceptable to God. ⁴⁶He is holy, and his glory and perfection must be represented by the earthly service. ⁴⁷Nothing but perfection could properly represent the sacredness of the heavenly service. ⁴⁸Finite man might rend his own heart by showing a contrite and humble spirit. ⁴⁹This God would discern. ⁵⁰But no rent must be made in the priestly robes, for this would mar the representation of heavenly things.

⁵¹The Jewish rulers said of Christ, "We have a law, and by our law he ought to die." ⁵²Christ, who made the laws

governing the temple service, might have said to Caiaphas as he rent his robe, You have transgressed the law of the God of heaven.

⁵³Every word of Christ's reply was an arrow aimed by no uncertain hand. ⁵⁴The judges rose up and confronted Christ, and with angry vehemence one after another asked him the question, "Art thou the Son of God?" ⁵⁵To all came the answer as to Caiaphas, "I AM." ⁵⁶Oh, will not the dignity revealed in that pale face bring discernment to these men? ⁵⁷Will not his bearing impress them with the truth of his words? ⁵⁸On this occasion impressions were made that were never effaced. ⁵⁹The actors in the scene went from place to place, hoping to find relief, but never did they gain the peace and quietude they sought.

⁶⁰The rulers did not yield to the conviction, but decided the matter as Satan hoped they would. ⁶¹They condemned Christ as a blasphemer. ⁶²But Christ was not cowed or intimidated by their anger. ⁶³With patience and without retaliation, he bore dishonor and shameful abuse. ⁶⁴He looked forward to the time when their positions would be reversed, when he would sit on the right hand of God, clothed with power, when all--Pilate, Caiaphas, and those who mocked and derided him--would stand before him. ⁶⁵When he comes in the clouds of heaven, the whole world will be cited before him. ⁶⁶Those who pierced him will look upon him. ⁶⁷They will know him then. ⁶⁸Then sentence will be

passed on those who have not received him.

⁶⁹This is one of the times when Christ publicly confessed his claim to be the Messiah, the One for whom the Jews had long looked. ⁷⁰Weighted with such great results, it was to Christ one of the most wonderful moments of his life. ⁷¹He realized that all disguise must be swept away. ⁷²The declaration that he was one with God must be made. ⁷³His judges looked upon him as only a man, and they thought him guilty of blasphemous presumption. ⁷⁴But he proclaimed himself as the Son of God. ⁷⁵He fully asserted his divine character before the dignitaries who had arraigned him before their earthly tribunal. ⁷⁶His words, spoken calmly, yet with conscious power, showed that he claimed for himself the prerogatives of the Son of God.

⁷⁷At this time, none of the disciples dared open their lips to acknowledge Christ as the Messiah so long expected. ⁷⁸When asked if he was one of the disciples, Peter denied, and when again charged with being Christ's follower, he denied with cursing and swearing. ⁷⁹On one occasion Jesus asked his disciples, "Whom say ye that I am?" ⁸⁰The light of the Saviour's glory flooded Peter's soul, and with inspired earnestness, he broke out into no prosaic acknowledgment, "Thou art the Christ, the Son of the living God." ⁸¹Christ commended him, saying, "Blessed art thou, Simon Bar-jona, for flesh and blood hath not revealed it unto thee, but my Father, which is in heaven. ⁸²Is this the

same Peter that now denies his Lord with cursing?

⁸³These things are too great for me to handle, but I must mention some things, to ease my mind of its burden.

⁸⁴Many who claim to be Christians are in danger of rending their garments, making an outward show of remorse and repentance when their hearts are not softened or contrite.

⁸⁵This is the reason why so many continue to make failures in the Christian life. ⁸⁶An outward appearance of sorrow is

manifested for wrong, but their repentance is not that repentance that needeth not to be repented of. ⁸⁷May God

grant to his church true contrition for sin. ⁸⁸O that we may feel the necessity of revealing true sorrow for wrong doing.

⁸⁹My soul is constantly pained because of the evidence that I have of the superficial conversion of those who claim to be children of God. ⁹⁰The question arises in my mind, Do

these have any sense of the infinite sacrifice made in their behalf? ⁹¹It was a priceless gift, the sacrifice of One who

was the foundation of the Jewish economy. ⁹²All the offerings that were made pointed to Christ, the one complete offering for the sins of the world.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 75

Introduction to Farrar's Life of Christ

The following material, relating to DA chapter 75, is from the edition of Farrar's Life of Christ that we used for finding literary parallels. As has been mentioned earlier, Manuscript 51, 1897, is one that especially follows the sections in the Farrar LC that correspond to chapter 75 of DA.

haps St. Mark the Evangelist,¹ perhaps Lazarus the brother of Martha and Mary — ventured, in his intense excitement, to hover on the outskirts of the hostile crowd. He had apparently been roused from sleep, for he had nothing to cover him except the *sindôn*, or linen sheet, in which he had been sleeping. But the Jewish emissaries, either out of the mere wantonness of a crowd at seeing a person in an unwonted guise, or because they resented his too close intrusion, seized hold of the sheet which he had wrapped about him; whereupon he too was suddenly terrified, and fled away naked, leaving the linen garment in their hands.

Jesus was now absolutely alone in the power of His enemies. At the command of the tribune His hands were tied behind His back,² and forming a close array around Him, the Roman soldiers, followed and surrounded by the Jewish servants, led Him once more through the night, over the Kidron, and up the steep city slope beyond it; to the palace of the High Priest.

¹ Mark xiv. 61, 52 only. As to the supposition that it was Lazarus — founded partly on the locality, partly on the probabilities of the case, partly on the fact that the *sindôn* was a garment that only a person of some wealth would possess — see a beautiful article on "Lazarus," by Professor Plumptre, in the *Dict. of the Bible*. Ewald's supposition, that it was St. Paul (!), seems to me amazing. The word *διϋ*, *γυμνός*, though, like the Latin *nudus*, it constantly means "with only the under robe on" (1 Sam. xix. 24; John xxi. 7; Hes. *Epy.*, 391; Virg. *G.* l. 209), is here probably *literal*.

² John xviii. 12.

CHAPTER LVIII.

JESUS BEFORE THE PRIESTS AND THE SANHEDRIM.

"הִלֵּךְ בְּרַגְלֶיךָ בְּחָזֶק, "Be slow in judgment." — *Pirke Abboth*, l. 1.

ALTHOUGH sceptics have dwelt with disproportioned persistency upon a multitude of "discrepancies" in the fourfold narrative of Christ's trial, condemnation, death, and resurrection, yet these are not of a nature to cause the slightest anxiety to a Christian scholar; nor need they awaken the most momentary distrust in any one who — even if he have no deeper feelings in the matter — approaches the Gospels with no preconceived theory, whether of infallibility or of dishonesty, to support, and merely accepts them for that which, at the lowest, they claim to be — histories honest and faithful up to the full knowledge of the writers, but each, if taken alone, confessedly fragmentary and obviously incomplete. ¹ After repeated study, I declare, quite fearlessly, that though the slight variations are numerous — though the lesser particulars cannot in every instance be rigidly and minutely accurate — though no one of the narratives taken singly would give us an adequate impression — yet, so far from there being, in this part of the Gospel story, any irreconcilable contradiction, it is perfectly possible to discover how one Evangelist supplements the details furnished by another, and perfectly possible to understand the true sequence of the incidents by combining into one whole the separate indications which they furnish. ² It is easy to call such combinations arbitrary and baseless; but they are only arbitrary in so far as we cannot always be absolutely certain that the succession of facts was exactly such as we suppose; and so far are they from being baseless, that, to the careful reader of the Gospels, they carry with them a conviction little short of certainty. ³ If we treat the Gospels as we should treat any other authentic documents recording all that the authors knew, or all that they felt themselves commissioned to record, of the crowded incidents in one terrible and tumultuous day and night, we shall, with care and study,

see how all that they tell us falls accurately into its proper position in the general narrative, and shows us a sixfold trial, a quadrangle derision, a triple acquittal, a twice-repeated condemnation of Christ our Lord.

⁵ Reading the Gospels side by side, we soon perceive that of the three successive trials which our Lord underwent at the hands of the Jews, the first only—that before Annas—is related to us by St. John; the second—that before Caiaphas—by St. Matthew and St. Mark; the third—that before the Sanhedrin—by St. Luke alone.¹ Nor is there anything strange in this, since the first was the practical, the second the potential, the third the actual and formal decision, that sentence of death should be passed judicially upon Him.

⁷ Each of the three trials might, from a different point of view, have been regarded as the most fatal and important of the three. ⁸ That of Annas was the authoritative *præjudicium*, that of Caiaphas the real determination, that of the entire Sanhedrin at daybreak the final ratification.²

⁹ When the tribune, who commanded the detachment of Roman soldiers, had ordered Jesus to be bound, they led Him away without an attempt at opposition. ¹⁰ Midnight was already passed as they hurried Him, from the moonlit shadows of green Gethsemane, through the hushed streets of the sleeping city, to the palace³ of the High Priest. It seems to have been jointly occupied by the prime movers in this black iniquity, Annas and his son-in-law, Joseph Caiaphas. ¹¹ They led Him to Annas first. ¹² It is true that this Hanan, son of Seth, the Ananus of Josephus, and the Annas of the Evangelists, had only been the actual High Priest for seven years (A.D. 7-14), and that, more than twenty years before this period, he had been deposed by the Procurator Valerius Gratus. ¹⁴ He had been succeeded first by Ismael

¹ But nevertheless, St. John distinctly alludes to the second trial (xviii. 24, where *interrogatus* means "sent," not "had sent," as in the E. V.; and cf. xl. 46); and St. Matthew and St. Mark imply the third (Matt. xxvii. 1; Mark xv. 1). St. Luke, though he contents himself with the narration of the third only—which was the only legal one—yet also distinctly leaves room for the first and second (xxii. 64).

² One might, perhaps, from a slightly different point of view, regard the questioning before Annas as mere conspiracy; that before Caiaphas as a sort of preliminary questioning, or derision; and that before the Sanhedrin as the only real and legal trial.

³ *abba* means both the entire palace (Matt. xxvi. 58) and the open court within the walls or *peristyle* (id. 69). Probably the house was near the Temple (Noh. xlii. 4, seq.). That Hanan and Caiaphas occupied one house seems probable from a comparison of John xviii. 13 with 15. John being known to Caiaphas is admitted to witness the trial before Annas.

Ben Phabi, then by his son Eleazar, then by his son-in-law, Joseph Caiaphas.¹⁵ But the priestly families would not be likely to attach more importance than they chose to a deposition which a strict observer of the Law would have regarded as invalid and sacrilegious; nor would so astute a people as the Jews be likely to lack devices which would enable them to evade the Roman fiat, and to treat Annas, if they wished to do so, as their High Priest *de jure* if not *de facto*.¹⁶ Since the days of Herod the Great, the High Priesthood had been degraded from a permanent religious office, to a temporary secular distinction; and, even had it been otherwise, the rude legions would probably care less than nothing to whom they led their victim.¹⁷ If the tribune condescended to ask a question about it, it would be easy for the Captain of the Temple—who may very probably have been at this time, as we know was the case subsequently, one of the Sons of Annas himself—to represent Annas as the *Sagan*¹ or *Nasi*.

¹ The title *Sagan haccohanim*, "deputy" or "chief" of the priests, is said to date from the day when the Seleucids neglected for seven years to appoint a successor to the wicked Alcimus, and a "deputy" had to supply his place. But accident must often have rendered a *sagan* necessary, and we find "the second priest" prominently mentioned in 2 Kings xxv. 18; Jer. lii. 24 (Buxtorf, *Lex. Talm.* s. v. סגן). Thus on one occasion, on the evening of the great Day of Atonement, Hareth, King of Arabia, was talking to Shimon Ben Kamhith, who, being High Priest, was rendered legally impure, and unable to officiate the next day, because some of the king's saliva happened to fall on his vestments. His brother then supplied his place. It is, however, doubtful whether the title of *Sagan* did not originate later, and whether any but the real High Priest could, under ordinary circumstances, be the *Nasi*. In fact, the name *Nasi* seems to be enveloped in obscurity. Perhaps it corresponds to the mysterious *shephel* (= *Sar am El*, "Prince of the People of God"). Ewald says that Hanan might have been *Ab Beth Din*, as the *second* in the Sanhedrin was called; and it is at any rate clear, among many obscurities, that *shephel* of being High Priest, he might have even exceeded him in influence (cf. Acts iv. 6; Maimon. *Sanhedr.* 2, 4). The High Priesthood at this time was confined to some half-dozen closely-connected families, especially the Boethusians, and the family of Hanan, the Kamhiths, and the Kantheras; yet, since the days of Herod, the High Priests were so completely the puppets of the civil power that there were no less than twenty-eight in 107 years (Jos. *Ant.* xx. 10, § 1). Both Josephus (*de r. iud.* c. viii. 1, § 4) and the Talmud (*בבלי* כהנים נרמס) quite bear out the language of the Gospels in attributing the pontifical power more to a caste than to any individual. The fact seems to be that even in these bad times the office demanded a certain amount of external dignity and self-denial which some men would only tolerate for a time; and their ambition was that as many members of their family as possible should "have passed the char." Such is the inference drawn by Derenbourg from Jos. *Ant.* xx. 9, § 1; and still more from the letter of the High Priest Jonathan, son of Hanan, to Agrippa (id. xix. 6, § 4). Martha, daughter of Boethus, bought the priesthood for her husband, Jesus, son of Gamala, and had carpets spread from her house to the Temple when she went to see him sacrifice. This man had six

—the "Deputy," or the President of the Sanhedrin—and so as the proper person to conduct the preliminary investigation.

¹⁸i. Accordingly, it was before Hanan that Jesus stood first as a prisoner at the tribunal.¹⁴ It is probable that he and his family had been originally summoned by Herod the Great from Alexandria, as supple supporters of a distasteful tyranny.²⁰ The Jewish historian calls this Hanan the happiest man of his time, because he died at an advanced old age, and because both he and five of his sons in succession—not to mention his son-in-law—had enjoyed the shadow of the High Priesthood;² so that, in fact, for nearly half a century he had practically wielded the sacerdotal power.²¹ But to be admired by such a renegade as Josephus is a questionable advantage.²² In spite of his prosperity he seems to have left behind him but an evil name, and we know enough of his character, even from the most unsuspected sources, to recognize in him nothing better than an astute, tyrannous, worldly Sadducee, unvenerable for all his seventy years, full of a serpentine malice and meanness which utterly belied the meaning of his name,³ and engaged at this very moment in a dark, disorderly conspiracy, for which even a worse man would have had cause to blush.²³ It was before this alien and intriguing hierarch that there began, at midnight, the first stage of that long and terrible trial.⁴

²⁴And there was good reason why St. John should have preserved for us *this* phase of the trial, and preserved it apparently for the express reason that it had been omitted by the other Evangelists.²⁵ It is not till after a lapse of

gloves made, that he might not dirty his hands while sacrificing! (See Renan, *L'Antechrist*, 48 seqq.)

¹ John xviii. 13, 19-24.

² Eleazar, A.D. 16; Jonathan, A.D. 36; Theophilus, A.D. 37; Matthias, A.D. 42-43; Annas the younger, A.D. 63. The Talmudic quotations about Annas and his family are given in Lightfoot. They were remarkable for boldness and cunning (Jos. Ant. xx. 9, § 1), and also for avarice and meanness (*Sif'r*, Deuter. 1, 8, quoted by Dercnbourg, who calls them "ces pontifes détestés" [*Hist. Pal.*, p. 463]).—An energetic malediction against all these families is found in *Pesachim*, 87 a, in which occur the words, "Woe to the house of Hanan! woe to their serpent lings!" (אוי לי מכית חנן אוי לי מלחישתן).—The Boëthusians are reproached for their "bludgeons;" the Kantheras for their libels; the Phabis for their "fists" (Raphall, *Hist. of the Jews*, II. 370). The passage is a little obscure, but the Talmud has many allusions to the worthlessness and worldliness of the priests of this period. (Renan, *L'Antechrist*, pp. 50, 51.)

³ רבן, "element," or "merciful."

⁴ John xviii. 19-24.

years that people can always see clearly the prime mover in events with which they have been contemporary.²⁶ At the time, the ostensible agent is the one usually regarded as most responsible, though he may be in reality a mere link in the official machinery.²⁷ But if there were one man who was more guilty than any other of the death of Jesus, that man was Hanan.²⁸ His advanced age, his preponderant dignity, his worldly position and influence, as one who stood on the best terms with the Herods and the Procurators, gave an exceptional weight to his prerogative decision.²⁹ The mere fact that he should have noticed Jesus at all showed that he attached to His teaching a *political* significance—showed that he was at last afraid lest Jesus should alienate the people yet more entirely from the pontifical clique than had ever been done by Shemaia or Abtalion.³⁰ It is most remarkable, and, so far as I know, has scarcely ever been noticed, that, although the Pharisees undoubtedly were actuated by a burning hatred against Jesus, and were even so eager for His death as to be willing to co-operate with the aristocratic and priestly Sadducees—from whom they were ordinarily separated by every kind of difference, political, social, and religious—yet, from the moment that the plot for His arrest and condemnation had been matured, the Pharisees took so little part in it that their name is not once directly mentioned in any event connected with the arrest, the trial, the derisions, and the crucifixion.³¹ The Pharisees, as such, disappear; the chief priests and elders take their place.³² It is, indeed, doubtful whether any of the more distinguished Pharisees were members of the degraded *simulacrum* of authority which in those bad days still arrogated to itself the title of a Sanhedrin.³³ If we may believe not a few of the indications of the Talmud, that Sanhedrin was little better than a close, irreligious, unpatriotic confederacy of monopolizing and time-serving priests—the Boëthusim, the Kantheras, the Phabis, the family of Hanan, mostly of non-Palestinian origin—who were supported by the government, but detested by the people, and of whom this bad conspirator was the very life and soul.

³⁴And, perhaps, we may see a further reason for the apparent withdrawal of the Pharisees from all active co-operation in the steps which accompanied the condemnation and execution of Jesus, not only in the superior mildness which is attributed to them, and in their comparative insignificance in the civil administration, but also in their total want of

sympathy with those into whose too fatal toils they had delivered the Son of God.³⁵ There seems, indeed, to be a hitherto unnoticed circumstance which, while it would kinde to the highest degree the fury of the Sadducees, would rather enlist in Christ's favor the sympathy of their rivals.³⁶ What had roused the disdainful insouciance of those powerful aristocrats? ³⁷Morally insignificant—the patrons and adherents of opinions which had so little hold upon the people that Jesus had never directed against them one tithe of the stern denunciation which He had levelled at the Pharisees—they had played but a very minor part in the opposition which had sprung up round the Messiah's steps. Nay, further than this, they would be wholly at one with Him in rejecting and discountenancing the minute and casuistical frivolities of the Oral Law; they might even have rejoiced that they had in Him a holy and irresistible ally in their opposition to all the *Hagadôth* and *Halachôth* which had germinated in a fungous growth over the whole body of the Mosaic institutions.³⁸ Whence, then, this sudden outburst of the very deadliest and most ruthless opposition? ³⁹It is a conjecture that has not yet been made, but which the notices of the Talmud bring home to my mind with strong conviction, that the rage of these priests was mainly due to our Lord's words and acts concerning that House of God which they regarded as their exclusive domain, and, above all, to His second public cleansing of the Temple.⁴⁰ They could not indeed press this point in their accusations, because the act was one of which, secretly at least, the Pharisees, in all probability, heartily approved; and had they urged it against Him they would have lost all chance of impressing upon Pilate a sense of their unanimity.⁴¹ The first cleansing might have been passed over as an isolated act of zeal, to which little importance need be attached, while the teaching of Jesus was mainly confined to despised and far-off Galilee; but the second had been more public, and more vehement, and had apparently kindled a more general indignation against the gross abuse which called it forth.⁴² Accordingly in all three Evangelists we find that those who complained of the act are not distinctively Pharisees, but "*Chief Priests and Scribes*" (Matt xxi. 15; Mark xi. 18; Luke xix. 47), who seem at once to have derived from it a fresh stimulus to seek His destruction.

⁴³But again, it may be asked, Is there any reason beyond

¹ Jos. Antt. xiii. 10, § 6.

this bold infraction of their authority, this indignant repudiation of an arrangement which *they* had sanctioned, which would have stirred up the rage of these priestly families?

⁴⁴Yes—for we may assume from the Talmud that it tended to wound their avarice, to interfere with their illicit and greedy gains.⁴⁵ Avarice—the besetting sin of Judas—the besetting sin of the Jewish race—seems also to have been the besetting sin of the family of Hanan.⁴⁶ It was they who had founded the *thauzôth*—the famous four shops under the twin cedars of Olivet—in which were sold things legally pure, and which they had manipulated with such commercial cunning as artificially to raise the price of doves to a gold coin apiece, until the people were delivered from this gross imposition by the indignant interference of a grandson of Hillel.⁴⁷ There is every reason to believe that the shops which had intruded even under the Temple porticoes were not only sanctioned by their authority, but even managed for their profit.⁴⁸ To interfere with these was to rob them of one important source of that wealth and worldly comfort to which they attached such extravagant importance.⁴⁹ There was good reason why Hanan, the head representative of "the viper brood," as a Talmudic writer calls them, should strain to the utmost his cruel prerogative of power to crush a Prophet whose actions tended to make him and his powerful family at once wholly contemptible and comparatively poor.

⁵⁰Such then were the feelings of bitter contempt and hatred with which the ex-High Priest assumed the initiative in interrogating Jesus.⁵¹ The fact that he dared not avow them—nay, was forced to keep them wholly out of sight—would only add to the intensity of his bitterness.⁵² Even his method of procedure seems to have been as wholly illegal as was his assumption, in such a place and at such an hour, of any legal function whatever.⁵³ Anxious, at all hazards, to trump up some available charge of secret sedition, or of unorthodox teaching, he questioned Jesus of His disciples and of His doctrine.⁵⁴ The answer, for all its calmness, involved a deep reproof.⁵⁵ "I have spoken openly to the world; I never taught in the synagogue and in the Temple, where all the Jews come together, and in secret I said nothing."⁵⁶ Why askest thou me?⁵⁷ Ask those who have heard me what I said to them.⁵⁸ Lo! these"—pointing, perhaps, to the bystanders—"know what I said to them."⁵⁹ The emphatic repetition

¹ *ôrai*, not *laïci*.

of the 'I,' and its unusually significant position at the end of the sentence, show that a contrast was intended; as though He had said, "This midnight, this sedition, this secrecy, this indecent mockery of justice, are yours, not mine." There has never been anything esoteric in my doctrine; never anything to conceal in my actions; no hole-and-corner plots among my followers.⁶¹ But thou? and thine?"⁶² Even the minions of Annas felt the false position of their master under this calm rebuke; they felt that before the transparent innocence of this youthful Rabbi of Nazareth the hoary hypocrisy of the crafty Sadducee was abashed.⁶³ Answerest thou the High Priest so?" said one of them with a burst of illegal insolence; and then, unreprieved by this priestly violator of justice, he profaned, with the first infamous blow the sacred face of Christ.⁶⁴ Then first that face which, as the poet-preacher says, "the angels stare upon with wonder as infants at a bright sunbeam," was smitten by a contemptible slave.⁶⁵ The insult was borne with noble meekness.⁶⁶ Even St. Paul, when similarly insulted, flaring into sudden anger at such a grossly illegal violence, had scathed the fustian and his abetter with "God shall smite thee, thou whited wall:"⁶⁷ but He, the Son of God — He who was infinitely above all apostles and all angels — with no flash of anger, with no heightened tone of natural indignation, quietly reproved the impudent transgressor with the words, "If I spoke evil, bear witness concerning the evil; but if well, why smitest thou me?"⁶⁸ It was clear that nothing more could be extorted from Him; that before such a tribunal He would brook no further question.⁶⁹ Bound, in sign that He was to be condemned — though unheard and unsentenced — Annas sent Him across the court-yard to Joseph Caiaphas, his son-in-law, who, not by the grace of God, but by the grace of the Roman Procurator, was the titular High Priest.⁷⁰ Caiaphas, like his father-in-law, was a Sadducee — equally astute and unscrupulous with Annas, but endowed with less force of character and will.⁷¹ In his house took

¹ Acts xxiii. 3. It is remarkable that in the Talmudic malediction of these priestly families (*Pesach*. 57; *Toseft*. *Menachoth*, 15) there is an express complaint that they monopolized all offices by making their sons treasurers, capitalists (of the Temple), etc., and that "their servants (*עבדיהן*) strike the people with their rods." When Josephus talks of Hanan the son of Hanan as "a prodigious lover of liberty and admirer of democracy," the more context is quite sufficient to show that this is a very careless, if not dishonest, judgment; as for his wonderful "virtue" and "justice," it is probable that Josephus hardly cared to reconcile his own statements with what he records of him in *Ant.* xx. 9, § 1.

place the second private and irregular stage of the trial.⁷² There — for though the poor Apostles could not watch for one hour in sympathetic prayer, these nefarious plotters could watch all night in their deadly malice — a few of the most desperate enemies of Jesus among the Priests and Sadducees were met.⁷³ In form a session of the Sanhedrin there must at least have been twenty-three members present.⁷⁴ And we may perhaps be allowed to conjecture that this particular body before which Christ was now convened was mainly composed of Priests.⁷⁵ There were in fact three Sanhedrins, or as we should rather call them, committees of the Sanhedrin, which ordinarily met at different places — in the *Lishat Haggazzith*, or Paved Hall; in the *Beth Midrash*, or Chamber by the Partition of the Temple; and near the Gate of the Temple Mount.⁷⁶ Such being the case, it is no unreasonable supposition that these committees were composed of different elements, and that one of them may have been mainly sacerdotal in its constitution.⁷⁷ If so, it would have been the most likely of them all, at the present crisis, to embrace the most violent measures against One whose teaching now seemed to endanger the very existence of priestly rule.⁷⁸ But, whatever may have been the nature of the tribunal over which Caiaphas was now presiding, it is clear that the Priests were forced to change their tactics.⁷⁹ Instead of trying, as Hanan had done, to overawe and entangle Jesus with insidious questions, and so to involve Him in a charge of secret apostasy, they now tried to brand Him with the crime of public error.⁸⁰ In point of fact their own bitter divisions and controversies made the task of convicting Him a very difficult one.⁸¹ If they dwelt on any supposed opposition to civil authority, that would rather enlist the sympathies of the Pharisees in His favor; if they dwelt on supposed Sabbath violations or neglect of traditional observances, that would accord with the views of the Sadducees.⁸² The

¹ Matt. xxvi. 59-68; Mark xiv. 55-65. Irregular, for capital trials could only take place by daylight (*Sanhedr.* iv. 1).

² Twenty-three would be about a third of the entire number (*Matmonides*, *Sanhedr.* 3). Unless there be some slight confusion between the second and third trials, the words of Mark xiv. 63 cannot be taken au pied de la lettre, but must mean simply "all who were engaged in this conspiracy." Indeed, this seems to be distinctly implied in Mark xv. 1. Similarly in Matt. xxvi. 59, *ἡ συνήθεια αὐτῶν* must mean "that entire committee of the Sanhedrin," as may be seen by comparing it with xxvii. 1. That *συνήθεια* may be used simply for a small *Beth Din* is clear from Matt. v. 22. (*Jost*. i. 404.)

Sadducees dared not complain of His cleansing of the Temple: the Pharisees, or those who represented them, found it useless to advert to His denunciations of tradition. But Jesus, infinitely nobler than His own noblest Apostle, would not foment these latent animosities, or evoke for His own deliverance a contest of these slumbering prejudices. He did not disturb the temporary compromise which united them in a common hatred against Himself. Since, therefore, they had nothing else to go upon, the Chief Priests and the entire Sanhedrin "sought false witness" — such is the terribly simple expression of the Evangelists — "sought false witness against Jesus to put Him to death." Many men, with a greedy, unnatural depravity, seek false witness — mostly of the petty, ignoble, malignant sort; and the powers of evil usually supply it to them. The Talmud seems to insinuate that the custom, which they pretend was the general one, had been followed in the case of Christ, and that two witnesses had been placed in concealment while a treacherous disciple — ostensibly Judas Iscariot — had obtained from His own lips an avowal of His claims.

This, however, is no less false than the utterly absurd and unchronological assertion of the tract *Sanhedrin*, that Jesus had been excommunicated by Joshua Ben Perachiah, and that though for forty days a herald had proclaimed that He had brought magic from Egypt and seduced the people, no single witness came forward in His favor. Setting aside these absurd inventions, we learn from the Gospels that though the agents of these priests were eager to lie, yet their testimony was so false, so shadowy, so self-contradictory, that it all melted to nothing, and even those unjust and bitter judges could not with any decency accept it. But at last two came forward, whose false witness looked more promising. They had heard Him say something about destroying the Temple, and rebuilding it in three days. According to one version His expression had been, "I can destroy this Temple;" according to another, "I will destroy this Temple." The fact was that He had said neither, but "Destroy this Temple;" and the imperative had but been addressed, hypothetically, to them. They were to be the destroyers; He had but promised to rebuild. It was just

¹ *Sanhedr.*, 43 a. (Grätz, *Gesch. Jüd.* III. 242.) — See Excursus II. "Allusions to Christ and Christians in the Talmud."

² The brevity of the Evangelists prevents us from knowing whether the ordinary Jewish rules of evidence were observed. For Josephus's account of the trial of Zechariah the son of Baruch, see *Bell. Jud.* IV. 5, § 4.

one of those perjuries which was all the more perjured, because it bore some distant semblance to the truth; and by just giving a different nuance to His actual words they had, with the ingenuity of slander, reversed their meaning, and hoped to found upon them a charge of constructive blasphemy. But even this semblable perjury utterly broke down, and Jesus listened in silence while His disunited enemies hopelessly confuted each other's testimony. Guilt often breaks into excuses where perfect innocence is dumb.

He simply suffered His false accusers and their false listeners to entangle themselves in the hideous coil of their own malignant lies, and the silence of the innocent Jesus atoned for the excuses of the guilty Adam.

But that majestic silence troubled, thwarted, confounded, maddened them. It weighed them down for the moment with an incubus of intolerable self-condemnation. They felt, before that silence, as if they were the culprits, He the judge. And as every poisoned arrow of their carefully-provided perjuries fell harmless at His feet, as though blunted on the diamond shield of His white innocence, they began to fear lest, after all, their thirst for His blood would go unslaked, and their whole plot fail. Were they thus to be conquered by the feebleness of their own weapons, without His stirring a finger, or uttering a word? Was this Prophet of Nazareth to prevail against them, merely for lack of a few consistent lies? Was His life charmed even against calumny confirmed by oaths? It was intolerable.

Then Caiaphas was overcome with a paroxysm of fear and anger. Starting up from his judgment seat, and striding into the midst — with what a voice, with what an attitude we may well imagine! — "Answerest Thou NOTHING?" he exclaimed. What is it that these witness against Thee? Had not Jesus been aware that these His judges were wilfully feeding on ashes and seeking lies, He might have answered; but now His awful silence remained unbroken. Then, reduced to utter despair and fury, this false High Priest — with marvellous inconsistency, with disgraceful illegality — still standing as it were with a threatening attitude over his prisoner, exclaimed, "I adjure Thee by the

¹ Mark xiv. 60, *ἀναστή . . . ἐκ πύλου*. The Sanhedrin sat on opposite divans of a circular hall; the *Nasi*, or President, who was usually the High Priest, sat in the middle at the farther end, with the *Ab Beth Din*, or Father of the House of Judgment, on his right, and the *Chakam*, or Wise Man, on his left. The accused was placed opposite to him. (See *Jas. Bell. Jud.* IV. 5, § 4; *Kelm*, III. II. 328.)

— living God to tell us "— what? whether Thou art a malefactor? whether Thou hast secretly taught sedition? whether Thou hast openly uttered blasphemy?— no, but (and surely the question showed the dread misgiving which lay under all their deadly conspiracy against Him)—

"WHETHER THOU ART THE CHRIST, THE SON OF GOD?"

DA 705
35209.75
D-290
Strange question to a bound, defenceless, condemned criminal; and strange question from such a questioner—a High Priest of His people! Strange question from the judge who was hounding on his false witnesses against the prisoner! Yet so adjured, and to such a question, Jesus could not be silent; on such a point He could not leave Himself open to misinterpretation. In the days of His happier ministry, when they would have taken Him by force to make Him a King—in the days when to claim the Messiahship in their sense would have been to meet all their passionate prejudices half way, and to place Himself upon the topmost pinnacle of their adoring homage—in those days He had kept His title of Messiah utterly in the background; but now, at this awful decisive moment, when death was near—when, humanly speaking, nothing could be gained, everything must be lost, by the avowal—there thrilled through all the ages—thrilled through that Eternity, which is the synchronism of all the future, and all the present, and all the past—the solemn answer, "I AM;" and ye shall see the Son of Man sitting on the right hand of power, and coming with the clouds of heaven." In that answer the thunder rolled—a thunder louder than at Sinai, though the ears of the cynic and the Sadducee heard it not then, nor hear it now. In overacted and ill-omened horror, the unjust judge who had thus supplemented the failure of the perjuries which he had vainly sought—the false High Priest rending his linen robes before the True—demanded of the assembly His instant condemnation.

¹ In Matt. xxvi. 64, *2d* *drac.* Alford refers to John x. 49.

² Dan. vii. 13: "I saw in the night visions, and, behold, one like the Son of Man came with the clouds of heaven, and came to the Ancient of Days, and they brought him near before him." Hence the hybrid term, Bar-*enai*, "Son of a cloud," applied to the Messiah in *Sanhedr.* 96, 0.

³ This was forbidden to the High Priest in cases of mourning (Lev. x. 6; xxi. 10); but the Jewish *Holocausta* considered it lawful in cases of blasphemy (*Yidduph*) (1 Macc. xi. 71; Jos. B. J. ii. 15, § 4). As to Joseph Colophas the Talmud is absolutely silent; but the general conception which it gives of the priests of this epoch agrees entirely with the Gospels. It tells how since the days of Valerius Gracchus the office had constantly been bought and sold; how the widow Martha, daughter of Boethus, gave Agrippa II. two

DA 705
35209.75
"BLASPHEMY!" he exclaimed; "what further need have we of witnesses? See, now ye heard his blasphemy! What is your decision?" And with the confused tumultuous cry, "He is *ish maveth*," "A man of death," "Guilty of death," the dark conclave was broken up, and the second stage of the trial of Jesus was over.¹

bushels of gold *denarii* to buy it for Joshua Ben Gamala, her betrothed; how it was disgraced by cringing meanness and supple sycophancy; how there were more than eighty of these High Priests of the second Temple (which they quoted in Illustration of Prov. x. 27), whereas there were only sixteen of the first Temple (Frankl, *Monatschrift.* Dec. 1852, p. 588; Raphall, *Hist. of Jews*, ii. 368); and many other disgraces and enormities.
¹ Cf. Numb. xxv. 31.

CHAPTER LIX.

THE INTERVAL BETWEEN THE TRIALS.

"I gave my back to the smiters, and my cheeks to them that plucked at the hair: I hid not my face from shame and spitting."—ISA. L. 6.

¹ AND this was how the Jews at last received their promised Messiah—longed for with passionate hopes during two thousand years; since then regretted in bitter agony for well-nigh two thousand more! ² From this moment He was regarded by all the apparitors of the Jewish Court as a heretic, liable to death by stoning; and was only remanded into custody to be kept till break of day, because by daylight only, and in the *Lisbat Haggazzith*, or Hall of Judgment, and only by a full session of the entire Sanhedrin, could He be legally condemned. ³ And since now they looked upon Him as a fit person to be insulted with impunity, He was haled through the court-yard to the guard-room with blows and curses, in which it may be that not only the attendant menials, but even the cold but now infuriated Sadducees took their share. ⁴ It was now long past midnight, and the spring air was then most chilly. ⁵ In the centre of the court the servants of the priests were warming themselves under the frosty starlight as they stood round a fire of coals. ⁶ And as He was led past that fire He heard—what was to Him a more deadly bitter-ness than any which His brutal persecutors could pour into His cup of anguish—He heard His boldest Apostle denying Him with oaths.

⁷ For during these two sad hours of His commencing tragedy, as He stood in the Halls of Annas and of Caiaphas, another moral tragedy, which He had already prophesied, had been taking place in the outer court.

⁸ As far as we can infer from the various narratives,⁹ the

¹ "Millionen gabrochener Herzen und Augen haben seinen Tod noch nicht abgebußt" (Grätz, iii. 245). On the whole of this trial, see the powerful and noble remarks of Lange (iv. 309) and Keim (*ubi supra*).

² In this narrative again there are obvious variations in the quadruple accounts of the Evangelists; but the text will sufficiently show that there is no irreconcilable discrepancy if they are judged fairly and on common-sense principles. The conception of accuracy in ancient writers differed

palace in Jerusalem, conjointly occupied by Annas the real, and Caiaphas the titular High Priest, seems to have been built round a square court, and entered by an arched passage or vestibule; and on the farther side of it, probably up a short flight of steps,¹ was the hall in which the committee of the Sanhedrin had met. ² Timidly, and at a distance, two only of the Apostles had so far recovered from their first panic as to follow far in the rear³ of the melancholy procession. ⁴ One of these—the beloved disciple—known perhaps to the High Priest's household as a young fisherman of the Lake of Galilee—had found ready admittance, with no attempt to conceal his sympathies or his identity. ⁵ Not so the other. ⁶ Unknown, and a Galilean, he had been stopped at the door by the youthful portress. ⁷ Better, far better, had his exclusion been final. ⁸ For it was a night of tumult, of terror, of suspicion; and Peter was weak, and his intense love was mixed with fear, and yet he was venturing into the very thick of his most dangerous enemies. ⁹ But John, regretting that he should be debarred from entrance, and judging perhaps of his friend's firmness by his own, exerted his influence to obtain admission for him. ¹⁰ With bold imprudence, and concealing the better motives which had brought him thither, Peter, warned though he had been, but warned in vain, walked into the court-yard, and sat down in the very middle of the servants¹¹ of the very men before whom at that moment his Lord was being arraigned on a charge of death. ¹² The portress, after the admission of those concerned in the capture, seems to have been relieved (as was only natural at that late hour) by another maid, and advancing to the group of her fellow-servants, she fixed a curious and earnest gaze¹³ on the dubious stranger as he sat full in the red glare of the firelight, and then, with a flash of recognition, she exclaimed, "Why, you, as well as the other, were with Jesus of Galilee." ¹⁴ Peter was off his guard. ¹⁵ At this

widely from our own, and a document is by no means necessarily inaccurate, because the brevity, or the special purpose, or the limited information of the writer, made it necessarily incomplete. "Qui plura dicit, pauciora complectitur; qui pauciora dicit, plura non negat."

¹ Mark xiv. 66, *καὶ ἦν ἐν τῇ ἀλκῇ*.

² Luke xxii. 54, *παρῳδῶν*.

³ Luke xxii. 65, *πλεονεχῶν*.

⁴ Luke xxii. 66, *δρισκεῖται*. For the other particulars in this clause compare John xviii. 17 with Matt. xxvi. 69; Mark xiv. 67. For female porters, see Mark xiii. 34; Acts xii. 13.

⁵ It is most instructive to observe that no one of the Evangelists puts exactly the same words into her mouth (showing clearly the nature of

period of life his easy impressionable nature was ever liable to be moulded by the influence of the moment, and he passed readily into passionate extremes.²² Long, long afterwards, we find a wholly unexpected confirmation of the probability of this sad episode of his life, in the readiness with which he lent himself to the views of the Apostle of the Gentiles, and the equal facility with which a false shame, and a fear of "them which were of the circumcision," made him swerve into the wrong and narrow proprieties of "certain which came from James."²⁴ And thus it was that the mere curious

question of an inquisitive young girl startled him by its very suddenness into a quick denial of his Lord.²² Doubtless, at the moment, it presented itself to him as a mere prudent evasion of needless danger.²³ But did he hope to stop there?

²⁴ Alas, "once denied" is always "thrice denied;" and the sudden "manslaughter upon truth" always, and rapidly, develops into its utter and deliberate murder; and a lie is like a stone set rolling upon a mountain-side, which is instantly beyond its utterer's control.

²⁵ For a moment, perhaps, his denial was accepted, for it had been very public, and very emphatic.²⁶ But it warned him of his danger.²⁷ Guiltily he slinks away again from the glowing brazier to the arched entrance of the court, as the crowing of a cock smote, not quite unheeded, on his guilty ear.²⁸

²⁹ His respite was very short.³⁰ The portress — part of whose duty it was to draw attention to dubious strangers — had evidently gossiped about him to the servant who had relieved her in charge of the door.³¹ Some other idlers were standing about, and this second maid pointed him out to them as having certainly been with Jesus of Nazareth.³² A lie seemed more than ever necessary now, and to secure him-

their report), and yet each faithfully preserves the *sal*, which, in the maid's question, couples Peter with John.

¹ Matt. xxvi. 70, *ἡμετέριον ἀδελφόν*; Mark xiv. 68, *ὁς ἑστὶν (sc. ἀδελφός), σὺ δὲ ἡμετέριον εἶ*.

² Matt. xxvi. 71, *ὁς τὸν κυρία*; Mark xiv. 68, *ὁς τὸν ἀδελφόν*. There must be some trivial "inaccuracy," if any one cares to press the word, either here or in John xviii. 25 (*ὁς τὸν ἀδελφόν*), Luke xxii. 58 (*ἡμετέριον*). A wretched pseudo-criticism has fixed on the cock as "unhistorical," because the Jews are thought to have held cocks unclean, from their scratching in the dung. But not to mention that the bird may have belonged to some Roman in the Tower of Antonia, other Talmudical stories show that cocks were kept at Jerusalem: e.g., the story of a cock that was stoned for killing an infant (*Herachdih* 27, 1; see Buxtorf, *Lex. Talm.* 81, 2653). It is a concession to notice such objections, particularly when they are supposed to rest on Talmudical authorities quoted from our imperfect knowledge of a literature which is invariably unhistorical, and abounds in self-contradictions. See Excursus XII., "Notes on the Talmud."

DA 712.7 self from all further molestation he even confirmed it with an oath.³³ But now flight seemed impossible, for it would only confirm suspicion; so with desperate, gloomy resolution he once more — with feelings which can barely be imagined — joined the unfriendly and suspicious group who were standing round the fire.

DA 712.7 A whole hour passed: for him it must have been a fearful hour, and one never to be forgotten.³⁴ The temperament of Peter was far too nervous and vehement to suffer him to feel at ease under this new complication of ingratitude and falsehood.³⁵ If he remain silent among these priestly servitors, he is betrayed by the restless self-consciousness of an evil secret which tries in vain to simulate indifference; if he brazen it out with careless talk, he is fatally betrayed by his Galilean burr.³⁶ It is evident that, in spite of denial and of oath, they wholly distrust and despise him; and at last one of the High Priest's servants — a kinsman of the wounded Malchus — once more strongly and confidently charged him with having been with Jesus in the garden, taunting him, in proof of it, with the misplaced gutturals of his provincial dialect.³⁷ The others joined in the accusation.³⁸ Unless he persisted, all was lost which might seem to have been gained.³⁹ Perhaps one more effort would set him quite free from these troublesome charges, and enable him to wait and see the end.

⁴⁰ Pressed closer and closer by the sneering, threatening band of idle servitors — sinking deeper and deeper into the mire of faithlessness and fear — "then began he to curse and to swear, saying, I know not the man."⁴¹ And at that fatal moment of guilt, which might well have been for him the moment of an apostasy as fatal and final as had been that of his brother apostle — at that fatal moment, while those shameless curses still quivered on the air — first the cock crew in the cold gray dusk, and at the same moment, catching the last accents of those perjured oaths, either through the open portal of the judgment-hall,² or as he was led past the group at the fireside through the open court, with rude pushing and ribald jeers, and blows and spitting — the Lord — the Lord in the agony of His humiliation, in the majesty of His silence — "the Lord turned and looked upon

¹ John xviii. 26 (*συγγενής*); Luke xxii. 58 (*ἀλλος τις δειγνύμενος*); Matt. xxvi. 73 (*ὁ τὸν ἀδελφόν*); Mark xiv. 70 (*ὁ τὸν ἀδελφόν*).

² The room in which Jesus was being tried may have been one of the kind called *mark'ad* in the East, i.e., a room with an open front, two or more arches, and a low railing the floor of which is a paved *terrazza* (Lane, *Mod. Egyptians*, i. 22.)

Peter." ⁴² Blessed are those on whom, when He looks in sorrow, the Lord looks also with love! ⁴³ It was enough. ⁴⁴ Like an arrow through his inmost soul, shot the mute eloquent anguish of that reproachful glance. ⁴⁵ As the sunbeam smites the last hold of snow upon the rock, ere it rushes in avalanche down the tormented hill, so the false self of the fallen Apostle slipped away. ⁴⁶ It was enough: "he saw no more enemies, he knew no more danger, he feared no more death." ⁴⁷ Flinging the fold of his mantle over his head, ⁴⁸ he too, like Judas, rushed forth into the night. ⁴⁹ Into the night, but not as Judas; into the unsunned outer darkness of miserable self-condemnation, but not into the midnight of remorse, and of despair; into the night, but, as has been beautifully said, it was "to meet the morning dawn." ⁵⁰ If the angel of Innocence had left him, the angel of Repentance took him gently by the hand. ⁵¹ Sternly, yet tenderly, the spirit of grace led up this broken-hearted penitent before the tribunal of his own conscience; and there his old life, his old shame, his old weakness, his old self was doomed to that death of godly sorrow which was to issue in a new and a nobler birth. ⁵² And it was this crime, committed against Him by the man who had first proclaimed Him as the Christ — who had come to Him over the stormy water — who had drawn the sword for Him in Gethsemane — who had affirmed so indignantly that he would die with Him rather than deny Him — it was this denial, confirmed by curses, that Jesus heard immediately after He had been condemned to death, and at the very commencement of His first terrible derision. ⁵³ For, in the guard-room to which He was remanded to await the break of day, all the ignorant malice of religious hatred, all the narrow vulgarity of brutal spite, all the cold innate cruelty which lurks under the abjectness of Oriental servility, was let loose against Him. ⁵⁴ His very meekness, His very silence, His very majesty — the very stainlessness of His innocence, the very grandeur of His fame — every divine circumstance and quality which raised Him to a height so infinitely immeasurable above His persecutors — all these made Him an all the more welcome victim for their low and devilish ferocity. ⁵⁵ They spat in His face; they smote Him with rods; they struck Him with their closed fists and with their open

¹ *ἐκπαλὲς* (Mark xiv. 72). This seems a better meaning than (i.) "vehemently" (Matthew, Luke, *καρπῶς*), or (ii.) "when he thought thereof" (but cf. Marc. Aurel. *Comment.* x 30), or (iii.) "hiding his face in his hands."

² Lange, vi. 310.

palms. ⁵⁶ In the fertility of their furious and hateful insence, they invented against Him a sort of game. ⁵⁷ Blindfolding His eyes, they hit Him again and again, with the repeated question, "Prophecy to us, O Messiah, who it is that smote thee." ⁵⁸ So they whiled away the dark cold hours till the morning, revenging themselves upon His impassive innocence for their own present vileness and previous terror; and there, in the midst of that savage and wanton varlety, the Son of God, bound and blindfold, stood in His long and silent agony, defenceless and alone. ⁵⁹ It was His first derision — His derision as the Christ, the Judge attained, the Holy One a criminal, the Deliverer in bonds.

iii. ⁶⁰ At last the miserable lingering hours were over, and the gray dawn shuddered, and the morning blushed upon that memorable day. ⁶¹ And with the earliest dawn — for so the Oral Law ordained, ⁶² and they who could trample on all justice and all mercy were yet scrupulous about all the infinitely little — Jesus was led into the *Lishat Haggazith*, or Paved Hall at the southeast of the Temple, or perhaps into the *Chanujôth*, or "Shops," which owed their very existence to Hanan and his family, where the Sanhedrin had been summoned, for His third actual, but His first formal and legal trial. ⁶³ It was now probably about six o'clock in

¹ Matt. xxvi. 67, *ἐκπαλὲς* (slapped with open palm); *ἐκπαλὲς* (struck, probably with sticks); Mark xiv. 65, *ἐκπαλὲς* (slapped); Luke xxii. 63, 64, *ἐκπαλὲς* (slapped); *ἐκπαλὲς* (slapped). There is a pathetic variety in these five forms of insult by blows [cf. Acts xxi. 32; xxiii. 2; Isa. l. 6; and the treatment of one of Annas's own sons (Jos. B. J. iv. 5, § 3)].

² Wetstein quotes from *Sanhedr.* f. 93 b, a similar tentative applied to the false Messiah, Bar-Cochebas.

³ Zohar, 56. See Excursus V.

⁴ Luke xxii. 66-71. It is only by courtesy that this body can be regarded as a Sanhedrin at all. Jost observes that there is in the Roman period no trace of any genuine legal Sanhedrin, apart from mere special incompetent gatherings. (See Jos. Ant. xx. 9, § 1; B. J. iv. 5, § 4.) But all the facts about the Sanhedrin of this period are utterly obscure. On Sabbaths and feast days they are said to have met in the *Beth Midrash*, or Temple Synagogue, which was built along the *Chel*, or wall between the Outer Court and the Court of the Women. (Lightfoot, *Hor. Hebr.*; Keim, etc.) R. Ismael, son of It. Josè, the author of *Seder Olam*, is reported to have said that "forty years before the destruction of the Temple the Sanhedrin exiled itself (from the Paved Hall), and established itself in the *Chanujôth*" (*Aboda Zara*, 8 b); and this is the first of ten migrations of the Sanhedrin mentioned in *Rosh Hashana*, 31 a. These *Chanujôth*, four in number, are said to have been shops for the sale of doves, etc., under a cedar on the Mount of Olives, connected with the Temple by a bridge over the Kidron (*Taanith*, iv. 8). They seem to have been founded by the family of Annan, who made them very profitable, and they are called *Chanujôth*. They were destroyed by the mob when the goods of these notorious priests were pillaged three years before the siege of Jerusalem (Dietrich, *Hist. de Pal.* 468; Huxford, *Lex. Talm.* s. v. *Chanujôth*, p. 514.)

the morning, and a full session met.⁶² Well-nigh all—for there were the noble exceptions at least of Nicodemus and of Joseph of Arimathea, and we may hope also of Gamaliel, the grandson of Hillel—were inexorably bent upon His death.⁶³ The Priests were there, whose greed and selfishness He had reprov'd; the Elders, whose hypocrisy He had branded; the Scribes, whose ignorance He had exposed;⁶⁴ and worse than all, the worldly, sceptical, would-be philosophic Sadducees, always the most cruel and dangerous of opponents,⁶⁵ whose empty sapience He had so grievously confuted.⁶⁶ All these were bent upon His death; all filled with repulsion at that infinite goodness; all burning with hatred against a nobler nature than any which they could even conceive in their loftiest dreams.⁶⁷ And yet their task in trying to achieve His destruction was not easy.⁶⁸ The Jewish fables of His death in the Talmud, which are shamelessly false from beginning to end,⁶⁹ say that for forty days, though summoned daily by heraldic proclamation, not one person came forward, according to custom, to maintain His innocence, and that consequently He was first stoned as a seducer of the people (*mesith*), and then hung on the accursed tree.⁷⁰ The fact was that the Sanhedrists had not the power of inflicting death,⁷¹ and even if the Pharisees would

¹ These are the Sopharim, who may perhaps have ordinarily formed a separate committee of the Sanhedrin. See Excursus XIII., "The Sanhedrin."

² Though Josephus was a Pharisee, we may, from its probability, accept his testimony on this point—*τοις ἀπὸ τῶν ἑκαστῶν ἀνδράσιν ὁμοῦ τοῦτο* (Ant. xiii. 10, § 6; B. J. ii. 8, § 14). The philosophic immorality of a man of the world, when once thoroughly irritated, knows no scruples. Ordinarily the Sanhedrin was a mild tribunal. The members fasted a whole day when they had condemned any one to death, and many Rabbis declared themselves with strong abhorrence against capital punishments. Some of them—like R. Akiba—considered it a blot on a meeting of the Sanhedrin to condemn even one offender to death. (Salvador, *Jasit. de Mote*, ii.; *Fl. de Jésus*, ii. 108.) Their savagery on this occasion was doubtless due to Sadducean influence. The *Megillath Taanith*, § 10, mentions a sort of traditional penal code of this party which seems to have been Draconian in its severity, and which the Pharisees got set aside. These Sadducean priests, like Simon Ben Shetach before them, had "hot hands." (Derenbourg, p. 106.) See Excursus XIV., "Pharisees and Sadducees."

³ Any one who cares to look at the Talmudic falsehoods and confusions about Ben Sotada, Pandora, etc., may see them in Buxtorf, *Lex. Talm.* s. v. 770, p. 1458, seqq.; Derenbourg, *Hist. de Pal.* 468, seqq. In unexpurgated editions of the Talmud, the name of Jesus is said to occur twenty times. See Excursus II., "Allusions to Christ and Christians in the Talmud."

⁴ This is distinctly stated by the Jews in John xviii. 31, and though contemporary notices seem to show that in any common case the Romans might overlook a judicial murder on religious grounds (John v. 18; vii. 25; Acts xxiii. 27), yet the Jews could not always act as they liked in such cases with impunity, as was proved by the reprisals and degradation on

have ventured to usurp it in a tumultuary sedition, as they afterwards did in the case of Stephen, the less fanatic and more cosmopolitan Sadducees would be less likely to do so.⁶⁸ Not content, therefore, with the *cherem*, or ban of greater excommunication, their only way to compass His death was to hand Him over to the secular arm.⁶⁹ At present they had only against Him a charge of constructive blasphemy, founded on an admission forced from Him by the High Priest, when even their own suborned witnesses had failed to perjure themselves to their satisfaction.⁷⁰ There were many old accusations against Him, on which they could not rely.⁷¹ His violations of the Sabbath, as they called them, were all connected with miracles, and brought them, therefore, upon dangerous ground.⁷² His rejection of oral tradition involved a question on which Sadducees and Pharisees were at a deadly feud.⁷³ His authoritative cleansing of the Temple might be regarded with favor both by the Rabbis and the people.⁷⁴ The charge of esoteric evil doctrines had been refuted by the utter publicity of His life.⁷⁵ The charge of open heresies had broken down, from the total absence of supporting testimony.⁷⁶ The problem before them was to convert the ecclesiastical charge of constructive blasphemy into a civil charge of constructive treason.⁷⁷ But how could this be done?⁷⁸ Not half the members of the Sanhedrin had been present at the hurried, nocturnal, and therefore illegal, session in the house of Caiaphas;⁷⁹ yet if they were all to condemn Him by a formal sentence, they must all hear something on which to found their vote.⁸⁰ In answer to the adjuration of Caiaphas, He had solemnly admitted that He was the Messiah and the Son of God.⁸¹ The latter declaration would have been meaningless as a charge against Him before the tribunal of the Romans; but if He would repeat the former, they might twist it into something politically seditious.⁸² But He would not repeat it, in spite of their insistence, because He knew that it was open to their wilful misinterpretation, and because they were evidently acting in flagrant violation of

the younger Hanan for the part which he and the Sanhedrin took in the execution of James the brother of Jesus. Döllinger (*First Age of the Church*, E. Tr., p. 420) takes a different view, and thinks that all they meant was, that they could not crucify or put to death during a feast. But whatever may be the difficulties of the subject, the Talmud seems to confirm the distinct assertion of St. John. (*Heraklōth*, f. 58, l. and six or seven other places. See Buxtorf, *Lex. Talm.* p. 514.)

¹ Acts ii. 23, *διὰ χειρὸς ἀνθρώπων κρίναντες αὐτόν*.

² "Be tardy in judgment" (*Pirke Abhoth*; Sanh. i. f. 7). נח ריבא כשל ריבא (Sanh. 95, 1; Buxtorf, *Lex. Talm.*, p. 515).

their own express rules and traditions, which demanded that every arraigned criminal should be regarded and treated as innocent until his guilt was actually proved.

Perhaps, as they sat there with their King, bound and helpless before them, standing silent amid their clamorous voices, one or two of their most venerable members may have recalled the very different scene when Shemaia (Sameas) alone had broken the deep silence of their own cowardly terror upon their being convened to pass judgment on Herod for his murders. On that occasion, as Sameas had pointed out, Herod had stood before them, not, "in a submissive manner, with his hair dishevelled, and in a black and mourning garment," but "clothed in purple, and with the hair of his head finely trimmed, and with his armed men about him."

And since no one dared, for very fear, even to mention the charges against him, Shemaia had prophesied that the day of vengeance should come, and that the very Herod before whom they and their prince Hyrcanus were trembling, would one day be the minister of God's anger against both him and them. What a contrast was the present scene with that former one of half a century before! Now they were clamorous, their King was silent; they were powerful, their King defenceless; they guilty, their King divinely innocent; they the ministers of earthly wrath, their King the arbiter of Divine retribution.

But at last, to end a scene at once miserable and disgraceful, Jesus spoke. "If I tell you," He said, "ye will not believe; and if I ask you a question, you will not answer me."

Still, lest they should have any excuse for failing to understand who He was, He added in tones of solemn warning, "But henceforth shall the Son of Man sit on the right hand of the power of God."

"Art thou, then," they all exclaimed, "the Son of God?" "Ye say that I am," He answered, in a formula with which they were familiar, and of which they understood the full significance. And then they too cried out, as Caiaphas had done before, "What

¹ Jos. Ant. xiv. 9, § 4; Bab. Sanhedrin, f. 19, a, b. It is on this memorable occasion that we first meet with the name of Sanhedrin. Here Hyrcanus is, with the usual Jewish carelessness, called Jannous, and Shomala is called Simeon Ben Shetach. There seems, however, to be inextricable confusion between the names Hillel, Potho, Abtalion, and Samon, Shamnal, Shomala, and Simeon.

² Cf. Dan. vii. 13; Ps. viii. 4; cx. i.

³ On this formula (*anti amaria, Koini*), which is found in the Talmud, see Schöttgen, *Hor. Hebr.*, p. 225, and the remarks of De Quincey, *Works*, iii. 304. It is clearly more than a mere affirmation.

further need have we of witness? for we ourselves heard from His own mouth." And so in this third condemnation by Jewish authority — a condemnation which they thought that Pilate would simply ratify, and so appease their burning hate — ended the third stage of the trial of our Lord. And this sentence also seems to have been followed by a second derision resembling the first, but even more full of insult, and worse to bear than the former, inasmuch as the derision of Priests, and Elders, and Sadducees is even more repulsively odious than that of menials and knaves.

Terribly soon did the Nemesis fall on the main actor in the lower stages of this iniquity. Doubtless through all those hours Judas had been a secure spectator of all that had occurred, and when the morning dawned upon that chilly night, and he knew the decision of the Priests and of the Sanhedrin, and saw that Jesus was now given over for crucifixion to the Roman Governor, then he began fully to realize all that he had done. There is in a great crime an awfully illuminating power. It lights up the theatre of the conscience with an unnatural glare, and, expelling the twilight glamour of self-interest, shows the actions and motives in their full and true aspect. In Judas, as in so many thousands before and since, this opening of the eyes which follows the consummation of an awful sin to which many other sins have led, drove him from remorse to despair, from despair to madness, from madness to suicide. Had he, even then, but gone to his Lord and Saviour, and prostrated himself at His feet to implore forgiveness, all might have been well. But, alas! he went instead to the patrons and associates and tempters of his crime. From them he met with no pity, no counsel. He was a despised and broken instrument, and now he was tossed aside. They met his maddening remorse with chilly indifference and callous contempt. "I have sinned," he shrieked to them, "in that I have betrayed innocent blood." Did he expect them to console his remorseful agony, to share the blame of his guilt, to excuse and console him with their lofty dignity? What is that to us? "What is that to us?" was the sole and heartless reply they deigned

¹ Unless Luke xxii. 63-65 (which seems as though it refers to verse 71) describes the issues of one of the trials which he has not narrated; but, literally taken, we might infer from Matt. xxvi. 67, that those who insulted Christ after the second trial were not only the servants.

² Tac. Ann. xiv. 10. "Perfucto domum acclere magnitudo ofus intellecta est" (cf. Juv. Sat. xiii. 238). I have tried to develop this strange law of the moral world in my *Silence and Voices of God*, p. 43.

³ Lk. xxvii. 4, 2d 44. The same words were given back to them by Pilate (ver 24).

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III

Narrative material on Judas used in the DA, chapter 76, was drawn from three chapters, VI, VII, and VIII, in 3SP. Therefore the relevant passages are included here. Possible parallels, from which part of the SP material might have been drawn, can be found in works on the life of Christ by Fleetwood and Krummacher.

Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III

Chapter VI - The Passover Supper - Pages 81-83

¹THE scribes and priests now counseled together how they might take Jesus without raising a tumult among the people; for many of those who witnessed his mighty works believed him to be the prophet of the Most High, and would have been greatly incensed at any attempt upon his liberty. ²So the dignitaries decided that open violence would not be good policy, but that treachery must serve their purpose.

³Judas, one of the twelve, proposed secretly to betray Jesus into their hands, by leading them to one of the Saviour's resorts for prayer and retirement. ⁴In this quiet place they could make sure of their prey, for there would be no multitude to oppose them. ⁵Judas, ever greedy for gain, made a contract with the priests and rulers to betray his Master into their hands for thirty pieces of silver. ⁶The Lord of life and glory was sold to ignominy and death by one of his disciples for a paltry sum of money.

⁷The heart of Judas had not suddenly grown thus base and corrupt. ⁸His love of mammon, like any vice which is left unchecked, had daily grown stronger, until it overbalanced his love for the Saviour, and he had become an idolater. ⁹His mind had become debased by covetousness; and a man who is enslaved by avarice is in danger of going to any lengths in crime.

¹⁰Judas, with the rest of the twelve, had been privileged to listen to the teachings of Jesus, and to

witness his acts of sacrifice for the benefit of men. ¹¹He had noted his forbearance and patience; that when weary, hungry, and pressed upon by the multitude of poor and afflicted, he had pitied their cries and turned none away unrelieved. ¹²Judas had seen him perform miracles in giving health to the dying and joy to the despairing. ¹³He himself had felt in his person evidences of his divine power. ¹⁴But when men reject light, and blindly follow their natural inclinations, they are led into darkness, and the plainest facts are unheeded. ¹⁵Judas was naturally avaricious, and he had fostered this evil propensity until it had become the ruling motive of his life.

¹⁶We look with horror upon the treachery of Judas; but his case represents a large class who file in under the banner of Christ, yet are really his worst enemies. ¹⁷They worship only self and money, and use the name of Christian as a cloak to hide their evil deeds. ¹⁸They sell their integrity for money, and their Saviour for a little worldly advantage.

¹⁹After Judas had closed the contract by which he agreed to betray his Master into the hands of those who thirsted for his life, he mingled with the other disciples as though innocent of wrong and interested in the work of preparing for the passover. ²⁰The betrayer thought that his base purposes were hidden from his Master, although every day furnished fresh evidence that the thoughts and intents of all hearts were open unto him.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III

Chapter VII - In the Garden - Pages 105-106

¹⁵⁷Judas was himself surprised that Jesus should deliver himself into the hands of those who sought to destroy him. ¹⁵⁸He had frequently known the Saviour's enemies to lay plans to take him, but Jesus would quietly depart and defeat their murderous designs. ¹⁵⁹Now the betrayer saw with astonishment that his master suffered himself to be bound and led away. ¹⁶⁰The false disciple flattered himself, however, that Jesus had only permitted himself to be taken that he might manifest his power by delivering himself from his enemies in a miraculous manner. ¹⁶¹He knew that nothing else could free him from that armed band. ¹⁶²For three years the Jews had been secretly planning to take him, and now that they had accomplished this they would not let him escape death, if they could prevent it.

Chapter VIII - In the Judgment Hall - Pages 123-126

²⁰⁴Just then a hoarse voice rang through the hall, which sent a thrill of terror through the hearts of all present: He is innocent. ²⁰⁵Spare him, O Caiaphas! ²⁰⁶He has done nothing worthy of death! ²⁰⁷The tall form of Judas was now seen pressing his way through the startled crowd. ²⁰⁸His face was pale and haggard, and large drops of

perspiration stood upon his forehead. ²⁰⁹He rushed to the throne of judgment, and threw down before the high priest the pieces of silver he had received as the price of his Lord's betrayal. ²¹⁰He eagerly grasped the robe of Caiaphas, and implored him to release Jesus, declaring that he was innocent of all crime. ²¹¹Caiaphas angrily shook him off, but he was confused and knew not what to say. ²¹²The perfidy of the priests was revealed before the people. ²¹³It was evident to all that Judas had been bribed to deliver Jesus into the hands of those who sought his life.

²¹⁴Judas continued to beseech Caiaphas to do nothing against Jesus, declaring that he was indeed the Son of God, and cursing himself that he had betrayed innocent blood. ²¹⁵But the high priest, having recovered his self-possession, answered with chilling scorn, "What is that to us! see thou to that!" ²¹⁶He then represented to the people that Judas was some poor maniac, one of the mad followers of Jesus, and charged them not to let any influence prevail to release the prisoner, who was a base deceiver.

²¹⁷Finding his prayers were in vain, Judas fell at the feet of Jesus, acknowledging him to be the Son of God, begging forgiveness for his sin, and imploring him to exercise his God-like power and deliver himself from his enemies. ²¹⁸The Saviour did not reproach his betrayer either by look or word. ²¹⁹He knew that he was suffering

the bitterest remorse for his crime. ²²⁰He gazed compassionately upon Judas, and declared that for that hour he had come into the world.

²²¹A murmur of surprise ran through the assembly at the heavenly forbearance manifested by Jesus. ²²²Again a conviction swept over their minds that this man was more than mortal. ²²³But the question then arose, If he was indeed the Son of God, why did he not free himself from his bonds and rise triumphant above his accusers?

²²⁴The love of money had perverted the nobler nature of Judas, making him a fit agent for Satan to use in the betrayal of Christ. ²²⁵When Judas had become annoyed at the implied rebuke of Jesus because of his covetous spirit upon the occasion of Mary anointing her Lord with costly ointment, he yielded to the tempter, and gave Satan easy access to his mind. ²²⁶But when he decided to sell his Master to the murderous priests and rulers, he had no thought that Jesus would permit himself to be taken. ²²⁷He thought the priests would be cheated of their bribe, and he, the betrayer, would secure the money to use for some purpose of his own, and Jesus would have a new opportunity to display his divine power in delivering himself from the wiles of his enemies.

²²⁸From the time of his betrayal in the garden, Judas had not lost sight of the Saviour. ²²⁹He eagerly looked for him to surprise his enemies by appearing before them in the

character of the Son of God, setting at naught all their plots and power. ²³⁰But when he saw him meekly submitting to their abuse, suffering himself to be tried and condemned to death, his heart smote him, and he realized the full extent of his own crime--he had sold his divine Master to shame and death. ²³¹He remembered how kind and considerate Jesus had ever been to him, and his heart filled with remorse and anguish. ²³²He now despised the covetousness which Jesus had reproved, and which had tempted him to sell the Saviour for a few pieces of silver.

²³³Perceiving that his entreaties to spare the life of Jesus availed nothing with the high priest, he rushed from the hall in despair, crying, It is too late! ²³⁴It is too late! ²³⁵He felt unable to live to see Jesus crucified, and, in an agony of remorse, went out and hanged himself.

²³⁶Afterward the money which Judas had cast down before the priest was used for the purchase of a public burial ground. ²³⁷"And the chief priests took the silver pieces, and said, it is not lawful for to put them into the treasury, because it is the price of blood. ²³⁸And they took counsel, and bought with them the potter's field, to bury strangers in. ²³⁹Wherefore that field was called, The field of blood, unto this day."

²⁴⁰If any testimony had been needed to prove the innocence of Jesus, it was given in the confession of Judas. ²⁴¹Not only was it an evidence of the innocence of the

Spirit of Prophecy Vol. III

Saviour, but the event was a direct fulfillment of prophecy.

²⁴²In prophetic vision Zechariah had looked down the ages and seen the trial of God's dear Son. ²⁴³The act of Judas

is thus described: "And I said unto them, If ye think good, give me my price; and if not, forbear. ²⁴⁴So they weighed

for my price thirty pieces of silver. ²⁴⁵And the Lord said unto me, Cast it unto the potter; a goodly price that I was prized at of them. ²⁴⁶And I took the thirty pieces of

silver, and cast them to the potter in the house of the Lord."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Signs of the Times December
1893

"The Character to Be Tested" is the title of the December 18, 1893, Signs article which gave a portrayal of the character of Judas and how it failed the test. This article had an indirect influence upon the composition of chapter 76 of DA.

THE SIGNS OF THE TIMES. Vol. 20, No. 7

----- December 18, 1893.

THE CHARACTER TO BE TESTED.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ We are to form characters after the divine Model, Jesus Christ, and bring every power and capability of our natures into subordination to him in this life, that we may through him have a right hold of the future immortal life. ² "And this is life eternal, that they might know thee the only true God, and Jesus Christ, whom thou hast sent." ³ Those who have a character that will be found worthy of a place in the kingdom of God, will be those who have become acquainted with God, who have obeyed the explicit directions given in his word. ⁴ They will be entitled to a seat at the marriage supper of the Lamb.

⁵ The only way in which we can distinguish between the true Christian and the pretender to Christianity is by the fruit of the life. ⁶ The works will testify whether or not Christ, the hope of glory, is formed within. ⁷ Everyone who enters the kingdom of heaven will have been tested and proved. ⁸ Judas was one who was favored in being associated with Christ and his disciples. ⁹ He was with Jesus during the time of his public ministry, and he possessed qualities of character that would have made him a blessing to the church had he but submitted to the discipline that Jesus desired him to have. ¹⁰ He was privileged to have the same advantages as did John and the other disciples, and might have been benefited by the education and training of the greatest Teacher the world ever knew.

¹¹ In Christ he beheld a character that was pure, harmless, and undefiled, and his heart was drawn out in love for his Master. ¹² But the light that was shed upon him from the character of Christ, brought with it the responsibility of yielding up every natural or acquired trait that was not in harmony with the character of Christ. ¹³ In this Judas did not stand the test. ¹⁴ The love of the world was deeply rooted in his heart, and he did not give up his love for the world, nor surrender his ambition to Christ. ¹⁵ He never came to the point of surrendering himself fully to Jesus. ¹⁶ He felt that he could retain

his own individual judgment and opinion. ¹⁷ While he accepted the position of the minister of Christ, yet he never brought himself under the divine moulding of Christ. ¹⁸ He clung to his objectionable traits of character, and indulged in his own sinful habits, and, instead of becoming pure and Christlike, he

became selfish and covetous. ¹⁹ Selfishness became the controlling power of his life.

²⁰ Judas listened to the lessons which Christ gave to his disciples and to the multitudes, and he did not offer any opposition, or seem to question their importance. ²¹ He made no outward murmur until the time that Mary anointed the feet of Jesus. ²² The record says:

"Then Jesus six days before the passover came to Bethany, where Lazarus was which had been dead, whom he raised from the dead. ²³ There they made him a supper; and Martha served; but Lazarus was one of them that sat at the table with him. ²⁴ Then took Mary a pound of ointment of spikenard, very costly, and anointed the feet of Jesus, and wiped his feet with her hair; and the house was filled with the odor of the ointment. ²⁵ Then saith one of his disciples, Judas Iscariot, Simon's son, which should betray him, Why was not this ointment sold for three hundred pence, and given to the poor? ²⁶ This he said, not that he cared for the poor; but because he was a thief, and had the bag, and bare what was put therein."

²⁷ In the circumstance of Mary's anointing Jesus' feet, the plague spot of Judas' character was revealed. ²⁸ The crisis had come in the life of Judas, and the ruling trait of character took its supremacy over every other trait. ²⁹ Covetousness, which is idolatry, had been cultivated, and had strengthened in his heart, and when temptation came upon him, he was held under its control. ³⁰ The temptations of Satan will ever thus meet a response from the elements of depravity that are in the human character that have not been resisted and overcome. ³¹ The covetous greed that Judas had indulged for years, now held in control and overpowered every other characteristic of his nature. ³² He harmonized with the drawings of Satan, and evil triumphed as he yielded to temptation. ³³ Although he was professedly a follower of Jesus, yet he was in heart strengthening the evil of his character. ³⁴ Jesus knew every transgression, and he now looked sorrowfully upon him who was numbered with the twelve, and who was yet not a doer of the words of Christ.

³⁵The disciples could not discern the evil of Judas' heart; only the eye of God could discern the hidden motive, the unholy desire.

³⁶When an impure thought is welcomed, an unholy desire cherished, a rebellious purpose formed, the purity of the soul is stained and its innocence is ruined, temptations prevail, and hell triumphs.

³⁷"Every man is tempted, when he is drawn away of his own lust, and enticed."

³⁸Then when lust hath conceived, it bringeth forth sin; and sin, when it is finished, bringeth forth death."

³⁹A man is tempted to sin when some attractive object or indulgence is presented to him, and he is drawn to overstep principle, and to violate his conscience in doing that which he knows to be wrong.

⁴⁰This was what Judas was doing.

⁴¹He had no oil in his vessel with his lump.

⁴²He professed to have a deep interest in the welfare of the poor, but all his professions were pretenses, mere hypocrisy.

⁴³He wanted to give others the impression that he was a very pious man, but the fact was that he was nothing else than a self-conceited sinner.

⁴⁴It was his duty to seek grace and purity and holiness; but he failed to seek them.

⁴⁵He did not cultivate humility, and die to the world.

⁴⁶He did not cultivate hope and love, and manifest pure devotion to God.

⁴⁷He did not obtain a strong, noble character, full of faith and holy endeavor, but permitted the wild, unsanctified elements of character to prevail.

⁴⁸During his whole life he continually repeated acts of selfishness, though wearing the garb of religion.

⁴⁹Those who are satisfied in having merely a form of religion, who do not carry out the lessons of Christ in their practical life, make manifest the weakness of their character when trial and temptation come upon them, and they prove that they were not Christians.

⁵⁰Every duty that is performed in love to Jesus, in simplicity and humility, divested of all selfishness, has its effect on the character and shapes it after the divine Model.

⁵¹Through faithfulness in the Christian life the soul is braced to withstand sudden assaults of temptation; for the true Christian learns to depend upon Christ for strength and grace.

⁵²When the first temptation is met and resisted, the second is more easily met and resisted.

⁵³We may be able to resist every temptation that assails the heart by calling upon our mighty Deliverer.

⁵⁴It is not in the power of Satan to force anyone to sin.

⁵⁵Sin is the sinner's individual act.

⁵⁶Before sin exists in the heart, the consent of the will must be given, and as soon as it is given, sin is triumphant, and hell rejoices.

⁵⁷But there is no excuse for sin, either great or little.

⁵⁸Christ has been provided as the tempted one's refuge.

⁵⁹"For verily he took not on him the nature of angels; but he took on him the seed of Abraham."

⁶⁰Wherefore in all things it behooved him to be made like unto his brethren, that he might be a merciful and faithful high priest in things pertaining to God, to make reconciliation for the sins of the people.

⁶¹For in that he himself hath suffered being tempted, he is able to succor them that are tempted."

⁶²"For we have not an high priest which cannot be touched with the feeling of our infirmities; but was in all points tempted like as we are, yet without sin."

⁶³Let us therefore come boldly unto the throne of grace, that we may obtain mercy, and find grace to help in time of need."

⁶⁴Temptation is not sin, and is no indication that God is displeased with us.

⁶⁵The Lord suffers us to be tempted, but he measures every temptation, and apportions it according to our power to resist and overcome evil.

⁶⁶It is in time of trial and temptation that we are enabled to measure the degree of our faith and trust in God, and to estimate the stability of our Christian character.

⁶⁷If we are easily jostled and overcome, we should be alarmed; for our strength is small.

⁶⁸Let us consider the words of comfort that have been left on record for our instruction: "There hath no temptation taken you but such as is common to man; but God is faithful, who will not suffer you to be tempted above that ye are able; but will with the temptation also make a way to escape, that ye may be able to bear it."

⁶⁹God has apportioned the temptation in proportion to the strength he can supply, and he never permits us to be tempted beyond our ability to resist or to endure.

⁷⁰"The Lord knoweth how to deliver the godly out of temptation."

⁷¹"Blessed is the man that endureth temptation; for when he is tried, he shall receive the crown of life, which the Lord hath promised to them that love him."

⁷²Through prayer and the word of God we shall be enabled to overcome temptation.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Signs of the Times December 1894

On December 24, 1894, another Signs article, entitled "A Lesson from the Experience of Judas," gave more insights into that disciple's character and the fruitage of his life. Again, this article is one which had only an indirect influence on the composing of DA chapter 76. However, along with the ST December 18, 1893, article on Judas, it provided sentences and/or thoughts which were used in Manuscript 120, 1897, which in turn became one of the major sources for the structural form of chapter 76 of the DA text.

THE SIGNS OF THE TIMES. Vol. 20, No. 59

December 24, 1894.

A LESSON FROM THE EXPERIENCE OF JUDAS.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ It was a grief to the Saviour that his disciples failed to comprehend the character of his kingdom. ² He plainly stated to his followers the humiliation, suffering, and death that awaited him; but they seemed to be unable to understand it, and on the way to the scene of the Saviour's trial and death, disputed among themselves who should be greatest in his kingdom. ³ Judas was numbered among the twelve. ⁴ He was accepted, not because he was perfect, but notwithstanding his imperfections. ⁵ Peter, James, and John were not perfect characters, but they were received by the Master in order that they might be moulded by the words he should speak and the example he should set before them. ⁶ Judas had witnessed the power which the disciples had over the unclean spirits, and could testify that the devils were subject unto them.

⁷ But the often-repeated statements of Christ in regard to his kingdom not being an earthly kingdom, created thoughts of disaffection in the mind of Judas. ⁸ He had marked out a line upon which he expected Christ to work. ⁹ He had planned that Christ should deliver John the Baptist from prison, and, lo! John was left to be beheaded in prison, and Jesus withdrew himself and his disciples into a country place, instead of avenging the death of John. ¹⁰ Judas wanted more aggressive warfare established, and thought that if Jesus would not hold them back from carrying out their schemes, they would be more successful. ¹¹ Doubt became more established in his mind as he saw the gathering enmity of the Jewish leaders, and saw the challenge go by unheeded by Christ when they requested that he should show them a sign from heaven. His heart was open to unbelief, and the enemy supplied mind and heart with thoughts of questioning and rebellion. ¹² Why did Christ dwell so much upon that which was discouraging, portraying his trials and persecutions, and describing the trials and persecutions which his disciples must endure? ¹³ Why did he refer to his own humiliation and death? ¹⁴ Were their hopes to be all disappointed? ¹⁵ Was it not the prospect of having a high place in the new kingdom which God

was to establish that led him to espouse the cause of Christ? ¹⁷ Judas had not decided that Jesus was not the Son of God, he had not made up his mind that he performed miracles through the agency of Satan, but yet he was questioning, and seeking to find some way by which he could explain the mighty works which he did.

¹⁸ The other disciples were as unwilling as was Judas to receive the statement concerning Christ's humiliation and death, for it seemed to them to mean an end to all their hopes; but when Christ presented before them his true mission, they were not offended, but appreciated the spiritual good that was to come, although they but dimly perceived its nature. ¹⁹ Jesus said unto them: "I am the Bread of Life; he that cometh to me shall never hunger; and he that believeth on me shall never thirst. . . . ²⁰ Verily, verily, I say unto you, Except ye eat the flesh of the Son of Man, and drink his blood, ye have no life in you. ²¹ Whoso eateth my flesh, and drinketh my blood, hath eternal life; and I will raise him up at the last day. ²² For my flesh is meat indeed, and my blood is drink indeed. ²³ He that eateth my flesh, and drinketh my blood, dwelleth in me, and I in him. ²⁴ As the living Father hath sent me, and I live by the Father; so he that eateth me, even he shall live by me. ²⁵ This is that Bread that came down from heaven; not as your fathers did eat manna, and are dead; he that eateth of this Bread shall live forever. . . . ²⁶ Many therefore of his disciples, when they heard this, said, This is a hard saying; who can hear it? ²⁷ When Jesus knew in himself that his disciples murmured at it, he said unto them, Doth this offend you? what and if ye shall see the Son of Man ascend up where he was before? ²⁸ It is the Spirit that quickeneth; the flesh profiteth nothing; the words that I speak unto you, they are spirit, and they are life. ²⁹ But there are some of you that believe not. ³⁰ For Jesus knew from the beginning who they were that believed not, and who should betray him. ³¹ And he said, Therefore said I unto you, that no man can come unto me, except it were given him of my Father." ³² Jesus, the Lord of life and glory, was about to suffer an ignominious death, and he spoke plain truth in order that the characters of all those who professed to be his disciples might be developed, so that the true and faithful

might not have added to their trials the discouragement that these doubters and questioners should bring upon them at his death.

33 Judas was among those who said, "This is a hard saying; who can hear it?" 34 "From that time many of his disciples went back, and walked no more with him." 35 Then said Jesus unto the twelve, Will ye also go away? 36 Then Simon Peter answered him, Lord, to whom shall we go? thou hast the words of eternal life. 37 And we believe and are sure that thou art that Christ, the Son of the living God. 38 Jesus answered them, Have I not chosen you twelve, and one of you is a devil? 39 He spake of Judas Iscariot the son of Simon; for he it was that should betray him, being one of the twelve."

40 It was at this very time that Judas made shipwreck of faith. 41 After this he permitted doubt, envy, suspicion, bitterness, and hatred to be his guests. 42 He became jealous at once when he was not included among the three who were chosen to witness the transfiguration of Christ upon the mount. 43 When the disciples disputed by the way as to who should have the supremacy, his voice was often heard. 44 In all that Christ said to his disciples there was always something with which he disagreed, and the leaven of disaffection was fast developing under the influence and presence of Judas. 45 When he witnessed the manifestation of the fervent love of Mary as she anointed the feet of Christ with the precious ointment, his very spirit seemed turned to gall. 46 He manifested his covetous nature; and displayed his malice and hatred.

47 Judas was not a doer of the words of Christ. 48 He had had every advantage given him in order that he might learn lessons concerning Him who brought to light life and immortality, but he failed to overcome his selfish spirit, and cherished covetousness, which is idolatry, and did not cleanse the soul temple of its defilement. 49 Every human soul has some mastering passion which must be overcome or it will overcome him and plunge the soul into ruin. 50 Christ said: "Woe unto the world because of offenses! for it must needs be that offenses come; but woe to that man by whom the offense cometh!"

51 Wherefore if thy hand or thy foot offend thee, cut them off, and cast them from thee; it is better for thee to enter into life halt or maimed, rather than having two hands or

two feet to be cast into everlasting fire."

52 Each one has a work of overcoming to do. 53 If the objectionable trait of character is not overcome, Satan will take advantage of the defect, and thereby defile the whole man.

54 While Jesus was at Bethany, he told his disciples of what was to come to pass in a few days from that time. 55 At the Passover the case of Judas was decided. 56 Satan took control of heart and mind. 57 He thought that Christ was either to be crucified, or would have to deliver himself out of the hands of his enemies. 58 At all events, he would make something out of the transaction, and make a sharp bargain by betraying his Lord. 59 He went to the priests and offered to aid them in searching for him who was accounted the troubler of Israel. 60 Thus it was that the Lord was sold us a slave, purchased by the temple money used for the buying of the sacrifices.

61 Satan bound Judas to his side to be his human agent to work the death of the Son of God. 62 But conscience was not yet dead in Judas, and when he saw Jesus deliver himself into the hands of those who would condemn and crucify him, Judas rushed in to the priests, exclaiming: "I have sinned in that I have betrayed the innocent blood." 63 And they said, What is that to us? see thou to that. 64 And he cast down the pieces of silver in the temple, and departed, and went and hanged himself. 65 As he saw Jesus given into the hands of his enemies, he remembered the words he had spoken in Gethsemane, "Betrayest thou the Son of Man with a kiss?"

66 His master passion had spent its force, and reason again held sway; but he felt nothing but despair. 67 He knew that Christ was the Son of God, and that he was his betrayer.

68 The leaders of Israel heartily despised his base conduct; though they had taken advantage of his covetousness and hatred, yet when he repented, and turned to them with a confession of his guilt, they spurned him, and left him to die in his sins. 69 Judas failed to have a place among the sanctified because he failed to learn of Christ the daily lessons that he would teach his followers, of meekness and lowliness of heart. 70 He failed to learn the lessons of faith that the other disciples finally learned, and thus became heirs of God and joint heirs with Jesus Christ.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Manuscript 28 1897

Apparently on April 22 of 1897 copyist Minnie Hawkins finished the typing of Manuscript 28 on Judas. It is lengthy, having 258 sentences. Portions of the same manuscript appeared later in the year in two different Review and Herald articles, and then ultimately in chapter 76 of Desire of Ages.

Judas

¹The history of Judas presents before us the sad ending to the life of a man who might have been honored of God. ²By co-operating with Christ, not mechanically, but with heart and soul, Judas might have obtained victory after victory. ³He was trusted by his fellow-disciples, and by his Master he was entrusted with a special work for the church. ⁴Apparently Judas was an honor to the cause, and as such he always represented himself.

⁵Christ's last journey to Jerusalem, whither he went with his disciples to attend the passover feast, was a fatal one for Judas. ⁶Not that it needed to be thus, but he himself made it so by his own course of action. ⁷The dissensions which frequently arose among the disciples as to which of them should be greatest, were generally created by Judas. ⁸On this occasion this spirit led to the request of James and John that one might sit at the right hand of Christ, and the other on his left, in his kingdom. ⁹That request would never have been made if, in placing the different disciples on their position, James and John had been assigned the lowest place. ¹⁰Those who held that they were nearest to their Lord in position, Christ declared, were not of special consequence. ¹¹Those who would bring Christ into the heart as an abiding presence, would not selfishly seek the highest position in personal relation to

him. ¹²Those who, in the spirit and love of Jesus, will become one with him, will be in close fellowship one with another, bound up by the silken cords of love. ¹³Then the titles of human brotherhood would not be always on the strain, ready at any provocation to snap asunder. ¹⁴"All ye are brethren" will be the sentiment of every child of faith. ¹⁵When the followers of Christ are one with him, there will be no first and last, no less respected or less important ones. ¹⁶A blessed brotherly fellowship one with another will bind all who truly receive the Lord to Jesus Christ in a firm loyalty that cannot be broken. ¹⁷All will be equally one with Christ.

¹⁸When Judas betrayed his Master, he did not expect that Christ would allow himself to be taken. ¹⁹How often he had seen the scribes and Pharisees, as Jesus taught them the truth in parables, carried away with the striking figures presented. ²⁰When questions were given for their decision, they had pronounced judgment against themselves, condemning the course they themselves were pursuing. ²¹How often when Christ had made the application of the word to their own hearts, and showed they were the ones he was illustrating before the people, the plain truth sent home enraged them, and in their mortification and madness they had taken up stones to cast at the world's Redeemer! ²²Again and again he would have been killed had it not been for the heavenly angels who attended him and guarded his life until the time

when the case of the Jews as a nation should be decided.

²³This human life must be kept by the power of God until his day of work was ended. ²⁴But Judas did not reason in accordance with the purpose of God. ²⁵If Christ could escape so many snares set to destroy him, he thought, he certainly would not allow himself to be taken by the Pharisees and Sadducees. ²⁶He, Judas, would act his part in selling his Lord and obtain his reward, while the people would be cheated out of their money. ²⁷Even to the end of his companionship with the disciples Judas was not suspected by them of the evil purpose in his heart. ²⁸But the Lord Jesus knew the character of Judas.

²⁹When Judas united with the twelve, he had a desire to be with the man whose teaching he knew to be superior to anything he had ever heard, although it was condemnatory of all dishonest pretense, hypocrisy, and avarice. ³⁰There came to him a desire to be changed in spirit and inclination, and he hoped to experience this by connecting himself with Jesus Christ. ³¹Yes, in the companionship of Jesus, Judas would have found continual strength and aid; he might have co-operated with Christ in overcoming temptation rather than yielding to the suggestions of Satan. ³²Judas had listened to the parables illustrating the gospel of the kingdom of God, and in its every phase he had assented to it. ³³But he did not practice that which was contrary to his own inclinations; therefore his strong, avaricious

spirit was not corrected.

³⁴Judas looked upon several of the disciples as very deficient. ³⁵They would not see their opportunities, and take advantage of circumstances. ³⁶The church would never prosper with such short sighted men. ³⁷Peter was so impetuous; he would move without consideration. ³⁸John, who was gathering the power of the truths that fell from the lips of Christ, and bringing them into the sanctuary of the soul, was looked upon by Judas as a poor financier, one who could not keep the church free from financial embarrassment. ³⁹Matthew, who had had an education which qualified him for accuracy in all his undertakings, was very definite and particular in regard to honesty. ⁴⁰He was ever contemplating the words of Christ, and became so absorbed in them that he could not be trusted to do sharp, far-seeing business. ⁴¹Thus Judas summed up all the disciples, and flattered himself that the church would often be brought into perplexity and embarrassment if it were not for his managing ability. ⁴²Judas thought himself the capable one, who would not allow himself to be cheated in a bargain.

⁴³The love of money in the heart of Judas was growing with the exercise of his shrewd abilities. ⁴⁴His practical financiering ability if exercised and enlightened and moulded by the Holy Spirit, would have been of great service to the little church, and by the sanctification of his spirit he would have had a clear insight, a correct

discernment to appreciate heavenly things. ⁴⁵But worldly policy plans were constantly cherished by Judas. ⁴⁶There was no outbreking sin on his part, but his sharp scheming, the selfish, parsimonious spirit that took possession of him finally led him to sell his Lord for a small sum of money.

⁴⁷He might have obtained a larger sum; but Satan had impressed upon his mind that Christ, who had so often defeated the purposes of the scribes and Pharisees, would not suffer himself to be taken. ⁴⁸So he was willing to put the matter to the test, and bring the crisis. ⁴⁹If he really were the Son of God, the Messiah, the people for whom he had done so much in relieving them from the oppressive power of Satan, would rally and come to his assistance. ⁵⁰Then he, Judas, would have the credit of having caused him to be crowned king on David's throne. ⁵¹This would forever settle many minds that were now in such uncertainty. ⁵²And this act would place him as first, next to Christ, in the new kingdom.

⁵³Judas had not been satisfied with the turn affairs had taken on the occasion of the feeding of the five thousand. ⁵⁴It was he who had set on foot the project to take Christ by force and make him king. ⁵⁵But Christ, with greater authority than he was in the custom of exercising, had rebuked this step. ⁵⁶This had provoked Judas, and he became more and more separated in his feeling and love for Jesus.

⁵⁷At his first connection with Christ, Judas had manifested a spirit subordinate to his Master. ⁵⁸He loved the great Teacher. ⁵⁹He understood the Scriptures and at times seemed to have large discernment to take in the meaning of the word of God. ⁶⁰He could present the words of the Old Testament Scriptures in an acceptable manner. ⁶¹He had listened to the words of Christ; he had keen perceptive powers, a retentive memory, and was able to communicate that word to others. ⁶²If Judas had been a doer of the word, he would have had the grace and powers of Christ to apply that word to his own soul. ⁶³Possessing appropriating faith, he would, under the influence of light, have appreciated the presence of the Spirit, would have consecrated his heart, and would have received the seal of oneness with Christ. ⁶⁴But Judas stopped short of this. ⁶⁵He held the first place in the church without any question as to its propriety, and after a time began gradually to bring in his own natural traits of character.

⁶⁶There are two kinds of experience,--the outside showing and the inward working. ⁶⁷The divine and human were at work in the character of Judas. ⁶⁸Satan was working the human, Christ the divine. ⁶⁹Jesus longed to see Judas rise to his appointed privileges. ⁷⁰But the human side of Judas' character was confused with his religious sentiments, and treated by him as essential attributes. ⁷¹By taking this view of things, he left an open door for Satan to enter and

take possession of the entire man. ⁷²If Judas had practiced the lessons of Christ, he would have surrendered to Christ, he would have consecrated his heart fully to God; but his confused experience was misleading him.

⁷³When with the disciples, he introduced controversies, doubts, and misleading sentiments, repeating the objection that the scribes and Pharisees urged when questioning the claims of Christ, as though they were difficult to answer.

⁷⁴He began this work at first in order to develop his reasoning powers, but the more he gave expression to the unbelieving remarks made, the more he turned them over in his mind, the more doubt and unbelief came in.

⁷⁵God gives grace, and he expects all to use it. ⁷⁶He supplies the power if the human mind feels any need or any disposition to receive that power. ⁷⁷He never asks us to do anything without supplying the grace and power to do that very thing. ⁷⁸All the Lord's biddings are enablings to perform.

⁷⁹All the little and large troubles and crosses, the difficulties and hindrances to the advancement of the gospel, Judas interpreted as being an evidence against its truthfulness. ⁸⁰He would introduce texts of Scripture that had no connection with the themes of truth that Jesus was seeking to impress upon the minds and hearts of the disciples. ⁸¹And these texts, separated from their connection and placed where they had no appropriate bearing

or force, confused their minds and increased the discouragements that were constantly pressing in with the suggestions of the scribes and Pharisees. ⁸²The sayings of the Pharisees also were so used by him to encourage unbelief and lessen the force of truth upon the minds of the disciples, that Christ declared of him that he had a devil. ⁸³Yet all this was done in such a way as to leave its impression that he was conscientious. ⁸⁴And while the disciples were searching for evidence to confirm the word of the great Teacher, Judas would lead them almost imperceptibly on another track.

⁸⁵Jesus saw that the mind of Judas was open to the questions and doubts, and unbelief which had more or less influence on the other disciples, and that in this work Satan was communicating his attributes to Judas, and opening up a direct channel through which to work. ⁸⁶The disciples did not understand the working of the enemy. ⁸⁷In a very religious and apparently wise way, he was presenting matters in a different light to what Jesus had given them, and attaching to his words a meaning which he never intended to convey.

⁸⁸If all could understand the deep trials and discouragements that came to the human nature of Christ in his mission and work, very verily human hearts would draw nigh to the human heart of Jesus. ⁸⁹In the disciples their old nature would often appear, but Jesus was ever presenting

before them that the natural powers of the human heart which were striving for the mastery must be given up, emptied from the soul, that he might implant a new nature, a new principle therein. ⁹⁰It is essential to live by every word of God else the old nature will reassert itself. ⁹¹It is the Holy Spirit applied to his followers, the redeeming grace of truth in the soul, that makes his disciples one with each other, and one with God. ⁹²He alone can expel enmity, envy, and unbelief from the heart. ⁹³He sanctifies the entire affection. ⁹⁴He restores the willing, desirous soul from the power of Satan unto God.

⁹⁵This is the power of grace. ⁹⁶It is a divine power. ⁹⁷Under its influence a change from the old formed habits, customs, and practices is wrought in the human agent, which, when cherished, separate the heart from God, and the work of sanctification cannot go on in the soul, constantly progressing and enlarging. ⁹⁸When unbelief and envy are allowed even utterance, they become agents to expel calm, living, trusting, faith.

⁹⁹The eye of faith must see and increase by exercise. ¹⁰⁰All who live near to God will have a realization of what Jesus is to them and they to Jesus. ¹⁰¹As communion with God is making its impress upon the inward soul temple, and shining out in his countenance as an illuminating light, the steadfast principles of Christ's holy character will be reflected in humanity. ¹⁰²Judas had the privilege of being

conformed to the image of Christ's character. ¹⁰³This regeneration, this new birth would have come to him through a vital connection with Christ. ¹⁰⁴His abiding presence would have been to him a daily renewal of consecration and progressive sanctification of the entire man. ¹⁰⁵Satan is our destroyer, but Christ is our Restorer. ¹⁰⁶Streams of grace from the treasure house of God's love is our source of supply for spiritual life.

¹⁰⁷The great hereditary and cultivated tendency to evil with Judas was covetousness. ¹⁰⁸And by practice this became a habit which he carried into all his trading. ¹⁰⁹Christlike principles of uprightness and justice had no room in selling and buying. ¹¹⁰His economical habits developed into a parsimonious spirit, and became a fatal snare. ¹¹¹Cain was his measurement of correct religious experience, and all true righteousness became subordinate to this. ¹¹²While he continued a disciple in outward form, while in the very personal presence of Christ, he appropriated to himself means that belonged to the Lord's treasury.

¹¹³"Now when Jesus was in Bethany, in the house of Simon the leper, there came unto him a woman having an alabaster box of very precious ointment, and poured it on his head as he sat at meat. ¹¹⁴But when his disciples saw it, they had indignation, saying To what purpose is this waste? ¹¹⁵For this ointment might have been sold for much,

and given to the poor. ¹¹⁶When Jesus understood it he said unto them, Why trouble ye the woman? for she hath wrought a good work upon me. ¹¹⁷For ye have the poor always with you; but me ye have not always. ¹¹⁸For in that she hath poured this ointment on my body, she did it for my burial. ¹¹⁹Verily I say unto you, Wheresoever this gospel shall be preached in the whole world, there shall also this, that this woman hath done, be told for a memorial of her."

¹²⁰"But when the disciples saw it, they had indignation, saying, To what purpose is this waste?" ¹²¹Judas was the one who first made this suggestion, and others were ready to voice his words. ¹²²But was it waste? ¹²³Mary had been long reserving this box of ointment. ¹²⁴Lazarus her brother had been called forth from the grave and restored to his family by the words and power of the Saviour, and Mary's heart was filled with gratitude.

¹²⁵Taking in her hands the box of precious ointment, she quietly opened it, and the whole room was filled with its fragrance. ¹²⁶Her action would probably have passed unnoticed had not the ointment made its presence known by its rich, sweet fragrance. ¹²⁷Then Mary poured its contents upon the head and feet of the Master. ¹²⁸In this act she expressed her deep gratitude to Jesus for all that he had done for them as a family.

¹²⁹This incident is full of instruction. ¹³⁰Jesus, the world's Redeemer is drawing close to the time when he will

give his life for a sinful world. ¹³¹Yet how little did even his disciples realize what they were about to lose. ¹³²Mary could not reason upon this subject. ¹³³Her heart was filled with pure, holy love. ¹³⁴The sentiment of her heart was, "What shall I render unto the Lord for all his benefits toward me." ¹³⁵This ointment, costly as it was estimated by the disciples, was but a poor expression of her love for her Master. ¹³⁶But Christ could appreciate the gift as an expression of her love, and Mary's heart was filled with perfect peace and happiness.

¹³⁷Christ delights in the earnest desire of Mary to do the will of her Lord. ¹³⁸He accepts the wealth of pure affection which his disciples did not, could not understand. ¹³⁹He knew that if his disciples were under the influence of the heavenly angels that accompanied him, they too would be inspired with a zeal in true devotion and entire consecration to the mind and will of God. ¹⁴⁰They would consider not [sic] offering of sufficient value to declare the heart's spiritual affection. ¹⁴¹He has been everything to them, and they do not realize that soon they would be deprived of his presence, and could offer him no token of their great love. ¹⁴²Mary's ointment was the gift of love, and this gave it its value in the eyes of Christ.

¹⁴³Led by Judas, the disciples continued, "This ointment might have been sold for much, and given to the poor." ¹⁴⁴Here is a saving expressive of narrow minds.

¹⁴⁵By their words the disciples showed that they begrudged Christ the gift which they would have given to the poor.

¹⁴⁶Jesus saw Mary shrink away abashed, expecting to hear reproof from the One she loved and worshiped. ¹⁴⁷But instead of this she hears words of commendation. ¹⁴⁸"Why trouble ye the woman?" he said, "for she hath wrought a good work upon me. ¹⁴⁹For ye have the poor always with you; but me ye have not always. ¹⁵⁰For in that she hath poured this ointment on my body, she did it for my burial. ¹⁵¹Verily, I say unto you, Wheresoever this gospel shall be preached in the whole world, there shall also this, that this woman hath done, be told for a memorial of her." ¹⁵²No other anointing would Jesus receive; for the Sabbath was nigh at hand, and they kept the Sabbath according to the commandment. ¹⁵³When the three Marys came early on the morning of the first day of the week with sweet spices to anoint the body of Jesus, they found the tomb empty.

¹⁵⁴It was not at all pleasant to Judas to be reproved, and he was greatly angered. ¹⁵⁵He went out to consider how he could gain money by selling himself to do a most terrible deed. ¹⁵⁶For a far less sum than that box of ointment cost, Judas betrayed his Lord.

¹⁵⁷O, if we could only realize that in every congregation there may be souls who are being called upon for the last time, by counsel and reproof, to repent! who, like the Jewish nation, have advanced step by step almost

imperceptibly in resistance of the Spirit of God, until spiritual blindness has taken the place of the light they once enjoyed. ¹⁵⁸Under a spirit of unbelief, envy, and criticism, the evidences they have had are no longer evidence, but a matter of questioning and doubt. ¹⁵⁹Truth is misunderstood, and perverted to mean error. ¹⁶⁰Evidence might be piled upon evidence, but Satan is close at their side that the word spoken shall be misapplied and perverted, and become a matter of suspicion and distrust. ¹⁶¹How careful then should every person be that they shall not do despite to the spirit of grace. ¹⁶²Take heed how ye hear; take heed how ye read.

¹⁶³"And even as they did not like to retain God in their knowledge, God gave them over to a reprobate mind, to do those things which are not convenient; being filled with all unrighteousness, fornication, wickedness, covetousness, maliciousness, full of envy, murder, debate, deceit, malignity; whisperers, backbiters, haters of God, despiteful, proud, boasters, inventors of evil things, disobedient to parents, without understanding, covenant breakers, without natural affection, implacable, unmerciful: who knowing the judgment of God, that they which commit such things are worthy of death, not only do the same, but have pleasure in them that do them."

¹⁶⁴Those who resist the Holy Spirit of God, and provoke him to depart, know not to what lengths Satan will lead

them. ¹⁶⁵"O, that thou hadst known, even thou, in this thy day, the things that belong unto thy peace." ¹⁶⁶Shall the words of Christ be irrevocably spoken, "But now they are hid from thine eyes"? ¹⁶⁷When the Holy Spirit departs from the human agents, they will imperceptibly do those things which they once viewed in a correct light to be decided sin. ¹⁶⁸They will follow step by step in the footsteps of Satan. ¹⁶⁹Who then can strive with them to any purpose. ¹⁷⁰Will the minister plead for them and with them? ¹⁷¹All their words are as idle tales. ¹⁷²These souls have Satan, their chosen companion, close beside them to misconstrue the word spoken, and bring it to their understanding in a perverted light. ¹⁷³They are misinterpreted by them; for when the Spirit of God is grieved away, every appeal made through the Lord's servants is meaningless to them. ¹⁷⁴They will misconstrue every word. ¹⁷⁵They will laugh and turn into ridicule the most solemn words of Scripture warnings, which, if they were not bewitched by Satanic agencies, would make them tremble. ¹⁷⁶Every appeal, made to those who are in need of help, is in vain. ¹⁷⁷They will not hear a word of reproof or council [sic]. ¹⁷⁸They despise all the entreaties of the Spirit, and disobey the commandments of God which they have once vindicated and exalted. ¹⁷⁹Well may the words of the apostle come home to such souls, "Who hath bewitched you that ye should not obey the truth." ¹⁸⁰They have followed the counsel of their own heart until

truth is no more truth to them. ¹⁸¹Barabbas is chosen, Christ is rejected.

¹⁸²"As it was in the days of Noe, so shall it also be in the days of the Son of man. ¹⁸³They did eat, they drank, they married wives, they were given in marriage, until the day that Noe entered into the ark, and the flood came and destroyed them all. ¹⁸⁴Likewise also as it was in the days of Lot: they did eat, they drank, they bought, they sold, they planted, they builded. ¹⁸⁵But the same day that Lot went out of Sodom, it rained fire and brimstone from heaven, and destroyed them all. ¹⁸⁶Even thus shall it be in the day when the Son of man shall be revealed."

¹⁸⁷Those who have caught the inspiration of that love which will exist in every heart in the family of the redeemed host, will enter into the joys of their Lord. ¹⁸⁸The spirit of peace and heavenly joy fills the hearts of those who can appreciate the heavenly gift. ¹⁸⁹Christ, the world's Redeemer, although unseen, fills some human hearts with love. ¹⁹⁰They, by faith, are one with Christ, and their hearts are drawn out to him as was the heart of Mary. ¹⁹¹They eat his flesh; they drink his blood. ¹⁹²They live in Christ, and Christ lives in them. ¹⁹³Nothing is too costly to give him; no self-denial or self-sacrifice too severe to be endured for his sake. ¹⁹⁴Jesus is loved supremely.

¹⁹⁵The desire that Mary had to do this service for her

Lord was of more value to Christ than all the spikenard and precious ointment in the world, because it expressed her appreciation of the world's Redeemer. ¹⁹⁶It was the love of Christ that constrained her. ¹⁹⁷The matchless excellency of the beauty of the character of Christ filled her mind and heart.

¹⁹⁸The commendation of Christ after the condemnation of the disciples was inexpressibly valuable to Mary. ¹⁹⁹She adored him as her Redeemer. ²⁰⁰Judas and the disciples wanted to withhold this expensive favor from Christ, calculating the money value of the gift under pretense of helping the poor.

²⁰¹Mary, by the Holy Spirit's power, saw in Jesus one who had come to seek and to save the souls that were ready to perish. ²⁰²Every one of the disciples should have been inspired with a similar devotion. ²⁰³Their after knowledge gave them a true sense of the many things they might have done for Jesus expressive of the love and gratitude of their hearts, while they were near him, and enjoyed his counsel; while they beheld his love for poor and suffering humanity. ²⁰⁴They felt the reproof of Christ keenly as they took from the cross the bruised body of their Lord. ²⁰⁵When Jesus was no longer with them they felt indeed as sheep without a shepherd. ²⁰⁶And there were many things that they began to see and understand. ²⁰⁷They might have shown him favor on many occasions. ²⁰⁸They could see now where they could have

offered attentions that would have been expressive of their love. ²⁰⁹They no longer reflected upon Mary's act but upon themselves. ²¹⁰O, if they could have taken it all back, this censuring, this presenting the poor as more worthy of the gift than Christ!

²¹¹Those who should have been first in these offices of love were last. ²¹²And Mary, who was considered the least, was first. ²¹³The all pervading love of Jesus Christ in the hearts of his disciples should have been expressed by his followers in visible actions, showing that they recognized his supremacy, and that all might witness that they knew him to be worthy of the highest homage. ²¹⁴The world can only judge of our knowledge and love of Jesus by the outward expression, the external testimony.

²¹⁵The disciples did not take in the many lessons given in the Scriptures in regard to the faith that works by love and purifies the soul. ²¹⁶And the work of Mary was just the lesson that they needed to show them that if they were more demonstrative in their appreciation of their Lord, it would have been wholly acceptable. ²¹⁷Christ's human nature was often grieved because of that which he should have received from his disciples, but which they did not give him. ²¹⁸This was a sorrow to Christ. ²¹⁹He knew they needed a stronger faith in him as the world's Redeemer to enable them to withstand the temptations of Satanic agencies. ²²⁰Actions of love mean much. ²²¹The loneliness of Christ

separated from the heavenly courts and living a life of humanity, was never understood or appreciated by the disciples as it should have been.

222 And the very same want is evident in our world to-day. 223 But few appreciate all that Christ is to them. 224 If they did, the great and beautiful love of Mary would be expressed, the anointing would be freely bestowed. 225 The expensive ointment would not be called a waste. 226 Jesus approved of this waste as a testimonial of Mary's love for her Master, who was constantly working in the behalf of others, doing good to the poor, and speaking words of comfort to the oppressed.

227 Christ announced his mission in Galilee. 228 This mission he had presented to the prophet Isaiah, the substance of which is repeated in Luke 4:16-19. 229 "The Spirit of the Lord is upon me, because he hath anointed me to preach the gospel to the poor; he hath sent me to heal the broken hearted, to preach deliverance to the captives, and recovering of sight to the blind, to set at liberty them that are bruised, to preach the acceptable year of the Lord."

230 The entire life of Christ had been one of self-denial and self-sacrifice. 231 The words, spoken in indignation, "To what purpose is this waste," brought vividly to his mind the greatest sacrifice ever made, the one that could not be surpassed, in giving himself to be the

propitiation for a lost world. ²³²Christ took it all in. ²³³If left to be judged from a human standpoint, such a sacrifice was a most extravagant one, a wanton waste.

²³⁴There are gifts that we rightly proportion to the character and necessities of the ones upon whom we bestow them. ²³⁵Not many of the poor would appreciate Mary's offering, which gift was the highest that could be given. ²³⁶That ointment was a symbol of the overflowing heart of the giver. ²³⁷It was an outward demonstration of a love fed by heavenly streams until it overflowed. ²³⁸And that ointment of Mary, which the disciples called waste is repeating itself a thousand times in the susceptible hearts of others.

²³⁹The Lord God is profuse in his gifts to our world. ²⁴⁰The question may be asked, Why does the Lord show such waste, such extravagance in the multitude of his gifts that cannot be enumerated? ²⁴¹The Lord would be so bountiful toward his human family that it cannot be said of him that he could do more. ²⁴²When he gave Jesus to our world, he gave all heaven. ²⁴³His love is without a parallel. ²⁴⁴It did not stop short of anything. ²⁴⁵And having given us his only begotten Son, shall he not with him also freely give us all things?

²⁴⁶Well may the heavenly host be filled with amazement as they look upon the human family who cling to their old rags of self-righteousness, and refuse to be uplifted and

enriched with the boundless love expressed in Christ as he presents to them the white linen, which is the righteousness of his character, as they behold how few accept the great gift of life, eternal life. ²⁴⁷Men cling to the earth with all their powers as if fearful that they shall become inhabitants of heaven. ²⁴⁸They do everything that will show that they choose Barabbas and reject Christ and the Father. ²⁴⁹Their wicked spirit leads them to do everything contrary to that which the Lord desires them to do. ²⁵⁰He has given them every facility, every advantage, that they may do the works of God, but it is at an immense sacrifice. ²⁵¹The heavenly universe exclaim, "Why cast ye your pearls before swine?" ²⁵²Why is this great waste, my Lord?" ²⁵³The Lord sees the human beings who belong to him by creation and by redemption, and if they will fulfil the conditions which the Lord has covenanted with them, they shall have life and immortality in the kingdom of God.

²⁵⁴Self-denial and whole hearted sacrifice meets us everywhere. ²⁵⁵To human reasoning the whole plan of salvation is a waste of mercies and resources. ²⁵⁶They are provided to accomplish the restoration of the moral image of God in man. ²⁵⁷The atonement is abundantly able to secure to all who will receive it, mansions in heaven. ²⁵⁸The supposed prodigality of Mary is an illustration of the methods of God in the plan of salvation; for nature and grace, related to each other, manifest the ennobling fullness of the Source from which they flow.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Desire of Ages chapter 62 (in
part)

This portion of chapter 62 of the DA text is of interest for comparative purposes. Please note the sentences to compare with similar units in Manuscript 28, 1897.

Desire of Ages Chapter 62 pages 564-566

[Please compare sentences 137-142, 193-197, and 201-226 of MS 28, 1897, with the following selection.]

¹³¹Christ delighted in the earnest desire of Mary to do the will of her Lord. ¹³²He accepted the wealth of pure affection which His disciples did not, would not, understand. ¹³³The desire that Mary had to do this service for her Lord was of more value to Christ than all the precious ointment in the world, because it expressed her appreciation of the world's Redeemer. ¹³⁴It was the love of Christ that constrained her. ¹³⁵The matchless excellence of the character of Christ filled her soul. ¹³⁶The ointment was a symbol of the heart of the giver. ¹³⁷It was the outward demonstration of a love fed by heavenly streams until it overflowed.

¹³⁸The work of Mary was just the lesson the disciples needed to show them that the expression of their love for Him would be pleasing to Christ. ¹³⁹He had been everything to them, and they did not realize that soon they would be deprived of His presence, that soon they could offer Him no token of their gratitude for His great love. ¹⁴⁰The loneliness of Christ, separated from the heavenly courts, living the life of humanity, was never understood or appreciated by the disciples as it should have been. ¹⁴¹He was often grieved because His disciples did not give Him

that which He should have received from them. ¹⁴²He knew that if they were under the influence of the heavenly angels that accompanied Him, they too would think no offering of sufficient value to declare the heart's spiritual affection.

¹⁴³Their afterknowledge gave them a true sense of the many things they might have done for Jesus expressive of the love and gratitude of their hearts, while they were near Him. ¹⁴⁴When Jesus was no longer with them, and they felt indeed as sheep without a shepherd, they began to see how they might have shown Him attentions that would have brought gladness to His heart. ¹⁴⁵They no longer cast blame upon Mary, but upon themselves. ¹⁴⁶Oh, if they could have taken back their censuring, their presenting the poor as more worthy of the gift than was Christ! ¹⁴⁷They felt the reproof keenly as they took from the cross the bruised body of their Lord.

¹⁴⁸The same want is evident in our world today. ¹⁴⁹But few appreciate all that Christ is to them. ¹⁵⁰If they did, the great love of Mary would be expressed, the anointing would be freely bestowed. ¹⁵¹The expensive ointment would not be called a waste. ¹⁵²Nothing would be thought too costly to give for Christ, no self-denial or self-sacrifice too great to be endured for His sake.

¹⁵³The words spoken in indignation, "To what purpose is this waste?" brought vividly before Christ the greatest sacrifice ever made,--the gift of Himself as the

propitiation for a lost world. ¹⁵⁴The Lord would be so bountiful to His human family that it could not be said of Him that He could do more. ¹⁵⁵In the gift of Jesus, God gave all heaven. ¹⁵⁶From a human point of view, such a sacrifice was a wanton waste. ¹⁵⁷To human reasoning the whole plan of salvation is a waste of mercies and resources. ¹⁵⁸Self-denial and wholehearted sacrifice meet us everywhere. ¹⁵⁹Well may the heavenly host look with amazement upon the human family who refuse to be uplifted and enriched with the boundless love expressed in Christ. ¹⁶⁰Well may they exclaim, Why this great waste?

¹⁶¹But the atonement for a lost world was to be full, abundant, and complete. ¹⁶²Christ's offering was exceedingly abundant to reach every soul that God had created. ¹⁶³It could not be restricted so as not to exceed the number who would accept the great Gift. ¹⁶⁴All men are not saved; yet the plan of redemption is not a waste because it does not accomplish all that its liberality has provided for. ¹⁶⁵There must be enough and to spare.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Review and Herald October 1897

Following is the Review and Herald series of two articles, for October 5 and 12, that carry the title of "Judas." As mentioned already, portions of Manuscript 28, 1897, provided for parts of these articles.

JUDAS.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

The history of Judas presents before us the sad ending of the life of a man who might have been honored of God. ²By co-operating with Christ, not mechanically, but with heart and soul, Judas might have obtained victory after victory. ³He was trusted by his fellow disciples, and by his Master he was given a special work to do for the church. ⁴He understood the Scriptures, and at times seemed to have large discernment to take in the meaning of the word of God. ⁵He could present the words of the Old-Testament Scriptures in an acceptable manner. ⁶He had keen perceptive powers, a retentive memory, and was able to communicate the word to others. ⁷Had he been a doer of the word, he would have had grace and power from Christ to apply that word to his own soul. ⁸Possessing appropriating faith, he would, under the influence of light, have appreciated the presence of the Spirit, would have consecrated his heart, and would have received the seal of oneness with Christ. ⁹But Judas stopped short of this. ¹⁰He had not received Christ as his personal Saviour. ¹¹He did not think that his character needed the transforming grace of Christ. ¹²In many respects he acted as Christ's disciple. ¹³He manifested an interest in his work, and in a certain sense believed on him. ¹⁴But Christ read beneath the surface. ¹⁵He saw the true inwardness of the heart. ¹⁶He knew that Judas was not converted. ¹⁷He was not a true son of God. ¹⁸He had not lost something he once possessed. ¹⁹He had never experienced the soul cleansing, the change of character, that constitutes conversion. ²⁰Judas had valuable qualities, but there were some traits in his character that would have to be cut away before he could be saved. ²¹He must be born again, not of corruptible seed, but of incorruptible. ²²His great hereditary and cultivated tendency to evil was covetousness. ²³And by practise this became a habit which he carried into all his trading. ²⁴His economical habits developed a parsimonious spirit, and became a fatal snare. ²⁵Gain was his measurement of a correct religious experience, and all true righteousness became subordinate to this. ²⁶Christlike principles of uprightness and justice had no room in his life practises. ²⁷When Judas first united with the twelve, he manifested a spirit subordinate to his Master. ²⁸He loved the great Teacher. ²⁹He had listened to the parables illustrating the gospel of the kingdom of God, and he desired to be with the

man whose teaching he knew to be superior to anything he had ever heard, although it was condemnatory of all pretense, hypocrisy, and avarice. ³⁰There came to him a desire to be changed in spirit and inclination, and he hoped to experience this by connecting himself with Christ. ³¹Yes; in the companionship of Christ, Judas might have found continual strength and aid; he might have co-operated with Christ in overcoming temptation, instead of yielding to the suggestions of Satan.

³²Knowing that he was being corrupted by covetousness, Christ gave him the privilege of hearing many precious lessons. ³³He heard Christ laying down the principles which all must possess who would enter his kingdom. ³⁴He was given every opportunity to receive Christ as his personal Saviour, but he refused this gift. ³⁵He would not yield his way and will to Christ. ³⁶He did not practise that which was contrary to his own inclinations; therefore his strong avaricious spirit was not corrected. ³⁷While he continued a disciple in outward form, and while in the very presence of Christ, he appropriated to himself means that belonged to the Lord's treasury.

³⁸Several of the disciples were looked upon by Judas as very deficient. ³⁹They would not see their opportunities, and take advantage of circumstances. ⁴⁰The church, he thought, would never prosper with such short-sighted men. ⁴¹Peter was so impetuous; he would move without consideration. ⁴²John, who was gathering the power of the truths that fell from the lips of Christ and bringing them into the sanctuary of the soul, was looked upon by Judas as a poor financier, one who could not keep the church free from financial embarrassment. ⁴³Matthew, who had had an education which qualified him for accuracy in all his undertakings, was very definite and particular in regard to honesty. ⁴⁴He was ever contemplating the words of Christ, and became so absorbed in them that he could not be trusted to do sharp, far-seeing business. ⁴⁵Thus Judas summed up all the disciples, and flattered himself that the church would often be brought into perplexity and embarrassment if it were not for his managing ability. ⁴⁶Judas thought himself the capable one, who would not allow himself to be cheated in a bargain. ⁴⁷In his own estimation he was an honor to the cause, and as such he always represented himself.

⁴⁸Christ's last journey to Jerusalem, whither he went with his disciples to attend the Passover feast, was a fatal one for Judas. ⁴⁹Not that it needed to be thus, but he himself made it so by his own course of action. ⁵⁰The dissensions which frequently arose among the disciples as to which of them should be greatest,

were generally created by Judas.⁵¹ On this occasion this spirit led to the request of James and John that one might sit at the right hand of Christ, and the other on his left, in his kingdom.⁵² But Christ taught them that those who were nearest to their Lord in position, were not of special consequence; that those who would bring Christ into the heart as an abiding presence would not selfishly seek the highest position in personal relation to him.

⁵³ Thus it is with Christians to-day.⁵⁴ Those who, in the spirit and love of Jesus, become one with him, will be in close fellowship one with another, bound together by the silken cords of love.⁵⁵ Then the ties of human brotherhood will not be always on the strain, ready at any provocation to snap asunder.⁵⁶ "All ye are brethren," will be the sentiment of every child of faith.⁵⁷ When the followers of Christ are one with him, there will be no first and last, no less respected or less important ones.⁵⁸ A blessed brotherly fellowship will bind all to Christ in a firm loyalty that cannot be broken.

⁵⁹ The turn that affairs had taken at the feeding of the five thousand had dissatisfied Judas.

⁶⁰ It was he who had set on foot the project to take Christ by force and make him king.⁶¹ But Christ, with greater authority than he was in the custom of exercising, had rebuked this step.⁶² This had provoked Judas, and he became more and more separated from Jesus.

⁶³ If Judas had practised the lessons of Christ, he would have surrendered to Christ, he would have consecrated his heart fully to God; but his confused experience was misleading him.

⁶⁴ When with the disciples, he introduced controversies, doubts, and misleading sentiments, repeating the objections that the scribes and Pharisees urged when questioning the claims of Christ.⁶⁵ He did this at first in order to develop his reasoning powers; but the more he gave expression to the unbelieving remarks made, the more he turned them over in his mind, the more doubt and unbelief came in.

⁶⁶ All the little and large troubles and crosses, the difficulties and hindrances to the advancement of the gospel, Judas interpreted as being evidences against its truthfulness.⁶⁷ He would introduce texts of Scripture that had no connection with the themes of truth that Jesus was seeking to impress upon the minds and hearts of his disciples.⁶⁸ And these texts, separated from their connection, and placed where they had no appropriate bearing and force, confused their minds and increased the discouragements that were constantly pressing in with the suggestions of the scribes and Pharisees.⁶⁹ The sayings of the Pharisees also were so used by him to encourage unbelief, and lessen the force of truth upon the minds of the disciples, that Jesus declared of him that he had a devil.

⁷⁰ Yet all this was done by Judas in such a way

as to give the impression that he was conscientious.⁷¹ And while the disciples were searching for evidence to confirm the words of the great Teacher, Judas would lead them almost imperceptibly on another track.⁷² Thus in a very religious and apparently wise way he was presenting matters in a different light from that in which Jesus had given them, and attaching to his words a meaning that he never intended to convey.

⁷³ The disciples did not see in this the working of the enemy; but Jesus saw that the mind of Judas was open to questionings, doubt, and unbelief which had more or less influence on the other disciples, and that in this way, Satan was communicating his attributes to Judas, and opening up a direct channel through which to work.

⁷⁴ If all could understand the deep trials and discouragements that came to the human nature of Christ in his mission, verily human hearts would draw nigh to the human heart of Jesus.

⁷⁵ The old nature of the disciples often appeared. Often their natural characteristics strove for the mastery.⁷⁶ But Jesus was ever presenting before them that these must be given up, emptied from the soul, that he might implant a new nature therein.

⁷⁷ That Judas, with all his faults and defects of character, was numbered among the twelve, is an instructive lesson, one by the study of which Christians may be profited.⁷⁸ God takes men as they are, with the human element in their character, and then trains them for his service if they will be disciplined and learn of him.⁷⁹ When Judas was chosen by the Lord, his case was not hopeless.⁸⁰ He had some good qualities.⁸¹ In his association with Christ in the work, by listening to his discourses, he had a favorable opportunity to see his wrongs, to become acquainted with his defects of character, if he really desired to be a true disciple.⁸² He was even placed in a position where he could have his choice either to develop his covetous disposition or to see and correct it.

⁸³ Judas might have been benefited by these lessons, had he possessed a desire to be right at heart; but his acquisitiveness overcame him, and the love of money became a ruling power.

⁸⁴ Through indulgence, he permitted this trait in his character to grow and take so deep a root that it crowded out the good seed of truth sown in his heart.⁸⁵ But the fact that Judas was not right at heart, that he was corrupted by selfishness and love of money, is no evidence that there are not true Christians, genuine disciples, who love their Saviour and try to imitate his life and example.⁸⁶ There will ever be some who do not live out their profession, whose daily lives show them to be anything but Christians.⁸⁷ But those who, in the love of God, desire to do his will, will manifest the same in their lives.⁸⁸ The more man views his Saviour, the more will he become assimilated to his image, and work the works of Christ.

ADVENT REVIEW AND SABBATH HERALD.

VOL. 74, No. 41.

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., OCTOBER 12, 1897.

JUDAS.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

¹ The love of money grew in the heart of Judas with the exercise of his shrewd abilities. ² His practical financiering ability, if exercised, enlightened, and molded by the Holy Spirit, would have been of great service to the little church; and by the sanctification of his spirit, he would have had a clear insight, a correct discernment to appreciate heavenly things. ³ But worldly policy plans were constantly cherished by Judas. ⁴ There was no outbreaking sin on his part; but his sharp scheming, the selfish, parsimonious spirit that took possession of him, finally led him to sell his Lord for a small sum of money.

⁵ He might have obtained a larger sum; but Satan had impressed upon his mind that Christ, who had so often defeated the purposes of the scribes and Pharisees, would not suffer himself to be taken. ⁶ How often he had seen the scribes and Pharisees, as Jesus taught them the truth in parables, carried away with the striking figures presented: ⁷ When questions were given for their decision, they pronounced judgment against themselves, condemning the course they themselves were pursuing. ⁸ How often when Christ had made the application of the word to their hearts, and showed that they were the ones whose course he was illustrating, the plain truth sent home enraged them, and in their mortification and madness they had taken up stones to cast at the world's Redeemer! ⁹ Again and again he would have been killed had it not been for the heavenly angels who attended him and guarded his life until the time when the case of the Jews as a nation should be decided. ¹⁰ This human life must be kept by the power of God until his day of work was ended.

¹¹ If Christ could escape so many snares set to destroy him, thought Judas, he certainly would not allow himself to be taken by the scribes, the Pharisees, and the Sadducees; and he decided to put the matter to the test, and bring the crisis. ¹² He, Judas, would act his part in selling his Lord, and the priests would be cheated out of their money. ¹³ If Christ really were the Son of God, the Messiah, the people for whom he had done so much in relieving them from the oppressive power of Satan, would rally, and come to his assistance. ¹⁴ Then he, Judas, would have the credit of having placed him on David's throne. ¹⁵ This would forever settle many minds that were now in such uncertainty. ¹⁶ And this act would place him as first, next to Christ, in the new kingdom.

¹⁷ There are two kinds of experience,—the external showing and the inward working. ¹⁸ The divine and the human were at work in the character of Judas. ¹⁹ Satan was working the human. Christ the divine. ²⁰ Jesus longed to see Judas rise to his appointed privileges. ²¹ He had the privilege of being conformed to the image of Christ's character. ²² This regeneration, this new birth, would have come to him through a vital connection with Christ. ²³ The Saviour's abiding presence would have been to him a daily renewal of consecration and progressive sanctification of the entire man. ²⁴ But the human side of the character of Judas was confused with his religious sentiments, and was treated by him as essential. ²⁵ By taking this view of things, he left an open door for Satan to enter and take possession of him. ²⁶ When unbelief and envy are allowed even utterance, they become agents to expel calm, living, trusting faith. ²⁷ Truth is misunderstood, and perverted to mean error. ²⁸ Evidence might be piled upon evidence, but Satan is close at hand to see that the word spoken shall be misapplied, and become a matter of suspicion and

The Review and Herald,

BATTLE CREEK, MICH., OCTOBER 12, 1897.

distrust.³⁹ How careful, then, should every person be that he does no despite to the Spirit of grace!

³⁹Those who resist the Spirit of God, and provoke him to depart, know not to what lengths Satan will lead them. ⁴⁰When the Holy Spirit departs from the man, he will imperceptibly do those things which once he viewed, in a correct light, to be decided sin. ⁴¹Unless he heeds the warnings, he will wrap himself in a deception that, as in the case of Judas, will cause him to become a traitor and blind. ⁴²He will follow, step by step in the footsteps of Satan. ⁴³Who, then, can strive with him to any purpose? ⁴⁴Will the ministers plead with him and for him? ⁴⁵All their words are as idle tales. ⁴⁶Such souls have Satan as their chosen companion, to misconstrue the word spoken, and bring it to their understanding in a perverted light. ⁴⁷When the Spirit of God is grieved away, every appeal made through the Lord's servants is meaningless to them. ⁴⁸They will misconstrue every word. ⁴⁹They will laugh at and turn into ridicule the most solemn words of Scripture warnings, which, if they were not bewitched by satanic agencies, would make them tremble. ⁵⁰Every appeal made to them is in vain. ⁵¹They will not hear reproof or counsel. ⁵²They despise all the entreaties of the Spirit, and disobey the commandments of God which they once vindicated and exalted. ⁵³Well may the words of the apostle come home to such souls, "Who hath bewitched you, that ye should not obey the truth?" ⁵⁴They follow the counsel of their own heart until truth is no more truth to them. ⁵⁵Barabbas is chosen, Christ is rejected.

⁵⁶It is essential to live by every word of God, else our old nature will constantly reassert itself. ⁵⁷It is the Holy Spirit, the redeeming grace of truth in the soul, that makes the followers of Christ one with one another, and one with God. ⁵⁸He alone can expel enmity, envy, and unbelief. ⁵⁹He sanctifies the entire affections. ⁶⁰He restores the willing, desirous soul from the power of Satan unto God. ⁶¹This is the power of grace. ⁶²It is a divine power. ⁶³Under its influence there is a change from the old habits, customs, and practises which, when cherished, separate the soul from God; and the work of sanctification goes on in the soul, constantly progressing and enlarging.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Manuscript 120 1897

"The fourth and final 1897 manuscript, entitled 'Judas,' is Manuscript 120, dated Occtober 27, 1897. This document combines the older SP material and the ST articles of 1893 and 1894 with some new commentary to form the major structural component for chapter 76." Paage 673 of Research MS.

Judas

¹On the second night before the Passover, Judas had renewed his contract with the priests to deliver Jesus into their hands. ²Then it was arranged that the Saviour should be taken in one of his resorts for prayer and meditation. ³Since the feast at the house of Simon, Judas had had opportunity to reflect upon the deed which he had covenanted to perform, but his purpose was unchanged. ⁴For thirty pieces of silver--the price of a slave--he sold the Lord of glory to ignominy and death.

⁵Judas had naturally a strong love for money; but he had not always been wicked and corrupt enough to do such a deed as this. ⁶He had fostered the evil spirit of avarice until it had become the ruling motive of his life. ⁷The love of mammon overbalanced his love for Christ. ⁸Through becoming the slave of one vice, he gave himself to Satan, to be driven to any lengths in sin.

⁹Judas had joined the disciples when multitudes were following Christ. ¹⁰The Saviour's teachings moved their hearts as they hung entranced upon their words, spoken in the synagogue, by the seaside, upon the mount. ¹¹Judas watched every movement. ¹²He saw the sick, the lame, the blind, flock to Jesus from the towns and cities. ¹³He saw the dying laid at his feet. ¹⁴He witnessed the Saviour's mighty works in healing the sick, casting out devils, and

raising the dead. ¹⁵He felt in his own person the evidence of Christ's divine power. ¹⁶But Judas did not come to the point of surrendering himself fully to Christ. ¹⁷He did not give up his worldly ambition or love of money. ¹⁸While he accepted the position of a minister of Christ, he did not bring himself under the divine moulding. ¹⁹He felt that he could retain his individual judgment and opinion, and he cultivated a disposition to condemn and accuse others.

²⁰In his office of trust, as treasurer for the disciples, Judas had opportunity to see his own weakness of character, and to correct it. ²¹But in the very presence of Christ, while listening daily to his lessons and witnessing his unselfish life, Judas indulged his covetous spirit. ²²The small sums that came into his hands to be spent for the poor and in supplying the needs of Christ and his disciples, were a continual temptation to Judas. ²³Often when he did a little service for Christ, or devoted time to religious services, he paid himself out of this meager fund. ²⁴These pretexts served to excuse his actions in his own eyes; but in God's sight he was a thief.

²⁵The oft-repeated statement of Christ, that his kingdom was not of this world, created thoughts of disaffection in the mind of Judas. ²⁶He had marked out a line upon which he expected Christ to work. ²⁷He had planned that John the Baptist should be delivered from prison. ²⁸But lo, John was left to be beheaded, and Jesus

withdrew himself and his disciples into a country place, instead of avenging the death of John. ²⁹Judas wanted more aggressive warfare. ³⁰He thought that if Jesus would not hold the disciples back from carrying out their schemes, the work would be more successful. ³¹He marked the increasing enmity of the Jewish leaders, and saw their challenge unheeded when they demanded from Christ a sign from heaven. ³²His heart was opened to unbelief, and the enemy supplied thoughts of questioning and rebellion. ³³Why did Christ dwell so much upon that which was discouraging? ³⁴Why did he portray his own trials and persecutions, and point to the trial and persecution of his disciples? ³⁵The prospect of having a high place in the new kingdom had led Judas to espouse the cause of Christ. ³⁶Were his hopes to be disappointed? ³⁷Judas had not decided that Jesus was not the Son of God; he had not made up his mind that Jesus performed miracles through the agency of Satan; but he was questioning, and seeking to find some explanation of his mighty works.

³⁸Christ's discourse in the synagogue concerning the bread of life was the turning point in the history of Judas. ³⁹He heard the words, "Except ye eat my flesh and drink my blood, ye have no life in you." ⁴⁰He saw that Christ was offering spiritual rather than worldly good. ⁴¹His own expectations of a worldly kingdom would not be realized. ⁴²At this time he made shipwreck of faith. ⁴³After this he

permitted doubt, envy, and hatred to be his guests. ⁴⁴His jealousy was aroused when he was not included with the three disciples chosen to witness the transfiguration of Christ upon the mount. ⁴⁵When the disciples disputed by the way as to who should be greatest, his voice was often heard. ⁴⁶In all that Christ said to the disciples there was something with which, in heart, Judas disagreed. ⁴⁷Under his influence the leaven of this disaffection was fast developing. ⁴⁸Yet he made no open opposition, nor seemed to question the importance of the Saviour's lessons. ⁴⁹He made no outward murmur until the time of the feast in Simon's house. ⁵⁰When Mary anointed the Saviour's feet with the precious ointment, Judas manifested his covetous disposition. ⁵¹At the reproof from Jesus, his very spirit seemed turned to gall. ⁵²The greed so long indulged now held him in control, and overpowered every other characteristic of his nature. ⁵³This will be the experience of every man who persists in tampering with sin. ⁵⁴The elements of depravity that are not resisted and overcome, respond to Satan's temptations, and the soul is led captive at his will.

⁵⁵But Judas was not yet wholly hardened. ⁵⁶Even after he had twice covenanted to betray the Saviour, there was opportunity for repentance. ⁵⁷But at the Passover supper Jesus proved his own divinity by revealing the traitor's purpose. ⁵⁸He tenderly included Judas in his ministry to

the disciples. ⁵⁹But the last appeal of love was made, only to be rejected. ⁶⁰Then the case of Judas was decided. ⁶¹The feet that Christ had washed, went forth to the betrayer's work, and Satan took control of heart and mind.

⁶²Judas reasoned that if Christ was to be crucified, the event must come to pass. ⁶³His own act in betraying the Saviour would not change the result. ⁶⁴If Jesus was not to die, it would only force him to deliver himself from his enemies. ⁶⁵At all events, Judas would gain something by his treachery. ⁶⁶He counted that he had made a sharp bargain in betraying his Lord.

⁶⁷Judas did not, however, believe that Christ would permit himself to be taken by his enemies. ⁶⁸He thought that the priests would be cheated of their bribe, he would secure the pieces of silver, and Jesus would have a new opportunity of displaying his divine power.

⁶⁹In the garden, Judas was filled with amazement as Jesus suffered himself to be bound and led away. ⁷⁰He anxiously followed the Saviour to the place of trial before the Jewish rulers. ⁷¹At every movement he looked for him to surprise his enemies, by appearing before them in the character of the Son of God, setting at naught all their plots and power. ⁷²But when he saw him meekly submitting to their abuse, suffering himself to be tried and condemned, his heart smote him. ⁷³He realized that he had sold his divine Master to shame and death. ⁷⁴He remembered the

tenderness of Jesus toward him, and he was filled with remorse and anguish. ⁷⁵He now despised the covetousness which Jesus had reproved, and which had tempted him to sell the Saviour for a few pieces of silver.

⁷⁶As the trial drew to a close, Judas could no longer endure the torture of his guilty conscience. ⁷⁷Suddenly a hoarse voice rang through the hall, sending a thrill of terror to the hearts of all present: spare him, O Caiaphas! ⁷⁸He has done nothing worthy of death.

⁷⁹The tall form of Judas was now seen pressing through the startled crowd. ⁸⁰His face was pale and haggard, and large drops of sweat stood upon his forehead. ⁸¹Rushing to the throne of judgment, he threw down before the high priests the pieces of silver that had been the price of his Lord's betrayal. ⁸²He eagerly grasped the robe of Caiaphas and implored him to release Jesus, declaring that he was innocent of all crime. ⁸³Caiaphas angrily shook him off, but was confused and knew not what to say. ⁸⁴The perfidy of the priests was revealed before the people. ⁸⁵It was evident to all that Judas had been bribed to deliver Jesus into the hands of those who sought his life.

⁸⁶Judas continued his entreaties, exclaiming, "I have sinned, in that I have betrayed the innocent blood. ⁸⁷But the high priest, having recovered his self-possession, answered with chilling scorn, "What is that to us? See thou to that." ⁸⁸The priests had been ready to make Judas their

tool. ⁸⁹They had taken advantage of his covetousness and hatred. ⁹⁰Yet they despised his baseness. ⁹¹When he turned to them with confession of his guilt, they spurned him, and left him to perish in his sins.

⁹²Finding that his prayers were in vain, Judas fell at the feet of Jesus, acknowledging him to be the Son of God, begging forgiveness of his sins, and imploring him to exercise his Godlike power, and deliver himself from his enemies. ⁹³The Saviour did not reproach his betrayer either by look or word. ⁹⁴He knew that he was suffering the bitterest remorse. ⁹⁵He gazed compassionately upon Judas, and declared, that for this hour he had come into the world.

⁹⁶A murmur of surprise ran through the assembly at the heavenly forbearance of the Saviour. ⁹⁷Again a conviction swept over them that this man was more than mortal. ⁹⁸But the question arose, If he was the Son of God, why did he not free himself from his bonds, and rise triumphant above his accusers?

⁹⁹Judas perceived that his entreaties for the life of Jesus were in vain. ¹⁰⁰In despair he rushed from the hall, exclaiming, It is too late! ¹⁰¹It is too late! ¹⁰¹He felt that he could not live to see Jesus crucified, and in an agony of remorse, he went out and hanged himself.

¹⁰²Later that same day, on the road from Pilate's judgment hall to Calvary, there came an interruption to the shouts and jeers of the wicked throng who were leading Jesus

to the place of crucifixion. ¹⁰³As they passed a retired spot, they saw at the foot of a lifeless tree the body of Judas. ¹⁰⁵It was a most revolting scene. ¹⁰⁶His weight had broken the cord by which he had hanged himself to the tree. ¹⁰⁷In falling, his body had been horribly mangled, and dogs were now devouring it. ¹⁰⁸His remains were immediately buried out of sight; but there was less mockery among the throng, and many a pale face revealed the fearful thoughts within. ¹⁰⁹Retribution seemed already visiting those who were guilty of the blood of Jesus.

¹¹⁰Judas the betrayer of Christ bore testimony to his innocence. ¹¹¹More than this, his very act in betraying the Saviour bore witness to his divine character; for it was in direct fulfilment of a prophecy of him. ¹¹²In prophetic vision the prophet Zechariah had looked down the ages and seen the trial of God's dear Son. ¹¹³The act of Judas is thus described: "And I said unto them, If ye think good, give me my price; and if not forbear. ¹¹⁴So they weighed for my price thirty pieces of silver. ¹¹⁵And the Lord said unto me, Cast it unto the potter; a goodly price that I was prized at by them. ¹¹⁶And I took the thirty pieces of silver, and cast them to the potter in the house of the Lord."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 76

Introduction to Sources - Dods, Hanna, Edersheim

Here in Appendix D for DA chapter 76 are being provided some of the principal sources used in the chapter. Narrative materials from Dods, Hanna, and Edersheim are the ones chosen.

I shall give a sop when I have dipped it." ³⁷ And when He had dipped the sop, He gave it to Judas Iscariot. ³⁸ This reveals to John, but to no one else, who the traitor was, for the giving of the sop was no more at that table than the handing of a plate or the offer of ³⁹ any article of food is at any table. John alone knew ⁴⁰ the significance of it. But Judas had already taken alarm at the narrowing of the circle of suspicion, and had possibly for the moment ceased dipping in the same dish with Jesus, lest he should be identified with ⁴¹ the traitor. Jesus therefore dips for him and offers him the sop which he will not himself take, and the look that accompanies the act, as well as the act itself, shows Judas that his treachery is discovered. He ⁴² therefore mechanically takes up in a somewhat colder form the question of the rest, and says, "Master, is ⁴³ it I?" His fear subdues his voice to a whisper, heard only by John and the Lord; and the answer, "Thou ⁴⁴ hast said. [That thou doest, do quickly," is equally ⁴⁵ unobserved by the rest. Judas need fear no violence at their hands; John alone knows the meaning of his abrupt rising and hurrying from the room, and John sees that Jesus wishes him to go unobserved. The ⁴⁶ rest, therefore, thought only that Judas was going out to make some final purchases that had been forgotten, or to care for the poor in this season of festivity. But ⁴⁷ John saw differently. "The traitor," he says, "went immediately out; and it was night." As his ill-omened, ⁴⁸ stealthy figure glided from the chamber, the sudden night of the Eastern twilightless sunset had fallen on the company; sadness, silence, and gloom fell upon John's spirit; the hour of darkness had at length fallen in the very midst of this quiet feast. ⁴⁹ This sin of Judas presents us with one of the most

perplexed problems of life and character that the strange circumstances of this world have ever produced. Let us first of all look at the connection of ⁴¹ this betrayal with the life of Christ, and then consider the phase of character exhibited in Judas. In connection with the life of Christ the difficulty is to understand why the death of Christ was to be brought about in this particular way of treachery among His own followers. It may be said that it came to pass "that ⁴³ Scripture might be fulfilled," that this special prediction in the 41st Psalm might be fulfilled. But why ⁴⁴ was such a prediction made? It was of course the ⁴⁵ event which determined the prediction, not the prediction which determined the event. Was it, then, an ⁴⁶ accident that Jesus should be handed over to the authorities in this particular way? Or was there any ⁴⁷ significance in it, that justifies its being made so prominent in the narrative? Certainly if our Lord ⁴⁸ was to be brought into contact with the most painful form of sin, He must have experience of treachery. He had known the sorrow that death brings to the ⁴⁹ survivors; He had known the pain and disappointment of being resisted by stupid, obstinate, bad-hearted men; but if He was to know the utmost of misery which man can inflict upon man, He must be brought into contact with one who could accept His love, eat His bread, press His hand with assurance of fidelity, and then sell Him.

When we endeavour to set before our minds a ⁵⁰ clear idea of the character of Judas, and to understand how such a character could be developed, we have to acknowledge that we could desire a few more facts in order to certify us of what we can now only conjecture. Obviously we must start from the idea that ⁵¹

with extraordinary capacity for wickedness Judas had also more than ordinary leanings to what was good. 52 He was an Apostle, and had, we must suppose, been called to that office by Christ under the impression that he possessed gifts which would make him very service- 53 able to the Christian community. He was himself so impressed with Christ as to follow Him: making those pecuniary sacrifices of which Peter boastfully spoke, and which must have been specially sore to Judas. 54 It is possible, indeed, that he may have followed Jesus as a speculation, hoping to receive wealth and honour in the new kingdom; but this motive mingled with the attachment to Christ's person which all the Apostles had, and mingles in a different form with the discipleship of all Christians. [With this motive, therefore, 55 there probably mingled in the mind of Judas a desire to be with One who could shield him from evil influences; he judged that with Jesus he would find continual aid against his weaker nature.] Possibly he wished by 56 one bold abandonment of the world to get rid for ever of his covetousness. [That Judas was trusted by the 57 other Apostles is manifest from the fact that to him they committed their common fund,—not to John, whose dreamy and abstracted nature ill fitted him for minute practical affairs; not to Peter, whose impulsive nature might often have landed the little company in difficulties; not even to Matthew, accustomed as he was to accounts; but to Judas, who had the economical habits, the aptitude for finance, the love of bargaining, which regularly go hand in hand with the love of money.] This practical faculty for finance and for 58 affairs generally might, if rightly guided, have become a most serviceable element in the Apostolate, and might have enabled Judas more successfully than any other

of the Apostles to mediate between the Church and 57 the world. That Judas in all other respects conducted himself circumspectly is proved by the fact that, though other Apostles incurred the displeasure of Christ and were rebuked by Him, Judas committed no glaring 60 fault till this last week. Even to the end he was unsuspected by his fellow-Apostles; and to the end he 61 had an active conscience. His last act, were it not so awful, would inspire us with something like respect for him: he is overwhelmed with remorse and shame; his sense of guilt is stronger even than the love of money that had hitherto been his strongest passion: he judges himself fairly, sees what he has become, and goes to his own place; recognises as not every man does recognise what is his fit habitation, and goes to it. 62 But this man, with his good impulses, his resolute will, his enlightened conscience, his favouring circumstances, his frequent feelings of affection towards Christ and desire to serve Him, committed a crime so unparalleled in wickedness that men practically make very little attempt to estimate it or measure it with sins 63 of their own. Commonly we think of it as a special, exceptional wickedness—not so much the natural product of a heart like our own and what may be reproduced by ourselves, as the work of Satan using a man as his scarcely responsible tool to effect a purpose which needs never again to be effected. 64 If we ask what precisely it was in the crime of Judas that makes us so abhor it, manifestly its most 65 hateful ingredient was its treachery. "It was not an enemy that reproached me; then I could have borne it; but it was thou, a man mine equal, my guide, and 66 mine acquaintance." Caesar defended himself till the dagger of a friend pierced him; then in indignant grief

braced himself up to go through with it. ⁶³ Hence, when the time for action comes, he stops not to reflect, but lets the momentum of his predetermined purpose carry him along. ⁶⁴ He salutes Jesus with a kiss! ⁶⁵ If ever a righteous indignation might legitimately be felt, surely it was here. ⁶⁶ And if that burning sense of wrong had gone no farther in its expression than simply the refusal of such a salutation, would not Christ have acted with unimpeachable propriety? ⁶⁷ But it is far above this level that Jesus will now rise. ⁶⁸ He will give an example of gentleness, of forbearance, of long-suffering kindness without a parallel. ⁶⁹ Jesus accepts the betrayer's salutation. ⁷⁰ He does more. ⁷¹ He says a word or two to this deluded man: "Friend, wherefore art thou come?" ⁷² Is it possible that thou canst imagine, after all that passed between us at the supper-table, that I am ignorant of thy purpose in this visit? ⁷³ I know that purpose well; thou knowest that I do; if not, I will make a last attempt to make thee know and feel it now. ⁷⁴ Thought of, cared for, warned in so many ways, art thou really come to betray such a Master as I have ever been to thee? ⁷⁵ But though thou hast made up thy mind to such a deed, how is it that thou chooseth such a cloak as this beneath which to conceal thy purpose? ⁷⁶ The deed is bad enough itself without crowning it with the lie of the hypocrite!—"Judas, betrayest thou the Son of man with a kiss!"—the last complaint of wounded love, the last of the many and most touching appeals made to the conscience and heart of the betrayer; rebuke and remonstrance in the words, but surely their tone is one more of pity than of anger; surely the wish of the speaker was to arrest the traitor, if it were not yet too late. ⁷⁷ Had Judas yielded even at that last moment; with a broken and a contrite heart had he thrown himself at his Master's feet, to bathe with tears the feet of him whose cheek he had just polluted with his unhallowed kiss; looking up through those tears of penitence, had he sought mercy of the Lord, how freely would that mercy have been extended to him! who can doubt that he would have been at once forgiven? ⁷⁸ But he did not, he would not yield; and so on he went, till there was nothing left to him but the horror of that remorse which dug for him the grave of the suicide.

⁷⁹ We often wonder, as we read his story, how it was ever possible, that, in the face of so many, such explicit, solemn, affectionate appeals, this man should have so obstinately pursued his course. ⁸⁰ We should wonder, perhaps, the less, if we only reflected what a blinding, hardening power any one fixed idea, any one settled purpose, any one dominant passion, in the full flush and fervor of its ascendancy, exerts upon the human spirit; how it blinds to consequences

that are then staring us in the very face; how it deadens to remonstrances to which, in other circumstances, we should at once have yielded; how it carries us over obstacles that at other times would at once have stopped us; nay, more, and what perhaps is the most striking feature of the whole, how the very interferences, for which otherwise we should have been grateful, are resented; how the very appeals intended and fitted to arrest, become as so many goads driving us on the more determinedly upon our path.⁸¹ So it was with Judas.⁸² And let us not think that we have in him a monstrous specimen of almost superhuman wickedness.⁸³ We should be wiser the truth, I suspect, if we took him as an average specimen of what the passion of avarice, or any like passion, when once it has got the mastery, may lead any man to be and do.⁸⁴ For we have no reason to believe of Judas, that from the first he was an utter reprobate.⁸⁵ Our Lord we scarcely can believe would have admitted such a man to the number of the twelve.⁸⁶ Can it be believed of him that when he first joined himself to Jesus, it was to make gain of that connection?⁸⁷ There was but little prospect of worldly gain in following the Nazarene.⁸⁸ Nor can we fairly attribute that obstinacy which Judas showed in the last great crisis of his life, to utter deadness of conscience, or utter hardness of heart.⁸⁹ The man who no sooner heard the death-sentence given against his Master, than—without even waiting to see if it would be executed—he rushed before the men by whom that sentence had been pronounced—the very men with whom he had made his unholy covenant, from whom he had got but an hour or two before the price of blood—exclaiming in the bitterness of his heart, “I have sinned, in that I have betrayed innocent blood;”—the man who took those thirty pieces of silver, which his itching palm had so longed to clutch, but which now were burning like scorching lead the hand that grasped them, and flung them ringing on the temple floor, and hurried to a lonely field without the city walls and hanged himself, dying in all likelihood before his Master—let us not think of him that he was utterly heartless—that he had a conscience seared as with a hot iron.

⁹⁰ What, then, is the true explanation of his character and career?

⁹¹ Let us assume that, when he first united himself to Christ, it was not of deliberate design to turn that connection into a source of profit.

⁹² He found, however, as time ran on, that to some small extent it could be so employed.⁹³ The little company that he had joined had chosen him to be their treasurer, to hold and to dispense the slender funds which they possessed.⁹⁴ Those who are fond of money, as he was, are generally careful in the keeping, thrifty in their use of it.⁹⁵ Judas had

those faculties in perfection, and they won for him that office of trust, to him so terribly dangerous.⁹⁶ The temptation was greater than he could resist.⁹⁷ He became a pilferer from that small bag.⁹⁸ Little as it had to feed upon, his passion grew.⁹⁹ It grew, for he had no higher principle, no better feeling, to subdue it.¹⁰⁰ It grew, till he began to picture to himself what untold wealth was in store for him when his Master should throw off that reserve and disguise which he had so long and so studiously preserved, and take to himself his power, and set up his kingdom—a kingdom which he, in common with all the apostles, believed was to be a visible and temporal one.¹⁰¹ It grew, till delay became intolerable.¹⁰² At the supper in Bethany, it vexed him to see that box of ointment of spikenard, which might have been sold for three hundred pence, wasted on what seemed to him an idle piece of premature and romantic homage.¹⁰³ It vexed him still more to hear his Master rebuke the irritation he had displayed, and speak now once again, as he had been doing so often lately, of his death and burial, as if the splendid vision of his kingdom were never to be realized.¹⁰⁴ Could nothing be done to force his Master on to exercise his kingly power?¹⁰⁵ These scribes and Pharisees, who hated him so bitterly, desired nothing so much as to get him into their hands.¹⁰⁶ If once they did so, would he not, in self-defence, be obliged to put forth that power which Judas knew that he possessed?¹⁰⁷ And were he to do so, things could not remain any longer as they were.¹⁰⁸ The passover—this great gathering of the people—would soon go past, and he, Judas, and the rest, have to resume their weary journeyings on foot throughout Judea.¹⁰⁹ Thus and then it was, that, in all likelihood, the thought flashed into the mind of the betrayer to go and ask the chief priests what they would give him if he delivered Jesus into their hands.¹¹⁰ They offered him thirty pieces of silver, a very paltry bribe—the price in the old Hebrew code of a slave that was gored by an ox—less than £5 of our money; a bribe insufficient of itself to have tempted even a grossly avaricious man, in the position in which Judas was, to betray his Master, knowing or believing that it was unto death.¹¹¹ Why, in a year or two Judas might have realized as much as that by petty pilferings from the apostolic bag.¹¹² But this scheme of his would bring his Master to the test.¹¹³ It would expedite what, to his covetous, ambitious heart, had seemed to be that slow and meaningless course to a throne and kingdom which his Master had been pursuing.¹¹⁴ Not suspecting what the immediate and actual issue was to be, he made his unholy compact with the high priests.¹¹⁵ He made it on the Wednesday of the passion week.¹¹⁶ Next evening he sat with Jesus in the supper-chamber.¹¹⁷ He found himself detect-

ed; more than one terrible warning was sounded in his ears.¹¹⁶ Strange, you may think, that instead of stopping him in his course, these warnings suggested, perhaps for the first time, the thought that what he had engaged to do might be done that very night.¹¹⁷ The words, "What then doest thou quickly," themselves gave eagerness and firmness to his purpose; for, after all, though Jesus seemed for the time so much displeased—let this scheme but prosper—let the kingdom be set up, and would he not be sure to forgive the offence that had hastened so happy a result?

¹²⁰ Have we any grounds for interpreting in this way the betrayal?

¹²¹ Are we right in attributing such motives to Judas?¹²² If not, then how are we to explain his surprise when he saw his Master, though still possessing all his wonderful power, as he showed by the healing of the servant's ear, allow himself to be bound and led away like a felon?¹²³ How are we to explain the consternation of Judas when he learned that though Jesus, publicly, before the Sanhedrim, claimed to be the Christ, the Son of God, the King of Israel, yet, instead of there being any acquiescence in that claim, a universal horror was expressed, and on the very ground of his making it, he was doomed to the death of a blasphemer?¹²⁴ Then it was, when all turned out so differently from what he had anticipated, that the idea of his having been the instrument of his Master's death entered like iron into the soul of Judas.¹²⁵ Then it was, that, overwhelmed with nameless, countless disappointments, vexations, self-reproaches, his very living to see his Master die became intolerable to him, and in his despair he flung his ill-used life away.

¹²⁶ Accept such solution, and the story of the betrayal of our Lord becomes natural and consistent; reject it, and have you not difficulties in your way not to be got over by any amount of villainy that you may attribute to the traitor?¹²⁷ But does not this solution take down the crime of Judas from that pinnacle of almost superhuman and unapproachable guilt on which many seem inclined to place it?

¹²⁸ It does; but it renders it all the more available as a beacon of warning to us all.¹²⁹ For if we are right in the idea we have formed of the character and conduct of Judas, there have been many since his time, there may be many still, in the same way, and from the operation of the same motives, betrayers of Christ.¹³⁰ For everywhere he is a Judas, with whom his worldly interests, his worldly ambition, prevail over his attachment to Christ and to Christ's cause; who joins the Christian society, it may be, not to make gain thereby—but who, when the occasion presents itself, scruples not to make what gain he can of that connection; who, beneath the garb of the Christian call-

ing, pursues a dishonest traffic; who, when the gain and the godliness come into collision, sacrifices the godliness for the gain.¹³¹ How many such Judases the world has seen, how much of that Judas spirit there may be in our own hearts, I leave it to your knowledge of yourselves and your knowledge of the world to determine.

¹³² Let us now resume our narrative of the arrest.¹³³ Whatever lingering reluctance to touch Christ had been felt, that kiss of Judas removed. They laid their hands upon him instantly thereafter, grasping him as if he were a vulgar villain of the highway, and binding him after the merciless fashion of the Romans. This is what one, at least, of his followers cannot hear. Peter springs forth from the darkness, draws his sword, and aims at the head of the first person he sees; who, however, bends to the side, and his ear only is lopped off. To Christ an unwelcome act of friendship. It ruffles his composure, it impairs the dignity of his patience. For the first and only time a human creature suffers that he may be protected. The injury thus done he must instantly repair. They have his hand within their hold, when, gently saying to them, "Suffer ye thus far," he releases it from their grasp, and, stretching it out, touches the bleeding ear, and heals it: the only act of healing wrought on one who neither asked it of him, nor had any faith in his healing virtue; but an act which showed how full of almighty power that hand was which yet gave itself up to ignominious bonds. Then said Jesus to Peter, "Put up again thy sword into his place: for all they that take the sword shall perish with the sword. Thinkest thou that I cannot now pray to my Father, and he shall presently give me more than twelve legions of angels? But how then shall the Scriptures be fulfilled, that thus it must be? The cup which my Father hath given me, shall I not drink it?" He was drinking then, even at that time, of the same cup in regard to which he had been praying in the garden. Not only his agonies in Gethsemane and on the cross, but all his griefs, internal and external, were ingredients in that cup which, for us and for our salvation, he took, and drank to the very dregs—a cup put by his Father's hand into his, and by him voluntarily taken, that the will of his Father might be done, and that the Scriptures might be fulfilled. All this about the cup, and his Father, and the Scriptures, spoken for the instruction and reproof of Peter, must have sounded not a little strange to those chief priests and scribes and elders who have come out to be present, at least, if not to take part in the apprehension, and who are now standing by his side. But for them, too, there must be a word, to show them that he is after all a very brother of our race, who feels as any other innocent man would

JUDAS.

77

from the later challenge of His own relatives to go and meet the Pharisees at headquarters in Judæa, and to show openly, if He could, by His works, that He was the Messiah.^a All the more remarkable appears Christ's dealing with His disciples, His demand on, and training of their faith. It must be remembered, that His last 'hard' sayings at Capernaum had led to the defection of many, who till then had been His disciples.^b Undoubtedly this had already tried their faith, as appears from the question of Christ: 'Will ye also go away?'^c It was this wise and gracious dealing with them—this putting the one disappointment of doubt, engendered by what they could not understand, against their whole past experience in following Him, which enabled them to overcome. And it is this which also enables us to answer the doubt, perhaps engendered by inability to understand seemingly unintelligible, hard sayings of Christ, such as that to the disciples about giving them His Flesh to eat, or about His being the Living Bread from heaven. And, this alternative being put to them: would they, could they, after their experience of Him, go away from Him, they overcame, as we overcome, through what almost sounds like a cry of despair, yet is a shout of victory: 'Lord, to whom shall we go? Thou hast the words of eternal life.'

CHAP.
XXXVII^a St. John
vii. 1-5^b St. John
vi. 60-68;
comp.
St. Matt.
xv. 12^c St. John
vi. 67

³⁶And all that followed only renewed and deepened the trial of faith, which had commenced at Capernaum.³⁷We shall, perhaps, best understand it when following the progress of this trial in him who, at last, made shipwreck of his faith: Judas Iscariot.³⁸Without attempting to gaze into the mysterious abyss of the Satanic element in his apostasy, we may trace his course in its psychological development.³⁹We must not regard Judas as a monster, but as one with passions like ourselves.⁴⁰True, there was one terrible master-passion in his soul—covetousness; but that was only the downward, lower aspect of what seems, and to many really is, that which leads to the higher and better—ambition.⁴¹It had been thoughts of Israel's King which had first set his imagination on fire, and brought him to follow the Messiah.⁴²Gradually, increasingly, came the disenchantment. ⁴³It was quite another Kingdom, that of Christ; quite another Kingdom than what had set Judas aglow.⁴⁴This feeling was deepened as events proceeded.⁴⁵His confidence must have been terribly shaken when the Baptist was beheaded.⁴⁶What a contrast to the time when his voice had bent the thousands of Israel, as trees in the wind!⁴⁷So this had been nothing—and the Baptist must be written off, not as for, but as really against, Christ.⁴⁸Then came the next disappoint-

BOOK
III

ment, when Jesus would not be made King.⁴⁷ Why not—if He were King?¹⁰⁴ And so on, step by step, till the final depth was reached, when Jesus would not, or could not—which was it?—at the public challenge of the Pharisees.¹⁰⁵ We take it, that it was then that the leaven pervaded and leavened Judas in heart and soul.

¹⁰⁶ We repeat it, that what so, and permanently, penetrated Judas, could not (as Christ's warning shows) have left the others wholly unaffected.¹⁰⁷ The very presence of Judas with them must have had its influence.¹⁰⁸ And how did Christ deal with it?¹⁰⁹ There was, first, the silent sail across the Lake, and then the warning which put them on their guard, lest the little leaven should corrupt the bread of the Sanctuary, on which they had learned to live.¹¹⁰ The littleness of their faith must be corrected; it must grow and become strong. And so we can understand what follows. It was after solitary prayer—no doubt for them*—that, with reference to the challenge of the Pharisees, 'the leaven' that threatened them, He now gathered up all their experience of the past by putting to them the question, what men, the people who had watched His Works and heard His Words, regarded Him as being. Even on them some conviction had been wrought by their observance of Him. It marked Him out (as the disciples said) as different from all around, nay, from all ordinary men: like the Baptist, or Elijah, or as if He were one of the old prophets alive again. But, if even the multitude had gathered such knowledge of Him, what was their experience, who had always been with Him? Answered he, who most truly represented the Church, because he combined with the most advanced experience of the three most intimate disciples the utmost boldness of confession: 'Thou art the Christ!'

* St. Luke
lx. 18

And so in part was this 'leaven' of the Pharisees purged! Yet not wholly. For then it was, that Christ spake to them of His sufferings and death, and that the resistance of Peter showed how deeply that leaven had penetrated. And then followed the grand contrast presented by Christ, between minding the things of men and those of God, with the warning which it implied, and the monition as to the necessity of bearing the cross of contempt, and the absolute call to do so, as addressed to those who would be His disciples. Here, then, the contest about 'the sign,' or rather the challenge about the Messiahship, was carried from the mental into the moral sphere, and so decided. Six days more of quiet waiting and growth of faith, and it was met, rewarded, crowned, and perfected by the sight on the Mount of Transfiguration; yet, even so, perceived only as through the heaviness of sleep.

Him much to sit around Him in mournful silence as He thus spake, and to follow Him unto His Dying.

CHAP.
VIII

But to one of them, in whose heart the darkness had long been gathering, this was the decisive moment. The prediction of Christ, which Judas as well as the others must have felt to be true, extinguished the last glimmering of such light of Christ as his soul had been capable of receiving. In its place flared up the lurid flame of hell. By the open door out of which he had thrust the dying Christ 'Satan entered into Judas.'^a Yet, even so, not permanently.^b It may, indeed, be doubted, whether, since God is in Christ, such can ever be the case in any human soul, at least on this side eternity. Since our world's night has been lit up by the promise from Paradise, the rosy hue of its morning has lain on the edge of the horizon, deepening into gold, brightening into day, growing into midday-strength and evening-glory. Since God's Voice wakened earth by its early Christmas-Hymn, it has never been quite night there, nor can it ever be quite night in any human soul.¹

^a St. Luke
xxii. 3
^b St. John
xiii. 2 and
27

But it is a terrible night-study, that of Judas. We seem to tread our way over loose stones of hot molten lava, as we climb to the edge of the crater, and shudderingly look down its depths. And yet there, near there, have stood not only St. Peter in the night of his denial, but mostly all of us, save they whose Angels have always looked up into the Face of our Father in heaven. And yet, in our weakness, we have even wept over them! There, near there, have we stood, not in the hours of our weakness, but in those of our sore temptation, when the blast of doubt had almost quenched the flickering light, or the storm of passion or of self-will broken the bruised reed. But He prayed for us—and through the night came over desolate moor and stony height the Light of His Presence, and above the wild storm rose the Voice of Him, Who has come to seek and to save that which was lost. Yet near to us, close to us, was the dark abyss; and we can never more forget our last, almost sliding, foothold as we quitted its edge.

45 A terrible night-study this of Judas, and best to make it here, at once, from its beginning to its end. 46 We shall, indeed, catch sudden glimpse of him again, as the light of the torches flashes on the traitor-face in Gethsemane; and once more hear his voice in the assemblage of the haughty, sneering councillors of Israel, when his footfall on the marble pavement of the Temple-halls, and the clink of those thirty accursed pieces of silver shall waken the echoes, wake also the dirge of despair in his soul, and he shall flee from the night of his soul into the night that for ever closes around him. 47 But all

¹ This apart from the question of the exceptional sin against the Holy Ghost.

BOOK this as rapidly as we may pass from it, after this present brief study
V of his character and history.

*St. John
xii. 6, 8

¹ Cor. xii.
28

43 We remember, that 'Judas, the man of Kerioth,' was, so far as we know, the only disciple of Jesus from the province of Judæa.⁴⁷ This circumstance; that he carried the bag, i.e. was treasurer and administrator of the small common stock of Christ and His disciples; and that he was both a hypocrite and a thief*—this is all that we know for certain of his history.⁵⁰ From the circumstance that he was appointed to such office of trust in the Apostolic community, we infer that he must have been looked up to by the others as an able and prudent man, a good administrator.⁵¹ And there is probably no reason to doubt, that he possessed the natural gift of administration or of 'government' (κυβέρνησις).⁵² The question, why Jesus left him 'the bag' after He knew him to be a thief—which, as we believe, he was not at the beginning, and only became in the course of time and in the progress of disappointment—is best answered by this other: Why He originally allowed it to be entrusted to Judas?⁵³ It was not only because he was best fitted—probably, absolutely fitted—for such work, but also in mercy to him, in view of his character.⁵⁴ To engage in that for which a man is naturally fitted is the most likely means of keeping him from brooding, dissatisfaction, alienation, and eventual apostasy.⁵⁵ On the other hand, it must be admitted that, as mostly all our life-temptations come to us from that for which we have most aptitude, when Judas was alienated and unfaithful in heart, this very thing became also his greatest temptation, and, indeed, hurried him to his ruin.⁵⁶ But only after he had first failed inwardly.⁵⁷ And so, as ever in like circumstances, the very things which might have been most of blessing become most of curse, and the judgment of hardening fulfils itself by that which in itself is good.⁵⁸ Nor could 'the bag' have been afterwards taken from him without both exposing him to the others, and precipitating his moral destruction.⁵⁹ And so he had to be left to the process of inward ripening, till all was ready for the sickle.

60 This very gift of 'government' in Judas may also help us to understand how he may have been first attracted to Jesus, and through what process, when alienated, he came to end in that terrible sin which had cast its snare about him.⁶¹ The 'gift of government' would, in its active aspect, imply the desire for it.⁶² From thence to ambition in its worst, or selfish, aspect, there is only a step—scarcely that: rather, only different moral premisses.⁶³ Judas

* On the relation between ambition and covetousness, generally and in the special case of Judas, see p. 77.

was drawn to Jesus as the *Jewish* Messiah, and he believed in Him as such, possibly both earnestly and ardently; but he expected that His would be the success, the result, and the triumphs of the Jewish Messiah, and he also expected personally and fully to share in them. ⁶⁵How deep-rooted were such feelings even in the best, purest, and most unselfish of Jesus' disciples, we gather from the request of the mother of John and James for her sons, and from Peter's question: 'What shall we have?' ⁶⁶It must have been sorrow, the misery of moral loneliness, and humiliation, to Him Who was Unselfishness Incarnate, Who lived to die and was full to empty Himself, to be associated with such as even His most intimate disciples, who in this sense also could not watch with Him even one hour, and in whom, at the end of His Ministry, such heaviness was mentally and morally the outcrop, if not the outcome. ⁶⁷And in Judas all this must have been an hundredfold more than in them who were in heart true to Christ.

⁶⁸He had, from such conviction as we have described, joined the movement at its very commencement. ⁶⁹Then, multitudes in Galilee followed His Footsteps, and watched for His every appearance; they hung entranced on His lips in the Synagogue or on 'the Mount'; they flocked to Him from every town, village, and hamlet; they bore the sick and dying to His Feet, and witnessed, awestruck, how conquered devils gave their testimony to His Divine Power. ⁷⁰It was the spring-time of the movement, and all was full of promise—land, people, and disciples. ⁷¹The Baptist, who had bowed before Him and testified to Him, was still lifting his voice to proclaim the near Kingdom. ⁷²But the people had turned after Jesus, and He swayed them. ⁷³And, oh! what power was there in His Face and Word, in His look and deed. ⁷⁴And Judas, also, had been one of them who, on their early Mission, had temporarily had power given him, so that the very devils had been subject to them. ⁷⁵But, step by step, had come the disappointment. ⁷⁶John was beheaded, and not avenged; on the contrary, Jesus withdrew Himself. ⁷⁷This constant withdrawing, whether from enemies or from success—almost amounting to flight—even when they would have made Him a King; this refusal to show Himself openly, either at Jerusalem, as His own brethren had taunted Him, or, indeed, anywhere else; this uniform preaching of discouragement to them, when they came to Him elated and hopeful at some success; this gathering enmity of Israel's leaders, and His marked avoidance of, or, as some might have put it, His failure in taking up the repeated public challenge of the Pharisees to show a sign from heaven; last, and chief of all, this constant and growing

BOOK V reference to shame, disaster, and death—what did it all mean, if not disappointment of all those hopes and expectations which had made Judas at the first a disciple of Jesus?

⁷⁸ He that so knew Jesus, not only in His Words and Deeds, but in His inmost Thoughts, even to His night-long communing with God on the hill-side, could not have seriously believed in the coarse Pharisaic charge of Satanic agency as the explanation of all. ⁷⁹ Yet, from the then Jewish standpoint, he could scarcely have found it impossible to suggest some other explanation of His miraculous power. ⁸⁰ But, as increasingly the moral and spiritual aspect of Christ's Kingdom must have become apparent to even the dullest intellect, the bitter disappointment of his Messianic thoughts and hopes must have gone on, increasing in proportion as, side by side with it, the process of moral alienation, unavoidably connected with his resistance to such spiritual manifestations, continued and increased. ⁸¹ And so the mental and the moral alienation went on together, affected by and affecting each other. ⁸² And if we were pressed to name a definite moment when the process of disintegration, at least sensibly, began, we would point to that Sabbath-morning at Capernaum, when Christ had preached about His Flesh as the Food of the World, and so many of His adherents ceased to follow after Him; nay, when the leaven so worked even in His disciples, that He turned to them with the searching question—intended to show them the full import of the crisis—whether they also would leave Him? ⁸³ Peter conquered by grasping the moral element, because it was germane to him and to the other true disciples: 'To whom shall we go?' ⁸⁴ Thou hast the words of eternal life.' ⁸⁵ But this moral element was the very cliff on which Judas made shipwreck. ⁸⁶ After this, all was wrong, and increasingly so. ⁸⁷ We see disappointment in his face when not climbing the Mount of Transfiguration, and disappointment in the failure to heal the lunatick child. ⁸⁸ In the disputes by the way, in the quarrels who was greatest among them, in all the pettiness of misunderstandings and realistic folly of their questions or answers, we seem to hear the echo of his voice, to see the result of his influence, the leaven of his presence. ⁸⁹ And in it all we mark the downward hastening of his course, even to the moment when, in contrast to the deep love of a Mary, he first stands before us unmasked, as heartless, hypocritical, full of hatred—disappointed ambition having broken down into selfishness, and selfishness slid into covetousness, even to the crime of stealing that which was destined for the poor.

⁹⁰ For, when an ambition which rests only on selfishness gives way,

there lies close by it the coarse lust of covetousness, as the kindred passion and lower expression of that other form of selfishness.⁹¹ When the Messianic faith of Judas gave place to utter disappointment, the moral and spiritual character of Christ's Teaching would affect him, not sympathetically but antipathetically.⁹² Thus, that which should have opened the door of his heart, only closed and double-barred it.⁹³ His attachment to the Person of Jesus would give place to actual hatred, though only of a temporary character; and the wild intensity of his Eastern nature would set it all in flame.⁹⁴ Thus, when Judas had lost his slender foothold, or, rather, when it had slipped from under him, he fell down, down the eternal abyss.⁹⁵ The only hold to which he could cling was the passion of his soul.⁹⁶ As he laid hands on it, it gave way, and fell with him into fathomless depths.⁹⁷ We, each of us, have also some master-passion; and if, which God forbid! we should lose our foothold, we also would grasp this master-passion, and it would give way, and carry us with it into the eternal dark and deep.

⁹⁸ On that spring day, in the restfulness of Bethany, when the Master was taking His sad and solemn Farewell of sky and earth, of friends and disciples, and told them what was to happen only two days later at the Passover, it was all settled in the soul of Judas. 'Satan entered' it.⁹⁹ Christ would be crucified; this was quite certain.¹⁰⁰ In the general cataclysm let Judas have at least something.¹⁰¹ And so, on that sunny afternoon, he left them out there, to seek speech of them that were gathered, not in their ordinary meeting-place, but in the High-Priest's Palace.¹⁰² Even this indicates that it was an informal meeting, consultative rather than judicial.¹⁰³ For, it was one of the principles of Jewish Law that, in criminal cases, sentence must be spoken in the regular meeting-place of the Sanhedrin.^a The same inference is conveyed by the circumstance, that the captain of the Temple-guard and his immediate subordinates seem to have been taken into the council,^b no doubt to concert the measures for the actual arrest of Jesus. There had previously been a similar gathering and consultation, when the report of the raising of Lazarus reached the authorities of Jerusalem.^c The practical resolution adopted at that meeting had apparently been, that a strict watch should henceforth be kept on Christ's movements, and that every one of them, as well as the names of His friends, and the places of His secret retirement, should be communicated to the authorities, with the view to His arrest at the proper moment.^d

It was probably in professed obedience to this direction, that the traitor presented himself that afternoon in the Palace of the High-

^a Ab. Zar. 8 b. line before last

^b St. Luke xii. 4

^c St. John xi. 47, 48

^d St. John xi. 57

APPENDIX D - Chapter 83

Introduction to Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III
Chapter XV

The Spirit of Prophecy account of the walk to Emmaus is nearly the same length in number of sentences as the narrative of that event given in The Desire of Ages, published 20 years later. A good half of those sentences contributed to the DA account. The reader will also note that the same two sources, Hanna and March, furnish parallels for both.

¹ON this same day Jesus met several of his disciples, and greeted them with "All hail," upon which they approached him and held him by the feet and worshiped him. ²He permitted this homage, for he had then ascended to his Father, and had received his approval, and the worship of the holy angels. ³Late in the afternoon of the same day, two of the disciples were on their way to Emmaus, eight miles from Jerusalem. ⁴They had come to the city to keep the passover, and the news of the morning in regard to the removal of the body of Jesus from the sepulcher had greatly perplexed them. ⁵This perplexity had been increased by the reports of the women concerning the heavenly messengers, and the appearance of Jesus himself. ⁶They were now returning to their home to meditate and pray, in hope of gaining some light in reference to these matters which so confused their understanding.

⁷These two disciples had not held a prominent position beside Jesus in his ministry, but they were earnest believers in him. ⁸Soon after they began their journey, they observed a stranger coming up behind them, who presently joined their company; but they were so busy with perplexing thoughts, which they were communicating to each other, that they scarcely noticed they were not alone. ⁹Those strong men were so burdened with grief that they wept

Jesus at Emmaus

as they traveled on. ¹⁰Christ's pitying heart of love saw here a sorrow which he could relieve. ¹¹The disciples were reasoning with each other concerning the events of the past few days, and marveling how the fact of Jesus yielding himself up to a shameful death could be reconciled with his claims as the Son of God.

¹²One maintained that he could be no pretender, but had been himself deceived in regard to his mission and his future glory. ¹³They both feared that what his enemies had flung in his teeth was too true--"He saved others; himself he cannot save." ¹⁴Yet they wondered how he could be so mistaken in himself, when he had given them such repeated evidence that he could read the hearts of others. ¹⁵And the strange reports of the women threw them into still greater uncertainty.

¹⁶Long might these disciples have perplexed themselves over the mysteries of the past few days, if they had not received enlightenment from Jesus. ¹⁷He, disguised as a stranger, entered into conversation with them. ¹⁸"But their eyes were holden that they should not know him. ¹⁹And he said unto them, What manner of communications are these that ye have one to another, as ye walk, and are sad? ²⁰And the one of them whose name was Cleopas, answering said unto him, Art thou only a stranger in Jerusalem, and hast not known the things which are come to pass there in these days? ²¹And he said unto them, What things? ²²And they said unto him, Concerning Jesus of Nazareth, which was a prophet

Jesus at Emmaus

mighty in deed and word before God and all the people."

²³They then recounted to him the facts of the trial and crucifixion of their Master, together with the testimony of the women in regard to the removal of his body, the vision of angels which they had seen, the news of the resurrection, and the report of those disciples who had gone to the sepulcher. ²⁴"Then he said unto them, O fools, and slow of heart to believe all that the prophets have spoken; ought not Christ to have suffered these things, and to enter into his glory? ²⁵And beginning at Moses and all the prophets, he expounded unto them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself."

²⁶The disciples were silent from amazement and delight. ²⁷They did not venture to ask the stranger who he was. ²⁸They listened to him intently, charmed by his intelligence, and drawn toward him by his gracious words and manner, as he opened the Scriptures to their understanding, showing them from prophecy how Christ must suffer, and after suffering enter into his glory.

²⁹Jesus began with the first book written by Moses, and traced down through all the prophets the inspired proof in regard to his life, his mission, his suffering, death, and resurrection. ³⁰He did not deem it necessary to work a miracle to evidence that he was the risen Redeemer of the world; but he went back to the prophecies, and gave a full and clear explanation of them to settle the question of his identity, and the fact that all which had occurred to him

Jesus at Emmaus

was foretold by the inspired writers. ³¹Jesus ever carried the minds of his hearers back to the precious mine of truth found in the Old-Testament Scriptures. ³²The esteem in which he held those sacred records is exemplified in the parable of the rich man and Lazarus, where he says, "If they hear not Moses and the prophets, neither will they be persuaded though one rose from the dead." ³³The apostles also all testify to the importance of the Old-Testament Scriptures. ³⁴Peter says: "For the prophecy came not in old time by the will of man; but holy men of God spake as they were moved by the Holy Ghost." ³⁵Luke thus speaks of the prophets who predicted the coming of Christ: "Blessed be the Lord God of Israel; for he hath visited and redeemed his people; and hath raised up a horn of salvation for us in the house of his servant David, as he spake by the mouth of his holy prophets, which have been since the world began."

³⁶It is the voice of Christ that speaks through the prophets and patriarchs, from the days of Adam even down to the closing scenes of time. ³⁷This truth was not discerned by the Jews who rejected Jesus, and it is not discerned by many professing Christians to-day. ³⁸A beautiful harmony runs through the Old and New Testaments; passages which may seem dark at a first reading, present clear interpretations when diligently studied, and compared with other scripture referring to the same subject. ³⁹A careful search of the prophecies would have so enlightened the understanding of the Jews that they would have recognized Jesus as the

Jesus at Emmaus

predicted Messiah. ⁴⁰But they had interpreted those predictions to meet their own perverted ideas and ambitious aspirations.

⁴¹The disciples had been confused by the interpretations and traditions of the priests, and hence their darkness and unbelief in regard to the trial, death, and resurrection of their Master. ⁴²These misinterpreted prophecies were now made plain to the understanding of the two disciples, by Him who, through his Holy Spirit, inspired men to write them. ⁴³Jesus showed his disciples that every specification of prophecy regarding Messiah had found an exact fulfillment in the life and death of their Master. ⁴⁴He addressed them as a stranger, and as one who was astonished that they had not interpreted the Scriptures correctly, which would have relieved them from all their difficulties.

⁴⁵Although Jesus had previously taught them in regard to the prophecies, yet they had been unable to entirely relinquish the idea of the temporal kingdom of Christ at his first coming. ⁴⁶Their preconceived views led them to look upon his crucifixion as the final destruction of all their hopes. ⁴⁷But when, in the midst of their discouragement, they were shown that the very things which had caused them to despair formed the climax of proof that their belief had been correct, their faith returned with increased strength. ⁴⁸They now comprehended many things which their Master had said before his trial, and which they could not at that time

Jesus at Emmaus

understand. ⁴⁹Everything was clear and plain to their minds. ⁵⁰In the life and death of Jesus they saw the fulfillment of prophecy, and their hearts burned with love for their Saviour.

⁵¹Many professed Christians throw aside the Old Testament, and shut themselves up to the New. ⁵²The cry now is, "Away with the law and the prophets, and give us the gospel of Christ." ⁵³If the life of Christ and the teachings of the New-Testament Scriptures were all that was necessary to establish belief, why did not Jesus upon this occasion merely refer to the doctrines he had taught, the wisdom and purity of his character, and the miracles he had performed, as sufficient evidence of his Messiahship?

⁵⁴The history of the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus, as that of the Son of God, cannot be fully demonstrated without the evidence contained in the Old Testament. ⁵⁵Christ is revealed in the Old Testament as clearly as in the New. ⁵⁶The one testifies of a Saviour to come, while the other testifies of a Saviour that has come in the manner predicted by the prophets. ⁵⁷In order to appreciate the plan of redemption, the Scripture of the Old Testament must be thoroughly understood. ⁵⁸It is the glorified light from the prophetic past that brings out the life of Christ and the teachings of the New Testament with clearness and beauty. ⁵⁹The miracles of Jesus are a proof of his divinity; but the strongest proofs that he is the world's Redeemer are found in the prophecies of the Old

Jesus at Emmaus

Testament compared with the history of the New. ⁶⁰Jesus said to the Jews "Search the Scriptures; for in them ye think ye have eternal life, and they are they which testify of me." ⁶¹At that time there was no other scripture in existence save that of the Old Testament; so the injunction of the Saviour is plain.

⁶²As the disciples walked on with Jesus, listening intently to his gracious words, nothing in his bearing suggested to them that they were listening to other than a casual pilgrim, returning from the feast, but one who thoroughly understood the prophecies. ⁶³He walked as carefully as they over the rough stones, halting with them for a little rest after climbing some unusually steep place. ⁶⁴Thus the two disciples made their way along the mountainous road in company with the divine Saviour, who could say, "All power is given unto me in Heaven and on earth."

⁶⁵This mighty conqueror of death, who had reached to the very depths of human misery to rescue a lost world, assumed the humble task of walking with the two disciples to Emmaus, to teach and comfort them. ⁶⁶Thus he ever identifies himself with his suffering and perplexed people. ⁶⁷In our hardest and most trying paths, lo, Jesus is with us to smooth the way. ⁶⁸He is the same Son of man, with the same sympathies and love which he had before he passed through the tomb and ascended to his Father.

⁶⁹At length, as the sun was going down, the disciples

Jesus at Emmaus

with their companion arrived at their home. ⁷⁰The way had never before seemed so short to them, nor had time ever passed so quickly. ⁷¹The stranger made no sign of halting; but the disciples could not endure the thought of parting so soon from one who had inspired their hearts with new hope and joy, and they urged him to remain with them over night. ⁷²Jesus did not at once yield to their invitation, but seemed disposed to pursue his journey. ⁷³Thereupon the disciples, in their affection for the stranger, importuned him earnestly to tarry with them, urging as a reason that "the day was far spent." ⁷⁴Jesus yielded to their entreaties and entered their humble abode.

⁷⁵The Saviour never forces his presence upon us. ⁷⁶He seeks the company of those whom he knows need his care, and gives them an opportunity to urge his continuance with them. ⁷⁷If they, with longing desire, entreat him to abide with them he will enter the humblest homes, and brighten the lowliest hearts. ⁷⁸While waiting for the evening meal, Jesus continued to open the Scriptures to his hosts, bringing forward the evidence of his divinity, and unfolding to them the plan of salvation. ⁷⁹The simple fare was soon ready, and the three took their position at the table, Jesus taking his place at the head as was his custom.

⁸⁰The duty of asking a blessing upon the food usually devolved upon the head of the family; but Jesus placed his hands upon the bread and blessed it. ⁸¹At the first word of his petition the disciples looked up in amazement. ⁸²Surely

Jesus at Emmaus

none other than their Lord had ever done in this manner. ⁸³His voice strikes upon their ear as the voice of their Master, and, behold, there are the wounds in his hand! ⁸⁴It is indeed the well-known form of the beloved Master! ⁸⁵For a moment they are spell-bound; then they arise to fall at his feet and worship him; but he suddenly disappears from their midst.

⁸⁶Now they know that they have been walking and talking with the risen Redeemer. ⁸⁷Their eyes had been clouded so that they had not before discerned him, although the truths he uttered had sunk deep in their discouraged hearts. ⁸⁸He who had endured the conflict of the garden, the shame of the cross, and who had gained the victory over death and the tomb--He, before whom angels had fallen prostrate, worshiping with thanksgiving and praise, had sought the two lonely and desponding disciples, and been in their presence for hours, teaching and comforting them, yet they had not known him.

⁸⁹Jesus did not first reveal himself in his true character to them, and then open the Scriptures to their minds; for he knew that they would be so overjoyed to see him again, risen from the dead, that their souls would be satisfied. ⁹⁰They would not hunger for the sacred truths which he wished to indelibly impress upon their minds, that they might impart them to others, who should in their turn spread the precious knowledge, until thousands of people should receive the light given that day to the despairing

Jesus at Emmaus

disciples as they journeyed to Emmaus.

⁹¹He maintained his disguise till he had interpreted the Scriptures, and had led them to an intelligent faith in his life, his character, his mission to earth, and his death and resurrection. ⁹²He wished the truth to take firm root in their minds, not because it was supported by his personal testimony, but because the typical law, and the prophets of the Old Testament, agreeing with the facts of his life and death, presented unquestionable evidence of that truth. ⁹³When the object of his labors with the two disciples was gained, he revealed himself to them that their joy might be full, and then vanished from their sight.

⁹⁴When these disciples left Jerusalem, to return to their homes, they intended to take up their old employment again, and conceal their blighted hopes as best they could. ⁹⁵But now their joy exceeded their former despair. ⁹⁶"And they said one to another, Did not our heart burn within us, while he talked with us by the way, and while he opened to us the Scriptures?"

⁹⁷They forgot their hunger and fatigue, and left the prepared repast, for they could not tarry in their homes and hold their newly found knowledge from the other disciples. ⁹⁸They longed to impart their own joy to their companions, that they might rejoice together in a living Saviour risen from the dead. ⁹⁹Late as it was, they set about retracing their way to Jerusalem; but how different were their feelings now from those which depressed them when they set

Jesus at Emmaus

out upon their way to Emmaus. ¹⁰⁰Jesus was by their side, but they knew it not. ¹⁰¹He heard with gladness their expressions of joy and gratitude as they talked with each other by the way.

¹⁰²They were too happy to notice the difficulties of the rough, uncertain road. ¹⁰³There was no moon to light them, but their hearts were light with the joy of a new revelation. ¹⁰⁴They picked their way over the rough stones, and the dangerous ledges, sometimes stumbling and falling in their haste. ¹⁰⁵But not at all disconcerted by this, they pressed resolutely on. ¹⁰⁶Occasionally they lost their path in the darkness, and were obliged to retrace their steps until they found the track, when they renewed their journey with fresh speed. ¹⁰⁷They longed to deliver their precious message to their friends. ¹⁰⁸Never before had human lips such tidings to proclaim; for the fact of Christ's resurrection was to be the great truth around which all the faith and hope of the church would center.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 83

Introduction to Signs of the Times January
1888

A next periodical article which deserves attention for its contributions to DA chapter 83 (as well as to chapter 84) is the one dated January 20, 1888, and entitled, "Know the Reason of Your Hope." The first 72 sentences, less three, apply to DA chapter 83. Because the three sentences of paragraph one of the Signs article do not correspond, we inadvertently left them out of the sentence-numbering process. This should be kept in mind when any comparisons are made.

The Signs of the Times.

VOLUME 14.

OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA, SIXTH-DAY, JANUARY 20, 1888.

KNOW THE REASON OF YOUR HOPE.

BY MRS. E. G. WHITE.

"But sanctify the Lord God in your hearts; and be ready always to give an answer to every man that asketh you a reason of the hope that is in you with meekness and fear."

¹ THIS exhortation is addressed to the children of God. ² The Scriptures are they which testify of our hope, and it is necessary for us to search them diligently, that we may be ready to give an intelligent and well-grounded reason for our faith. ³ This is the duty enjoined upon us by Him who gave his life to redeem man.

⁴ After the crucifixion of Christ two disciples were journeying toward Emmaus. ⁵ Their hearts were burdened with grief and doubt.

⁶ Their way lay over a bleak, barren plain, broken by rugged ridges and dangerous steepes.

⁷ The ground was cracked and parched, and loose stones strewed the path.

⁸ As they ascended the ridge a stranger joined them; but they were so engrossed in reviewing the mournful events of the passover week that they did not notice his presence. ⁹ The stranger gently accosted them; but their eyes were holden, and they did not recognize their divine Master. ¹⁰ And he asked, "What manner of communications are these that ye have one to another, as ye walk, and are sad?"

¹¹ And the one of them, whose name was Cleopas, answering said unto him, Art thou only a stranger in Jerusalem, and hast not known the things which are come to pass there in these days? ¹² And he said unto them, What things? ¹³ And they said unto him, Concerning Jesus of Nazareth, which was a prophet mighty in deed and word before God and all the people; and how the chief priests and our rulers delivered him to be condemned to death, and have crucified him. ¹⁴ But we trusted that it had been he which should have redeemed Israel. ¹⁵ And beside all this, to-day is the third day since these things were done.

¹⁶ Yea, and certain women also of our company made us astonished, which were early at the sepulcher; and when they found not his body, they came, saying, that they had also seen a vision of angels, which said that he was alive. . . . ¹⁷ Then he said unto them, O fools, and slow of heart to believe all that the prophets have spoken. ¹⁸ Ought not Christ to have suffered these things, and to enter into his glory? ¹⁹ And beginning at Moses and all the prophets, he expounded unto them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself.

²⁰ Had not the disciples heard this very exposition of these scriptures from their Master's lips while he was with them? ²¹ But how little had they comprehended them! ²² How forcible is their meaning now! ²³ How startling their fulfillment! ²⁴ The truths they had but dimly discerned now stand revealed in a blaze of light. ²⁵ The very things he had told them have been accomplished. ²⁶ Faith begins to revive. ²⁷ Their hearts beat with a strong and renewed hope as they listen eagerly to the plain, simple words of their unknown fellow-traveler. ²⁸ They are surprised to find their burdened hearts becoming light; and as they think of Jesus, of all he was to them, of

all he suffered, their tears flow freely. ²⁹ Their confidence had not been misplaced. ³⁰ He was all and even more than they had believed.

³¹ If these men had had no reason of their hope within them, their hearts would not have responded to the world's Redeemer as he strove to fasten their trembling faith upon the testimony of the prophets concerning himself. ³² As it was, the evidences of the truth needed only to be revived in their minds. ³³ The very clouds that darkened their faith grew luminous with assurance as they saw the harmony of prophecy and its fulfillment. ³⁴ As the mists began to lift, the betrayal, trial, and crucifixion stood like great way-marks promising the fulfillment of the word

of God, witnessing to his providences, and telling the story of the unutterable love and truth of their Saviour. ³⁵Again their feet stood firm on the sure foundation.

³⁶There will be chapters of a similar character in the experience of every follower of Christ. ³⁷Faith will be tested, and for a time its brightness will be dimmed; but those who sincerely love God will not be left to be overwhelmed. ³⁸Jesus comes to their side. ³⁹He speaks to them. ⁴⁰He encourages them. ⁴¹It may be through some humble agent; but he surely ministers unto them.

⁴²The divine Son of God, the resurrected Saviour, who walked with the sorrowing disciples up and down the steeps that intercepted the journey to Emmaus, is our compassionate Saviour. ⁴³He knows whose hearts are burdened with sorrows and disappointed hopes. ⁴⁴He is at our right hand to interest himself in all our sorrows and to soothe our griefs. ⁴⁵He presses close to the believing mourner who yearns for his presence; but he never forces his company upon any.

⁴⁶These two disciples saw in Jesus not only a stranger but one who had been acquainted with their beloved Master, and as such he was endeared to them. ⁴⁷The sun sinks behind the hills and they near their destination.

⁴⁸They cannot endure the thought of separation. ⁴⁹As the stranger seems about to leave them they urge the request, "Abide with us, for it is toward evening, and the day is far spent."

⁵⁰The three weary travelers had walked together. ⁵¹The Son of God was one with them. ⁵²He had labored up the toilsome steeps; he

had moved with equal caution down the precipitous path, and there was nothing in his dress or his manner to lead the disciples to suspect that he was any other than one of the many pilgrims returning from the great feast.

⁵³He enters the lowly home, and is seated before the humble board. ⁵⁴While the meal is preparing, words that stir and warm the heart flow from his lips. ⁵⁵He puts forth his hands to bless the bread. ⁵⁶The eyes of the disciples are riveted on them. ⁵⁷They see the print of the nails. ⁵⁸They recognize his voice. ⁵⁹The

words, the tone, the manner, are all familiar. ⁶⁰It is the Master himself. ⁶¹He whom they had placed in Joseph's new tomb lives before them. ⁶²They had walked with their risen Saviour from Jerusalem to Emmaus. ⁶³Oh! why had they not known him? ⁶⁴Their unbelief had hidden Jesus from their view. ⁶⁵They rise in great haste and fall at his feet to express their joy; but he is gone.

⁶⁶The disciples had thought themselves weary; but now their vigor is renewed. ⁶⁷Discouragement is gone. ⁶⁸They stop not for food, nor feel they the need of it, but hasten to retrace their steps over the rough path so lately trodden with Jesus. ⁶⁹They have a message of joy to carry to their mourning brethren. ⁷⁰They have seen and talked with Jesus. ⁷¹He has risen from the dead. ⁷²Their hearts are all light, and joy, and peace.

⁷³They urge their way through the darkened streets, and climb to the upper chamber. ⁷⁴All is silent within; but finally, to their continued knocking, they hear the slipping of the bolts. ⁷⁵The door is cautiously opened, and carefully barred after them. ⁷⁶Scarcely had they finished relating the marvelous story of the walk to Emmaus to the incredulous disciples, when they behold with amazement another in their midst. ⁷⁷It is Jesus. ⁷⁸The bars and bolts have not been withdrawn. ⁷⁹They have heard no footstep, and they are terrified. ⁸⁰Their amazement deepens as they hear his voice, saying, "Peace be unto you," and continuing to reassure the terrified disciples: "Why are ye troubled? and why do thoughts arise in your hearts? ⁸¹Behold my hands and my feet, that it is I myself; handle me, and see; for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see me have." ⁸²And while they yet believed not for joy, and wondered, he said unto them, Have ye here any meat? ⁸³And they gave him a piece of a broiled fish, and of a honeycomb. ⁸⁴And he took it, and did eat before them. ⁸⁵And he said unto them, These are the words which I spake unto you, while I was yet with you, that all things must be fulfilled, which were written in the law of Moses, and in the prophets, and in the psalms, concerning me. ⁸⁶Then opened he their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures, and said unto them,

Jan. 20. 1888

THE SIGNS OF THE TIMES.

Thus it is written, and thus it behooved Christ to suffer, and to rise from the dead the third day; and that repentance and remission of sins should be preached in his name among all nations, beginning at Jerusalem.

⁸⁷And ye are witnesses of these things."

⁸⁸The duty of the disciple of Christ is revealed in these words. ⁸⁹To preach to all na-

tions repentance and remission of sins; to present Jesus as the sin-pardoning Redeemer.

⁹⁰The hearts of sinners must be melted into contrition, before God will hear their prayer.

⁹¹When the soul is emptied of its defilement, Jesus will take possession, and pardon and peace that floweth like a river will be enjoyed.

⁹²The followers of Christ will have trials and conflicts while on earth, but we have a sure refuge in every storm. ⁹³Jesus has told us, "In the world ye shall have tribulation, but be of good cheer; I have overcome the world."

⁹⁴The forces of Satan are marshaled against us.

⁹⁵He is a diligent foe, but in following the warning of Christ we shall find safety. ⁹⁶"Watch and pray, lest ye enter into temptation."

⁹⁷There are foes to be resisted and overcome, but Jesus is by our side, ready to strengthen for every effort and brace for duty.

⁹⁸We have a great work to do to be witnesses to the fulfillment of God's word; and to "be ready always to give an answer to every man that asketh us a reason of the hope that is in us," will require a thorough knowledge of the Scriptures. ⁹⁹We need in these times of peace to become familiar with the prophecies that foretell the events to take place in our time, that, like the disciples, our minds will need only to be refreshed to become encouraged, and that the very trial which seems to confuse us may become a tower of strength, and an evidence that God is fulfilling the sure word of prophecy.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 83

Introduction to Manuscript 113 1897

Apparently the basic text behind DA chapter 83 is Manuscript 113, 1897. That is, with the exception of five introductory sentences of the DA text, about 16 sentences in another section, (and there are a few transitions) the text of the DA is derived from the former. This means that the first five sentences of DA chapter 83 are drawn directly from 3SP, page 206, sentences 3-6, and the DA sentences 33-47, page 796, also come from 3SP, but otherwise the rest of the sentences in Chapter 83 find their most direct source in MS 113,--thus illustrating some steps in the textual tradition. Only the first 111 sentences of Manuscript 113 apply to DA chapter 83; the rest of the sentences provide the essential text for the first part of DA chapter 84.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 83

MS 113, 1897

The Walk to Emmaus

¹On the first day of the week after Christ's crucifixion, the disciples had everything to fill their hearts with rejoicing. ²But this day was not to all a day of joy. ³To some it was a day of uncertainty, confusion, and perplexity. ⁴The apparent unbelief of the disciples in the testimony of the women gives evidence of how low their faith had sunk. ⁵The women brought tidings that a vision of angels had appeared to them, and had positively affirmed that Christ had risen from the dead, and that they themselves had seen Jesus alive in the garden. ⁶But still the disciples seemed unbelieving. ⁷Their hopes had died with Christ. ⁸And when the news of his resurrection was brought to them, it was so different from what they had anticipated, that they could not believe it. ⁹It was too good to be true, they thought. ¹⁰They had heard so much of the doctrines and the so-called scientific theories of the Sadducees that the impression made on their minds in regard to the resurrection was vague. ¹¹They scarcely knew what the resurrection of the dead could mean. ¹²They were unable to take in the great subject.

¹³From eye witnesses some of the disciples had obtained quite a full account of the events of Friday. ¹⁴Others beheld the scenes of the crucifixion with their own eyes. ¹⁵In the afternoon of the first day of the week, two of the disciples, restless and unhappy, decided to return to their

The Walk to Emmaus

home in Emmaus, a village about eight miles from Jerusalem.
¹⁶Sad, discouraged, and hopeless, they pursued their evening walk, talking over the scenes of the trial and the crucifixion. ¹⁷Their voices were full of mournful weeping. ¹⁸Never had they been so utterly discouraged. ¹⁹Hopeless and faithless, they were walking in the shadow of the cross. ²⁰They were filled with gloomy forebodings for the future.

²¹They had not advanced far on their journey when they were joined by a stranger. ²²But they were so absorbed in their gloom and disappointment that they did not observe him closely. ²³They continued their conversation, expressing the thoughts of their hearts. ²⁴They were reasoning in regard to the lessons that Christ had given, which they seemed unable to comprehend. ²⁵As they talked of the events that had taken place, Jesus longed to comfort them. ²⁶He had seen their grief, and understood the conflicting, perplexing ideas that brought to their minds the thought, Can this man, who suffered himself to be so humiliated and so cruelly treated be the Christ? ²⁷Their grief could not be restrained, and they wept. ²⁸Jesus knew that their hearts were bound up with him in love, and he longed to take them in his arms and wipe away their tears, and put joy and gladness in their hearts. ²⁹But he must first give them lessons that they would never forget.

³⁰"He said unto them, What manner of communications are these that ye have with one another, as ye walk, and are sad? ³¹And one of them, whose name was Cleophas [sic],

The Walk to Emmaus

answering said unto him, Art thou a stranger in Jerusalem, and hast not known the things which are come to pass in these days [sic]?" ³²They told him of their disappointment in regard to their Master, "how the chief priests and our rulers delivered him to be condemned to death, and have crucified him." ³³With hearts sore with disappointment, and with quivering lips, they said, "We trusted that it had been he which should have redeemed Israel, and besides all this, to-day is the third day since these things were done."

³⁴Why did not the disciples remember Christ's words, and realise [sic] that events were to be as they had been. ³⁵Why did not they realise [sic] that the last part of his disclosure would be just as verily fulfilled as the first part, that the third day he would rise again. ³⁶This was the part they should have remembered. ³⁷The priests and rulers did not forget this. ³⁸The day that followed the day of preparation, the chief priests and Pharisees came together unto Pilate, saying, Sir, we remember that that deceiver said, while he was yet alive, After three days I will rise again." ³⁹Why did not the disciples remember these words?

⁴⁰Then said he unto them, O fools, and slow of heart to believe all that the prophets have spoken. ⁴¹Ought not Christ to have suffered these things, and to enter into his glory?" ⁴²The disciples wondered what this stranger could know that he should penetrate to their very souls, and speak with such earnestness, tenderness, sympathy, and with such

The Walk to Emmaus

hopefulness. ⁴³For the first time since Christ's betrayal in the garden, they began to feel hopeful. ⁴⁴Often they looked earnestly at their companion, and thought that his words were just the words that Christ would have spoken. ⁴⁵They were filled with amazement, and their hearts began to throb with expectation, hope and joy.

⁴⁶Beginning at Moses, the very Alpha of history concerning himself, Christ expounded unto them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself." ⁴⁷There are many who discount Old Testament history. ⁴⁸They advocate the idea that the New Testament takes the place of the Old, and that therefore the Old Testament is no longer of any use. ⁴⁹But Christ's first work with his disciples was to begin at the Alpha of the Old Testament to prove that he was to come to this world, and pass through the experiences that had taken place in his incarnation. ⁵⁰The rejection of the Son of God was plainly seen by the prophets.

⁵¹Christ gave his disciples a correct idea of what he was to be in humanity. ⁵²The idea of a Messiah that was to take his throne and kingly power in accordance with the ideas of men, had been misleading, and would interfere with a correct apprehension of his descent from the high to the lowest position that could be occupied. ⁵³Christ would have the ideas of his disciples pure and true in every specification. ⁵⁴They must understand as far as possible in regard to the cup of suffering that was apportioned to him. ⁵⁵He showed them that the awful conflict that they could not

The Walk to Emmaus

yet understand, but that they should understand, was the fulfilment of the covenant made before the foundation of the world was laid. ⁵⁶Christ must die as every transgressor of the law will die if he continues in sin. ⁵⁷All this should be, but it would not end in defeat, but in glorious, eternal victory. ⁵⁸He told them that every effort must be made to save a world from sin. ⁵⁹His followers must live as he lived, and work as he worked, with intense, persevering effort.

⁶⁰Thus Christ discoursed with his disciples, opening their minds that they might discern the Scriptures. ⁶¹The disciples were weary, but the conversation did not flag. ⁶²Words of life and assurance fell from the Saviour's lips. ⁶³But still their eyes were holden. ⁶⁴As he told them of the overthrow of Jerusalem, they looked upon the doomed city with weeping. ⁶⁵But little did they know what was to come upon that impenitent city. ⁶⁶They did not suspect who their travelling [sic] companion was. ⁶⁷They did not think that the subject of their conversation was walking by their side; for Christ referred to himself as though he were another person. ⁶⁸They thought that he was one of those who had been in attendance at the great feast, and who was now returning to his home. ⁶⁹Thus they proceeded, making their way over the rough places in the road, while the One who was soon to take his position at the right hand of God, and who could say, "All power is given unto me in heaven and in earth," walked beside them.

The Walk to Emmaus

⁷⁰During the journey the sun had gone down, and before the travellers [sic] reached their place of rest, the laborers in the fields had left their work. ⁷¹As the disciples were about to enter their house, the stranger appeared as though he would continue his journey. ⁷²But the disciples felt drawn to him. ⁷³Their souls hungered to hear more from him. ⁷⁴"Abide with us," they said; "for it is toward evening, and the day is far spent." ⁷⁵Christ responded to the invitation without making any excuses. ⁷⁶"He went in to tarry with them."

⁷⁷Had the disciples failed on this occasion to press their invitation, they would not have known that their travelling [sic] companion was no other than the risen Lord. ⁷⁸Christ never forces his company upon any one. ⁷⁹He interests himself in those who he knows need him. ⁸⁰But if they pass along, indifferent and careless, never thinking of the heavenly guest, or asking him to abide with them, he passes on. ⁸¹Thus many meet with great loss. ⁸²They do not know Christ any more than did the disciples as he walked and talked with them by the way.

⁸³The simple evening meal of bread is prepared. ⁸⁴It is placed before the guest, and he puts forth his hands to bless the food. ⁸⁵Why do the disciples start back in astonishment. [sic] ⁸⁶Their companion spreads forth his hands in exactly the same way as their Master used to do. ⁸⁷They look again, and lo, they see in his hands the print of nails. ⁸⁸Both exclaim at once, It is the Lord Jesus.

The Walk to Emmaus

⁸⁹He has risen from the dead.

⁹⁰They rise to cast themselves at his feet and worship him. ⁹¹But he has vanished out of their sight. ⁹²They look at the space which had been occupied by One whose body had lately lain in the grave, and say to each other, "Did not our hearts burn within us while he talked with us by the way, and opened to us the Scriptures?"

⁹³But they cannot sit and talk with this great news to communicate. ⁹⁴Their weariness and hunger has [sic] gone, and full of joy, they immediately set out again on the same path by which they came, hurrying to tell the tidings to his disciples in the city. ⁹⁵The moon has set, but the Sun of Righteousness has shone upon them. ⁹⁶Their hearts leap for joy. ⁹⁷They seem to be in a new world. ⁹⁸Christ is a living Saviour. ⁹⁹They no longer mourn over him as dead, but rejoice over a living Redeemer. ¹⁰⁰Christ is risen, they repeat over and over again. ¹⁰¹This is the message they are carrying to the sorrowing ones. ¹⁰²They must tell them the wonderful story of the walk to Emmaus. ¹⁰³They must tell who had joined them by the way. ¹⁰⁴They carried the greatest message ever given to the world, a message of glad tidings upon which the hopes of the human family for time and eternity hang. ¹⁰⁵Christ has risen from the dead. ¹⁰⁶He who is the antitype of the sheaf of the first fruits which was waved before the Lord, has come forth from the dead.

¹⁰⁷In some parts the road was not safe or secure, but

The Walk to Emmaus

they climbed over the steep places, slipping on the smooth rocks. ¹⁰⁸They did not know, they did not see that they had the protection of him who has just travelled [sic] the road with them. ¹⁰⁹With their pilgrim's staff in hand, they press on, desiring to go faster than they dare. ¹¹⁰They lose their track, but find it again. ¹¹¹Sometimes running, sometimes stumbling, they urge their way forward, their unseen companion close beside them.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 83

Introduction to Sources - Hanna & March

The two apparent sources for The Desire of Ages chapter 83 are The Life of Christ by William Hanna and Night Scenes in the Bible by Daniel March. The chapters from these two works which correspond to the Ellen White materials are here included.

Father up in heaven; still shall I feel to you and all the others as tenderly as I ever felt, not ashamed even to call them still my brethren. Touch me not, then, Mary; step not to lavish on me an affection that has in it too much of the human, too little of the divine; but go to my brethren, and say unto them, I ascend to my Father, and to your Father, and to my God and your God; my Father and my God, in a sense in which he is not and cannot be yours; but your Father and your God in a sense in which he could not have been yours had I not died and risen, and been on my way now to sit down with Him on the throne of glory in the heaven.'

III.

THE JOURNEY TO EMMANUS.*

It was towards evening; the day was far spent when the two disciples reached Emmaus; yet there was time enough for them, after they had dined, to return by daylight to Jerusalem, (a distance of about seven miles, a two or three hours' walk,) and to be present at that evening meeting, in the midst of which Jesus was seen by them once more. ¹It must have been between mid-day and sunset that the journey to Emmaus was taken. ²Of the two travellers, the name of one only has been preserved; that of Cleopas, generally believed to have been a near relation of Christ—the husband of the Virgin Mary's sister. ³It was not, however, the closeness of the relationship to Jesus which won for him the privilege of that strange conversation by the way. ⁴Had nearness of relationship had anything to do with the matter, there was one surely to whom, above all others, we might have expected that he would appear on the day of his resurrection. ⁵Yet neither on that day, nor on any of the forty days he spent on earth thereafter, does Jesus seem to have made any special manifestation of himself to his mother, or indeed to have taken any individual notice of her whatever. ⁶Her name does not once occur in the record of this period of our Redeemer's life. ⁷It looks as if with that kindly, son-like notice of her from the cross, Jesus had dropped the recognition of the earthly relationship altogether, as one not suitable to be carried into that kingdom to whose throne he was about to ascend.

⁸And as it was nothing in their outward relationship to Jesus, so

* Luke 24: 13-33.

neither was it anything in the personal character, position, or services of these two men which drew down upon them this great favor from the Lord. ⁹They had occupied no prominent place beside the Saviour in the course of his ministry. ¹⁰They had exhibited no peculiar strength of attachment to him, or to his cause. ¹¹Had Peter and James and John been the travellers, it would not have been so remarkable that he should have given them so many of the hours of that first day of his resurrection life; more hours, in fact, than he ever gave to any two disciples besides; nay, so far as we can measure them, more hours than he gave to any other interview of that period—perhaps as many as were spent in all the other interviews together, for generally they were very brief. ¹²What was there in these two men to entitle them to such a distinction? ¹³They were not apostles, nor were they of any great note among the seventy. ¹⁴Our Lord's first words to them may perhaps help us to understand why it was that he joined himself to them. ¹⁵He has been walking beside them, so close as to overhear somewhat of their conversation. ¹⁶But they are so intent upon the topic which engrosses them, that they notice not that a stranger has overtaken them, and been in part a listener to their discourse. ¹⁷At last, in manner the easiest and most natural, least calculated to give offence, expressive at once of interest and sympathy, Jesus breaks in upon their discourse with the inquiry, "What manner of communications are these that ye have to one another, as ye walk and are sad?" ¹⁸That sadness, who can tell what power it had in drawing the Man of sorrows to their side? ¹⁹It was to Mary, weeping in her lonely grief; to Peter, drowned in tears of penitence—that he had already appeared. ²⁰And now it is to these two disciples in their sorrow that he joins himself: so early did the risen Saviour assume the gracious office of comforting those who mourn, of binding up the broken heart. ²¹But in Mary, Peter, and these two disciples, three different varieties of human grief were dealt with. ²²Mary's was the grief of a grateful and affectionate heart, mourning the loss of one beloved; Peter's was the grief of a spirit smitten with the sense of a great offence committed; the grief of the two disciples was that of men disappointed, perplexed, thrown into despondency and unbelief. ²³It is especially noticed that it was while they communed together, and reasoned with one another, that Jesus himself drew near to them. ²⁴There was much about which they well might differ and dispute. ²⁵The yielding of their Master to the power of his enemies, and his shameful crucifixion two days before—how could they reconcile with his undoubted pretensions and power, as a prophet so mighty in words and deeds? ²⁶This one, that other say-

ing of his, pointing to a future, never now, as they fancied, to be realized, what could they make of them? ²⁸ Had Jesus himself been disappointed, deceived; had he imagined that the people would rise on his behalf, and prevent his crucifixion? ²⁹ That might have been, had he not so often shown that he knew all that was passing in men's hearts. ³⁰ Could he, then, have been ignorant how the multitude of Jerusalem would feel and act? ³¹ There was truth, too, in what so many of them had flung reproachfully in his teeth, as he hung upon the cross: He had saved others, why did he not save himself? ³² What a confused heap of difficulties must have risen up before these two men's eyes as they reasoned by the way! ³³ And then besides, there was what they had heard just before they left the city—the report of some women that they had gone out, and found the sepulchre empty, and had seen angels, who had told them that he was alive. ³⁴ They, indeed, might easily have been deceived; but Peter and John had also gone out. ³⁵ It is true they had seen no angels, nor had any one, that they had heard of, seen the Lord himself. ³⁶ But the sepulchre had been found empty. ³⁷ The women were right so far; were they right also in what they said about the angel's message? ³⁸ Could Jesus actually be alive again? ³⁹ We wonder that these two men could have left the city at the time they did; we wonder at this perhaps the more because we know that, had they but waited an hour or two longer, they would have had all their doubts resolved. ⁴⁰ It is clear enough, however, that neither of them had any faith in the resurrection; and as clear that they were dissatisfied with their unbelief—altogether puzzled and perplexed. ⁴¹ Ignorant, they needed to be taught; deeply prejudiced, they needed to have their prejudices removed. ⁴² For hours and hours, for days and days, they might have remained together without clearing up the difficulties that beset them. ⁴³ But now, in pity and in love, the great Enlightener himself appears—appears in the garb of a stranger who joins them by the way. ⁴⁴ They do not at first, they do not at all through the earnest conversation which follows, recognize him.

⁴⁵ In reading the accounts of all the different appearances of Christ after his resurrection, the conviction seems forced upon us, that some alteration had taken place in the aspect of our Saviour, enough to create a momentary hesitation in recognizing him, yet not enough, after a closer inspection, to leave any doubt as to his identity. ⁴⁶ In the garden, Mary Magdalene was so absorbed in her sorrow, so utterly unprepared to meet the living Master—she looked so indirectly, with such a heedless glance at the stranger, whom she took to be the gardener—that we do not wonder at her failing to see at

first who he was. ⁴⁷ So soon, however, as her name was uttered, and she turned and fixed that steadier look upon the speaker, the recognition was complete. ⁴⁸ To the women by the way, to whom next he showed himself, his very salutation revealed him, and left them no room for doubting that it was he. ⁴⁹ They held him by the feet, too, for a moment or two, as they worshipped, and got the evidence of touch as well as sight to assure them of his bodily presence. ⁵⁰ That evening, in the upper chamber, the disciples were assembled. ⁵¹ They could not be taken by surprise. ⁵² They were prepared by the reports of Mary Magdalene, of the women, of Peter, of the two disciples from Emmaus, to believe that he was alive; yet when Jesus stood in the midst of them, they supposed that they had seen a spirit; so troubled were they at the sight, so incredulous were they even as they looked at him, that he had to say to them: "Why are ye troubled, and why do thoughts arise in your heart? ⁵³ Behold my hands and my feet, that it is I myself; handle me, and see, for a spirit hath not flesh and bones as ye see me have;" and still further, to remove all doubt, he asked that some meat should be presented, and he took the piece of the broiled fish and the honeycomb, and did eat them in their presence. ⁵⁴ It may have been the sudden apparition of Christ in the midst of them, while the doors of the chamber remained unopened, which, in part, begot the belief that it was a spirit that stood before them; but that there was something too in the changed appearance of their Master, which helped to sustain that belief, is evident, from what is told us of his next appearance by the lake side of Galilee. ⁵⁵ John's quick's eye and ear recognized him from the boat; but when they had all landed and gathered round him, "None of them," it is said, "durst ask him, Who art thou? knowing that it was the Lord." ⁵⁶ Whence the desire to put such a question, but from a passing shadowy doubt, and whence the doubt but from some change in his appearance? ⁵⁷ When afterwards, on the mountain which he had appointed, Jesus showed himself to above five hundred brethren at once, they saw him, and worshipped; but some, it is said, doubted—those, let us believe, who saw him then for the first and only time, and on whom the sight seems to have had the same effect that it had in the first instance on nearly all who witnessed it. ⁵⁸ It seems to us the best, if not the only way of accounting for this, to suppose that the resurrection body of our Lord had passed through a stage or two in its transition from the natural into the spiritual body; from its condition as nailed upon the cross, to its otherworldly and glorified condition as now upon the throne; the flesh and blood which cannot inherit the heavenly kingdom, still there, yet so modified as to

be more plastic under the power of the indwelling spirit, less subject to the material laws and conditions of its earlier being, the corruptible on its way to the incorruptible, the mortal putting on the clothing of immortality.⁵⁹ And that strange, half spiritual appearance which the risen Lord presented, may it not have served to further the great end that our Lord had in view throughout the forty days, namely, to wean the minds of his disciples from their earlier, lower, more human conceptions of him, to a true faith in his mingled humanity and divinity?

⁶⁰ There was, however, something special, I believe, in this instance of the two disciples travelling to Emmaus.⁶¹ They might not have recognized him, as, clothed perhaps in the garb of an ordinary traveller, he put his first questions to them by the way; but when he assumed the office of their instructor, and, showing such intimate acquaintance with the Scriptures, made their hearts burn within them, as he unfolded their new meaning, must they not many a time have turned on him a very searching look, wondering, as they looked, who this strange teacher possibly could be?⁶² Yet were two or three hours spent in that close and earnest conversation, without their once suspecting that it was the Lord.⁶³ How accurately does this accord with the differing statements of Mark and Luke!⁶⁴ Mark distinctly tells us that he appeared to them in another, in a strange form—a form different from that in which they had seen him previously.⁶⁵ He appeared to them, as to all the others, somewhat changed in aspect; but had that been all, they would speedily have recovered from their first surprise, and ere many minutes, would have identified him.⁶⁶ For a reason, however, hereafter to be alluded to, our Lord purposely concealed himself till his work of instruction was completed, and drew a veil of some kind over their eyes, which hindered their discovery of him by the way.

⁶⁷ He comes to them as an entire stranger, such as they might naturally have met upon the road; and it is as a stranger that throughout he converses with them.⁶⁸ "What manner of communications," he says, "are those that ye have one to another, as ye walk, and are sad?"⁶⁹ Little need, thought one of them (his own deep interest in them leading him, perhaps, to exaggerate that felt by the general community)—little need of asking such a question.⁷⁰ Of what could any two men leaving Jerusalem, only two days after that crucifixion had occurred—of what else than of it, and him the Crucified, could they be talking?⁷¹ "Art thou only," says Cleopas, "a stranger in Jerusalem, and hast not known the things which are come to pass there in these days?"⁷² And the stranger says to him, "What things?"

⁷³ Thus it is, by questions needless for him on his own account to put, but very useful to them to answer, that Jesus draws out from them that statement, which at once reveals the extent of their ignorance and incredulity, but, at the same time, the amount of their belief, the strength of their attachment to Christ, and the bitterness of that grief which the disappointment of their expectations regarding him had created.⁷⁴ A stranger though this man is to them, they do not hesitate to confess their faith in Jesus of Nazareth as a prophet mighty in words and deeds; obvious as they know the now haled sinner to be, they do not hesitate to acknowledge themselves openly as disciples of this persecuted and now crucified Nazarene, though the hope they once had, that he should have been the Redeemer of Israel, they must confess themselves to have relinquished.⁷⁵ Nay, so far has the kindly and sympathizing inquiry of this stranger won for him a way into their confidence, that, as if he must be interested in all that concerned the discipleship of Jesus, they tell him what certain women of their company, and certain others of themselves, had reported about the sepulchre.

⁷⁶ The stranger's end is gained.⁷⁷ The wound has been gently probed; its nature and extent revealed; and now the remedy is to be applied.⁷⁸ He who had asked to be informed, takes the place of the instructor; he who had been reproached for his ignorance, reproaches in his turn.⁷⁹ "O fools, and slow of heart to believe!"⁸⁰ Slow of heart indeed, and difficult to convince had they been, who, after such explicit declarations of his own beforehand, that he should be delivered up to the rulers, and suffer many things at their hands, and be crucified, and rise again the third day, had nevertheless remained so obstinate in their incredulity.⁸¹ Truly the rebuke was needed.⁸² Yet how faithful are the wounds of a friend; he wounds but to heal; he rebukes the unbelief, but instantly proceeds to remove its grounds, even as he rose from his slumber in the storm-tossed fishing-boat, first to rebuke the disciples for their unbelieving fears, and then to quiet the tempest which had produced them.⁸³ The one great, misleading prejudice of the disciples had been their belief that the path of the promised Messiah was only to be one of triumph and of glory.⁸⁴ To rectify that error, it was only required that they should be made to see that the predicted triumph and glory were alone to be reached through the dark avenues of suffering and of death.⁸⁵ "O fools, and slow of heart to believe all that the prophets have spoken: ought not Christ to have suffered these things, and to enter into his glory?"⁸⁶ And beginning at Moses and all the prophets, he expounded to them in all the Scriptures the things concerning himself.⁸⁷ Either Christ, then, is

not himself to be believed—in which case it were useless to hear and read anything about him—or in those Old Testament Scriptures there are to be seen everywhere prophetic fingers pointing forward to Him.

⁸⁸To search those Scriptures, and to find little or nothing there of Christ, little or nothing to show how it behoved him to suffer, and then to enter into his glory, is to handle them after a very different fashion from that in which they were handled by our Lord himself.

⁸⁹It is not likely that these three travellers had a copy of the Old Testament in their hands.⁹⁰ It was not by reference to chapter and verse, that the exposition of the Saviour was conducted; it was by no minute criticism of words and phrases, that the conviction of these wayfaring men was carried.⁹¹ They were familiar generally with the Scriptures.

⁹²One or two of the leading prophecies about the Messiah, such as that first one of God himself in paradise, as to the seed of the woman and the serpent; such as that of Moses as to the raising up of a prophet like unto himself; such as that of Isaiah, when he saw his glory, and testified beforehand of the sufferings by which that glory should be preceded and entered; such as that of Daniel about the Messiah being cut off, but not for himself—Jesus may have quoted.⁹³ But not alone from direct and specific prophecies—

from the paschal lamb, and the smitten rock, and the serpent of brass, and the blood-sprinkled mercy-seat, but from the whole history of the Jewish people—from the entire circle of types and ceremonies and sacrifices, did Jesus draw forth the materials of that wonderful exposition by which, for two hours or so, he kept those listening men hanging upon his lips.⁹⁴ As we think who the expounder in that instance was, and what the materials of his exposition, how natural the expression, Would that I had heard all these things concerning Christ illustrated by Christ himself!⁹⁵ But have we not the substance of that exposition, as much of it as is needful for us to have, preserved in the writings of the New Testament, and may we not be sure that if we believe not them, neither would we be persuaded though one rose from the dead, as Jesus that morning had done, and should teach us even as he taught those two disciples?

⁹⁶There was something indeed peculiarly, sublimely interesting in that two hours' walk and talk of these three men on the way to Emmaus.⁹⁷ Had you been on that road that day, had you met those travellers as they journeyed on, beyond the earnestness of their conversation with one another, you would have seen nothing remarkable about them, nothing to make you turn and look back upon them as they passed.⁹⁸ Two of them are men in humble attire, travelling in the humblest fashion, returning to one of the humblest village-houses:

and the third, there is nothing about him different in appearance from the other two; nothing to keep them from conversing with him as an equal, one with whom the most unrestrained familiarity might be used.⁹⁹ Yet who is He?¹⁰⁰ He who that very morning had burst the barriers of the grave; he in honor of whose exit from the tomb angels from heaven had been despatched to watch at the foot and at the head of the sacred spot, where in death his body had for a time reposed; he who was now upon his way to enter into that glory which he had with the Father before the world was—incarnate Deity fresh from the conflicts and the victories of the garden, the cross, the sepulchre.¹⁰¹ It is literally God walking with men, men walking, though they knew it not, with God.¹⁰² History tells us of earthly sovereigns stripping themselves at times of all the tokens and trappings of royalty, for the purpose of mixing on equal terms with the humblest of their people; but history never told, and imagination never pictured a disguise, an *incognito* like this.¹⁰³ But why was that disguise adopted, and, in this instance, so long preserved?¹⁰⁴ Why, instead of doing as he did with the eleven, first manifesting himself, and then opening their understanding to understand the Scriptures, did he keep himself unknown all the time that the work of exposition was going on?

¹⁰⁵May it not have been to obtain such a simple, natural, easy access for the truth into these two men's minds and hearts, as to give it, even when unsupported by the weight of his own personal authority, a firmer and securer hold?¹⁰⁶ Whatever may have been its more special object as regards the two disciples, wonderful indeed was that condescension of our Lord which led him to give so many hours of his first resurrection-day to this humble office.¹⁰⁷ Many a proud scribe in Jerusalem would have recoiled from it, have deemed it a waste of his precious time, if asked to accompany two such humble men, and spend so much of one of his Sabbaths in instructing them out of the Scriptures.¹⁰⁸ The divine Redeemer himself thought it not a task too lowly; and by devoting, in his own person, so much of that first Christian Sabbath to it, has he not at once left behind him a pattern of what all true and faithful exposition of the sacred Scriptures ought to be, even the unfolding of the things touching a once crucified, but now exalted Saviour; and has he not dignified, by himself engaging in it, the work of one man's trying, at any time, or in any way, to lead another to the knowledge of the truth as it is in Jesus?

¹⁰⁹It was with heavy hearts that the two disciples had left Jerusalem; and had all the journey been like the first few paces of it, it had seemed a long way to Emmaus.¹¹⁰ But they are at the village now, and the road had never appeared so short.¹¹¹ Had they imagined they

could be there so soon, they would have lingered on the road.¹¹² And now this stranger, whose discourse had so beguiled the way, and made their hearts so burn within them, makes as if he would go farther.¹¹³ Emmaus, it would seem, is not his resting-place.¹¹⁴ But how can they part from him?¹¹⁵ How may that conversation, which has shed such a fresh light into their understandings, such a new hope into their hearts, be prolonged?¹¹⁶ They invite, they urge him to remain.¹¹⁷ He gives, he makes the opportunity for their constraining him to be their guest.¹¹⁸ He acts as he had done with the two blind beggars: with the disciples in the storm; with the Syrophenician woman.¹¹⁹ He suffers violence to be used with him; and then, when he has brought out all the strength of desire and affection towards him in the earnest entreaty, he yields to the urgency he had himself excited.¹²⁰ The two disciples constrain him, and he goes in apparently to abide with them.¹²¹ They have him now, as they think, with them for the whole evening; and what an evening it shall be, when, supper over, the conversation of the wayside may be renewed.¹²² The humble table is quickly spread.¹²³ This is the home, it has been thought, of one of the two disciples, and he whose home it is prepares to do the duty of the host.¹²⁴ That duty is taken out of his hands.¹²⁵ The mysterious stranger takes the bread; he blesses, he breaks, he gives.¹²⁶ Who but One could bless and break and give in such a way as this?¹²⁷ The scales fall from the disciples' eyes.¹²⁸ 'Tis he, their own lost but now recovered Lord and Master.¹²⁹ Let him wait but a moment or two, they shall be clasping him, as Mary would fain have done, to their hearts, or, falling down, as the women did, and worshipping at his feet.¹³⁰ Time is not given them.¹³¹ He reveals himself, and disappears.¹³² This moment known by them, the next vanishing from their sight.

IV.

THE EVENING MEETING.*

When they left Jerusalem on the afternoon of the first day of the week, the two disciples had intended to remain that night, perhaps permanently, at Emmaus. The Paschal Sabbath over, they had resolved to return to their village home, to their old way of living, burying, as best they could, their expectations disappointed. But the conversation by the way, the manifestation in the breaking of

* Mark 16: 13, 14; Luke 24: 33-43; John 20: 19-23.

bread, that revealed and vanishing presence of their risen Lord, altered the whole current of their thoughts and acts. They could not stay at Emmaus. Late as it was, they instantly arose and returned to Jerusalem. How quickly, how eagerly would they retrace their steps! What manner of communications would those be that they would now have with one another; how different from those which Jesus had interrupted; the incredulity turned now into faith, the sadness into joy. The stranger who had made their hearts burn within them, on their way out to the village, he too was traversing at the same time the road they took on their way back to Jerusalem. But he did not join them now; he left them to muse in silence on all they had seen and heard, or to add to each other's wonder, gratitude, and gladness, by talking to one another by the way. Their hearts were now full of the desire to tell to the brethren they had left behind in the city all that had happened. On reaching Jerusalem, they get at once the opportunity they so much desire. A meeting of the apostles, and of as many others as they could conveniently call together, or could entirely trust, had quietly, somewhat stealthily convened; the first, we may believe, since the Thursday evening meeting in the upper chamber. And where but in that same chamber can we imagine that this Sunday evening assembly gathered? The doors were closed against intruders, but these two well-known disciples from Emmaus are easily recognized, and at once admitted. In what an agitated, conflicting state of thought and feeling do they find those assembled there! They had all heard the reports of the women and of Mary Magdalene; but they say little or nothing about them; perhaps give them little credit. But there is Peter, whom no one can well distrust, telling all the particulars of his interview, and carrying the conviction of so many, that they are joyfully exclaiming; "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." But this is not the general, not at least the universal state of sentiment. The two disciples tell their tale, but it falls on many an incredulous ear. They are as little believed as the women and Mary Magdalene had been. They are trying all they can by a minute recital of how Jesus had been known of them, to remove the incredulity, when suddenly, coming as a spirit cometh, casting no shadow before him, the doors not being open to let him in, no sight nor sound giving token of his approach, Jesus himself is in the midst of them, and his "Peace be unto you" stills at once the conflicting conversation that had been going on. The manner of this appearance may have been wholly miraculous and supernatural, or it may have been partly or wholly due to those new properties with which

Then the same day at evening, being the first day of the week, when the doors were shut where the disciples were assembled for fear of the Jews, came Jesus and stood in the midst, and said unto them Peace be unto you.—JOHN XX. 19.

D-394

XX.

THE FIRST NIGHT AFTER THE RESURRECTION.

THE two great facts which complete and confirm everything else in the gospel history are the crucifixion and the resurrection.² The appointed sacrifice of redemption itself was indeed finished when Jesus bowed his head in death on the cross.³ But the Divine seal was set to the sacrifice, and the full and final witness was given to the world when Jesus rose from the dead.⁴ We therefore truly say that the two great days in the world's history are the Friday when darkness veiled the awful scene upon Calvary, and the following Sunday when the white-robed angel, with a countenance like lightning, rolled away the stone from the door of the tomb where the body of Jesus was laid.⁵ The extraordinary events of those two days have exerted a controlling influence upon the history of the world ever since, and they are still doing more than great battles and mighty revolutions in forming the character and fixing the destiny of individuals and nations.

⁶These events were all purposed and sure in the Infinite Mind. ⁷But to human judgment the most dis-

mal night that ever cast its shadows upon the hearts and hopes of men was the last night that the body of Jesus rested in the grave. ⁸The brightest morning that ever rose upon a darkened and death-stricken world was the morning when the two Marys ran with wonder and joy from the garden of Joseph to the gate of Jerusalem, to tell the disciples that the tomb was empty and the Lord was risen. ⁹The disappointed and disheartened disciples refused to believe the words of the trembling and excited women. ¹⁰And when the tidings came again that Mary Magdalene had seen Jesus himself alive in the garden, and that a vision of angels had appeared to others and had positively affirmed the fact of the resurrection, still they believed it not.

¹¹The day which might most fitly have been spent in rejoicing was one of confusion and perplexity of mind to them, because the awful and glorious event of the resurrection surpassed the utmost reach of their faith. ¹²Friday had taken from them their living Master, and now it seemed that Sunday would deprive them of the last sad privilege of embalming his dead body in the tomb. ¹³Alas! how often do the sad thoughts of the afflicted linger about the grave and cling to the perishable form of the beloved who sleep in Jesus, forgetful of the angel-voice which speaks from the tomb, "He is not here, he is risen!" ¹⁴The great fact of an actual rising from the dead, a continued and glorified life after death has done its worst upon the suffering body, is still what believers themselves find it hardest to be-

lieve. ¹⁵They still find it easier to talk of their lost friends and buried hopes and broken hearts than of the better life and blessed home to which the disciples of Jesus go through the gate of the tomb.

¹⁶It will help us to correct our false impressions, and discipline our hearts to faith and patience, if we observe the fears and fluctuations of mind through which the disciples passed on the first day and evening after the resurrection. ¹⁷Late in the afternoon two of the number resolved to give up all further inquiry and suspense, and go home to quiet their excited and weary minds in a little village eight miles away from Jerusalem. ¹⁸As nearly as can be ascertained they went out of the city at its western gate, and pursued their evening walk with sad looks and heavy hearts. ¹⁹The path which they were to follow was one of the most dreary and desolate in all Palestine. ²⁰First, they had to pass two miles over a bleak and barren level of loose stones and sun-dried earth and naked slabs of rock.

²¹I think it must have been somewhere on this cheerless mountain ridge, at the beginning of their walk, that they saw a stranger coming up from behind with a quicker step and silently joining their company.

²²They were so busy with their sad thoughts, and he was so gentle and courteous in his approach, that they kept on in their conversation as if they were still alone.

²³He saw that their faces were sad and their words came forth from burdened and sorrowing hearts. ²⁴He gently drew from them the cause of their grief, and in a few

moments he entered into their feelings with so much earnestness, tenderness and sympathy that their hearts burned within them while he spoke.²⁵ They wondered who he could be, and they expressed their wonder by sly glances at each other, while he went on with them and talked all the way.²⁶ But they did not dare to ask him, or in any way to interrupt the flow of his gracious words, while he opened to them the Scriptures, and showed them how Christ must needs suffer and by suffering enter into his glory.

²⁷And so the three walked on together, the delighted and wondering disciples not knowing that they were listening to their lamented and risen Lord.²⁸ They hear his step upon the stony road just like their own.

²⁹He labors with panting breath in climbing the steep place, and he moves with cautious tread in descending the slippery path, just as they do.³⁰ Nothing in his

³¹dress or manner or person leads them to suspect that he can be anything else than one of the pilgrims returning from the great feast to some distant home.

³¹Having passed over the rocky platform immediately west of Jerusalem, on what is now the Ramleh road, they turn to take their last look of the city and brush away a silent tear at the fresh remembrance of all they had seen and suffered there within the last few days.

³²Then they plunge down into a narrow glen and make their way cautiously over a dreary waste of bare ledges and confused drifts of gravel and rubble stone.³³ They cross the dry bed of a torrent, and then climb slowly

up a winding and zig-zag path cut in the limestone rock to the crest of another ridge.³⁴ This height is no sooner gained than they begin another descent, again to climb a long, steep and winding track over loose stones and ledges that have been worn smooth by winter rains and spring torrents and the feet of travelers for centuries.

³⁵And all the way the Divine Saviour, the Son of God, who could say, "All power is given unto me in heaven and in earth," walks with these two men, taking as many steps as they, and talking all the while as they go up and down the steep places together.³⁶ He spends more time in this long and laborious conversation with these two sad and despondent men than with all others on the first day of his resurrection life.³⁷ This mighty Conqueror of death, who had unbarred the gates of the tomb for a lost world, would thus teach us his readiness to be with us and comfort our hearts in the hardest paths we have to tread.³⁸ In his risen and glorified state he is still the Son of Man, having all the sympathies and affections of the human heart.³⁹ He is still as near to those who desire his company as he was before he passed through the awful transformation of the cross and the tomb.

⁴⁰The sun has gone down behind the gray hill-tops, and the shadows of evening have begun to deepen in the narrow valleys, and the laborers have left the terraced orchards and vineyards on the hill-sides before the two travelers reach their home, and beg the kindly

stranger to go in and abide with them for the night.
 41 He would have gone farther, and they would not have recognized their Lord had they not yielded to the impulse which his words had kindled in their hearts and urged him to stay. 42 He never forces himself upon any.

43 He joins the company of many who are toiling along the hard journey of life, he interests himself in the sorrows that press them down, he warms their hearts with his words of love, but if they fail to ask him to abide with them, he passes on and they know him not.

44 It is toward evening, and the day of life is far spent with some to whom Jesus has often drawn near in the way; the shadows of evening are gathering thick around them, and yet they have never said to him with earnest and longing desire, "Abide with us." 45 The humblest home becomes a palace fit for a king when Jesus enters in to tarry there. 46 And without him the most splendid mansion on earth can give no rest to the weary soul. 47 Blessed is the home and sweet is the rest of those who let no evening pass without offering the prayer to him who walked from Jerusalem to Emmaus with the two disciples: "Abide with us."

48 It was only to draw forth the invitation to stay that Jesus made as if he would have gone farther. 49 When asked he entered without delay. 50 The three weary travelers sat down together in that lowly cottage home, and the mysterious stranger continued to speak his heart-burning words while waiting for the evening meal. 51 When bread, the simple fare of the poor, was

set before them, he put forth his hands to bless it. 52 But what now so suddenly startles the wondering disciples? 53 They see the print of the nails in the open palms, the sign and scar of the cross. 54 And now that he breathes forth the blessing they recognize the tone, the manner, the look. 55 It is he who hung upon the cross! 56 It is he whose body was laid in the tomb! 57 He lives, and they have been walking with him all the way! 58 Now they are ready to cast themselves in wonder and in worship at his feet. 59 But the object of his appearance and his long reasoning with them by the way is gained, and he vanishes out of their sight.

60 And now, that this great joy has filled their hearts, their weariness and their discouragement are all gone. 61 They have no thought of hunger or of rest. 62 They must hurry back to tell the tidings to their brethren in the city. 63 In a moment they are out again upon the stony path with their faces toward Jerusalem. 64 It is now night, and the moon which was full four days ago, has not yet risen. 65 But it is all light in the glad hearts of the disciples who have seen their risen Lord. 66 The sad looks and sorrowful words with which they went out in the bright afternoon are all exchanged for exultations of joy, now that they are coming back in the dark night. 67 The world is all new to them, and the one dread horror of death is all gone, if Christ be risen from the dead. 68 They cannot wait for the morning to carry such joyful tidings to the sorrowing band of their brethren.

69 They hurry along the wild mountain road, plunging into dark glens, climbing over steep ridges, bending around shadowy hills, sometimes stepping from stone to stone, feeling the way in the dark with the pilgrim's staff, and sometimes slipping upon the smooth face of the steep ledges, and then losing the track in crossing the dry bed of a torrent. 70 I have myself more than once traveled as wild and rugged a mountain-path alone by night, and I know that Cleopas and his companion must have had light hearts to have started out upon that night journey to Jerusalem, without waiting for the moon to rise or the morning to dawn.

71 But they carried in their hearts tidings of the greatest victory ever gained in this world—the victory over death, the unbarring of the gates of the grave for the whole human race. 72 And well they might go, running when they could, climbing and descending with cautious step when they must, but rejoicing all the way. 73 For they were bearers of the best tidings that human lips ever told. 74 They could testify to a fact upon which all the hopes of man for eternity must depend.

75 Reaching the walls of the city at a late hour, they probably passed around to one of the eastern gates, which was kept open all night during the great festivities of the Jewish people. 76 Having gained admission, they hurry along the narrow streets, guided now by the light of the risen moon. 77 The doors are shut and the blank walls of the stone houses give no sign of life

within. 78 They make their way first of all, we may suppose, to that one memorable house with the upper chamber where Jesus spent the last evening with his disciples before he suffered. 79 Late as is the hour, they feel confident that the band will still be together. 80 The excitement of the day has been too great to let them think of sleep.

81 When they reach the door, they find it barred from within and they cannot enter. 82 They knock, but none reply. 83 They call aloud and announce their names, and then they hear steps and voices within, and the swift and cautious hands of their brethren unbolting the door. 84 But they have not had time to enter or to unburden their hearts of the great joy which they bring, before the voices of all within break out in the exclamation, "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared unto Simon!" 85 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus, the strange companion that joined them in the way, the burning words that he spoke as he climbed the hills and toiled along the steep stony path in their company, the blessing that he pronounced at the evening meal, the print of the nails that they plainly saw in his extended hands, the familiar looks of their beloved Lord shining out upon his face, and then his vanishing out of their sight.

86 They have scarcely finished their story, amid the wonder and joy of the listening throng, when, behold!

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Introduction to Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. III
Chapter XVI

This passage from 3SP entitled, "In the Upper Chamber," is the early material on DA chapter 84, which bears the title of "Peace Be Unto You." Not all of the latter is represented in the former; however, the two appearances of Jesus to His disciples in the upper room are touched upon. What is not covered is left to Manuscript 149, 1897, to bring in a strong and broad basis.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Spirit of Prophecy - Vol. III - Chapter XVI

In the Upper Chamber

¹WHEN the disciples arrived at Jerusalem they entered the eastern gate, which was open on festal occasions. ²The houses were dark and silent, but they made their way through the narrow streets by the light of the rising moon. ³They knew that they would find their brethren in the memorable upper chamber where Jesus had spent the last night before his death. ⁴Here the disciples had passed the Sabbath in mourning for their Lord. ⁵And now they had no disposition to sleep, for exciting events were being related among them. ⁶Cautious hands unbarred the door to the repeated demand of the two travelers; they entered, and with them also entered Jesus, who had been their unseen companion all the way.

⁷They found the disciples assembled, and in a state of excitement. ⁸Hope and faith were struggling for ascendancy in their minds. ⁹The report of Mary Magdalene, and that of the other women, had been heard by all; but some were too hopeless to believe their testimony. ¹⁰The evidence of Peter, concerning his interview with the risen Lord, was borne with great ardor and assurance, and had more weight with the brethren, and their faith began to revive. ¹¹When the disciples from Emmaus entered with their joyful tidings, they were met by the exclamation from many voices: "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon."

¹²The two from Emmaus told their story of how the Lord

In the Upper Chamber

had opened their eyes, and revealed to them the straight chain of prophecy which reached from the days of the patriarchs to that time, and foreshadowed all that had transpired regarding their Saviour. ¹³The company heard this report in breathless silence. ¹⁴Some were inspired with new faith; others were incredulous. ¹⁵Suddenly Jesus himself was in their midst. ¹⁶His hands were raised in blessing, and he said unto them, "Peace be unto you."

¹⁷"But they were terrified and affrighted, and supposed that they had seen a spirit. ¹⁸And he said unto them, Why are ye troubled? and why do thoughts arise in your hearts? ¹⁹Behold my hands and my feet, that it is I myself; handle me, and see; for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see me have. ²⁰And when he had thus spoken, he showed them his hands and his feet."

²¹There they beheld the feet and hands marred by the cruel nails; and they recognized his melodious voice, like none other they had ever heard. ²²"And while they yet believed not for joy, and wondered, he said unto them, Have ye here any meat? ²³And they gave him a piece of a broiled fish, and of an honeycomb. ²⁴And he took it, and did eat before them." ²⁵Faith and joy now took the place of doubt and unbelief, and they acknowledged their risen Saviour with feelings which no words could express.

²⁶Jesus now expounded the Scriptures to the entire company, commencing with the first book of Moses, and dwelling particularly on the prophecy pointing to the time

In the Upper Chamber

then present, and foretelling the sufferings of Christ and his resurrection. ²⁷"And he said unto them, These are the words which I spake unto you, while I was yet with you, that all things must be fulfilled, which were written in the law of Moses, and in the prophets, and in the Psalms, concerning me. ²⁸Then opened he their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures. ²⁹And said unto them, Thus it is written, and thus it behooved Christ to suffer, and to rise from the dead the third day; and that repentance and remission of sins should be preached in his name among all nations, beginning at Jerusalem. ³⁰And ye are witnesses of these things."

³¹The disciples now began to realize the nature and extent of their commission. ³²They were to proclaim to the world the wonderful truths which Christ had intrusted to them. ³³The events of his life, his death, and resurrection, the harmony of prophecy with those events, the sacredness of the law of God, the mysteries of the plan of salvation, the power of Jesus for the remission of sins--to all these things were they witnesses, and it was their work to make them know to all men, beginning at Jerusalem. ³⁴They were to proclaim a gospel of peace and salvation through repentance and the power of the Saviour. ³⁵At the first advent of Jesus to the world, the angel announced: Peace on earth, and good will to men. ³⁶After his earthly life was completed, he came forth from the dead, and, appearing for the first time to his assembled disciples,

In the Upper Chamber

addressed them with the blessed words, "Peace be unto you."

³⁷Jesus is ever ready to speak peace to souls that are troubled with doubts and fear. ³⁸This precious Saviour waits for us to open the door of our heart to him, and say, Abide with us. ³⁹He says, "Behold, I stand at the door, and knock; if any man hear my voice, and open the door, I will come in to him, and will sup with him, and he with me." ⁴⁰Our life is a continual strife; we must war against principalities and powers, against spiritual wickedness, and foes that never sleep; we must resist temptations, and overcome as Christ overcame. ⁴¹When the peace of Jesus enters our heart we are calm and patient under the severest trials.

⁴²The resurrection of Jesus was a sample of the final resurrection of all who sleep in him. ⁴³The risen body of the Saviour, his deportment, the accents of his speech, were all familiar to his followers. ⁴⁴In like manner will those who sleep in Jesus rise again. ⁴⁵We shall know our friends even as the disciples knew Jesus. ⁴⁶Though they may have been deformed, diseased, or disfigured in this mortal life, yet in their resurrected and glorified body their individual identity will be perfectly preserved, and we shall recognize, in the face radiant with the light shining from the face of Jesus, the lineaments of those we love.

⁴⁷The death of Jesus had left Thomas in blank despair. ⁴⁸His faith seemed to have gone out in utter darkness. ⁴⁹He was not present in the upper chamber when Jesus appeared to

In the Upper Chamber

his disciples. ⁵⁰He had heard the reports of the others, and had received copious proof that Jesus had risen, but stolid gloom and stubborn unbelief closed his heart against all cheering testimony. ⁵¹As he heard the disciples repeat their account of the wonderful manifestation of the resurrected Saviour, it only served to plunge him in deeper despair; for if Jesus had really risen from the dead there could be no farther hope of his literal earthly kingdom. ⁵²It also wounded his vanity to think that his Master would reveal himself to all his disciples but him; so he was determined not to believe, and for an entire week he brooded over his wretchedness, which seemed all the darker as contrasted with the reviving hope and faith of his brethren.

⁵³During this time he frequently, when in company with his brethren, reiterated the words, "Except I shall see in his hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into his side, I will not believe." ⁵⁴He would not see through the eyes of his brethren, nor exercise faith which was dependent upon their testimony. ⁵⁵He ardently loved his lord, but jealousy and unbelief took possession of his mind and heart.

⁵⁶The upper chamber was the home of a number of the disciples, and every evening they all assembled in this place. ⁵⁷On a certain evening Thomas decided to meet with his brethren; for notwithstanding his unbelief, he cherished a faint hope, unacknowledged to himself, that the good news was true. ⁵⁸While the disciples were partaking of their

In the Upper Chamber

usual meal, and meanwhile canvassing the evidences of the truth of their faith which Christ had given them in the prophecies, "then came Jesus, the doors being shut, and stood in the midst, and said, Peace be unto you."

⁵⁹He then reproved the unbelieving who had not received the testimony of those who had seen him, and, turning to Thomas, said, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold my hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into my side; and be not faithless, but believing." ⁶⁰These words showed that he had read the thoughts and words of Thomas. ⁶¹The doubting disciple knew that none of his companions had seen Jesus for a week, and therefore could not have told the Master of his stubborn unbelief. ⁶²He recognized the person before him as his Lord who had been crucified; he had no desire for farther proof; his heart leaped for joy as he realized that Jesus was indeed risen from the dead. ⁶³He cast himself at the feet of his Master in deep affection and devotion, crying, "My Lord and my God."

⁶⁴Jesus accepted his acknowledgment, but mildly rebuked him for his unbelief: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed; blessed are they that have not seen, and yet have believed." ⁶⁵Jesus here showed Thomas that his faith would have been more acceptable to him if he had believed the evidence of his brethren, and had not refused to believe until he had seen Jesus with his own eyes. ⁶⁶If the world should follow this example of Thomas, no one would believe unto salvation; for all who now receive

In the Upper Chamber

Christ do so through the testimony of others.

⁶⁷Many who have a weak and wavering faith, reason that if they had the evidence which Thomas had from his companions they would not doubt as he did. ⁶⁸They do not realize that they have not only that evidence, but additional testimony piled up about them on every side.

⁶⁹Many who, like Thomas, wait for all cause of doubt to be removed, may never realize their desire as he did, but gradually become entrenched in their unbelief, until they cannot perceive the weight of evidence in favor of Jesus, and, like the skeptical Jews, what little light they had will go out in the darkness which closes around their minds.

⁷⁰To reject the plain and conclusive evidence of divine truth hardens the heart, and blinds the understanding.

⁷¹The precious light, being neglected, fades utterly from the mind that is unwilling to receive it.

⁷²Jesus, in his treatment of Thomas, gave his followers a lesson regarding the manner in which they should treat those who have doubts upon religious truth, and who make those doubts prominent. ⁷³He did not overwhelm Thomas with words of reproach, nor did he enter into a controversy with him; but, with marked condescension and tenderness, he revealed himself unto the doubting one.

⁷⁴Thomas had taken a most unreasonable position, in dictating the only conditions of his faith; but Jesus, by his generous love and consideration, broke down all the barriers he had raised.

⁷⁵Persistent controversy will seldom weaken unbelief, but

In the Upper Chamber

rather put it upon self-defense, where it will find new support and excuse. ⁷⁶Jesus, revealed in his love and mercy as the crucified Saviour, will wring from many once unwilling lips the acknowledgment of Thomas, "My Lord, and my God."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Introduction to Signs of the Times January
1888

A selection provided as an exhibit for Appendix D following the DA chapter 83 materials is the Signs article for January 20, 1888, entitled "Know the Reason of Your Hope." The first 72 sentences of that article apply to chapter 83 of DA, while sentences 73-99 refer to a portion of DA chapter 84. Since a photo copy of the Signs article appears in full in Appendix D for chapter 83, would the reader kindly turn there to refer to the portion applicable to chapter 84.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Introduction to Manuscript 113 1897

Now we have 35 sentences from the last portion of Manuscript 113, 1897, which apply to the first part of DA chapter 84. October 14 is the date give for MS 113, whereas Manuscript 149, 1897, which refers to the rest of DA chapter 84, apparently was produced on December 1.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

MS 113, 1897

The Walk to Emmaus
(Continued)

¹¹²Entering Jerusalem, they go to the upper chamber, where Christ spent the hours of the last evening before his death instructing his disciples. ¹¹³It is late, but they know that the disciples will not sleep till they know for a certainty what has become of the body of their Lord. ¹¹⁴They find the door of the chamber securely barred. ¹¹⁵They knock for admission, but no answer comes. ¹¹⁶All is still. ¹¹⁷Then they give their names. ¹¹⁸The door is carefully unbarred, but as soon as they have entered, it is again fastened, to keep out spies.

¹¹⁹The travellers [sic] find all in surprised excitement. ¹²⁰The voices of those in the room break out into thanksgiving and praise, saying, "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared unto Simon." ¹²¹Then the travellers [sic], panting with the haste with which they have made their journey, tell the wondrous story of how as they were journeying along full of discouragement and hopelessness, they were joined by a stranger. ¹²²With wonder and hope, they relate how he opened the Scriptures to them, and how they invited him to abide with them. ¹²³They tell how, as they prepared the evening meal, and when as their guest had extended his hands to bless the food, they recognized him. ¹²⁴Their eyes were indeed opened. ¹²⁵They saw the marks of the nails, and rose up to worship him, but

The Walk to Emmaus

he vanished out of their sight.

¹²⁶They have just finished their story, and some are saying that they could not believe it; for it is too good to be true, when behold, another person stands before them. ¹²⁷Every eye is fastened upon the stranger. ¹²⁸No one had knocked for entrance. ¹²⁹No footstep had been heard. ¹³⁰The disciples are startled, and wonder what it means. ¹³¹Then they hear a voice which is no other than the familiar voice of their Master. ¹³²Clear and distinct the words fall from his lips, "Peace be unto you."

¹³³"Then" John states, "were the disciples glad, when they saw the Lord." ¹³⁴Then said Jesus unto them again, "Peace be unto you; as my Father hath sent me, even so send I you." ¹³⁵And when he had said this he breathed on them, and said unto them, "Receive ye the Holy Ghost. ¹³⁶Whose soever sins ye remit, they are remitted unto them; and whose soever sins ye retain, they are retained."

¹³⁷No one is to venture presumptuously into the work of God. ¹³⁸He is not to go unless the Holy Spirit is evidently upon him. ¹³⁹Only under the supervision of the Holy Spirit can Christ's followers work as he worked.

¹⁴⁰That evening Christ showed his disciples his hands and his feet, that no doubt that he was the Christ might exist in their minds. ¹⁴¹"Behold my hands and my feet," he said, "that it is I myself: handle me, and see; for a spirit hath not flesh and blood as ye see me have. ¹⁴²And when he had thus spoken, he showed them his hands and his feet.

The Walk to Emmaus

¹⁴³And while they yet believed not for joy, and wondered, he said unto them, Have ye any meat? ¹⁴⁴And they gave him a piece of a broiled fish, and an honeycomb. ¹⁴⁵And he took it, and did eat before them. ¹⁴⁶And he said unto them, these are the words that I spake unto you while I was yet with you, that all things must be fulfilled, which were written in the law of Moses, and in the prophets, and in the psalms, concerning me. ¹⁴⁷Then opened he their understanding, that they might understand the scriptures, and said unto them, Thus it is written, and thus it behooved Christ to suffer, and to rise from the dead the third day; and that repentance and remission of sins should be preached in his name among all nations, beginning at Jerusalem. ¹⁴⁸And ye are witnesses of these things."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Introduction to Manuscript 149 1897

"The Remission of Sins" is the title of Manuscript 149, 1897, the second manuscript from that year used in the preparation of the DA text of chapter 84. There appear to be a number of parallels in this manuscript from Hanna, but not from March. In the DA text, as well as the 3SP text, there are parallels from both sources.

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

MS 149, 1897

The Remission of Sins

¹Before his death Jesus told his disciples what the priests and rulers would do to him, but the disciples could not understand his words. ²Now, after they had been verified, after Christ had been rejected, condemned, scourged, crucified, buried, and had risen from the dead on the third day, the disciples believed. ³They had gained a valuable experience. ⁴All the sophistry and theories of the scribes and Pharisees could not now turn them from Christ. ⁵They could say as did Paul, "I know whom I have believed." ⁶Their faith in Christ was followed by a most remarkable experience. ⁷They saw their beloved Master. ⁸They heard his voice as he opened to them the Scriptures; and from this they obtained much knowledge.

⁹The lessons given by Christ to his disciples after his resurrection were with reference to the Old Testament Scriptures. ¹⁰He could now explain to them the prophecies concerning himself. ¹¹They were surprised that they had not discerned the meaning of the inspired prophetic delineation [sic] of Christ's work and the reception given him by the Jewish dignitaries. ¹²While the poor heard him gladly, those to whom had been committed the sacred oracles closed the eyes of their understanding that they might not see Christ. ¹³They blinded the eyes of others. ¹⁴By misapplying the Scriptures, substituting their own traditions and fables, and exalting their words as the

The Remission of Sins

commandments of God, they so bewildered the minds of the people, that they could not see Christ.

¹⁵Christ rebuked these false teachers. ¹⁶"In vain do ye worship me," he said, "teaching for doctrines the commandments of men." ¹⁷"Thus have ye made the commandments of God of none effect by your tradition." ^{17b}This is the work of many of the teachers of this time. ¹⁸They make void the law of God, teaching for doctrine the commandments of men. ¹⁹Christ said of the teachers in his day, "Ye are both ignorant of the Scripture and of the power of God." ²⁰His words embrace all who claim to be religious, but who make void the law of God by their traditions."

²¹"Then the same day at evening being the first day of the week, when the doors were shut where the disciples were assembled, for fear of the Jews, came Jesus, and stood in the midst, and said unto them, Peace be unto you. ²²And when he had so said, he showed them his hands and his side." ²³He gave them evidence that he was the same Jesus that had been crucified. ²⁴"Then were the disciples glad when they saw the Lord. ²⁵Then said Jesus unto them again, Peace be unto you; as my Father hath sent me, even so send I you. ²⁶And when he had said this he breathed on them, and said unto them, Receive ye the Holy Ghost: whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted; and whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained."

²⁷Thus the disciples received their commission. ²⁸They were to preach and teach the gospel in Christ's name. ²⁹The

The Remission of Sins

instruction given them had the vital, spiritual breath that is in Jesus. ³⁰He alone could give them the oil that they must have to work successfully. ³¹Christlikeness must appear in them. ³²They could be successful only as they studied their Master's character, and followed his example.

³³The impartation of the Spirit was the impartation of the very life of Christ, which was to qualify the disciples for their mission. ³⁴Without this qualification, their work could not be accomplished. ³⁵Thus they were to fulfil [sic] the official duties connected with the church. ³⁶But the Holy Spirit was not yet fully manifested, because Christ had not yet been glorified. ³⁷The more abundant impartation of the Holy Spirit did not take place till after Christ's ascension.

³⁸The Holy Spirit is the breath of life in the soul. ³⁹The breathing of Christ upon his disciples was the breath of true spiritual life. ⁴⁰The disciples were to interpret this as imbuing them with the attributes of Christ, that in purity, faith, and obedience, they might exalt the law and make it honorable. ⁴¹God's law is the expression of his character. ⁴²By obedience to its requirements we meet God's great standard of righteousness. ⁴³Thus the disciples were to witness for Christ.

⁴⁴"And when he had said this, he breathed on them, and said, Receive ye the Holy Ghost; whosoever sins ye remit, they are remitted." ⁴⁵The warnings in the seventh chapter of Matthew forbid men from pronouncing judgment on their

The Remission of Sins

fellowmen. ⁴⁶The remission of sins is to be understood as the prerogative of God alone. ⁴⁷The Holy Spirit will convince of sin, of righteousness, and of judgment. ⁴⁸The lesson given to the disciples means that wise men, truly taught of God, possessing the inward working of the Holy Spirit, are to be representative men, samples of the whole body of believers. ⁴⁹These are to show themselves capable of preserving due order in the church.

⁵⁰Christ has given rules for the guidance of his church. ⁵¹"Moreover if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone: if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother. ⁵²But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee one or two more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every word may be established. ⁵³And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church; but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as an heathen man and a publican. ⁵⁴Verily I say unto you, Whatsoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven, and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven."

⁵⁵There is no power given to any of God's delegated servants to cast down or destroy. ⁵⁶The apostles were unable to remove the guilt from any soul. ⁵⁷They were to give the message from God, which might reach the soul. ⁵⁸"It is written, the Lord hath said thus and thus in regard to lying, Sabbath breaking, bearing false witness, stealing, idolatry."

The Remission of Sins

⁵⁹Remitting sins or restraining sins applies to the church in her organized capacity. ⁶⁰God has given directions to reprove, rebuke, exhort, with all longsuffering and doctrine. ⁶¹Censure is to be given. ⁶²This censure is to be removed when the one in error confesses and repents of his sin. ⁶³This solemn commission is given to men who have in them the breath of the Holy Spirit, in whose lives the Christ-life is manifested. ⁶⁴They are to be men who have spiritual eyesight, who can discern spiritual things, whose actions in dealing with members of the church are such as can receive the endorsement of the great head of the church. ⁶⁵If this is not so, in their human judgment they will censure those who should be commended, and sustain men who are worked by a power from beneath.

⁶⁶The gospel commission is entrusted to men to be executed by those who know the inward working of the Spirit, and who have the attributes of Christ. ⁶⁷Christ's breath is breathed upon them, and he says to them, "Receive ye the Holy Ghost." ⁶⁸All who are thus inspired by God have a work to do for the churches. ⁶⁹Christ's representatives, the ministers of the grace of God may say to others, "It is written," "If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness." ⁷⁰This is remission of sins in accordance with the word of God.

⁷¹In all labor with individual members of the church,

The Remission of Sins

every eye is to be directed to Christ. ⁷²The shepherds are to take kindly, fatherly care of the flock of the Lord's pasture by presenting the word of Christ, giving encouragement to the erring by speaking of the divine tenderness of the Saviour. ⁷³Those in the wrong are to confess their sins to the sin-pardoning Saviour, and the servants of the Lord Jesus are not to drive, but to minister in word and doctrine. ⁷⁴Present the grace of Christ, encouraging all who shall fall into sin to repent and believe in him who alone can pardon transgression and sin.

⁷⁵Let the tenderness of Christ find a place in the hearts of Christ's ministers. ⁷⁶Encourage the one humiliated to go to Christ. ⁷⁷If he repents of his sin, he will find abundant pardon. ⁷⁸He has assurance that his sins will be remitted; for thus it is written. ⁷⁹Bear in mind that first the Lord gave his disciples the Holy Ghost. ⁸⁰He breathed upon them, and those who truly believed on him received the presence of the Holy Spirit, and worked under his influence.

⁸¹The servants of God are to watch for souls as they that must give account. ⁸²Watch constantly, vigilantly. ⁸³Earnest prayer is essential. ⁸⁴Faithfully warn every soul that is in danger.

⁸⁵Remission of sins can be obtained only through the merits of Christ. ⁸⁶On no man, priest, or pope, but on God alone rests the forgiveness of sins. ⁸⁷All who announce the gospel message to sinners voice the words of John,

The Remission of Sins

"Behold the Lamb of God, which taketh away the sins of the world." ⁸⁸"As many as received him to them gave he power to become the sons of God." ⁸⁹Here is the message that is to be borne. ⁹⁰"If we say that we have fellowship with him, and walk in darkness, we lie and do not the truth. ⁹¹But whoso keepeth his word, in him verily is the love of God perfected." ⁹²On this basis Christians are free. ⁹³Give encouragement of sins remitted. ⁹⁴"If we walk in the light as he is in the light, we have fellowship one with another, and the blood of Jesus Christ his Son cleanseth us from all sin. ⁹⁵If we say that we have no sin, we deceive ourselves, and the truth is not in us. ⁹⁶If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just to forgive us our sins, and to cleanse us from all unrighteousness." ⁹⁷"My little children, these things write I unto you that ye sin not. ⁹⁸And if any man sin, we have an Advocate with the Father, Jesus Christ the righteous; and he is the propitiation for our sins; and not for ours only, but also for the sins of the whole world."

APPENDIX D - Chapter 84

Introduction to Sources - Hanna & March

As for chapter 83 of the DA, the life of Christ works by William Hanna and Daniel March are the two apparent sources for this chapter. The particular work by Daniel March is Night Scenes in the Bible; he wrote several volumes having to do with the life narrative of Christ the Saviour.

could be there so soon, they would have lingered on the road. And now this stranger, whose discourse had so beguiled the way, had made their hearts so warm within them, makes as if he would no farther. Euanus, it would seem, is not his resting-place. But how can they part from him? How may that conversation, which has shed such a fresh light into their understandings, such a new hope into their hearts, be prolonged? They invite, they urge him to remain. He gives, he makes the opportunity for their examining him to be their guest. He asks as he had done with the two blind beggars; with the disciples in the sterna; with the Syrochanaan woman. He suffers violence to be used with him; and then, when he has brought out all the strength of desire and affection towards him in the earnest entreaty, he yields to the urgency he had himself excited. The two disciples constrain him, and he goes in apparently to abide with them. They have him now, as they think, with them for the whole evening; and what an evening it shall be, when, supper over, the conversation of the wayside may be renewed. The humble table is quickly spread. This is the hour, it has been thought, of one of the two disciples, and he whose home it is prepares to do the duty of the host. That duty is taken out of his hands. The mysterious stranger takes the bread; he blesses, he breaks, he gives. Who but Our Lord could bless and break and give in such a way as this? The scales fall from the disciples' eyes. 'Tis he, their own lost but now recovered Lord and Master. Let him wait but a moment or two, they shall be clasping him, as Mary would fain have done, to their hearts, or, falling down, as the women did, and worshipping at his feet. Time is not given them. He reveals himself, and disappears. This moment known by them, the next vanishing from their sight.

IV.

THE EVENING MEETING.*

When they left Jerusalem on the afternoon of the first day of the week, the two disciples had intended to remain that night, perhaps permanently, at Euanus. The Paschal Sabbath over, they had resolved to return to their village home, to their old way of living, burying, as best they could, their expectations disappointed. But the conversation by the way, the manifestation in the breaking of

* Mark 16: 13, 14; Luke 24: 33-49; John 20: 19-23.

bread, that revealed and vanishing presence of their risen Lord, altered the whole carriage of their thoughts and acts. They could not stay at Euanus. Late as it was, they instantly arose and returned to Jerusalem. How quickly, how eagerly would they retraced their steps! What manner of communications would those be that they would now have with one another; how different from those which Jesus had interrupted; the incredulity turned now into faith, the sadness into joy. The stranger who had made their hearts burn within them, on their way out to the village, he too was traversing at the same time the road they took on their way back to Jerusalem. But he did not join them now; he left them to muse in silence on all they had seen and heard, or to add to each other's wonder, gratitude, and gladness, by talking to one another by the way. Their hearts were now full of the desire to tell to the brethren they had left behind in the city all that had happened. On reaching Jerusalem, they got at once the opportunity they so much desire. A meeting of the apostles, and of as many others as they could conveniently call together, or could entirely trust, had quietly, somewhat stealthily convened; the first, we may believe, since the Thursday evening meeting in the upper chamber. And where but in that same chamber can we imagine that this Sunday evening assembly gathered? The doors were closed against intruders, but those two well-known disciples from Euanus are easily recognized, and at once admitted. In what an agitated, conflicting state of thought and feeling do they find those assembled there! They had all heard the reports of the women and of Mary Magdalene; but they say little or nothing about them; perhaps give them little credit. But there is Peter, whom no one can well distrust, telling all the particulars of his interview, and carrying the conviction of so many, that they are joyfully exclaiming; "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared to Simon." But this is not the general, not at least the universal state of sentiment. The two disciples tell their tale, but it falls on many an incredulous ear. They are as little believed as the women and Mary Magdalene had been. They are trying all they can by a minute recital of how Jesus had been known of them, to remove the incredulity, when suddenly, coming as a spirit cometh, easing no shadow before him, the doors not being open to let him in, no sight nor sound giving token of his approach, Jesus himself is in the midst of them, and his "Peace be unto you" stills at once the conflicting conversation that had been going on. The manner of this appearance may have been wholly miraculous and supernatural, or it may have been partly or wholly due to those now properties with which

the resurrection body of the Saviour was enshrouded. Upon the Sabbath, I have already said all it seems needed or perhaps possible to say. No mystery, however, hinged round the kindly, comforting manner in which Jesus proceeds to deal with the terror which his sudden appearance had created. He points to his hands, his feet, his side, to the marks of those wounds that told of his recent death; marks which he pleased him that his resurrection body should still bear; marks which, it would seem from the apocryphic vision, were not to be effaced even from that glorified body which he carried to the throne; marks which that form is to wear for ever, the only visible monuments that are to survive of the great decesso accomplished at Jerusalem. Jesus asks them to handle him; an invitation which it is difficult to say whether they accepted or not. He shows them his hands and his feet; and while yet they believe not for joy and wonder, he seeks still further to remove their incredulity, by showing them that he has still the power, though no longer the need, of partaking with them of their ordinary food. The eating of the fish and of the honeycomb. Doubt may give place to conviction, fear to believing joy; a joy so fresh, so full, that it in turn begins to shake the new-born faith. How true to nature all this rapid succession of convincing sentiments. Now at last, however, that little company of disciples has settled into a condition fitting it to listen, and Jesus returns to the subject that had engrossed the conversation on the way out to Emmaus; to this larger, more impartial audience he unfolds the testimony that Moses, the prophets, the Psalms, all the three divisions into which the Scriptures of the Old Testament were classified by the Jews—referred to his Messianicship; dwelling particularly upon the logic most suited to the existing condition of their thoughts, how, in accordance with all that had been beforehand declared and signified, it behoved him, as the Christ, to suffer and then to rise again the third day. When opened to their understanding, that they might understand the Scriptures. However, therefore, in the writings of any one of those Christ-taught men they refer an important passage of the Old Testament to the Messiah, we may conclude that they had for doing so the direct and authoritative sanction of our Lord's own interpretation.

But his Messianicship, his death, his resurrection, were not matters in which they alone, their nation alone, were interested. Now that the new work of suffering and death was over, now that the wonderful exhibition at once of the sacredness of the Divine law, the holiness of the Divine character, the deep unchangeable love of God,

had been given; now, wide over all the world, were repentance and remission of sin to be proclaimed in his name; and they, the men to whom Jesus was then speaking, were to be his witnesses, the heralds, the preachers of this large and all-comprehending gospel of peace on earth, and good-will to God's part towards all the children of men: the first and earliest fruit of the nature and the extent of that great commission; a fruit which they did not then understand, which they did not understand even under the multiplying and unlooked-for influence of the day of Pentecost. No far their understanding was opened, that they saw clearly now that Christ ought to have suffered these things, and then to enter into his glory; but their understanding was shut as to that proclamation of God's forgiving mercy and love, which now in the name of Jesus was to be borne abroad over the whole earth.

But though it was to be left to time, and the after teachings of the Spirit, to lift them out of their narrow conceptions of the Divine love to man, as if its outgoings were to be limited to the pale of any one community upon earth, still an initial impression of the sacredness of their vocation as his disciples, of the manner in which the duties of that vocation could alone properly be discharged, and of the blessed and enduring results which were to follow in the train of that discharge, might be made upon their minds. And this was the result which Jesus, in the most striking and solemn manner, proceeded now to bring about: the first step taken by him in the gradual and slow-moving process of qualifying them for that mission which they, and all other disciples of the Saviour after them, were to undertake and carry out.

Then said Jesus unto them again, "Peace be unto you!" This first greeting, in which the same words had been used, they had been long surprised and delighted to listen to, or take home. Now that their minds had become more composed, that they had settled down into a tranquil and joyful conviction that it was indeed their risen Lord who was in the midst of them, he repeats the greeting; repeats it that they might not take it—though it was the common salutation phrase he used, as means merely to be the usual greeting with which few met few in the ordinary intercourse of life; that they might not take it as a mere expression of good-will, a wish for their welfare; but that they might have their thoughts thrown back upon what, three evenings before, he had said to them: "Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you. Let not your hearts be troubled, neither let them be afraid." And he had said so with the cross, with the suppetive before him. And now the peace having been secured, and sealed by the blood of the

cross and the rising from the sepulchre, with a new emphasis he says to them, 'Peace, my peace, peace with God, peace of conscience, the peace of pardon be unto you; take it as coming to you through me; enter into, and enjoy it as the fruit of my passion, as God's free gift to you in me.' ⁴⁶ Let the quickening, the comforting assurance that God is at peace with you, that you are at peace with God, take possession of your hearts; that, having tasted and seen that the Lord is gracious, you may be prepared for executing the high errand on which I am about to send you forth, that of publishing everywhere the gospel of this peace; preaching peace by me to them that are afar off, and to them that are nigh; "For as my Father sent me, even so now send I you." ⁴⁷ I send you forth in my name, and I will qualify you by my Spirit. ⁴⁸ And having said so, he breathed on them, and said, "Receive ye the Holy Ghost"—an outward and expressive symbol of the twofold truth, that dead, motionless, useless for all the common work of this earthly existence, as lay that dust which the hand of the Creator moulded into human form till he breathed into it the breath of his natural life, so dead, motionless, useless for the work of our Christian calling do we all lie, till the breath of true spiritual life be breathed into us by the Holy Ghost. ⁴⁹ And as it was from the lips of the risen Saviour that the breath proceeded, which spread out upon the little company at Jerusalem, so is it from the risen, exalted Saviour that the Spirit comes, whose life-giving influences spread over the whole church of the first-born. ⁵⁰ But specially upon this occasion was the breathing of Jesus upon the disciples, and the gift which accompanied that breathing, meant to indicate that the mission on which Jesus was sending these disciples out—that of being witnesses for him—was one that could alone be discharged by those who, through him, had received more or less of that heavenly gift. ⁵¹ It was this impartation of the Spirit, which was to form the one, indispensable qualification for the work; without which it could not be done. ⁵² We know, historically, that it was but a very limited measure of this gift which was actually, upon this occasion, bestowed. ⁵³ The Holy Ghost was not yet in his fulness given, because that Jesus was not yet glorified. ⁵⁴ The more plentiful effusion of this gift was reserved for the day of Pentecost. ⁵⁵ That Spirit, who was to convince of sin, and to lead into all truth, began even then, indeed, his gracious work in the minds and hearts of these disciples, by convincing them of their unbelief and hardness of heart, and by opening their minds to understand the Scriptures. ⁵⁶ This was but an earnest of better things to come—a few sprinkled drops of that fuller baptism wherewith they were afterwards to be baptized; but yet enough

D-424

to teach that it was by Spirit-taught, Spirit-moved men—by men in whose breasts the heaven-kindled fire of the true spiritual life had begun to burn—that the commission Jesus had been giving could alone be executed. ⁵⁷ And let not those to whom Jesus is now speaking, speaking as the heads and representatives of the whole body of his true followers upon earth; let them not think, weak as they are, powerless as they appear, that, in going forth to proclaim in his name, to every penitent transgressor, the free, full, instant, gracious pardon of all his sins, they are embarking in an ideal, unreal work—a work of which they shall never know whether they are succeeding in it or not.

⁵⁸ No, says the Saviour; 'Partake of the peace I now impart, accept the commission I now bestow; go forth in my name; receive ye the Holy Ghost to guide you; announce the news of God to sinners; proclaim the remission of sins, and, verily I say, whosoever sins ye thus remit, they are remitted; whosoever sins ye retain, they are retained.' ⁵⁹ Such I take to be the real spirit and objects of those last words of Jesus, as spoken by him to his disciples at this time; words spoken to animate them in their after work by the assurance that they should not labor in vain; that what they should do on earth should be owned and ratified in heaven. ⁶⁰ It were to misinterpret the incidents of that evening meeting; it were to mistake the simple, immediate, and precise object which, in using them, our Lord had in view, to explain these words, as if they were intended to clothe the eleven apostles, and after them, their successors or representatives—to clothe any class of officials in the church, exclusively, with a power of remitting and retaining sins. ⁶¹ Where is the evidence that, as originally spoken, the words were addressed exclusively to the eleven? ⁶² There were others present as well as they. ⁶³ The two disciples," Luke tells us, "found the eleven gathered together, and those that were with them." ⁶⁴ These other members of the infant church, with the two disciples, had the benediction pronounced on them, as well as on the eleven; the instructions were given to them as well as to the eleven; the breath was breathed on them as well as on the eleven. ⁶⁵ Had Jesus meant, when he spoke of this remitting and retaining sins, to restrict to the eleven the power and privileges conferred, should he not by some word or token have made it manifest that such was his desire? ⁶⁶ At other times he was at pains to single out the twelve, when he had something meant for their eyes and their ears alone. ⁶⁷ Is it likely that at this time he would have omitted to draw a line between them and the others who were before him, had it been to them that these closing words were exclusively addressed?

But we have another and still stronger reason for not believing in any such restriction. Jesus had once before used words of nearly the same import with those that are now before us, and he had addressed them to the disciples at large: "Moreover, if thy brother shall trespass against thee, go and tell him his fault between thee and him alone: if he shall hear thee, thou hast gained thy brother." But if he will not hear thee, then take with thee two or three more, that in the mouth of two or three witnesses every word may be established. And if he shall neglect to hear them, tell it unto the church: but if he neglect to hear the church, let him be unto thee as a heathen man and a publican. Verily I say unto you, Whosoever so shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven; and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven. Again I say unto you, That if two of you shall agree on earth as touching anything that they shall ask, it shall be done for them of my Father which is in heaven. For where two or three are gathered together in my name, there am I in the midst of them." The two concluding verses, as well as the preceding context, contain the conclusive evidence, that it was not to any select class or order of his followers that Jesus said, "Whosoever ye shall bind on earth shall be bound in heaven; and whatsoever ye shall loose on earth shall be loosed in heaven." (Matt. 18:15-20.)

We are not in the least disposed to doubt that while Christ speaks of the remitting and the retaining of sins as pertaining to the church at large, his words cover the acts of the church in her organized capacity, the inflicting and removing of ecclesiastical censures through her officers in the exercise of discipline. Here, however, we have two remarks to make: First, that it is only so far as these acts are done by spiritual men, seeking and following the guidance of the Spirit, only so far as they are in accordance with Christ's acknowledged will, that they are of any avail, or can place any heavy burden upon his sins. But did not he, we are asked, with whom alone it is acknowledged that power rests, appoint the chosen as his earthly delegates, and in the commission here given them, convey into their hands as such, that power? Just as little as little as in two other commissions given to two of the old prophets, he handed over to them that power over the kingdoms and nations of the earth which we rightly

believe and affirm rests alone in the hands of the Almighty. "Then the Lord put forth his hand, and touched my mouth: and the Lord said unto me, Behold, I have put my words in thy mouth. So, I have this day set thee over the nations, and over the kingdom, to root out, and to pull down, and to destroy, and to throw down, and to build, and to plant." Jer. 1:9, 10. It came to pass also in the twelfth year, in the nineteenth day of the month, that the word of the Lord came unto me, saying, Son of man, will for the multitude of Egypt, and cast them down, even her, and the daughter of the famous nations, into the neither parts of the earth, with them that go down into the pit." Ezek. 32:17, 18.

Now, in terms not less distinct than those in which Christ gives the disciples power over the sins of men, to remit or to retain, that power to the two prophets given over the nations to cast down and to destroy. The time interpretation of the grant or commission is in both cases the same. In the exercise of any power, inherent or delegated, natural or acquired, temporal and intellectual, important of themselves to overturn a nation; in the exercise of any power, original or conferred, personal or official, the apostles were just as impotent to remove any sinner's guilt. The prophets' function was limited to the denouncing of a doom which it was for the hand of Jehovah alone to execute. The church's function is as strictly limited to the announcing of a pardon which it is for the grace of the heavenly Father alone to bestow. And if, in exercising that simple but most honorable office of proclaiming unto all men that there is remission of sins through the name of Jesus, she teaches that it is alone through her channels—through channels that priestly or ordained and consecrated hands can alone open—the pardon counsel, she teaches upon the rights and prerogatives of Him whom she represents, and turns that eye upon herself that should be turned alone on him.

But it is the glorious office of the church, of every individual member thereof, of every distinct community thereof, in the sense here indicated, to absolve the sinner, to assure him of the divine forgiveness, to help him to believe in that forgiveness. Nevertheless, the gospel of the grace of God is preached, not generally, but particularly, to an individual man, and he is entrusted and encouraged to take hold of peace, to accept of pardon, to trust in the mercy of Jesus, to believe in the forgiving love of God—then is that office of remitting sins in the name of Jesus undertaken and discharged. Illustrative instances occur to us; the one public and official, the other private and personal. The first is that of the penitent offender

at Corinth, who was in danger of being removed up of over the sorrow. Assuming that it lay with the church to extend her sympathy to that offender, desiring to do nothing upon his own behalf and authority, claiming no excommunicative power of herself absolutely. And invites the Corinthian believers to deal kindly, forgivingly with that man, and to receive him back into their communion, a thing which he was quite prepared to do along with them in such treatment of the problem. "Wherefore I beseech you," he says, "that you would confirm your love toward him, to whom ye forgive anything, I forgive also; for if I forgive anything, to whom I give it, for your sakes forgive I it, in the person of Christ." ⁹⁷ The great object was to make the repentant one feel how why, how generous, how cordial and answered was the forgiveness which the church extended to him, that he might all the more confidently repose in that other sympathy, that other forgiveness, which, far as the heavens are above the earth, are above all the sympathy, all the forgiveness of man.

⁹⁷ But other instance belongs to a late period in the life of the beloved disciple. ⁹⁸ It has beyond the period embraced in the New Testament history, but is well authenticated. When the tyrant who sent John to Patmos was dead, the apostle returned to Ephesus. Engaged in a visitation of the neighbouring churches, he saw in one of them a youth of so attractive an appearance that he specially committed him to the care and guardianship of the bishop, or chief minister of the church. ⁹⁹ The minister took the youth to his own home, cherished him, educated him, and at length baptized him. As he grew up, however, the care of his guardian relaxed, and he fell into the company of a band of idle and dissolute youths, who mingled together into a career of sin which led to the commission of offences that exposed them to the severest penalties of the law. ¹⁰⁰ Resolved from all contact, and forming his association into a band of robbers, the youth became their captain, surpassing all of them in deeds of violence and blood. Time ran on, and the aged apostle once more visited the same church. ¹⁰¹ He asked about the youth, and wept when he heard his story. ¹⁰² To look his way instantly to the district which the robber-band infested, and was taken prisoner by theanguard of the band. ¹⁰³ He neither tried to fly nor offered any resistance to his captors. ¹⁰⁴ He said to the very purpose of seeing him, "I have come for the very purpose of seeing him." ¹⁰⁵ As soon as he recognized the venerable apostle advancing towards him, the captain would have fled; but the apostle pursued him, crying out, "Why dost thou fly, my son, from me thy father—thy brethren—

V.

[THE INDEPENDENT OF THOMAS.]

"I have compassion on thee, my son. I fear not thou wilt lose hope. ¹⁰⁶ I will intercede with Christ for thee. ¹⁰⁷ Believe that Christ hath sent me. ¹⁰⁸ The fugitive was arrested. They met once more. ¹⁰⁹ The apostle embraced him; prayed with him; solemnly assured him that there was pardon for him at the hands of Christ; and did not leave him till he had him back again, and restored him to the church. ¹¹⁰ In the manner of his restoring that erring youth, the beloved apostle showed how thoroughly he had imbibed the spirit of his divine Master, from whose lips fell a century before he had his word to the world. ¹¹¹ "Wherefore thus ye reject, they are reconciled."

"Was it his fault, or his misfortune simply, that Thomas was not present at that first meeting on the evening of the day of the resurrection? ¹¹² Clearly enough, we cannot charge his absence with the same kind of neglect, with which now a refusal to join in the ordinary services of the sanctuary would be loaded; for no such services had then been instituted, nor had any authority, human or divine, as yet prescribed them. ¹¹³ That evening conference, hastily summoned under the prompting of the strange incidents of the day, was, in fact, the first of those assemblies on the Lord's day which have since become one of the established customs of Christianity. ¹¹⁴ But as no such custom had as yet been established, Thomas cannot be accused of violating it. ¹¹⁵ The circumstances, however, under which that conference was held, were so peculiar, the pressure which impelled it so urgent, that we cannot imagine that any slight or fortuitous impediment would have kept any one of the eleven away. ¹¹⁶ It may, therefore, have been Thomas' extreme inordinance in the fact of the resurrection, the utter and thank-despise into which the death of his Master had cast him, which indisposed him to join the rest. ¹¹⁷ It it were so; if he kept aloof from his brethren as believing that no good could come from their assembling; that it was all over with the hopes as to their Master which they had been cherishing; that they were men till the tales which had been circulating about his having risen from the dead—then, for his neglect of all that Jesus had preached about his death and resurrection, and for his treatment of

the testimony of Peter and the other early visitors of the sepulchre, he was amply punished, in losing that sight of the risen Jesus given to the others, and in his being left, for the seven days that followed, to the wretchedness of uncertainty and doubt—an uncertainty and doubt which would be all the bitterer, as contrasted with the unclouded convictions and new-born joy of his brother disciples.

While they, lifted from the depths of their despair, were congratulating one another on the great triumph over death and the grave which their Master had achieved, were strengthening each other's faith, and brightening each other's joy, he, alone and disconsolate, was scraping together the scanty food on which his incredulity might nourish itself.⁸ In the course of that week, his brethren made many attempts to rid him of his distrust.⁹ But all in vain; the more they insisted, the more he refused.¹⁰ The stronger they affirmed the proof to be, the more inflexible became his resolution to resist it.¹¹ The particulars of the manifold conversations and discussions which would, no doubt, go on between them, are not preserved.¹² All that is told is, that he took and kept resolutely to that position, behind which he had entrenched himself, as he said, "Except I shall see in his hands the print of the nails, and put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into his side, I will not believe."¹³ What were the grounds, real or fictitious, upon which this incredulity of Thomas rested? and how came that incredulity to take such a shape, and to embody itself in such a declaration?

Here, I think, by realizing distinctly the actual condition of things, both as regards the external circumstances which surrounded him, and the jaundiced eye with which he was disposed to look at them, we may convince ourselves that the incredulity of Thomas was not due to any reluctance, on his part, to believe in the resurrection, simply because of its being a strange, a supernatural occurrence.¹⁴ In that age, and in that country, this was a form of unbelief altogether rare, quite unlikely to have been exhibited by Thomas or any follower of Jesus Christ.¹⁵ A belief in the supernatural was general, almost universal.¹⁶ To withhold his belief in any occurrence, purely and solely because it was miraculous, would have made a man about as conspicuous then, as a belief in all the alleged miracles of ancient and modern times would make a man conspicuous now.¹⁷ Between that time and this, the world has undergone an entire revolution in the state of its general belief, in the form of its practical infidelity.¹⁸ Besides, even if there had been a large heaven of Sadduceism working originally in the mind of Thomas, he had already witnessed, in his attendance upon Christ, incidents too extraordinary for him to

refuse credence to the resurrection purely and solely on the ground of its singularity.¹⁹ Neither he, nor any others of the Lord's disciples—unwilling, as they all were at first, to believe that their Master was indeed alive again; difficult as they all were of conviction on this point—would have admitted their initial hesitation and incredulity to have proceeded from any such source.²⁰ It was not the character of the event, it was the nature of their precedent faith in, and their precedent expectations about, their Master and his kingdom, which generated the difficulty which was felt by them as to believing in the resurrection.²¹ The true fountain of their earlier incredulity lay within, and not without; in their prejudices in regard to other matters, not in the nature and circumstances of the resurrection.²² There appears to me, therefore, to be a violence done to the historic truth, to the real state of the case, when Thomas is taken, as he so often is, as a type or early instance of that unbelief, belonging rather to modern than to ancient times, which staggers at all miracles, and is indisposed to admit anything supernatural.

Thomas' incredulity seems to have outstripped that of all the other disciples.²³ They would not believe the Galilean women, when they brought to them the first reports of the resurrection; but they had believed when Peter told them that he had seen the Lord, even before they saw him with their own eyes.²⁴ But Thomas will not believe, though to Peter's testimony there is added that of the two disciples who went out to Emmaus, and that of the whole body of the disciples to whom Jesus had afterwards appeared.²⁵ To what is this excess, this peculiar obstinacy of unbelief on Thomas' part, to be attributed?²⁶ Was he the most prejudiced man among them; the man who clung most tenaciously to his earlier ideas and prepossessions, and would not let them go?²⁷ Did those common elements of unbelief, which operated in the breasts of the others as well as in his, yet work in his with so much greater force as to signalize him in this way, and keep him standing out in his distrust for so long a time beyond them?²⁸ There was one of those elements which we have some reason to think did work powerfully on Thomas.²⁹ It would be quite a mistake to conceive of Thomas, because of his abiding incredulity, that he was a cold, selfish, cautious, unsanguine, naturally misbelieving man, hard to convince of anything which lay outside the circle of his own observations, or that did not touch or affect his own interests.³⁰ Whatever in origin and nature his skepticism was, it was not the skepticism of religious indifference, nor did it spring from a predisposition to doubt.³¹ That the spirit of curiosity, of inquiry, was strong in him, we may perhaps infer from his breaking in upon our Lord's

discussion in the upper chamber, saying, "Lord, we know not which-
er thou goest, and how can we know the way?"³⁵ Fuller evidences that
he possessed and knew how to exercise the critical faculty. That he
liked to search and sift the evidence, and get at the real and solid
grounds for believing, will meet us presently; but we must dismiss
from our minds the idea that he answered in any way to the descrip-
tion which Wordsworth has given us of the man—

"A smooth-rubbed soul, to which could cling
No form of feeling, great or small;
A reasoning, self-sufficient thing,
An intellectual all in all."

³⁶The only other notice of him in the gospel narrative, besides the one
already alluded to, and that in the passage now before us, forbids us
to entertain any such ideas of Thomas' natural character and dispo-
sition.³⁷ Escaping out of the hands of his enemies, Jesus had retired
to Bethabara.³⁸ To him, in his retreat, the sorrowing sisters sent their
message: "Lord, behold, he whom thou lovest is sick."³⁹ The mes-
sengers were left without an answer.⁴⁰ And, after two days of delay
and inaction, Jesus abruptly says to his disciples, without explaining
anything of the object of his visit, "Let us go into Judaea again."⁴¹ It
seemed a fatal resolution; the disciples try to turn their Master from
acting on it.⁴² "Master," they say to him, "the Jews of late sought to
stone thee, and goest thou thither again?"⁴³ Their Master then tells
of the reason for his going, and of his resolution at all hazards to
carry out his intention.⁴⁴ Then, says one of the twelve, if he will go,
go to almost certain death, "let us also go, that we may die with him."⁴⁵
Had the name not been given, had we not been told which of them
it was who so instantly, so warmly, so generously declared himself
ready to die with his Master rather than desert him, we should have
said that it must have been Peter who spoke these words; but it was
Thomas, to whom much of Peter's ardor appears to have belonged.
⁴⁶ Upon such a man, so ardent in his attachment to his Master, we can
readily believe that the blow of the crucifixion came with a peculiarly
stunning force.⁴⁷ In proportion to the eagerness of his hopes would
be the blackness of his despair; nor is it wonderful that, sunk into
the depths of that despair, he would at first refuse to believe in the
resurrection.⁴⁸ Still, however, attribute what extra force we may to
this one or that other of the ingredients of the unbelief shown by
Thomas in common with his brethren, it seems difficult to understand
the pertinacity of Thomas in standing out so long and so stubbornly
against all attempts of his brethren to convince him.⁴⁹ The great bulk
of them had believed before they had seen the Lord.⁵⁰ Why should

that evidence, which was sufficient to carry their faith, not have
carried his?⁵¹ Yes, but they all at last had seen; they had seen, and he
had not.⁵² In that very distinction do we not get sight of the secret
bias by which the spirit of Thomas was swayed over to an unwilling-
ness to give credence to the resurrection, an incredulity which, in
self-justification, built up those buttresses of self-defence, behind
which it finally entrenched itself, and from which it would not be
dislodged?⁵³ The others had seen him, and he had not; why should
he be asked to believe on different evidence from theirs?⁵⁴ He had
been as attached a follower of Jesus as any of them.⁵⁵ Why should
he be singled out, and left the only one who had not seen his Mas-
ter?⁵⁶ He did not like, he did not choose to be indebted to others for
the grounds of his believing.⁵⁷ He had just as good a right to ocular
proof as they had; and, in fact, till he got it he would not believe.
⁵⁸ The unwillingness that his faith should be ruled by theirs, generated
a disposition to question the soundness of that faith.⁵⁹ The evangelist
has given us only the conclusion to which Thomas came, the result
of the many conferences with his brethren, and to which he for so
many days so resolutely adhered.⁶⁰ The very terms in which he em-
bodied this resolution enable us to fill up the blank.⁶¹ Jesus had come
among them, the other disciples would tell Thomas, suddenly, silently—
the door being shut; they had not seen him till he was standing
in the midst.⁶² It was very like the mode of a spirit's entrance; very
unlike the manner in which one clothed with a solid substantial
body would or could appear.⁶³ They confessed to Thomas, that unless
it were the two disciples who had just come in from Emmaus, all of
them at first believed that it was a spirit, none of them that it was
Christ: that he had himself noticed this, and had corrected their first
and false impression.⁶⁴ He had eaten in their presence, he had shown
them the marks in his hands and side; he had said, "Handle me, and
see; for a spirit hath not flesh and bones, as ye see me have."⁶⁵ Yes,
but had any of them accepted the invitation, had any of them made
such scrutiny of these marks, as to be sure that they were not super-
ficial?⁶⁶ They could not say they had.⁶⁷ Strictly interrogated by one
who was anxious to detect any weak point in the evidence, they could
not deny that it was within the limits of the possible that there might
have been a mistake; that there was a difference, they could not tell
what, between the appearance of their Master as they had seen him
before death, and as they saw him at the evening meeting.⁶⁸ Seizing
greedily upon anything which could possibly create a doubt, and
turning it into an instrument of self-justification, Thomas at last de-
clares, "Except I shall not only see in his hands the print of the

nails, but shall put my finger into the print of the nails, and thrust my hand into his side, I will not believe." ⁶⁹In this we discern no small amount of ingenious casuistry springing out of wounded pride, and an exaggerated feeling of self-consequence working in a nature not less strong in will than ardent in affection.

⁷⁰"I will not believe." ⁷¹And is it even thus, we feel disposed to make answer, 'that thy hurt vanity hopes to redeem itself from the fancied oversight; is it thus that placed, as thou thinkest, below thy brethren, by not having got the same proof given them, thou thinkest to set thyself right by putting thyself above them, and declaring that that proof may have been enough for them, but is not enough for thee?' ⁷²What right hast thou to ask a kind or amount of evidence above that which has satisfied all these thy brethren, and which would have satisfied any one unbiased by deep precedent prejudice? ⁷³What right hast thou to dictate thus to God, and to declare that thou wilt not believe till the form of proof thou prescribed be attended? ⁷⁴Thou wilt not believe! and if thou dost not, who but thyself will be the loser? ⁷⁵Hadst thou been in the hands of man, in any other hands than those of so gracious a Master, thou mightest have waited long enough ere the proof was given, which in such a spirit was demanded.

⁷⁶Seven days go past, and the apostles are once more gathered together on the evening of the second first-day of the week. ⁷⁷Thomas is with them now. ⁷⁸What brought him there? ⁷⁹Why, if he thought them wrong in rejoicing over an event, in the reality of which they had not sufficient reason to believe, did he join himself to their company? ⁸⁰Because, I believe, with all his assumed and declared incredulity, he was not in his inmost heart such an utter unbeliever as he would have others think he was. ⁸¹He had taken up a position which it behooved him to defend; but I am much mistaken, if a stronger desire, an expectation, nay, something even of a faith, that it was even as his brethren had told him, was not working latently, yet strongly in his breast. ⁸²We often grievously err in this respect, in our judgment or representations of others. ⁸³If a man is known or said to be a covetous or an ambitious man, we are too apt to make him all covetousness or all ambition, and nothing besides. ⁸⁴And so, Thomas being obstinately incredulous, we might imagine him to be utterly so. ⁸⁵Not at all likely. ⁸⁶There was room in him, as there is in most men, for very opposite and conflicting states of thought and emotion. ⁸⁷We believe, therefore, that it was in a very mixed state of faith and feeling that Thomas sat down that evening with the rest. ⁸⁸They have not sat long when again, in the very same way in which he had come before, Jesus

enters and stands before them. ⁸⁹The general salutation over, and before another word was spoken, he turns to Thomas and says, "Reach hither thy finger, and behold my hands; and reach hither thy hand, and thrust it into my side: and be not faithless, but believing." ⁹⁰How sudden, how unexpected the address! ⁹¹Thomas knew that for seven days none of the disciples had seen the Lord; none of them could have reported to him the words that he had used. ⁹²Yet now are these very words repeated. ⁹³It is the omniscient Jesus; it is his own well-loved Master who stands before him! ⁹⁴Instant within him is the rebound from incredulity to faith, to a far higher faith than that simply in the reality of the resurrection; of that he has no doubt. ⁹⁵He does not what the Lord desires, and what he himself desired before. ⁹⁶He does not put his finger into the print of the nails; he does not thrust his hand into the side. ⁹⁷Enough to see that well-known form; enough to hear that well-loved voice. ⁹⁸That sight, those words of Jesus, are sufficient to rebuke and to remove his unbelief. ⁹⁹In a moment his doubts all flee; faith takes their place; a faith purified, exalted, strengthened; a faith in the true divinity as well as in the true humanity of his risen Lord; a faith higher, perhaps, at that moment than that to which any of his brethren around had attained. ¹⁰⁰Adoring, believing, loving, the fervent, affectionate Thomas casts himself at his Master's feet, exclaiming, "My Lord and my God!"

¹⁰¹A great advance here, we may well believe, on all Thomas' earlier conceptions of his Master's character. ¹⁰²And may we not believe also that the bitter experience of the preceding week, the troubled exercises of thought through which he then had passed, the searchings of those Scriptures which it was reported to him had been quoted and commented on by Christ himself, had all been secretly preparing him to take this advancing step; to believe that the Messiah of ancient prophecy was a very different Being in character and office from what he had before imagined; much lowlier in some respects, much higher in others. ¹⁰³And now, all at once, the revelation of the Redeemer's glory bursts upon him as Jesus in person stands before him; and not only does all his former incredulity die away, but on its ruins there rises a faith which springs up all the higher and stronger, because of the pressure by which it had previously been kept in check. ¹⁰⁴Jesus knew how prepared Thomas was to call him Lord and God. ¹⁰⁵He then might be asked to do what to Mary was so emphatically forbidden. ¹⁰⁶"Touch me not," he said to her whose love to him had too much in it of the earthly, the human—too little of the spiritual, the divine. ¹⁰⁷"Reach hither thy hand," he said to

Thomas.¹⁰⁸ The invitation may be safely given to him who is ready to own the divinity of his Lord.

¹⁰⁹The title given him, conveying as it did so distinct and emphatic a testimony to that divinity, Jesus, at once, as if it were his by birth-right, accepts.¹¹⁰ But though he refuses not the tendered homage, he passes no such approving judgment on him who presents it, as he had formerly done upon Peter when he had made a like confession of his faith, and Christ had called him 'blessed.'¹¹¹ Instead of this, Christ administers now a mild but effective rebuke: "Thomas, because thou hast seen me, thou hast believed."¹¹² Blessed are they who have not seen, and yet have believed.¹¹³ Christ could not mean by saying so, to declare that he who believes without seeing is more blessed than he who upon sight believes: for that would exalt the weakest believer now above the strongest believer of Christ's own age.¹¹⁴ The idea that Jesus evidently intended to convey was this, that of two kinds of faith equally strong, that was to him a more acceptable, and to the possessor a more power-giving one, which rested on reasonable testimony in absence of personal observation, than that which would not yield to this kind of evidence, and demanded that ocular demonstration should be given.¹¹⁵ It was, in fact, as addressed to Thomas, a distinct enough yet delicate intimation, that his faith had been all the more acceptable to his Master if it had not been delayed so long.¹¹⁶ But though this was the primary meaning of the saying, it is not without its bearings upon those who, like ourselves, have not seen, and yet are called to believe.¹¹⁷ The spirit of Thomas still lives among us.¹¹⁸ Have we not often detected ourselves, thinking at least, if not saying, that, had we lived in the days of Jesus Christ, had we seen what those disciples saw, we would not have doubted as they did; that, give us but the evidence that they had, and our doubts would disappear?¹¹⁹ We practise thus a strange deception upon ourselves.¹²⁰ We transfer ourselves in fancy to those scenes of the gospel history, carrying with us all the ideas of our age, forgetting that very different were the ideas of the men of that generation, who, though they had the advantage of the sight, had the disadvantage of the prejudices of their country and their epoch.¹²¹ So equalized in point of advantage and responsibility do we believe the two periods to have been, that we may safely affirm, that the men of this generation who will not believe in the testimony of the original eye-witnesses, had they been of that generation, would not have believed though they had been eye-witnesses themselves.¹²² No who now says, I will not believe till I see, would not, even seeing, have then believed.

¹²³Two closing reflections are offered.¹²⁴First: Take this case of

Thomas, his throwing himself at once at his Master's feet, exclaiming, "My Lord, my God," as a most instructive instance of the exercise and expression of a true, loving, affectionate, appropriating faith.¹²⁵ It is outgoing, self-forgetting, Christ-engrossed.¹²⁶ No raising by Thomas of any question as to whether one who had been incredulous so long, would be unwelecome when at last he believed.¹²⁷ No occupation of mind or heart with any personal considerations whatever.¹²⁸ Christ is there before him; thought to be lost, more than recovered; his eye beaming with love, his encouraging invitation given.¹²⁹ No doubt about his willingness to receive, his desire to be trusted.¹³⁰ Thomas yields at once to the power of such a gracious presence, unshackled by any of those false barriers we so often raise; the full warm gushing tide of adoring, embracing, confiding love, goes forth and pours itself out in the expression, "My Lord, and my God!"¹³¹ Best and most blessed exercise of the spirit, when the eye in singleness of vision fixes upon Jesus, and, oblivious of itself, and all about itself, the abashed heart fills with adoration, gratitude, and love, and in the fulness of its emotion casts itself at the feet of Jesus, saying with Thomas, "My Lord, my God."

¹³²Second: Let us take this instance of our Lord's treatment of Thomas, as a guide and example to us how to treat those who have doubts and difficulties about the great facts and truths of religion.¹³³ There was surely a singular toleration, a singular tenderness, a singular condescension in the manner of the Saviour's conduct here towards the doubting, unbelieving apostle.¹³⁴ There was much about those doubts of Thomas affording ground of gravest censure; the bad *moral* of the heart had much to do with them.¹³⁵ It was not only an unreasonable, it was a proud, a presumptuous position he took up, in dictating the conditions upon which alone he would believe.¹³⁶ What abundant materials for controversy, for condemnation did his case supply!¹³⁷ Yet not by these does Jesus work upon him, but by love—by simply showing himself, by stooping over to comply with the conditions so unreasonably and presumptuously proscribed.¹³⁸ And if, in kindred cases—when the spirit of religious incredulity is busy in any human breast, doing there its unhappy work in blasting the inward peace—waiving all controversy we could but present the Saviour as he is, and get the eye to rest upon him, and the heart to take in a right impression of the depth and the tenderness and the condescension of his love, might not many a vexed spirit be led to throw itself down before such a Saviour, saying, "Lord, I believe; help thou mine unbelief?"

69 They hurry along the wild mountain road, plunging into dark glens, climbing over steep ridges, bending around shadowy hills, sometimes stepping from stone to stone, feeling the way in the dark with the pilgrim's staff, and sometimes slipping upon the smooth face of the steep ledges, and then losing the track in crossing the dry bed of a torrent. 70 I have myself more than once traveled as wild and rugged a mountain-path alone by night, and I know that Cleopas and his companion must have had light hearts to have started out upon that night journey to Jerusalem, without waiting for the moon to rise or the morning to dawn.

71 But they carried in their hearts tidings of the greatest victory ever gained in this world—the victory over death, the unbarring of the gates of the grave for the whole human race. 72 And well they might go, running when they could, climbing and descending with cautious step when they must, but rejoicing all the way. 73 For they were bearers of the best tidings that human lips ever told. 74 They could testify to a fact upon which all the hopes of man for eternity must depend.

75 Reaching the walls of the city at a late hour, they probably passed around to one of the eastern gates, which was kept open all night during the great festivities of the Jewish people. 76 Having gained admission, they hurry along the narrow streets, guided now by the light of the risen moon. 77 The doors are shut and the blank walls of the stone houses give no sign of life

within. 78 They make their way first of all, we may suppose, to that one memorable house with the upper chamber where Jesus spent the last evening with his disciples before he suffered. 79 Late as is the hour, they feel confident that the band will still be together. 80 The excitement of the day has been too great to let them think of sleep.

81 When they reach the door, they find it barred from within and they cannot enter. 82 They knock, but none reply. 83 They call aloud and announce their names, and then they hear steps and voices within, and the swift and cautious hands of their brethren unbarring the door. 84 But they have not had time to enter or to unburden their hearts of the great joy which they bring, before the voices of all within break out in the exclamation, "The Lord is risen indeed, and hath appeared unto Simon!" 85 And now, that all are within and the door is barred again, the excited and panting travelers take their turn and tell the wondrous story of the evening walk to Emmaus, the strange companion that joined them in the way, the burning words that he spoke as he climbed the hills and toiled along the steep stony path in their company, the blessing that he pronounced at the evening meal, the print of the nails that they plainly saw in his extended hands, the familiar looks of their beloved Lord shining out upon his face, and then his vanishing out of their sight.

86 They have scarcely finished their story, amid the wonder and joy of the listening throng, when, behold!

another stands in the midst of the room.⁸⁷ They are startled and terrified at the sudden apparition, even as they were when they saw the bright form walking upon the Sea of Galilee.⁸⁸ Every eye is fixed upon the stranger.⁸⁹ There has been no knocking without.⁹⁰ The door has not been unbarred.⁹¹ No sound of entering footsteps has been heard.⁹² And yet there he stands before the affrighted throng—a stranger, a spirit, a living man!⁹³ What can it be?⁹⁴ In the hush of silence which pervades the breathless group they hear a voice speaking as only their Lord could speak, and saying, "Peace be unto you."⁹⁵ Then he shows them his hands and his feet, and they lean forward with fear and wonder to look upon the print of the nails, the signs of sacrificial suffering which he wears even now upon the throne of heaven.⁹⁶ He lays bare his wounded side, and they shudder as they see the dreadful scar where the soldier thrust his spear.⁹⁷ He bids them draw near and lay their hands upon him, and thus be sure that it is his real living body which they see.⁹⁸ While they tremble and dare not approach, he calls for food and eats in their presence.⁹⁹ And now at last are they glad and satisfied that they see their Lord.¹⁰⁰ It is he that was nailed to the cross.¹⁰¹ It is Jesus himself, who died and was buried, and behold he lives and shall be alive for evermore.

¹⁰² And the first word which the risen Lord brings to the assembly of his disciples on this first night after his resurrection is "PEACE."¹⁰³ He stands forth in the

midst of the startled company with that blessing upon his lips.¹⁰⁴ And when they have recovered from their fear and excitement sufficiently to heed his words, he says again, "Peace be unto you."¹⁰⁵ His first appearance on earth was announced by angel voices with the same blessed word—peace.¹⁰⁶ And after he has completed his work and passed away from the world, he comes back from the grasp of death and the grave to bring the weary and the sorrowing the blessing of peace.¹⁰⁷ Peace to the troubled conscience, for the blood of the cross takes away the stain of sin from the penitent soul.¹⁰⁸ Peace to the weary and heavy-laden, for all who believe in Jesus shall enter into rest.¹⁰⁹ Peace to those who destroy their own happiness, for the love of Jesus reconciles the believing to God, to duty and to themselves.¹¹⁰ Peace to all troubled and restless and doubting and dissatisfied souls, for Jesus came to seek and to save the lost.¹¹¹ Peace to all to whom the message of his Gospel is given, for the risen Christ lives in his truth and he comes to breathe the blessing of his own Divine and abiding peace upon all who hear his word.¹¹² Jesus can enter the closed doors of the sanctuary and of the secret chamber.¹¹³ But he stands at the door of the heart and knocks and waits to be invited in.¹¹⁴ He knocks and knocks again.¹¹⁵ He waits and waits long.¹¹⁶ And many never invite him in.¹¹⁷ And yet the blessing of peace, for which every bosom longs, is never ours until we unbar our stony hearts and ask the waiting Saviour in.

APPENDIX E

Appearing here in Appendix E are biographical sketches of the authors of the major literary sources used in the 15 chapters of the Desire of Ages under review in this project. These authors in alphabetical order are: John Cumming, Alfred Edersheim, Frederic William Farrar, William Hanna, John Harris, Joseph Holt Ingraham, George Jones, Daniel March, Francis Wayland. All nine of these individuals were primarily nineteenth century figures.

As we perused some 500 works in the endeavor to find potential sources for the book Desire of Ages, we took some note of certain literary conventions practiced by the respective authors, namely whether or not other sources were evidently used and acknowledged. For the most part, acknowledgments were made, and/or credit was bestowed. For the sake of general interest we have included in these brief introductions some reference to how these authors handled the question of literary dependency. Perhaps these references could provide a starting point for comparing Ellen White's use of sources with the practices of her contemporaries.

The sources used in developing the following biographical sketches are listed at the close of this appendix.

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCHES OF MAJOR SOURCE AUTHORS FOR THE BOOK
DESIRE OF AGES

John Cumming, 1810-1881

A native of Aberdeenshire, Scotland, John Cumming was to become distinguished not only as a minister with popular appeal but also as a prolific, successful, and interesting author. His first pastorate was the Scottish Church in Crown Court, Covent-Garden, London. By the end of his life the sale of Dr. Cumming's works had exceeded the sale of the productions of any other theological writer of that day.

Of Cumming's more than 45 works we mention a few abbreviated titles: Apocalyptic Sketches; Lectures on the Seven Churches; On Christ's Miracles; On the Parables; On Daniel; The Finger of God; Christ our Passover; The Comforter; A Message from God; The Great Sacrifice; Christ Receiving Sinners; Is Christianity from God? Sabbath Readings; On Genesis; On Exodus; On Leviticus; Benedictions; Voices of the Day; Of the Night; Of the Dead; God in History; Infant Salvation; The Baptismal Font; Lectures for the Times; Christian Patriotism; The Communion Table; Almost Protestant; The Church before the Flood; Liberty.

When we consider the matter of giving credit to literary sources used, one might find the footnote on page 130 of Cumming's Minor Works; Second Series of significance. It says:

In the course of my lecturing on this parable, I received a note from a hearer, complaining I had not acknowledged my obligations to Trench. The answer is, Trench and I are both very deeply indebted to Olshausen.

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

In certain works, such as Sabbath Readings on the New Testament, he provided notes and gave credit for his quotations. In his lectures on prophetic studies on Daniel (also true of his approach in other works), Dr. Cumming addressed himself to the multitudes of common people rather than to the scholars--apparently because of his intense interest in sharing the gospel with the many rather than the few.

Alfred Edersheim, 1825-1889

Alfred Edersheim was born in Vienna to wealthy German Jewish parents. He gained his higher education at the universities of Vienna and Berlin and at New College, Edinburgh. He studied under Hengstenberg and Neander in Berlin. He mastered three languages, English, German, and Hebrew--the latter giving him a firm background from which he could draw as he composed books on Jewish social life, the temple and its services in the time of Christ, and other topics. Under the tutelage of Dr. John Duncan, a Scottish Presbyterian pastor in Pest, Edersheim was converted to Christianity. At the age of 24 he became a minister of the Free Church, Old Aberdeen. Later in his ministerial career he took orders in the Church of England and was vicar of Loders at Dorsetshire, 1876-1883. At Oxford in 1886 he was appointed as Grinfield lecturer on the Septuagint.

Through the years Edersheim was becoming brilliant in

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

Oriental scholarship. After he had written several works on the Jewish world, its life, literature, and human affairs, he launched into preparing a two-volume work entitled The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah, which took him years to complete. In some opinions that finished work was considered superior to the best of German works of its kind to that date. As far as higher criticism was concerned he was conservative; he was faithful to defend soteriology with the atonement and resurrection as components, also inspiration of God's Word, and supernaturalism. The following is a fine commendation of his accomplishments:

Dr. Edersheim is a Hebrew Christian, who believes that Jesus is the Christ the son of God, and all his Hebrew learning--which is great--is used strictly for the setting-forth of this great theme. . . . He has thrown light on many obscure points in the gospel history, and he has written the history of the time between the closing of the Old Testament and the opening of the New as it was never written before.--Spectator, lvii, 286.

Over twenty works were the result of Edersheim's labors. Some of the abbreviated titles are as follows: History of the Jewish Nation; History of the Old Covenant; Commentary on Matthew; Heart Converse with Jesus in the Psalms; History of Elisha; The Temple, its Ministry, and Services in the Time of Christ; The World before the Flood, and the History of Patriarchs; Sketch of Jewish Social Life in the Days of Christ; The Exodus and the Wanderings in the Wilderness; Israel in Canaan under . . .; History of Judah . . .; Life and Times of Jesus, the Messiah (1884); Prophecy and History in Relation to the Messiah.

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

Frederic William Farrar, 1831-1903

Frederic William Farrar, though of English descent, was born in Bombay, India. London and Cambridge were the centers sought for his education. He became a distinguished churchman, in fact, one of the most eloquent of English pulpit orators. Also he was chaplain to the Queen and of the House of Commons. As school administrator he became headmaster of Marlborough College. In his church career he became canon of Westminster in 1875 and dean of Canterbury twenty years later.

Farrar's diversified and prolific writings by the 1870s had won him a name. He published in 1874 a life of Christ. This pleasing work had a fresh approach, which had been enhanced by his using all his vacations between school terms over four years in touring Palestine to gather helpful data. In this work he added touches of psychological insights, and he let shine his faith in the Christ of the Book.

The works of Farrar were on theology, education, philology, and other subjects. A few titles are: Life of Christ; Seekers after God; Witness of History to Christ; The Silence and the Voices of God; Eternal Hope; Lives of the Fathers. For a few years in the late 1870s Farrar courageously published a series of controversial sermons questioning eternal punishment. His productions in philological studies won for him his election to the Royal Society.

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

William Hanna, 1808-1882

Educated at Edinburgh University, and ordained to the gospel ministry in 1835, William Hanna became pastor of a Scottish Free Church. In the course of time he was editor of the North British Review, and biographer of Dr. Thomas Chalmers, his father-in-law. In the 1860s he published a life of Christ, in six volumes, which turned out to be the most ambitious work of its nature for the decade. (The American Tract Society published all six parts in one volume about the time Hanna had finished the final segment.) This work was devotional and practical, and struck a new note of historical sensitivity. A tour of Palestine in 1863 furnished Dr. Hanna with a reservoir of ideas from which he could write and recapture ancient "time and place," such as might have figured in the life of Christ. Thus he dealt in both antiquarian theology and orthodox theology--no doubt appealing to and reassuring those readers who had a "measure of faith."

Regarding his work on the life of Christ, Dr. Hanna apparently availed himself of the best critical helps in establishing gospel harmony. He did not deem it necessary to burden the pages with references to every single authority he had consulted. However, he did cite three writers for helps on the "original and inspired records," and he did give proper credit for quotations.

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

John Harris, 1804-1856

John Harris was born at Ugborough, Devonshire, in 1804. His college career as a student of divinity began at Hoxton in 1823. For a number of years his preaching pastorate was at Epsom. Apparently he was a nonconformist as a minister. In 1837 he became professor of theology in Chestnut College. At another time in his life he was principal of New College, St. John's Wood, London.

As an author Dr. Harris attained a wide celebrity both in Europe and America. A few of the titles, in some cases abbreviated, of his books are as follows: The Great Teacher (1835), The Christian Citizen; Witnessing Church; The Condition and Claims of Seamen; Mammon; or, Covetousness the Sin of the Christian Church; The Divided Church Made One; The Great Commission; The Pre-Adamite Earth; Man Primeval; Patriarchy.

Harris' book, The Great Teacher, is largely thematic. He makes no references to sources he might have used. Dr. Heman Humphrey, president of Amherst College, wrote the Introduction; and Harris himself, the Preface.

Joseph Holt Ingraham, 1809-1860

Born in Portland, Maine, and being the grandson of a wealthy shipbuilder, Joseph Ingraham's early interests centered around going to sea for travel. Before the age of seventeen he left for South America, and found himself there for several exciting revolutions. He began writing for

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

newspapers at age twenty, and in two or three years was professor of languages at Jefferson College, Washington, Mississippi. That early in life, as novelist and romanticist, Ingraham's publications were multitudinous.

After traveling much between the North and the South in the United States, Ingraham married and seems to have settled in the Southern states. After his confirmation in the Protestant Episcopal Church (1847) he established a school for young ladies near Nashville, Tennessee. From 1852 to 1858 he had clerical duties in connection with several churches in turn. In 1859 he was appointed to the pulpit of Christ Church, apparently in close connection with St. Thomas Hall, a local school for boys at which he had become principal a year earlier.

Some of Ingraham's very popular semi-Biblical works or religious romances were (abbreviated): The Prince of the House of David; or, Three years in the Holy City; The Pillar of Fire; or, Israel in Bondage; The Throne of David: From the Consecration of the Shepherd of Bethlehem to the Rebellion of Prince Absalom. These were written in letter-form.

George Jones, 1800-1870

George Jones was born on a farm near York, Pennsylvania. Later he attended Yale College where he graduated in 1823; he stayed to receive his A.M. in 1826. Thereafter his experience was interspersed with teaching,

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

navigation duties, tutoring at Yale, being rector of the Episcopal Church, Middletown, Connecticut, serving as chaplain on the United States, flagship of the Mediterranean Squadron, and on other expeditions. Subsequently he was commissioned chaplain, 1833. After marriage in 1837 he still continued as a naval chaplain. During a five-year period he was able to accomplish effective temperance work for various crews. In 1851 he became the first chaplain of the United States Naval Academy. From time to time he took leaves of absence for naval expeditions to China, Japan, and Ecuador. After retirement at age 62, Jones would do voluntary duty as chaplain and nurse, especially during the Civil War.

Jones was also an author, and his last two books were Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels (1865), and Life-Scenes from the Old Testament (1868).

Daniel March, 1816-1891

Born in 1816 at Millbury, Massachusetts, Daniel March later attended Yale and graduated from there in 1840. His ordination to the gospel ministry was five years thereafter, and he was put in charge of certain churches, Presbyterian and Congregational.

Some of the religious works by March that we reviewed were: Walks and Homes of Jesus; Night Scenes in the Bible; Days of the Son of Man; Our Father's House; From Dark to Dawn; Home Life in the Bible; Lessons in the Life of Joseph.

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

Dr. March had a colorful style and his books contained geographical descriptions and details that reflect his careful scholarship. However, it was interesting for us to note in perusing several of his works that he did not identify his sources. In fact, in the Preface to Walks and Homes he made this comment:

It has not been thought necessary or appropriate, in a purely practical work, to assign reasons or authorities for a few assumptions that have been made, such as that Tabor is the mount of the Transfiguration, . . .

In the composition of the following pages an attempt has been made to look upon our Lord as he was seen by the men of his time, and to combine with that view the more mature and instructed impressions which spring from faith in his redeeming work and his divine nature.

Francis Wayland, 1796-1865

In some opinions, Francis Wayland was one of the most eminent "divines" and philosophers. Of English parentage, he was born in New York City. He graduated from Union College, Schenectady, 1813, and took up the study of medicine. In the years, 1816-1817, he studied theology at Andover. As both clergyman and educator, he spent some time tutoring, as well as teaching mathematics and natural philosophy at Union College, and pastoring the First Baptist Church in Boston (1821-1826). He was for many years (1827-1855) president of Brown University. From Brown University he returned to the ministry, taking a pulpit in Providence.

We list here some of the abbreviated titles of his works: The Moral Dignity of the Missionary Enterprise;

Major Source Authors Biographical Sketches

Duties of an American Citizen; Elements of Moral Science; Of political Economy; Moral Law of Accumulation; Limitations of Human Responsibility; Thoughts on the Present Collegiate System in the United States; Domestic Slavery Considered as a Scriptural Institution; Memoirs of Harriet Ware; Of the Life and Labours of the Rev. Adoniram Judson; Elements of Intellectual Philosophy; Sermons to the Churches; Salvation by Christ (1859); The Ministry of the Gospel; Memoirs of . . . Thomas Chalmers.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

(for above sketches)

Allibone, S. Austin. A Critical Dictionary of English Literature and British and American Authors, 3 vols. (Philadelphia, Penn.: J. B. Lippincott Co., 1897, 1898).

American Authors 1600-1900 A Biographical Dictionary of American Literature, 1 vol., edited by Stanley J. Kunitz and Howard Haycraft (New York: H. W. Wilson Co., 1938).

Dictionary of American Biography, 20 vols., Supplement, 2 vols., Index, 1 vol., edited by Dumas Malone (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1933).

Kirk, John Foster. A Supplement to Allibone's Critical Dictionary, 2 vols. (Philadelphia, Penn.: J. B. Lippincott Co., 1897).

The Lincoln Library of Language Arts, 2 vols. (Columbus, Ohio: The Frontier Press Co., 1969).

Pals, Daniel L. The Victorian "Lives" of Jesus (San Antonio, Texas: Trinity University Press, 1982), 223 pp.

GENERAL SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

The general bibliography which follows lists the sources used or cited in the writing of the research report.

GENERAL SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Beardslee, William A. Literary Criticism of the New Testament. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1970.

Bible Echo and Signs of the Times, The. Melbourne, Victoria: Australian Branch of the International Tract and Missionary Society, 1886-1903.

Brinsmead, Robert D. Judged by the Gospel: A Review of Adventism. Fallbrook, CA: Verdict Publications, 1980.

Canright, D. M. Public Notice. Michigan Christian Advocate, October 8, 1887. Cited by Nichol, Francis D. Ellen G. White and her Critics. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1951.

Cottrell, Raymond F. "The Literary Relationship Between The Desire of Ages, by Ellen G. White and The Life of Christ, by William Hanna," Part I. Unpublished manuscript, Nov. 1, 1979.

Couperus, Molleurus. "The Bible Conference of 1919." Spectrum, Vol. 10, Number 1 (1979 May), pp. 23-57.

Crandall, Alan. "In Defense of Ellen White." Evangelica, December, 1980, p. 37.

Dart, John. "Plagiarism Found in Prophet Books." Los Angeles Times, October 23, 1980.

Davis Letter Book, Marian. White Estate, Washington, D. C.

E. G. White Concordance Word List. Bakersfield, CA: Select Video Products, 1983.

Ellen G. White Concordance. Select Video Products. St. Paul, Minnesota: 3M, 1982.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

The Ellen G. White Estate Incorporated. Comprehensive Index to the Writings of Ellen G. White, Volumes 1-3. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1963.

Ellen G. White Health Reformer Articles. Second edition. Payson, AZ: Leaves-of-Autumn Books, 1979.

"Ellen White's Use of Sources"/"There Simply Is No Case." Interview with Attorney Vincent L. Ramik about Ellen G. White and her Writings. Adventist Review, September 17, 1981, pp. 3-6.

Fannie Bolton Story, The. Collection of Source Documents. Ellen G. White Estate, Washington, D. C., April, 1982.

"Fundamental Beliefs." Adventist Review, May 1, 1980, pp. 25, 26.

General Conference Department of Education. Fundamentals of Christian Education. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Nashville, TN: Southern Publishing Association, 1923.

General Conference E. G. White Letter Book, 1898-1900. Unpublished White Estate Document, Washington, D. C.

Graybill, Ronald D. "E. G. White's Literary Work, An Update." Annotated transcript, talks at General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, Washington, D. C., Nov. 15-19, 1981.

Graybill, Ronald D. The Power of Prophecy: Ellen G. White and the Women Religious Founders of the Nineteenth Century. Doctoral dissertation. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University, 1983.

Graybill, Ronald D., and Robert W. Olson, compilers. "Exhibits Relating to the Writing of The Desire of Ages." White Estate Document, Washington, D. C., May 23, 1979.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Graybill, Ronald D., Warren H. Johns, and Tim Poirier. "A Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries." Second Revised Edition. White Estate Document, Washington, D. C., January, 1983.
- Graybill, Ronald D., Warren H. Johns, and Tim Poirier. "Henry Melvill and Ellen G. White: A Study in Literary and Theological Relationships." White Estate Document, Washington, D. C., April, 1982.
- Gregg, Alice Elizabeth. "The Unfinished Story of Fannie Bolton and Marian Davis, Part 1: Fannie's Folly," Adventist Currents, October, 1983, pp. 24-27, 34, 35.
- Gregg, Alice Elizabeth. "The Unfinished Story of Fannie Bolton and Marian Davis, Part 2: Marian the 'Bookmaker,'" Adventist Currents, February, 1984, pp. 23-25, 29.
- Guthrie, Donald. New Testament Theology. Leicester, England: Inter-Varsity Press, 1981.
- Hackleman, Douglas. "GC Committee Studies Ellen White's Sources." Spectrum, Vol. 10, Number 4 (1980 March), pp. 9-15.
- Jarnes, Norman. Unpublished documents. Fallbrook, California: Verdict Publications, n.d.
- Jemison, T. Housel. A Prophet Among You. Mountain View, California: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1955.
- Johns, Warren H. "Ellen White: Prophet or Plagiarist?" Ministry, June, 1982, pp. 5-19.
- McAdams, Donald R. "Ellen G. White and the Protestant Historians." Unpublished manuscript, 1974. Revised, 1977.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- McAdams, Donald R. "Shifting Views of Inspiration: Ellen G. White Studies in the 1970s." Spectrum, Vol. 10, Number 4 (1980 March), pp. 27-41.
- Morrison, E. M. Unpublished letter of August 24, 1896. White Estate Document File 89, Washington, D. C.
- Nichol, Francis D. Ellen G. White and Her Critics. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1951.
- Numbers, Ronald L. Prophetess of Health: A Study of Ellen G. White. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, 1976.
- Olson, Robert W. "Ellen G. White's Use of Uninspired Sources." White Estate Document, April 10, 1980.
- Olson, Robert W. How the Desire of Ages Was Written. Washington, D. C.: Ellen G. White Estate, 1979.
- Olson, Robert W. One Hundred and One Questions on the Sanctuary and on Ellen White. Washington, D. C.: Ellen G. White Estate, 1981.
- Ostling, Richard N., Jim Castelli, and Dick Thompson. "The Church of Liberal Borrowings." Time, August 2, 1982, p. 49.
- Pals, Daniel L. The Victorian "Lives" of Jesus. San Antonio, Texas: Trinity University Press, 1982.
- Paxton, Geoffrey. The Shaking of Adventism. Wilmington, Delaware: Zenith publishers, Inc., 1977.
- Perrin, Norman. What Is Redaction Criticism? Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1969.
- Perry, Alfred M. "The Growth of the Gospels." The Interpreter's Bible, Vol. VII. New York City, New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1981.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Peterson, William S. "Ellen White's Literary Indebtedness."
Spectrum, Autumn, 1971, pp. 73-84.

Rea, Walter T. "Ellen G. White and Contemporary Authors."
Claremont Dialogue, Vol. 2, Number 2 (1965), pp.
27-36.

Rea, Walter T. The White Lie. Turlock, California: M &
R Publications, 1982.

Robertson, A. T. Harmony of the Gospels. New York: Harper
and Row, 1922.

Robertson, John J. The White Truth. Mountain View, CA:
Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1981.

Robinson, D. E. The Story of Our Health Message.
Nashville, Tennessee: Southern Publishing
Association, 1943.

Sandmel, Samuel. "Parallelomania." JBL, LXXXI, 1962, pp.
1-13.

Schweitzer, Albert. The Quest of the Historical Jesus.
Translated by W. Montgomery. London: A. and C.
Black, Ltd., 1910.

Spangler, J. R. "Ellen White and Literary Dependency."
Ministry, June, 1980.

Specht, Walter F. "The Literary Relationship Between The
Desire of Ages, by Ellen G. White and The Life of
Christ, by William Hanna," Part II. Unpublished
manuscript, 1979.

Synopsis of the Four Gospels. Edited by Kurt Alaud. United
Bible Societies, 1982.

Seventh-day Adventist Bible Commentary. Volume 5. Edited
by Francis D. Nichol. Washington, D. C.: Review
and Herald Publishing Association, 1956.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. The Adventist Home. Compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Nashville, TN: Southern Publishing Association, 1952.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. The Colporteur Evangelist. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1920.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Colporteur Ministry. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1953.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Ellen G. White Present Truth and Review and Herald Articles. Volumes 1-6. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1962.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Ellen G. White Signs of the Times Articles. Volumes 1-4. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1974.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Our High Calling. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald, 1961.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Selected Messages. Book I. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1958.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Selected Messages, Book III. A compilation of Ellen G. White writings. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1980.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Preface to facsimile edition, Spiritual Gifts, Volume 3, by Ellen G. White (Battle Creek, MI: Steam Press, 1864). Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1945.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Trustees of Ellen G. White Publications. The Story of Redemption. From earlier writings of Ellen G. White. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1947.
- Trustees of the Ellen G. White Publications. Ellen G. White Youth's Instructor Articles. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1986.
- White, Arthur L. Ellen G. White: The Early Years Volume 1 . . . ; The Lonely Years Volume 3; The Australian Years Volume 4 . . . ; The Later Elmshaven Years Volume 6. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1981, . . . 1986.
- White, Arthur L. "The Ellen G. White Historical Writings." Series in Adventist Review, July 12, 19, 26, & Aug. 2, 9, 16, & 23, 1979.
- White, Arthur L. "Ellen G. White's Portrayal of the Great Controversy Story." Supplement to the reprint edition, The Spirit of Prophecy, Vol. 4, by Ellen G. White (Oakland, CA: Pacific Press, 1884). Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1969, pp. 507-549.
- White, Arthur L. The Ellen G. White Writings. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1973.
- White, Arthur L. "Toward an Adventist Concept of Inspiration." Series in Adventist Review, Jan. 12, 19, 26, & Feb. 2, 1978.
- White, Ellen G. Acts of the Apostles. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1911.
- White, Ellen G. "Caiaphas." Manuscript 102, 1897 (Sept. 26). White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. "The Causes of the Jewish Rejection of Christ." Manuscript 24, 1891 (March). White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- White, Ellen G. "Christ at Nazareth." Diary Book 14, 1889-1890, pp. 73-77. White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)
- White, Ellen G. Christ Our Saviour. Adapted for young readers. New York: International Tract Society, 1896.
- White, Ellen G. "Christ's Humiliation." Diary Book 14, 1890, pp. 272-295. White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)
- White, Ellen G. "Christ's Mission to Earth." Manuscript 143, 1897 (Dec. 9). White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Christ's Object Lessons. Washington, D. C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1941; c., 1900.
- White, Ellen G. "Condemned by the Jews." Manuscript 104, 1897. White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. The Desire of Ages. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1940; c., 1898.
- White, Ellen G. The Desire of Ages "working" draft, chapters 1-39. Unpublished document, White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Diary Book 17, 1891, pp. 98-100. White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)
- White, Ellen G. Diary Book 18, 1894, pp. 43, 45. White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)
- White, Ellen G. Diary Book 32, 1899, pp. 1-37, 39-48. White Estate, Washington, D. C. (Handscript.)

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

White, Ellen G. Education. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1952; c., 1903.

White, Ellen G. Gospel Workers. Early edition. Battle Creek, MI: Review and Herald Publishing Co., 1892.

White, Ellen G. The Great Controversy Between Christ and Satan. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1911.

White, Ellen G. "In the Judgment Hall." Manuscript 51, 1897 (May 20). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. "Judas." Manuscript 28, 1897 (Apr. 22). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. "Judas." Manuscript 120, 1897 (Oct. 27). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. "The Ladder to Heaven." Manuscript 13, 1884. White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. La Vie de Jesus-Christ notre Seigneur (French); or The Life of Jesus Christ our Saviour. Basel, Switzerland: S. D. A. Publishing House, 1887.

White, Ellen G. Letter 1a, 1872 (to L). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. Letter 54, 1874 (Oct. 24), to Brother Lee. White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. Letter 4, 1889 (July 23), to Brethren Miller. White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. Letter 47, 1893 (Oct. 25), to W. W. Prescott. White Estate, Washington, D. C.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

- White, Ellen G. Letter 43, 1895 (June 14), to J. H. Kellogg. White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Manuscript 9, 1896. White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. The Ministry of Healing. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1942; c., 1905.
- White, Ellen G. "The Ordinances of the Lord's House." Manuscript 35, 1897 (April 6). White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. "Our Substitute and Surety." Manuscript 111, 1897 (Oct. 7). White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Patriarchs and Prophets. Battle Creek, MI: Review and Herald Publishing Co., 1890. .
- White, Ellen G. "Peril of Doubt and Unbelief." Manuscript 40, 1887. White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Redemption [Leaflets]. Eight pamphlets. Battle Creek, MI: Steam Press, 1877, 1874, & 1878.
- White, Ellen G. "The Remission of Sins." Manuscript 149, 1897 (Dec. 1). White Estate, Washington, D. C.
- White, Ellen G. Sketches from the Life of Paul. Facsimile reproduction. Battle Creek, MI: Review and Herald, 1883.
- White, Ellen G. The Spirit of Prophecy. Volume II. Facsimile reproduction. Battle Creek, MI: Steam Press, 1877.
- White, Ellen G. The Spirit of Prophecy. Volume III. Facsimile reproduction. Battle Creek, MI: Steam Press, 1878.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

White, Ellen G. Spiritual Gifts. Volumes I and II. Facsimile reproduction. Battle Creek, MI: Steam Press, 1858.

White, Ellen G. Spiritual Gifts. Volumes III and IV. Facsimile reproduction. Battle Creek, Michigan: Steam Press, 1864.

White, Ellen G. Steps to Christ. Battle Creek, MI: Review and Herald Publishing Co., 1896.

White, Ellen G. Thoughts from the Mount of Blessing. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1955; c., 1896.

White, Ellen G. "The True High Priest." Manuscript 101, 1897 (Sept. 26). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, Ellen G. "The Walk to Emmaus." Manuscript 113, 1897 (Oct. 14). White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White Estate, The Ellen G. "Documents Available." The White Estate Office, May 1, 1985.

White, James and Ellen G. Life Sketches, Ancestry, Early Life, Christian Experience, and Extensive Labors of Elder James White and His Wife, Mrs. Ellen G. White. Battle Creek, Michigan: Steam Press, 1880.

White Letter Book, W. C. Unpublished documents, The White Estate, Washington, D. C.

White, W. C. "Addresses to Faculty and Students at the 1935 Advanced Bible School." The White Estate Office.

Wilson, Neal C. Address published in Adventist Review, July 11, 1985, p. 18.

Wood, Kenneth H. "This Work Is of God, or It Is Not." Adventist Review, Sept. 17, 1981, pp. 13, 14.

WORKS REVIEWED

The bibliography of works reviewed has been divided into several divisions. The first section contains the lives of Christ surveyed. Section II lists the commentaries and general reference works. The sermons and devotional literature are alphabetized in the third and final grouping.

Many of these volumes contributed nothing to our search for literary parallels. Some, however, gave indication of possible or even probable use, even though very little was found by way of literary parallels for the 15 chapters in this study. In order to identify how these works may be viewed in respect to the parallels located in the 15 chapters and to further literary analysis, a special notation system appears in the left margin. The numbers in the brackets should be interpreted as follows: [1] indicates a major source for the DA text according to our analysis of the 15 chapters (Several works so noted appear to have been used as major sources for other chapters of DA.); [2], a minor literary source; [3], a probable source but more study is required to establish clear dependency; [4], a possible source. There are striking similarities but a cursory examination revealed no apparent literary parallels for the 15 chapters under review (though we were keeping in mind other DA chapters and pre-DA materials as well).

A second schedule of identification keys may be found in the brackets which follow the individual bibliographic entry. This series of notations reflect the symbols used in A Bibliography of Ellen G. White's Private and Office Libraries, compiled by Warren H. Johns, Tim Poirier, and Ron Graybill. The keys are:

- [A] - From inventory of EGW private library
- [B] - From inventory of EGW office library
- [C] - Listed in C. C. Crisler's collection
- [H] - Contains EGW handwritten signature
- [()] - An inventory listing of a work containing office or private library bookplate
- [R] - Requested by Ellen G. White or her "bookmaker" by correspondence
- [N] - Unstamped books published before 1916 in White Estate possession but not on inventory lists
- [ww] - Designation for the whole work not just for the article named
- [O] - EGW had other work(s) by the same author

WORKS REVIEWED

I. Lives of Christ

- [3] Abbott, John S. C. The History of Christianity: Consisting of the Life and Teachings of Jesus of Nazareth; the Adventures of Paul and the Apostles; and the Most Interesting Events in the Progress of Christianity, from the Earliest Period to the Present Time (Boston: B. B. Russell, 1872), 504 pp. [B]

Abbott, Lyman. A Life of Christ Founded on the Four Gospels and Illustrated by Reference to the Manners, Customs, Religious Beliefs, and Political Institutions of His Times (New York: Harper & Brothers, Franklin Square, 1882), 534 pp.

- [4] Adams, Charles C. Life of our Lord Jesus (New York: No. 11 Bible House. Charles F. Roper, 1878), 407 pp. [O]

- [3] Anderson, John L. The Messiah: A Narrative of the Life and Death, Resurrection and Ascension of our Lord; in the Chronological Order of the Four Gospels (London: John Murray, 1864), 830 pp.

- [2] Andrews, Samuel J. The Life of our Lord upon the Earth Considered in its Historical, Chronological, and Geographical Relations (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1891), 651 pp. [B]

- [3] Angus, Joseph. Christ Our Life: in its Origin, Law, and End (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1853), 336 pp. [N]

Avancinus, Nicholas. Meditations on the Life and Doctrine of Jesus Christ, Vol. I (translated from the German Edition of John Evangelist Zollner by F. E. Bazalgette); (London: Burns and Oates, 1875), 411 pp.

Lives of Christ

- Balfern, W. P. Glimpses of Jesus; or, Christ Exalted in the Affections of His People, 2nd ed. (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), 259 pp.
- Ballou, Hosea. Notes on the Parables, or the New Testament, Scripturally Illustrated and Argumentatively Defended, Vol. II, 6th ed. (Boston: A. Tompkins, 1852; c. 1804), 297 pp.
- Barrett, George S. The Temptation of Christ (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1884), 243 pp.
- [4] Beecher, Henry Ward. The Life of Jesus, the Christ, Volume I (New York: J. B. Ford & Co., 1871), 387 pp. [O]
- [4] Beecher, Henry Ward. The Life of Jesus the Christ, Volume II. Later Scenes (bound together with Volume I. Earlier Scenes); (New York: E. B. Treat, 1896, c. 1891), 292 pp. [O]
- [2] Bennett, James. Lectures on the History of Jesus Christ, 2 vols., 2nd ed. (London: F. Westley & A. H. Davis, 1828); 602 pp. & 627 pp., respectively.
- [4] Blunt, Henry. Lectures upon the History of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ (Philadelphia: H. Hooker, 1851), 360 pp. [O]
- [4] Blunt, Henry, Lectures upon the History of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ; Delivered during Lent, 1833, at the Church of the Holy Trinity, Upper Chelsea. Part I, 10th ed. (London: J. Hatchard & Son; Piccadilly: Hamilton, Adams & Co., 1843), 293 pp. [O]
- [4] Blunt, Henry, Lectures upon the History of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ; Delivered during Lent, 1833, at the Church of the Holy Trinity, Upper Chelsea. Part II, 8th ed. (London: J. Hatchard & Son; Piccadilly: Hamilton, Adams & Co., 1843), 307 pp. [O]

Lives of Christ

- [4] Blunt, Henry, Lectures upon the History of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ; Delivered during Lent, 1833, at the Church of the Holy Trinity, Upper Chelsea. Part III, 7th ed. (London: J. Hatchard & Son; Piccadilly: Hamilton, Adams & Co., 1843), 249 pp. [O]

Bonaventure, S. The Life of Christ (translated and edited by W. H. Hutchings); (London: Rivingtons, 1881), 337 pp.

- [4] Briggs, Charles Augustus. The Messiah of the Gospels (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1894), 337 pp. [O]

Brown, John. Discourses and Sayings of our Lord Jesus Christ, Illustrated in a Series of Expositions, 2 vols. (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855); 646 pp. & 599 pp., resp.

Burton, N. S. Christ's Acted Parables. A Study of the Miracles (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, n.d.), 256 pp.

Calderwood, Henry. The Parables of our Lord Interpreted in View of their Relations to Each Other (London: Macmillan & Co., 1881), 452 pp.

Campbell, William M. Foot-Prints of Christ (New York & London: Funk & Wagnalls, 1889), 375 pp.

Caspers, A. The Footsteps of Christ (translated from the German by Adelaide E. Rodham; edited, with a preface, by Charles H. H. Wright); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1871), 434 pp.

Christmas, Henry. Scenes in the Life of Christ, 3rd ed. (London: Smith, Elder, & Co., 1853), 191 pp.

Lives of Christ

- [4] Clark, Rufus W. The True Prince of the Tribe of Judah; or, Life Scenes of the Messiah (Boston: Albert Colby & Co., 1860), 355 pp.
- Clodd, Edward. Jesus of Nazareth: Embracing a Sketch of Jewish History to the Time of His Birth (London: C. Kegan Paul & Co., 1880), 386 pp.
- Crafts, W. F., ed. Talks to Boys and Girls about Jesus, with Bible Links to Make a Complete and Chronological Life of Christ for the Young (New York: Funk & Wagnalls Co., 1881), 381 pp. [O]
- [4] Crosby, Howard. Jesus: His Life and Work as Narrated by the Four Evangelists (New York: University Publishing Company, 1871), 551 pp. [O]
- [4] Culross, James. John, Whom Jesus Loved (London: Morgan and Scott, n.d.), 244 pp. [B]
- [2] Cumming, John. Foreshadows. Lectures on our Lord's Miracles (Philadelphia: Lindsay and Blakiston, 1854), 378 pp. [O]
- [3] Cumming, John. Foreshadows. Lectures on our Lord's Parables (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1856), 379 pp. [O]
- [2] Cumming, John. The Life and Lessons of our Lord, Unfolded and Illustrated, new ed. (London: John F. Shaw & Co., n.d.), 616 pp. [O]
- [1] Cumming, John. Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. John (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co.; Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett, Proctor, & Worthington, 1856), 464 pp. [A]
- [4] Cumming, John. Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Luke (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co.; Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett & Proctor, 1855), 476 pp. [O]

Lives of Christ

- [4] Cumming, John. Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Mark (London: Arthur Hall, Virtue & Co., 1860), 266 pp. [O]

- [2] Cumming, John. Sabbath Evening Readings on the New Testament. St. Matthew. (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co.; Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett, Proctor, & Worthington, 1855), 423 pp. [O]

Cummings, Joseph. "The Last Supper of the Lord." In Remarkable Characters and Places of the Holy Land: Comprising an Account of Patriarchs, Judges, Prophets, Apostles, Women, Warriors, Poets, and Kings . . . (edited by Charles W. Elliott); (Hartford, Conn.: J. B. Burr & Company, 1867), pp. 499-508. [B, ww]

- [2] Deems, Charles F. Who Was Jesus? [same book, under different title: The Light of the Nations; New York: Gay Brothers & Co., 1884]; (New York: J. Howard Brown, 1880), 756 pp.

- [4] Didon, Father. Jesus Christ, 2 vols. (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner, & Co. Ltd., 1893), 493 pp. & 481 pp., resp.

- [2] Dods, Marcus. The Gospel of St. John, 2 vols. (edited by W. Robertson Nicoll for The Expositor's Bible); (New York: Hodder & Stoughton, or George H. Doran Co., n.d.), 388 pp. & 427 pp., resp. [B]

- [4] Dods, Marcus. The Parables of our Lord (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1886), 276 pp. [A, (B)]

Dover, T. B. The Hidden Word. Thirty Devotional Studies of the Parables of our Lord (London: Swan Sonnenschein, Lowrey & Co., 1887), 200 pp.

Dover, T. B. The Ministry of Mercy. Thirty-three Devotional Studies of the Gospel Miracles (London: Swan Sonnenschein, Le Bas & Lowrey, 1886), 220 pp.

Lives of Christ

Drummond, D. T. K. The Parabolic Teaching of Christ; or, the Engravings of the New Testament (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1856), 440 pp.

Dupin, Andre Marie. Jesus before Caiaphas and Pilate: Being a Refutation of Mr. Salvador's Chapter Entitled "The Trial and Condemnation of Jesus" (translated from the French by John Pickering); (New York: American Tract Society, 1867), 86 pp.

[4] Eddy, Zachary. Immanuel; or, the Life of Jesus Christ our Lord, from His Incarnation to His Ascension (Springfield, Mass.: W. J. Holland & Co., 1868), 752 pp.

[1] Edersheim, Alfred. The Life and Times of Jesus the Messiah, 2 vols. (New York: E. R. Herrick & Co., 1886), 696 pp. & 828 pp., resp. [B]

[4] Edersheim, Alfred. The Temple: Its Ministry and Services as They Were at the Time of Jesus Christ (New York: Hodder & Stoughton, n.d.), 414 pp. [B]

Ellicott, C. J. Historical Lectures on the Life of our Lord Jesus Christ, Being the Hulsean Lectures for the Year 1859. With Notes, Critical, Historical, and Explanatory (Boston: Gould and Lincoln, 1863), 382 pp. [O]

[4] Ewald, Heinrich. The Life of Jesus Christ (translated and edited by Octavius Glover); (Cambridge: Deighton, Bell, & Co., 1865), 364 pp. [O]

Fairbairn, A. M. Studies in the Life of Christ, 3rd ed. (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1882), 359 pp.

[1] Farrar, Frederic W. The Life of Christ (New York: Hurst & Co., 1874), 752 pp. [A]

Lives of Christ

- [2] Fleetwood, John. The Life of our Lord and Saviour
DA Jesus Christ: Containing a Full and Accurate
[1] History from His Taking upon Himself our Nature to
pre- His Crucifixion, Resurrection and Ascension,
DA Together with the Lives, Transactions, and
Sufferings of his Holy Evangelists, Apostles, and
other Primitive Martyrs. Also, A History of the
Jews (Philadelphia: J. W. Bradley, 1860), 541 pp.
[A]

Fleetwood, John. The Lives of the Apostles, 2nd vol.
[bound with 1st vol., The Life of Christ]; [title
page, missing], pp.427-785. [O]

- [4] Foote, A. L. R. Closing Scenes in the Life of Christ;
Being Sequel to "Incidents in the Life of our
Saviour" (London: James Nisbet and Co., 1862),
320 pp.

Foote, A. L. R. Incidents in the Life of our Saviour,
Illustrative of His Divine Character and Mission,
3rd ed. (London: James Nisbet and Co., 1856), 381
pp.

Foster, Charles. The Story of the Gospel; or, our
Saviour's Life on Earth Told in Words Easy to Read
and Understand (Philadelphia: Charles Foster
Publishing Co., n.d.), 366 pp.

Furness, W. H. A History of Jesus (Boston: William
Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1850), 291 pp.

Furness, W. H. Jesus (Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott
& Co., 1871), 223 pp.

Furness, W. H. Jesus and His Biographers; or the
Remarks on the Four Gospels (Philadelphia: Carey,
Lea & Blanchard, 1838), 450 pp.

Furness, W. H. Jesus, the Heart of Christianity
(Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott & Co., 1879), 84
pp.

Lives of Christ

- [2] Geikie, Cunningham. The Life and Words of Christ (New York: United States Book Company, successors to [1]preDA John W. Lovell Co., n.d.), 812 pp. [A]

Gilbert, George Holley. The Student's Life of Jesus (Chicago: Chicago Theological Seminary, 1896), 411 pp.

Goebel, Siegfried. The Parables of Jesus: A Methodical Exposition (translated by Professor Banks); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1883), 455 pp.

Green, Samuel G. Bible Sketches and their Teachings for Young People (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1888), 319 pp. [O]

- [3] Greenhough, J. G. The Apostles of our Lord (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1904), 278 pp. [B]

- [4] Guthrie, Thomas. The Parables Read in the Light of the Present Day (New York: E. B. Treat & Co., 1873), 278 pp. [O]

Habershon, Ada R. The Study of the Parables (New York: Charles C. Cook, n.d.), 366 pp.

- [2] Hall, Joseph. Scripture History; or Contemplations on the Historical Passages of the Old and New Testaments (abridged by George Henry Glasse); [another edition of 602 pp., in 1868]; (New-York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 516 pp. [A]

- [1] Hanna, William. The Life of Christ (New York: American Tract Society, 1863), 861 pp. [B, H]

- [1] Harris, John. The Great Teacher: Characteristics of our Lord's Ministry (with an introductory essay by Heman Humphrey); (Amherst: J. S. & C. Adams, 1836), 444 pp. [B, C, H]

Lives of Christ

Hase, Carl. Life of Jesus. A Manual for Academic Study (translated from the German by James Freeman Clarke); (Boston: Walker, Wise, & Co., 1860), 267 pp.

Hoge, William J. Blind Bartimeus; or, the Story of a Sightless Sinner, and his Great Physician (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1859), 257 pp.

Howson, J. S. Meditations on the Miracles of Christ (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1871), 296 pp.

Hutchison, John. Our Lord's Signs in St. John's Gospel. Discussions Chiefly Exegetical and Doctrinal on the Eight Miracles in the Fourth Gospel (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1892), 237 pp.

[1] Ingraham, J. H. The Prince of the House of David; or, Three Years in the Holy City (Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1888; c. 1859), 472 pp. [0]

The Jesus of History (London & Edinburgh: Williams & Norgate, 1869), 426 pp.

[1] Jones, George. Life-Scenes from the Four Gospels, 3rd ed. (Philadelphia: J. C. Garrigues & Co., 1868), 443 pp. [A, H]

Keach, Benjamin. An Exposition of the Parables, and Express Similitudes of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ. . ., in four books (London: W. H. Collingridge, 1856), 904 pp.

Keim, Theodor. The History of Jesus of Nazara. Considered in its Connection with the National Life of Israel, and Related in Detail. Vol. II (translated from the German by E. M. Geldart); (London & Edinburgh: Williams & Norgate, 1876), 404 pp. [0]

Lives of Christ

- Keim, Theodor. The History of Jesus of Nazara. Considered in its Connection with the National Life of Israel, and Related in Detail. Vol. III (translated by Arthur Ransom); (London &c.: Williams & Norgate, 1877), 408 pp. [O]
- Keim, Theodor. The History of Jesus of Nazara. Considered in its Connection with the National Life of Israel, and Related in Detail. Vol. IV (translated by Arthur Ransom); (London &c.: Williams & Norgate, 1879), 346 pp. [O]
- Keim, Theodor. The History of Jesus of Nazara. Considered in its Connection with the National Life of Israel, and Related in Detail. Vol. V (translated by Arthur Ransom); (London &c.: Williams & Norgate, 1881), 343 pp. [O]
- Keim, Theodor. The History of Jesus of Nazara. Considered in its Connection with the National Life of Israel, and Related in Detail. Vol. VI (translated by Arthur Ransom); (London & Edinburgh: Williams & Norgate, 1883), 450 pp. [B]
- [2] Kennedy, William S. Messianic Prophecy, and the Life of Christ, 2nd ed. (Andover: Warren F. Draper; Boston: Gould & Lincoln; New York: John Wiley; Philadelphia: Smith, English & Co., 1860), 484 pp. [B]
- [2] Kirk, Edward Norris. Lectures on the Parables of our Saviour (New York: R. Craighead, 1857), 506 pp. [B, C, H]
- [3] Kitto, John. Daily Bible Illustrations: Being Original Readings for a Year on Subjects from Sacred History, Biography, Geography, Antiquities, and Theology. Vol. VII: The Life and Death of our Lord (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1881 [also, an 1853 ed.]), 433 pp. [C]

Lives of Christ

- [2] Krummacher, Friedrich Wilhelm. The Suffering Saviour; or, Meditations on the Last Days of Christ (translated by Samuel Jackson); (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855), 474 pp. [0]

Laidlaw, John. The Miracles of our Lord. Expository and Homiletic (New York & Toronto: Funk & Wagnalls Company, 1892), 384 pp.

Lang, J. Marshall. The Last Supper of our Lord and His Words of Consolation to the Disciples (New York: Macmillan & Co., 1882), 258 pp.

- [2] Lange, Johann P. The Life of the Lord Jesus Christ: A Complete Critical Examination of the Origin, Contents, and Connection of the Gospels, 4 vols. (edited, with additional notes, by Marcus Dods); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1872), 544 pp., 504 pp., 512 pp., 502 pp., resp. [0]

- [4] Leask, W. The Footsteps of Messiah: Review of Passages in the History of Jesus Christ (New York & Philadelphia: William S. Martien, 1847), 351 pp.

Ligny, Father Francis de. The History of the Life of our Lord Jesus Christ, from His Incarnation until His Ascension, Denoting and Incorporating the Words of the Sacred Text from the Vulgate. Also, the History of the Acts of the Apostles (translated from the French . . . by Mrs. F. Sadlier); (New York: D. & J. Sadlier & Co., 1853), 749 pp.

Mac Donald, George. The Miracles of our Lord (London: Strahan & Co., 1870), 280 pp.

- [4] Macduff, John Ross. Brighter than the Sun; or, Christ the Light of the World (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1878), 433 pp. [0]

- [4] Macduff, John Ross. The Footsteps of St Peter: Being the Life and Times of the Apostle (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1876), 632 pp. [0]

Lives of Christ

- Macduff, John Ross. Memories of Bethany (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1864), 268 pp. [O]
- [4] Macduff, John Ross. Memories of Gennesaret (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1858), 388 pp. [O]
- [1] Macduff, John Ross. Memories of Olivet (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1868), 373 pp. [A, B, C]
- Macduff, John Ross. Noontide at Sychar; or, the Story of Jacob's Well. A New Testament Chapter in Providence and Grace (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1869), 268 pp. [O]
- Macduff, John Ross. Parables of the Lake or the Seven Stories of Jesus by the Sea of Galilee. A Sunday Book for Young Readers (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1885), 202 pp. [O]
- Macduff, John Ross. Story of Bethlehem. A Book for the Young (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1859), 202 pp. [O]
- Mackenzie, W. Douglas. The Revelation of the Christ. Familiar Studies in the Life of Jesus (London: The Sunday School Union, 1896), 303 pp.
- [4] Macmillan, Hugh. The Marriage in Cana of Galilee (London: Macmillan & Co., 1882), 262 pp. [O]
- [2] Macmillan, Hugh. Our Lord's Three Raisings from the Dead (Glasgow: James Maclehose, 1876), 338 pp. [A, (B), H]
- [2] March, Daniel. Days of the Son of Man (Philadelphia: J. C. McCurdy & Co., 1882), 685 pp. [O]
- [1] March, Daniel. Walks and Homes of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1866), 339 pp. [B]

Lives of Christ

[2] March, Daniel. Days of the Son of Man (Philadelphia: J. C. McCurdy & Co., 1882), 685 pp. [O]

[1] March, Daniel. Walks and Homes of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, 1866), 339 pp. [B]

[3] McWherter, Leroy. The King of Glory or the Most Important Events in the Life of Jesus Christ with their Precious and Practical Lessons to Humanity (Nashville, Tenn.: Southwestern Publishing House, 1884), 256 pp.

Mendenhall, J. W. Echoes from Palestine (Cincinnati: Walden & Stowe, 1883), 736 pp. [B, C]

Morison, John Hopkins. Scenes from the Life of Jesus (Boston: Crosby, Nichols, & Co., 1852), 137 pp.

[3] Neander, Augustus. The Life of Jesus Christ in its Historical Connexion and Historical Developement (translated from the fourth German edition by John McClintock & Charles E. Blumenthal); (New York: Harper & Brothers, n.d.), 450 pp. [B, C]

[3] Nevin, Alfred. The Parables of Jesus (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1881), 503 pp. [A]

[2] Nicoll, W. Robertson. The Incarnate Saviour. A Life of Jesus Christ (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1881), 388 pp.

Patton, William. Jesus of Nazareth: Who Was He? And What Is He Now? (New York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 320 pp.

[3] Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies from the New Testament Covering the International Sunday-School Lessons for 1890 (New York & Chicago: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1889), 391 pp. [B, C]

Lives of Christ

- [2] Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments Covering the International Sunday-School Lessons for 1888 (New York & Chicago: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1887), 343 pp. [B, C]

- [2] Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments Covering the International Sunday-School Lessons for 1889 (New York & Chicago: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1888), 403 pp. [B, C]

Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies: I. Studies in the Pentateuch; II. Studies in the Life of Christ. The International Sunday-School Lessons for 1894 (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1893), 416 pp. [B, C]

- [3] Pentecost, George F. The Birth and Boyhood of Jesus (New York: American Tract Society, 1896), 399 pp. [O]

- [4] Pentecost, George F. Israel's Apostasy and Studies from the Gospel of St. John Covering International Sunday-School Lessons for 1891 (New York & Chicago: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1890), 405 pp. [B, C]

Power, Philip Bennett. The Feet of Jesus in Life, Death, Resurrection, and Glory (London: Hamilton, Adams, & Co., 1872), 315 pp. [O]

- [4] Pressense, Edmond Dehault de. Jesus Christ: His Times, Life and Work (London: Jackson, Walford, & Hodder, 1866), 560 pp. [O]

Renan, M. Ernest. The Life of Jesus (Garden City, New York: Dolphin Books, Doubleday & Co., Inc., 1863), 317 pp.

Schauffler, W. G. Meditations on the Last Days of Christ; Together with Eight Meditations on the Seventeenth Chapter of John (London: Sampson Low, Son & Co.; Cleveland, Ohio: Jewett et al; Boston: J.P. Jewett & Co., 1853), 439 pp.

Lives of Christ

- Scrymgeour, William. Lessons on the Life of Jesus. Handbooks for Bible Classes and Private Studies (edited by Alexander Whyte & John Kelman); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, n.d.), 232 pp.
- Smith, William, ed. The New Testament History. With an Introduction, Connecting the History of the Old and New Testaments (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1876), 780 pp. [A]
- [4] Stalker, James. The Life of Jesus Christ, new, revised ed. (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., n.d.), 167 pp. [O]
- Stanford, Charles. The Evening of our Lord's Ministry Being Preludes to 'Voices from Calvary' (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1886), 331 pp.
- Stanford, Charles. From Calvary to Olivet. Being a Sequel to 'Voices from Calvary' (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 352 pp.
- Stapfer, Edmond. Jesus Christ before His Ministry (translated by Louise Seymour Houghton); (London: Richard D. Dickinson, 1897), 182 pp.
- Steinmeyer, F. L. The History of the Passion and Resurrection of our Lord Considered in the Light of Modern Criticism, new, revised ed. (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1879), 398 pp.
- Steinmeyer, F. L. The Miracles of our Lord in Relation to Modern Criticism (translated from the German by L. A. Wheatley); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1875), 274 pp.
- Strauss, David Friedrich. The Life of Jesus, Critically Examined, 3 vols. (translated from the 4th German ed.); (London: Chapman, Brothers, 1846), 423 pp., 454 pp. & ? pp., resp.
- [4] Strickland, William P. The Light of the Temple (Cincinnati: J. Ernst, 1854), 288 pp. [B, H]

Lives of Christ

Sumner, John Bird. The Parables of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ: with the Practical Exposition . . . (London: C. Cox, 1850), 372 pp.

Talmage, Dr., ed.(?) The Lost Books of the Bible Being All the Gospels, Epistles, and Other Pieces Now Extant Attributed in the First Four Centuries to Jesus Christ, His Apostles and their Companions . . . (bound with: The Forgotten Books of Eden); (New York: The World Syndicate Publishing Co., 1926), 293 pp.

Talmage, T. DeWitt. From Manger to Throne Embracing a New Life of Jesus the Christ, and a History of Palestine and its People (Philadelphia: Historical Publishing Co., 1890), 656 pp.

Taylor, Jeremy. The History of the Life and Death of Jesus Christ, new, revised ed. (London: Routledge, Warne, and Routledge, 1860), 714 pp. [B]

[4] Taylor, William M. The Boy Jesus and other Sermons (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1893), 301 pp. [O]

Taylor, William M. The Gospel Miracles in their Relation to Christ and Christianity (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co., 1880), 249 pp. [O]

Taylor, William M. The Miracles of our Saviour Expounded and Illustrated, 5th ed. (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1906), 449 pp. [O]

[3] Taylor, William M. The Parables of our Saviour Expounded and Illustrated, 13th ed. (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1904; c. 1886), 445 pp. [B, H]

Thompson, Joseph P. Jesus of Nazareth: His Life for the Young (Boston: James R. Osgood & Co., 1876), 438 pp.

Lives of Christ

- [4] Trench, Richard Chenevix. Notes on the Miracles of our Lord (London: Macmillan & Co., 1866), 485 pp.
[O]

- [3] Trench, Richard Chenevix. Notes on the Parables of our Lord (New-York: D. Appleton & Co., 1855), 425 pp.
[A, B, C]

Weiss, Bernhard. The Life of Christ, Vol. I
(translated by M. G. Hope); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1894), 393 pp.

Weiss, Bernhard. The Life of Christ, Vol. II
(translated by M. G. Hope); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1894), 403 pp.

Weiss, Bernhard. The Life of Christ, Vol. III
(translated by M. G. Hope); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1892), 428 pp.

Williams, Henry W. The Incarnate Son of God: or, the History of the Life and Ministry of the Redeemer, Arranged, Generally, according to Greswell's Harmony of the Gospels; with a Concise View of the Mediatorial Economy (London: J. Mason, 1853), 384 pp.

- [1] Wylie, James A. Scenes from the Bible (Glasgow & London: William Collins, Sons, & Co., 1867), 352 pp. [A]

Young, John. The Christ of History: An Argument Grounded in the Facts of His Life on Earth (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855), 260 pp.

II. Commentaries, Reference Works &c.

Aids to Religious Teaching. Lessons on the Acts of the Apostles. . . , 5th ed. (London: Church Extension Association, 1895), 272 pp.

- [3] Barnes, Albert. Notes, Explanatory and Practical, on the Gospels: Designed for Sunday School Teachers and Bible Classes. Volume I (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1860; c. 1832), 414 pp. [A]

- [3] Barnes, Albert. Notes, Explanatory and Practical, on the Gospels: Designed for Sunday School Teachers and Bible Classes. Volume II (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854; c. 1832), 413 pp. [A]

Bengel, John Albert. Gnomon of the New Testament. Volume I: The Gospels (edited by Blackley & Hawes, from the 1866 ed.); (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1893), 743 pp.

- [3] Bickersteth, Edward. A Scripture Help, Designed to Assist in Reading the Bible Profitably (New-York: A. Works, J. Macfarlan, 1828), 209 pp. [B]

Breed, David R. A History of the Preparation of the World for Christ (Chicago: Young Men's Era Publishing Co., 1891), 388 pp. [O]

Briggs, Charles Augustus. Messianic Prophecy; the Prediction of the Fulfilment of Redemption through the Messiah. A Critical Study of the Messianic Passages of the Old Testament in the Order of their Development (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1886), 519 pp. [B]

- [4] Brown, David. "Matthew - Romans" Vol. II. New Testament. Part of A Commentary, Critical and Explanatory, on the Old and New Testaments by Robert Jamieson, A. R. Fausset, & David Brown. (Hartford, Conn.: S. S. Scranton & Co., 1872). Vol. II, 605 pp.

Commentaries & Reference Works &c.

Brown, John. The Sufferings and Glories of the Messiah: an Exposition of Psalm XVIII., and Isaiah, LII. 13 - LIII. 12 (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1853), 352 pp.

Cadman, James P. The Four in One. Christ in the Gospels; or, the Life of our Lord in the Words of the Evangelists; American Revision, A. D. 1881, 6th ed. (with an Introduction by P. S. Henson); (Chicago: American Publication Society of Hebrew, 1886), 378 pp. [A]

- [4] Clarke, Adam. Clarke's Commentary. The New Testament of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ. . . . Volume I.--Matthew to the Acts, new ed. (New York & Nashville: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, n.d.; c. 1810-1825, ww), 920 pp. [B, C]

Edersheim, Alfred. The Bible History, Volume I. The World before the Flood, and the History of the Patriarchs (Boston: Bradley & Woodruff, n.d.), 190 pp. [B]

Edersheim, Alfred. The Bible History, Volume II. The Exodus and the Wanderings in the Wilderness (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1876), 200 pp. [B]

Edersheim, Alfred. The Bible History, Volume III. Israel in Canaan under Joshua and the Judges (Boston: Bradley & Woodruff, 1877), 191 pp. [B]

Edersheim, Alfred. Prophecy and History in Relation to the Messiah (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co., 1885), 369 pp. [B]

- [3] Edersheim, Alfred. Sketches of Jewish Social Life in the Days of Christ (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1876), 342 pp. [O]

Commentaries & Reference Works &c.

- [4] Elliott, Charles W. Remarkable Characters and Places of the Holy Land: Comprising an Account of Patriarchs, Judges, Prophets, Apostles, Women, Warriors, Poets, and Kings. With Descriptions of Ancient Cities and Venerated Shrines (Hartford, Conn.: J. B. Burr & Co., 1867), 640 pp. [B]

- [4] Fairbairn, Patrick. The Typology of Scripture: Viewed in Connection with the Entire Scheme of the Divine Dispensations. Volume II, 3rd ed. (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1857), 508 pp. [B, C]

Fleetwood, John. History of the Holy Bible, from the Creation of the World to the Incarnation of our Lord Jesus Christ (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855), 683 pp. [O]

Geikie, Cunningham. The Holy Land and the Bible. A Book of Scripture Illustrations Gathered in Palestine, 2 vols. (New York: John B. Alden, 1888), 656 pp., ww. [O]

Geikie, Cunningham. New Testament Hours, Vol. I. The Gospels (Hartford, Conn.: The S. S. Scranton Co., 1914; c. 1894 by James Pott & Co.), 500 pp. [O]

Hall, John, compiler & author of an Introduction for: The Earthly Footprints of our Risen Lord. Illumined. A Continuous Narrative of the Four Gospels according to the Revised Version (New York & Chicago: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1891), 450 pp. [R]

- [3] Henry, Matthew. An Exposition of the Old and New Testaments: Wherein each Chapter Is Summed Up in its Contents; the Sacred Text Inserted at Large, . . . with Practical Remarks and Observations, Volume V, new ed. (edited by George Burder & Joseph Hughes); (Philadelphia: Towar & Hogan, 1828), 960 pp. [A]

Commentaries & Reference Works &c.

Jennings, David. Jewish Antiquities: Or, a Course of Lectures on the Three First Books of Godwin's Moses and Aaron. To Which Is Annexed a Dissertation of the Hebrew Language (London: Thomas Tegg & Son, 1837), 541 pp.

Josephus, Flavius. Josephus with an English Translation by Louis H. Feldman, in Ten Volumes. VIII: Jewish Antiquities, Books XV-XVII; IX: Jewish Antiquities, Books XVIII-XIX (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press; London: William Heinemann Ltd, 1981). [A, B, C; wwl]

Keith, Alexander. Evidence of the Truth of the Christian Religion Derived from the Literal Fulfilment of Prophecy; Particularly as Illustrated by the History of the Jews, and by the Discoveries of Recent Travellers (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 395 pp. [B, C]

[2] Kitto, John. Daily Bible Illustrations: Being Original Readings for a Year, on Subjects from Sacred History, Biography, Geography, Antiquities, and Theology. Volume I: Antediluvians and Patriarchs (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1850), 407 pp. [C]

Kitto, John. The History of Palestine from the Patriarchal Age to the Present Time; with Introductory Chapters on the Geography and Natural History of the Country, and on the Customs and Institutions of the Hebrews (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1851), 426 pp. [C]

Kitto, John. The Land of Promise; a Topographical Description of the Principal Places in Palestine, and of the Country Eastward of the Jordan: Embracing the Researches of the Most Recent Travellers (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 328 pp. [C]

Krummacher, Friedrich Wilhelm. Elijah the Tishbite (translated from the German); (New-York: American Tract Society, 1836), 458 pp. [A, B, C]

Commentaries & Reference Works &c.

Lightfoot, J. B. On a Fresh Revision of the English New Testament (London & New York: Macmillan & Co., 1872), 259 pp. [B, C]

Maurice, Frederick Denison. The Prophets and Kings of the Old Testament (London & New York: Macmillan & Co., 1894; c. 1852), 495 pp. [O]

- [3] Nevin, John W. A Summary of Biblical Antiquities; for the Use of Schools, Bible-Classes and Families (Spine Title: Biblical Antiquities); (Philadelphia: American Sunday-School Union, 1849), 447 pp. [R]

Noble, W. F. P. Holy Men of Old. Biographies of . . . Together with some Account of the Early Christian Churches (Philadelphia: H. C. Watts & Co., 1876), 538 pp. [B, C]

- [2] Porter, Josias L. The Giant Cities of Bashan; and Syria's Holy Places (New-York: Thomas Nelson & Sons, 1883), 377 pp. [B, C, R]

Riehm, Edward. Messianic Prophecy: Its Origin, Historical Character, and Relation to New Testament Fulfilment (translated from the German by John Jefferson); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1876), 266 pp.

Robinson, Thomas. "Dr. Robinson's Account of the Temple." In Remarkable Characters and Places of the Holy Land: Comprising an Account of Patriarchs, Judges, Prophets, Apostles, Women, Warriors, Poets, and Kings . . . (edited by Charles W. Elliott); (Hartford, Conn.: J. B. Burr & Co., 1867), pp. 423-36. [O; B, wwl]

- [2] Smith, William, ed. A Dictionary of the Bible Comprising its Antiquities, Biography, Geography and Natural History (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., n.d.), 778 pp. [A, B, C]

Commentaries & Reference Works &c.

Stanley, Arthur Penrhyn. The History of the Jewish Church . . ., 3 vols. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1882), 572 pp., 656 pp., 549 pp., resp. [B, C]

Stevenson, John. Christ on the Cross. An Exposition of the Twenty-Second Psalm (New York: Robert Carter, 1846), 345 pp.

Stowe, Harriet Beecher. Woman in Sacred History: A Series of Sketches Drawn from Scriptural, Historical, and Legendary Sources (New York: J. B. Ford & Co., 1874).

Ward, Henry Dana. History of the Cross: The Pagan Origin, and Idolatrous Adoption and Worship, or the Image (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1872), 100 pp. [B, C]

Westcott, Brooke Foss. Introduction to the Study of the Gospels with Historical and Explanatory Notes (New York: Macmillan & Co., 1887), 476 pp.

Whitelaw, Thomas. The Gospel of St. John: An Exposition Exegetical and Homiletical, for the Use of Clergymen, Students, and Teachers (Glasgow: James Maclehose & Sons, 1888), 464 pp.

III. Sermons, Devotional Works &c.

- Abbott, Jacob. The Corner-Stone, or a Familiar Illustration of the Principles of Christian Truth (Boston: William Peirce, 1835), 360 pp.
- Adams, Nehemiah. Christ a Friend: Thirteen Discourses (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1856), 290 pp.
- Adams, William. Conversations of Jesus Christ with Representative Men (New York: American Tract Society, 1868), 290 pp.
- Alexander, L. "Christians the Light of the World. A Sermon Preached in the Poultry Chapel, . . ." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 318-24.
- Anderson, James S. M. Discourses on Elijah, and John the Baptist (London: J. G. & F. Rivington, 1735) 373 pp. [B]
- Andrewes, Father Lancelot. Ninety-six Sermons, Vol. I, new ed. (reprinted from editions in 1631, 1641, 1661); (Oxford: John Henry Parker, 1865), 462 pp.
- Andrewes, Father Lancelot. Ninety-six Sermons, Vol. III, new ed. (reprinted from editions in 1631, 1641, 1661); (Oxford & London: James Parker & Co., 1870), 406 pp.
- [4] Armistead, Jesse S. "The Work of the Holy Spirit on the Hearts of Men." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), pp. 3-16.
- Arthur, Timothy Shay. Golden Grains from Life's Harvest Field (Philadelphia: J. W. Bradley, 1850), 240 pp. [O]
- [4] Arthur, Timothy Shay. Steps Towards Heaven; or, Religion in Common Life (New York: Derby & Jackson, 1858), 403 pp. [A]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Arthur, Timothy Shay, ed. Words of Cheer for the Tempted, the Toiling, and the Sorrowing (Philadelphia: H. C. Peck & Theo. Bliss, 1857), 300 pp. [A]

Baldwin, Maurice S. Life in a Look, 3rd ed. (New York & Chicago: Fleming H. Revell, n.d.), 104 pp.

Barnes, Albert. The Atonement, Relations to Law and Moral Government (Philadelphia: Parry & McMillan, Successors to A. Hart, late Carey & Hart, 1859), 358 pp. [O]

[4] Baxter, Richard. A Call to the Unconverted to Turn and Live (New-York: The American Tract Society, 1825), 159 pp. [A]

Baxter, Richard. Treatise on Conversion (New York: The American Tract Society, n.d.), 408 pp. [O]

[2] Beecher, Charles. Redeemer and Redeemed, an Investigation of the Atonement and of Eternal Judgment (Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1864), 357 pp. [B, H]

Beecher, Henry Ward. "The Sifting of Peter by Satan." In Remarkable Characters and Places of the Holy Land: Comprising an Account of Patriarchs, Judges, Prophets, Apostles, Women, Warriors, Poets, and Kings . . . (edited by Charles W. Elliott); (Hartford, Conn.: J. B. Burr & Co., 1867), pp. 521-32. [O; B, ww]

Bethune, George W. "Christ at the Door." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 85-96.

Bickersteth, Edward Henry. The Rock of Ages, or Scripture Testimony to the One Eternal Godhead of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost, new, revised ed. (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 182 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Bickersteth, Edward Henry. Water from the Well-Spring, for the Sabbath Hours of Afflicted Believers: Being a Complete Course of Morning and Evening Meditations for Every Sunday in the Year (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1853), 254 pp. [0]
- Blaikie, William Garden. The Public Ministry and Pastoral Methods of our Lord (London: James Nisbet and Co., 1883), 347 pp. [0]
- Bogue, David. Essay on the Divine Authority of the New Testament (New-York: The American Tract Society, n.d.), 252 pp. [N]
- [4] Bonar, Horatius. The Blood of the Cross. (Philadelphia: William S. and Alfred Martien, 1858), 43 pp. [0]
- [4] Bonar, Horatius. The Everlasting Righteousness; or, How Shall Man Be Just with God? (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1873), 211 pp. [0]
- [3] Bonar, Horatius. Family Sermons [a later 1954 ed.: Fifty-two Sermons]; (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1863), 464 pp. [0]
- [4] Bonar, Horatius, ed. "God's Purpose of Grace." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (selected from the "Kelso Tracts"); (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 12 pp. [0]
- [4] Bonar, Horatius. God's Way of Holiness (Chicago: Moody Press, 1970), 128 pp.; (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1865), 261 pp. [0]
- [3] Bonar, Horatius. Light and Truth: or, Bible Thoughts and Themes. The Gospels (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1874), 422 pp. [0]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [3] Bonar, Horatius, ed. "Luther's Conversion." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (selected from the "Kelso Tracts"); (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 8 pp. [O]

- [4] Bonar, Horatius. The Morning of Joy; Being a Sequel to the Night of Weeping (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1852), 220 pp. [A]

Bonar, Horatius. The Rent Veil (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1875), 184 pp. [O]

Bonar, Horatius, ed. "The Sin-Bearer." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (selected from the "Kelso Tracts"); (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 12 pp. [O]

Bonnet, L. The Family of Bethany; or, Meditations on the Eleventh Chapter of the Gospel according to St. John, 12th ed. (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1848), 316 pp.

Bowen, George. Daily Meditations (with an Introductory Notice by William Hanna); (Edinburgh: David Douglas, 1885), 488 pp.

- [2] Boyd, Robert. The World's Hope; or, the Rock of Ages (Chicago &c.: H. S. Goodspeed & Co., 1873), 700 pp. [(A), B]

Briggs, Charles Augustus. The Messiah of the Apostles (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1895), 562 pp. [O]

Bright, William. The Incarnation as a Motive Power, Sermons by William Bright (London: Rivingtons, Waterloo Place; New York: E. & J. B. Young & Company, 1889), 283 pp.

Broadus, John A. Jesus of Nazareth. I. His Personal Character. II. His Ethical Teachings. III. His Supernatural Works, 2nd ed. (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1890), 105 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Brookes, James H. The Christ (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1893), 287 pp.

- [4] Brown, Peter. "Christ's Last Words on the Cross." In Sermons by Congregational Ministers (London: James Paul, 1855), pp. 239-246.

Bruce, Alexander Balmain. The Humiliation of Christ, in its Physical, Ethical, and Official Aspects, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1881), 455 pp.

Bruce, Alexander Balmain. The Kingdom of God; or, Christ's Teaching according to the Synoptical Gospels, 5th ed. (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark; New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1893), 361 pp.

Budington, William Ives. "What Shall I Do to Be Saved?" In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858).

Bulfinch, Stephen G. "The Sufferings of Christ." In Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections (edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 263-74.

- [4] Burns, Jabez. Mothers of the Wise and Good, 4th ed. (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1851), 288 pp.

Burrell, David James. The Gospel of Gladness (New York: American Tract Society, 1892), 318 pp.

Burrell, David James. "The Morning Cometh." (New York: American Tract Society, 1893), 320 pp.

Bushnell, Horace. The Character of Jesus Forbidding His Possible Classification with Men (New York: The Chautaugua Press, 1888), 87 pp. [0]

- [4] Bushnell, Horace. Christ and His Salvation: In Sermons Variousy Related Thereto (New York: Charles Scribner, 1864), 456 pp. [0]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Bushnell, Horace. God In Christ. Three Discourses . . . with a Preliminary Dissertation on Language (Hartford: Brown & Parsons, 1849), 356 pp. [O]
- Bushnell, Horace. Sermons for the New Life, 7th ed. (New York: Charles Scribner, n.d.; c. 1858), 456 pp. [O]
- [3] Calthrop, Gordon. "The Dream of Pilate's Wife." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 193-200.
- Calthrop, Gordon. "The New Creation in Christ Jesus." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. III (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 18-24.
- Campbell, John McLeod. The Nature of the Atonement and its Relation to Remission of Sins and Eternal Life (Cambridge: Macmillan & Co., 1856), 382 pp.
- Campbell, John McLeod. Thoughts on Revelation with Special Reference to the Present Time (Cambridge: Macmillan & Co., 1862), 200 pp.
- Carpenter, W. B. "The Attractive Influence of the Cross." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 10-16. [O]
- Caughey, James. Helps to a Life of Holiness and Usefulness, or, Revival Miscellanies: Containing Eleven Revival Sermons, . . . (Boston: James P. Magee, 1854), 442 pp. [A]
- Chalmers, William. "The Power of Faith and Prayer." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of all Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 49-56.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Channing, William Ellery. "Character of Christ." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 136-155. [O; A, wwl]

Christian Home Life. A Book of Examples and Principles
(New York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 299 pp.

Clark, Thomas M. "John the Baptist." In Remarkable Characters and Places of the Holy Land: Comprising an Account of Patriarchs, Judges, Prophets, Apostles, Women, Warriors, Poets, and Kings . . . (edited by Charles W. Elliott); (Hartford, Conn.: J. B. Burr & Company, 1867), pp. 509-518. [B, wwl]

Coolidge, James I. T. "The Attraction of the Father." In Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections (edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 76-84.

Culross, James. "Behold, I Stand at the Door, and Knock." (London: Morgan & Scott, n.d.), 152 pp.
[ol]

[4] Culross, James. Emmanuel; or, the Father Revealed in Jesus. (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1868), 144 pp. [ol]

Culross, James. The Home at Bethany. Its Joys, its Sorrows and its Divine Guest (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 188 pp. [ol]

Cumming, John. Christ Alpha and Omega in the Word of God (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1865), 354 pp.
[ol]

Cumming, John. Christ our Passover; or, Thoughts on the Atonement (bound with: Infant Salvation, 104 pp.); (London: Arthur Hall, Virtue, & Co., 1855), 170 pp. [ol]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Cumming, John. The Church before the Flood (London: Arthur Hall, Virtue, & Co., 1853), 608 pp. [0]
- [4] Cumming, John. Cumming's Minor Works. First Series (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1854), 127 pp., 130 pp., 123 pp., resp. [0]
- [4] Cumming, John. Cumming's Minor Works. Second Series (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1854), 90 pp., 184 pp., 132 pp., resp. [0]
- [2] Cumming, John. Cumming's Minor Works. Third Series (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1855), 91 pp., 83 pp., 198 pp., resp. [0]
- [4] Cumming, John. The Daily Life; or Precepts and Prescriptions for Christian Living (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1855), 279 pp. [A]
- Cumming, John. The End: or, the Proximate Signs of the Close of this Dispensation (London: John Farquhar Shaw, 1855), 458 pp. [(A), B]
- Cumming, John. God in History, and God in Science (New York: Phillips & Hunt; Cincinnati: Hitchcock & Walden, n.d.), 181 pp. [0]
- [4] Cumming, John. The Great Preparation; or, Redemption Draweth Nigh. First Series (New York: Rudd & Carleton, 1860), 259 pp. [0]
- [4] Cumming, John. The Great Preparation; or, Redemption Draweth Nigh. Second Series (New York: Rudd & Carleton, 1861), 323 pp. [0]
- [3] Cumming, John. The Great Tribulation; or, Things Coming on the Earth. First Series; . . . Second Series (New York: Rudd & Carleton; London: Richard Bentley, 1860), 290 pp. & 305 pp., resp. [0]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Cumming, John. Is Christianity From God? Or, a Manual of Bible Evidence for the People (New York: M. W. Dodd, 1849), 276 pp. [O]
- Cumming, John. Occasional Discourses, 2 vols., 3rd ed. Vol. II (London: Arthur Hall, Virtue & Co., 1848), 360 pp. [O]
- [1] Cumming, John. Prophetic Studies; or, Lectures on the Book of Daniel (London: Arthur Hall, Virtue & Co., 1853), 500 pp. [B, H]
- [3] Cumming, John. Signs of the Times; or, Present, Past and Future (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1855), 288 pp. [R]
- Cumming, John. Teach Us to Pray; Being Experimental, Doctrinal, and Practical Observations on the Lord's Prayer (New York: Carleton, Publisher, 1862), 303 pp. [O]
- [4] Cumming, John. The Tent and the Altar, Sketches from Patriarchal Life (Boston: John P. Jewett & Co., 1854), 365 pp. [O]
- Cumming, John. "Testimony Concerning Christ." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 274-80. [O]
- [4] Cumming, John. Urgent Questions. Twelve Urgent Questions: Personal, Practical, and Pointed (Philadelphia: Lindsay & Blakiston, 1855), 281 pp. [O]
- [2] Cumming, John. Voices of the Day (London: John Farquhar Shaw, 1851), 452 pp. [A]
- [4] Cumming, John. Voices of the Night, enlarged ed. [early ed., Boston: Jn P. Jewett & Co., 1854]; (London: Virtue, Hall, & Virtue, n.d.), 470 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Campaigning for Christ (New York: American Tract Society, 1902 [from earlier "articles"]), 238 pp. [0]
- [4] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Christianity in the Home (New York: The Baker & Taylor Co., n.d.), 264 pp. [0]
- [4] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. "Christian Recreations and Unchristian Amusements." In Christian Recreations and Unchristian Amusements [and other lectures] ([title page, missing; this sermon was given on Oct. 24, 1858, at Cooper Institute, New-York]). [0]
- Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. God's Light on Dark Clouds (New York: The Baker & Taylor Co., 1882), 180 pp. [0]
- [2] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Heart Life (New York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 191 pp. [A]
- Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Heart Thoughts (Belfast: William Mullan, 1872), 123 pp. [0]
- Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Mountain Tops with Jesus. Calls to a Higher Life (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1898), 74 pp. [0]
- [4] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Pointed Papers for the Christian Life (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1881), 363 pp. [0]
- [2] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Right to the Point. Spare Minute Series (selected from the writings of Theodore L. Cuyler by Mary Storrs Haynes, with an introduction by Newman Hall); (Boston: D. Lothrop & Co., 1884), 266 pp. [A]
- [4] Cuyler, Theodore Ledyard. Thought-Hives (New York: American Tract Society, 1872) 341 pp. [0]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Dale, Thomas. "The Creation and the Fall, Explained to Children." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. I (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 17-24.
- Doddridge, Philip. "The Evidences of Christianity Briefly Stated, and the New Testament Proved to Be Genuine." With The Lives of the Apostles by John Fleetwood [title page, missing], pp. 555-607.
- Doddridge, Philip. The Miscellaneous Works of Philip Doddridge (London: Joseph Ogle Robinson, 1830), 1259 pp.
- [4] Drummond, Henry. Addresses (Philadelphia: Henry Altemus, 1891), 363 pp. [A]
- Dunlop, John Irvine. "The Believer's Privilege." In Sermons by Congregational Ministers (London: James Paul, 1855), pp. 477-488.
- Elliott, Charles. Christus Mediator (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1891), 145 pp. [O]
- Erskine, Thomas. Remarks on the Internal Evidence for the Truth of Revealed Religion, 10th ed. (Edinburgh: David Douglas, 1878), 312 pp.
- Erskine, Thomas. The Unconditional Freeness of the Gospel (Edinburgh: Edmonston & Douglas, 1870), 156 pp.
- Ewing, Alexander. "The Character of the Redeemer, and the Blessings He Bestows." In Sermons by Ministers of the Congregational Union of Scotland: . . . (Glasgow: James Curll, 1823), pp. 28-43.
- Falloon, William M. "The Mind of Christ." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of all Protestant Denominations, Vol. III (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 271-6.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Farrar, Frederic W. "The Atonement." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of all Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 405-12. [O]

Farrar, Frederic W. "In the Days of thy Youth," 3rd ed. (London: Macmillan & Co., 1877), 398 pp. [O]

Farrar, Frederic W. The Silence and the Voices of God, with other Sermons (New York: E. P. Dutton & Co., 1874), 238 pp. [O]

Farrar, Canon [Frederic W.]. Talks on Temperance (New York: National Temperance Society & Publication House, 1881), 198 pp. [A]

Farrar, Frederic W. Truths to Live By. A Companion to "Everyday Christian Life" (London: Wm. Isbister Limited, 1890), 372 pp. [B, C]

- [2] Ferguson, S. C. and Allen, E. A. The Golden Gems of Life: or, Gathered Jewels for the Home Circle (Cincinnati, Nashville, Pittsburg: Cline & Caraway, Ladoga, Ind., 1881), 608 pp. [A]

Flavel, John. Christ Knocking at the Door of Sinners' Hearts; a Solemn Entreaty to Receive the Saviour and His Gospel . . . (New York: The American Tract Society, n.d.; c. 1689), 400 pp. [O]

Flavel, John. The Fountain of Life; or, a Display of Christ in His Essential and Mediatorial Glory (New-York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 362+ pp. [O]

- [4] Flavel, John. The Method of Grace, in the Holy Spirit's Applying to the Souls of Men the Eternal Redemption Contrived by the Father and Accomplished by the Son, 2nd ed., revised (New York: American Tract Society, 1820), 560 pp. [(B)]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Flavel, John. The Whole Works of John Flavel, 2 vols. (London &c.: John Nicholson, 1716), 684 pp. & 752 pp., resp. [O]

Foster, John. Miscellaneous Essays on Christian Morals; Experimental and Practical (New-York: D. Appleton & Co., 1844), 252 pp. [O]

Fry, Caroline. Christ our Example (Philadelphia: R. S. H. George, 1841), 318 pp.

Furness, William H. "A Communion Sermon." In Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections (edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 314-25.

Garbett, Edward. God's Word Written: The Doctrine of the Inspiration of Holy Scripture Explained and Enforced (New York: American Tract Society, n.d.), 372 pp. [O]

- [2] Garbett, Edward. Religion in Daily Life (London: Religious Tract Society, 1865), 238+ pp. [A, H]

Gausson, L. Theopneustia; the Plenary Inspiration of the Holy Scriptures Deduced from Internal Evidence, and the Testimonies of Nature, History and Science, revised ed. (translated by David Scott); (Chicago: The Bible Institute Colportage Association, n.d.), 365 pp. [A, B, C]

Gleanings for the Young (British & Foreign Bible Society: 1880-1898). [B]

Gloag, Paton James. The Messianic Prophecies (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1879), 368 pp. [B]

Gordon, Adoniram Judson. In Christ; or, the Believer's Union with His Lord (New York &c.: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1880), 199 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Gordon, Adoniram Judson. The Ministry of Healing, or, Miracles of Cure in All Ages, 3rd ed. (Chicago: Fleming H. Revell, 1882), 249 pp. [A]

Gordon, Adoniram Judson. The Ministry of the Spirit (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, 1895), 225 pp. [O]

Gordon, Adoniram Judson. The Twofold Life or Christ's Work For Us and Christ's Work In Us (Chicago: The Bible Institute Colportage Association, 1883), 285 pp. [O]

Goulburn, Edward Meyrick. The Pursuit of Holiness: A Sequel to "Thoughts on Personal Religion" (London, Oxford & Cambridge: Rivingtons, 1869), 220 pp. [O]

- [2] Goulburn, Edward Meyrick. Thoughts on Personal Religion, Being a Treatise on the Christian Life in its Two Chief Elements, Devotion and Practice, first American ed. (from the 5th London ed.); (New York: D. Appleton & Co., 1864), 398 pp. [A]

Goulburn, Edward Meyrick. Three Counsels of the Divine Master for the Conduct of the Spiritual Life, 2 vols. (London: John Murray, 1888), 256 pp. & 243 pp., resp. [O]

Guthrie, Thomas. "A Saviour Given." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. I (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 414-20. [O]

Hall, Joseph. The Great Mystery of Godliness, Laid Forth by Way of Affectuous and Feeling Meditation. Also the Invisible World, Discovered to Spiritual Eyes, and Reduced to Useful Meditation (London: William Pickering, 1847; c. 1652), 208 pp. [O]

Hall, Newman. Atonement the Fundamental Fact of Christianity (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., n.d.), 159 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Hall, Newman. The Lord's Prayer: A Practical Meditation (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1883), 463 pp.
- Halsey, Le Roy J. The Beauty of Immanuel. His Name Shall Be Called Wonderful (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1860), 204 pp. [0]
- Hamilton, James. The Mount of Olives, and other Lectures on Prayer (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1853), 163 pp. [0]
- Hanna, William. The Resurrection of the Dead (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1873), 222 pp. [0]
- [2] Harris, John. The Great Commission: or, the Christian Church Constituted and Charged to Convey the Gospel to the World (with an introductory essay by William R. Williams); (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1854), 396 pp. [A, B, C]
- [2] Harris, John. Mammon: or, Covetousness the Sin of the Christian Church (Pittsburgh: United Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1836), 228 pp. [A]
- Harris, John. Miscellanies, Consisting Principally of Sermons and Essays (Boston: Gould, Kendall & Lincoln, 1844), 287 pp. [0]
- Hartley, Sherman. Lessons at the Cross: or Spiritual Truths Familiarly Exhibited in their Relations to Christ (Boston: S. K. Whipple & Co., 1852), 274 pp.
- [3] Headley, J. T. The Sacred Mountains (New York: Charles Scribner, 1856), 175 pp. [A, (B)]
- Henry, Mrs. S. M. I. Studies in Home and Child Life (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1897), 251 pp. [N]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Herron, George D. The Larger Christ (Edinburgh & London: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1893), 122 pp. [A]
- Hill, John. "Reasons for Glorifying in the Cross of Christ." In Sermons by Congregational Ministers (London: James Paul, 1855), 8 pp.
- Hiscox, Edward T. "The Cross Contemplated." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 263-277.
- Hitchcock, Roswell D. "True Religion a Service." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 339-58.
- [4] Holland, Josiah G. Gold-Foil, Hammered from Popular Proverbs (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1859), 358 pp. [A]
- Holland, Joshiah G. Titcomb's Letters to Young People Single and Married, 50th ed. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1858), 251 pp. [A]
- [4] Hopkins, Ezekiel. The Whole Works of Ezekiel Hopkins (Edinburgh: A. & C. Black, 1841), 961 pp.
- [4] Hopkins, Samuel. The Works of Samuel Hopkins, Volume II (Boston: Doctrinal Tract & Book Society, 1854), 770 pp.
- Hopkins, Samuel. The Works of Samuel Hopkins, Volume III (Boston: Doctrinal Tract & Book Society, 1854), 798 pp.
- Hutton, M. S. "Coming to Christ." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 187-206.
- Irving, Edward. The Collected Writings of Edward Irving, 5 vols. Vol. II (London: Alexander Strahan & Co., 1864), 642 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Irving, Edward. The Collected Writings of Edward Irving, 5 vols. Vol. IV (London: Alexander Strahan, Publisher, 1865), 559 pp. [O]

Irving, Edward. For the Oracles of God, Four Orations. For Judgment to Come, an Argument, in Nine Parts (London: T. Hamilton, 1823), 548 pp. [B]

James, John Angell. Christian Progress: A Sequel to the Anxious Inquirer after Salvation (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1853), 180 pp. [O]

Kingsley, Charles. "The Transfiguration." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 518-27. [A, ww]

Kirk, Edward Norris. Sermons on Different Subjects, Delivered in England and America (New York: Dayton & Saxton, 1842), 362 pp. [O]

Krummacher, Friedrich Wilhelm. "The Crucifixion." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 598-608. [O; A, ww]

Krummacher, Friedrich Wilhelm. The Risen Redeemer: The Gospel History from the Resurrection to the Day of Pentecost (translated from the German by John T. Betts); (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1863), 298 pp. [O]

Landels, William. Every Day Religion; or, Christian Principle in Daily Practice (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1863), 313 pp. [O]

Landels, William. The Great Cloud of Witnesses; or, Faith and its Victories. Abel to Moses (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 311 pp. [O]

Latimer, Hugh. Select Sermons and Letters of Dr. Hugh Latimer (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 436 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Law, William. Wholly for God. The True Christian Life. A Series of Extracts from the Writings of William Law (selected, & with an introduction by Andrew Murray); (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co., Inc., 1893), 328 pp.

Lee, Alfred. The Life of the Apostle John, in a Series of Practical Discourses (New York: Protestant Episcopal Society for the Promotion of Evangelical Knowledge, 1858), 205 pp. [B]

Lee, Charles. "The Lord's Supper." In Sermons by Congregational Ministers (London: James Paul, 1855), pp. 145-52.

Lightfoot, Canon [Joseph B.]. "Losing the Soul to Save It." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 43-48. [O]

"The Light-House, or Jesus Christ the Light of the World." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), 8 pp.

Macduff, John Ross. Elijah, the Prophet of Fire (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1864), 351 pp. [O]

Macduff, John Ross. The Faithful Promiser (bound with The Words of Jesus); (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1855), 66 pp. [O]

Macduff, John Ross. Memories of Patmos; or, Some of the Great Words and Visions of the Apocalypse (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1883), 353 pp. [A]

[4] Macduff, John Ross. The Mind and Words of Jesus; and the Faithful Promiser (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1871), 128 pp., 126 pp., 62 pp., resp. [A]

Macduff, John Ross. The Mind of Jesus (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1855), 133 pp. [A]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Macduff, John Ross. The Morning Watches and Night Watches (London: James Nisbet & Co., Limited, 1852), 256 pp. [A]

Macduff, John Ross. The Shepherd and His Flock; or, the Keeper of Israel and the Sheep of His Pasture (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1868), 275 pp. [O]

- [4] Macduff, John Ross. Sunsets on the Hebrew Mountains (London: James Nisbet & Co., 1869), 317 pp. [A, H]

Macduff, John Ross. The Words of Jesus (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1854), 131 pp. [A]

Mackay, W. P. 'Grace and Truth' Under Twelve Different Aspects (Chicago & New York: Fleming H. Revell, n.d.), 258 pp.

Macmillan, Hugh. Bible Teachings in Nature (London: Macmillan & Co., 1867), 344 pp. [O]

Macmillan, Hugh. The Ministry of Nature (London: Macmillan & Co., 1888), 347 pp. [O]

- [4] Macmillan, Hugh. The Sabbath of the Fields, Being a Sequel to "Bible Teachings in Nature", 2nd ed. (London: Macmillan & Co., 1876), 358 pp. [O]

- [4] Macmillan, Hugh. The True Vine; or the Analogies of our Lord's Allegory, 4th ed. (London: Macmillan & Co., 1879), 328 pp. [O]

Macmillan, Hugh. Two Worlds Are Ours (London: Macmillan & Co., 1880), 349 pp. [O]

Macpherson, Robert. The Resurrection of Jesus Christ with an Examination of the Speculations of Strauss in his 'New Life of Jesus' and an Introductory View of the Present Position of Theological Inquiry in Reference to the Existence of God and the Miraculous Evidence of Christianity (Edinburgh & London: William Blackwood & Sons, 1867), 467 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

March, Daniel. From Dark to Dawn; Being a Second Series of Night Scenes in the Bible (Philadelphia &c.: J. C. McCurdy & Co., 1878), 632 pp. [O]

[4] March, Daniel. Home Life in the Bible (Philadelphia &c.: Ziegler & McCurdy, 1873), 622 pp. [B]

[1] March, Daniel. Night Scenes in the Bible (Philadelphia &c.: Ziegler & McCurdy, 1872), 544 pp. [B]

[2] March, Daniel. Our Father's House, or the Unwritten Word (Philadelphia &c.: Ziegler & McCurdy, 1870), 560 pp. [B]

McClintock, John. "Import of the Lord's Supper." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 528-39. [A, wwl]

M'Clintock, John. "The Strait Gate." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 278-88.

[4] McEwen, William. Grace and Truth; or, the Glory of the Fulness of the Redeemer Displayed . . . (Philadelphia: W. W. Woodward, 1821; c. 1763), 328 pp. [B, C]

[4] McEwen, William. The Most Remarkable Types, Figures, and Allegories of the Old Testament (Danbury: Stiles Nichols, 1803), 333 pp. [O]

McEwen, William. A Select Set of Essays, Doctrinal and Practical, upon a Variety of the Most Important and Interesting Subjects in Divinity, 2 vols. (Edinburgh: John Gray & Gavin Alston, 1769), 184 pp. [O]

McNeill, John. Sermons, Volume II (New York & Chicago: Fleming H. Revell, n.d.), 416 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Melvill, Henry. Lectures on Practical Subjects, Delivered at St. Margaret's, Lothbury (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1853), 402 pp. [O]
- [1] Melvill, Henry. Miscellaneous Sermons (London: "The Pulpit" Office, Glasshouse Yard, 1843), 512 pp., 507 pp., 444 pp., resp. [O]
- [2] Melvill, Henry. The Preacher in Print. Second Series.
DA The Golden Lectures, 7 vols. [Sermons for the years 1850-56]; (London: James Paul, 1, Chapter House Court). [B, C]
- [1] Melvill, Henry. Sermons, 3rd ed., enlarged (edited by C. P. McIlvaine); (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1844), 561 pp. [A, B]
- Melvill, Henry. Sermons, 2 vols. (edited by C. P. McIlvaine). Volume II (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1847), 382 pp. [O]
- [1] Melvill, Henry. Sermons, 2 vols. (edited by C. P. McIlvaine); (New York: Stanford & Swords, 1850), 416 pp. & 382 pp., resp. [O]
- Melvill, Henry. Sermons Delivered in the Cathedral Church of St. Paul, London [Sermons for the years 1856-59]; (London: James Paul, 1, Chapter House Court, 1860), 408 pp. [O]
- Melvill, Henry. Sermons on Certain of the Less Prominent Facts and References in Sacred Story (New-York: Stanford & Swords, 1845), 131 pp. [O]
- Melvill, Henry. Sermons Preached at Cambridge, During the Month of November, 1839 (London: J. G. F. & J. Rivington, 1840). [O]
- Melvill, Henry. Sermons Preached on Public Occasions (New-York: Stanford & Swords, 1847), 118 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [3] Meyer, Frederick Brotherton. Christ in Isaiah. Expositions of Isaiah XL - LV (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1895), 243 pp. [B]

Meyer, Frederick Brotherton. Elijah: and the Secret of his Power (London: Morgan & Scott, n.d.), 187 pp. [A, B, C]

Meyer, Frederick Brotherton. The Life and Light of Men. Expositions of John I. - XII. (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., n.d.), 251 pp. [O]

Miles, Henry A. "Man before God in the Attitude of a Sinner." In Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections (edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 1-10.

Miller, James R. The Building of Character (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell & Co., 1894), 273 pp. [O]

Miller, James R. Come Ye Apart. Daily Morning Readings in the Life of Christ (New York: Robert Carter & Bros., 1887), 366 pp. [O]

- [4] Miller, James R. Home-Making (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication & Sabbath-School Work, 1912; c. 1882), 310 pp. [B]

- [4] Miller, James R. Silent Times. A Book to Help in Reading the Bible into Life (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell & Co., 1914; c. 1886), 266 pp. [O]

- [2] Miller, James R. Week-Day Religion (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1880), 315 pp. [(B)]

"The Ministration of the Spirit." In Christian Recreations and Unchristian Amusements [and other lectures]; (delivered at the Annual Meeting of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, New Haven, October, 1872).

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Molyneux, Capel. "The Empty Sepulchre." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 437-52.

Moore, Daniel. "The Golden Rule of Gospel Equity." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 225-32.

Moore, Daniel. "True and False Righteousness." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. II (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 193-200.

Moore, Edward W. The Christ-Controlled Life or the Secret of Sanctity (New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co. Inc., 1893), 231 pp.

More, Hannah. The Book of Private Devotion, a Series of Prayers and Meditations: With an Introductory Essay on Prayer, Chiefly from the Writings of Hannah More (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1849), 342 pp. [O]

More, Hannah. The Works of Hannah More, 2 vols. (New-York: Harper & Brothers, 1835), 563 pp. & 587 pp., resp. [B, C]

Morison, James. Sheaves of Ministry: Sermons and Expositions (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1890), 394 pp.

Morison, John. Sermons and Expositions on Interesting Portions of Scripture (London: Smith & Elder & T. Hamilton, 1819), 416 pp.

Morison, John H. "Jesus our Redeemer." In Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections (edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby & H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 226-37.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Mulock-Craik, Dinah Maria. Sermons Out of Church (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1875), 217 pp. [A, H]

Munro, John. "The Nature and Necessity of a Good Conscience." In Sermons by Ministers of the Congregational Union of Scotland; . . . (Glasgow: James Curll, 1823).

[4] Murray, Andrew. Abide in Christ: Thoughts on the Blessed Life of Fellowship with the Son of God (New York: A. D. F. Randolph & Co., n.d.), 223 pp. [A, B]

[4] Murray, Andrew. Absolute Surrender and other Addresses (Chicago: The Bible Institute Colportage Association, n.d.; [c. by Fleming H. Revell Co., 1897]), 126 pp. [O]

Murray, Andrew. The Deeper Christian Life an Aid to its Attainment (Chicago, New York, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1895), 127 pp. [O]

[4] Murray, Andrew. Holy In Christ: Thoughts on the Calling of God's Children to Be Holy As He Is Holy (New York: A. D. F. Randolph & Co., n.d.), 302 pp. [O]

Murray, Andrew. Jesus Himself (New York, Chicago, Toronto: F. H. Revell Co., 1897), 68 pp. [O]

Murray, Andrew. Love Made Perfect (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1897), 73 pp. [O]

Murray, Andrew. The Master's Indwelling (Chicago, New York, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., n.d.), 180 pp. [O]

[4] Murray, Andrew. The Ministry of Intercession. A Plea for More Prayer (New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1897), 200 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Naville, Ernest. The Christ (translated from the French by T. J. Despres); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1880), 247 pp.
- Newman, Cardinal John Henry. Sermons Bearing on Subjects of the Day (London: Longmans, Green, & Co., 1891), 424 pp. [0]
- Newman, Cardinal John Henry. Sermons Preached on Various Occasions (London: Longmans, Green, & Co., 1894), 337 pp. [0]
- [4] Nichols, W. A. The Wise Woman As Builder, or, Strength and Beauty in the Formation of Female Character (Chicago: Fleming H. Revell, 1883), 123 pp.
- [4] Nicoll, W. Robertson. The Lamb of God. Expositions in the Writings of St. John (New York: Macmillan & Co., 1883), 124 pp.
- [4] Olin, Stephen. The Works of Stephen Olin. Volume I. Sermons and Sketches (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854), 422 pp. [A]
- [4] Olin, Stephen. The Works of Stephen Olin. Volume II. Lectures and Addresses (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1854), 475 pp. [A]
- Osborn, G. "The Holy Spirit: His Work and Mission." In Lectures on the Foundation of John Fernley, Esq., Delivered in the Years 1870, 1871, 1872, 1873 (London: Wesleyan Conference Office, 1874), 32 pp.
- Owen, John. The Glorious Mystery of the Person of Christ, God and Man. To Which Are Subjoined, Meditations and Discourses on the Glory of Christ (New-York: Robert Carter, 1839), 612 pp.
- [4] Parker, Joseph. Ecce Deus. Essays on the Life and Doctrine of Jesus Christ with Controversial Notes on "Ecce Homo" (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1867), 338 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Payne, George. "On Sanctification." In Sermons by Ministers of the Congregational Union of Scotland; . . . (Glasgow: James Curll, 1823), pp. 317-349.
- Pearse, Mark Guy. The Gentleness of Jesus (New York: Thomas Y. Crowell & Co., 1898), 250 pp. [O]
- [4] Peck, George. Formation of a Manly Character: A Series of Lectures to Young Men (New-York: Carlton & Phillips, 1854), 304 pp. [O]
- Peck, Jesse T. "The Life Battle." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 359-81.
- Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments Covering the International Sunday-School Lessons for 1892 (New York; Chicago: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1891), 416 pp. [B, C]
- Pentecost, George F. Bible Studies from the Old and New Testaments Covering the International Sunday-School Lessons for 1893 (New York: A. S. Barnes & Co., 1893), 437 pp. [B, C]
- Philip, Robert. Manly Piety, in its Spirit (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Publication Committee, n.d.), 215 pp. [A]
- [2] Philip, Robert. Redemption; or, the New Song in Heaven: The Test of Truth and Duty on Earth (New-York: D. Appleton & Co., 1835), 215+ pp. [O]
- Pike, John Gregory. Persuasives to Early Piety (London: The Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 190 pp. [O]
- Plumer, William S. The Grace of Christ, or Sinners Saved by Unmerited Kindness (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1853), 454 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Plumer, William S. "How to Bring Up Children." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication), 8 pp. [O]

Plumer, William S. The Person and Sinless Character of our Lord Jesus Christ (Richmond: Presbyterian Committee of Publication; New York: Anson D. F. Randolph & Co., 1876), 127 pp. [O]

- [4] Plumer, William S. The Rock of our Salvation: A Treatise Respecting the Natures, Person, Offices, Work, Sufferings, and Glory of Jesus Christ (New York: The American Tract Society, 1867), 519 pp. [O]

Plumer, William S. Vital Godliness: A Treatise on Experimental and Practical Piety (New York: The American Tract Society, 1864), 610 pp. [O]

Plumptre, Edward H. Christ and Christendom (London: Alexander Strahan, 1867), 378 pp. [O]

- [4] Pope, W. B. The Person of Christ: Dogmatic, Scriptural, Historical. The Fernley Lecture of 1871 with Two Additional Essays on the Biblical and Ecclesiastical Development of the Doctrine, and Illustrative Notes, 2nd ed. (London: Wesleyan Conference Office, 1875), 302 pp. [B]

- [4] Porteus, Beilby. "Evidences of the Christian Religion." With The Life of our Lord and Saviour Jesus Christ: . . ., by John Fleetwood; (London: Thomas Kelly, 1844), 100+ pp.

- [4] Porteus, Beilby. Sermons on Several Subjects (London: T. Payne & Son; T. Cadell, 1784), 431 pp.

- [4] Power, Philip Bennett. "I Will:" Being the Determinations of the Man of God, As Found in Some of the "I Wills" of the Psalms (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1863), 404 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [2] Power, Philip Bennett. The "I Wills" of Christ; Being Thoughts upon Some of the Passages in Which the Words "I Will" Are Used by the Lord Jesus Christ (Edinburgh: Religious Tract Society; London: William Macintosh, 1866), 382 pp. [A]

Power, Philip Bennett. Pivot Words of Scripture (New York: Wilbur R. Ketcham, 1865), 353 pp. [O]

- [4] Pressense, Edmond Dehault de. The Redeemer: Discourses (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1864), 369 pp. [O]

Punshon, William Morley. "The Gospel of the Incarnation." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. III (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 169-176. [O]

Punshon, William Morley. Lectures and Sermons, 3rd ed. (Toronto: Methodist Book & Printing Establishment, 1876), 378 pp. [A]

Reid, William. The Blood of Jesus (Philadelphia: American Baptist Publication Society, n.d.), 122 pp.

Robertson, Frederick William. "The Loneliness of Christ." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 241-253. [A, ww]

Robertson, James. "The Brazen Serpent a Type of Christ." In Sermons by Ministers of the Congregational Union of Scotland; . . . (Glasgow: James Curll, 1823), pp. 350-389.

Robinson, Thomas. Scripture Characters: or, a Practical Improvement of the Principal Histories in the Old and New Testaments, 2 vols. (London: Henry G. Bohn, 1849), 701 pp. & 716 pp., resp. [B]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Saphir, Adolph. Christ and the Scriptures (London: Morgan & Chase, 1867), 194 pp.
- Sartorius, Ernest. The Person and Work of Christ (translated by Oakman S. Stearns); (Boston: Gould, Kendall & Lincoln, 1848), 161 pp.
- [2] Schaff, Philip. The Person of Christ: The Miracle of History. With a Reply to Strauss and Renan, and a Collection of Testimonies of Unbelievers (The American Tract Society, 1865; New York: Charles Scribner & Co., n.d.; [revised ed., New York: American Tract Society, 1880; 285 pp.]), 375 pp.
- Sears, Edmund H. Christ in the Life: Sermons. With a Selection of Poems (Boston: Lockwood, Brooks, & Co., 1877), 278 pp.
- Sears, Edmund H. The Fourth Gospel the Heart of Christ, 2nd ed. (Boston: Noyes, Holmes, & Co., 1872), 551 pp.
- Sears, Edmund H. Regeneration (Boston: Crosby, Nichols, & Co., 1853), 248 pp.
- Sears, Edmund H. Sermons and Songs of the Christian Life (Philadelphia: Claxton, Remsen, & Haffelfinger, 1875), 334 pp.
- Seeley, John Robert. Ecce Homo: A Survey of the Life and Work of Jesus Christ (Boston: Roberts Brothers, 1869), 355 pp.
- Simons, Michael Laird, ed. Evenings with Moody and Sankey: Comprising Sermons and Addresses at their Great Revival Meetings . . . (Philadelphia: Henry T. Coates & Co., 1877), 296 pp. [0]
- [4] Simons, Michael Laird, ed. Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), 846 pp. [A]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- Smeaton, George. The Doctrine of the Atonement As Taught by Christ Himself (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1871; reprint ed., Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1953), 502 pp.
- [3] Smith, Hannah Whitall. The Christian's Secret of a Happy Life (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1883 & 1888), 250+ pp. [N]
- Smith, R. Payne. Prophecy a Preparation for Christ: Eight Lectures Preached before the University of Oxford, in the year MDCCCLXIX (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1870), 397 pp.
- Smock, D. V. "Systematic Benevolence." In Presbyterian Tracts, Vol. III (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, n.d.), pp. 261-274.
- South, Robert. Sermons Preached upon Several Occasions, 4 vols. (Philadelphia: Sorin & Ball, 1845), 540 pp., 536 pp., 550 pp., 583 pp., resp.
- Speer, Robert E. Studies of the Man Christ Jesus (New York, Chicago, Toronto: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1896), 249 pp.
- Spurgeon, Charles Haddon. "Condescension of Christ." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 309-329. [O; A, ww]
- Spurgeon, Charles Haddon. "Search the Scriptures." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. I (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 113-28. [O]
- Spurgeon, Charles Haddon. Sermons, 2nd Series (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1857), 441 pp. [A, H]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Stanley, Arthur Penrhyn. "Jesus of Nazareth." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 349-54. [O; A, ww]

- [4] Stowe, Mrs. Harriet Beecher. Little Foxes [by Christopher Crowfield]; (Boston: James R. Osgood & Co., 1872), 287 pp.

Taylor, Jeremy. The Rule and Exercises of Holy Living, 2 parts (London, New York, Toronto: Longmans, Green & Co., 1930; earlier printing, 1851), 310 pp. & 248 pp., resp. [A]

Taylor, Jeremy. The Sermons of Jeremy Taylor. . . . (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1849), 565 pp. [O]

Taylor, William M. Contrary Winds and other Sermons (New York: A. C. Armstrong & Son, 1895), 372 pp. [O]

- [3] Taylor, William M. Elijah the Prophet (New York & London: Harper & Brothers, 1875; also, London: Sampson Low, Marston, Searle, & Rivington, 1878), 217 pp. & 248 pp., resp. [B, C]

- [2] Thayer, E. W. Sketches from the Life of Jesus, Historical and Doctrinal (Chicago & New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1891), 548 pp.

Thomas a Kempis. Of the Imitation of Christ (Philadelphia: Henry Altemus, 1895), 284 pp. [A]

Thomas a Kempis. A Meditation on the Incarnation of Christ. Sermons on the Life and Passion of our Lord and of Hearing and Speaking Good Words (London: Kegan Paul, Trench, Trubner & Co., Ltd., 1907; 1st printing, 1456), 256 pp. [O]

Thompson, Augustus C. The Mercy-Seat; or, Thoughts on Prayer (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1863), 345 pp. [O]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Thompson, Joseph P. "Man's Pride Against God's Grace." In The New York Pulpit in the Revival of 1858 (New York: Sheldon, Blakeman & Co., 1858), pp. 112-26.

Thompson, J. W. "The Doctrine of the Cross." In Tracts of the American Unitarian Association. First Series. . . , Vol. XIV (Boston: James Munroe & Co., 1841), 32 pp.

[4] Thomson, Bishop Edward. "What Think Ye of Christ?" In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 583-97. [A, ww]

[3] Tonna, Charlotte Elizabeth. "Principalities and Powers in Heavenly Places" (with an Introduction by Edward Bickersteth); (New-York: John S. Taylor & Co., 1842), 298 pp. [O]

[3] Trench, Richard Chenevix. The Fitness of Holy Scripture for Unfolding the Spiritual Life of Men. II. Christ the Desire of all Nations, or, the Unconscious Prophecies of Heathendom: Being the Hulsean Lectures for 1845 & 1846 (Philadelphia: H. Hooker, 1850), 322 pp. [(B), part II]

[4] Trench, Richard Chenevix. Sermons Preached in Westminster Abbey (New York: W. J. Widdleton, 1860), 368 pp. [O]

[3] Trench, Richard Chenevix. Studies in the Gospels, 3rd ed., revised (London: Macmillan & Co., 1874; 1st printing, 1867), 335 pp. [O]

Uhlhorn, Gerhard. The Modern Representations of the Life of Jesus, 3rd ed. (translated from the German by Charles E. Grinnell); (Boston: Little, Brown, & Co., 1868), 164 pp.

Ullmann, Carl. The Sinlessness of Jesus an Evidence for Christianity (translated from the German 7th ed. by Sophia Taylor); (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1882), 300 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

Upham, C. W. "The Scripture Doctrine of Regeneration."
In Tracts of the American Unitarian Association.
First Series. . . , Vol. XIV (Boston: James
Munroe & Co., 1841), 40 pp.

Vaughan, Charles John. The Personality of the Tempter,
and other Sermons, Doctrinal and Occasional,
Including a Sermon Preached in St. Paul's
Cathedral, at the Festival of the Sons of the
Clergy (London: John W. Parker & Son, 1851), 253
pp.

Wace, Henry. The Gospel and its Witnesses. Some of
the Chief Facts in the Life of our Lord and the
Authority of the Evangelical Narratives Considered
in Lectures Chiefly Preached at St. James's,
Westminster (London: John Murray, 1883), 211 pp.

[4] Waggoner, Ellet J. Prophetic Lights. Some of the
Prominent Prophecies of the Old and New
Testaments, Interpreted by the Bible and History
(Oakland, San Francisco, New York: Pacific Press
Publishing Co., 1888), 180 pp. {B, C}

Walker, James B. God Revealed in the Process of
Creation, and by the Manifestation of Jesus
Christ; Including an Examination of the
Development Theory Contained in the "Vestiges of
the Natural History of Creation" (Boston: Gould &
Lincoln, 1857), 273 pp.

Walker, James. "Perfection the Christian's Aim." In
Sermons on Christian Communion, Designed to
Promote the Growth of the Religious Affections
(edited by T. R. Sullivan); (Boston: Wm. Crosby &
H. P. Nichols, 1848), pp. 176-87.

Wallich, L. C. "The Good Shepherd Restoring the Soul,
Directing the Steps, and Dispelling the Fears of
One of the Flock." In Three Hundred Sermons by
the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of all
Protestant Denominations, Vol. I (London: Charles
Higham, 1886), pp. 75-80.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Warren, Israel Perkins. The Cross-Bearer. A Vision
(Boston: American Tract Society, 1861), 206 pp.
[A]

Warren, Israel Perkins. The Parousia: A Critical Study of the Scripture Doctrines of Christ's Second Coming; His Reign as King; the Resurrection of the Dead; and the General Judgment (Portland, Maine: Hoyt, Fogg & Donham, 1879), 311 pp. [O]

Wayland, Francis. "A Day in the Life of Jesus of Nazareth." In Sunday Half-Hours with Great Preachers (edited by M. Laird Simons); (Philadelphia: Porter & Coates, 1871), pp. 180-96. [A, ww]

- [1] Wayland, Francis. Salvation by Christ. A Series of Discourses on Some of the Most Important Doctrines of the Gospel (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1859), 386 pp.

Wayland, Francis. Sermons Delivered in the Chapel of Brown University (Boston: Gould, Kendall, & Lincoln, 1849), 328 pp.

- [4] Wesley, John. "Christian Perfection." In Living Thoughts of John Wesley . . . [by James H. Potts]; (Cincinnati: Cranston & Stowe; New York: Hunt & Eaton, 1891), pp. 249-318. [O]

- [4] Wesley, John. Sermons on Several Occasions (London: J. Bumpus, Holborn-Bars &c., 1823), 673 pp. [O]

West, Anson. The Old and the New Man: or, Sin and Salvation (Nashville, Tenn.: Southern Methodist Publishing House, 1886), 335 pp. [A]

Wharton, Morton Bryan. Famous Women of the New Testament (New York: E. B. Treat, 1890), 340 pp.

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- White, Edward. Life in Christ: A Study of the Scripture Doctrine on the Nature of Man, the Object of the Divine Incarnation, and the Conditions of Human Immortality, 3rd ed. (London: Elliot Stock, 1878), 543 pp. [B]
- Whitelaw, Thomas. How Is the Divinity of Jesus Depicted in the Gospels and Epistles? (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1883), 271 pp.
- Whitfield, Frederick. Truth In Christ (edited by Charles W. Quick); (Philadelphia: The Leighton Publications, 1872), 279 pp.
- Williams, Samuel Porter. Sermons on Various Subjects, Chiefly Practical (Salem: Essex Register Office, 1827), 306 pp.
- Williams, William R. Miscellanies (New York: Edward H. Fletcher, 1850), 391 pp.
- Williams, William R. Religious Progress; Discourses on the Development of the Christian Character (Boston: Gould & Lincoln, 1854), 258 pp.
- Winslow, Octavius. "Christ the Centre of Christian Union." In Three Hundred Sermons by the Most Eminent Modern Preachers of All Protestant Denominations, Vol. III (London: Charles Higham, 1886), pp. 417-24. [O]
- [2] Winslow, Octavius. The Glory of the Redeemer in His
DA Person and Work (Philadelphia: Lindsay &
Blakiston, 1855), 419 pp. [A]
- [1] for pre-DA
- [3] Winslow, Octavius. Midnight Harmonies, or, Thoughts for the Season of Solitude and Sorrow (London: John Farquhar Shaw, 1851), 276 pp. [A, B, H]

Sermons & Devotional Works &c.

- [4] Winslow, Octavius. Patriarchal Shadows of Christ and His Church: As exhibited in Passages Drawn from the History of Joseph and His Brethren, (New York: Robert Carter & Brothers, 1863), 402 pp. [0]
- [3] Winslow, Octavius. Personal Declension and Revival of Religion in the Soul (London: The Banner of Truth Trust, 1962; 1st printing, 1841), 203 pp. [0]